Liberty University

School of Music

A Narrative Study: Professional Development of a Piano Teacher through Various Music

Education Philosophies and Psychologies in Different Sociocultural Contexts

A Dissertation Submitted to

the Faculty of the School of Music

in Candidacy for the Degree of

Ph.D. in Music Education

by

Shuenda Wong

Lynchburg, VA

May 2024

Abstract

Philosophers have analyzed music education philosophies since Ancient times. For example, Plato and Aristotle in Greece mused over such matters, as did Confucius and Mozi in China. Today, music educators must examine both philosophies and psychologies of music education to understand the value of teaching music. They need music education philosophies to critique their actions and delve into their pedagogical methods to gain meaning from their teaching efforts. Previous research focused on music education philosophies in one or two countries without a thorough comparative analysis between countries or continents. This narrative study on music education philosophies traced the unique journey of the researcher through Asia, Europe, and North America. Interviews with additional participants enriched the narrative study and provided triangulation for the findings. The researcher highlighted themes and codes that illustrate the richness of philosophies and psychologies of music education, which can be helpful for music educators worldwide. Data analysis indicated the differences between these philosophies and music education psychologies in different sociocultural contexts, filling a gap in the literature. Through the data analysis, the researcher traced the music education philosophies and psychologies that influence professional development.

Keywords: Philosophies, psychologies, music education, piano pedagogy, narrative, sociocultural contexts, and professional development

Dedication/Acknowledgments

I want to thank my advisor, Dr Brian Stifller, and reader, Dr. Monica Taylor, for their support throughout the dissertation. You both have enriched my life greatly with your guidance and knowledge. I am a more potent researcher because of your efforts. Completing this study would not have been possible without the love and support of God and the encouragement of my family and friends. I dedicate this work to all of you.

Contents

List of Tables

Abbreviations

ABRSM- Associated Boards of the Royal Schools of Music, United Kingdom.

Chapter One: Introduction

Background

The philosophy and psychology of music education is a burgeoning research area involving interdisciplinary aspects of sociology, anthropology, pedagogy, andragogy, musicianship training, and subconscious worldviews and mindsets of teachers and students. This narrative study included the researcher as the prominent participating voice. The study also included additional participants to enrich the perspective of the main story, providing illuminating insights into the differing traditions and sociological environments surrounding music education and piano pedagogy.

Historical Background

Philosophies of music education have existed since ancient times. Plato and Aristotle have written on how music can affect character and personality, citing it as instrumental in the educational syllabus for the young. Plato placed philosophy above music as the highest of all subjects, as students must access ideal knowledge to become fair and just rulers. Aristotle was more moderate in his thinking, speaking of the tempering effects of music in building moral character.[1] In China, Confucius and Mozi also wrote substantially on the impact of music on creating virtuous and educated individuals, speaking on the influential nature of music as sounds and vibrations.[2] In medieval Europe, philosophers like Boethius and Hildegard of Bingen also investigated music's mathematical and mystical properties.[3]

---

[1] Daniela Bartels, "Review of *Why Music? The Foundations of Music Education from Plato Until Today* by Øivind Varkøy," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 27, no. 2 (2019): 224-229.

[2] Leonard Tan, "On Confucian Metaphysics, the Pragmatist Revolution, and Philosophy of Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 26, no. 1 (2018): 63-81.

[3] Diane Thram, "Understanding Music's Therapeutic Efficacy: Implications for Music Education," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 192-200.

Investigations into music education philosophies have focused on Europe and North America and general music education. Therefore, research studies can fill the gap in the literature to analyze diverse music education philosophies and piano teaching and methodologies. Narrative research can be a powerful way to illustrate these underlying worldviews and mindsets that color the pedagogical strategies of music teachers in different countries. The unique journey of the researcher, who has studied in various countries, can serve as a directing torch to cast light on these philosophies and psychologies, providing insights through comparison and analysis.

Many research studies have focused on educational philosophies in Germany and the United States. For example, Kertz-Welzel wrote extensively on "Didaktik," teaching and learning methodologies in Germany.[4] She also expounded on "Bildung," which emphasizes forming a holistic identity in students through an educational approach. She compared German methods to American pragmatic philosophies of music education. Other studies have focused on online education, tracing the differences between online education and traditional education.[5] There have been few studies focusing on music education philosophies in diverse contexts.

Sociological Background

The narrative study began in Malaysia, where the leading participant lived and received his education at a young age. Malaysia uniquely represents Asia, with its diverse population of many races and backgrounds. The country has a colonial past, with Britain, Portugal, Netherlands, and Japan being some of the imperialistic powers that influenced the country's cultural development. Influxes of migrants from China, India, Indonesia, and other Southeast Asian countries have contributed to the melting pot of individuals who live in Malaysia. For

---

[4] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Didaktik of Music: a German concept and its Comparison to American Music Pedagogy," *International Journal of Music Education* 22 no. 3(2004): 277–286.

[5] D. J. Albert, "Online Versus Traditional Master of Music in Music Education Degree Programs: Students' Reasons for Choosing," *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 25 no.1 (2015): 52–64.

example, in a research study by Carsten, she dissected Malaysian Chinese culture and the anthropological changes of the Chinese diaspora through the ages.[6] Much research literature provided a historical analysis of community cultures in Malaysia. However, little literature has a specific focus on music education philosophies.

Music education and piano teaching are unique in Malaysia due to the juxtaposition of this oriental culture and the piano as a versatile instrument symbolizing progression and modernization. The study included interviews with participants who have undergone music education or piano lessons in Malaysia. The narrative then moved to Europe as the researcher uprooted himself in his late teens to delve into the European Art culture. The research also focused on Germany and Britain with peripherical notes on continental Europe. Many researchers have conducted studies on European music philosophies, and this research study provides a unique lens by interviewing a few foreign Malaysian or Asian music students/teachers who received their training in Europe. This research can provide vital insights into the differences in musical cultures and philosophies, offering fresh perspectives in this field. Lastly, the study pivoted toward North America, focusing on online education and music teaching philosophies. The study highlighted interviews with foreign music students who have undergone such experiences, and the researcher can extract relevant themes to provide information for further dissection and comparison with past thematic analysis.

Theoretical Background

Two theories served as the basis for the theoretical framework of the research: social constructivism and narrative inquiry. The researcher examined assumptions and beliefs involved in music education methods and practices, specifically instrumental piano teaching. Interpretive

---

[6] Sharon Carstens, "Dancing Lions And Disappearing History: The National Culture Debates and Chinese Malaysian Culture," *Crossroads: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 13, no. 1 (1999): 11–63.

frameworks are the foundation of qualitative research studies, unlike quantitative studies, which are often positivist. The study considered music education philosophies' ontological, epistemological, and axiological aspects. The study also investigated how students and teachers perceive music teaching in diverse cultural contexts.[7] The construction of knowledge and the values behind the education and learning processes were integral to the research study as well.

The unique positionality of the researcher as the driving force of the narrative study provided illuminating points for the study. Analysis of the interviews for thematic threads was a central aspect of the research study.[8] The researcher can also have real-world knowledge of the unique contexts and environments in which music teaching occurs.

The study inspected several philosophical ideas, depending on the country and context of the musical interactions. Starting in Malaysia, the study dissected the cultural identities and backdrop of the musical activities there. The study discussed philosophies about the making of Asian music and its syncretization with Western art music. The researcher examined multicultural music education and its effects on piano teaching through interviews with participants with experience in these areas.

The subsequent journey to Europe involved investigations into concepts that inform music education in Germany and Britain. For example, the researcher dissected the idea of classical music education philosophies similar to Kertz-Welzel's research.[9] The researcher analyzed music educational methods, pedagogical strategies, worldviews, and philosophies. The

---

[7] Greg Guest, Kathleen M. MacQueen, and Emily E. Namey. *Applied Thematic Analysis*. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012).

[8] John W Creswell and J. David Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods*, (5th ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

[9] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Didaktik of Music: a German concept and its Comparison to American Music Pedagogy," *International Journal of Music Education* 22 no. 3(2004): 277–286.

researcher also analyzed interviews with participants for vital information on these aspects. The research included North American music education and online education. The researcher conducted interviews to highlight valuable insights useful for pedagogical purposes. Also, the researcher extracted themes and compared these themes with themes from previous topics.

Statement of the Problem

Investigating philosophies and psychologies of music education in relevance to piano teaching amid diverse sociocultural backgrounds is a task that requires substantial experience and real-life interactions. Based on the unique narrative and positionality of the researcher, fresh insights may be obtained through interpretative comparisons of philosophies and practical approaches of music educators. These findings could significantly benefit music educators and piano teachers from all countries and backgrounds. The problem that inspired this study was that these philosophies and psychologies needed to be analyzed from personal experiences to provide a unique individual lens that can be necessary for this subjective field of music. Therefore, a large amount of research is needed to fill this gap. Researchers have written some literature on this subject, but it is limited to certain countries. For example, Garrepy provided a comparative analysis of music educational philosophies in the United States and Germany, focusing on praxialism, internationalization, and globalization and highlighting philosophical worldviews in Europe and North America.[10] Golding elaborated on music education philosophies specifically in

---

[10] Stacey A. Garrepy, "Music Education in the United States and Germany as a Representative Example of Internationalization: A Philosophical Inquiry," Ph.D. diss. University of North Carolina at Greensboro, 2022. ProQuest (AAT 29061481).

Britain.[11] Huang also emphasized the cultural confluence of West and East in the transcultural phenomenon of Asian classical pianists.[12]

Narrative studies can provide substantial information and inferences that enrich the literature on the philosophies and psychologies of music education and piano pedagogy. Through sifting through the subjective experiences of various selected participants, the construction of knowledge can serve as a medium for teachers to understand diverse philosophical perspectives in music teaching and education. Music educators and piano teachers cling to methodologies that may suit their classrooms and students without critically examining these philosophies and psychologies of music education. They may need more flexibility and adaptability to different learners of diverse backgrounds. Lacking understanding, they may not be able to achieve the musical results they want with their students. Thus, this research served as a conduit for teachers to improve their pedagogical and pedagogical practices, filling a much-needed gap in the literature.

<div align="center">Statement of the Purpose</div>

The study analyzes music education's philosophies and psychologies, linking this with a narrative about the researcher's educational journey. The study also extracted interdisciplinary and cross-cultural insights relevant to all music educators and piano teachers worldwide in their teaching contexts. By conducting such a study, the construction of knowledge contributed to acquiring a global and international approach to general music education and instrumental music teaching.

---

[11] Rosemary Golding, "Seeking a Philosophy of Music in Higher Education: The Case of Mid-Nineteenth Century Edinburgh," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 2 (2016): 191–212.

[12] H. Huang, "Why Chinese people play Western classical music: Transcultural Roots of Music Philosophy," *International Journal of Music Education* 30 no.2 (2012): 161–176.

There are many sociological, philosophical, psychological, and cultural themes to be analyzed. Such themes include education in music performance versus general music, empiricism versus rationalism, and European versus American versus Asian education.[13] These are also quite broad umbrellas that can contain many different sub-elements. The advent of online education and constructivism in music education are two other emerging themes that require analysis.[14] Seeking the significance of music education through understanding the diversity of music education philosophies is an important research undertaking.[15]

Significance of the Study

This study is significant because it provided a unique lens into the literature about the philosophies and psychologies of music education. Delving into past experiences, worldviews, and opinions of selected participants in triangulation with the personal narrative and positionality of the researcher creates a research study that provides new knowledge in the realm of education and piano pedagogy. For example, Malaysia, with its multicultural background, is already a rampant site for analysis in terms of cultural and musical influences. The piano, as a symbol of Westernization and a channel for diverse musical genres, transcending its original roots, is an exciting part of this study.[16] Thus, fruitful inferences can be analyzed by posing specific questions to participants on these issues to shed light on the philosophies and psychologies of

---

[13] David J. Elliott, *Praxial Music Education: Reflections and Dialogues*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005)

[14] David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015).

[15] Bennett Reimer, *Seeking the Significance of Music Education: Essays and Reflections*. (New York: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2009).

[16] Artur Simon, "Southeast Asia: Musical Syncretism and Cultural Identity," *Fontes Artis Musicae* 57, no. 1 (2010): 23–34.

music education. Exploration of diverse Asian philosophies in tandem with music education is part of the research as well.

The researcher surveyed contrasting music education and pedagogy philosophies as the journey shifted to Europe. Research has provided some rich inferences in comparative philosophies in European contexts.[17] A bird's-eye view of these traditions can give teachers and students a rich knowledge of European musical art traditions. The perspectives of music students from Asia who have studied in Europe about cultural identities, musical expression, and communication would be of interest. These inferences from interviews can be enlightening, valuable, and empowering for all parties involved in music education.[18] Philosophies from Europe that influence piano teaching and music education can also be themes dissected. The final aspect of the narrative study involved North American educational philosophies in music education and piano teaching. The research also briefly touched on online music education and the way this has changed the landscape of music education. Discussion of the philosophical questions on the justification of music education methods and approaches can be exciting themes extracted through participant interviews.

<div align="center">Research Questions and Sub Questions</div>

Central Research Question: What are the differences and similarities between music education philosophies and psychologies among piano pedagogical methods of different countries and regions?

---

[17] Lauri Väkevä, "Four Pieces on Comparative Philosophy of Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 5–7.

[18] Estelle R. Jorgensen, "Values and Philosophizing about Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 22, no. 1 (2014): 5–21.

Sub Question 1:What are the philosophical and psychological factors that influence general music education and instrumental tutoring (specifically piano) in different countries?

Sub Question 2: What are the pedagogical processes of music education involved in divergent Cultures and contexts?

Sub Question 3:What are the pros and cons of diverse philosophies and psychologies of music education?

<div align="center">Hypothesis</div>

Hypothesis for Central Research Question: Significant differences exist between music education philosophies of different countries and regions that must be analyzed thematically through qualitative inquiry, specifically in piano pedagogical methods.

Hypothesis for Sub question 1:Various factors influence music education, instrumental tutoring philosophies, and psychology in different countries.

Hypothesis for Sub question 2: There are different pedagogical processes of music education in diverse cultures and contexts.

Hypothesis for Sub-question 3: Diverse philosophies and psychologies of music education have different pros and cons that can affect the procedures of music education.

<div align="center">Definition of Terms</div>

Philosophies of music education: Systematic and constant evaluation and examination of beliefs and assumptions for musical instruction, actions, and processes.[19]

---

[19] Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega, "What Should the Music Education Profession Expect of Philosophy," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education,* ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 17-36.

Psychologies of music education: Investigations on behaviors in music, experience, cognition, and perception of music, teaching theory, analysis, composition, and aural skills.[20]

Piano pedagogy: The study of teaching piano in school classrooms, group settings, or individual lessons.[21]

Sociocultural Contexts: social and cultural contexts of human beings, with cultural contexts being creative, educational, and artistic activities, and social contexts being interconnected relationships between humans and the hierarchies and structures of societies.[22]

Narrative study: A qualitative method used to analyze themes in the experiences of individuals chronologically and sequentially.[23]

Professional development: Improvement and training in a specific field to become adept in the skills and knowledge involved, becoming an expert with breadth and depth.[24]

---

[20] David Beard and Kenneth Gloag, eds. *Musicology: The Key Concepts*. (New York: Routledge,2016)

[21] Beard and Gloag, eds. *Musicology*.

[22] Ibid.

[23] John W. Creswell and Cheryl N. Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. (4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

[24] Ibid.

Chapter Two: Literature Review

Introduction

A comprehensive literature review serves as the foundation for the research study. This literature review aims to provide a systematic overview of the relevant literature described by Claxton and Dolan.[1] A systematic literature review follows precise protocols to survey a broad range of literature. This research study is unique as it can simultaneously narrow a significant gap in the literature, such as an analysis of philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts through a narrative inquiry; solve a significant problem by enabling music educators worldwide to synthesize a global music education philosophy; and improve practices in crucial areas with music pedagogical approaches that can be enhanced to cater to different contexts. This study covered several main points, and philosophies of music education from Asia come first. These include a broad spectrum of ideas and concepts about music education from the long history of countries such as Japan and China. Next, the research study surveyed the philosophies of music education in Europe. The European tradition of music education from Ancient Greece through to Rome, and the time periods of the Renaissance, Baroque, Classical, and modern are analyzed. The researcher also surveyed philosophies of music education from North America. The primary schools of utilitarian, aesthetic, and praxial traditions are examined. The researcher also dissected the theme of online education versus traditional brick-and-mortar education. Globalization and internationalization are discussed as well. Music education has become a global commodity, and the researcher investigated this phenomenon in detail. Lastly, the researcher examined comparative music education. The researcher explored the differences and similarities between music education philosophies in

---

[1] Bunnie L. Claxton and Carol L. Dolan, *A Step-by-Step Guide to Writing a Literature Review for Doctoral Research*. (Dubuque, IA: Kendall Hunt, 2022). 13–20.

diverse sociocultural contexts. These critical theoretical and conceptual analyses served as the foundation for the research study, which Burkholder and Cox recommend.[2] The researcher described the theoretical framework before analyzing these music education philosophies from Asia, Europe, and North America.

<div align="center">Theoretical Framework</div>

Literature reviews must begin with an identification of a theoretical framework. The researcher presented fundamental theories, concepts, and constructs so that the primary lens of the topic in the research could be understood. These theories can explain relationships and connections between various ideas which underpin the research study. For this narrative research study on philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts, the theory of social constructivism drove the main story. Music education philosophies are analyzed and added to this leading theory. The research design of narrative inquiry complemented these theories and philosophies, providing direction to the research study.

<div align="center">**Social Constructivism**</div>

Lev Vygotsky initially proposed the concept of social constructivism. Vygotsky focused on learning as a constructive activity with collaboration with different people.[3] When people interact, they construct an understanding of culture and society. Knowledge develops from this procedure. Vygotsky, a well-known psychologist and educator, proposed many theories. He posited the significance of linguistic skills that aid in constructing sociocultural knowledge in contrast with behaviorists who favoured biologically determined cognitive abilities.

---

[2] Gary J. Burkholder, K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J.H Hitchcock. *Research Designs and Methods.* (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020)., 3-13.

[3] R. Van der Veer and J. Valsiner, *Understanding Vygotsky: A Quest for Synthesis.* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell,1991).

This understanding brings to the forefront the mediating effect of other human beings in making information and perception of knowledge. Vygotsky's famous contribution was the zone of proximal development, which refers to a person's ability to reach a higher level of knowledge acquisition, provided the right persons have the right tools and materials surrounding them. Vygotsky's theory differs significantly from Piaget's theory of cognitive development, which proposed that intelligence in children came into being through the rational development of the sensorimotor, pre-operational stage, concrete operational stage, and formal operational stage.[4] Piaget's theory meant that each child would develop intelligence based on a pre-determined teleological program. Vygotsky's concept, on the other hand, posits that intelligence is much more dependent on social interactions and relationships than one realized.

Social constructivism was later used as crucial terminology by Denzin and Lincoln to describe the way people create knowledge from the subjective meanings of their lived experiences.[5] Human beings construct knowledge in a varied and diverse manner. The processes, contexts, and environments become more crucial than facts and data. Qualitative researchers often use this theory for the interpretive social sciences to explain many existing phenomena. Interviews and journals are the primary data collection methods in this current research. As the study utilizes the journal reflections of the researcher to analyze philosophies and psychologies of music education, inferences and conclusions are drawn and constructed to form subjective knowledge. Social constructivism is an effective qualitative paradigm that guides assumptions and beliefs in research.

---

[4] Bunnie L. Claxton and Carol L. Dolan, *A Step-by-Step Guide to Writing a Literature Review for Doctoral Research*. (Dubuque, IA: Kendall Hunt, 2022). 49–66.

[5] N.K Denzin and Y.S. Lincoln, *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*, 2nd ed. (Thousand Oaks, and CA: Sage, 1994).

Social constructivism enables relativism and possibilities to emerge from data collection, which is contrary to positivism and logical positivism; these are concepts related to facts, empirical evidence, rational thinking, and observation and which lead to reductionism in research.[6] The experiences and worldviews of the participants and researchers are unique and individual, and these can form the epistemological foundation of research. The subjective, value-laden, open-to-interpretation nature of phenomena perceived by each human being is considered data to be analyzed. Thus, hypotheses can be proven true or false as constructed by the researcher. Researchers can reveal meaning through reflection in such cases.

Gubba described the differences between social constructivism and positivism in a transparent and salient manner.[7] For constructivists, there are no facts, only probable theories in specific contexts, which can shift from lens to lens. These theories cannot be proven or experimentally tested, and there will always be other possible theories and explanations. Objectivity is impossible in such cases; subjectivity relies on the researcher's and the participants' positionality. Some philosophers even posit that consciousness causes physical reality, emphasizing the mind over the body and the concept of intentionality.[8] For the social constructivist, relativism and subjective interpretation of experiences is the ontological stance. Communication between human beings that is socially dependent can generate epistemological

---

[6] Gary J. Burkholder, K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J.H Hitchcock. *Research Designs and Methods*. (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020).

[7] E. Guba, *The Paradigm Dialog*, (Newbury Park, and CA: SAGE, 1990).

[8] W. Harman, *A Re-Examination of the Metaphysical Foundations of Modern Science*," (Petaluma, CA: Institute of Noetic Science, 1991).

data. Therefore, knowledge hinges on interactions, which can be unpredictable but are a rich source of information for hermeneutic and interpretive efforts in research.[9]

Narrative Inquiry

The theoretical framework is tightly related to the research design. Narrative inquiry is the research design that forms the foundation of this social constructivist approach. Clandinin and Connelly describe the way personal experiences and stories are analyzed. The researcher interprets their history through narrative and also dissects the construction of that narrative. Artifacts such as journals, letters, biographies, and interviews aid the structure of this narrative. These are the field texts for the research. The researcher coded narrative blocks, determined themes and significant epiphanies or turning points and events, and divided these blocks.[10] The researcher derived nested story structure themes from these blocks. For example, the researcher extracts themes from the narrative block of Malaysian music education. Then, these themes were analysed further for detailed codes. Notably, this process is deductive, unlike the inductive methods of forming themes from codes that other research designs like ethnography and phenomenology entail. After elaborating on these themes and codes, the researcher compared all themes and codes of different narrative blocks. Then, the researcher constructed a general narrative from the narrative blocks of different participants.

There are many types of narrative research, such as a biographical study of a third party (specific experiences), an autoethnography (studying one's own experiences), life history (the

---

[9] M. Crotty, *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and Perspective in the Research Process*, (Thousand Oaks, and CA: SAGE, 1998).

[10] D.J. Clandinin and F.M. Connelly, *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research*, (San Francisco, and CA: Jossey Bass, 2000).

entire life of one individual), and oral history (producing a narrative from various stories).[11]

Narrative research is the most fluid form and is less linear than other research designs. The

emphasis is on the sequence and potential chronology. The temporality of past, present, places,

and situations becomes very important. Stauffer highlighted the significance of place as location,

position, status indicator, and dimension, which is relevant to time and space.[12] The place

describes the being in the world that provides characters with boundaries, identity, and

interconnectedness in the specific web of society. The place is not just physical but metaphorical

for developing and constructing worldviews, habits, cultural norms, beliefs, and assumptions that

the researcher can dissect. Social constructivism as the theoretical framework can be

strengthened by the philosophy of place and driven by the research design of a narrative inquiry.

This research strived to be place-conscious in identifying music education philosophies and

psychologies.

Summary of Framework

Music education philosophies and psychologies are the researcher's main topics in this

study. The researcher analyzed these philosophies and psychologies based on social

constructivism and narrative inquiry. These are diverse philosophies from Asia, Europe, and

North America. For example, the researcher expounded on the philosophies of Confucius and

Mozi from China, Hume Kant from Europe, and Reimer and Elliott from North America.

Psychological theories include ideas from Maslow, Gardner, Piaget, and Bruner. The researcher

detailed these philosophies and psychologies through journal reflections and interviews with

relevant parties.

---

[11] John W. Creswell and Cheryl N. Poth. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. (4th ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

[12] Sandra Stauffer, "Place, Music Education and the Practice and Pedagogy of Philosophy", in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*," ed. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega, (Oxford: New York, 2012), 434-451.

Related Literature

The literature review includes music education philosophies in Asia, Europe, and North America. Also, the literature review contains a study of the psychologies of music education from Europe and North America. A subsequent section details globalization in music education. This literature review provided a comprehensive survey of the philosophies and psychologies of music education in three major continents, which are part of the narrative journey of the researcher.

Philosophies of Music Education from Asia

Philosophies of Music Education consist of philosophies from China, Malaysia, India, Japan, Persia, and West Asia. A section also discussed Latin American influences on Asian music education philosophies. These diverse philosophies are described below.

Philosophies of Music Education from Ancient China

The researcher surveyed music education philosophies from Asia at the start of this literature review, beginning with the narrative research in Malaysia. The most ancient Asian philosophies are philosophies from China, which existed around the same time as the Axial Age of Greece, around the 8th to 3rd century B.C.. The most renowned of the Chinese philosophers is Confucius. Leonard Tan discussed the philosophies of Confucius in his article. Tan emphasized the Confucian tendency to favor mutually dependent concepts rather than dualistic dichotomies that were separate from each other.

Certain Chinese philosophers view the world as subjective and ever-changing in its fluidity. There is an aesthetic synthesis of beauty in nature and art, but reason cannot completely explain or provide comprehension for these phenomena and perceptions.[13] Chinese philosophers

---

[13] Leonard Tan, "On Confucian Metaphysics, the Pragmatist Revolution, and Philosophy of Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 26, no. 1 (2018): 63-81.

view music and art as processual and not grasped as absolute knowledge. The "how" is more important than the "what." As art and music are constantly in flux, the artist and the musician must negotiate the way around these diverse elements.

Tan expounded further on Confucius's ideas on music, aesthetics, and education, which are related to cultivating virtue. As China moved from the age of the warring states to a unified country, many philosophers espoused integrity and character as the highest embodiment of a cultured nation. Confucius and his followers, such as Mencius and Xunzi, were proponents of this philosophy, influencing Chinese and Asian education for many years.[14] Even the Daoists, who had religious connotations in their ideas, such as Zhuangzi, were influenced by these concepts. Ivanhoe describes the models of virtue building from the ideas of these philosophers as acquisition, development, reformation, and knack mastery.[15] He further elaborates on several Chinese philosophies. Confucius emphasized *li* (ceremonies and social protocols), *wen* (civilized behaviors), *dao* (sagacious teachings), *ren* (compassion/empathy), and *yi* (integrity, justice) in his philosophical ideas. Virtue was, as described by Ivanhoe, acquired.[16]

In contrast, Mencius would emphasize the development aspect of virtue by cultivating goodness through a combination of understanding cardinal moral values like *ren, yi, li*, and *Zh*i (wisdom). Xunzi would posit that human nature was evil originally and needs to be reformed by cultivating these virtues. Zhuangzhi would emphasize mastery of various skills (knack-mastery), such as meditation, understanding sacred texts, and physical labor to unify aesthetics and ethics.

---

[14] Tan, "On Confucian Metaphysics, the Pragmatist Revolution, and Philosophy of Music Education," 63-81.

[15] Philip J. Ivanhoe, *Confucian Moral Self Cultivation*. (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 2000).

[16] Ibid.

Tan further references Confucius's texts, the Analects, which contain many references to his music education philosophies.[17] Music is the tool to finalize virtue and character formation in human beings. Music also symbolizes the transcendent perfection that all human beings strive to become. The Chinese character of music has the additional meaning of joy. Tan further expounds on Confucius's stance on music education. Music education represents the desire for students to acquire pleasure in music activities while mastering these skills perfectly. While doing so, music education propagates virtue building, with students becoming disciplined, wise, patient, cooperative, and intuitive.

Park expounds on the philosophy of Mozi, one of the most vocal critics of the Confucian doctrines of philosophy regarding music and music education. His writings against music were not to eradicate the phenomenon of music and its relevant activities but to warn against the dangers of overindulgence in music's pleasures and positive effects. Park elaborated on Mozi's philosophy of music: music is purely for ritualistic, intellectual, and character-building purposes and not for any sensual purposes.[18] Mozi believed music was too irresistible and robust a force to be morally neutral. In such a case, the Confucian way of using music to cultivate virtue is considered easily corruptible and ineffective. Music and music education went against the very ideas of frugality and stoic ideals espoused by Mozi. People could funnel these luxuries and public funds to other enterprises for the good of the community and society. Park emphasizes Mozi's idea that if music were to exist, it cannot be allowed to evoke or arouse any emotions but must be decorative or incidental.[19]

---

[17] Tan, "On Confucian Metaphysics, the Pragmatist Revolution, and Philosophy of Music Education," 63-81.

[18] So-Jeong Park, "Danger of Sound: Mozi's Criticism of Confucian Ritual Music," *The Philosophical Forum* 51, no. 1 (2020): 49-65.

[19] Park, "Mozi's Criticism," 49-65.

Grayling traces the differences between Confucian and legalistic philosophies in the history of China. Despite philosophical ideas from Confucius, who sought to illuminate the people with ideas of moderation, morality, and virtues, there also arose a contradicting force of legalism, such as from the concepts of Han Fei Tzu; this caused the infamous purging of books and culture by the emperor Qin Shi Huang, more commonly known as Shi Huang Di, which led to many Confucian texts to perish.[20] He did this act under the name of unifying China. This act would, unfortunately, be echoed eerily in the 20th century when Maoist officials burnt all intellectual books and cultural products, such as musical instruments, under the guise of equality among all citizens. Music educators and musicians went to prison or labor camps. Grayling concludes that progress in thought and ideas remained behind during those times due to constant repression and suppression from the rulers. He also mentions that once in awhile, in the course of China's history, for example, during the Tang dynasty, the emperors sought to display even-tempered and virtuous qualities, which were exemplary, leading to the flourishing of culture and artistic expressions. In this study, the researcher examined both the positive and negative aspects of Chinese philosophy to provide a balanced perspective on Asian music education philosophies.

Philosophies of Music Education in Malaysia

Historical developments and sociocultural contexts influenced the philosophies of music education in Malaysia. There are no renowned philosophers who espoused Malay philosophies of music, however, there are social commentaries and critiques of the situation in the country. For example, Lockard dissects the practices and mindsets surrounding the development of popular music in Malaysia, from multiculturalism, traditional music, and religious music to

---

[20] A.C. Grayling, *The History of Philosophy.* (Penguin: U.K., 2019).

Western pop influences, which hugely influenced music education.[21] He writes that Malaysia has

an authoritarian government that censors many forms of music art. Thus, the researcher can trace

the political nature of music through a survey of the development of popular music in Malaysia.

Lockard also discusses the heterogeneous nature of music genres and activities inherent

in the country, which reflects the country's multicultural history. For example, there are

traditional rituals and dances of Malay (*joget, wayang kulit, dangdut*), Chinese, Indian (*irama*

Hindustan), and Aboriginal music (*asli, ghazal*) that originated from the various racial groups

that reside in Malaysia.[22] Music education has religious underpinnings due to a growing

influence of Muslim music practices like *dakwah* (missionary), *nasyid* (chanted poetry), *dikir*

barat (rhythmic chants of Islamic verses), and *boria* (choral singing). Integration of music and

drama in *Bangsawan* plays resulted from syncretization and assimilation of traditional and

Western musical genres.[23]

According to Lockard, Malaysian music education philosophies have an amalgamation of

various cultural influences, from Islamic ideas to Western popular music. Music education and

informal music practices originated from religious or commercial avenues are connected. Thus,

many music teachers relied on verbal or aural transmission to impart their knowledge rather than

rely on musical notation or theory. Although there were no grand theories on music education

philosophies, many versatile musicians emerged from Malaysia, combining cultural influences in

---

[21] Craig A. Lockard, "Popular Music and Politics in Modern Southeast Asia: A Comparative Analysis," *Asian Music* 27, no. 2 (1996): 149–99.

[22] Ibid.

[23] Ibid.

their music. For example, Lockard dissected the life of musician P. Ramlee, who successfully fused popular music genres with traditional Malay music for palatable music to all generations.[24]

Lockard further describes the music scene in Malaysia. As Britain formerly colonized Malaysia, there are no official state or federal organizations for music education. The government has ties with the British Music Examination Boards and the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM). This board entails a syllabus with grades from beginner to diploma levels for many types of instruments. Public and private schools have optional music classes, which are not mandatory. Therefore, students who want to learn music often go for private lessons. Lockard describes that Malaysia hosts many examination boards due to this reason, as they still need an official curriculum for school students. For example, the syllabus includes the Trinity College London UK, Yamaha Music Japan, Australian Music Examination Syllabus (AMEB), Australian New Zealand Music Exams (ANZCA), and the Rockschool U.K. syllabus.[25] Private teachers also used the Dalcroze, Suzuki, Orff, and Kodaly methods for group lessons. However, the RCM (Royal Conservatory of Music from Canada) syllabus is absent. These syllabuses are for Western instruments in classical, jazz, pop, and rock genres.

Lockard also mentiones the presence of examination syllabuses from China, focusing on ethnic Chinese instruments, which also exist in Malaysia. These exams cater to the guzheng (stringed zither), erhu (two-stringed bow instrument), and many other instruments. Due to the diversity present in the country, Indian performing Arts and Malay performing Arts genres are also present at some private institutions, usually in tandem with traditional dance and theater. Lockard also describes this fusion of many cultures in Malaysia. For example, the ABRSM

---

[24] Lockard, "Popular Music and Politics in Modern Southeast Asia," 149-99.

[25] Ibid.

system from the United Kingdom entails knowledge of musical notation and theory. Assessment goals and learning outcomes are a heritage of British culture. Chinese philosophies also have a significant influence on Malaysian music education. Wang describes the general philosophical concepts and ideas related to music in China, which spread to Southeast Asia. For example, the views of assimilation and regulation of virtues (the main goals of music-making in China).

Even according to the Chinese language, there are three categories of sounds. For example, *Sheng* is utterances, *yin* patterns with meaning, and *Yue* is transcendent morality from digesting these patterns. These were related to *li* (conscientious propriety) and *ho* (unified perfection of mind and body).[26] Specifically, the Guqin, a seven-string zither, could enable ethical behavior. Practicing this instrument could rectify mindsets and ward off evil. The practice environment, states of mind, and body significantly influence these effects. Malaysian Chinese also believe in the rules of "Feng-shui," which are ideas about energy, positioning, and spatial orientations. Also mentioned by Lockard, traditional Malay music education in Malaysia was based heavily on aural and rote learning.[27] Like many indigenous art forms, music was part of rituals and religious ceremonies. Animism was the main religion, and later, the Chinese and Indian people brought Buddhism and Hinduism to the country. Then, the Portuguese, Dutch, and British arrived with Christianity and Western culture. These led to a variety of music genres in Malaysia.

Simon describes Southeast Asia as home to many religious philosophies influencing all sociocultural activities, from music education to linguistics. For example, Buddhism, Hinduism, Islam, and Christianity are the main influences of culture. Gongs originated from oriental

---

[26] Yuhwen Wang, "Cultivating Virtuous Character: The Chinese Traditional Perspective of Music Education," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 263-267.

[27] Lockard, "Popular Music and Politics in Modern Southeast Asia," 149-99.

religions like Buddhism and Hinduism, lending all music-making activities a grand and otherworldly demeanor.[28] Simon also describes aerophone and bowed instruments, similar to their Western orchestral counterparts but made of different materials, thus having different sonorities, ranges, and tone colors. He also goes into detail about the many temples like Borobodur, which contained carvings of instruments that reflect music's magical and supernatural nature. Later, when Islam arrived, the idea of *adat* (Islamic traditions) resulted in gamelan and dance traditions that would last centuries.[29] He also described that religion and ritual became a vital component of music-making, influencing music education in the region. Animistic beliefs continued to persist through the ages, with music activities focused on the spiritual facet of all living things, assuming that all material objects contained souls and life sources. Many people then used music in ceremonies to invoke spirits and appease the gods.

Philosophy of Music from India

According to Phillips, Indian music education and the concept of *gurukulavasa*, which is a form of rote learning, are connected.[30] Demonstration, imitation, and observation form an integral component of learning. Phillips also elaborates on terms relevant to Indian music. The Indian word for sound, *sabda*, is a complex word with many philosophical meanings. For example, the *sabda* triggers the phenomenon of existence. Phillips discusses the practices of Indian classical performing arts tradition as well. The musician and audience will traverse together toward the Paramatma or the divine; music is thus a perfect integration of emotion from

---

[28] Artur Simon, "Southeast Asia: Musical Syncretism and Cultural Identity," *Fontes Artis Musicae* 57, no. 1 (2010): 23–34.

[29] Ibid.

[30] Norman Phillips, "Music Education in Asian Schools," *Music Educators Journal* 51, no. 4 (1965): 164–67.

the soul and the ambiance of nature. Also, the sacred texts of Sanskrit, the Veda, identify God as consisting of sounds. Therefore, the universe is full of sound.

Rejimon elaborates that music-making embodies the divine through the individual to merge with nature. Through music, manifestation creates reality as it is and liberates the soul from the trappings of the body. Mind, body, and soul are in harmony without dominating the other. He traced the idea of music as a meditative mantra to connect with spiritual forces and nature, which continues to permeate the philosophy of music education in India. Melody and rhythm unite as science and art through the raga, a series of notes that trigger emotional states similar to the baroque affects.[31]

Philosophy of Music Education from Japan

Imada traces the philosophy of music education in Japan extensively. Japan is well known for its music education system, which fused Western traditions with traditional ideals for modernization. According to Imada, music in Japan initially did not contain any semantic or semiotic connotations. The grain or sound had a form of emptiness or nothingness.[32] Music is empty or consists of ambient sounds. This concept is similar to semiotician Roland Barthes's idea of the grain, in which this sound signified nothing in particular, only something ambiguous. This idea contrasts with the fixed semiotic sign designated in Western classical music, in which music contains meaning and indicates something else, such as emotion, literary characters, and drama. Imada also compares the idea of grain to praxial views that music is what he called "musicking," only that the grain is harmonious, natural, and part of nature.

---

[31] P.K. Rejimon, "Philosophical Foundations of Indian Music," *International Journal of Innovative Studies in Sociology and Humanities* 3 no.1 (2018).

[32] Tadahiko Imada, "The Grain of the Music: Does Music Education "mean" Something in Japan?" in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 147-161.

In contrast, North American praxial views are much more action-oriented. Imada also compares the grain to European philosopher Spinoza's idea of integrating mind and body in the eye of God or nature in Japanese culture. Imada also corresponds the grain to the concept of "new objectivity" by Hartlaub, in which sounds only exist in themselves without any subjective references or subjective content such as emotions.[33]

Imada also provides many parallels between Japanese music and Western music. For example, subjective expressions of music in Western music are metaphorically like cultivated gardens. In contrast, with its ambient ambiguity, original Japanese music can be compared metaphorically to natural phenomena in the forest or nature. When subjective emotions are sought to be expressed, the fingers become flattered, and they start to create sounds that symbolize something else or acquire semantic and semiotic significances. Imada mentions that traditional Japanese music emphasizes noise and musical sounds interchangeably. These sounds have no metaphors, references, or representations: they exist as they are. At the same time, the emphasis on the instrument or body that creates the sound is aligned with its most natural state to mimic the environment. Music performance has no meaning, but performers produce sounds objectively, and listeners perceive these sounds as they are in their unique sociocultural contexts.[34] Expression of emotion is entirely foreign to pre-modern Japanese music.

Imada then traces the development of music education philosophies in Japan. When the Meiji Restoration Government came up with a committee for music education, director Izawa, with American music educator Mason, designed a series of music textbooks. This event started

---

[33] Imada, "*The Grain of Music*," 147-161

[34] Ibid.

the process of Westernization in music education in Japan.[35] As Japan encountered imperialistic forces from the West, they decided to implement Western music in the course of study, which created an ambivalence toward music expression versus music as neutral sounds. Imada noted that music education philosophies had the integral idea that music was a study subject for mastery and unlocking achievements. This concept is very similar to utilitarian philosophies that promoted music education as a means to raise levels of scientific and technological accomplishments. The idea of emotions and willpower in music expression was entirely antithetical to traditional Japanese musical culture. It resulted in a separation of musicians from general society and an alienation of identity.

In modern times, opposing forces characterize Japanese music philosophies. Many non-Western countries still experience this phenomenon to this day. Imada highlights the merging of Japanese ideologies, which espouse neutrality in sounds, and Western philosophies, which espouse meaning, emotion, and will to sound patterns and shapes, creating a dynamic music education system that thrives from its contradictory natures. Until today, the ambivalence between traditional Japanese values and the meanings of Western music still exists. This ambivalence is quite normal in many countries, with citizens having a sense of multiple identities merging into a modern or postmodern citizenship.

Famous music education systems from Japan are related to Western notation and theory, with the added pedagogical ideas of aural training, improvisation, and imitation. Hermann writes extensively on Suzuki, a music education specialist who devised a music method based on language learning of mother tongues. As Suzuki traveled to Germany to study music when he was young, this method is a prime example of educational transfer from one country to another.

---

[35] Imada, "*The Grain of Music*," 147-161

Hermann traces the idea that parents and teachers must create an environment where students can learn music from their surroundings; listening, repetitive practice, and encouraging instructions form the foundation of the Suzuki music education system.[36] Suzuki's philosophy of music education differed from the traditional Japanese philosophy of transmissive teaching and was more similar to Western ideals of child-centered approaches. The saturation of music in the environment formed a crucial tenet of Suzuki's philosophy of music education. Learning by ear is favored over theoretical knowledge initially, somewhat similar to avoidance of grammar in language learning for mother tongue learners.

Another renowned music education system from Japan is Yamaha. Anzis writes that Yamaha music courses were devised in the 1950s in Japan under Gen'ichi Kawakami.[37] Yamaha did not only want to manufacture pianos, but he wanted a comprehensive and fun curriculum. The non-profit Yamaha Music Foundation (YMF) was founded in 1966 to promote music education worldwide. The Yamaha music system emphasized improvisation, keyboard harmony, composition, and listening skills. Group lessons are an integral part of the curriculum. The fixed-do and solfege systems are part of the syllabus. Aural skills are highly prized, and technique and note-reading are in the later sections of the curriculum.

Latin-American Influence on Asian Music Education Philosophies

The significant influences of China, India, and Japan on music education philosophies are apparent in the literature. Also, the syncretization of Western music genres is quite evident in many Asian countries. Less obvious is the influence of Latin-American genres in Asian countries. Rodriguez traces the development of music education philosophies in Latin America. He

---

[36] Evelyn Hermann, *Shinichi Suzuki: The Man and his Philosophy*, (Warner Brothers Publications, 1981).

[37] Kathy Anzis, "Yamaha Music Education System: Celebrating 50 Years of Growth," *American Music Teacher* (August 1, 2005).

analyzes research from Estrada, mentioning that theory, philosophy, aesthetics, and humanities are not considered essential subjects in Mexico. Specifically in music, academia is limited to historical chronicles, and he notes that there needs to be more critique and reflection on musical practices and pedagogical methods. This trend in Latin American countries would affect some Southeast Asian countries due to colonization.[38]

Specifically, Latin-American music education has become known in the Phillippines due to its historical ties with Spain and Latin American countries. Singing and dancing were integrated with music education in many countries, as music was a massive part of rites, religious festivities, and social events. Entertainment is also a considerable part of music-making activities, with less emphasis on serious art music. Rodriguez concludes that music education philosophies were more geared toward producing musicians who could support society's cultural activities and entertain when needed.[39] Like Mexico, the Philippines was a former colony of Spanish conquistadors. Thus, the process of acculturalization and merging of various musical styles caused a drastic transformation in the processes of music education. Evangelization also had a huge role in disseminating Western music. Consequently, the music education systems in the Philippines strongly focus on performance and composition. However, the focus on philosophical reflection and research in music education would benefit from improvement.

Philosophies of Music Education from Persia and West Asia

---

[38] Luis Alfonso Estrada and Julio Estrada, "Music and Institutions in Mexico," in *La Musica en Mexico.* (Mexico: Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico, 1984), 79-113.

[39] Luis Alfonso Estrada Rodriguez, "Education in Latin American Schools: A Philosophical Perspective," in the *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education,* ed. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 231-247.

Like many traditional art music practices, Persian music was conceived for an intimate court and not for public consumption. Naqvi expounds on Persian art music practices and the philosophies underpinning these practices. For example, the subtlety of microtonal changes indicated a rich spectrum of aural sensations that only the elite could understand and appreciate. The voice, specifically, with its yodeling and portamento-like quality, would yield much material for composers. The repertoire, termed *radif*, is performed by the *Ostad* and their apprentices, who study this music through observation, imitation, and memorization.[40] The theory is optional, but intuitive understanding is significant.

Naqvi also explains that this philosophy of music and music education favored freedom and spontaneity, although the *radif* has tonal ranges named *dastgah*, a range of tonal improvisation. These connected sequences are similar to jazz improvisations with the adlibitum sections.[41] Thus, interweaving related yet dissimilar motifs results in constant reinvention and freshness in performances. Through this performance practice, artistic interpretations of great subtlety and intimacy can appear. This practice indicated a hierarchy of values slightly different from Western classical music's notation-based system. The richness of the *gusheh*, microtones inside this scope, through interweaving is an essential element of Persian art music.[42] Naqvi elaborates that this performance practice represents an integral part of Persian culture, such as in the pattern weaving of carpets and crafts. Persian music did not separate notation from performance. Thus, Persian music education emphasizes transmitting the creative aspect of music-making over a stale theoretical regurgitation of notational values and indication. Naqvi also explained that this philosophy ensures that music does not become mired in mere academia

---

[40] Erum Naqvi, "Teaching Practices in Persian Art Music," in the *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education,* ed. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 180-191.

[41] Ibid.

[42] Ibid.

or polished pretentiousness. The emphasis on the spur-of-the-moment creation of new materials engenders an ever-fluid and renewable philosophical outlook for musicians and educators.

Nettl also traces the Persian art music tradition from ancient times, such as the Sassanian dynasty in the third century A.D. He analyzes the courtly nature of this music, which people revered for its complexity and sophistication. The royal nobility and aristocrats would contemplate this art music in a secluded, intimate setting, symbolizing their status and power. The monophonic quality of the music lends a meditative and subtle character to the sound produced. This art music would differ from the mainstream music of the populace.[43]

Summary: Philosophies of Music Education from Asia

Asia is a large continent with several different countries. This literature review attempts to cover the most significant music education philosophies from China, Japan, India, Malaysia, and Southeast Asia. West Asian and Persian music education philosophies were also briefly surveyed. The researcher will touc. Examining teaching practices in these contexts can bring hidden assumptions, worldviews, and beliefs to light. Asian music education philosophies are wide and varied, from emphasizing virtue-building in music education and the concept of emptiness in music to focusing on improvisation or rote learning.

Philosophies of Music Education from Europe

Philosophies of European music education include doctrines from Ancient Greece, the Middle Ages, the Enlightenment and Romantic era, and modern European philosophies. Sections on ethics, music education philosophies, and music education methods from Europe are included. These diverse ideas are described below.

---

[43] Bruno Nettl, "Classical Music in Tehran: The Process of Change," in *Eight Musical Cultures,* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1978), 146-185.

Philosophies of Music Education from Ancient Greece

Ancient Greece produced many renowned philosophers; chief among these is the renowned teacher Plato. His ideas and musings on music and music education have influenced European philosophies for many ages. Bartels reviews some of Plato's key ideas and his biography. She notes that Plato's academy and corresponding curriculum, which he founded during his lifetime, was famed for generating critical thinkers and scholars.[44] She highlights his best-known philosophical idea: the allegory of the cave. Human beings are akin to being tied up in a cave facing darkness. We must be led to the open skies and released from our metaphorical blindfolds. Music educators have to assist their students in perceiving ideals that they should strive for.

Bartels also emphasizes Plato's idea that philosophers should be wise and just rulers, with the philosopher-king striving to acquire fixed universal ideals and transcendent knowledge.[45] Before achieving this true wisdom and understanding, the philosopher-king has to immerse himself in studying mathematics, logic, astronomy, geometry, and music. For Plato, mastery of music was not only about understanding the harmonious combination of sounds but also involved knowledge of acoustics and harmonics. Music was akin to science: one would understand dialectics in nature and all phenomena with critical study. The word Plato used interchangeably for music was harmonics, which referred to the production of sounds that create sensitive reactions when perceived by humans.

Bartels also compares Plato's writings in music education philosophy to those of other philosophers. Like Confucian philosophies of music, Plato advocated music education to form

---

[44] Daniela Bartels, "Review of *Why Music? The Foundations of Music Education from Plato Until Today* by Øivind Varkøy," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 27, no. 2 (2019): 224-229.

[45] Ibid.

human character. However, Plato diverged from Confucius because Plato believed in the absolute censorship of music, categorizing certain music as immoral and others as moral. Plato also believed in the formation of taste and culture in music, which would highly influence the ideas of enlightenment and classicism in aesthetics later in the nineteenth century. Contrary to how Beethoven would later state that music is a higher revelation than all wisdom or philosophy, Plato believed philosophy was the highest form of intellectual knowledge.[46] Music education triggered students' emotional, academic, and spiritual growth.

Bartels also discusses another renowned philosopher from Ancient Greece: Aristotle, Plato's chief student. However, Aristotle carved a name for himself through his systematic classification of knowledge and his moderate tone on ideas such as thought and action. Well known for his peripatetic school with diverse curricula to cater to different students, Aristotle viewed knowledge as changeable and in flux. In a way, Aristotle favored the empirical and sensory evidence that provided an epistemological foundation for specific facts rather than the rationalistic and already extant version of knowledge that does not need proof. Bartels emphasizes the concept of teleology, where all objects and living beings unfold or move toward a specifically determinate path or development to fulfill their purposes. This concept provided Aristotle's ideas with a practical yet logical philosophical foundation. Bartels clarified Aristotle's views on music, such as the idea that music was both for enjoyment and intellectual stimulation. Aristotle also moved away from Plato's strict ideas on music, although he still agreed with the character-building ethical nature of music education.[47] He disdained virtuosic instrumental displays and propagated general musicianship among all young people. In tandem with vocal

---

[46] Bartels, "Review of *Why Music*?" 224-229.

[47] Bartels, "Review of *Why Music*?" 224-229.

training and understanding of rhythm and movement, early childhood training in music was Aristotle's other significant idea on music education.

Apart from Plato and Aristotle, Bartels discusses the philosopher Pythagoras, another ancient Greek philosopher who produced many key ideas on music and music education. He was quite eccentric in his beliefs, such as espousing the view of metempsychosis, the transmigration of souls through music. Music would serve as the medium of purification for this process.[48] Thus, music acquired a mystical and otherworldly nature; music education would have a religious connotation. Like Plato, Pythagoras thought music, harmonics, arithmancy, geometry, and mathematics were related, and his experiments on vibrations are still influential in scientific circles up to the present day. As he adjusted the variables of length, tension, and thickness of the resonating string, he hypothesized that heavenly bodies produced music when they moved through their circuits. Almost similar to quantum physicists of modern times, Pythagoras theorized that the invention of appropriate instruments would assist in perceiving these sounds. Pythagoras spearheaded the movement that music and science were related, and he attempted to divide consonant intervals in music into calculable ratios. Later, in the Renaissance, these ideas would lead to the emergence of the golden ratio and a deeper understanding of symmetry. Musical tuning of instruments was to become a burgeoning field as well. For example, Baroque instrumentalists would create an equal temperament tuning system from Pythagoras's knowledge of intervals. This system, in turn, would influence J.S Bach to compose his 48 Prelude and Fugues in 12 major and minor keys, serving as a foundation for Western classical music that would develop into its modern and postmodern version in this time. As can be inferred from Bartel's review, Pythagoras's philosophy of music and music education would involve ideas

---

[48] Ibid.

from mathematics, acoustics, and mysticism. Music education should be balanced, multidimensional, and conscious of the unseen and magical. This fusion of music and physics would stir the imaginations of many musicians, scientists, philosophers, and music educators for generations.

Philosophies of Music Education from the Middle Ages

Apart from the ancient Greek philosophers, quite a few philosophers from the Middle Ages wrote about music and music education. For example, Chua writes about the philosopher St. Augustine, who mused about the pleasurable nature of rhythmic equality in music. The existence of such perfection was, for him, evidence of God's intervention in music. The sensual nature of music provided clues to the presence of higher supernatural wisdom and theological confirmation for holiness and godliness. At the same time, Chua wrote that St. Augustine warned others about the corruptible nature of music, similar to the downfall of the archangel Lucifer, the angel of music.[49] Music education has to be rational and practical, according to Augustine, with steps to teach musical understanding in students' minds. Music educators conduct their sessions under controlled circumstances rather than laboratory experiments.

Another famous philosopher from the Middle Ages was Boethius. He wrote many treatises on music and music education. Simplicity and elegance in the expression of music were the main goals of music activities. Thram traces his ideas and life in her article entitled "Understanding Music's Therapeutic Efficacy: Implications for Music Education." Boethius created the quadrivium, curricula comprising music, astronomy, mathematics, and geometry;

---

[49] Daniel K.L. Chua, "Together in Harmony," *U.S. Catholic* 86, no. 4 (2021): 16-19.

theology and philosophy would complement this curriculum.[50] Thram also compares Boethius to Pythagoras of ancient Greece: both philosophers emphasized music's sensual and calculative side, advocating for integrating intellect and sensory pleasure in music education. Thram also expounded on the life and writings of Hildegard of Bingen, another medieval writerwho believed in the magical properties of the four elements of fire, earth, water, and air. These elements had their distinctive tones of celestial harmonies, which could invoke spiritual unity in human beings.[51] Her philosophy of music and music education incorporated the healing powers of music. Music students were not just masters of emotions; they were agents of healing, according to her. Therefore, music education served as a medium to train musicians who could holistically influence others. These ideas would influence music education in a music therapeutical direction, emphasizing the medicinal nature of music.

Thram also discusses another philosopher, Marsilio Ficino, who viewed music as the glue between the human soul and the soul of the universe. His theological ideas would influence both science and philosophy in the Middle Ages. His authoritative book, the *Three Books of Life*, contains texts and songs almost like magical chants but related to Christian theology and Platonic philosophies.[52] Music education was said to be an elixir of life, engendering the soul and spirit toward a nurturing state of flow. Music would aid human beings in restoring health and youth through the affectation of nerves. Music education can thus influence human beings' motor activity and imaginative faculties.

Philosophies of Music Education from the Enlightenment and the Romantic Era

---

[50] Diane Thram, "Understanding Music's Therapeutic Efficacy: Implications for Music Education," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 192-200.

[51] Ibid.

[52] Diane Thram, "Understanding Music," 192-200.

After the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, which saw a flourishing of knowledge and the arts, music education philosophies would become the focus of many Enlightenment writers. For example, Voorhees traces the influence of Rousseau on music education philosophies. Rousseau wrote many articles on politics, philosophy, and music. Melody was the most significant aspect of music as it had communicative powers and the ability to touch emotions, while harmony was mere decorative soundwaves that were calculable with physics. He even compared the relationship between melody and harmony to the political relationship between the persuasive power of the general united voice and the population's will to each voice.[53] Music education would engender the unification of political representatives into a coherent unit for the greater good.

Voorhees also explains that persuasion and agreement are essential for language development. Language was the medium that facilitated the understanding of music. It had melodic qualities similar to music, which aided the expressiveness and communicability of the words and phrases. Rousseau's vision of freedom consisted of the spontaneity of language and musical expression. Self-interest and dependence on each other cause tension between humans, which humans must overcome to enable freedom of emotional expression. Music's emotional power and language's capacity to mimic this quality meant that human beings could emphasize the social connections between human beings. Praxialists and pragmatists would later develop the idea of the social nature of music activities. Music educators would serve as quasi law-givers in connecting humans to music by combining taste in language and music.[54]

---

[53] Matthew Voorhees, "Melodic Communities: Music and Freedom in Rousseau's Political Thought," *History of Political Thought* 32 no.4 (2011): 617-644.

[54] Voorhees, "Melodic Communities," 617-644.

Barnes expounds on the philosophies of Immanuel Kant in his article. Considered one of Europe's most famous classical philosophers, Immanuel Kant proposed a philosophy of music that would free music and art from preconceived biases. Music and music education, he affirmed, are neutral and disinterested activities. One should have an observer's lens, needing to be more engaged. Taste in music was seen as misleading, as it could turn into dogma in appreciating different genres.[55] Barnes traces Kant's idea that the perception of art that is aesthetically pleasing may not be good art. In this way, music educators guide students to understand diverse musical genres and allow them to perceive and judge them. When the approach is disinterested, the perception of the work of art in its true nature emerges. The organization of sound, notational symbols, sensory perception, and intellectual processing of music have to be critical and constantly evaluated by reason and logic. Longyear also mentions in his review of Schiller's relationship with music that Schiller also had similar ideas emphasizing the intellectual nature of music. Schiller favored education in literature and philosophy over music education. Longyear also traces Schillers' notion that theory and analysis of music were essential components of music education.[56] Schiller distrusted the senses and felt that all musical works were autonomous works.

Anderson writes extensively about Eduard Hanslick, an Austrian music critic and scholar who would also propagate the emphasis on structure and expressive purity of absolute music over program music. Hanslick believed that the perception of music was a rational activity, and he dismissed extra-musical symbols, imaginative ideas, and emotions in music as nonsense.[57]

_____

[55] Adrian Darnell Barnes, "A Philosophy of Music Education according to Kant," *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 51, no. 2 (2017): 33-39.

[56] R.M. Longyear, *Schiller and Music*, (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1966)

[57] Robert Michael Anderson, "Polemics or Philosophy? Musical Pathology in Eduard Hanslick's "Vom Musikalisch-Schönen," *The Musical Times* 154, no. 1924 (2013): 65-76.

For example, Hanslick disparaged Liszt and Wagner, who attempted to dramatize music through grand operas, free rhapsodies, and picturesque titles relevant to literature and art. Pederson would trace the way Hanslick's philosophy would influence the idea of formalism in music.[58] Music possessed autonomy and did not refer to anything outside itself: itwas an intrinsic object containing aesthetic qualities. Hanslick would champion the idea of art for art's sake.[59] The most well-read book by Hanslick is *On the Musically Beautiful*, and Beard and Gloag stated that Hanslick described music as mere "tonally moving forms."[60]

As a music critic, Hanslick was conservative. He championed instrumental music in its purity, abhorring the excessive expressions of music from the Romantic period. Many critics dismissed forms such as tone poems, symphonic dramas, and operas as unauthentic music. At the same time, he could not entirely eradicate the possibility that music could represent poetry, emotion, or nature. No matter how he tried to objectify music, music as a phenomenon was ungraspable and subjective in interpretation. He could not deny the existence of hermeneutics of music as a legitimate study, which meant there were variances in interpretations when it came to music; this fact opened the door for many other philosophers to posit their philosophies of music education, which were rooted in the expressive nature of music and the ability of music to evoke images and emotions. A century later, modernism and postmodernism would lead many philosophers to support Hanslick's view. For example, Elliott brought up the fact that Suzanne Langer had proposed a theory that music was just a cognitive experience and not an emotional process in his review of music's emotional experience. The audience was hearing the traces of

---

[58] Sanna Pederson, Nicole Grimes, Siobhán Donovan and Wolfgang Marx, "Rethinking Hanslick: Music, Formalism, and Expression," *Journal of Musicological Research* 34 no.2 (2015): 164-166.

[59] David Beard and Kenneth Gloag eds., *Musicology: The Key Concepts* (New York: Routledge,2016)

[60] Ibid.

inner shapes and connections between sounds.[61] This anti-emotional stance toward music would objectify and alienate it from human perceptual and emotional responses. Both Hanslick and Langer would treat music as a static object.

Elliott further expounds on other philosophers about music education and music's emotional experiences. For example, he traced the ideas of G.W.F. Hegel, another German philosopher who would agree with Hanslick's philosophy. Still, Hegel would posit that music has two facets: an autonomous, self-sufficient one and a symbolic representation of music, such as emotion and feelings. Self-sufficient music did not refer to anything but possessed its beauty and meaning. This categorization of music extolled the independent nature of the work.[62] Aesthetics in music refer to the intrinsic and inherent qualities and not to any transcendent or extra-musical qualities. When the audience listens to music, they perceive a movement, flow, and gesture through time; this process is aesthetical contemplation. Hegel proposed the idea of thesis, antithesis, and synthesis, a fresh reimagining of Plato's dialectic. Thus, these two facets of self-sufficient music and symbolic representation of music would form music as a holistic unit. His story, *The Lord and Bondsman*, illustrates the struggles that teachers face to gain recognition, being in a role that emphasizes servitude and ethics.

Tate provides a concise account of Leo Tolstoy's philosophy of music education, which influenced many musicians and composers. Tolstoy was a Russian author who emphasized music education's humanistic and moralistic aspects that could educate society at all levels.[63] He

---

[61] David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, "Rethinking Philosophy: Reviewing Musical-Emotional Experiences," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 49.

[62] Ibid.

[63] Nicholas Tate, "The Case Against the Arts from Plato to Tolstoy and its Implications for Why and How the Arts Should be Taught in Schools," *Educational Review* 68, no.1 (2016): 24-39.

demonstrated his philosophical and psychological ideas through his literary works, such as *Anna Karenina* and *War and Peace*. In his article, "What is art?", Tolstoy expounded on the role of music as a tool for developing a moral approach to life. Many of his ideas came from Christian ethics and Platonic ideals, with the absolute moralistic life being the goal of each human being. Tate also compared Tolstoy's ideas to Aristotle's on moderation, such as the doctrine of the mean, and that, in Tate's words, "happiness came from the activity of the soul in accord with perfect virtue."[64]

Tate would also compare Tolstoy's ideas to Christian ethics, duty or deontology, consequence or utilitarianism, and motive ethics. Leo Tolstoy's philosophy was said to be colored by these concepts. Duty ethics refers to the goodness of a person who fulfills his duty. In contrast, consequence ethics refers to the person's integrity if the effects of his actions are favorable for many. Motivist ethics would refer to the goodness of a person if his motives were pure, even if the efforts did not reflect this.[65] Tolstoy emphasized the responsibility of art and music to assist humans in arriving at enlightenment. Tate emphasizes Tolstoy's idea that art and music had to cause society to become more righteous and less evil. Music had the duty to sharpen the minds of human beings and sensitize them toward God and nature. Music and art also should represent the egalitarian universality of the human experience. In this way, Tolstoy did not believe that art and music were isolated esoteric processes but should be understood by all and accessible to the general members of society. Art and music were not exclusive but universal; this would be deemed great art when many appreciate it.

---

[64] Ibid.

[65] Tate, "The Case Against the Arts," 24-39.

Rawson expounds on the philosopher Steiner's Waldorf school system, a significant milestone for developing education and music education. This school system had the philosophy that each student needed a unique path toward holistic learning. The ecological formation of spirituality is an essential element of this system. All assessments would be designed uniquely for each student.[66] Rawson emphasized that these Steiner assessments would be more formative or flexible than quantitative or summative. Music education must be individually tailored for each student, meaning Steiner did not recommend group music classes.

White brings to the foreground another well-known European philosopher, Schopenhauer, who also expressed seminal ideas on music education. As Schopenhauer posited, our phenomenal world was not an authentic reality: music and art were instruments that assisted us in transcending our limitations and perceiving the noumenal world as it were. When we experience flow in music, we encounter bliss, and flow reveals the authentic metaphysical world or the will.[67] White further traces Schopenhauers's idea that music education would involve teaching students to become sensitive to perceiving these supernatural aspects of music. Through music activities, students should encounter something intangible and not part of the ordinary world. Teachers are like spiritual guides that bring illumination to their students.

Lynch discusses the contributions of Goethe, a German author renowned in literature who wrote saliently about music education philosophies.[68] Music education is related to social rules. That would mean the customs and etiquette of polite society should regulate music.

---

[66] Martyn Rawson, "Spirituality and Subjectivity in Waldorf (Steiner) Education: A Postmodern Bildung Perspective," *International Journal of Children's Spirituality* 26, No.1-2 (2021): 24-43.

[67] Richard White, "Schopenhauer, the Philosophy of Music, and the Wisdom of Classical Indian Philosophy," *Sophia* 60, no. 4 (2021): 899–915.

[68] Andrew Lynch, "Last Minstrels: Medievalism, Emotion and Poetic Performance in Walter Scott and Goethe," *Postmedieval* 10, no. 4 (12, 2019): 423-38.

Community music activities should still retain an elevated sense of class. Many continental authors and philosophers thought that their music compositions were culturally significant.

Philosophers like David Hume, John Locke, and George Berkeley influenced music education ideas in the United Kingdom and Ireland. Grayling traces the contributions of these philosophers in his writings. For example, one of the main branches of philosophy is epistemology, the theory of knowledge. These philosophers analyzed how one acquires knowledge, the definition of knowledge, and the perception of knowledge from senses or naturally occurring in the mind. Before this, French philosopher Descartes was the leading proponent of rational cognitive-developed knowledge. His ever-quoted line was, "I think. Therefore, I am."[69] In other words, ideas emerge from the mind, which is fixed knowledge. Hume, Locke, and Berkeley would challenge this and many other ideas. Russell provided examples, such as Locke positing that the mind was *tabula rasa* or a blank slate. The construction of knowledge consists of sensory perceptions.[70] Berkeley proposed that objects only exist upon being perceived: if they were not perceptible, they were not authentic, genuine, or accurate. Aligning with religious principles, the ideas in our minds come from God, and our sensory world is illusory.

Grayling elaborates that Hume derided causation and the need to justify everything with reason and effect. He states that our knowledge relates to our habits and customs, which may or may not be valid. For example, a blue object is labeled as blue because other objects we see with a similar shade are termed blue. This skeptical lens resulted in an empirical slant in British music

---

[69] A.C. Grayling, *The History of Philosophy*, (Penguin: U.K., 2019).

[70] Bertrand Russell, *A History of Western Philosophy*, (George Allen and Unwin Ltd: U.K., 1946).

education philosophies. Knowledge needed to be measured and graded with evidence of truthfulness.

Ethics and European Music Education Philosophies

Richmond expounds on ethics and music education philosophies, which European philosophers often discussed.[71] Music education needs a conceptual framework for ethical situations, precisely when conflicts of interest arise. Descriptive ethics originated from different cultures and evolved from anthropology and sociology. Normative ethics are philosophical and moral guidance for prescribing advice. Richmond divides ethical theories into consequential ethics; virtue ethics, in which the act is moral if it is inherently good; duty ethics, or deontology and non-consequential ethics; and ethical relativism. He traces the origin of these concepts in Ancient Greece, which persisted through the Middle Ages and Enlightenment periods in Europe. Consequential Ethics is related to teleology, in which the consequence of the act decides whether the act is moral. Hedonism (pleasurable effects) and utilitarianism (the greatest good of action for the maximum amount of people) are relevant concepts. Perfectionism is another relevant concept. (Moral actions make one perfect.) Aristotle and his ideas of balance and moderation are the earliest philosophers to state these ideas.

Richmond also mentions Mortimer Adler's idea that justice, temperance, prudence, and courage make one moral while balancing individual happiness and the greater good. He also brings up Aristotle's ideas, stating that music education helps to reach ideals of moderation, truth, generosity, empathy, patience, and tenacity. Richmond explains that aesthetics usually has no right or wrong (contemplating music and art). However, when ethics are involved with aesthetics, according to Plato, Aristotle, and Tolstoy, music practices and music education should lead to

---

[71] John W. Richmond, "Ethics and the Philosophy of Music Education," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 30, no. 3 (1996): 3–22.

moral progress in human beings. He also mentioned that the criticism of this theory involves

questioning how one can determine the greatest good. This conclusion is not available

knowledge. Also, choices must often be made immediately, with no time to consider all these

factors. This type of thinking can lead to hive or mob mentality.

Richmond also elaborates on non-consequentials, or deontology, while duty ethics would

be related to Torts, usually infractions of duties, different from outright crimes. The intention of

the acting person determines whether an action is moral. The person needs to be responsible and

proper with activities to be ethical. He compares this to Immanuel Kant's Categorical Imperative,

defined by him as "act always like it will become a universal law."[72] This principle is similar to

the Golden Rule. He also brings up the idea that humans cannot possess pure intentions; all

humans will always have to consider the consequences. Richmond also mentiones that people

cannot be specific about the golden rule, so they can only treat some things equally when they

are.

According to Richmond's division, ethical relativists also consist of the following: ethical

egoists- what is suitable for the individual may not be right for others, but it is acceptable for

them; ethical egotists- they are correct, and everyone else is wrong, moral nihilists- morality is

meaningless; which according to Nietzsche, morality is the invention of the weak to protect

themselves from the strong, and it is better to act on one's desires, and cultural relativists- similar

to the maxim of when in Rome do as the Romans do. Richmond also questions the lack of moral

discourse, which can lead to immorality and anarchy. He traced other emerging ethic theories to

narrative ethics (Christian ethics) and Feminist ethics (caring/nurturing ethics).

---

[72] Richmond, "Ethics and the Philosophy of Music Education," 3-22.

Other concepts that Richmond dissects are reflective equilibrium, rule utilitarianism, and neo-Kantianism, which involve moral sensitivity (awareness, disposition, empathy), rationality, and moral theory (principles) based on intuition (hunches).[73] Richmond also expounds on ideas from the classical Enlightenment period. For example, Kantian Philosophy states that everyone is equal in moral worth. Jefferson's U.S. Declaration of Independence has a similar idea, too, that all men are created equal; he also mentions respect as an essential factor. Implications for music education are that music education should be inclusive and change should be part of a natural process in pedagogical practices. Also, moral theory informs daily and immediate split-second choices, keeping the exploitation of others at bay, which blind allegiance to doctrine or utilitarianism cannot achieve. Reflection of consequences is an integral part of ethics and social and collective activity to maintain moral balance. Richmond also notes that the critical difference between ethics and advocacy/law is that the latter involves vested interests, coercion of parties, and blind following of written precepts. To promote awareness of ethics in music education, one must regularly converse with others about this topic, introduce the topic of ethics in music education to all teachers, introduce this topic in textbooks, and create ethics committees that can discuss these issues, such as in the field of medicine-discussing euthanasia, abortion, invasive surgeries. Issues and conflicts of interest for music education would be the scarcity of resources leading to competition in music education and the clash of different parties' needs.

Modern European Philosophies of Music Education and Methods

European philosophies of music education developed during the modern era as well. For example, Ross Shields elaborates on Ludwig Wittgenstein's ideas. Wittgenstein wrote about the analogy of the "gramophone." The sounds and the score had a dichotomous relationship, picture

---

[73] Richmond, "Ethics and the Philosophy of Music Education," 3-22.

versus vibrational waves.[74] Music was like a code that musicians needed to decipher for communication. This process was similar to linguistic techniques. The idea of a cryptographic sublime meant that music could contain many levels of interpretation and hermeneutic analysis. This concept is almost identical to the theosophical idea that only self exists, and our reality is part of our self, which we must keep digging into for interpretation. Language, thought, pictures and the world are concepts relevant to music and literature. Shields elaborates on how these concepts represent how humans interact with music and literature, highlighting that Wittgenstein was ambiguous. For example, language could refer to music or literature. These concepts were logical yet unbelievable as well. In this manner, teachers and students had to work closely together for music processes to be effective and connected. Drastic, critical, and gnostic readings of music referred to different approaches. For example, drastic readings would mean no distinction between performer, work, and unique performance; gnostic readings would refer to the specific performance details in work, and critical would mean interpretation of the score.[75] As can be inferred, a drastic music reading was rare and artistically desired. Therefore, Shields concluded that music education should move beyond gnostic and critical music readings and toward drastic readings.

     Closer to the postmodern era, Kanellopoulos dissects Derrida's philosophies about music education. He brought up Derrida's proposition that music was fluid and interactional, requiring participation and intertextual engagement. Accordingly, every belief, assumption, and opinion

---

[74] Ross Shields, "Nonsense, Wherein There is Method by Ludwig Wittgenstein (Review)," *The Germanic Review: Literature, Culture, Theory* 93, no. 4 (2018): 394-413.

[75] Shields, "Nonsense," 394-413.

must be validated, reevaluated, and deconstructed.[76] Authority and music should not become

inextricably linked, and the music score has multiple layers of meanings and performance

possibilities. Derrida challenged the typical values of music education, proposing that music

education should become more neo-liberal, non-expectational, and relevant to issues of mastery

and knowledge. Knowledge is changeable, and mastery of specific techniques means deleting

other methods. In this way, his philosophy of music education is akin to an avant-garde artwork

or music work without any preconceived theoretical foundation derived from history. Derrida's

ideas of temporality, such as unpredictability, slow-ability, immeasurability, anticipation,

uncertainty, and surprise, would serve as theoretical points of departure for artistic conceptions.[77]

The defamiliarization of well-known traditions was the springboard for originality and creativity

in music and the arts. Therefore, music education needs to disrupt or rupture the normative

approaches toward instrumental learning and focus on avant-garde methods of performances and

compositional strategies. Musicians have blank slates to reveal their true selves when the notions

of good and bad art undergo deconstruction, with conventions discarded.

Lilja and Vinthagen discusses that modern philosopher Foucault mirrored Hegel's ideas

in his writings on power. They write that music educators would need to tend to the individual

needs of students, communities, and the societal context, enabling them to gain recognition and

self-actualization in music. Power, Foucault affirms, consists of a few types: sovereign,

disciplinary, and biopower, or control over populations through charisma or manipulation. Music

---

[76] Panagiotis A. Kanellopoulos, "Knowledge-Power, Mastery-Institution: Rethinking Some Music Education Certainties Through Reflections on Hegel, Foucault, Rancière, and Derrida," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 1 (2016): 3-7.

[77] Ibid.

educators may need to rely on disciplinary power over students.[78] Lilja and Vinthagen emphasize that teachers can guide students toward standards of proper practice in music activities. Teachers can also prevent students from engaging in counter-conducts or subversive practices. Music is dependent on the strength and power of communal relationships; sovereign power, however, is not appropriate as it requires absolute control from the teacher. In such cases, students have no say and may revolt or rebel. Biopower entails too many machinations and potential counter-cultures from students, so teachers should rely on something other than this.

Beard and Kenneth also discuss that Theodor Adorno would echo Hegel's ideas on critical theory related to the Frankfurt school in his writings. The identity of a musical work and the autonomous nature of the work are connected. The more it could form its identity without extra-musical semiotic symbols, the greater the music or art.[79] Beard and Kenneth trace Karl Marx's ideas about music education. Marx was a well-known philosopher and writer. Although Karl Marx did not extensively write about music education, researchers utilize his dialectical materialism theory to analyze epistemology and culture in music education. Abramo also traces the relationship between Marxian ideas and music practices. When society's economy undergoes dematerialization, and mental ideas and cultural artifacts become more critical than commodities, music performances, production, and compositions become rarer.[80] Corresponding with the concepts of Marx, the economy would be the "base" on which cultural activities like the arts and music form a foundation, termed the "superstructure." Through this influence, streaming on the Internet of Events replaces live performances, and online credit transfers replace cashier

---

[78] Mona Lilja and Stellan Vinthagen, "Sovereign power, Disciplinary Power and Biopower: Resisting What Power with What Resistance?" *Journal of Political Power* no. 7 (2014).

[79] Beard and Kenneth, *Musicology.*

[80] Joseph Michael Abramo, "Whence Culture and Epistemology? Dialectical Materialism and Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 29, no. 2 (2021): 155-173.

transactions. The potential of virtual music learning creates a massive market for large

corporations to mobilize the masses. The average teacher and student must understand this

development to survive, and this situation marginalizes the average student and teacher. Abramo

recommends mastering intellectual symbols and simulacrums of politics, sociology, and culture

to be competitive in the market.[81] In music education, music theory and technology become

necessary skills.

At the turn of the century, three dominant music education systems influenced music

education philosophies in Europe: the Kodaly method, the Dalcroze method, and the Orff-

Schulwerk approach. Dunbar traces the biography and ideas of the composer Zoltan Kodaly from

Hungary. He was the composer who created and devised the method that bears his name..

Kodaly noticed that school children could not sing in tune, causing him to become devoted to

research in music education curricula. He worked with Jeno Adam in implementing reform in

Hungarian schools till the government recognized his efforts and revolutionized music education

methods in the country. Dunbar elaborates on the philosophical tenets of the Kodaly method,

which includes the following: the usage of linguistic literacy to engender musical literacy,

singing as the foundation of music education with young children, folksongs in the instruction

material like the mother tongue, usage of artistic valuable music, music as a core subject, highly

structured sequences in music curriculum for children, tools like rhythm syllables, and use of

solfege syllables and hand signs.[82]

Marks and Ward-Steinmann also trace the development of the Dalcroze method. Emile

Jaques-Dalcroze was a Swiss music educator who developed the Dalcroze method based on

---

[81] Abramo, "Whence Culture and Epistemology?" 155-173.

[82] Laura Dunbar, "'Triggering' Understanding in a Kodály Present," *General Music Today* 32, no. 2 (January 2019): 40–43.

Eurhythmics or music education through movement. The relation between musical and body rhythm forms the basis of this method, in tandem with solfege, ear training, and improvisation. Internalization of musical sensations of time and energy emerge as they manifest in space. The movement expresses rhythm and harmonious structure. Marks and Ward-Steimann also write that sequential exercises influence the study of scales, modes, intervals, melody, harmony, modulation, counterpoint, and vocal improvisation.[83] The method aids in developing perfect pitch, accurate hearing, refined intonation, alertness, concentration, memory, breathing, postural balance, muscular relaxation, and visual skills. The fixed-do or key of C is the starting point of learning music and the basis for the concept of inner hearing through many listening and singing exercises. Dalcroze's method enables students to develop a sense of balance, coordination, and innate musicality.

Kiser also writes about Orff's ideas in music education. Carl Orff was a German composer who composed in a radical musical-theatrical style. His interest in folksong, 19th century popular music, and medieval music influenced the development of his music education approach. Kiser zooms in on Orff's emphasis on the intricate combination of rhythm, melody, and sonority using ensembles of Instrumentarium, an eclectic variety of diverse instruments.[84] For example, xylophones, glockenspiels, metallophones, drums, cymbals, woodblocks, rattles, viola da gambas, lutes, and recorders were used in the approach in an improvisatory manner with ostinato accompaniment. Kiser mentioned that the Orff-Schulwerk approach differed from a method with textbooks or lesson plans. Creativity was the main guiding philosophy of this

---

[83] Michael L. Marks and Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman, *Contemporary Music Education*, (New York: Schirmer Cengage Learning, 2014).

[84] Donna Crinklaw-Kiser, "Integrating Music with Whole Language through the Orff-Schulwerk Process." *Young Children* 51, no. 5 (1996): 15–21.

approach. The central tenets of the system were the exploration of space, sound, form, imitation to creation, individual to ensemble, and the elemental nature of music involving the body.

Hildegard Froehlich also proposes a philosophy of music education that relates to the "webs of interaction" between community members, a complicated, interwoven network of diverse people, parties, and institutions.[85] Symbolic interactionism strives to clarify the positionality of the self as an extension of others, where meanings, roles, and identities are constantly evolving and reconstructed. All actions and language are symbols and signals for specific purposes. A symbolic community forms when shared meanings, values, and a sense of belonging exist. Froehlich defines community as geopolitical divisions, special interest groups with particular umbrellas of influence, and individuals linked together with a common purpose.[86] The idea of "shared praxis" in music-participatory activities, such as performing or listening, is essential. The relationship between self and society forms the foundation for communities of music practice, which creates similar identities through social practices. The concepts of Gemeinschaft and Gesellschaf, or community and culture are also analyzed. Gemeinschaft focuses on the similarities between human beings that cause them to unite as part of a tight-knit community. At the same time, Gesellschaft consists of multiple communities about each other in the public sphere.[87] Many sociologists say that global neighborhoods resemble Gesellschaft more than Gemeinschaft, as individualism reigns supreme over collectivism. Froehlich further lists challenges for music educators, such as differences of interest in music genres, diverse

_____

[85] Hildegard Froehlich, "Music Education and Community: Reflections on "Webs of Interaction" in School Music," *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education: Refereed Journal of the Mayday Group* 8, No. 1(2009).

[86] Froehlich, "Music Education and Community."

[87] Ibid.

individuals with different backgrounds in a society coming together through compromise, and socioeconomic and class distinctions that can cause further tension between other individuals.

Froehlich also presents the idea of the "empirical self" with every individual's evolving role in different contexts, such as example, father, son, and teacher. Each individual is like a cog in a complex machine that is interrelated to one another. All individuals constantly share their embodied expertise, generating a dynamic societal interaction process. Ways of creating ideal communities of practice include allowing evolution, dialogues between insiders and outsiders with different levels of participation, developing public and private community spaces, creating value, having regular habits but having fresh input at times, and knowing the community's pulse. According to Froehlich, all these correspond with Habermas's theory of communicative action.[88]

Interaction with the community would require transformation and emancipation of ourselves, followed by others. Educators must constantly reflect on teaching practices and the contexts and interrelationships between teachers, students, parents, and other involved parties. Music educators must also consider the materials and musical genres with their social and historical contexts when teaching. Their interactions with the community require sensitivity to multidimensional perspectives, considering the ever-evolving nature of relationships and social practices.

Morton also highlights the fact that modern European philosophy should consider the curriculum in the light of academic rationalism (usefulness of the knowledge), self-actualization (ways it can help the learner achieve their potential), social efficiency (the ways this knowledge contributes to the market economy), and social reconstructionism (the way this knowledge improves the surroundings we live in). Music education can foster associated and sustainable

---

[88] Ibid.

living through critical thinking about the implications on society, politics, ethics, and the environment. Morton discusses these potential influences and interconnected factors.[89]

Walker argues against the postmodern ideals of music, stating that any music is valuable by highlighting the intrinsic qualities of certain music.[90] With proper standards to judge music, accepting music as equally valid can lead to a nihilistic worldview that anything goes and nothing matters because all musical works have the same value. This attitude might lead to indifference in music education, as everything is relative and meaningless regardless. Careful analysis of music genres and interpretations is warranted, although utilizing all types of music in education is still recommended. Propositional knowledge versus acquaintance or dispositional expertise can be essential in highlighting the nature of music education. He suggests that through encounters with music, students learn music rather than just acquiring facts. Listening to music, in particular, leaves psychological traces, like a specter haunting the listener. These "schemata" or "ghosts" can be necessary for the student to experience music.[91] The symbolic process of music is also significant for music education. When random sounds seem like expressive shapes, and these shapes seem like forms, these forms acquire meaning. Thus, the sound transforms into something ethereal, valuable, and personal.

<div align="center">Philosophies of Music Education from North America</div>

Philosophies of music education from North America consist of aesthetic, praxial, and postmodern philosophies. Pragmatism is a central philosophical school as well. A section on the philosophies of North American music education methods is included.

---

[89] Charlene A. Morton, "Music Education for All My Relations," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (Oxford University Press, 2012), 472.

[90] Robert Walker, "Avoiding the Dangers of Postmodern Nihilist Curricula in Music Education," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (Oxford University Press, 2012), 386-400.

[91] Walker, "Avoiding the Dangers of Postmodern Nihilist Curricula in Music Education," 386-400.

Aesthetic Philosophy of Music Education

The divide between aesthetic and praxial schools of thought dominated North American music education philosophies. Apart from these primary schools, pragmatist ideas and utilitarian principles were also highly influential. Bennett Reimer was the leading proponent of the aesthetic philosophy of music education. He wrote that music has its own intrinsic merits, which warrants its position as a main subject in school. Politically, music has a place and deserves careful study by students and teachers, deserving funnels of funds to educate the average person on music's aesthetic qualities and other art forms. Reimer noted that music educators should devise curricula based on great music works with transcendent qualities. Students will be taught how to identify these traits of great music and appreciate this music while denigrating other supposed lower art forms. Reimer also elaborated on the idea that genres of music cannot be treated as equal since historians categorize some works as aesthetically acceptable and pleasurable to the senses. When students receive education, they understand why these musical pieces are better than others, shielding them from the ignorance of the masses. In a way, Reimer's idea of the aesthetic philosophy of music education is akin to constructing an ivory tower where the elite who possess great wisdom may dwell.

Reimer also expounded on knowledge and analysis of this fabulous art and music as music education's primary purpose and justification. Music students receive education to acquire good musical taste and good intellectual judgment of music. Only when they achieve this can they aid the progress of humanity. Reflections on meanings and interpretations of these musical works become the foundation of music education. He introduces the concept of a "music education world," which means that realm of elevated art and music separate from mundane

daily life needs engagement from students and teachers.[92] Reimer's idea is highly contrasting to

the philosophical school of praxialism, which emphasizes the socially embedded nature of music

education. The aesthetic philosophy of music education focuses on understanding the nature of

emotions and the evocation of feelings in musical genres. Symbolism, semiotics, sophisticated

theories, and musical notations are integral to music education.

Reimer further attempts to defend his aesthetic view by juxtaposing the idea of music's

immanence and the singular purpose of music through the experience of the affective self,

contrasting with the sociological nature of music education activities and supplementing the

world with diverse moral or non-musical values.[93] Aesthetic music education emphasizes music

creation through craftsmanship, the sensitivity of choices in music activities, using imagination

to bestow music with significance, and honesty or authenticity in the creative act.[94] Practical

aspects of music activities would also be significant for music education and the social part of

these activities. The aesthetic philosophy of music education also supports music cognition as

something rationalistic rather than being interconnected with others or integrated with an

embodied mind-body unit. Reimer also proposed to extend his philosophy to include an amalgam

of formalism, praxialism, contextualism, and referentialism to form a gesamtphilosophie, a

comprehensive and universal philosophy of music education.[95] That means the dimensions of

---

[92] Bennett Reimer, "Essential and Nonessential Characteristics of Aesthetic Education," in *Seeking the Significance of Music Education: Essays and Reflections.* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2009), 15-40.

[93] Bennett Reimer, "Uncomfortable with Immanence: The Nature and Value of Music and Music Education as Singular or Supplemental," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (Oxford University Press, 2012), 112-120.

[94] Reimer, "Uncomfortable with Immanence,"112-120.

[95] Bennett Reimer, "Should there be a Universal Philosophy of Music Education?" in *Seeking the Significance of Music Education: Essays and Reflections* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2009), 67-88.

"form, practice, reference, and context" are inseparable components of music and music

education, and music educators need to become aware of these aspects. Works of art offer

tangible evidence of the living forms of consciousness itself. Bennett Reimer attempts a

reconciliation of the dualistic elements of musical affect, which he terms "inherent" in the way

music portrays feelings and "delineated" in the way music refers to extramusical ideas or

events.[96] He also theorizes the unification of the self and the Other through comparison,

commensuration, and logical compatibility to help comprehend musical diversity. When music

educators relate to the variety of musical practices available, they also become versatile in their

pedagogical approaches.

Reimer further highlights the importance of research in curricular issues relevant to music

education. He mulled over the paradoxical aspect that humans are alike and yet unique in

different parts, which leads to difficulty in accurate conclusions utilizing quantitative research

methods. He encouraged researchers to employ qualitative methods that consider the subjective,

subconscious, relative, and interconnected qualities that are empirically untraceable but essential

for gathering new knowledge about human activities such as music-making and music-educating,

which will be significant for curricular building and planning.

Bennet Reimer also traced psychological issues in music education in his article "Roots

of Inequity and Injustice: The Challenges for Music Education." He analyzes the roots of these

problems, but first, he expounded on the ubiquity of inequality in nature, seemingly proving that

equity and justice are human constructs; he goes on to posit three levels in which injustice

exists.[97] The individual level is psychopathology. The societal and cultural level pertains to

---

[96] Ibid.

[97] Bennet Reimer, "Roots of Inequity and Injustice: The Challenges for Music Education," *Music Education Research* 9 No.2 (2007): 191-204.

interactions between humans with different beliefs and worldviews, and the universal level

pertains to the corrupt nature of human beings prone to malignant behaviours. He juxtaposed the

universal story of injustice with the contextual and nonessential nature of postmodern thinking,

where everything is relative, and there is no good or evil. He analyses the role of fear, survival,

and security as a precursor for aggressive behaviours. Empathy and nurturing behaviours are

relatively modern constructs that flourished in civilized nations in the distant past. As a constant

throughout history, war and terror prove that peace and stability are antithetical to human nature.

Reimer then brings up academic criticism that music education cannot deal with political

and social issues. He refutes such criticism with reminders of the obligations of music educators

to teach good values to their students, promote ethical values in the community, and disseminate

information on musical knowledge itself. Humility and courage are attributes needed for this

dual role of music educators. The article is credible as it analyses the patterns and trends that

emerge from history pertinent to the dark side of human nature while trying to illuminate insights

on how humans can overcome injustice and inequity. Psychological analysis and practical

recommendations explicitly focusing on music education go hand in hand.[98]

Apart from Bennett Reimer, Leonard Meyer contributed many ideas to the aesthetic

philosophy of music education. Although a proponent of the praxial philosophy, David Elliott

has written extensively on Meyer's thoughts, mainly derived from Meyer's seminal book *Emotion*

and Meaning. Meyer's ideas were congruent with the psychological Gestalt Theory.[99] According

to this theory, the "whole" was more important than the separate "parts." Music was a complete

entity that could symbolize emotion and meaning. Usually, feeling emerges when the fulfillment

---

[98] Reimer, "Roots of Inequity and Injustice," 191-204.

[99] David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, "Rethinking Philosophy, Reviewing Musical-Emotional Experiences," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 37-62.

of desires does not happen. Elliott compares Meyer's ideas to Reimer's philosophy that music was an autonomous aesthetic unit containing intrinsic qualities that an audience could perceive; Meyer further adds the concepts of musical expectation, fulfillment, and inhibition. When a musical composition moves away from conventional patterns of harmony, rhythm, melody, or other parameters, the listener encounters a sense of surprise that arouses emotions and triggers images or cognitive associations in the listener's mind. Elliott also highlighted that Meyer allowed a sense of ambiguity to the listener's feelings, not attributing it directly to the composer's intentions or the music's intrinsic properties. Different listeners will perceive other emotions in the same musical work, and this subjectivity is a valid part of the musical experience.

Pragmatism

Although Meyer's philosophy belongs to the aesthetic school, he was intrigued by the ideas of pragmatist philosophies. Grayling has written extensively on the philosophies of pragmatists. For example, Peirce was known for his theory of semiotics, in which the sign was in a triangular relationship with the significant and the interpretant, or the understanding of the sign, which enabled subjectivity in the perception of the interpretant. Peirce's ideas differed from Saussure's linguistic theory that the sign directly related to the signified. A word would mean something objective, and this had no hidden semantics.[100] Grayling also notes that Meyer was intrigued by Dewey, with his ideas of the fluid ends-in-view and the concept of the consummatory experience.[101] Dewey's pragmatist ideas also influenced the praxial philosophy of music education, emphasizing the role of the perceiver in creating musical meaning in emotions.

Grayling expounds further on Dewey's philosophies. Dewey believed that music education could be the art of life: making sense of one's experience is essential. Rather than

---

[100] A.C. Grayling, *The History of Philosophy.* (Penguin: U.K., 2019)

[101] Ibid.

grasping music as a remote truth or ideal, he focuses on the idea that music can mediate between human practical affairs and universal standards. Thus, participation and social relationships become essential in music-making and music education. When comparing Dewey's with the European aesthetic tradition, Dewey emphasized the social and practical music-making activities more than acquiring refined taste. This philosophy differs from Plato's ideas on attaining absolute ideals in ethics, the aesthetic theories of the good, true, and beautiful, and the self-regulation of perceptual experiences (Askesis). Dewey's ideas are also divergent from modernist aesthetic concepts by Kant and Baumgarten.

Grayling provides more seminal ideas of Dewey's philosophies. Dewey challenged the aesthetic notion that the body, the soul, and the mind were distinct entities. Also, he questioned the idea of aesthetics in the service of reason. He wrote thoughts on many European philosophies such as Baumgarten's idea of aesthetics as sensory cognition; Kant's idea of education as cultivating the mental powers; Schopenhauer's idea that music is the pure expression of the metaphysical will, or the real world of objects, not the world we perceive; and Nietzsche's ideas on music education exemplifying the aesthetic ways of life and living.[102] Dewey was far more down-to-earth and practical, and he treated art and music as embedded in everyday life, like an organism about its environment. Integrating music education's consummatory experience into daily life and part of a sense of transcendent flow is mandated. Dewey described education as recreating beliefs, ideals, hope, happiness, misery, and practices that renew the social group.

Grayling also mentions the influence of Richard Rorty on pragmatism and music education.[103] Pragmatism focuses on the actions and situations related to music education,

---

[102] Grayling, *The History of Philosophy*.

[103] Ibid.

concerning itself with application and practical implementations. Music educators have freedom of choice in methodologies; truth depends on what is effective at a given time. The "what" and "how" are essential and hinge on sociopolitical, historical, and other contexts.

Praxial Philosophy of Music Education

David Elliot is the leading proponent of the praxial philosophy of music education. His philosophy emerged from his musings over the nature and significance of music education; he wrote many articles on this philosophy. Elliott values critical thinking and reflection on experiences. Theory and practice are interdependent, and the nature and values of music and education form an integral part of this philosophy. "Musicing" is a term given to music-making in its socially embedded form, whereas praxis refers to music-making as a communal and multidimensional act. Educative teaching is the movement of knowledge among human beings in the environment. Praxialism is also related to multiculturalism, inclusiveness, postmodernism, decolonization, and critical theories that emphasize non-oppression, emancipation, and intersubjective interactions.[104] Elliott's philosophy can be differentiated from common advocacy slogans through his stance on empirical evidence to justify the value and existence of music education. Advocacy efforts usually depend on strategic marketing tools or lean on the secondary effects of music education to justify music education.

Elliott writes that the praxial philosophy of music education strives to transform the lives of teachers and students through reflection and methods with solid ethical foundations: thinking, doing, and creating are activities combined in music education. Praxis's holistic and embodied

---

[104] David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, "Rethinking Philosophy, Reviewing Musical-Emotional Experiences," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 37-62.

nature is essential, with participation and communication being significant tenets of the philosophy. Socializing and relationships become primary reasons for musical activities, similar to Dewey's pragmatic concept of the organic nature of music education.[105] Music education is thus a field that emphasizes the integration of people, processes, products, and contexts.

Elliott also emphasizes that listening to music will allow one to form interconnected dimensions of meaning- "affective, interpretive, structural, expressional, representational, social, ideological and personal meanings."[106] This sense of "listenership" is considered one of the foundations of music education. Performances are a way of productive musical engagement as they are action-oriented, in contrast to listening, which is a wise contemplation of music. Elliott's conception of the processual, experiential, embodied nature of performances also forms the basis of the praxial philosophy of music education. Music education should be mindful of doing: involving the cerebral, affective, and conative. It should not be just action without thought or ungrounded theory. He further elaborates that music education has to be flexible in integrating the theoretical, practical, and productive processes in their socially embedded contexts, which means that the human factor is essential. When considering the diversity of musical practices and the pluralism of musical genres, issues of representation, authenticity, and social contexts are significant.

Elliott in *Music Matters* has provided a comprehensive overview of the universality of music educational curriculum and competencies. He highlighted the difference between music and education as two different social practices requiring different kinds of practical experience, informed cognitive-affective intuitions, interpersonal sensitivities, and metacognitive

---

[105] David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015) 24-53.

[106] David J. Elliott, *Praxial Music Education: Reflections and Dialogues*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005) 3-18.

knowledge.[107] Both mind and heart must be involved in the habits and strategies involved in music educational contexts. Elliott criticizes the neo-liberal agenda of treating education, and music education by proxy, as a market-driven activity to supply human capital for the workplace, not considering the unique individual, emotional, and social aspects of teaching and music education. Elliott also expounds on the "reflective musical practicums" as an integral part of the music education curriculum. He mentions the following seven decision points: the kinds of music-making to pursue, the relevant musical practices and challenges involved, the musicianship and listenership components needed, the teaching-learning goals and strategies, the sequences, and the assessments involved.[108]

Elliott's critical analysis of music education's technical-rational and structure-of-the-discipline style can help all music educational institutions revolutionize their instructional approaches.[109] This idea would shift the worldview that music education is abstract and autonomous, neatly packaged for each learner, to a worldview that considers music education's social and situational nature. The multicultural curriculum is also an issue addressed by Elliott. He subdivides how the multicultural curriculum consists of assimilationist, amalgamationist, open society, insular, modified, and dynamic strategies, with the dynamic method being the best way forward.

Although Elliott was a proponent of the praxial school of music education, which valued music's social and participatory nature over its aesthetic qualities, he still wrote some seminal ideas on emotions and music. Elliott, whose concept of flow in music is significant, much like Dewey's idea of consummatory experience, mentions eleven processes that influence the

---

[107] Elliott and Silverman, *Music Matters,* 107-152.

[108] Elliott and Silverman, *Music Matters*, 423-451.

[109] Ibid.

musical-emotional experience.[110] The first is brain stem reflexes, which are innate processes in the brain. Secondly, there is rhythmic entrainment; this refers to how humans synchronize to the beat of music. The third, evaluative conditioning, refers to using stimuli that arouse human emotion. Emotional contagion, the fourth process, relies on mirror neurons that map the expressed sentiments of an outsider in our brain. Associations and expectancy are the fifth and sixth processes, respectively. When the brain associates certain music with certain emotions or expects something from the turn of musical events, then humans experience emotions in music. Labeling feelings can help the brain understand emotions in music. Cognitive monitoring is the seventh process. Visual interactions and corporeality are the eighth and ninth processes. Music can generate images and a sense of movement. Music can also express drama and a feeling of narrative, the tenth process of musical-emotional experience. Lastly, the purpose of social bonding between different people relates to musical-emotional incidents.

Regelski, another proponent of praxialism, analyses several philosophical ideas about education and music education. Through the shift from aesthetic and utilitarian to the praxial philosophy of music education, the undesirable qualities of idealism (music education is about acquiring universal knowledge), realism (perception of music education through the senses), neo-scholasticism (knowledge for knowledge's sake) and perennialism (education should be uniform) is avoidable.[111] Positive qualities from pragmatism (music education is experiential) and progressivism (music education enables the unique self-actualization of each student) can then be incorporated.

---

[110] Elliott and Silverman, *Music Matters*, 423-451

[111] Thomas A. Regelski, "Curriculum: Implications of Aesthetic versus Praxial Philosophies" in *Praxial Music Education: Reflections and Dialogues* by David J. Elliott, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005) 219-248.

North American Music Education Methods

The Manhattan Music Curriculum Program (MMCP), Comprehensive Musicianship Program (CMP), and Gordon's learning theory for aural skills originated in North America. Walker describes the philosophies of the Manhattan Music Curriculum Program (MMCP). The MMCP aims to enhance students' creativity and expressive powers to engage in musical discovery. It started as a sequential music program from primary to high school; the program strives to bridge the gap between the teacher's classroom style and the student's learning style. Spiral curricula that met the needs of students with objectives assisted teachers in their efforts. Sequences of musical concepts allowed students to synthesize knowledge in a flexible environment. Walker also stated that interaction in music and sensitivity to musical elements and materials are the central philosophical tenets of the MMCP. He traces five phases of the MMCP: free exploration, guided exploration, exploratory improvisation, planned improvisation, and reinforcement.[112] MMCP encourages children to listen to sounds and create their sounds, form compositions in melody and rhythm and learn about cycles of pitch, rhythm, form, dynamics, and timbre. Aural skills, performances, and theory are also equally emphasized.

Burton provides a general account of the Comprehensive Musicianship Program (CMP) with the setting in Hawaii. CMP is a program that emphasizes the interdisciplinary nature of music education. The program strives to serve all music degree students regardless of specialization. Conceptual knowledge and technical skills are included in the program to communicate the content of music, knowledge of all musical studies goes through a synthesized process. Burton also notes that the program aims to relate to contemporary thought and practices of former times. Students should expect an evolving and open-ended curriculum relevant to their

---

[112] Robert Walker, "Innovation in the Music Classroom: The Manhattanville Music Curriculum Project. *Psychology of Music* 12, No. 1 (1984): 25-33.

profession. Burton describes the curriculum as a spiral based on tone, rhythm, melody, harmony, form, tonality, and texture. The curriculum consists of a taxonomy of concepts from general to specific and straightforward to complex. He also mentions the following five zones: general music studies, performance with reading and writing music, selection of major, ensemble, theory, and music literature. The "common elements approach" was used to analyze structural elements of music in any culture and style.[113] Exploration of the properties of sound and their expressive qualities or frequency, duration, intensity, timbre in a horizontal and vertical organization is significant. Burton also emphasizes the roles of listener, performer, and composer in the MMCP.

Marks and Ward-Steinmann also elaborate on Gordon's Music Learning Theory, which originated in North America. This theory traces the process of learning music to the development of audiation. It is not a pedagogical method but a philosophy or psychology of the music learning process, which can aid teachers in their efforts. There are a few types and stages of audiation, or the ability to hear and comprehend music when sounds are not physically present. For example, the phases consist of audiating tonal and rhythmic patterns (rather than individual pitch names, time-value names), language in words, not letters, or logographic language (Chinese), where one character represents a word/idea. Marks and Ward-Steinmann noted that through this theory, music is learned ideally in sequential order of tonal and rhythmic patterns. The eight types of audiation are listening, reading, writing from dictation, recalling from memory, writing from memory, creating/improvising music, reading/creating music, and writing/creating music.[114] The stages of audiation are retention, imitating and audiating tonal and rhythm patterns, establishing

---

[113] Leon Burton, "Comprehensive Musicianship-The Hawaii Music Curriculum Project," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 16, no. 1(2010): 67-76.

[114] Michael L. Marks and Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman. *Contemporary Music Education*. (New York: Schirmer Cengage Learning, 2014).

objective/subjective tonality and meter, retaining in audiation organized tonal/rhythmic patterns, and recalling and anticipating them.

Postmodern Philosophies of Music Education

Postmodern music education philosophies focus on transformation in the thought processes involved in music education. These are similar to the modern European philosophies of Foucault and Derrida, who wrote about hierarchies, power, deconstruction, and language. Zangwill describes that in North America, postmodern philosophies involve radical theories from feminism, critical theory, critical race theory, queer theory, and disability theories. These philosophies assist marginalized individuals to become emancipated and integrate well into society. Issues like hegemony, alienation, decolonization, oppression, and imperialism are relevant to postmodern philosophies. Race, class, and gender as constructs become unstable in definition. Equity is the primary goal of such doctrines.

In music education, this translates to being inclusive of diverse genres of music. These critical theories help philosophers to become balanced in their perspectives. Zangwill focuses in on Susan McClary, who wrote extensively on music and gender, questioning if music could indicate gender.[115] He also notes how McClary dissects gender stereotypes and characteristics. Undoubtedly, there is a political undertone to all postmodern philosophies.

Deborah Bradley also questions epistemological colonialism in music education.[116] She traced the idea of Western music versus the newly emerging world music genre. Issues like appropriation, binary constructions, inequalities, market forces, diverse assumptions and values,

---

[115] Nick Zangwill, "Friends Reunited: Susan McClary and Musical Formalism." *The Musical Times* 155, no. 1929 (2014): 63-69.

[116] Deborah Bradley, "Good for What, Good For Whom? Decolonizing Music Education Philosophies," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, ed. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 409-433.

social change, and cultural politics are analysed. Critical pedagogy and conscientization enable music educators to be active agents in preventing oppression and inequalities. Empowerment, dialogue, and student voices are essential parts of this process.

<p style="text-align:center">Psychologies of Music Education</p>

Psychologies of music education are interrelated with philosophies of music education. Tan, Pfordrescher, and Harre describe the psychologies of music education as leaning more toward the mental processes and behaviours involved in music education. In contrast, philosophies of education are more concerned with studying the nature of knowledge, being, values, assumptions, and beliefs. They also note that psychology is an interdisciplinary field intersecting with education, social psychology, cultural psychology, and neurobiology. Therefore, music education psychology can encompass knowledge of how music is picked up and understood by sensory systems, cognition and perception, acquisition of musical expertise (the development and education), and use of music in the world (social psychology).[117] Tan, Pfordrescher, and Harre trace the many areas of research, from cognitive psychology (development of melodic processing, singing, children's representations of music) to cognitive-developmental psychology (retention of music and aesthetic sensitivity), behavioral psychology (motivation, affect, classroom music learning), development psychology (exploration of relations between formal and intuitive musical understanding, composition, improvisation, and assessment techniques. Psychology was a field that burgeoned in Europe and North America around the modern era. The following sections survey some seminal ideas of renowned psychologists.

Psychologies of Music Education from Europe

---

[117] Siu-Lan Tan, Peter Pfordresher and Rom Harré, *Psychology of Music: From Sound to Significance.* (New York: Psychology Press, 2010).

Lev Vygotsky was an influential psychologist from the former Soviet Union. He was involved in many child psychology research efforts and developed a complex theory to explain culture and history. Mastnak and Toropova trace his most well-known psychological hypothesis, which relates to the social nature of the mind. Cognition does not emerge naturally like behaviorists or cognitivist apologists describe it but, according to Vygostky, relates to the interactive and social environment of the child through language. The interconnected nature of knowledge requires mediators, and a child always possesses a zone of proximal development that careful education can cultivate. Mastnak and Toropova also noted that apart from standard learning methodologies, Vygotsky encouraged education to incorporate creativity and playfulness. He also contrasts the human mind with the animal conditional mind, which depends on conditional reflexes. History, culture, social experiences, and consciousness influence the human mind. Education should integrate social aspects of a child and biological traits as well.[118]

Mastnak and Toropova also expound on Vygotsky's idea that speech consists of inner speech for mental reasoning, private speech or self-talk that diminishes with age, and external speech for conversations and dialogues with others. Challenges and meaningful activities trigger educative development in children. The result of higher-order mental processes happens through contact with other people. Although children are born with elementary cognitive functions like attention, sensation, perception, and memory, scaffolding and intersubjectivity with other knowledgeable people engender mastery and understanding of complex intellectual tasks or theories.[119] Reciprocity of the child with other children and adults entails more understanding of knowledge and contexts. Mastnak and Toropova note that Vygtosky's theory has implications

---

[118] W. Mastnak, W. and A. Toropova, "Experiencing Music as the Basis of the Effectiveness of Music Therapy," *Journal of Russian and East European Psychology* 55, no. 1 (2018): 1–14.

[119] Mastnak and Toropova, "Experiencing Music as the Basis of the Effectiveness of Music Therapy," 1–14.

for music education and therapy, emphasizing language and socialization as tools for constructing knowledge.

Jean Piaget was another well-known psychologist from Europe who was famed for his theories of childhood intellectual development. Larsen and Boody elaborate on how Piaget was interested in how children thought and not the contents of their thoughts: the thought processes were more important than the contents of the mind. He keenly believed in observation to trace essential conclusions for further experiments. Larsen and Boody also provided an account of Piaget's hypotheses. He proposed a few stages of intellectual development in children. First, children develop their sensory-motor processes; there then is a preparatory period and a concrete operational setting where the formation of fundamental skills to create thought patterns happens. Reaching the age of about eleven to fifteen, they have a formal grasp of cognitive tasks. Implications for music education include concrete steps, and the children will need a supply of data.[120] This structured style facilitates effective pedagogical transmission. For example, when teaching composition, students can start constructing one melody. Then, the next step is to create a phrase, and so on. Recognition of repetition and contrast in aural perception is also crucial for music education.

Larsen and Boody also highlight Piaget's theory of schemata, which has its roots in Immanuel Kant. This theory consists of mental structures that help humans process the environment. Behavioral, symbolic, and operational schemata are how minds process behaviors, signs, and mental activities.[121] Piaget and the child-centered education movement are related, placing each child's unique needs at the forefront of pedagogical methods. Larsen and Boody

---

[120] Ronald L. Larsen and Charles G. Boody. "Some Implications for Music Education in the Work of Jean Piaget," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 19, no. 1 (1971): 35–50.

[121] Larsen and Boody. "Some Implications for Music Education in the Work of Jean Piaget," 35–50.

also note that some parties criticized Piaget's cognitive behavioristic theories as being too structured and not considering the social and constructivist nature of learning. At the same time, the stages of operation were considered great frames of reference for many educators.

Sigmund Freud was a pioneer of psychoanalysis; Esman expounds on his famous ideas, such as Freudian slips, dream interpretations, ego, superego, and the id. He notes Freud's uneasiness about the uncontrollable influence that music could have on humans, similar to many philosophers of the past. Specifically, Freud was appalled by Richard Wagner's grand approach to music, which he felt was irresponsible and manic.[122] Esman elaborated that music could sway emotions, contrasting with Freud's cognitive structural dissection of the psyche. Freud's psychoanalysis theories led to psychodynamic ideas on conscious and unconscious motivations. Human beings have natural-born instincts that influence their emotions and, subsequently, their decisions. Therefore, any irrational force that can affect human beings, like music, must be carefully regulated or applied.

Some of his disciples and other psychologists influenced by him had a greater interest in music. For example, Pratt expounds on Theodor Reik's utilization of Freud's idea of the suppressed subconscious to explain that motivic materials could represent repressed emotions or desires.[123] Associations in music were essential ways that music could reveal the indescribable and inexpressible. Smethurst highlights the contributions of Jacques Lacan, who posited the idea of the drive and mirror stage in the development of human will, which explained how cognition and human desires developed.[124] Music and architecture were similar because they had inherent

_____

[122] Aaron H. Esman, "Freud and Music," *The American Journal of Psychiatry* 152, no. 12 (1995): 1835.

[123] Carroll C. Pratt, "Review of 'The Haunting Melody; Psychoanalytic Experiences in Life and Music, by T. Reik,'" *Notes 11* no. 2 (1954): 308–310.

[124] Reilly Smethurst, "Say No to Lacanian Musicology: A Review of Misnomers," *International Journal of Zizek Studies* 11 no.3 (2017), 249-270.

structures needed to hold up complex constructions. Smethurst also notes that onomatopoeia in music was a powerful way of communicating the divine supernaturality of music.

Hancock traces the theories of Carl Jung, a friend of Freud influenced by his psychoanalytical ideas. Jung proposed more elements of the psyche, such as archetypes, anima, persona, shadow, and synchronicity, which can be helpful for pedagogical efforts. Hancock highlights Jung's idea of the transcendent function as a way to facilitate the mediation between conscious and unconscious, which has significant implications for education in music, arts, and dance.[125] The arts serve as a cathartic release of pent-up emotions and unexpressed parts of our psyche that might have experienced trauma or emotional disturbances. Clarifying the affected experiential feelings and the understanding that comes from awareness of the subconscious can be an integral part of arts and music expression. Therefore, Hancock concludes that music educators should assist in this process. Non-judgment, kindness, and obliteration of critical attention would produce a sense of flow conducive to musical expression and healing of the soul.

Hancock elaborates further on Jung's ideas that the transformation of motifs in music was symbolic of the unconscious changes in the human psyche. Subjective responses to these changes participate in an inner dialogue in our subconscious, which individuals may or may not be aware of.[126] The more sensitive a temperament toward music one possesses, the more one may comprehend this inner dialogue. Actively expressing these fantastical dialogues is more artistic and cathartic than passively releasing them in the form of dreams. Hancock noted that Jung's recognition of the spiritual dimension and the diversity of human personality, which can

---

[125] Pamela D. Hancock, "Re-Embodied by the Rhythm: A Jungian Understanding of a Woman's Experience of Birth Trauma and its Transformation through a Spiritual Dance Practice," *American Journal of Dance Therapy* 43, no. 2 (12, 2021): 157-66.

[126] Hancock, "Re-Embodied by the Rhythm," 157-66.

be conflicting and complex, has significant implications for music education. Music educators must avoid generalizing and stereotyping their methodologies, as each human being has various facets that can emerge and manifest themselves at any time.

Other influential psychological theories from Europe include Erik Erikson's psychosocial development theory, ecological systems theory by Urie Bronfenbrenner, and Mihalyi Csikszentmihalyi's concept of flow. Erik Erikson developed a complex psychological theory comprising eight psychosocial development stages.[127] The first stage of infancy, from birth to one year of age, involves building trust to meet basic needs like food and love. The second stage of early childhood, from one to three years of age, consists of building more autonomy or willpower and recognizing shame and doubt. Children become more and more independent as they move through the stages. The third stage, from three to six years of age, involves developing a sense of initiative and purpose. The fourth stage is the schooling years, from age seven to eleven. Competence and confidence grow in this stage. The fifth stage comprises adolescents ages twelve to eighteen, focused on identity construction.

The sixth, seventh, and eighth stages are adulthood, with early adulthood (19-29), middle ages (30-64), and elderly (65 onward) being the categorization markers. As a young adult, intimacy and isolation can be significant. Reaching middle age, stagnation, contribution to society, generativity, and family creation can be significant issues. Advanced age brings potential wisdom or despair as human beings assess the meanings of their lives.[128] Erikson noted that this psychosocial theory relates to instruction for diverse age groups in music education.

---

[127] Erik Erikson, *Childhood and Society*, (New York: Norton, 1950).

[128] Erikson, *Childhood and Society*.

Completion of each stage involves achieving various virtues or acquiring relevant personality traits.

Parker and Powell expound on Urie Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory in their research study. Bronfenbrenner's approach consists of concentric circles surrounding the self, such as the microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, and macrosystem.[129] Molar activities are meaningful experiences within the microsystem, and the mesosystem consists of interconnections and relationships. Exosystems and macrosystems are governing policies or other external factors that influence people. Parker and Powell were explicitly interested in the phenomenological nature of his theory, in how contexts and environments exist in each individual's perception. These circles will keep evolving in a chronosystem. For example, a beginner musician developing into an intermediate musician will involve many changes in all these concentric circles. The microsystem of family and siblings may shift to apply a microsystem of music teachers and peers; the self may transform from an unconfident novice to someone who has mastered musical elements. The mesosystem may include more different relationships. The exosystem may fit the music school rules and regulations, and the macrosystem may change to fit the music performance policies of the state or country.

Mihalyi Csikszentmihalyi's theory of flow and creation of positive psychology have influenced music education seminally. Csikszentmihalyi provides a brief account of his theories in a conversation with Beard. Flow involves challenges balance, action-awareness merging, clear goals, unambiguous feedback, concentration on the task at hand, sense of control, loss of self-

---

[129] Elizabeth Cassidy Parker and Sean R. Powell, "A Phenomenological Study of Music Education Majors' Identity in Methods Courses Their Areas of Focus," *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 201 (2014): 23–41.

consciousness, transformation of time, and autotelic experience.[130] Engagement and intrinsic

motivation for musicians result in a sense of creativity. Transformation of time to an

understanding that music is just unfolding can be an empowering experience for musicians.

Csikszentmihalyi elaborates that music educators must continuously attempt to bring their

students into a state of flow when they learn to perform, compose, or improvise. This

transcendent state is similar to Dewey's description of the consummatory experience in music-

making and learning. When one continuously feels a state of flow, this can help construct a

positive mindset and a solid philosophical foundation for music education.

Psychologies of Music Education from North America

Abraham Maslow was one of the more iconoclastic psychologists from North America

who contributed to the psychology of music education and wrote extensively on his theories on

the psychologies of music education. Maslow was concerned that acquiring external skills or

knowledge overshadowed the intrinsic humanistic purpose of education in general. He was also

worried that associated learning would result in Pavlovian conditioning in which humans could

only perform specific skills by cue and had no real purpose. At the same time, he also loathed

education as a pure means to an end. He felt that music could help humans discover their true

identity and develop their full expressive and communicative potential. He emphasized that

human beings had higher needs that needed to be fulfilled, rather than just physical and

emotional. Music education should deal with the spiritual and mental aspects of students

---

[130] Karen Stansberry Beard and Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi, "Theoretically Speaking: An Interview with Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi on Flow Theory Development and its Usefulness in Addressing Contemporary Challenges in Education," *Educational Psychology Review* 27, no. 2 (2015): 353-364.

regularly. His ideas of cognition of being, the hierarchy of needs, and peak or plateau experiences attempt to link these spiritual and mental aspects to music education.[131]

Maslow emphasizes the present functioning human, which possesses high worth, without any reference to the past. Personal growth and happiness are the ultimate goals of each human being. His self-actualization concept was contrary to Freudian determinism through biological background, and he listed many qualities he deemed necessary for self-actualization. For example, honesty, goodness, beauty, wholeness, perfection, justice, playfulness, effortlessness, and simplicity are essential.[132] Education and music education aim to help students achieve these qualities as much as they can through the pedagogical processes.

Howard Gardner is famed for his psychological theory of multiple intelligences. He elaborated in an interview that Bloom's taxonomy influenced his approach. This taxonomy influenced educational psychology seminally; Gardner compared his approach to Bloom's, which consists of remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating, and creating. Gardner would divide intelligence into specific areas of mastery. These areas were visual-spatial, linguistic-verbal, logical-mathematical, body-kinesthetic, musical, interpersonal (social), intrapersonal (self-reflection and awareness), naturalistic (understanding nature), and existential (philosophical or religious).[133] All human beings have a combination of these skills. As an educator and music educator, one must be aware of these differences to be effective.

_____

[131] Abraham H. Maslow, "Music Education and Peak Experience," *Music Educators Journal* 54, no. 6 (1968): 72-171.

[132] Abraham H. Maslow, *The Farther Reaches of Human Nature*. (Arkana, 1993): 128.

[133] "A Conversation with Howard Gardner," *Art Education* 72 no.3 (2019): 55-58.

There have also been many attempts by other psychologists to divide skills into categories. Marks and Ward-Steinmann expound on several such categorizations. For example, Philip Phenix divided realms of meaning such as symbolics (language/math), empirics (science), esthetics (music, art), synnoetics (personal knowledge), ethics (morals), and synoptics (history, religion). Elliot Eisner divided knowledge into aesthetic, scientific, interpersonal, intuition, narrative, paradigmatic, formal, and spiritual. Paul Hirst split knowledge into physical sciences, human sciences, history, religion, literature, fine arts, and philosophy.[134] These divisions are helpful for music educators and educators in their pedagogical efforts.

Albert Bandura is another psychologist from North America whose social psychological theory became influential in educational settings. Prichard expounds on Bandura's theory as part of her research. Learning happens through observation, imitation, and modeling. Attention, retention, motor reproduction, and reinforcement are the phases involved in Bandura's theory.[135] Live modeling, or demonstrations, and cognitive modeling, which is talking through the process, can happen in music education contexts. Prichard also elaborated on pedagogical actions such as tracking behavioral responses, receiving feedback, and reinforcement through practice experiences, which can be significant ways music students can improve their playing skills. Self-efficacy is a concept that students should learn to have the initiative and understanding to regulate their progress and improvement without being overly dependent on the teacher.

Jerome Bruner contributed to curriculum and learning receptivity theories in his psychological research. Krueger and Wilson elaborate on Bruner's spiral, involving teaching children practical instructional steps. The enactive (action), iconic (image), and symbolic

---

[134] Michael L. Marks and Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman. *Contemporary Music Education*. (New York: Schirmer Cengage Learning, 2014).

[135] Stephanie Prichard, "Practice Makes Perfect? Effective Practice Instruction in Large Ensembles," *Music Educators Journal* 99, no. 2 (2012): 57–62.

(notation) are scaffolding stages in which music educators can bring students to the next level.[136] The emphasis on the learning process over the result or the product is essential to Bruner's theory. Krueger and Wilson also noted that music educators must choose appropriate musical pieces for their objectives and be ready to analyze them with the students. Students must also become immersed in musical sounds before they understand musical symbols. Bruner also was a massive proponent of conceptual learning, where understanding is more often than rote memorization of facts.

Frances Rauscher is an American psychologist who posited that music can cause sociobiological changes to brain functions.[137] She writes that music education improves spatial-temporal reasoning. The data transfer process that music triggers in the brain neurons is conclusive evidence of the significance of music education, according to her. The brain becomes more efficient in action as neurons become more efficient. Improvement of cognitive domains and perceptive powers speak to the ability of music to influence biological functions in the brain. Rauscher's research indicates that the perception of musical processes in the brain transforms the brain in a significant manner: musicians have additional development of brain structures that assist in comprehending musical parameters like melody, rhythm, or harmony.

Psychologist B. F. Skinner pioneered the science behind human behavior, leading to behaviorism theory. Environment and conditioning are essential components of how behavior is affected. At the same time, quantifiable behaviors are considered more valuable than non-quantifiable behaviors. In music education, musical results and achievements are more valuable than the social nature of music. External rewards would motivate students to move toward their

---

[136] Carol Krueger and Jill Wilson, "Foundations of Music Literacy: Jerome Bruner's Contributions to Choral Music Education," *The Choral Journal* 59, no. 1 (2018): 18–29.

[137] Frances H. Rauscher and Sean C. Hinton, "Music Instruction and Its Diverse Extra-Musical Benefits," *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 29, no. 2 (2011): 215–26.

goals.[138] Skinner noted that for music education, this theory can be considered a rudimentary way of teaching but needs to consider the phenomenological experiential nature of music with its emotions and representations. At the same time, behaviorism represents a school of psychological thought that educators and music educators cannot ignore.

Globalization of Music Education

Globalization is a concept that is highly relevant to the philosophies and psychology of music education. As the internet and travel become ubiquitous, cultural borders and differences become blurred. Music educators have access to a wealth of pedagogical methods at their fingertips. International education, comparative education, educational transfer, online education, and social media have become significant concepts that influence the philosophies and psychologies of music education.

The concept of educational transfer in a global society is of utmost importance. According to the Oxford models by Phillips and colleagues, borrowing educational ideas and systems can be divided into a spectrum of academic transfer, stages of policy borrowing, and filters in the borrowing process.[139] The range of educational transfer pertains to the relationship between the borrowing country and the country from which the academic idea comes. The stages of borrowing consist of cross-national attraction, decision, implementation, and internalization or indigenization.[140] The filters involved in the borrowing process clarify how educational ideas transform through different institutions and individuals, or different lenses or perspectives.

---

[138] B.F Skinner, *About Behaviorism*, (New York: Vintage Books, 1974).

[139] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Thinking Globally in Music Education Research," In *Globalizing Music Education: A Framework*. (Indiana University Press, 2018). 35-79.

[140] Kimberly Ochs and David Phillips, "Processes of Educational Borrowing in Historical Context," in *Educational Policy Borrowing: Historical Perspectives*, ed. David Phillips and Kimberly Ochs (Oxford: Symposium Books, 2004), 16

Parquette defines a profession as a field that contains individuals who master a distinct body of technical knowledge and have a certain level of commitment to specific standards and norms of practice. There might be an organization or association that sets rules to control the entry of individuals into practice. There is also a monopoly over this practice that federal or state law sanctions.[141] Applying these concepts to music education and educational transfer in the profession can imply that other countries can borrow pedagogical methods, assessment systems, and philosophical and psychological ideas relating to music teaching. Still, there might need to be more systematic and bureaucratic involvement to facilitate this process smoothly. Analysis of the diverse adjustments of these ideas could also aid the process.

International Music Education

International education and comparative education can also assist in promoting collaborations to meet future challenges. Thompson describes international education as related to intercultural exchanges, global issues, and developing nations.[142] Stromquist describes comparative education as related to different education systems in other countries, with a flow of ideas in an international arena.[143] Music educators can get involved with these types of education to gain valuable insights that may revitalize their teaching methods.

Stromquist also traces the internationalization of community music and related music-making activities, the emergence of the International Society of Music Education, surface-level internationalization of music education approaches, and multiculturalism, which are various

---

[141] Jonathan Parquette, "Theories of Professional Identity: Bringing Cultural Policy in Perspective," in *Cultural Policy, Work and Identity: The Creation, Renewal, and Negotiation of Professional Subjectivities*, ed. Jonathan Parquette (Farnham, UK: Ashgate, 2012), 4.

[142] Jeff Thompson, "International Education: Towards a Shared Understanding," *Journal of Research in International Education* 1, no. 1 (2002): 5.

[143] Nelly P. Stromquist, "Comparative and International Education: A Journey Towards Equality and Equity," Harvard Educational Review 75, no. 1 (2005): 89.

subthemes involved with international music education.[144] The internationalization of music education can be a sensitive issue for some countries and cultures due to the erosion of local cultures and practices. This threat of extinction of diverse customs is natural for many people, thus, inclusiveness and synthesis of different music education approaches are essential. Mediation of diverse opinions, linguistic differences, and cross-cultural understandings is possible through technological mediums for knowledge dissemination, like video conferencing apps and social media platforms. Stromquist notes that global citizens can avoid potential faux pas and misunderstandings in different cultural contexts, but information flow authorities must be politically neutral, reflective, and democratic. Otherwise injustice, falsehoods, and unchecked flow of information will become ubiquitous phenomena.

Kertz-Welzel wrote many articles on international music education. She notes that international music education consists of diverse philosophies, policies, objectives, implementation strategies, existing bureaucratic structures, pedagogical processes, and methods. For example, many countries use the Orff-Schulwerk approach in different cultural settings utilizing local materials. International music education is effective if subconscious and overt political motives are averted. Kertz-Welzel also traces how assessment methods, music standards, teaching methods and materials, education systems, administrative protocols, and establishing foreign ties can also assist the efficacy of international music education.[145] Specifically, a foundational philosophy of music education can serve as a scrutinizing lens for international music education practices.

---

[144] Ibid.

[145] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "The Singing Muse? Three Centuries of Music Education in Germany," *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 26, no. 1 (2004): 8–27

Kertz-Welzel also elaborated on this topic about Europe. In Europe, PISA and Bologna's reform caused a reform of European music education, which people adopted in many international settings. Globalization theories such as a world blanket culture, a world system of ranking cultures, and decolonization profoundly impact global music education's functions. For example, El Sistema appears in different countries, but the sociocultural differences caused the implementation to have different results each time. Kertz-Welzel also notes that international mechanics and politics, educational transfer processes, hidden or public factors, and various organizations regarding the temporal-chronological aspects, hegemony, power, and fusion of cultures could affect the establishment of international music education.[146] Internationalization also happens due to a lingua franca, such as English, between diverse cultures.

Comparative Music Education

Kertz-Welzel's contribution to the literature on this topic is significant. She expounds that comparative music education strives to compare facets of music education, in contrast with international music education, which attempts to integrate different aspects into a united multidimensional system. Cross-national attraction and diplomacy affairs can be a catalyst for comparative educational processes. For example, she highlights research on the relative philosophical differences between music education in Germany and the United States. Both countries have the act of singing in churches as a foundation for music education. As Europe moved through the Enlightenment period, reason became more significant than spirituality, resulting in the rise of child-centered education or naturalistic education. Kertz-Welzel also brought the Humboldtian concept of "Bildung," which focuses on a holistic approach toward education to form a balanced and complete identity. Other seminal ideas include the concept of

---

[146] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Thinking Globally in Music Education Research." Chapter in *Globalizing Music Education: A Framework*. (Indiana University Press: 2018). 35-79.

Erziehung from Jodie, the academization of music from Leo Kestenberg, which utilizes the "Lehrplan" to align curriculum content, objectives, and procedures, Pestalozzian education, which focuses on exploration, observation, and experience, as well as Michael Alt's artwork-oriented versions of "Didaktik."[147]

Kertz-Welzel further notes the significance of "Didaktik," which is one of the subconcepts of "Bildung," referring to the act of teaching and learning. The criteria of learning modules emphasize the merging of theory and practice. Different pedagogical approaches such as analysis, auditory education, poly aesthetic education, hermeneutics, and life-world-centered approaches can assist in the formation of music education methods. Researchers can conduct studies based on intellectual, artistic, formal, or scientific aspects. Auditory education can refer to sensory perception and understanding of acoustics, while polyaesthetic education focuses on interdisciplinary subjects in music.[148] She traced the difference between German aesthetic education and the aesthetic philosophical tradition of the United States. German aesthetic education focuses on developing an independent disposition and citizens who are critical and aware of the perceptive powers of divergent senses in music, dance, literature, and art. American aesthetic education focuses more on the intrinsic values of music to differentiate itself from advocacy slogans that rely on secondary values. Self-actualization and humanistic fulfilment are the primary purposes of music education. Kertz-Welzel noted that emotions, symbols, and

---

[147] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Didaktik of Music: A German Concept and its Comparison to American Music Pedagogy." *International Journal of Music Education* 22 no. 3(2004): 277–286.

[148] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "In Search of the Sense and the Senses: Aesthetic Education in Germany and the United States," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 39, no. 3 (2005): 102–14.

pluralistic cultural signs are integral to aesthetic education. The pragmatic and praxial traditions focus on education's practical and social nature.[149]

Analyses by Kertz-Welzel yield further inferences. For example, she traces the concept of aesthetic education, which evolved from ancient Greek definitions of the perception of beauty to classical and modern European definitions. She traced the influence of Schiller, who posited the role of art in restoring the balance between the mind and sensory perception, which helps human beings to evolve into higher versions of themselves. She also compares Baumgarten to Adorno and Marcuse: Baumgarten emphasized the sensual cognitive nature of aesthetic education, whereas Adorno leaned on Marxian ideals to propose a critical perceptive educative process. Marcuse also focused on the transformative power of aesthetic education for societies and communities.[150] American music education focuses on ensembles and performance, whereas general music education is more emphasized in Germany. Kertz-Welzel notes that the reliance on the amalgamation of cultural ideas in the United States contrasts with the German stance of conservative dependence on tradition. Even linguistic terms such as pedagogy, expedition, mission trip, and place can have differing meanings in these two countries.

 Apart from Kertz-Welzel, Johansen also expounds on the topic of comparative education. Comparative education compares the concepts of glocalization and globalization. Glocalization functions as a bottom-up approach and differs from typical top-down trans-local/super-local methods of comparative education. Globalization entails a neoliberal competitive commodification of knowledge, which has the implications of resistance from local communities

---

[149] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "'Two Souls, Alas, Reside Within My Breast': Reflections on German and American Music Education Regarding the Internationalization of Music Education," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 52–65.

[150] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Lessons from Elsewhere? Comparative Music Education in Times of Globalization," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 23, no. 1 (2015): 48–66.

or diversification.[151] Johansen elaborated that the democratization of information is a leading trait of globalization. Multicultural and world music education, formal and non-formal music education, has resulted in the new onslaught of online music education becoming a mainstay of music education methods.

Online Music Education

Online music education is the next frontier for music education. Online platforms have the advantage of convenience and flexibility, while standard music education platforms have the social benefit. With flexibility, students can keep their jobs or living situations without uprooting themselves to be close to the institute. At the same time, some students may yearn for the communicative aspect of music education, leading them to prefer the traditional face-to-face approaches. Albert in his research traces how video-conferencing apps, music education technology, and social media have completely transformed music education.[152] He elaborates on the burgeoning ways of learning music through these platforms. Specifically, he analyzes the effectiveness of online music education. Philosophies and psychologies of music education relevant to online education are still new research topics that require many contributions, and this research intends to fill this gap as well.

<div align="center">Summary</div>

This literature review examined philosophies and psychologies of music education from Asia, Europe, and North America. As seen from the extensive survey, there is room for research studies that provide in-depth information and insight into diverse mindsets and approaches in different regions. As much of this information is subjective, each voice can contribute to the

---

[151] Geir Johansen, "Music Education and the Role of Comparative Studies in a Globalized World," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 41–51.

[152] D.J. Albert, "Online Versus Traditional Master of Music in Music Education Degree Programs: Students' Reasons for Choosing," *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 25 no.1 (2015): 52–64.

unique literature of philosophies and psychologies of music education. This narrative study

allowed the researcher's journey to illuminate the mindsets, beliefs, assumptions, and ideas

surrounding music education in different cultures.

Chapter Three: Methodology

Introduction

The research design chosen was the qualitative narrative research method. The researcher selected the narrative study as a sophisticated and specific research design to provide structure to investigate the philosophies and psychologies of music education in the framework of piano teaching in diverse contexts. The researcher's professional development as a piano teacher served as the main direction of the narrative study. This central narrative highlighted explorations of the mindsets, beliefs, and assumptions underpinning music education and piano teaching.

Design

Analyzing experiences linearly and chronologically formed the basis for narrative research. Many social science and humanities research literature utilized this design to provide procedural scaffolding to an otherwise subjective and broad analysis endeavor. As a method, the stories and experiences of individuals and the contexts and environments involved are significant aspects of narrative research.[1] The researcher extracted values and meanings from these stories, forming vital themes for analytical purposes. Sociocultural understandings and nuances can be perceived and mined to be helpful for the pedagogical application of music teachers. By understanding the interconnection between various practices in music education and the philosophies and psychologies attached to them, music educators become enlightened in effectively directing their teaching methods.

The unique positionality of the researcher, with his experiences in Asia, Europe, and online North America as a teacher, student, and performer, formed the skeletal makeup of this

---

[1] John W. Creswell and Cheryl N. Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. (4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

research study. After that, interviews with selected participants enriched the narrative analysis and provided triangulation regarding the inferences gleaned.

<div align="center">Design Rationale</div>

Narrative research is a unique qualitative research design that has evolved from interdisciplinary research in history, literature, sociology, and anthropology. It provides organization and orientation to humanistic experiences and perspectives, structuring themes in an orderly fashion.[2] As a methodology, it involves the collection of stories and experiences constructed by the researcher to extract meanings and values that can be illuminating. Specifically, in this research design, the unique narrative and positionality of the researcher drive the storyline and shed light on philosophies and psychologies of music education that underpin the educational contexts involved.

Through this collaborative and reflexive research, situations and places in historically temporal contexts can become significant data sites. Strategies to analyze these narratives through themes derived from philosophy, psychology, sociology, and anthropology can vividly describe and interpret these words and images in the subjective realm. Significant turning points, tensions, and ruptures in the narrative can be zoned in to be analyzed, providing meaning to similarities, differences, and changes in these philosophies and psychologies of music education.

Narrative research is a primary research method of many social sciences. However, music education needs more such literature. For example, in sociology, Chan examines the ethnic identity of Chinese Canadian students in narrative research describing the lives of immigrant

---

[2] Creswell and Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*.

students.[3] Nelson identifies linguistic hegemonies in African-American women in the field of linguistics.[4] In education, Brickhouse and Bodner explore the classrooms of new science teachers through narrative research, identifying issues and constraints to their teaching practices.[5] Narrative research has become more prevalent in many fields due to the ability of this design to provide a structure to otherwise broad and subjective arenas, extracting valuable, constructive insights for knowledge building. Therefore, this research study in music education can fill a gap in the literature, particularly in music education, where phenomenological studies dominate.

Limitations of the research design would be the constraints of the researcher's central narrative. The research was limited to the researcher's and satellite participants' experiences, which enriched and triangulated the findings. There is much room for further research studies that provide even more insights and inferences in music education, specifically in the topics relating to internationalization, globalization, and the burgeoning fields of philosophies and psychologies of music education.

Participants

Participants included the researcher, who also interviewed multiple participants. The researcher's educational journey is the main narrative, with the setting shifting from Malaysia in Asia; Europe, with a focus on Germany and Britain; and concluding in North America with several online participants. Therefore, selected participants reflected and triangulated the data to corroborate the findings and results based on the researcher's reflexive and autoethnographic

---

[3] E. Chan, "Living in the Space between Participant and Researcher as a Narrative Inquirer: Examining Ethnic Identity of Chinese Canadian Students as Conflicting Stories to Live By," *The Journal of Educational Research* 103 (2010) 113-122.

[4] L.W. Nelson, "Code-switching in the Oral Life Narratives of African American Women: Challenges to Linguistic Hegemony," *The Journal of Education* 172 no.3 (1990). 142-155.

[5] N. Brickhouse and G.M. Bodner. "The Beginning Science Teacher: Classroom Narratives of Convictions and Constraints," *Journal of Research in Science* Teaching 29 (1992). 471-485.

inferences. These interviews served as member-checking processes to provide more dependability and trustworthiness to the research, even though qualitative studies are generally subjective and are constructed based on the perceived experiences of diverse individuals of real-world phenomena.

Setting and Population

The population of the study is particular. The researcher only interviewed participants relevant to the narrative research questions. The participants included students who have studied music in Malaysia, Europe, or online in North America. These participants provided insights that enriched the findings of the narrative study and were selected based on availability. The research involved only a few participants as the researcher's main narrative drives the study. The other participants aided in the saturation of data and themes collected in the research study. Guest stated that interviews with more than ten participants exceed the saturation level of data: early identification of many high-level themes in the first six interviews is the norm.[6] The population of interest involved former students who had studied in various countries and had knowledge of the philosophies and psychologies of music education through experiencing the learning approaches and pedagogical processes there. Specifically, students who have learned piano are favored. Also, the researcher considered other instrumental students to enrich data in the research study.

Sampling Procedures and Groups

Qualitative studies usually focus on research questions and not on a specific population. Non-probability sampling or purposive sampling were employed. The researcher needed to

---

[6] Greg Guest, Kathleen M. MacQueen, and Emily E. Namey. *Applied Thematic Analysis*. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012)

choose criteria for the participants of the study. A significant part of the research process was establishing strategies to determine which participants were eligible for the study according to the requirements. The researcher utilized convenience sampling, using available participants who fit the criteria.[7]

Different criteria divided the eligibility of the participants for each group. The first group consisted of two participants who studied music or piano in Malaysia. The second group comprised four participants who studied music or piano in Europe. The third group consisted of three participants who studied music in North America. These are the participant criteria for the research study.

Defining the terms of the criteria was a significant task. Participants who studied music or piano in Malaysia have taken a few years of music lessons in the country, either through institutions or private lessons. The same applied to the participants who studied in Europe or North America. The research considered students who studied online versus live classes. The research study covered various themes just by sampling a few interviews. With just six to ten participants, many themes that can be analyzed emerged. Once the researcher had chosen specific individuals, the researcher provided a description of each participant, with personal details replaced by pseudonyms in the research study.

<div align="center">Interpretive Framework</div>

The conception of an interpretive framework gave the narrative study a proper structure and direction. An interpretive framework contained philosophical assumptions as well. The researcher elaborated on these assumptions. The researcher then fused these assumptions into

---

[7] Gary J. Burkholder, K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J.H Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*. (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020), 51-81.

frameworks relevant to ontology, epistemology, axiology, and methodology.[8] The interpretive framework also contained beliefs, theories, paradigms, and orientations pertinent to the research.

The interpretive framework of this study combined social constructivism and postmodernism. Social constructivism relates to interpreting the world in which the participants live. Paradigms, worldviews, meanings, understanding, philosophies, and psychologies come under the umbrella of social constructivism. Analysis of experiences yields subjective themes and codes; these themes and principles can be varied, rich, and interconnected. The participants' opinions and stories were the foundation for mining these data. Social, cultural, and historical meanings were significant to the narrative: induction of the theory from a large amount of qualitative data contrasts with post-positivism in quantitative studies.

Research questions in this interpretive framework served as broad guides through a situation, providing much room for open-ended analysis. Interactions, processes, experiences, memories, and specific contexts where these situations occurred became significant in this framework. Through the narrative study of the researcher, the construction of meanings and values can enlighten the reader. The results and findings can illuminate guideposts for music and piano teachers interested in becoming more globalized, cosmopolitan, and internationalized. By understanding the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts, music educators can construct a composite perspective of music education that can be powerful and almost omniscient.

Postmodernism was another component of the interpretive framework. The world has gone through several epochs and is currently at a stage where artificial intelligence can generate knowledge. Therefore, for researchers, postmodernism becomes a lethal tool in which all

---

[8] John W. Creswell and Cheryl N. Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. (4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

philosophies, psychologies, worldviews, opinions, and perspectives can be deconstructed and dissected. Trying to interpret the multiple meanings of language, words, and phrases, seeking the hegemony of power structures and unconscious biases, provided an additional layer of richness to the thematic analysis. Awareness of metanarratives, implicit or explicit preferences, subconscious philosophical contradictions, hierarchies, power imbalances, and implied subtexts added even more structure to the narrative.[9] Postmodernism seeks to transform philosophies and thought processes, helping readers to adopt a perspective melded from multiplicity. This research study can provide influential and groundbreaking insights for music teachers worldwide.

<div align="center">Philosophical Assumptions</div>

An interpretive framework can contain many philosophical assumptions. These philosophical assumptions are abstract ideas relevant to the individuality of the researcher and the unique nature and direction of each qualitative study. As the researcher constructed knowledge with other participants, the subjectivity of the data is appreciated. Evaluation of philosophical assumptions is an essential aspect of the research as well. Philosophical assumptions have several divisions, such as ontological, epistemological, axiological, and methodological beliefs.

Ontological Assumptions

Ontology pertains to the nature of being and the idea of reality as perceived by each human.[10] Meanings are subjective and can be interpreted differently in multiple ways. Each participant and the researcher provided stories through interviews in this research. The researcher analyzed the data in a multidimensional manner. Different words can represent other codes and

---

[9] Creswell and Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design.*
[10] Gary J. Burkholder, K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J.H Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*, (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020), 51-81.

themes which may be interrelated. Diverse perspectives formed this narrative study's foundation, tracing music education's philosophies and psychologies through various sociocultural contexts.

Epistemological Assumptions

Epistemology is the study of knowledge. In qualitative research, epistemological assumptions relate to the subjective themes and ideas that emerge from analyzing the participants' narratives.[11] These themes and codes are justified through their subjectivity, considering the contexts and environments involved. The researcher extracted data reflexively from autoethnographic stories and corroborated the narrative with data from external sources. The researcher became one of the participants, lessening the distance between researcher and participant, lending a unique quality to the narrative study through various sociocultural contexts.

Axiological Assumptions

Axiological assumptions relate to the values that emerge from the narrative study.[12] Discussion of these values and potential biases is essential to the research. The researcher may have biased stories from his own experiences due to his limited perspective, but this can be solved through triangulation and member checking with the other participants. These potential biases and differing values and perceptions can become a source of rich data in a postmodern sense, offering much insight and inferences into the analysis of metanarratives of philosophies and psychologies of music education. The description of the researcher's social and cultural background and the other participants is another important aspect of the research. These positionality-related values provided greater understanding and meaning to the narrative study conducted.

---

[11] Ibid.

[12] Ibid.

Methodological Assumptions

Methodology relates to the research processes and the logic and language involved.[13] Narrative research is an inductive process. The researcher conducted interviews and collected data and then determined initial codes; these codes were later grouped into themes. These codes and themes underwent linguistic analysis for inferences and conclusions on the philosophies and psychologies of music education. Constant revision of questions, themes, theories, meanings, and codes was a hallmark of this qualitative narrative research on the philosophies and psychologies of music education.

<div align="center">Role of the Researcher</div>

The researcher's journey through diverse sociocultural contexts inspired the research study. The researcher has the motivation to dissect and analyze this narrative, which is unique; this desire is so that the researcher can enrich literature in the area of philosophies and psychologies of music education. Only some studies covered the philosophies and psychologies of music education, and qualitative studies generally cannot be duplicated due to each unique narrative/case study or phenomenon. Therefore, this research can provide insights vital for music educators and piano teachers worldwide. The researcher has gone through an educational journey through various sociocultural contexts. Starting in Malaysia, the researcher studied Western classical piano surrounded by Asian and multicultural influences. Later, the researcher studied in Europe, both in Germany and Britain. Many philosophies and psychologies of music education from Europe shaped the educational journey of the researcher. Later, the researcher pursued a career in performing in teaching across Europe and Asia. Recently, the researcher sought an online Doctor of Philosophy program in North America. Thus, the dissection of educational, teaching, and performing pursuits in terms of their underlying philosophies and psychologies of

---

[13] Burkholder, Cox, Crawford, and Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*.

music education can be enlightening. Relevant participants added layers of richness to the narrative and served as a triangulation and member-checking function for this research study.[14]

The researcher served as the human instrument and leading research participant. Through the researcher's double identity as researcher and participant, the researcher can investigate many worldviews and beliefs through a dual lens. Fusing the words from the researcher's experiences and the experiences of the other participants through the researcher's research efforts, generating codes and themes to be analyzed, provided an iron-clad research study that is convincing, unique, and applicable for all music educators and piano teachers worldwide. Any biases of perspectives only added to the richness of the study as postmodernism attempts to deconstruct them for insights. The analysis of preconceptions and assumptions in this research study was essential. Therefore, this research study is both constructivist in generating meaning from data and deconstructive in trying to find multiple meanings and identify biases in the data. The researcher's relationship with the other participants connects with their shared experiences. For example, a former student of the Malaysian music education system, a university graduate from Germany or the United Kingdom, or an online music education graduate can provide different insights.

<div align="center">Procedures</div>

All institutions in the United States have review boards named Institutional Review Boards (IRB). These boards function as protective mediums to ensure researchers conduct research studies according to ethical standards. All behavioral science and biomedical research need the approval of the IRB. These boards consist of around five members from different disciplines of diverse backgrounds.

---

[14] Burkholder, Cox, Crawford, and Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*, 51-81

The researcher submitted the research proposal to the IRB before the data collection period. The IRB reviewed the research proposal by questioning various aspects of the study. Documents such as consent forms, assent forms, and relevant research materials, such as instrumentation and interview questions, were reviewed. The IRB also requested that the researcher complete the appropriate ethical training, for example, CITI training certification. For Liberty University, the researcher must upload all these documents on the CAYUSE link. The approval letter from IRB is included in Appendix A.[15]

Recruiting Participants

There were only ten participants for this narrative study. The researcher was the tenth participant. The recruitment of participants was related to their proximity and relevance to the research study. Two participants relevant to music education contexts in Malaysia and Asia were part of the study. The study included four other pertinent participants to European music education contexts. Lastly, three participants relevant to the contexts of music education online in the United States were part of the study. They were given consent forms through email to complete so they knew the research content. The researcher included the templates of these forms in Appendix B. These adhered to the fundamental ethical principles of research studies.

The Nuremberg Code sets the basic principles for all research, and the Belmont Report requires that all participants be respected.[16] The researcher cannot harm them; the participants should benefit from the study. This principle is also named the concept of beneficence or goodwill. They also should be treated in a manner that is morally right and just. The researcher upheld these principles and provided consent letters. These ensured that all participants

---

[15] Liberty University IRB," accessed 7 April 2023. https://www.liberty.edu/graduate/institutional-review-board/

[16] Burkholder, Cox, Crawford, and Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*, 51-81.

understood the research study. The consent forms included elaborations on the themes of music education philosophies and psychologies. These interviews were conducted via Zoom and recorded for further analysis with otter.ai and delve tool for qualitative analysis of themes and codes.

Description of Procedures

The researcher contacted the researcher's contacts for this qualitative narrative research study. This list of references included prior university or school colleagues who have undergone the same music education processes in the same contexts. This process is called convenience sampling. If more participants are needed, the researcher utilized other methods from purposive sampling strategies like snowballing, convenience, and opportunistic sampling.[17] Snowballing sampling would refer to asking those contacts for further contacts that fit the description and criteria of the study. Convenience sampling refers to the available participants who match the eligibility criteria of the research. Opportunistic sampling would refer to using whichever contact is available through contacting them cold. Ultimately, the researcher only relied on the original reference list to recruit participants.

Guest mentioned that less than ten participants would be sufficient to meet the feasibility demands of the qualitative research study. These participants would be relevant to the study's research questions and do not need to represent specific demographics or populations in specificity. According to Guest, saturation is achieved relatively quickly, with around six to ten participants yielding data-rich information with great depth.[18] Similar studies in social sciences

---

[17] Ibid.

[18] Greg Guest, Kathleen M. MacQueen, and Emily E. Namey. *Applied Thematic Analysis*. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012)

have also limited the analysis to very few participants, with Chan even conducting narrative research based on just one participant to trace the story of a migrant student.[19]

Training is only applicable if the researcher conducted the research reflexively and interviewed the other participants. No pilot study was conducted for the research as well. The researcher expounded on the data collection and analysis in a subsequent section.

Replication

Qualitative studies are unique based on their findings; this narrative study is no different. At the same time, some elements of this narrative study may be duplicable. For example, other instrumental teachers may want to analyze the philosophies and psychologies of music education that they hold. However, this research study provided a unique one-of-a-kind narrative due to the unique experiences of the researcher, who has studied in various countries and contexts. Therefore, the researcher is in a position to provide commentary and insights into globalization and internationalization in music education processes.

Data Security

The researcher does not disclose any data to outsiders. All interviews do not have identifiable personal information. The researcher ensured anonymity and confidentiality through consent forms and used pseudonyms to replace participants' real names. The only identifiable participant was the researcher-participant. At the same time, all autobiographical details in interview answers involved pseudonyms.

---

[19] E. Chan, "Living in the Space between Participant and Researcher as a Narrative Inquirer: Examining Ethnic Identity of Chinese Canadian Students as Conflicting Stories to Live By," *The Journal of Educational Research* 103 (2010), 113-122.

Data Collection Method

Data collection steps and procedures are essential for qualitative studies. Detailed descriptions of data collection methods are provided below.

Eligibility

Two data collection methods are interviews with questioned-based protocols and journal prompts with researcher-based and written protocols. Before describing these methods, the researcher defined the eligibility criteria for interview participants. As this study intended to trace the professional development of a piano teacher through various diverse sociocultural contexts based on the researcher's history and experiences, participants were recruited based on their likelihood to triangulate and provide a member-checking influence on the study. For example, the researcher interviewed two participants who have studied music or piano in Malaysia. The researcher repeated this process with four participants who have music education experiences in Europe and three who have music education experiences in North America. Also, as the research design is a narrative inquiry, the educational journey of the researcher served as the direction and foundation for the research. The researcher collected data through autoethnographic journal prompts containing the researcher's reflections. Both of these data collection methods are described in detail below.

Question-based Protocols

The researcher devised many interview questions and prompts for the participants. Qualitative research can employ a variety of questions that can be subjective and differ for each participant. These main interview questions are in Appendix C and are interconnected with the central research questions.

For this specific research study, questions can relate to the description of the philosophies and psychologies of music education, elaboration of the differences between these philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts, and analysis of the pros and cons of these philosophies and psychologies of music education. The rationale of these questions is that they can direct the interviewee to provide their opinions on the subject matter, which can enrich the narrative study and provide triangulation for the journal prompts and self-interviewing of the researcher. The researcher conducted these interviews via the Zoom app and used the Otter.ai software tool to transcribe these interviews. The researcher sent the transcriptions to the participants for member-checking processes. Then, the researcher used Delve to analyze the interview data. The data analysis section below describes the process in greater detail.

The general events were discussed for question one, providing context and background that leads to more specific questions. The second, third, and fourth questions directly addressed the central research question. The fifth question allowed the participant to provide their subjective opinions on the events in their lives. All of the questions were a combination of closed-specific questions and open questions. Closed-specific questions like describing the pros and cons elicited specific data-rich information. Open-ended questions like describing the events of the participants' lives provided free responses. After the interview, if the researcher requires additional data, follow-up interviews can also be conducted.

All questions enabled data extraction through a well-rounded research lens on the subject matter. These questions matched the criteria of a semi-structured interview style that offered the researcher a wide range of responses. The semi-structured interviewing technique allowed answers to preformulated questions and free discussion to occur flexibly. Semi-structured

interviews are flexible, and interview questions can be modified or extended.[20] This process differs from the quantitative Likert-esque structured interview questions with fixed options. Semi-structured interviews can also have the additional dimension of responsive interviewing, which allows the researcher to focus on the subjective individual nature of these interviews.

The responsive interview style consists of a leading question relevant to the central research questions, probes for more details and examples of experiences, and follow-up questions for perspectives and depth in insights and meaning about these ideas and events.[21] Follow-up questions, whether closed or open, and probes garner additional understanding. These can be constructed before the interview or posed at the spur of the moment. These questions can elicit responses that provide rich information and data on the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts. Each question was suitably specific, allowing interviewees to express their ideas and opinions freely.

Written or Researcher-based Protocols

The researcher also utilized reflexive autoethnographic prompts to self-interview. These can also be termed journal prompts.[22] The researcher can use journal prompts to share personal reflections on the researcher's experiences. The researcher has time and autonomy to reminisce and recollect his experiences and memories, which serve as data for this narrative study. These reflective and reflexive essays formed the foundation of narrative research. Philosophies, psychologies, worldviews, opinions, beliefs, and assumptions are written down, dissected, and

---

[20] Gary J. Burkholder, K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J.H Hitchcock, *Research Designs and Methods*, (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020), 147.

[21] H. Rubin and I. Rubin, *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing Data*, 3rd ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 2012).

[22] L. Harvey, "Intimate Reflections: Private Diaries in Qualitative Research," *Qualitative Research* 11 no. 6 (2011): 664-682.

deconstructed. This data collection process provided a subjective yet illuminating form of information, which the researcher can corroborate with the interviews of the other participants. The researcher can analyze the similarities, differences, contradictions, and biases of these views through the comparative reflections of the researcher on his experiences in diverse sociocultural contexts. This research study can sift through the varied and rich experiences of the researcher for insights into music education philosophies and psychologies.

There were four autoethnographic journal prompts. The researcher answered these questions by reflecting on his journey through various sociocultural contexts. Responses can be long, rich, and elaborate. These questions were also included in Appendix D. The researcher wrote answers to these autoethnographic prompts on a Microsoft Word template and then analyzed them with the Delve software tool. Journals are considered field texts by Clandinin and Connelly, together with autobiographical information, letters, interviews, conversations, documents, and other social artifacts like photographs or videos.[23] These artifacts can serve as foundational tools to extract data for narrative research studies. Creswell and Poth also highlighted the importance of documenting journals that express crucial ideas that can be part of the research study.[24] Autoethnographic journal prompts have been used in a study by cancer patients to document their journey through battling the disease.[25] Researchers often use this data collection method for narrative studies.

---

[23] D.J. Clandinin and F.M. Connelly, *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research*, (San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass, 2000).

[24] John W. Creswell and Cheryl N. Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*, 4th ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018).

[25] Patricia Ann Sealy, "Autoethnography: Reflective Journaling and Meditation to Cope with Life-Threatening Breast Cancer," *Clinical Journal of Oncology Nursing* 16 no. 1(2012), 38–41.

Transcriptions

No pilot study or focus groups are needed as this study can be conducted directly with participants about music education's relevant philosophies and psychologies. The researcher used consent forms to gain permission from participants. An excellent qualitative sampling strategy was needed, and the researcher elaborated on this in the research design section. Recording information using technology and apps and analyzing this data with multimedia tools can assist in the effectiveness of the research study. The researcher stored data securely in laptops or thumb drives with password encryption.

Qualitative Data Analysis Software (QDAS) has become ubiquitous. Zoom, Otter.ai, and Delve are good tools for the narrative research study based on their functionality and effectiveness. Zoom allows virtual interviews to take place and is easily accessible worldwide; Otter.ai enables interviews to be audio recorded and transcribed for audio and written texts. Delve allows the researcher to analyze transcriptions from Otter.ai for codes and themes. This combination allows for robust data management and clarity in data analysis in qualitative research, specifically for a narrative research study.[26] For this narrative research, individual experiences and stories from the researcher's life were recorded through journals. The researcher saved this information on a template in Microsoft Word. These answers were also analyzed using the Delve software tool.

After transcribing interviews using the Otter.ai software program and completing journals on Microsoft Word, the researcher checked the audio recordings and written text. The researcher conducted member-checking and triangulation by asking the participants to verify the interview contents. Then, the researcher used the Delve software program to conduct coding and thematic

---

[26] Greg Guest, Kathleen M. MacQueen, and Emily E. Namey. *Applied Thematic Analysis*. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012)

analysis. The researcher used deductive and inductive coding methods. The researcher also conducted content analysis by repetitively going through the data. The researcher also used open coding to identify keywords relevant to the philosophies and psychologies of music education.[27] After conducting initial coding, the researcher reviewed the data and added or revised more codes as necessary. The researcher grouped these codes into a codebook with potential subcodes identified as well.

Saturation

The researcher conducted these interviews in one to two months, depending on the participants' timetables. After the researcher conducted the interviews, the results were also subject to member-checking processes. The Delve tool can divide codes into descriptive codes of who, what, when, how; in vivo codes for evocative words; and interpretive codes. Later, the researcher conducted inductive and deductive thematic analysis. Guest describes that there is a threshold for participants as around six to ten will provide data saturation.[28] Guest also published an article where he and his co-writers describe how they trace data saturation in qualitative studies.[29] The researcher used base size (number of codes and themes), run length (number of interviews and journals), and new information threshold (statistics) to prove that only six to ten interviews are needed to achieve data saturation in qualitative research studies.

<div align="center">Data Analysis and Synthesis</div>

Data analysis can involve detailed organization, coding, and interpretation of themes. This spiral of activities, sequential steps of data analysis, starts with raw data and leads to fruitful

---

[27] J. Saldaña, *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*, 2nd ed. (SAGE Publications, 2013).

[28] Guest, Macqueen, and Namey, *Applied Thematic Analysis.*

[29] Greg Guest, Emily E. Namey, and M. Chen, "A Simple Method to Assess and Report Thematic Saturation in Qualitative Research," *PLoS ONE* 15 no.5 (2020): e0232076.

conclusions.[30] Conceptualization of these data provided vital inferences about the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts. The researcher discussed the findings for further inferences and conclusions. The researcher also detailed the steps of data analysis below.

The first step would be the management of data. The researcher organized journals into various sections. He then segmented interviews according to different areas. For example, music education experiences in Europe are one section, experiences in the U. S. are another, and experiences in Malaysia are another. The researcher does this using software like Microsoft Word or Delve.

The second step would be reading and note-taking emergent ideas. While reading through the contents of these interviews and journals in detail, initial codes and possible overarching themes can be sketched or identified. Journals and interviews can be compared and cross-checked for similarities and differences. Here, additional interviews with follow-up questions or probes could be added to the research process if more data is needed. Reflective notes can be added to the journals if necessary as well.

The third step would involve confirmation of the principal codes to be analyzed and classification into themes, patterns, or grand theories. The researcher conducted a reduction of the data into various coding segments and the assignment of names to these relevant segments. Then, the researcher must combine and match multiple elements into broad categories or themes. Throughout this process, comparing similarities or differences between these themes ensures that themes are unique yet categorizable. As described by Huberman and Miles, data analysis is customized and choreographed.

---

[30] Creswell and Poth, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design,* 185-186.

The fourth step would entail developing interpretations and constant revision and reassessment of these themes and codes, which is necessary for this process.[31] Dey describes this process as gathering insight, using intuition, and relying on impressions.[32] The last step would involve representing the data with visual tools like tables or matrices and writing a chronological narrative involving the analysis of the findings.

For this specific narrative research study, the researcher presented a chronology with particular turning points or epiphanies, as the term Clandinin and Connelly gave, using narrative inquiry as their research design. Clandinin and Connelly highlight the elements to be analyzed, which include personal and social interaction, continuity of past, present, and future, and situational places.[33] From these experiences gathered through interviews, the researcher can weave stories into intricate narratives that yield exciting insights. Data analysis starts with creating and organizing files and reading through the texts to form initial codes. The researcher can gather these codes into thematic patterns that describe the experiences and link them into a chronological story. Contexts and epiphanies are described and interpreted from a global point of view. Identifying similarities, differences, changes, rupture, and coherence in the data can aid the researcher in identifying valuable meanings and themes.

After the data analysis, the researcher integrated the results and findings into a coherent discussion to provide evidence for the central research question and sub-questions. Then, the researcher constructed the narrative with relevant storylines, main themes, and codes. Through the prior data analysis, where the researcher grouped the initial codes into themes, these themes

---

[31] M.B Miles, A.M Huberman and J. Saldana, *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2014).

[32] I. Dey, *Qualitative Data Analysis: A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists*. (England: Routledge, 1993).

[33] Clandinin and Connelly, *Narrative Inquiry.*

represent the philosophies and psychologies of the diverse sociocultural contexts analyzed.

Findings are dissected and mined for valuable insights. The researcher conducted data analysis

and synthesis using the initialization, construction, rectification, and finalization processes

described by Vaismoradi.[34] Initialization involves reading the data, coding, and note-taking.

Construction includes the classification and labelling of codes. Rectification would involve

verification, reflection, and analysis of the themes. Finalization would refer to constructing a

holistic narrative in the final dissertation.

<div align="center">Trustworthiness</div>

Trustworthiness is a significant aspect of qualitative research studies. Unlike quantitative

research studies, which focus on reliability and validity measures to legitimize the studies,

qualitative research studies rely on dependability, credibility, transferability, and confirmability.

The following sections elaborate on these criteria that explain the legitimacy of this narrative

research study.

Credibility

The researcher can confirm internal validity for quantitative research studies because the

data collected matches the concepts proposed in the research questions. Credibility is a parallel

idea in qualitative research, and the researcher can establish this through various measures. This

narrative research employed reflexivity, triangulation, member checking, and peer debriefing.[35]

Reflexivity would be established through the journal prompts that the researcher answers

about the personal narrative about philosophies and psychologies of music education. The

researcher can extract these data from the emic perspectives of the researcher. The researcher

---

[34] M. Vaismoradi, H. Turunen and T. Bondas, "Content Analysis and Thematic Analysis: Implications for Conducting a Qualitative Descriptive Study," *Nursing Health Science 15* (2013), 398-405.

[35] Y.S Lincoln and E.G. Guba, *Naturalistic Inquiry.* (Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1985).

delved into his memories and recollections to write about his experiences in diverse sociocultural contexts about piano study and teaching. Reflections formed the primary data of the narrative research to be analyzed. The investigation is credible due to the memorable fact that the researcher has participated as a live member in this journey.

Triangulation was established through the interviews with the six participants to provide additional sources for the information on philosophies and psychologies of music education. Multiple data sources can corroborate the findings of the journal prompts. The researcher can analyze this data for further insights and inferences even if there are contradicting opinions or worldviews. Member checking would involve having the participants check transcripts of the interviews to confirm their views and reflections. Systematic solicitation of feedback from these participants was an integral part of the research process. Peer debriefing would involve engagement with advisors and readers who may check through the study and provide feedback and edits, as well as suggestions and recommendations on how the researcher can conduct this research most effectively.

Dependability

Dependability addresses the consistency and duplicity of the findings.[36] All data collection methods and analysis should be consistent. The researcher can use inquiry audits and triangulation to address the issue of dependability. The researcher can also detail data collection methods and analysis processes in previous sections; elaborating on methodologies in detail can also be done. A thick description of themes and codes and member checking by participants legitimizes the dependability of the narrative research study.

---

[36] Lincoln and Guba, *Naturalistic Inquiry*.

Transferability

Transferability in qualitative studies corresponds to the concept of external validity in quantitative studies.[37] Naturalistic inquiry would mean that by providing a detailed description of the participants and the philosophical assumptions relevant to the study, the research study can be transferable to different settings which can be part of other research studies. The researcher can use thick descriptions and maximum variation to establish transferability.

Confirmability

Research subjectivity is a foundational part of qualitative research studies, but all procedures must be detailed as objectively as possible to establish confirmability. Triangulation through interviews with participants and the reflexive journals of the researcher provides confirmability to this narrative research study. These methods offer confirmability for the narrative research.

Ethical Considerations

The researcher dealt with a few ethical considerations in this narrative research. The Institutional Review Board approved the study and provided permission for data collection. After this, the researcher recruited participants with consent forms. The researcher respected the confidentiality and privacy of the personal details of participants. All personal information was replaced by relevant pseudonyms and stored on hard drives with password protection.

Summary

The narrative research design is an excellent way to highlight vital information on the philosophies and psychologies of music education through diverse sociocultural contexts. This chapter on research methods provided a roadmap for the researcher to analyze the rich data from

---

[37] Ibid.

participants' experiences. Through this detailed process, the researcher reveals music education's

relevant philosophies and psychologies in different countries.

Chapter Four: Results

Ten narratives from selected musicians detail their unique experiences with the philosophies and psychologies of music education. Each participant described the specific instrumental pedagogical processes of music education they encountered. They compared their experiences, noting any similarities or differences if they had diverse experiences. They also described the pros and cons of their educational experiences. As detailed in the previous chapter, this data was collected through transcribed interviews. The researcher served as one participant in the study as well. He wrote a journal based on the same interview questions, and the results include this data as information on one of the participants. The results chapter dissected the findings of these interviews and journals individually. In the final chapter of the discussion and summary, the researcher gleaned overarching themes and subthemes that answer the research questions and sub questions.

The Researcher's Music Education Journey

The researcher's journey online from Malaysia to Germany, the United Kingdom, and North America is described below. These results are based on the journal written to answer the interview questions. There are five questions, and the answers from each subsection are below.

Description of Music Education Journey

The researcher began his music education journey in Malaysia. He described music education in Malaysia as mostly spontaneous and freestyle in methods and training. He described the first music education method he encountered in Yamaha Music as broad, encompassing many skills like aural, keyboard skills, listening, composing, theory, and musicianship skills. His music education was general, as he experimented with various

instruments, from piano, violin, cello, Chinese Erhu, and vocal, to music-making activities like conducting, composing, chamber music, and orchestra playing.

The researcher experienced the Yamaha syllabus early in his life. He learned music through improvisation, informal listening, and imitation rather than formal theory lessons, which came much later. He composed music from a young age, inspired by his childhood experiences. For example, a trip to Disneyland led him to write a film music piece entitled "Tomorrowland." The researcher also wrote compositions inspired by diverse genres, such as "Funky Celebration" "Waltz for Violin and Piano," "The Lost Empire," and "Sanguine and the Melancholy." These were of varying genres, from Classical to New Age. These early childhood music education experiences were often based on free approaches: the researcher did not recall many formal systematic methods until his teen years.

The researcher was fortunate to learn music like a mother tongue. He also learned diverse genres of music, apart from the standard classical repertoire, like pop, jazz, and traditional Chinese music. The researcher did not encounter the idea that certain music was better than others till a much later age. These music education experiences at a young age enabled the researcher to have a broad palette of musical tastes. They provided him with a gamut of expressive possibilities in music-making activities.

The researcher noted a turning point in his teen years when formal theory and classical piano became more dominant than the general musical activities that he did. This switch from generalist to specialist happened gradually, however, in Malaysia, the most formal approach in music was based on music examinations, which were also flexibly applied. That meant that a teacher would subjectively prescribe certain levels of music repertoire for each student. As a teen, the researcher's burgeoning intellectual and emotional qualities were congruent with the

romantic piano repertoire of Chopin and Liszt. Classical piano performance became more significant in the researcher's music education journey as he participated more in competitions, concerts, masterclasses, and relevant activities. He also began to listen to more recordings of classical artists. At the same time, the limited sources of compact discs or cassettes inhibited his understanding of classical music, as the explosion of media through social media would only happen about twenty years later. Conversely, the researcher retained his originality in interpretation, which would serve him well, and with the ascent of recording media, many classical musicians started to sound similar and unoriginal in interpretation.

Malaysia did not have a formal music performance venue around twenty to thirty years ago. Many performances were entertainment-based or for background music. The researcher recalled that audiences needed to be more knowledgeable about art music, and even ethnomusicological arrangements for ceremonies and processions were rudimentary and not sophisticated. At the same time, unknowledgeable audiences had fewer preconceived notions or expectations for music performances: the audiences were like a blank slate that judged performances based on their entertainment or face value. They needed help understanding the form or style of music. The researcher had the opportunity to perform around Asia due to his connections with Yamaha Music. During those times, the Internet was unavailable, and concerts were promoted through flyers, posters, and phone calls. Also, the shows consist of different performances and acts rather than recitals, with mixtures of ensembles, solos, and duets; this informal style of music-making catered to the audiences, primarily families and amateurs. The theory of music was relegated to a student subject and was not popular in Malaysia. Many musicians did not read notes in Malaysia and relied on pop-based chordal systems or aural methods to make and communicate music. This informal approach also influenced the

researcher's music education significantly. Although the researcher did take theory and classical piano lessons more formally, as mentioned earlier, these would not be comparable to European approaches in music education.

Moving to Germany to study music was quite a culture shock for the researcher. He was used to only some teacher's and professors' rational and systematic approaches. Theory was critical; harmony, rules, and tradition were paramount to music education. Many professors critiqued the researcher's unconventional gestures and rubato in performance. The researcher had to acclimatize to the mainstream pedagogical practices of Europe. Although the researcher could read Western notation, play Western music, and understand the language, he did not feel he understood Germany's culture and habits: there was still a long period of trying to get used to the pedagogical traditions of Europe.

The musical style is an illustration of a significant issue faced by the researcher. He needed to understand musical phrasing, polyphonic voicings, or different articulations that mimicked the orchestral instruments of the Western orchestra. The only music the researcher had a natural affinity for was modern music. The researcher needed to comprehend the tradition surrounding most performance practices, such as pedaling and clarity of textures. Also, the professors would often speak about the superiority of Western music and had a slight patriotic tone to their speech. For example, they would talk about how Brahms embodied their national culture and how art music deserved an elevated societal position. Classical musicians had a unique prestige in society as well. This situation was different from Malaysia, where music was considered neutral and for entertainment. German music education was also based on an existing system that did not exist in Malaysia. There were conservatories, universities, and colleges linked with orchestras and schools. The music education system felt very formal compared to the

informality of Malaysian music education. The German music education system also helped

local graduates to place them in jobs at performance platforms or teaching avenues.

The researcher moved to the United Kingdom after a few years in Germany. The music

education system in the United Kingdom was similar to Germany, albeit with less emphasis on

tradition and art music. Many British music professors championed less-known composers and

tried to dig beyond the famous heavyweights of classical music. The atmosphere was slightly

more inclusive, with a sense of emancipation toward equality and openness toward experimental

music and new traditions. In Germany, the conservatories felt like gatekeepers of an ancient

secret, whereas in the United Kingdom, music education leaned toward freshness of repertoire.

Also, the cosmopolitan and multicultural nature of the United Kingdom due to its influx of

immigrants meant that the culture became more complex and less European.

Tutors and professors in the United Kingdom were also more international-minded and

politically correct. There was less talk on the superiority of Western classical music but more

talk on the inherent merits of each musical genre. Professors were less likely to engage in

microaggressions, such as asking about the reason why someone from Malaysia studied classical

music. In the United Kingdom, the researcher felt more at ease with my decision to study music

in Europe, whereas in Germany, he was constantly questioning his decision due to the slight

alienation he felt. At the same time, the researcher expressed his gratitude for the opportunity

provided to develop his intellect and psyche.

After his music education in Europe, the researcher worked for twelve years before

commencing an online Ph.D. course from Liberty University. This was very different from all

prior music education courses, which were in-person and performance-based. The academic

nature of the degree was very unsettling at first, but the researcher began to enjoy the analysis

required for the study. The researcher had the opportunity to complete the courses asynchronously and only interacted a little with other students. There were online discussions, but once again, the researcher had culture shock due to his different lens and experiences from the other students. The researcher sometimes lacked knowledge, but the topics were exciting to him. Technology in music education was a very new experience for him, and the researcher had to get used to many diverse tools and materials.

The most exciting element of music education research is the relevance to quantitative and qualitative research methods. The researcher felt that music education's scientific and philosophical nature needed to be added to his prior training, and the online degree supplemented this in many ways. The online course inspired the researcher to dissect assumptions, beliefs, ideas, and subjectivity in music education, which inspired this narrative study.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

The researcher experienced a very relaxed philosophy of music education in Malaysia. Most teachers had a flexible approach to education and were open-minded to diverse curricula. Many teachers had the philosophy that music education was a hobby to enjoy. Music was for entertainment and publicity for the school. In a way, music education in Malaysia was related to utilitarian philosophy, where students learned music for academic achievement. For example, the researcher was encouraged to take music exams to prove his efforts in music. The researcher discovered pieces with little proper instruction and took the exams based on his intuition. Methods were mainly based on individual teachers, and many music teachers needed more academic training or ideas on music education philosophies.

Moving to Europe, the researcher encountered a structured and rationalistic music education approach. Instructions were precise, and the researcher was expected to follow them

precisely. Many teaching methods were based on an intellectual understanding of music and careful analysis of techniques. For example, the researcher analyzed wrist movement in piano playing. In Malaysia, the researcher would try to mimic a recording or rely on intuition to get the technique, sound, or style. However, this result was approximate and needed to be more precise. Therefore, the philosophy of music education in Europe was relatively intellectual, academic, and rigorous.

Philosophies and psychologies of music education were the main topics of the researcher's studies during his online doctoral course in North America. The researcher analyzed many main theories of music education philosophies and psychologies, detailed in the literature review section. At the same time, the researcher encountered a freedom of expression that was similar to his music education in Malaysia yet different. Music educators in North America were more opinionated, and many had fixed ideas on specific subjects. At times, they could have more empathy and understanding of different ideas.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

The researcher experienced several types of music education processes. The Yamaha music education system was focused on listening, improvising, composing, and being creative. It was flexible and focused on music-making as a spontaneous activity. Even the exam system strongly focuses on these elements, which means that an intuitive musician does not have many issues and does not need much training. The British and Australian examination systems the researcher tasted in his youth were a bit more formal and structured but still relatively relaxed and not too demanding as they were catered to the casual learner. Also, English language skills played a vital role in these exams. If one could speak about music well and the music they played, they could handle these exams well. These exams had the feedback of "comments," which meant

that the student had to understand the abstract concepts the examiner was explaining. Often, the handwriting was not legible, and the musical jargon was very complicated for the average learner. When the researcher was younger, recordings were not widely available. Therefore, the researcher relied on intuition to interpret many different types of pieces, leading to some slight diversion from the usual stylistic interpretations.

In Europe, the instrumental pedagogical processes were more rigorous and goal oriented. This style was very different from the style in Malaysia. Understanding music, tradition, and technique was necessary for European students: every phrase needed to be understood and make sense logically in the piece's structure. Also, European music education emphasizes the cultural significance of classical music, which was sometimes overwhelming for the researcher. Many professors put much weight on the cultural importance of the repertoire being played and insisted that the researcher perform them in a specific manner. This rigorous or even rigid process would cause the researcher to be slightly uncomfortable with the music education system in Europe. The constant denial of self to be at the service of the music and the European art music tradition would take a toll on the researcher. At the same time, this systematic approach provided the researcher with a deep understanding of the classical style, which would assist him in his development as a music educator.

The researcher had the opportunity to take some online classes with North American professors and felt that their approaches had more room for flexibility and artistry. He did not feel he was being molded in a particular direction but was given more space to think and reflect on different interpretations. This approach helped the researcher overcome his mechanical approach to specific repertoires and rediscover his identity in musical expression. Also, listening to recordings of particular nuances was helpful, giving online learning a fresh new dimension.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

The researcher encountered Western notation throughout his music education journey through diverse countries. This phenomenon spoke to the ubiquity and dominance of the Western music notation system. Although other ethnomusicological notation systems were available in Malaysia, the researcher did not learn these notations. He also had the advantage of being a good sight-reader for Western notation. As someone who could read a hieroglyphical language like Chinese, the researcher found the Western notation system similar in complexity. Learning music and language at a young age provided the researcher with the necessary foundation to perceive Western music effectively.

The use of Western languages was another similarity throughout the researcher's journey. Malaysia was a former colony of Great Britain, so teachers used English to teach music. Also, English or German was the language used in Europe and online. Many Western music also used Italian and French terms in the score, so some basic knowledge was helpful. The researcher felt that using Western languages to teach Western music was more effective, as language and music expression were tightly related. More studies may be needed to analyze the effectiveness of using Asian languages to teach Western music, such as in countries like China, Korea, and Japan.

The researcher felt the similarity between Malaysian and North American education for the freedom of expression and emphasis on creativity. This trait would be the main difference between these regions and European music education. European music education was rigorous, structured, and tradition focused. As time passed, Malaysian music education acquired these traits as the researcher took on the teaching role. The music education differences between performance courses and academic courses were also significant. The roles of researcher and performer are very different.

Other differences include the performance venues, with differing acoustics and audiences. Malaysian venues were more informal with amateur audiences, whereas European venues had specific acoustics, and the audiences were sophisticated, with knowledge of musical styles and genres. Also, Malaysian audiences were used to being entertained, whereas European audiences expected to be intellectually and emotionally stimulated.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

The researcher described the pros of Malaysian music education as flexible and spontaneous. Music educators emphasized improvisation and expression of individual style and emotion. Musical styles and genres were considered equal. Modern music was ubiquitous, and the audience related to such music for entertainment purposes. However, the researcher noted many cons of Malaysian music education. For example, there needs to be more understanding of music theory, techniques, and styles, and a lack of proper performance venues.

The advantages of European music education included systematic and structured instruction and syllabuses, a proper understanding of Western classical music, and appropriate expression of different musical styles. The researcher then described the cons of European music education as the lack of emphasis on improvisation, the idea that classical music is superior to other genres, and the need for more understanding of diverse music cultures. Inclusivity is still a relatively new concept in European music education and may take time to permeate the system. The researcher also described the pros of North American online music education as academic, knowledge-oriented, inclusive, analytical, convenient, flexible, and suitable for introverts. The disadvantages of such an approach include the need for more performance instruction and participation and potential misunderstandings due to miscommunications.

Rachel's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to Australia to China

Rachel is a music teacher who had the opportunity to study in Malaysia, Australia, and China. In her interview, she provided information about her experiences learning the piano and violin. She also extensively discussed early childhood music training, one of her passions.

Description of Music Education Journey

Rachel was born in Malaysia, and she was inspired by her elder sister to learn the piano at five. She was taught by a private tutor, whom she described as strict. Unfortunately, due to this strictness, Rachel quit piano lessons for some time in her teens. She could not handle the stress of rigorous piano lessons and school workload, but at the same time, she managed to take a grade 6 ABRSM piano exam, which enabled her to study music at the Malaysian Institute of Arts. She had a piano tutor at that time who helped her through the diploma exam. After that, she went to Australia for a summer course concerning childhood musicianship. She received her certificate in musicianship after the class and traveled to China to complete a bachelor's degree. In China, she encountered a Russian teacher who taught her about the Russian piano method to help her with technique issues in performance. After her degree in China, she returned to Malaysia and where she continues to teach. She is also preparing for the Trinity College London Licentiate Diploma Exam in piano performance at the same time.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Rachel's journey was similar to the researcher's in that she experienced music education with Asian and Western philosophies and approaches. For example, in her Australian summer course, she received training in the Kodaly method regarding singing, solfege, and rhythmic training using folksongs. She was trained to develop the musical literacy of young children based on sequential skill-building processes. In Malaysia, she received training on the Suzuki method,

in which she was encouraged to teach young children based on listening, repeating, and positive reinforcement, like a second language.

She also noted that the music history of diverse countries contributed to the culture and psychology of music education.[1] For example, she was taught more traditional Chinese songs than Western music during her studies in China. Western music was introduced as a dry subject, whereas Chinese music was conducted with a great concern for the population of China and its relevance to the people there. Her lecturers in China would display the musical scores of Chinese songs and analyze the audio recordings with her. This method helped her to understand the human side of the musical expression of the Chinese people.

Rachel was exposed to different interpretations of styles through her other teachers with her piano and Western classical music studies. She noted that rhythm and theory were more critical in Western than Asian music. As a teacher, she attempted to integrate different elements of her studies to teach creativity, music appreciation, and cultural understanding in music education.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Rachel is also a violinist, and she specified that her journey as a violinist was just as crucial as her journey as a pianist and music educator. She felt the violin was a complex instrument to master, and her technical foundation in Malaysia was lacking. She was frustrated with the inability to hold the bow properly or produce good tones, and her subsequent teachers only slightly helped. Later, when Rachel went abroad, she also encountered different teachers. She noted that many violin teachers were good performers but could have been better teachers. Many of her violin teachers wanted her to figure out the problem herself rather than help her solve her technical issues. This pedagogical "freedom" was not palatable, and she had to find

---

[1] Rachel C., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, November 30, 2023

more teachers to help her graduate. Rachel continues to learn the violin and tried to find many pedagogical solutions for her technical and musical issues.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Rachel encountered diverse music education experiences, especially in terms of aural instruction.[2] For example, in Malaysia, she was taught using the fixed "Do" method using solfege syllables. She felt that her aural foundation was strong, as she was prepared to listen to sounds in tones both of music and natural settings. She developed a good sense of pitch recognition and interval identification, which helped her music studies throughout her life. In Australia, she learned about hand solfege gestures, which enabled her to reinforce the solfege syllables with corresponding pitches. Memorization of melodies and vocal exercises was another method of music education. This kinesthetic element of music education was the main difference between her Australian and Malaysian music education. When she studied in China, she was instructed to learn Chinese songs to internalize the musical culture there. She also had to analyze ceremonial music to understand the historical significance of Chinese music.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Rachel felt her experiences in Malaysia, China, and Australia were filled with good and bad teachers, so she needed help deciding which music education experience was the best. She noted that all experiences were valid and valuable for her learning process. She was grateful for multiple programs in performance, composition, musicology, and music education that helped to shape her musical background. She noted that Malaysian music education lacks accessibility to suitable teaching materials. Also, Malaysian music education does not emphasize diversity in learning styles, which might alienate some learners. Her experiences abroad in China and Australia were rich, although she notes that standardized testing of institutions sometimes stifled

---

[2] Rachel C, interview.

her learning processes and creativity. She said cultural contexts also influenced her music education journey in these diverse countries.

<p style="text-align:center">Jennifer's Music Education Journey: Made in Malaysia</p>

Jennifer's music education was solely in Malaysia. Interviewing her provided this narrative research with a participant who only experienced music education in Malaysia and served as a contrast for all the other participants with diverse music education experiences. In a way, her music education is representative of Malaysian music education and provided the researcher with vital conclusions on comparisons with the music education experiences of other participants in different countries.

Description of Music Education Journey

Jennifer started learning music at the Yamaha music school, with piano and musicianship lessons. She encountered group lessons at a very young age and went through the courses enthusiastically, as she could perform many songs in different parts. She enjoyed learning music by playing by ear and disliked sightreading or finding notes on the score. This disposition led her to disdain the classical music tradition, emphasizing faithfulness to the score, and moved her toward modern music with spontaneous, improvisatory performance practices. As she got older, like many music students in Malaysia, she discontinued the group lessons and opted for solo piano lessons. She noted that during this time, she learned more about rhythmic control, accompanying melodies, different textures like basslines, modulations, and various harmonic knowledge.

Jennifer also noted her experiences with several piano teachers, some of whom she did not connect with due to a lack of warmth or enthusiasm.[3] She also recollected that she did not know they were teaching her the wrong methods at the time due to the music teachers' lack of

---

[3] Jennifer Y., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 1, 2023

professional training. An example she gave was that one teacher insisted that she practice all repertoire loudly without any contrast or dynamic gradation. Later, she chose to pursue a diploma in classical music to give her a more solid pedagogical foundation, even though she preferred pop music. Her summary of Malaysian music education was that her experiences depended on the teacher involved. There was no standardization, and she was at the mercy of the quality of her tutors involved. She felt the only professional music training she encountered was at Yamaha Music School when she was younger.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Similar to her description of her music education journey, Jennifer expounded that the primary catalyst for her development of music aptitude stemmed from the Yamaha music education system. She felt that due to the ear training, she had good pitch recognition, which served her well throughout her musical journey. The philosophies and psychologies of music education related to Yamaha Music Education were the foundation for her musical development.. She recalled swapping with other students in the group lesson to play melody, accompaniment, or basses. This experience was inspiring for her musical development. She felt this philosophy of music education, which emphasized ear training and learning through playing, helped her sense of tempo, rhythm, and dynamics. She remembered going through many exciting pieces rather than focusing on a few pieces to polish. She was not too impressed with the philosophies and psychologies of music education related to classical music, such as close adherence to the score or certain stylistic traits to be emulated in performance. Thus, after her diploma in classical music, she moved from classical piano to modern piano performance and vocal performance. This shift allowed her to express her emotions organically and naturally.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Jennifer explained that the piano was her primary instrument due to her exposure to keyboard instruments early in her Yamaha music education experience.[4] She also had experiences with the keyboard, the electric organ, and the synthesizer, which produced a gamut of sounds mimicking the orchestra or pop bands. The Yamaha music education system was also based on the primary piano or keyboard teacher leading the other students on their keyboards through various syllabuses. She recalled that she learned to improvise using Alberti basses, chords, and octaves in this system and felt that this training enabled her to respond quickly to musical stimuli. Later, during her solo piano lessons, she encountered a variety of pedagogical methods. She eschewed the strict techniques and always opted for teachers that allowed her flexibility and reflection. Her current mentor allows her time to think about her musical experiences and learning processes rather than imposing regular lessons. This freedom allows her much more time and space to listen, experiment, experience music-making herself, and engage in critical reflection, leading to more musical learning growth.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Jennifer was trained solely in Malaysia and answered the interview questions on diverse music education experiences based on her experiences in Malaysia. As noted in previous paragraphs, her main struggle was between formal classical music education and the flexible improvisatory type of music education. She felt she leaned more toward spontaneous musical expression but recognized the importance of formal music education with theory, especially as a music teacher. As a music teacher, she noted the struggle between these two polarities, which has existed since her music education journey began. She knew she needed formal classical training for her teaching credentials but strived to be flexible and malleable. She compared the music

---

[4] Jennifer Y, interview.

exams she took from the ABRSM system with the Yamaha system she loved as representative of this polarity.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Jennifer's interview revolved around the duality of free musical expression and formal theoretical training. She discussed the pros of the Yamaha music education system as formative for her pitch recognition and keyboard skills. She felt that this early foundation helped her to succeed in her musical journey. She noted that the cons of her music education experiences revolved around bad teachers, especially when she moved toward solo instrumental lessons. She felt that Malaysian music education did not control the standards of solo instrumental teachers, which allowed many wrong methodologies to ruin the progress of many students. Thus, she had to spend considerable time and resources to find the right teacher to help her on her journey rather than lead her astray. She also noted that she needed to be more assertive and critical rather than mindlessly following the teacher's instructions. With this critical assessment of what she was learning and what the teacher was teaching, she avoided many pitfalls and saved herself even more trouble with incompetent teachers. She is against the strict authoritarian teaching that many Malaysian and Asian teachers rely on, as she feels that music is too subjective and requires more flexibility. She felt that rigorous teaching caused students to lose interest and restricted their musical expressivity. She also felt that tonal control was an aspect many Malaysian teachers did not understand, whether teaching Western or Asian music. She felt that as a teacher, she now strived to have good guidelines for her students' beautiful tone and expression.

Jessica's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to the United Kingdom to Ireland

Jessica started her music education in Malaysia. Then, she pursued music in the United Kingdom. She worked as a music teacher for several years. After the pandemic, she moved to Ireland to pursue a master's degree in music.

Description of Music Education Journey

Jessica's music education journey began in Malaysia, taking piano, theory, and vocal lessons. She had experiences with music schools and private teachers; she also learned aural and sightreading skills with her piano teachers. She enrolled in several music examinations and competitions, giving her vital performing experiences. She had experience with Trinity College London and the Associate Board of Royal Schools UK examination syllabuses. Most of her music education was related to classical music, with some modern repertoire occasionally included. She had some experiences with music theatre, which she enjoyed as well.

Jessica then furthered her music studies in the United Kingdom, majoring in piano performance. Her studies occurred at a university where academic music was considered as important as performance. She was assigned an academic supervisor as well as a performance supervisor throughout the three-year course. She had to attend multiple aural and theory courses as well. She could choose modules to make up the rest of the credits. She selected composition, music history, historical performance practice, electronic music, community music, music production, and music administration.

Jessica had a set amount of tuition hours with her piano tutor each term, and she worked on a repertoire to be performed for her year-end assessment. At the same time, she completed the Licentiate diploma in piano performance from Trinity College London. She emphasized that the exciting part of her music education here was that she had to be involved in at least one

university-led music society or ensemble. The university also encouraged students to be involved in many music productions and ensembles to further their practical experiences. She had many opportunities to be involved in musical productions and performances in different roles and capacities. For her final year, she chose to do a music production project and a final piano recital. She recalled her prominent interest and affinity with contemporary classical music, which she had explored during her time in the United Kingdom.

Jessica pursued a master's in Ireland after her studies in the United Kingdom, which she felt had similar music education approaches to Ireland, albeit slightly more academic in coursework. As the U.K. and Ireland share quite a similar culture, Jessica noted that the music education culture in both countries has many similarities. For example, both countries emphasized contemporary classical music. As she pursued her master's degree during the pandemic, she said the shift to online education permeated all music education degrees due to necessity.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Jessica described the philosophy of music education she experienced in Malaysia as rooted in classical music standards and technical mastery.[5] This experience was markedly different from the researcher's own experience. She felt the ABRSM and Trinity College London syllabi were structured and based on grade levels, which her teachers followed rigidly. She developed a sense of discipline, patience, and good time management based on this philosophy of music education. This psychology of music education helped her to focus on precision, diligence, and developing a solid work ethic. Her teachers provided her with tangible milestones through competitions, examinations, and recitals, fostering a sense of accomplishment and progression.

---

[5] Jessica T., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 3, 2023

When Jessica moved to the United Kingdom for her music studies, she experienced a music education approach that was freer, more diverse, and more creative. Again, this is the opposite experience of the researcher's journey. She experienced classical music as an evolving dynamic art form, focusing on experimentation and self-expression through different genres and styles. She described music education in the United Kingdom as following the cultural zeitgeist of emphasizing individuality, informed research, and critical thinking. She felt she developed her personal and authentic voice rather than focusing on technical proficiency. As her lecturers encouraged her to participate in many music societies, productions, and ensembles, she fostered a sense of community and collaboration, aligning with the belief that music is a shared experience.

Jessica's music education experience in Ireland was similar to that of the United Kingdom, with a strong focus on performance and academic music. She noted that performances were often self-guided projects that encouraged self-expression, unlike her experiences in Malaysia, where recitals were usually linked to examinations or competitions. She is grateful that the combination of tradition, creativity, discipline, and flexibility has shaped her musical identity regarding technical abilities and the transformative and collaborative nature of music and music education.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Jessica encountered traditional piano pedagogical methods in Malaysia, such as foundational elements like scales and arpeggios and technical exercises like Hanon and Czerny. Although some consider these pedagogies antiquated, she benefitted from them in developing finger strength, flexibility, and coordination. Her music education was oriented toward Western classical music, focusing on the modern eras of Baroque, Classical, Romantic, and 20th-century

repertoire. She studied different compositional styles, which enhanced her interpretive skills. She recalled memorization helped her master many pieces as she could internalize the music.

Jessica also discussed music notation and theory in her music education journey.[6] She learned to decipher complex musical scores, understand intricate notational symbols, and unravel the composition's theoretical underpinnings, which were significant skills. She felt that this theoretical foundation gave her an analytical approach toward music. As she progressed more in her music education journey, she became connected with the emotion and phrasing of the composition. She was instructed to create stories through music and cultivated a keen sense of listening. Listening to her playing and other musicians' recordings helped her develop artistry in piano playing. Also, understanding the sustaining pedal and the concept of legato helped her tremendously in her piano performance skills.

When Jessica moved to the United Kingdom and Ireland, she also encountered similar pedagogical methods in music theory. However, these were only some of the focus of her studies. She moved toward a self-directed approach emphasizing intricacy and detail in musical expression and interpretation. Historical performance practice was a new and enriching experience in her music education journey. Most significantly, she was introduced to extended instrumental techniques such as plucking the piano strings and preparing piano and microtones. She studied advanced musical and orchestral scores and was involved in collaborative large-scale performances. She also became familiar with the Alexander technique, a holistic learning process that helped musicians reduce performance anxiety and the likelihood of injury.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Jessica noted that, although Malaysian, her music education journey was united by her experiences in graded classical music repertoire. Despite vast differences in culture and

---

[6] Jessica T., interview.

geography, Jessica studied a rich tapestry of Western classical music, spanning the Baroque, Viennese Classical, and Romantic to the 20th Century. Thus, she acquired a comprehensive understanding of diverse compositional styles. The emphasis on music notation and theory was another commonality. She studied notational symbols of Western origin and complex musical scores and unraveled theoretical underpinnings in form through analysis. This study helped her with her interpretation of intricate compositions. Another consistent thread Jessica noted that was weaving through her musical journey was the activity of performance. Performance was pivotal in her music education, fostering skill development and providing tangible milestones in her music progression. In Malaysia, she noted that performances were tied to examinations and competitions. In contrast, her performances in the United Kingdom and Ireland extended to include ensemble, self-directed projects, and large-scale productions.

Despite these similarities, Jessica noted differences in the philosophical approaches between Malaysia and the United Kingdom/ Ireland. Her music teachers in Malaysia strongly emphasized tradition and technical mastery, characterized by adherence to specific syllabi and requirements. In contrast, her time in Europe was characterized by creativity, and music was viewed as a dynamic, evolving art form. She explored diverse genres and styles, helping to express herself through musical experimentation. Furthermore, Jessica was exposed to more experimental and contemporary music in Europe. Specifically, extending techniques, microtones, and usage of diverse instrumental techniques, which created fresh sounds, enriched her sense of musical vocabulary. Jessica also felt that her education in the United Kingdom and Ireland helped her explore her individuality and creativity. She developed a personal and musically authentic voice through informed research.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Jessica described the pros of her Malaysian music education as a solid foundation in traditional piano pedagogy and exposure to Western classical repertoire of Baroque, Viennese Classical, Romantic, and 20th-century music. Graded examinations and competitions provided concrete milestones, fostering a sense of discipline and technical proficiency. She cultivated a broad understanding of classical music as well. She appreciated the structured approach, which instilled a strong work ethic and commitment to excellence. Regular competitions and examinations helped ease her nerves when performing. At the same time, her music education in Malaysia limited her exposure to contemporary and experimental art forms. She felt that she could have explored more diverse genres and styles in her musical journey in Malaysia.

Jessica expounded on the pros of her music education in the United Kingdom and Ireland. The main pro of her music education was the holistic approach, which emphasized many diverse styles and the musician's musical well-being. She felt this approach fostered a long-term engagement with music as an art form. As she engaged with many collaborative projects, she experienced music as a communal and shared art form. She felt that the open approach she encountered helped her blossom as a musician and a person. The freedom to choose modules allowed flexibility but demanded a proactive personal and musical development approach. The cons of her music education in Europe would be the constant demands and pressures related to performances on a large scale. She felt this anxiety was the only negative side of her music education in Europe, which at times overshadowed her joy of learning music.

Yvonne's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to Singapore to the United Kingdom

Yvonne studied music in Malaysia and pursued higher education in Singapore. After her bachelor's degree, she had the opportunity to pursue further courses in the United Kingdom. She is currently a music teacher in Singapore.

Description of Music Education Journey

Yvonne's music education began in Malaysia, where she started traditional piano lessons. She recalled that her lessons took place in a studio that was so small that it could only fit an upright piano and a small study table.[7] She remembered her excitement in learning music and felt a deep sense of enjoyment playing the piano. This early exposure to music piqued her interest in understanding more about music. As she attended private lessons, she became confident that she wanted to pursue music performance in the future, as she believed in the transformative power of music. She was then exposed to numerous opportunities in piano performance, such as concerts, examinations, and competitions. She enjoyed learning many different pieces for these occasions. During this time, she achieved the Associate and Licentiate diploma for Trinity College London examinations.

After moving to Singapore, Yvonne studied music performance at a Conservatory. She noted that her music education in Singapore was similar to Malaysia, only that in Singapore, she was involved formally with an institution, which gave her studies more structure and direction. Also, during this time in Singapore, she encountered a module entitled "Instrumental and Vocal Teaching," which garnered her attention and paved the groundwork for further study in music education. She gained a Bachelor of Education in Instrumental and Vocal teaching and a diploma in music performance.

---

[7] Yvonne C., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 4, 2023

Yvonne had the opportunity to study in the United Kingdom, where she immersed herself in the music culture. She observed many lessons in chamber and orchestral environments, which enabled her to witness the contrast between music education approaches in Asian and European contexts. She also had principal study lessons to prepare her for lecture-recitals. These lessons helped her to gain confidence in delivering presentations and understanding specific topics. She extensively researched wrist motion in piano playing in the United Kingdom.

Yvonne described her observations on Asian and European educational settings in detail. From her perspective, she felt that in Asia, students often hesitate to voice their opinions when called upon by teachers, be it in a group or private setting. In Europe, however, students articulate their ideas freely in small or large groups. This cultural difference stems from the fact that in many Asian cultures, there is an emphasis on respect for authority figures like teachers and elders. Additionally, students are often taught to listen attentively and refrain from speaking out unless directly prompted by the teacher.

In contrast, European music education places less hierarchical relationships between teachers and students, allowing students to feel comfortable expressing their opinions freely without fearing potential repercussions or appearing disrespectful. Also, this method of conducting lessons encourages and prioritizes students' critical thinking skills. The subjectivity of music means that there are no correct or wrong answers, and this method of learning allows students to engage in discussions in an environment where speaking up is valuable and beneficial for learning. Due to this learning method, Yvonne also prompts students to be more participatory in her work as a music teacher.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Regarding the philosophies and psychologies of music education, Yvonne spoke extensively on her formal education.[8] During the completion of her Bachelor's Degree, she encountered the module "Conceptualizing Music Education" (CME), which exposed her to learning and understanding different music education philosophies. The module discussed various approaches like the Orff Schulwerk approach and the Kodaly method. She also encountered the idea of student-centered learning. The environment provided an active and welcoming environment where Yvonne felt comfortable sharing her thoughts and opinions. She firmly believed in the importance of the environment in learning music, which contributes to a child's growth. She believes children should have a safe space to express themselves and make mistakes without being judged harshly.

Another notable experience Yvonne had during this time was her experience with collaborative projects. Experiential learning through group activities helped her to engage in ensemble playing and receive feedback from classmates. She felt this philosophical approach enabled her to develop her communication and teamwork skills. She also experienced the Kodaly hand signs during her chorus rehearsals, which she felt helped her learn music. Yvonne's ideas on the psychologies of music education stem from her experiences with the emotional impact of music on learners. She observed many performers being deeply involved with the dynamic nature of music, and she felt that her cognitive processes, such as musical memory and problem-solving skills, were enhanced by studying music theory. She also felt that learning music helped her self-efficacy, motivation, and social skills. Her experiences with the philosophies and psychologies of music education in different countries have been similar in that they encompass music emotion, cognition, social dynamics, and motivation.

---

[8] Yvonne C., interview.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Yvonne described her piano learning processes beginning with seminal books by author Lina Ng, such as the "Piano Made Easy" series. She noted that the method book used "five finger techniques," comparable to the current famous "Faber Piano Adventures." She felt that this fixed position method could be a disadvantage for beginners, as the idea was based on the fact that every note or chord would need a specific hand position. Yvonne then noted that as she continued her piano lessons, her teachers showed her a more profound emphasis on mastering correct posture, flexible hand positions, and different touches. Also, she credited learning theory, aural, and sightreading skills as helpful to her journey. She also recalled exploring diverse repertoires such as Rachmaninoff and Copland, which she felt were very different from the usual student pieces she was playing. This exploration helped her build a solid musical growth and development foundation.

As Yvonne transitioned into her formal music education in Singapore, she was involved in many collaborative projects and ensemble performances. She also organized events, which she found highly beneficial for her confidence and leadership skills, translating into better performances onstage. She also experienced mutual learning, where she and her course mates offered each other feedback and constructive criticism. She learned the importance of teamwork and ensemble dynamics and participated in masterclasses by seasoned performers. The pinnacle of her instrumental pedagogical learning began when she encountered the "Instrumental and Vocal Teaching" module, which led her to pursue music teaching. She also learned about conceptualizing music education and was involved in teaching practicums. During her time in the United Kingdom, she had the opportunity to observe various classroom settings, providing her with valuable insights into different teaching approaches for other age groups and individual

or group lessons. Specifically, lesson planning and curriculum development that catered to the needs of students were essential highlights of her studies. Long-term and short-term plans had to be paired up with specific objectives.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Yvonne described the similarities and differences between her music education experiences in Malaysia, Singapore, and the United Kingdom. In Malaysia, her private piano lessons were mainly focused on polishing repertoire with minimal attention to theory. There were discussions about music and her progress at times but minimal interaction or collaborative activities. Her formal studies in Singapore emphasized instrumental techniques, theory, and music history. She had to present lectures and deal with viva voce examinations and performances; she also had teaching modules where she had to hone her teaching skills in various musical topics. She was exposed to more collaborative and ensemble playing in Singapore, the main difference between her music education in Malaysia and Singapore.

Yvonne also had significantly more resources for her education in Singapore than her private lessons in Malaysia. In Malaysia, she primarily relied on music scores or the internet for her music learning materials, while in Singapore, she had the libraries of the conservatories to enrich her studies. This resource wealth was also crucial for her research and music education interest. Another significant difference between her studies in both Malaysia and Singapore and the United Kingdom was the presence of constructive criticism from peers and tutors in the United Kingdom. This feedback was more limited in Malaysia and Singapore due to the cultural hesitancy to voice one's opinion truthfully and the fear of offending others. This environment of openness in the United Kingdom helped Yvonne to understand the perspectives of others from multiple angles on various musical topics.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Yvonne highlighted the main pros of her music education in Singapore as having more autonomy in tailoring her music studies toward combining music performance and music education. For example, learning how to present lecture recitals was a significant learning experience for Yvonne. Yvonne preferred a more formal approach to her informal private lessons as she felt it was more comprehensive. The main pros of her studies in the United Kingdom stem from the personalized and constructive feedback she received from peers and tutors. Also, she benefited from the diverse learning environment of London, a cosmopolitan multicultural city. She learned a lot through collaboration and having a safe space to voice her opinions and concerns.

Yvonne mentioned another pro of her formal education in Singapore: the opportunities to observe other tutors teaching music. These observations helped her to shape her teaching methodologies and understand effective teaching practices. She learned about diverse learning theories and teaching methodologies as well. However, she felt that knowledge of performance anxiety and memorization of music was lacking in all her educational experiences. She is also driven to find solutions for these issues in her teaching.

Yasmin's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to Germany

Yasmin started her music education in Malaysia. She decided to major in the violin and is currently pursuing her studies in Germany. She has had many performing experiences abroad and locally.

Description of Music Education Journey

Yasmin began her music education journey in Malaysia and commenced piano and violin lessons. She navigated through various basic exercises for technique and eventually tackled a

more challenging repertoire. She had experience in music examinations like the ABRSM and Trinity College London, which are ubiquitous in Malaysia. She also took lessons in music theory, which allowed her to unlock the nuances of compositions, decipher the language of musical notation, analyze harmonic structures, and comprehend the underlying principles of musical form. Yasmin noted that her theory lessons helped her provide a holistic understanding that helped her interpret, express, and appreciate the profound depths of music. Her violin lessons unfolded through the Suzuki method, where she learned the basic foundations of technique and ensemble playing. She also participated in competitions that helped her improve her technical prowess and interpretative skills. For her, competitions enabled her to develop qualities such as perseverance, grace under pressure, and a deep appreciation for the transformative power of music. Yasmin also participated in youth orchestra programs and chamber music events, enhancing her understanding of music in a collaborative setting.

Later, Yasmin decided to major in violin and pursue her studies in Germany. She described her education in Germany as alternating between weekly solo lessons, studio classes, and collaborative sessions with accompanists. Apart from these sessions, she had many performance opportunities and studio concerts during her studies. She also minored in piano and had weekly solo lessons as well. Yasmin regularly participated in orchestra projects, opera performances, and ensembles and had theory, aural, and history lessons. She described her education in Germany as a foundation for her commitment to excellence.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Yasmin's music education journey started in Malaysia, where she encountered a philosophy of music education based on discipline and precision. She learned basic techniques such as scales and etudes. This pedagogical approach instilled a solid technical foundation that

prepared students for the challenges of advanced repertoire, while the disciplined methodology aimed at fostering perfection and appreciation for craftsmanship. She also encountered philosophies based on examinations, which were utilitarian. These examinations provided her with a structured framework for achieving milestones through assessments. Suzuki's method was another music education philosophy focused on ear training and developing a passion for the instrument. Yasmin also noted that the Suzuki method concentrates on music as a language and supportive environment.[9] She was taught to cultivate a love of music early, emphasizing listening and imitation skills. She also experienced the communal climate promoted by the Suzuki method.

Yasmin's music education underwent a profound metamorphosis as she moved to Germany for further studies. The philosophy of music education was intensely focused on the elevation of artistry and interpretation. The educational landscape embraced a holistic approach, emphasizing individual artistic expression. Students were urged to infuse their distinctive voices into the fabric of performances, transforming each rendition into a personalized narrative. Yasmin also encountered collaborative endeavors as shared educational experiences. Her education in Germany consisted of a comprehensive curriculum that aimed to mold musicians with a multifaceted understanding of music, including theory, history, aural, and analysis. This attempt at well-roundedness helped her to delve into the broader context of music compositions. Yasmin also encountered psychologies of music education, such as the importance of cognitive processes in music performance and teaching. The emotional impact and historical and cultural contexts of musical works became integral to her studies. She became interested in research on music's connection with the psyche.

---

[9] Yasmin L., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 5, 2023

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Yasmin described her pedagogical processes as ranging from foundational techniques to advanced methodologies.[10] When she was in Malaysia, her initial music education was focused on building a solid technical foundation. The process involved meticulous attention to fundamental aspects like posture, hand position, and finger dexterity. Exercises and etudes, such as from Kreutzer, Schradieck, Rode, and Don't, were crucial for honing technique. This emphasis on technical precision laid the groundwork for instrumental proficiency and mastery of more advanced repertoire.

Yasmin also described the influence of ABRSM and Trinity College of London examinations, which favored structured progression through graded levels. She felt that these examinations provided a roadmap that was clear for progress. Apart from technical mastery and musical interpretation, sightreading, aural, and theory were included in the syllabi: this holistic approach aimed to foster well-roundedness in the musician. Yasmin also described the Suzuki method as immersive and significant for her music education. Emphasis was on learning music, like language acquisition, imitation, and aural skills. The repertoire was introduced gradually, allowing for natural progression aligned with the student's development. Group lessons and the involvement of her parents assisted her progress as well.

Moving to Germany shifted Yasmin's music education toward artistry in interpretation. Unique, expressive tone and personal connection to the music were essential in her music studies. Through weekly lessons, studio classes, and collaborative sessions with accompanists, Yasmin learned to refine her interpretation and understand the delicate nuances of music. Her participation in orchestras further enriched her studies, together with theory, aural, and analysis.

---

[10] Yasmin L., interview.

She learned more about the contexts surrounding musical compositions, significantly influencing her music education.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Yasmin described the similarities of her music education experiences as emphasizing a technical foundation. Meticulous study of etudes and elemental musical compositions was a hallmark of her education in Malaysia and Germany. Also, her music education in both countries was focused on discipline and precision. Regarding the differences, she did not encounter graded levels in Germany. In Germany, her music education was more holistic and focused on artistry and interpretation. For example, she understood music narrative and individual expression. Also, European music education emphasized the emotional connection to the music more than just mastery of notes. The shift from Asian to European music education meant that Yasmin had to become more engaged with the depth of the music.

Yasmin's experience in Germany was also more holistic as she had more ensemble and orchestra projects there. Although she did experience this in Malaysia, she felt that the collaborative scale of her music education was much more significant in Germany: she thought that she was part of a broader musical community. Through her education in Germany, she understood music as a vehicle of emotion and speaking.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Yasmin described the pros of her music education in Malaysia as progressive through step-by-step approaches. This methodology gave her a robust foundation with clear instructions and learning pathways. She benefitted from the discipline and precision that came with this approach and felt she had a strong foundation with a solid framework. Also, she felt that her

music education in Malaysia efficiently imparts basic musical skills. She was given quick feedback when she was doing something wrong so she could correct the mistake immediately.

Transitioning to Europe, the pros of her music education were the emphasis on exploration and individual expression. Yasmin felt that her music education in Germany encouraged her to engage with the musical materials with a sense of ownership and autonomy. The professor provided general input while the students needed to develop their understanding of nuances and details. Yasmin described the German music educational model as contributing to developing critical thinking skills and fostering a deep understanding of musical concepts in diverse contexts. Also, the emotional connection to music as a significant aspect of music education was another hallmark of German music education.

Yasmin expounded on the cons of her music education in Malaysia. She felt creativity was not emphasized enough, stifling the students' critical thinking ability. Also, the emphasis on technique overshadowed the music's emotional, expressive side: precision was favored more over performance. In contrast, the German music education model she experienced could be overwhelming for a student who needs more structure and guidance in learning. Yasmin sometimes had to steer herself toward musical goals independently without clear direction. Also, the European model of music education, at times, could benefit from more technical infusion so that students could feel comfortable with their mastery of the instrument.

Laura's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to the United Kingdom

Laura began her music education journey in Malaysia. She completed her bachelor's degree in Malaysia. She then studied for a Master's in Piano Performance in the United Kingdom. She completed her Doctor of Philosophy in Piano Performance and is an associate professor at a public university.

Description of Music Education Journey

Laura started learning music with Yamaha Music, which focused on ear training and musicianship skills. She also learned the electric organ, improvisation, and composing. Later, she transitioned to private piano lessons and followed the ABRSM and Trinity College London examinations to diploma levels. She also pursued a Bachelor's Degree in Music in Malaysia, which lasted three years. She had a few teachers, including a teacher from Uzbekistan, trained in Germany, who taught the Russian method. This method focused on technique, strong finger work, touch, and sound projection. After her bachelor's degree, she moved to the United Kingdom and had teachers focusing more on expression and musicality. She pursued a Doctor of Philosophy program in Piano Performance, which was a combination of research and performance. Her tutors were focused more on alternative musical techniques in performance in conjunction with research.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Laura's studies in Malaysia were characterized by strictness and rigid focus on the score. The philosophy of music education she encountered lacked understanding of the musical context or background of the musical work. This lack of flexibility in musical thinking and understanding impeded her musical progress significantly. She was instructed to keep a steady tempo regardless of ritardando aspects or phrasing. She was always taught to play loudly, as though she was playing for many audience members. This aspect stifled all musical expression, and she did not feel any emotional connection to the music, just a constant technical activity when playing the piano.

Later, when Laura moved to the United Kingdom, she encountered more artistry, expressive playing, and teaching in musical performance. The touch and timbre had more variety,

and teaching was more subjective. This approach opened her mind and ears to the richness of lyric interpretation, which led her to pursue a Doctor of Philosophy in Piano Performance there. She was encouraged by the creative way music students were expected to approach their craft. Research and careful judgment of tone helped her to master the instrument holistically.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Laura explained that her Malaysian music education felt forced and unnatural.[11] She recalled feeling like a mechanical robot regurgitating the notes while playing music. She reflected that most of her musical training in Malaysia was technically secure but needed more musical understanding. The only musical training she felt was a good experience was her initial training with the Yamaha music system, which gave her an excellent aural and musicianship foundation. She also thought she needed to progress toward sophisticated craftsmanship or artistry in music performance.

The pedagogical processes in the United Kingdom were more favorable for Laura. She felt that studying in the United Kingdom opened her mind and ears to the tone colors, imaginative phrasing, and artistic interpretation she never knew existed; she felt like a completely different musician while studying in the United Kingdom. It was as though she was a robot that was brought to life by understanding the subjective nature of music. This experience led her to become a dedicated researcher and performer of piano music.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Laura's experiences were very contrasting for Malaysia and the United Kingdom. Her Malaysian music education was characterized by discipline and strong technique, whereas her British education focused on artistry and interpretation. The only pros for her studies in Malaysia came from the flexibility found in the Yamaha syllabus. The differences between Malaysian and

---

[11] Laura L., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 6, 2023

British music education led her to pursue music at the highest level at university. As a lecturer now in a Malaysian public university, she draws on these experiences and strives to transform Malaysian music education philosophies and psychologies. She feels that Malaysian music educators must become critical thinkers and focus more on artistry and expression in music performance while teaching techniques with precision and discipline. British music education also intensely focused on diverse repertoires and composers other than the main classical canon. This trend moved her toward her research in classical and contemporary music, a burgeoning research area in music performance and music education.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Laura praised Malaysian music education for its focus on discipline and precision and the Yamaha music education system for good training for aural and musicianship skills.[12] However, the teaching could have been more varied in human expression, with teachers not open-minded to diverse interpretations and repertoires. She criticized the graded system for being narrow and not helping students to explore different composers. Various styles should be introduced to students at an early age.

As a current lecturer, Laura provided more information on the pros and cons of her music education through her research work in classical and contemporary music. She felt that students had little access to experimental music at a young age, which could open their minds to the tonal possibilities. For example, her research in French contemporary music and the connection between this music and Indonesian Gamelan music led to several exciting publications. She regularly championed contemporary classical music in music education and strived to change Malaysian music education to become more dynamic and artistic.

---

[12] Laura L., interview.

Carl's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to the United States

Carl began his music education in Malaysia. He also completed a Bachelor of Music in Malaysia. Then, he worked as a freelance teacher for a few years. He received an assistantship to study in the United States and completed a master's degree there. He is currently back in Malaysia as a music teacher.

Description of Music Education Journey

Carl described his music education in Malaysia as lacking: he needed better tutors and lagged in critical musicianship skills.[13] He also mentioned that Malaysian music teachers tend to have many students and activities, resulting in a lack of focus on students and a general fixed method to be applied for all students. He also felt that many music teachers needed more warmth and relationship skills, making him less interested in music. As a result, Carl felt that his fundamental music skills required to be stronger. He became passionate about music quite late and enrolled in a music program at a local Malaysian university. During this time, his musical skills improved, but he still felt that the culture of Malaysian music education did not help him to blossom.

As a result, Carl took a step to move to the United States to pursue music. He expounded on his positive experiences there. He enjoyed the systematic approach that he experienced in his music studies. For example, he took courses such as advanced aural skills, graduate research in music, wind ensemble, chamber music, applied music-piano, graduate music analysis, symphonic band, and piano pedagogy. He felt the courses equipped him with various musical knowledge and skills that helped him in his music career. Carl described the structure of his music studies in the United States as stemming from the lecturer's initial course introduction and a hard copy of a summary of the fourteen-week curriculum. These summaries were even more

---

[13] Carl C., interview by author, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, December 10, 2023

detailed for objective and quantifiable courses like research or analysis. The professors then provided additional resources and guidance throughout the courses, which helped students with their expectations and mastery of relevant skills. This systematic approach helped Carl improve his musical skills and fill the gaps in his musical knowledge. Professors would detail their requirements and expectations for subjective and practical courses like chamber music or wind ensemble. Carl was particularly impressed with chamber music courses, which listed many skills he needed to master. For example, he needed to label the scores with details on which instrument played the melody. This action helped him listen attentively to other players while playing collaboratively. Even intonation guidelines were provided for students in their ensembles, which opened Carl's mind to the intricacies of ensemble playing.

He also felt that his professors were engaged and attentive to the needs of students, always asking for the opinions of others while respecting their choices and allowing them the freedom to voice their concerns. Experiencing this learning approach led Carl to integrate an open-minded approach into his current teaching methodologies. Carl also explored the importance of mental and physical health during his music studies in the United States. The university system paired him with more senior students and students who were more junior. The senior students would offer him advice and counseling, and he was expected to do the same for the junior students. This support system was something he did not expect. Also, Carl had the opportunity to be a graduate assistant, which helped him to develop his teaching and social skills. He had to devise various curriculums which were attractive to him.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Carl was enthusiastic about the music education philosophies and psychologies of the United States. The open-mindedness of professors and students inspired him. Carl constantly

struggled to think creatively, as his Malaysian tutors often gave him direct instructions. In the States, the tutors often gave him a roadmap to decipher, especially in research. He was constantly challenged to think of diverse perspectives rather than leaning on the assumptions of the status quo. He had to continually imagine that his viewers and readers came from different cultures to write in a way that was communicative to many parties. Carl learned to provide contexts in his performances and research that clarified many opinions and beliefs in music. Becoming adaptable, adjustable, and malleable in mindsets was an encouraging experience for Carl.

Pedagogy courses were trickier as Carl had to analyze the philosophies and psychologies behind his actions constantly. American professors expected him to be able to mesh well with individuals from diverse backgrounds, as there were no one-size-fits-all solutions for students. Identifying the students' specific needs at the right time was challenging. Acknowledging one's weaknesses and human nature felt foreign to Carl as he grew up in a repressive educational environment. Carl also encountered diverse music education methods like Dalcroze, Suzuki, Orff, and Kodaly during his studies in the States, inspiring him in his teaching methods and approaches.

Carl continuously emphasized the structural nature of his education in the States. He was exposed to students from different age groups, providing him with much practical experience. He recalled having to be more fun for younger children in group settings. His professors reminded him that teachers significantly impact students, primarily if taught from a young age: Carl had to try to be creative in his teaching endeavors. Also, developing a teaching philosophy was a groundbreaking experience for Carl. He grew as a musician and teacher by having learning goals and plans, which he now incorporates into his teaching. Carl was used to the imitation pedagogical process he learned in Malaysia and the States; he had to become more critical

thinking by broadening his mind. Another aspect Carl learned about was planning lessons, in which an entire teaching course had to be planned out in advance. In Malaysia, he was used to going with the weekly flow of his lessons, so this was very different for him.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Carl was taught by an experienced professor in the United States who had many experiences with students from Malaysia. He said he needed a better foundation in Malaysia, so he needed to fix many bad habits in his piano playing. He needed to practice fundamental techniques, such as maintaining solid fingers that were curved and not bent. He strived to activate his finger joints from the knuckles. After much trial and error, he improved tremendously, especially his left hand. Previously, he had left-hand lagging issues regarding speed and agility that could be observed in scale-like passages. Carl could unify both hands to be equally agile using knuckle joints and active fingertips.

Carl also encountered the idea of utilizing body motion in piano playing. He subconsciously raised his shoulders when the music became tense, but it had the opposite effect of being detrimental to his playing. He also learned about moving his body naturally through the Dalcroze method. Specifically, he discussed how the shoulder, elbow, wrist, arm, and fingertips are connected when playing the piano. Weight transfer was another aspect that was important in piano playing. Chamber music sessions were also enlightening for Carl. He found aspects interesting in these sessions, such as the rhythmic precision, the differences in tone production between instruments that affect articulation, and the different styles of music, such as portato for Baroque).

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Carl went through the typical Malaysian exam-oriented music education process. For example, he was trained to get through the ABRSM examinations. He learned three pieces for each grade to get to the next level, and this process would be repeated. He needed to understand the musical elements properly. For example, he needed help understanding time signature differences. He had to get used to proper timings and rhythms in the United States. This was a significant difference in the music education processes he encountered in Malaysia.

Carl noted that both countries had music education syllabuses, but the United States professors provided much more initiative in ensuring that students master their subject.[14] In contrast, Malaysian professors and teachers had to juggle various administrative work and assignments, which affected their teaching methods. For example, a musicology professor may need to teach theory and musicianship with few references, resources, or guidelines. Also, Carl praised the specializations available in the United States, such as theory, composition, musicology, research, music therapy, music history, music education, and music production. Malaysian music education was much more general, resulting in many musicians and music teachers needing specialized skills and knowledge. Most commonly, available music and music performances are offered in Malaysian universities, with some research courses at a postgraduate level.

Carl also had the opportunity to observe the music programs of schools in the United States. In Malaysia, this type of program only existed in international schools. Most students in Malaysia only had a little exposure to music if the teachers or students formed bands, choirs, or orchestral ensembles through music clubs. The public does not have such a high level of musical skills and appreciation for music. Carl also remembered having an inferiority complex when he

---

[14] Carl C., interview.

moved to the States to study due to his lack of experience in the music field. Also, Carl mused on the need for more resources in Malaysian music education. He recalled exploring his university's library in the States and being impressed with the library resources there.

Another difference Carl noted for his education in the States was the graduate assistantship, which enabled him to be part of the university teaching program. This system was new to Carl, who said he had never experienced such a system in Malaysia. He felt that this system enabled him to be trained as a teacher in a way he would not imagine was possible; knowledge was transmitted and regurgitated in Malaysia, whereas teaching in the States required cultural understanding, flexible methods, and careful choice of words and actions.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Carl described his music education experience in Malaysia as having more room for mistakes. Since the music education level in Malaysia was less professional and systematic, his teachers, professors, and tutors were more accommodating. They were willing to be flexible and provide some extra guidance for students. He also had regular replacement lessons and additional guidance from different tutors throughout his studies in Malaysia. He also described the musician community in Malaysia as close, which helped him connect with many other musicians. He felt a sense of communal spirit as Malaysia needed more facilities and resources for musicians. Carl minored in the bassoon, which is very rare in Malaysia. Thus, many orchestras and ensembles asked him to participate in their performances, leading to a rich performing life and his solo and collaborative piano performances. Through these performances, he also acquired accompaniment and teaching opportunities.

However, the lack of resources in Malaysian music education caused many setbacks for Carl. He did not have much exposure to diverse music materials and books, which could have

sped up his progress significantly in all musical aspects. These materials were also costly, which made them more scarce. The lack of systematization in approaches also caused Carl to become less independent in thinking: he could not think of solutions to his musical problems and had to rely on imitation. This lack of understanding and critical thinking would significantly hinder Carl's music education journey.

Compared to his music education in Malaysia, Carl was excited to experience the wealth of workshops, festivals, materials, and learning approaches in the States. He was exposed to a high level of music-making and professionalism; this led him to explore music education approaches like Suzuki, Orff, Kodaly, Dalcroze, MYC, Taubman, and the Alexander Technique. He also felt that the music education approaches in the States led him to become a better thinker and emotionally intelligent. This catalyst for transformation led Carl to become interested in many diverse aspects of music-making and teaching.

Vicky's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to the United States

Vicky studied music in Malaysia until her undergraduate degree. Then, she received a scholarship to study in the United States. She completed a master's degree in the States and worked many years as a music teacher there before returning to Malaysia.

Description of Music Education Journey

Vicky started her music education in Malaysia and recalled her education as narrow in perspective. At the same time, she was brought up in a very formal and polite manner, where she had to respect her elders. Studying music in Malaysia was a serious matter, yet she did not feel she was developing her musical skills properly. When she had the chance, she moved to the United States to pursue further studies in music.

Vicky described her music education in the United States as well-rounded, with attention to many musical genres and styles. As she pursued a master's degree, the course focused on writing and performing. Due to the language requirement, Vicky had to enroll in an English course to become familiar with the writing style and citation format. She recalled that she needed to read articles and write essays every week. She enjoyed the comprehensive nature of the courses, which could be divided into several days. Each of the classes was planned, and the syllabus was detailed: she rarely had questions about what to do or prepare for future classes. Vicky also enjoyed the assignments that she was given. She described the assignments as reading articles of thirty to fifty pages or writing drafts of essays. Lectures were at most two hours, and she found it manageable for her workload. Vicky also enjoyed the online resources and tools like Google Classroom and Kahoot, which she found engaging.

Vicky also enjoyed the casual and informal lesson format of certain classes in the United States. She discovered that this format was helpful as it enabled the teacher and students to get to

know each other better. Fun dress codes and snacks helped her to bond with the teachers and other students in a way she did not think was possible. At the same time, she was impressed by the accessibility of professors. They would correspond regularly with students via email, and meetings were likely to discuss assignments or personal matters. Vicky was also impressed by the professors' professionalism and caring character. The support from the academic staff was significant for her music education journey.

As an international student, Vicky used her university's Center for Writing Excellence. This center enabled students to seek help for their thesis or assignments. Vicky scheduled regular meetings with the staff in person and online to help her with her writing. She was thankful she had regular supervision and guidance, as English was not her first language. The supportive role of the counseling center also struck Vicky: as an international student, she had some adjustment issues, which she overcame with the help of counselors. Vicky has yet to experience such professional psychological support in Malaysia. Also, there were courses such as the Alexander technique, which aided Vicky tremendously in her practice and mental well-being.

Overall, Vicky credited her education in the United States as a fantastic experience. She learned much about music and acquired additional skills such as time management, financial management, problem-solving, communication, discipline, and attention to detail. She benefited from the experience and became a better musician and music teacher.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Vicky had a strict and conservative upbringing for her education in Malaysia, so she was not used to the freedom to express her opinions in the United States. She was also struck by how her professors communicated their ideas in lecturing and teaching. Her professors regularly sought feedback on various matters to ensure she understood the materials she was analyzing. In

Malaysia, Vicky encountered education as a black-and-white matter, with facts as true or false. Her teachers asked specific questions, which she had to answer correctly. In contrast, professors in the United States preferred open-ended questions that led to much discussion and thinking among the students. Correct answers were unavailable, but many possibilities and ideas were discussed. Due to this process, Vicky felt that her mind became more open and analytical. As a music teacher, Vicky became more attentive to her students' questions through this way of learning. She learned to be diplomatic yet allowed students to probe musical ideas and concepts.

Vicky expounded on her professor's auditory and tactile approaches in teaching music and piano performance. For example, her professor would describe an expressive phrase as "speak with your fingers." Producing a singing tone on the instrument was a significant aspect of her instrumental lessons. Methods such as physically singing the melody, tonal differentiation, and body movements that change the sound, such as using the core and leaning forward or backward, enhanced her learning experiences. Vicky was struck by the involvement of the whole body in music-making, which can affect the performance. She described many sessions where she had to analyze with her professor and course mates the way physical movements and gestures affect the tonal production of the instrument. She was impressed by the way music and choreography were related.

Vicky also described her freedom in music research to express her ideas. She was used to the transmission education methods in Malaysia, where she just needed to fill in the blanks. In the United States, her professor encouraged her to write more freely to express her thoughts. This was a complex process as Vicky was used to having sample writing and transparent formats for research. Vicky gave an example of the "state of research," which she was expected to review and write about literature on the subject matter. The cultural difference between her conservative

education in Malaysia and her music education in the United States could also be traced to the fact that American professors were more complimentary. She felt this was a positive aspect, building her confidence and expressive side. She learned to appreciate compliments as empowering and positive rather than feel embarrassed due to her conservative upbringing.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Vicky described the pedagogical process in the United States as worlds apart from her music education in Malaysia. She eschewed how she learned music in Malaysia as too rigid and superficial. In the States, she had the opportunity to be a graduate assistant who taught functional group piano lessons. She learned to become flexible in applying pedagogical approaches with the mindset of helping each student with specific objectives. An essential part of this process was breaking down each learning process into small, achievable steps. For example, learning scales, using lead sheets, improvisation, learning standard repertoire, and sight-reading skills must be analyzed and broken down into learning steps. As a student and teacher, she learned to be systematic and flexible, which she credited to her music education in the United States.

Vicky also recalled the "descriptive word" concept that she learned through her music lessons. For each piece she played, she needed to pinpoint a specific descriptive word that served as the guidepost for her interpretation. Advanced musical analysis and conception of lyrical tone would then complement this descriptive word. Vicky was forced to envision music as something descriptive and expressive. In the past, she only aimed to play music smoothly without mistakes. In the United States, she had to focus on tone color, singing tone, phrasing, direction of the music, and constant listening to produce an interpretation of the highest quality. This pedagogical process challenged her. Her teachers criticized her "sight-reading style" performances, in which she played the music without attention to detail.

Vicky also described the joint studio class where students needed to provide constructive comments for each other professionally. She learned to be analytical in commenting on tone color, unique characteristics, technique, specific expressive details, and other musical issues. She benefited both as a student and also as a teacher-in-training. Vicky also recalled the listening assignments where she had to compare different recordings of the same piece and capture the differences in detail. Students also had to discuss the style and interpretation of these diverse recordings, which helped them understand the broad nature of music performance.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Vicky described the similarities of her music education in Malaysia and the United States as focused on music performances. She has experience playing for collaborative recitals, studio recitals, concerto competitions, choir concerts, and charity recitals. She also attended performances regularly as well. For Vicky, her music education in both countries firmly focused on performances.

Vicky then expounded on the differences between her music education in Malaysia and the United States. She had the privilege to attend a university that was a Steinway school, which meant she had access to practice on a high-quality piano every day, with performances on a beautiful concert grand as well. Having regular access to such instruments improved her piano techniques tremendously. Vicky also became a better listener as these instruments could produce fine gradations of tone and were sensitive to different touches. Vicky also felt that the warm, supportive environment in the United States differed significantly from the clinical nature of Malaysian music education. Her professors in the States tried to provide many platforms for Vicky to perform, whereas, in Malaysia, she had to find these herself. Vicky was involved in charitable events such as recitals for the Institute for Learning in Retirement and Oxford Food

Pantry, where she performed to raise funds for retirees and people experiencing homelessness. This attitude of giving back to the community inspired Vicky to believe musicians had social responsibilities to use their talents for the greater good.

Vicky also expounded on the Optional Practical Training program she enrolled in after graduation, enabling her to work as a piano teacher in the United States. Her teaching experiences in the United States were also vastly different from her Malaysian experiences. American approaches emphasized creative and fun learning methods. Vicky conducted many lessons similar to playing games and used many online resources for her lessons. She was glad that her students did not rebel in her classes. She recalled her experiences teaching in Malaysia, where parents wanted lessons that were not games or technology; Malaysian students were expected to master specific skills and demonstrate these through assessments and examinations. In the United States, Vicky did not need to enroll students for examinations and pressure them to get good grades in music. At the same time, they needed to perform two recitals a year, a summer and winter recital. The students would choose pieces they liked, and the teacher would prepare them for the performance. Thus, Vicky had to become knowledgeable in pop and rock songs and select appropriate student arrangements.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Vicky enthusiastically described the Pros of her music education in the United States. She felt that music education in the States was far superior to Malaysian music education as she acquired many soft skills such as communication, time management, problem-solving, creativity, leadership, and resourcefulness. She learned that as a piano performer and teacher, being a good communicator and resourcefulness is essential. She also highlighted that the States was a highly developed country with many professionals and experts. She was able to join the Music Teacher

National Association and receive a National College of Teacher Music title as well. Vicky received a peer-reviewed journal every quarter year containing many well-written professional articles. Through these articles, Vicky received information on teaching, managing music schools, music technology, personality tests for students, and other exciting materials. Vicky also mentioned the Music Teacher National Conference, where many publishers, authors, speakers, and performers participated. There were lectures, talks, and workshops on many different topics.

Vicky also noted that in the United States, there were countless instrumentalists with whom she could collaborate. There were many performance and collaborative opportunities, leaving her almost overwhelmed at times. The time she needed to divide between practicing, rehearsing, and teaching left her exhausted, but her portfolio improved in quality. She also had opportunities to work with many professors and travel around the States and Europe to perform on occasions such as choir concerts, orchestral concerts, and instrumental chamber concerts. Being a music student in the States gave her far more exposure than her narrow experiences in Malaysia. Also, her writing and research skills improved tremendously in the United States. Vicky recommends music education in the States to anyone who can travel there.

Karen's Music Education Journey: From Malaysia to the United States

Karen studied music in Malaysia up till her undergraduate degree. Then, she received a scholarship to study in the United States. She completed a master's degree in the States and is currently working as a music lecturer in the United States.

Description of Music Education Journey

Karen began her music education in Malaysia, taking private piano lessons at her teacher's home. She underwent the exam-oriented process, focusing on three examination pieces and music theory in forty-five-minute sessions. She took each practical examination after six or

eight months, alternating with theory exams over eight years. Ear training and musicianship were not emphasized except for periods close to the examination. Predominantly, her teacher chose the repertoire for her. Occasionally, she was allowed to pick a couple of favorite examination pieces to polish. Karen did not have many performance opportunities except during her music examinations. Later, in middle and high school, Karen joined the school orchestra as an extracurricular activity, choosing the violin as a second instrument. Traditionally, beginners were taught by senior orchestra members. Occasionally, professional violin instructors guided techniques and performance practices. The orchestra had concerts once every two years.

After high school, Karen majored in music performance at a public university in Malaysia. She had to take courses such as theory, history, aural, musicianship, applied piano, composition, choir, orchestra, world music, psychology, and sociology. She described music theory lessons as random and not tied to specific concepts. The lecturer would read the textbook and ask the class to answer the questions afterward with little explanation. Karen did not enjoy aural and musicianship classes as she noted that the lecturer needed to provide strategies for interval identification and melodic dictation. There were no textbooks or supplementary materials. Due to administrative circumstances, Karen studied with different piano tutors throughout her four-year undergraduate course. This situation presented her with learning challenges due to different expectations and teaching styles. Still, she learned the importance of listening, technique, and musicality.

After graduating, Karen pursued a master's degree in the United States and received a graduate assistantship for her time at the university. The degree program had three requirements: a solo recital, a graduate research paper, and a three-hour oral exam covering music theory, piano literature, and a specific research topic. Karen took other courses such as applied piano lessons,

piano literature, piano pedagogy, graduate research, advanced music theory, world music history, and advanced musicianship courses. Weekly assignments were posted on Canvas for submission and grading. Professors encouraged students to participate in group discussions once a week, and students needed to participate in group projects and presentations. As a graduate assistant, Karen required twenty hours of teaching functional piano classes for non-piano major students and accompaniment for singers and choir each week. She also taught four piano group classes, with one class meeting twice a week. She also accompanied chamber singers and solo singers for their examinations and performances. She described her music education in the States as comprehensive, well-rounded, and inspiring.

Philosophies and Psychologies of Music Education

Karen described the psychologies of music education in Asia as behaviorist. Her initial teacher provided step-by-step instructions, played the correct notes, gave accurate answers, and clapped the right rhythms during piano lessons. Mistakes were discouraged, and negative reinforcement meant that mistakes led to punishments. At the same time, she received positive reinforcement through compliments or external rewards such as stickers. In North America, Karen described her music education as cognitivist and humanistic. Instead of clear directions, professors would ask broad questions that students needed to explore. For example, for Karen's research, her professor asked her many questions that narrowed her topic selection, allowing her to utilize prior research strategies that Karen employed. Such an approach helped Karen to understand the importance of problem-solving, making mistakes, interacting with the material, and thinking critically. For theory, Karen encountered a humanistic approach that she found fresh and different. Her professor focused on the potential of each individual, allowing them to

choose their learning articles and set their structure for presentations. An informal, flexible, and engaging approach meant that each student had room to grow and experience self-actualization.

Karen noted that both Malaysian music education and music education in the States helped her to develop a passion for loving and creating music. She feels that music education philosophies in the States were more instrumental in shaping her musical identity as a performer and teacher, as Malaysian music education was more rigid in approaches. For example, she received much feedback from peers and professors in the States. She also had to listen to many recordings that helped her develop her sense of musical taste and judgment. Applied piano lessons were tailored to the student's strengths, and expressive qualities were constantly prioritized. Karen also described how she had to set clear goals for her practice sessions, leading her to develop a keen love for a systematic way of learning music. Analysis of piano techniques and interpretations of different genres helped Karen to feel motivated always.

Karen experienced a philosophy of music education that she specifically felt was special for the United States. Her professors respected the students' individuality and potential and could vary their teaching styles based on their personalities, strengths, limitations, and potential. Professors also understood the importance of one-to-one meetings with students to provide unique assignment suggestions and materials. She also felt that her professors in the States were great role models in performing research. They did not just teach but regularly performed and presented research topics at conferences.

Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Karen enthusiastically described the pedagogical processes she went through in the United States. The discovery learning approach meant that students had minimal information but only guidelines for their learning. For example, Karen learned about the Schenkerian method

through modeling after completing a version of another piece. The professor merely provided helpful hints, and she had to spend much time transcribing the technique to another piece. At the same time, through this independent project, she mastered the fundamentals of Schenkerian analysis.

In music education, Karen also experienced individual learning styles, incremental preparation, and systematic presentations. Recognizing her preference as a visual and tactile learner, Karen relied on demonstration and physical touch to master various instrumental techniques. For example, when working on a difficult passage, Karen would analyze the details or modify the passage to teach her muscles to understand the movements. Systematic analysis of musical passages and a focus on sound and interpretation meant that Karen had to learn music rationally yet expressively. The concept of trial and error also suggested that Karen could try out various pieces in performance settings and receive feedback from peers and tutors. Although this process was present in Malaysia, Karen felt her music education in the States elevated this approach to a different level. Also, in research, Karen had to constantly rely on trial and error to refine her papers to fit the thesis statement.

Similarities and Differences between Diverse Music Education Experiences

Karen described the similarities between Malaysian music education and music education in the States as relying on existing curricula and syllabi. Most institutions would utilize a fixed curriculum and emphasize the importance of ensembles and group performances. However, the similarities end there. Karen would expound on the merits of American music education compared to Malaysian music education. American music education had strong ties with festivals, competitions, and communities. Music education in the States would have more access to funding from different sources. Universities in the states had more access to qualified staff,

music scores, high-quality instruments, and facilities. Malaysian music education had few such advantages, and many professors had to teach courses outside their specialization. American music education focuses on expression, individual creativity, and broad exploration of musical genres. In contrast, Malaysian music education focuses on discipline and technical mastery. North American music education was more collaborative and interactive, while Malaysian music education emphasized the hierarchical relationship between teacher and student.

Pros and Cons of Music Education Experiences

Karen expounded on the pros of her music education in the Stated. She developed adaptive solid skills, integrating diverse teaching styles and methodologies. She learned many American musical terms and can tailor her lessons to the students' personalities, strengths, and needs. She also acquired a cultural versatility that enabled her to understand many cultures' different cultural contexts and musical genres. She had many opportunities to network and collaborate with music teachers and performers. Through her experiences in diverse contexts, Karen felt she became more creative and innovative. Regarding the cons of her music education in the States, she sometimes felt uncomfortable with discussions as Asian culture did not emphasize this approach to learning. She also felt overwhelmed with the research aspect of her university life, where she felt American music education had high standards for academic papers.

Overall Summary of Findings

The findings from the participants' interviews and the researcher's journal provided vital information on the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts. Many participants also detailed their piano learning journey and professional development experiences. This chapter systematically presented all of these data, which will be dissected for themes and subthemes in the following chapter.

Chapter Five: Conclusion/Discussion

This final chapter describes the participants' insights about their music education experiences in diverse cultures and contexts by summarizing the findings. This discussion addresses the four research questions with tables that depict the themes from participants' experiences and compared them to previous research. The chapter also presented theoretical and practical implications with recommendations for further study. The chapter and dissertation ended with a summary and conclusion.

Summary of Findings: Central Research Question

The central research question concerns the similarities and differences between music education philosophies and psychologies among piano pedagogical methods of different countries and regions. In the interviews, participants described the similarities and differences of their music education experiences. These descriptions relate to the countries and contexts in which they received their music education. From these interviews, a few themes emerged; these begin to be seen in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Similarities and Differences

1.1 Asian Music Education	Researcher	Rachel	Jennifer	Jessica	Yvonne	Yasmin	Laura	Carl	Vicky	Karen
a. Asian music education was strict and rigid.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes	Yes.
b. Asian music education was flexible and creative.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
c. Asian										

music education used Western languages and music notation.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
d. Asian music education involves diverse musical genres	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
e. Asian music education was formal.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
f. Asian music education was informal.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
1.2 European Music Education										
a. European music education was strict and rigid.	Yes.	-	-	No.	No.	No.	No.	-	-	-
b. European music education was flexible and creative.	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
c. European music education used	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-

Western languages and music notation.										
d. European music education involved diverse musical genres.	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
e. European music education was formal.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
f. European music education was informal.	No.	-	-	No.	No.	No.	No.	-	-	-
1.3 American Music Education										
a. American music education was flexible and creative.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. American music education used Western languages and music notation.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.

c. American music education involves diverse musical genres	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
d. American music education was formal.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
e. American music education as informal.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes. .

Theme 1.1 Asian Music Education

Theme 1.1 had the heading of Asian Music Education. Subtheme 1.1a was the statement that Asian music education was strict and rigid. The researcher disagreed with this statement due to his experiences with creative improvisation and Yamaha music education. However, all other participants resounded yes to this statement through their interview descriptions. For example, Rachel had to quit piano lessons for some time in her teens due to the rigorous nature of her lessons, which caused her much stress. Jennifer, whose education was purely in Malaysia, had some creative music education experiences, but these were overwhelmed by bad teachers who rigidly used false methods. All the other participants, including Yvonne, Yasmin, Jessica, Laura, Carl, Vicky, and Karen, compared Asian music education unfavorably to European or American music education. There were many descriptions of strict technical training with little room for creative interpretation or musicianship.

Subtheme 1.1b was that Asian music education was flexible and creative. Only the researcher agreed with this statement. He described his musical experiences in composition and improvisation with a strong focus on popular music. When he moved abroad to Europe, he was shocked by the systematic approaches to European music education. Interestingly, all other participants did not agree with this statement. The only possible exception was Jennifer: she received some positive experiences in her music education in Malaysia, but this was dampened by her many negative experiences with rigid and strict teachers who were not empathetic. Many participants became more creative when they moved from Asia to Europe or North America. This provides evidence for the hypothesis that European and North American music education encouraged musicianship, creativity, and improvisation.

Subtheme 1.1c was that Asian music education used Western languages and music notation. Overwhelmingly, all participants experienced Western music education as the dominant approach. The researcher and Rachel had some experiences with ethnomusicological music education approaches, but Western music was prevalent in Asian music education approaches. This fact meant that globalization and internationalization helped to standardize Western music into international music but also threatened the unique music practices of Asia. Many of Malaysia's music education philosophies and psychologies amalgamated Western musical ideas and Asian mindsets. This unique blend of music education approaches caused the Western musical world to be revolutionized, gradually becoming a global world music genre.

Subtheme 1.1d was that Asian music education involved diverse musical genres. The researcher and Rachel agreed with this statement through their descriptions. The researcher experienced many various musical genres while studying music in Malaysia. Rachel, who had music education experiences in China, noted that Chinese cultural music was incorporated into

her learning materials and approaches. Most other participants partook in the dominant Western music education tradition set up in the country as a global music education practice. Their descriptions of Asian music education involved the transmission of Western musical genres and musical practices.

Subtheme 1.1e was that Asian music education was formal subtheme, and 1.1f was that Asian music education was informal. All participants except the researcher believed that their music education experiences in Asia were traditional. Only the researcher wrote about his creative experiences in music-making in Malaysia. Other participants had to undergo rigorous training, which could have been more effective for their musicianship development. Alternatively, none of the participants felt that Asian music education was informal. Only the researcher had many everyday music-making experiences. Interestingly, the researcher is much older than many of the interviewed participants, which means he might have experienced an informal music education before systematic music education became popular in Malaysia. Most participants had experiences with strict music teachers who imposed discipline and rigor on their musical progress.

Theme 1.2 European Music Education

Theme 1.2 was European music education. Theme 1.2a is that European music education was strict and rigid; subtheme 1.2b was that European music education was flexible and creative. Only the researcher felt European music education needed more rigorous and inflexible. In contrast, the other four participants who studied in Europe, including Yvonne, Yasmin, Jessica, and Laura, had the opposite experience. They noted that European music education was artistic and creative. A possible reason is that many of these participants were trained in a rigorous technical background in music, and the researcher had a popular music background in Malaysia.

The researcher had a rigorous classical music education in Europe, so he did not find the educational philosophies flexible or creative. The other participants received enrichment in their music education through artistic interpretation and critical thinking, encouraged by their European professors. They had far more positive experiences in European music education than the researcher.

Subtheme 1c was that European music education used Western languages and music notation. All participants and the researcher agreed on this. Some participants mused that they had more exposure to contemporary classical music in Europe, which was experimental. They received training in such avant-garde musical genres unavailable in Malaysia. Their knowledge of music theory was enriched through their music education in Europe. As many of them were trained in classical Western music, their further education in Europe broadened this education. They had overwhelmingly positive feedback for the way European music education was conducted.

Subtheme 1.2d stated that European music education involved diverse musical genres, while subtheme 1.2e was that European music education was formal. The researcher had narrow classical music training in Europe, so he did not encounter many musical genres. However, the other interviewed participants spoke on the fact that they were encouraged to explore diverse repertoires from different composers. They met many different styles of music during their music education in Europe.. All participants studied music formally in a university and noted music education's systematic nature. At the same time, many participants noted how systematization was combined with the creative nature of music education in Europe. The subtheme 1.2f of informal European music education only resonated with some participants as they did not study outside the university.

Theme 1.3 American Music Education

Theme 1.3 is American Music Education, and all of the various subthemes produced diverse responses. Subtheme 1.3a was that American music education was flexible and creative. No one felt that American music education was strict and rigid. Many interviewed participants spoke on how American music education opened their eyes to the creative possibilities of music performance and music education. Subtheme 1.3b was that American music education used Western languages and music notation; all participants overwhelmingly agreed with this as they had moved to the States to pursue more profound knowledge of Western musical genres. All participants also agreed with subtheme 1.1d, which was that American music education involved diverse musical genres. They encountered various musical genres with a strong emphasis on Western traditions. These encounters utilized Western notation and languages, although the underlying ideas could be from diverse sources. Subtheme 1.1d was that American music education was formal: all participants pursued music in universities that had systematic curricula. All participants agreed with subtheme 1.1e that American music education was informal. This contradiction can be explained through the methodologies and approaches encountered. Many participants spoke in the informal discussions and guidance sessions, although they were part of a formal university degree course. This combination of formal and informal music education philosophies and approaches is the unique strength of American music education.

Summary of Findings: Research Sub-question One

The central research question had three sub-questions related to it. The first sub-question is related to different countries' music education philosophies and psychologies. Participants described the philosophies and psychologies of music education they encountered in the interviews. From these interviews, a few themes emerged, as shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Philosophies and Psychologies

2.1 Music Education Experiences in Asia Similar to Asian Philosophies of Music Education	Researcher	Rachel	Jennifer	Jessica	Yvonne	Yasmin	Laura	Carl	Vicky	Karen
a. Music education experiences similar to Chinese philosophies	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes	Yes.
b. Music education experiences similar to Malaysian philosophies	Yes	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
c. Music education experiences similar to Indian philosophies	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
d. Music education experiences similar to Japanese philosophies	Yes.	No.	Yes.	No.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.
e. Music education experiences similar to Latin-American/Philippines philosophies.	Yes	No.	No.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	No.	Yes.
f. Music education	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.

experiences similar to West Asian/Persian philosophies										
2.2 Music education experiences in Europe similar to European philosophies										
a. Music education experiences similar to Ancient Greek philosophies	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
b. Music education experiences similar to philosophies of the Middle Ages	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
c. Music education experiences similar to philosophies of the Enlightenment and Romanticism.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
d. Music education experiences are similar to modern European philosophies.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
2.3 Music education experiences in the United States similar to North American Philosophies										

a. Music education experiences similar to the Aesthetic Philosophy	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. Music education experiences similar to the Praxial/Pragmatic philosophies.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
c. Music education experiences similar to the Postmodern philosophies	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
2.4 Psychologies of Music Education										
a.Music Education experiences in Europe similar to Psychologies of music education in Europe	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes	-	-	-
b. Music Education experiences in the United States are similar to Psychologies of music education in North America	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
2.5 Experiences related to the Globalization of music education.										

a. Experiences related to International music education and comparative music education.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. Experiences related to Online music education.	Yes.	No.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.

Theme 2.1 Music Education Experiences in Asia are similar to Asian Philosophies of Music Education.

Several themes emerged from the participants' interviews. The first is theme 2.1, which is that music education experiences in Asia are similar to Asian music education philosophies. Subtheme 2.1a would be music education experiences similar to Chinese philosophies. All participants except Jessica and Yvonne mentioned philosophies of music education that fit the descriptions of Asian music education philosophies from literature. The researcher's narrative also contained similar descriptions. For example, Vicky described her music education in Malaysia as cultivating virtues such as discipline; this is similar to Confucian ideas of music education philosophies. Many participants also noted that their music education in Asia seemed more ritualistic and technical, identical to Mozi's philosophy of music education. Also, rigidity and strictness were similar to legalistic philosophies from China. For example, Jennifer encountered many teachers who were not flexible in their teaching approaches. Only Jessica and Yvonne described their music education as incompatible with Chinese philosophies. This phenomenon is apparently due to the Westernization of music education, which caused

some students to experience only Western music education approaches exclusively while living in Malaysia.

Subtheme 2.1b was identified as music education experiences being similar to Malaysian philosophies. All participants experienced Malaysian music education philosophies, for example. The researcher had experiences in diverse ethnomusicological genres during his studies in Malaysia. Also, Jennifer had experiences in popular music, which hugely influenced the music education philosophies in Malaysia. The colonization of Malaysia by Britain led to the proliferation of British music examinations, which dominated music education philosophies in Malaysia. All participants noted some experience with these examinations, either positively or negatively. The syncretization of various Chinese, Arabic, and Western cultures in Malaysian music education also influenced music education philosophies. All participants noted mixed approaches based on diverse music education philosophies in their interviews.

Subtheme 2.1c emerged as music education experiences being similar to Indian philosophies, while subtheme 2.1d was music education experiences being similar to Japanese philosophies. Both were emphasizing the holistic nature of music education. Only the researcher had a diverse music education while he was in Malaysia. Thus, he encountered music education philosophies with religious connotations to understand music as a harmonious activity between soul, mind, and body. The researcher, Jennifer, Yasmin, and Laura, all had experiences with Yamaha's and Suzuki's music education philosophies. Also, the researcher encountered music education philosophies similar to traditional Japanese music education philosophies, such as the emptiness of meaning in sound. Yasmin described the Suzuki method as key to her music education foundation in her interview. The Yamaha music education philosophy also had positive feedback from the participants who encountered it. They spoke of the difference

between the creativity of the music education philosophy versus the rigid philosophies of music education they encountered elsewhere in Asia.

Subtheme 2.1e was music education experiences being similar to Latin American/Filipino music education philosophies. The researcher, Jessica, Yasmin, Carl, and Karen encountered music education philosophies based on entertainment and rituals. Music education had the goal of producing people who could entertain others. This philosophy helped the performance skills of those involved, but detailed training needed to be included. Thus, this philosophy only made amateurs in music education and music performance.

The last subtheme, 2.1f, would be music education experiences similar to West Asian/Persian philosophies. Only the researcher had music education experiences related to ethnomusicology, which explored various instruments of diverse cultures. Other participants participated in the dominant Western music education system to which they had access.

Theme 2.2 Music Education Experiences in Europe are similar to European Philosophies of Music Education.

Theme 2.2 is music education experiences in Europe being similar to European philosophies. Subtheme 2.2a is music education experiences existing as identical to Ancient Greek philosophies. All participants who studied in Europe encountered music education philosophies identical to ancient Greek philosophies. For example, the researcher discovered the Platonic idea that classical music had to be studied intellectually to understand music; analysis of harmony and sound is similar to Pythagoras's ideas. The concept of Pythagorean acoustics also influenced Johann Sebastian Bach, a key figure in Western classical music. Therefore, all participants who studied in Europe had some encounter with ancient Greek philosophies of music education.

Subtheme 2.2b is music education experiences bieng similar to philosophies of the Middle Ages. All participants also encountered music education philosophies identical to those of the Middle Ages during their European studies. For example, the researcher wrote of the rationality and practicality of his music education, which is similar to ideas from St. Augustine. Understanding Christian theology and music also figures prominently in Western classical music. Thus, European music students strongly influenced the philosophies of the Middle Ages in their musical studies.

Subtheme 2.2c is music education experiences mirroring the philosophies of Enlightenment and Romanticism. This subtheme is very prominent as many ideas from these eras influenced European music education. Thus, all participants who had the opportunity to study in Europe experienced these philosophies. For example, Yasmin spoke of the artistic interpretation of music, which professors try to teach her through language: this idea is similar to Rousseau's and Kant's ideas. All participants also encountered ideas from philosophers, such as the autonomous nature of music from Hanslick, the subjective nature of music from Schopenhauer, and the tenuous relation between morals and music from Tolstoy and Adler. European music students study these ideas in detail, especially when analyzing music from composers of the same era. For example, Jessica spoke of the ideas of individual expression. Yvonne also talked about the subjective nature of music education in her interview. Yasmin noted the artistic and interpretative nature of music in her interview.

Subtheme 2.2d. is music education experiences being similar to modern European

philosophies. Again, all participants encountered experiences identical to modern European philosophies. The Wittgenstein ideas of music being fluid and interconnected with life and other art forms formed the cornerstone of the music education experiences of many participants who studied in Europe. For example, Laura encountered the ideas of artistic interpretation and imagination in Europe. Many participants also discovered the music education ideas of Kodaly, Dalcroze, and Orff in their studies in Europe: Yvonne studied the Kodaly method in the United Kingdom. Many of these modern European philosophies permeate the music education system of Europe.

Theme 2.3 Music Education Experiences in the United States are similar to North American Philosophies of Music Education.

Theme 2.3 is music education experiences in the United States being similar to North American Philosophies. All participants interviewed experienced Subthemes 2.3a to 2.3c. Subtheme 2.3a is music education experiences mirroring that of Aesthetic Philosophy; Subtheme 2.3b is music education experiences being identical to the Praxial/Pragmatic philosophies; and Subtheme 2.3c is music education experiences that are those akin to the Postmodern philosophies. For example, Carl experienced a systematic approach to music education to analyze works of art in his music education in the States. This experience is similar to Reimer's ideas from the Aesthetic philosophy. Vicky spoke about how casual and informal music education approaches led to her understanding of the relationship between music education and the community. This experience is similar to Dewey's ideas from Pragmatic philosophies. Karen spoke about the many collaborative experiences in performing and researching music, which is similar to ideas from Elliott's praxial philosophy.

Theme 2.4 Psychologies of Music Education

Theme 2.4 is the Psychologies of Music Education. Subtheme 2.4a is music education experiences in Europe mirroring that of psychologies of music education from Europe. Identical to music education philosophies, participants who studied in Europe encountered psychologies of music education from Europe. For example, the systematic nature of music education described by the researcher is similar to Vygotsky and Piaget's idea that education should be conducted in stages, incorporating knowledge acquisition's social and intellectual aspects. Yasmin spoke about the artistic interpretation of emotion and subconscious meanings in music, similar to the psychological theories of Freud and Jung. Yvonne also talked about the idea of performance flow, which is identical to the concept of flow by Csikszentmihalyi.

Subtheme 2.4b is that music education experiences in the United States are similar to music education psychologies in North America. Carl spoke on how the States' professors cared about the student's well-being and development, similar to the ideas of actualization by Maslow. Karen talked about incorporating a broad range of activities, similar to Gardner's ideas, highlighting multiple intelligences in education. She also mentioned the humanistic and cognivistic nature of her education in the States, similar to Rauscher's notion that music and sociobiological changes in the brain are interrelated.

Theme 2.5 Globalization of Music Education

The last theme, theme 2.5, is experiences related to the globalization of music education. Subtheme 2.5a is experiences related to international music education and comparative music education. All participants except Jennifer experienced global music education in different contexts; Jennifer was the only one who did not have the opportunity to experience music education outside Malaysia. Thus, her experiences are restricted to a particular local area and form a contrast to the other participants. The experiences of the other participants are similar to

Phillips's ideas that educational transfer is significant in today's society. Intercultural exchanges form the bulk of the interviews, where participants compared philosophies and psychologies of music education from diverse contexts. For example, Carl provided a stark contrast between his negative experiences in Malaysia versus his positive experiences in the States. The ideas of Westernization in music education are often broached in interviews, with most participants participating in the dominant Western music education models. Only the researcher had experience with ethnomusicological pursuits. Even contemporary classical ventures by Laura and Jessica were based on the foundation of Western classical music. Kertz-Welzel's ideas of different assessment methods can be traced in the musings of various participants on the examination system established in Malaysia. Both negative and positive facets of this system were mentioned throughout the study.

The last subtheme, 2.5b, is experiences related to online music education. Again, most participants had experiences with technology in music education, except Rachel and Jennifer. Participants like Vicky spoke about their experience with Kahoot and Google Classroom and using relevant online resources. Overwhelmingly, all participants felt that online music education was vital to music education moving into the future.

<div align="center">Summary of Findings: Research Sub-question Two</div>

The second research sub-question concerns different countries' music education pedagogical processes. Participants described the music education pedagogical processes they encountered in the interviews. From these interviews, a few themes emerged, detailed in Table 3.

Table 3. Music Education Pedagogical Processes

3.1 Asian Music Education Pedagogical Processes	Researcher	Rachel	Jennifer	Jessica	Yvonne	Yasmin	Laura	Carl	Vicky	Karen
a. The pedagogical process of Asian music education was systematic.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	Yes.
b. The pedagogical process of Asian music education was adequate.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.
c. The pedagogical process of Asian music education encouraged critical thinking.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
d. The pedagogical process of Asian music education was holistic and comprehensive.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.
e. The pedagogical process of Asian music education encouraged creativity and expressiveness.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
3.2 European										

Music Education Pedagogical Processes										
a. The pedagogical process of European music education was systematic.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
b. The pedagogical process of European music education was adequate.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
c. The pedagogical process of European music education encouraged critical thinking.	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
d. The pedagogical process of European music education was holistic and comprehensive	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
e. The pedagogical process of European music education encouraged creativity and	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-

expressivene ss.									
3.3 American Music Education Pedagogical Processes									
a. The pedagogical process of American music education was systematic.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. The pedagogical process of American music education was adequate.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
c. The pedagogical process of American music education encouraged critical thinking.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
d. The pedagogical process of American music education was holistic and comprehensi ve.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
e. The pedagogical process of	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.

American music education encouraged creativity and expressiveness.										

Theme 3.1 Asian Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Theme 3.1 is Asian music education pedagogical processes. Subtheme 3.1a is that the pedagogical process of Asian music education was systematic. Neither the researcher nor Carl agreed with this statement, however, all other participants agreed with this statement. Most participants who agreed with this statement referred to the graded syllabus they encountered, which was administered systematically. They took examinations in music level by level, leading to improvement in musical skills. For example, Karen noted that her music education in Malaysia consisted of going from level to level and accomplishing the specific milestones set by the syllabus. The researcher and Carl encountered more haphazard Asian music education processes that were not systematic.

Subtheme 3.1b is that the pedagogical process of Asian music education was adequate. The researcher and Yasmin agreed with this statement; all other participants did not agree with this statement. The researcher had a broad range of experiences in Asia with diverse musical genres and ethnomusicological leanings, leading him to feel favorably toward Asian music education. Yasmin praised the Suzuki music education system that helped build a strong foundation for her violin performance studies. Other participants like Laura and Jennifer had some positive experiences, for example, with Yamaha music education. Still, these were drowned out by the multiple rigid teachers and approaches they encountered in Malaysia. Other

participants did not speak too highly of Asian music education, with many speaking of their favorable experiences in Europe and North America.

Subtheme 3.1c is that the pedagogical process of Asian music education encourages critical thinking. No one agreed with this subtheme: all participants felt that Asian music education lacked the intellectual and academic facets they had to look for in other countries. For example, Yvonne mentioned that her education in the United Kingdom opened her eyes to diverse music teaching approaches due to the participatory nature of music education. She rarely encountered this type of learning in Asia, or it needed to be conducted more effectively. Jessica also spoke extensively about the self-directed approach in Europe, which helped her develop her critical thinking skills in music matters. She did not encounter such pedagogical processes in her education in Malaysia.

Subtheme 3.1d is that the pedagogical process of Asian music education was holistic and comprehensive, and Subtheme 3.1e is that the pedagogical process of Asian music education encourages creativity and expressiveness. Only Yasmin had a positive opinion due to her experiences with the Suzuki music education system. Other participants had negative experiences, with the main criticism being the narrowness of the musical instruction and materials used. For example, Carl described the lack of materials in Malaysia as a massive obstacle to his music education. Only the researcher agreed with Subtheme 3.1e due to his unique journey in improvisation and composition. Other participants were entrenched in music examinations and competitions. For example, Jessica felt that her music education in Malaysia focused on examinations and competitions. In contrast, in the United Kingdom, she participated in more creative projects that helped to improve her sense of musical expressiveness.

Theme 3.2 European Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Theme 3.2 is European music education pedagogical processes. Subtheme 3.2a is that the pedagogical process of European music education was systematic. All participants who had experiences in Europe agreed with this statement. For example, Jessica felt that European music education was systematic but enriched with creative ideas. Although she thought her prior experiences in Asia were organized, European music education added multidimensional facets to this systematic approach. Yvonne also praised the systematic classroom approaches in the United Kingdom, where she had the opportunity to observe various teaching settings. She learned specifically to develop lessons and curriculum that catered to the needs of students.

Subtheme 3.2b is that the pedagogical process of European music education was adequate. All participants agreed with this statement. For example, Laura pursued higher education in the United Kingdom up to a doctoral level as she felt that European music education's efficiency helped her raise her musical performing and research skills to a very high level. Yasmin also praised music education processes in Germany for helping her become a more artistic and well-rounded musician.

Subtheme 3.2c is that the pedagogical process of European music education encouraged critical thinking. The researcher disagreed with this as he encountered rigid European teachers who wanted him to follow specific piano styles. The classical tradition was imposed on him, and he could not express the music however he wanted. In contrast, all other participants encountered teachers who emphasized artistry and musical interpretation. They felt that music education in Europe was centered around developing their critical thinking skills in music. For example, Jessica developed her critical thinking skills in music performance through experimenting with diverse instrumental techniques involved with contemporary music. Yasmin also mentioned that

she had to participate in multiple ensemble projects where she had to think constantly about her role as a performer in collaboration with other musicians.

Subtheme 3.2d is that the pedagogical process of European music education was holistic and comprehensive. All participants agreed with this statement. Even the researcher had to admit that his European music education was holistic and complete, despite his tutors being demanding and controlling. Yasmin praised the holistic nature of her musical studies in Germany, where she participated in orchestra, chamber music, research, and diverse projects. She also had to focus on artistry and subjective interpretation of musical genres.

Subtheme 3.2e is that the pedagogical process of European music education encouraged creativity and expressiveness. The researcher disagreed with this as he felt the rigid classical music education approach stifled his creative and improvisatory side. However, all other participants felt that their music education in Europe encouraged them to be more creative and expressive. For example, Yvonne spoke about how lively discussions helped her to become more expressive of her musical ideas.

Theme 3.3 American Music Education Pedagogical Processes

Theme 3.3 is American music education pedagogical processes. Subtheme 3.3a is that the pedagogical process of American music education was systematic. All participants agreed with this statement. For example, Carl spoke extensively about how his professor helped him fix his bad habits in piano playing through the systematic implementation of technical exercises. Vicky also praised the organized way she was included as a graduate assistant at the university, enabling her to develop her teaching skills while pursuing her master's degree.

Subtheme 3.3b is that the pedagogical process of American music education was adequate. All participants agreed with this statement. For example, Karen experienced diverse

learning and teaching approaches, such as individual learning styles, incremental preparation, and systematic presentations. She praised the discovery learning approaches she encountered as creative and effective for learning many different skills, such as music theory and research.

Subtheme 3.3c is that the pedagogical process of American music education encouraged critical thinking. Carl mentioned that he had to outgrow the imitative method he relied on in Malaysia and on critical thinking in the States, particularly in chamber music and research. Vicky also described the idea of a "descriptive" word, which triggered her mind to imagine music in different terms. According to them, these pedagogical processes did not occur in Malaysian music education.

Subtheme 3.3d is that the pedagogical process of American music education was holistic and comprehensive. The researcher also took online lessons from an American university and mentioned completing his courses. He received instruction in various academic topics and had flexible room for performance interpretation. Vicky also described her education in the States as well-rounded, emphasizing different musical styles and genres. She had to research and perform music in different contexts, providing her with vital experiences.

Subtheme 3.3e is that the pedagogical process of American music education encouraged creativity and expressiveness. All participants also agreed with this statement. For example, Karen took many courses with professors encouraging students to express their ideas through discussions and presentations. She also had to listen to diverse recordings that helped her develop a keen sense of musical expressiveness and creativity.

Summary of Findings: Research Sub-question Three

The third research sub-question concerns the pros and cons of music education in different countries. Participants described the pros and cons of their music education experiences in the interviews. From these interviews, a few themes emerged, as shown in Table 4 below.

Table 4. Pros and Cons

4.1 Pros of Asian Music Education	Researcher	Rachel	Jennifer	Jessica	Yvonne	Yasmin	Laura	Carl	Vicky	Karen
a. Asian music education is flexible and spontaneous.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
b. Asian music education utilizes many diverse materials.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.	No.
c. Asian music education trained aural and sightreading skills well.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.
d. Asian music education involves a solid instrumental technical foundation.	No.	No.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.
e. Asian music education encouraged discipline, diligence, and conscientiou	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.

sness.										
4.2 Pros of European Music Education										
a. European music education was rational and structured.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
b. European music education was artistic and creative.	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
c. European music education was holistic and emphasized diverse styles of music.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
d. European music education involved personalized, constructive feedback.	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
e. European music education emphasized musical expression and individuality.	No.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	-	-	-
4.3 Pros of American Music										

Education										
a. American music education included a wealth of materials and professional development opportunities.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. American music education trained soft skills such as communication and critical thinking.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
c. American music education involved many performance and collaborative opportunities.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
d. American music education involved diverse musical genres.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
e. American music education encouraged cultural versatility and networking in a globalized and	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.

international ized context.										
4.4 Cons of Asian Music Education										
a.Asian music education lacked standardization and proper direction	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	No.	No.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
b. Asian music education lacked materials and proper resources.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
c. Asian music education was too exam-oriented and outcome-focused.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
d. Asian music education was narrow and did not focus on various methodologies and repertoires.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.
e. Asian music education did not encourage artistry, creativity, or critical thinking.	No.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.

4.5 Cons of European music education										
a. European music education was rigid and focused on the classical tradition with its rules and formalities	Yes.	-	-	No.	No.	No.	No.	-	-	-
b. European music education was competitive and demanding in standards	Yes.	-	-	Yes.	Yes.	Yes.	No.	-	-	-
c. European music education was not inclusive or internationalized	Yes.	-	-	No.	No.	No.	No.	-	-	-
4.6 Cons of American Music Education										
a. Lack of instruction and direction, which can be confusing	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	No.	Yes.	No.
b. Overly free in expression, which can lead to misundersta	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	No.	No.	Yes.

ndings										
c. Too many activities can lead to a lack of focus and specialization.	Yes.	-	-	-	-	-	-	No.	No.	Yes.

Theme 4.1 Pros of Asian Music Education

Theme 4.1 is the pros of Asian music education. Subtheme 4.1a is that Asian music education is flexible and spontaneous. Only the researcher and Jennifer agreed with this statement, as they had encountered flexible and spontaneous music education approaches in Malaysia. The other participants disagreed with this statement as they underwent rigid technical training involving examinations and competitions.

Subtheme 4.1b. is that Asian music education utilizes many diverse materials. Rachel and Jennifer, the researcher, were the only participants who experienced diverse music education materials while studying in Asian countries. Rachel mentioned incorporating Chinese folk songs during her music education in China, which was different from all the other Western-oriented music education materials she used.

Subtheme 4.1c is that Asian music education trains aural and sightreading skills well. This theme emerged in the interviews of some of the participants. The researcher, Jennifer, Jessica, Yvonne, Yasmin, and Laura agreed with this statement as they underwent good training for these musical skills. However, other participants disagreed with this statement. For example, Rachel felt she could only access suitable music education materials once she had the

opportunity to study in Australia. Carl also felt his music education skills could have been better honed in Malaysia. Similarly, Karen felt her initial music education should have focused more on aural and sightreading skills.

 Subtheme 4.1d is that Asian music education involves a solid instrumental technical foundation. Jessica, Yvonne, and Yasmin felt that the technical aspect of their instrumental lessons in Malaysia was adequate. However, the other participants disagreed with this. For example, Jennifer noted that Malaysian music education did not have controlled standards, which made her musical progress rocky.

Subtheme 4.1e is that Asian music education encourages discipline, diligence, and conscientiousness. The researcher, Carl, Vicky, and Karen did not agree with this statement; all other participants agreed. Vicky felt that her music education in Malaysia needed to be improved in training many soft skills necessary for music performers and educators. Similarly, Carl felt that the music education he encountered in Malaysia needed to be more active and provide him with the essential mindsets and traits required to be a successful musician.

Theme 4.2 Pros of European Music Education

Theme 4.2 is the pros of European music education. Subtheme 4.2a is that European music education was rational and structured. All participants who studied in Europe agreed with this statement. For example, Jessica praised music education's holistic and comprehensive nature in the United Kingdom. She could engage with many collaborative projects and benefitted from the systematic coursework she had in university.

Subtheme 4.2b is that European music education was artistic and creative. Only the researcher disagreed with this due to his experiences with rigid professors in the classical music field. Other participants felt that their artistic and creative sides were developed in European

music education. For example, Yasmin spoke of the musical exploration and cultivation of individual expression that she experienced in Germany.

Subtheme 4.2c is that European music education was holistic and emphasized diverse styles of music. All participants who studied in Europe agreed with this statement. Even the researcher had to admit that he encountered different styles of music during his music education in Europe. Laura also mentioned that her exposure to contemporary classical French music led to her research efforts in this area.

Subtheme 4.2d is that European music education involves personalized, constructive feedback. All participants agreed with this statement. Yvonne mentioned that this was the main difference between her Asian and European music education. This personalized constructive feedback helped her learn more effectively in music research and teaching.

Subtheme 4.2e is that European music education emphasizes musical expression and individuality. The researcher disagreed with this statement due to his stifled musicality from rigid professors. However, all other participants who studied in Europe agreed with this statement. For example, Yasmin developed a sense of ownership and autonomy to express herself in music. She also understood musical concepts and emotions deeply through her studies in Europe.

Theme 4.3 Pros of American Music Education

Theme 4.3 is the pros of American music education. Subtheme 4.3a is that American music education includes many materials and professional development opportunities. All participants agreed with this statement. For example, Carl mentioned the wealth of workshops, materials, and learning approaches in the United States. He explored many diverse educational approaches and musical styles in the States, contrasting with his time in Malaysia. Subtheme

4.3b American music education trains soft skills such as communication and critical thinking. All participants who studied in the States agreed with this statement. Vicky was enthusiastic about her training in the States, where she acquired leadership and time management skills.

 In contrast, her music education in Malaysia could have been more effective in helping her develop such soft skills. Subtheme 4.3c is that American music education involves many performance and collaborative opportunities. All participants who studied in the States agreed with this statement. For example, Karen had many opportunities to network and collaborate with music teachers and performers.

Subtheme 4.3d is that American music education involves diverse musical genres. All participants who studied in the States agreed with this statement. For example, Carl experienced many different ensemble settings and musical styles in the States. He also had many opportunities to collaborate with other musicians.

Subtheme 4.3e is that American music education encouraged cultural versatility and networking in a globalized and internationalized context. All participants who studied in the States agreed with this statement. For example, Vicky described her freedom in music research, which helped her write about her ideas freely. Carl also mentioned that his graduate assistant role helped him understand diverse students from different backgrounds. This music education setting encouraged a globalized learning model and international cooperation between other students and teachers.

Theme 4.4 Cons of Asian Music Education

 Theme 4.4 is the cons of Asian music education. Subtheme 4.4a is that Asian music education lacked standardization and proper direction. The researcher, Rachel, Jennifer, Carl, Vicky and Karen agreed with this statement; the other participants disagreed with this statement.

For example, Jennifer said she encountered many wrong music education methodologies in Malaysia. Rachel also felt she needed access to suitable standard materials for music education in Malaysia.

Subtheme 4.4b. is that Asian music education lacks materials and proper resources. All participants agreed with this statement. Carl felt his music education in Malaysia needed adequate materials to help him progress properly. Laura also felt that her music education in Malaysia needed to be more creative in using diverse materials.

Subtheme 4.4c is that Asian music education was too exam-oriented and outcome-focused. All participants also mentioned this statement. For example, Jessica said that her music education in Malaysia was level-based, and she did not experience much creative music in her activities until she studied in Europe. Similarly, Karen had a narrow music education in Malaysia due to her initial teachers' primary focus on passing examinations.

Subtheme 4.4d is that Asian music education was narrow and did not focus on various methodologies and repertoires. Only the researcher and Yasmin had a broad range of musical activities during their studies in Malaysia due to their involvement in the Suzuki and Yamaha music education systems. The researcher also had experience with popular music and ethnomusicology, which many other participants could not access.

Subtheme 4.4e is that Asian music education does not encourage artistry, creativity, or critical thinking. Only the researcher had positive experiences in this respect. All other participants encountered artistry, creativity, and critical thinking in European or American music education contexts. For example, Carl had a literal musical awakening when he studied in the States. He felt his education in Malaysia was a mere shadow compared to the richness of music education in the States.

Theme 4.5 Cons of European Music Education

Theme 4.5 is the cons of European music education. Subtheme 4.5a is that European music education was rigid and focused on the classical tradition with its rules and formalities. The researcher experienced many classical music professors who imposed on him the rules and formalities of classical music performance. However, most other participants who studied in Europe had more flexible professors who encouraged them to be artistic and expressive in interpretation.

Subtheme 4.5b was that European music education was competitive and demanding in standards. All participants agreed with this. For example, Jessica felt that the constant demands and pressures related to her music education led to her having anxiety, which overshadowed her joy of learning music. Yvonne also had issues with performance anxiety, which she could not solve even after her studies in the United Kingdom. Only Yasmin seemed comfortable with her studies in Germany and did not feel stressed regularly.

Subtheme 4.5c is that European music education was not inclusive or internationalized. The researcher had experiences with many classical music professors in Europe who had a narrow mindset toward international students in music performance. However, other participants who studied in Europe reported that they were encouraged to voice their opinions and receive effective personalized feedback. For example, Yvonne benefited from the diverse learning environment in London, and Yasmin also mentioned the focus on individuality in musical expression, which encouraged the inclusion of various interpretations.

Theme 4.6 Cons of American Music Education

Theme 4.6 is the cons of American music education. Subtheme 4.6a is the lack of instruction and direction, which can confuse students. The researcher and Vicky agreed with this statement. The researcher sometimes had to ask for clarity from the professors he encountered on their instructions as they could have been more specific. Similarly, Vicky was not used to the lack of clear directions in her music research efforts in the States.

Subtheme 4.6b is the overt freedom of expression, which can lead to misunderstandings. The researcher and Karen agreed that participation in discussions was new, and they were uncomfortable with this learning methodology. Carl and Vicky, on the other hand, felt that this methodology empowered them to become more vocal and expressive.

Subtheme 4.6c is that too many activities can lead to a lack of focus and specialization. The researcher and Karen felt that music research in the States could be overwhelming with many activities involved. Carl and Vicky, on the other hand, embraced the whirlwind of activities involved with music performance, teaching, and research in the States.

Implications

Although a narrative study with ten participants cannot be generalized to the larger population, this study regarding the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts has practical and theoretical implications. These implications will be detailed in the sections below. The study's limitations will be provided with recommendations for further research efforts.

Theoretical Implications

The findings answered the central research question and three sub-questions in great detail. The main research question pertained to the significant differences between music education philosophies and psychologies of different countries and regions. The research

findings suggested that music education in other areas and countries has substantial differences.

Music education in Asia is said to be primarily strict and rigid, with some traces of flexibility and

creativity. Asian music education also used Western languages and music notation, proving

Western influences' dominance through globalization and the aftereffects of colonization in Asia.

Asian music education also mostly involved diverse musical genres, although Western music

genres dominated music education in Asia. There was a combination of formal and informal

approaches in Asian music education. Theoretically, Asian music education amalgamated

traditional Asian philosophies, as detailed in the results section, with some traces of Western

influences. The participants' experiences indicated that music education in philosophies and

psychologies in Asia is a mixed bag of these traditions, resulting in diversity in the music

education experiences.

Based on the results, European music education was considered flexible and creative,

with strict and rigid training through classical music genres. European music education used

Western languages and music notation, which is natural as this is based on their cultural tradition.

The findings also indicated that European music education involved diverse musical genres, as

many participants experimented with different types of music. As noted in the conclusions,

European music education is also a mix of formal and informal approaches. Lastly, the results

indicated that American music education is flexible and creative. American music education also

used Western languages and music notation in teaching settings. The results also suggested that

American music education involves diverse musical genres. American music education was also

a mixture of formal and informal approaches, leaning more toward informal approaches.

Theoretically, music education in Asia, Europe, and America has moved toward a global

and international trend of using Western music genres. There are some vestiges of Asian

philosophical ideas left in Asian music education. Still, most Asian music students are trained in Western genres using Western philosophies and psychologies of music education. As indicated through the sub-question on philosophies and psychologies of music education, the results showed location congruence with the historical philosophies and psychologies from the region but with a tendency toward a globalized Western music education model based on Western music traditions. Local music traditions were less generally emphasized in all areas, with a sense of standardization across all regions.

The results of this narrative study also have implications for the theoretical framework of social constructivism. The findings represented constructed knowledge from the subjective meanings of the participant's experiences. These lenses provided new crucial knowledge on the subject of the philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse contexts. The research design of narrative inquiry helped to analyze the subjective experiences of these participants, in which themes and subthemes emerged. The findings provided vital information on music education experiences in diverse regions, which research literature has not covered.

The research study also satisfied the philosophical assumptions of the interpretive framework. The ontological, epistemological, axiological, and methodological assumptions were addressed. The participants provided ontological perspectives on their real-life experiences in diverse music education contexts. Their opinions, beliefs, stories, and words formed the basis of epistemological themes and subthemes in the research. The axiological subjectivity of their experiences with self-constructed meanings and values provided the narrative research methodology with undeniable logic and certainty. The role of the researcher provided a pivotal direction for the narrative, and through careful data collection procedures, the researcher

procured new knowledge on the philosophies and psychologies surrounding diverse music education processes.

<div align="center">Practical Implications</div>

In terms of the implications of this study in practical matters, the findings shed light on the music education pedagogical processes of diverse contexts, highlighting the pros and cons of these experiences. The research findings provided significant inferences from which music educators worldwide can benefit. For example, Asian music education pedagogical processes were described as a mixture of systematic, efficient, rigid, strict, lacking creativity and critical thinking. This mixed bag of adjectives meant that the diversity of Asian music education was highlighted in the research. European music education pedagogical processes were described as systematic, adequate, and encouraging expressivity, creativity, and critical thinking. The adjectives holistic and comprehensive were also used. American music education pedagogical processes were also described as systematic, adequate, and encouraging expressivity, creativity, and critical thinking. The adjectives holistic and comprehensive were also used.

With mostly positive feedback on European and American music education, the interview questions on pros and cons provided more differentiation between the music education experiences. The pros of Asian music education were described as flexible, spontaneous, and utilizing diverse materials. Other descriptions were the following: Asian music education trained aural and sightreading skills, involved a solid instrumental technical foundation, and encouraged discipline, diligence, and conscientiousness. The pros of European music education were that it was rational, structured, artistic, and creative. Other descriptions were that European music education was holistic and emphasized diverse styles of music, involved personalized, constructive feedback, and emphasized musical expression and individuality.

Pros of American music education were that it included a wealth of materials and professional development opportunities. Other descriptions were that American music education trained soft skills such as communication and critical thinking and involved many performance and collaborative opportunities with diverse musical genres. Many participants also described American music education as encouraging cultural versatility and networking in a globalized and internationalized context.

The cons of Asian music education were that it lacked standardization and proper direction. Some participants also said that Asian music education lacked materials and adequate resources. Other descriptions were that Asian music education was too exam-oriented and outcome-focused. Asian music education was also considered narrow and did not focus on various methodologies and repertoires. Asian music education did not encourage artistry, creativity, or critical thinking. As can be seen, some of the cons contradict the pros, which reveals the subjectivity of experiences in perceiving Asian music education.

The cons of European music education were that it was rigid and focused on the classical tradition with its rules and formalities. Other descriptions were that European music education was competitive, demanding in standards, and needed to be more inclusive and internationalized. The cons of American music education were that it needed more explicit instruction and direction, which can be confusing. Other descriptions were that American music education was overly expression-free, which can lead to misunderstandings. Another con was that too many activities can lead to a lack of focus and specialization.

As seen from listing the pros and cons of Asian, European, and American music education, music educators can analyze these experiences and glean vital inferences from the study. Analysis of the pedagogical processes and the philosophies and psychologies of music

education that informed these contexts provides significant implications for music educators worldwide, specifically piano teachers looking for professional development. This study highlighted these critical aspects that can help them become better educators in any global context.

Limitations of Study

Although the research provided pivotal inferences on philosophies and psychologies of music education in diverse contexts, it was ultimately limited to the perspectives of six to ten participants. Also, the study focused on the general continents of Asia, Europe, and North America. South America and Africa were beyond the scope of the study. The study was also focused on countries like Malaysia, China, Singapore, the United Kingdom, Germany, and the United States, representing the continents of Asia, Europe, and North America. There might be even more differences between the music education philosophies and psychologies of diverse countries on these continents. Ultimately, the narrative of the researcher shaped the study and its direction. There could be different research designs on philosophies and psychologies of music education, such as using phenomenology to trace the lived experiences of specific students in a particular setting.

Recommendations for Further Research

There could be even more research efforts that can survey this topic in many settings. For example, research could be conducted to differentiate between diverse countries in Asia, Europe, or America. There is much room for these efforts that can contribute to the literature relevant to the music education pedagogical processes of these different countries. Previous research, such as by Kertz-Welzel, focused on specific topics like "Bildung" and "Didaktik" in Germany versus

American music education,[1] so specific pedagogical concepts could be researched concerning diverse countries and continents.[2] A large amount of research is needed to analyze music education philosophies and psychologies, as these can be subjective and vary from individual to individual and community to community. Additionally, globalization and cross-cultural influences have resulted in unique experiences of individuals and communities that can be researched. Music education philosophies and psychologies are vast, burgeoning topics that need to be explored in depth through the contributions of researchers from diverse backgrounds.

<div align="center">Conclusion</div>

This study aimed to analyze music education philosophies and psychologies through a narrative based on the researcher's music education journey. Selected participants provided findings on pedagogical processes, pros and cons, and similarities and differences between music education contexts. Piano teaching and learning experiences were also highlighted. The study provided vital conclusions on these topics. Asian music education was found to be diverse and multicultural, with Western musical genres still dominating after years of decolonization. Both European and American mainly were hailed as positive, with differentiation of pros and cons. Many ideas were touched on, from online education to pedagogical strategies. The interview questions yielded rich knowledge that answered the research questions in a way that provided a well-rounded perspective on this multifaceted topic.

This narrative study illuminated the diverse mindsets, assumptions, beliefs, mental processes, and behaviors surrounding music education on different continents. The construction of knowledge through the social experiences of unique participants provided significant inferences that were analyzed. Through analyzing the music education philosophies and

---

[1] Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Didaktik of Music: a German concept and its Comparison to American Music Pedagogy." *International Journal of Music Education* 22 no. 3(2004): 277–286

psychologies of music education in diverse sociocultural contexts, music educators and piano teachers benefited from acquiring a global approach to their teaching settings. The similarities and differences between these philosophies and psychologies, the pedagogical processes of music education in diverse countries, and the pros and cons of these philosophies and psychologies provided valuable insights that contribute to music education literature.

Bibliography

"A Conversation With Howard Gardner." *Art Education* 72 no.3 (2019): 55-58.

Abramo, Joseph Michael. "Whence Culture and Epistemology? Dialectical Materialism and Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 29, no. 2 (2021): 155-173

Albert, D. J. "Online Versus Traditional Master of Music in Music Education Degree Programs: Students' Reasons for Choosing." *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 25 no.1 (2015): 52–64.

Anderson, Robert Michael. "Polemics Or Philosophy? Musical Pathology in Eduard Hanslick's "Vom Musikalisch-Schönen." *The Musical Times* 154, no. 1924 (2013): 65-76.

Anzis, Kathy. "Yamaha Music Education System: Celebrating 50 Years of Growth," *American Music Teacher* (August 1, 2005).

Barnes, Adrian Darnell. "A Philosophy of Music Education according to Kant." *The Journal of Aesthetic Education* 51, no. 2 (2017): 33-39.

Bartels, Daniela. Review of *Why Music? The Foundations of Music Education from Plato Until Today* by Øivind Varkøy. *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 27, no. 2 (2019): 224-229.

Beard, David, and Kenneth Gloag eds., *Musicology: The Key Concepts.* New York: Routledge, 2016.

Beard, Karen Stansberry and Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi. "Theoretically Speaking: An Interview with Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi on Flow Theory Development and its Usefulness in Addressing Contemporary Challenges in Education." *Educational Psychology Review* 27, no. 2 (2015): 353-364.

Bowman, Wayne, and Ana Lucia Frega. "What Should the Music Education Profession Expect of Philosophy?" In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Brickhouse, N. and G.M. Bodner. "The Beginning Science Teacher: Classroom Narratives of Convictions and Constraints." *Journal of Research in Science* Teaching 29 (1992). 471-485.

Burkholder, Gary, J., K.A. Cox, L.M Crawford, and J. Hitchcock. *Research Designs and Methods*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2020. 3-13.

Burton, Leon. "Comprehensive Musicianship-The Hawaii Music Curriculum Project." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 16, no. 1(2010): 67-76.

Carstens, Sharon. "Dancing Lions And Disappearing History: The National Culture Debates and Chinese Malaysian Culture." *Crossroads: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 13, no. 1 (1999): 11–63. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40860706.

Chan, E. "Living in the Space between Participant and Researcher as a Narrative Inquirer: Examining Ethnic Identity of Chinese Canadian Students as Conflicting Stories to Live By." *The Journal of Educational Research* 103 (2010). 113-122.

Chua, Daniel K.L. "Together in Harmony." *U.S. Catholic* 86, no. 4 (2021): 16-19.

Clandinin, D.J., and F.M Connelly. *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research*. San Francisco CA: Jossey-Bass, 2000.

Claxton, Bunnie L., and Carol L. Dolan. *A Step-by-Step Guide to Writing a Literature Review For Doctoral Research*. Dubuque, IA: Kendall Hunt, 2022. 13-20.

Creswell, John W., and Cheryl N. Poth. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. 4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018.

Creswell, John W. and J. David Creswell. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods*. 5th ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2018.

Crinklaw-Kiser, Donna. "Integrating Music with Whole Language through the Orff-Schulwerk Process." *Young Children* 51, no. 5 (1996): 15–21.

Crotty, M., *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and Perspective in the Research Process*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 1998.

Denzin, N.K. and Y.S. Lincoln. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1994.

Dey, I. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists*. England: Routledge, 1993.

Dunbar, Laura. "'Triggering' Understanding in a Kodály Present." *General Music Today* 32, no. 2 (January 2019): 40–43.

Elliott, David J., and Marissa Silverman. *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015. 24-53.

Elliott, David J. *Praxial Music Education: Reflections and Dialogues*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005. 3-18.

Elliott, David J., and Marissa Silverman. "Rethinking Philosophy: Re-viewing Musical-Emotional Experiences." In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. 49

Erikson, Erik. *Childhood and Society*. New York: Norton, 1950.

Esman, Aaron H. "Freud and Music." *The American Journal of Psychiatry* 152, no. 12 (1995): 1835.

Estrada, Luis Alfonso Estrada and Julio Estrada. "Music and Institutions in Mexico." In *La Musica en Mexico.* Mexico: Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico, 1984. 79-113.

Froehlich, Hildegard. "Music Education and Community: Reflections on "Webs of Interaction" in School Music." *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education: Refereed Journal of the Mayday Group* 8, No. 1(2009).

Garrepy, Stacey A. "Music Education in the United States and Germany as a Representative Example of Internationalization: A Philosophical Inquiry." Ph.D. diss. University of North Carolina at Greensboro, 2022. ProQuest (AAT 29061481).

Golding, Rosemary. "Seeking a Philosophy of Music in Higher Education: The Case of Mid-Nineteenth Century Edinburgh." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 2 (2016): 191–212.

Grayling, A.C. *The History of Philosophy*. Penguin: UK, 2019.

Guba, E. *The Paradigm Dialog*. Newbury Park, CA: SAGE, 1990.

Guest, Greg, Emily E. Namey, and M. Chen. "A Simple Method to Assess and Report Thematic Saturation in Qualitative Research." *PLoS ONE* 15 no.5 (2020): e0232076.

Guest, Greg, Kathleen M. MacQueen, and Emily E. Namey. *Applied Thematic Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2012

Hancock, Pamela D. "Re-Embodied by the Rhythm: A Jungian Understanding of a Woman's Experience of Birth Trauma and its Transformation through a Spiritual Dance Practice." *American Journal of Dance Therapy* 43, no. 2 (12, 2021): 157-66.

Harman, W., *A Re-Examination of the Metaphysical Foundations of Modern Science*, Petaluma, CA: Institute of Noetic Science, 1991.

Harvey, L. "Intimate Reflections: Private Diaries in Qualitative Research." *Qualitative Research* 11 no. 6 (2011): 664-682.

Hermann, Evelyn. *Shinichi Suzuki: The Man and His Philosophy*. Warner Brothers Publications, 1981.

Huang, H. "Why Chinese people play Western classical music: Transcultural roots of music Philosophy." *International Journal of Music Education* 30 no.2 (2012): 161–176.

Imada, Tadahiko. "The Grain of the Music: Does Music Education "Mean" Something in Japan?" In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega, New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. 147-161.

Johansen, Geir. "Music Education and the Role of Comparative Studies in a Globalized World." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (c2013): 41–51.

Jorgensen, Estelle R. "Values and Philosophizing about Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 22, no. 1 (2014): 5–21.

Kanellopoulos, Panagiotis A. "Knowledge-Power, Mastery-Institution: Re-Thinking Some Music Education Certainties Through Reflections on Hegel, Foucault, Rancière and Derrida." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 1 (2016): 3-7.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "Didaktik of Music: a German concept and its Comparison to American Music Pedagogy." *International Journal of Music Education* 22 no. 3(2004): 277–286.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "In Search of the Sense and the Senses: Aesthetic Education in Germany and the United States." *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 39, no. 3 (2005): 102–14.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "Lessons from Elsewhere? Comparative Music Education in Times of Globalization." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 23, no. 1 (2015): 48–66.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "The Singing Muse? Three Centuries of Music Education in Germany." *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 26, no. 1 (2004): 8–27

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "Thinking Globally in Music Education Research." Chapter in *Globalizing Music Education: A Framework*, 35–79. Indiana University Press: 2018.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "'Two Souls, Alas, Reside Within My Breast': Reflections on German and American Music Education Regarding the Internationalization of Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 52–65.

Krueger, Carol and Jill Wilson. "Foundations of Music Literacy: Jerome Bruner's Contributions to Choral Music Education." *The Choral Journal* 59, no. 1 (2018): 18–29.

Larsen, Ronald L., and Charles G. Boody. "Some Implications for Music Education in the Work of Jean Piaget." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 19, no. 1 (1971): 35–50.

"Liberty University IRB." Accessed 7 April 2023. https://www.liberty.edu/graduate/institutional-review-board

Lilja, Mona and Stellan Vinthagen. "Sovereign Power, Disciplinary Power, and Biopower: Resisting What Power with What Resistance?" *Journal of Political Power* no. 7 (2014).

Lincoln, Y.S., & Guba, E.G., *Naturalistic inquiry.* Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1985.

Lockard, Craig A. "Popular Music and Politics in Modern Southeast Asia: A Comparative Analysis." *Asian Music* 27, no. 2 (1996): 149–99.

Longyear, R.M. *Schiller, and Music*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1966.

Lynch, Andrew. "Last Minstrels: Medievalism, Emotion and Poetic Performance in Walter Scott and Goethe." *Postmedieval* 10, no. 4 (12, 2019): 423-38.

Marks, Michael L. and Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman. *Contemporary Music Education*. New York: Schirmer Cengage Learning, 2014.

Maslow, Abraham H. "Music Education and Peak Experience." *Music Educators Journal* 54, no. 6 (1968): 72–171.

Maslow, Abraham H. *The Farther Reaches of Human Nature*. Arkana, 1993: 128.

Mastnak, W, and A Toropova. "Experiencing Music as the Basis of the Effectiveness of Music Therapy." *Journal of Russian and East European Psychology* 55, no. 1 (2018): 1–14.

Miles, M.B, A.M. Huberman and J. Saldana. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2014.

McConville, Brendan, and Barbara Murphy. "What Is Online? A National Survey of Course Offerings in Music and a Case Study in Music Theory." *College Music Symposium* 57 (2017).

Naqvi, Erum. "Teaching Practices in Persian Art Music." In the *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education,* edited by Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega, New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. 180-191.

Nelson, L. W. "Code-switching in the Oral Life Narratives of African American Women: Challenges to Linguistic Hegemony." *The Journal of Education* 172 no.3 (1990). 142–155.

Nettl, Bruno. "Classical Music in Tehran: The Process of Change." In *Eight Musical Cultures,* Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1978. 146-185.

Park, So-Jeong. "Danger of Sound: Mozi's Criticism of Confucian Ritual Music." *The Philosophical Forum* 51, no. 1 (2020): 49-65.

Parker, Elizabeth Cassidy, and Sean R. Powell. "A Phenomenological Study of Music Education Majors' Identity in Methods Courses Their Areas of Focus." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 201 (2014): 23–41.

Pederson, Nicole Grimes, Siobhán Donovan, and Wolfgang Marx. "Rethinking Hanslick: Music, Formalism, and Expression." *Journal of Musicological Research* 34 no.2 (2015): 164-166.

Phillips, Norman. "Music Education in Asian Schools." *Music Educators Journal* 51, no. 4 (1965): 164–67.

Pratt, Carroll C. "Review of 'The Haunting Melody; Psychoanalytic Experiences in Life and Music, by T. Reik.'" *Notes 11* no. 2 (1954): 308–310.

Prichard, Stephanie. "Practice Makes Perfect? Effective Practice Instruction in Large Ensembles." *Music Educators Journal* 99, no. 2 (2012): 57–62.

Rawson, Martyn. "Spirituality and Subjectivity in Waldorf (Steiner) Education: A Postmodern Bildung Perspective." *International Journal of Children's Spirituality* 26, No.1-2 (2021): 24-43.

Rauscher, Frances H., and Sean C. Hinton. "Music Instruction and Its Diverse Extra-Musical Benefits." *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 29, no. 2 (2011): 215–26.

Reimer, Bennett. "Roots of Inequity and Injustice: The Challenges for Music Education." *Music Education Research* 9 No.2 (2007): 191-204.

Reimer, Bennett. *Seeking the Significance of Music Education: Essays and Reflections.* New York: Rowman and Littlefield Education, 2009.

Rejimon, P.K. "Philosophical Foundations of Indian Music." *International Journal of Innovative Studies in Sociology and Humanities* 3 no.1 (2018).

Richerme, Lauren Kapalka. "A Deleuzian Reimagining of Suzanne Langer's Philosophy: Becoming-feeling in Music Education." *Music Education Research* 20, no.3 (2018): 330-341.

Rodriguez, Luis Alfonso Estrada Rodriguez. "Education in Latin American Schools: A Philosophical Perspective." In the *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. 231-247.

Rubin, H., & Rubin, I. *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing Data.* 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 2012

Russell, Bertrand. *A History of Western Philosophy*. George Allen and Unwin Ltd: UK, 1946.

Saldaña, J. *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*. 2nd ed. SAGE Publications, 2013.

Schmidt, Patrick. "A Rabi, an Imam, and a Priest Walk into a Bar … Or, What Can Music Education Philosophy Learn from Comparative Cosmopolitanism?" *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 23–40.

Sealy, Patricia Ann. "Autoethnography: Reflective Journaling and Meditation to Cope with Life-Threatening Breast Cancer." *Clinical Journal of Oncology Nursing* 16 no. 1 (2012), 38–41.

Shields, Ross. "Nonsense, Wherein There is Method by Ludwig Wittgenstein (Review)." *The Germanic Review: Literature, Culture, Theory* 93, no. 4 (2018): 394-413.

Simon, Artur. "Southeast Asia: Musical Syncretism and Cultural Identity." *Fontes Artis Musicae* 57, no. 1 (2010): 23–34.

Skinner, B.F., *About Behaviorism*. New York: Vintage Books, 1974.

Smethurst, Reilly, "Say No to Lacanian Musicology: A Review of Misnomers," *International Journal of Zizek Studies* 11 no.3 (2017), 249-270.

Stauffer, Sandra. "Place, Music Education and the Practice and Pedagogy of Philosophy." In the *Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. Oxford: New York, 2012. 434-451.

Tan, Leonard. "On Confucian Metaphysics, the Pragmatist Revolution, and Philosophy of Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 26, no. 1 (2018): 63-81.

Tan, Siu-Lan, Peter Pfordresher and Rom Harré, *Psychology of Music: From Sound to Significance.* New York: Psychology Press, 2010.

Tate, Nicholas. "The Case Against the Arts from Plato to Tolstoy and its Implications for Why and How the Arts Should be Taught in Schools." *Educational Review* 68, no.1 (2016): 24-39.

Thram, Diane. "Understanding Music's Therapeutic Efficacy: Implications for Music Education." *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega. New York: Oxford University Press, 2012. 192-200.

Vaismoradi, M., H. Turunen, H. and T. Bondas. "Content Analysis and Thematic Analysis: Implications for Conducting a Qualitative Descriptive Study." *Nursing Health Science 15* (2013): 398-405

Väkevä, Lauri. "Four Pieces on Comparative Philosophy of Music Education." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 21, no. 1 (2013): 5–7.

Van der Veer, R., and J. Valsiner. *Understanding Vygotsky: A Quest for Synthesis*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1991.

Voorhees, Matthew. "Melodic Communities: Music and Freedom in Rousseau's Political Thought." *History of Political Thought* 32 no.4 (2011): 617-644.

Walker, Robert. "Innovation in the Music Classroom: The Manhattanville Music Curriculum Project." *Psychology of Music* 12, No. 1 (1984): 25-33.

Wang, Yuhwen. "Cultivating Virtuous Character: The Chinese Traditional Perspective of Music Education." In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, edited by Wayne Bowman and Ana Lucía Frega. Oxford University Press, 2012. 263-267

White, Richard. "Schopenhauer, the Philosophy of Music, and the Wisdom of Classical Indian Philosophy." *Sophia* 60, no. 4 (2021): 899–915.

Zangwill, Nick. "Friends Reunited: Susan McClary and Musical Formalism." *The Musical Times* 155, no. 1929 (2014): 63-69.

Appendix A: IRB Approval

IRB #: IRB-FY23-24-456

Title: A Narrative Study: Professional Development of a Piano Teacher through Various Music Education Philosophies and Psychologies in Different Sociocultural Contexts

Creation Date: 9-15-2023 **End Date:**

Status: Approved

Principal Investigator: Shuenda Wong

Review Board: Research Ethics Office **Sponsor:**

Study History

Submission Type Initial	Review Type Exempt	Decision Exempt

Key Study Contacts

Member Brian Stiffler	Role Co-Principal Investigator	▉▉▉▉▉
Member Shuenda Wong	Role Principal Investigator	▉▉▉▉▉
Member Shuenda Wong	Role Primary Contact	▉▉▉▉▉

Initial Submission

Appendix B: Consent Form

Title of the Project: A Narrative Study: Professional Development of a Piano Teacher through Various Music Education Philosophies and Psychologies in Different Sociocultural Contexts
Principal Investigator: Shuenda Wong, Ph.D. Music Education candidate, School of Music, Liberty University.

Invitation to be Part of a Research Study

You are invited to participate in a research study. You must have studied music in Malaysia, Germany, the United Kingdom, or the United States to participate. Taking part in this research project is voluntary.

Please read this entire form and ask questions before deciding whether to participate in this research.

What is the study about, and why is it being done?

- ◦ The purpose of the study is to analyze the philosophies and psychologies of music education, linking this with a narrative about the educational journey of the researcher.

What will happen if you take part in this study?

If you agree to be in this study, I will ask you to do the following:
1. Participate in an in-person, audio-recorded interview that will take an hour.
2. Member-checking from the interviewees and reading through the recorded transcript. Transcripts will be sent to the interviewees directly after the interview and checked, then returned to the researcher after a maximum of 3 days.
3. Follow-up Questions and Probes within two weeks after the primary interview for additional data.

How could you or others benefit from this study?

Participants should not expect a direct benefit from participating in this study.

Benefits to society include providing new knowledge in education and piano pedagogy on the aspects of philosophies and psychologies of music education.

What risks might you experience from being in this study?

The expected risks from participating in this study are minimal, which means they are equal to the risks you would encounter in everyday life.

How will personal information be protected?

The records of this study will be kept private. Published reports will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely, and only the researcher will have access to the records.

- Participant responses will be kept confidential by replacing names with pseudonyms.
- Interviews will be conducted in a location where others will not easily overhear the conversation.
- Data will be stored on a password-locked computer. After five years, all electronic records will be deleted
- Recordings will be stored on a password-locked computer for five years until participants have reviewed and confirmed the accuracy of the transcripts and then deleted. The researcher will have access to these recordings.

How will you be compensated for being part of the study?

Participants will be compensated for participating in this study. After the interview, participants will receive an Amazon voucher of $25.

Is the researcher in a position of authority over participants, or does the researcher have a financial conflict of interest?

No.

Is study participation voluntary?

Participation in this study is voluntary. Your participation will not affect your current or future relations with Liberty University. If you decide to participate, you are free not to answer any questions or withdraw at any time.

What should you do if you decide to withdraw from the study?

If you choose to withdraw from the study, please get in touch with the researcher at the email address/phone number in the next paragraph. Should you decide to cancel, data collected from you will be destroyed immediately and will not be included in this study.

Whom do you contact if you have questions or concerns about the study?

The researcher conducting this study is Mr Shuenda Wong. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact him at ████████████████ or ███████████████ .You may also contact the researcher's faculty sponsor, Dr Stiffler, at ████████████████

Whom do you contact if you have questions about your rights as a research participant?

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and want to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the IRB. Our physical address is Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd., Green Hall Ste. 2845, Lynchburg, VA, 24515; our phone number is 434-592-5530, and our email address is irb@liberty.edu.

Disclaimer: The Institutional Review Board (IRB) ensures that research on human subjects will be conducted ethically as defined and required by federal regulations. The topics covered, and viewpoints expressed or alluded to by student and faculty researchers are those of the researchers and do not necessarily reflect the official policies or positions of Liberty University.

Your Consent

By signing this document, you are agreeing to be in this study. Make sure you understand what the study is about before you sign. You will be given a copy of this document for your records. The researcher will keep a copy of the study records. If you have any questions about the study after you sign this document, you can contact the study team using the information provided above.

I have read and understood the above information. I have asked questions and have received answers. I consent to participate in the study.

☐ The researcher has my permission to audio-record me as part of my participation in this study.

_____
Printed Subject Name

_____
Signature & Date

Appendix C: Interview Questions

1.   Describe your music educational experiences in (Asia, Europe, and North America)

2.   Describe the philosophies and psychologies of music education that you experienced.

3.   Describe the specific instrumental pedagogical music education processes you experienced.

4.   Describe any similarities and differences from music educational experiences you went through, if you went through diverse ones.

5.   What are the pros and cons of your educational experiences?

Appendix D: Journal Questions

1. How were my experiences studying music in Malaysia?

2. How were my experiences studying music in Germany?

3. How were my experiences studying music in the U.K.?

4. How were my experiences studying music education online in the U.S.?

Appendix E: Recruitment Email

Dear Potential Participant,

As a Doctoral Candidate in the School of Music at Liberty University, I am conducting research as part of the requirements for a Ph.D. degree. The purpose of my study is to analyze the philosophies and psychologies of music education, linking this with a narrative about the educational journey of the researcher. I am writing to invite you to join my study.

Participants must have studied music in Malaysia, Germany, the United Kingdom, or the United States. Participants will be asked to participate in a one-on-one, audio-recorded, in-person interview. It should take approximately one hour to complete the procedure listed. Names and other identifying information will be requested for this study, but participant identities will not be disclosed. Member-checking from the interviewees and reading through the recorded transcript will be needed. Transcripts will be sent to the interviewees directly after the interview and checked, which will then be returned to the researcher after a maximum of 3 days. There will be follow-up Questions and Probes from the researcher within two weeks after the primary interview for additional data.

To participate, please get in touch with me at ████████████████ to schedule an interview. If you meet my participant criteria, I will contact you and work with you to schedule a date and time for an interview. A consent document will be emailed if you meet the study criteria at least one week before the interview. The consent document contains additional information about my research.

If you choose to participate, you must sign and return the consent document to me during the interview. Participants will be compensated for participating in this study. After the interview, participants will receive an Amazon voucher worth $25.

Sincerely,

Mr. Shuenda Wong
Ph.D. Music Education Candidate
████████████████████

Appendix F: Doctoral Thesis Proposal Decision

Doctor of Worship Studies or Doctor of Music Education

Doctoral Thesis Proposal Decision

The thesis Advisor and Reader have rendered the following decision

concerning the proposal status for

Shuenda Wong

on the research topic title of

A Narrative Study: Professional Development of a Piano Teacher through Various Music Education Philosophies and Psychologies in Different Sociocultural Contexts

as submitted on September 11, 2023

X_____ Full Approval to proceed with no proposal revisions.
The student may fully engage the research and writing process according to the established the timeline. Upon full approval, the student may apply for IRB approval, if applicable (see STEP 4 concerning IRB approval process).

_____ Provisional Approval to proceed with proposal pending cited revisions.
This is the most common decision. The student must resubmit the proposal with cited revisions according to the established timeline. The Advisor will indicate the committee's status on your response to the required revisions. The student may NOT apply for IRB approval until full approval is granted.

_____ Redirection of Proposal
The student is being redirected to develop a new proposal, as minor revisions will not meet the expectations for the research project. The student may NOT apply for IRB approval.

Brian Stiffler

9/11/2023

_____

Print Name of Advisor   **Signature**   **Date**

Monica Taylor

9/11/2023

_____

Print Name of Reader   **Signature**   **Date**