TEACHING IN THE TRENCHES:

A GROUNDED THEORY STUDY ON THE RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF URBAN

HIGH SCHOOL BAND DIRECTORS

By

Juvon R. Pollard, Sr.

Liberty University

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
THE DOCTOR OF MUSIC EDUCATION

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

TEACHING IN THE TRENCHES:

A GROUNDED THEORY STUDY ON THE RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF URBAN

HIGH SCHOOL BAND DIRECTORS

By

Juvon R. Pollard, Sr.

Liberty University

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT

OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

THE DOCTOR OF MUSIC EDUCATION

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

APPROVED BY:

Dr. Brian Stiffler, Advisor

_____

Dr. Stephen Müller, Reader

_____

Abstract

The recruitment and retention of high school band directors in urban settings are unique challenges in the 21st century. Those who advocate for arts education present evidence that participation in fine arts programs enhances student learning. Significant correlations exist between involvement in the arts and standardized test scores, high school graduation rates, and overall school attendance. However, funding and support are essential concerns for arts programs today. Funding and support through necessary resources affect the recruitment and retention of band directors in urban settings. Little research exists to describe these views. Exploring band directors' lived experiences working in urban schools supplies insight into recruitment and retention. Data collected through interviews with high school band directors from urban school settings were analyzed using a grounded theory approach. Conclusions fostered through analysis may help improve the recruitment and retention of teachers. Describing the experiences of band directors teaching in urban settings may raise support among education leaders and policymakers. Future research stemming from this study may help guide advocacy. As a result, study findings may help educators improve overall funding for fine arts programs, gain access to musical instruments needed for instruction and performance, and generate added resources to enhance effective teaching and learning in music and other art branches.

Keywords: Teaching In The Trenches; recruitment; retention; urban schools; band directors; advocate

Dedication

This paper is dedicated to my son, Juvon R. Pollard Jr., the best son in the world. I hope that you are as proud of me as I am of you. Thank you for being my late-night motivator, my inspiration, and my reason to keep pushing daily. While I am your earthly father, I thank God for trusting me with you. I could not have gotten this far in my life without you. You are my why! I hope and pray that I can continue motivating and inspiring you to accomplish all God has in store for you. There is an anointing on your life, and I cannot wait to see God manifest it through you. I am confident that you do far more in your life than I can ever imagine. Remember to keep God with you. I love you, son, and we did it. #PollardPack!

I would also like to dedicate this paper to my mother, Tina Pollard, who has supported and encouraged me throughout my life. I thank God for you daily. The many sacrifices you made for our family have not gone unnoticed. I am forever grateful for the many life lessons you provided to me. I know that I would not have become the man I am now without your unconditional love. I pray that God blesses you with the desires of your heart because you are so deserving of it.

To my grandmother, Gardiene Pollard, while you are no longer here on earth, I know you are smiling down from heaven. You have always spoken greatness into me. I love you and miss you dearly.

Lastly, this paper is for all band directors who are "Teaching In The Trenches." I am so proud of my colleagues who are doing more with less. Seeing the end products from many of my colleagues makes me incredibly proud. I hope you all will continue to advocate for your programs and bring out the very best in all of the students you teach. Continue to strive for the highest and achieve in every field of human endeavor.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Contents

List of Tables

List of Abbreviations

Historically Black College (HBCU)
Institutional Review Board (IRB)
Predominantly White College (PWI)

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Overview

The concept of "*teaching in the trenches*" stems from the idea and desire to explore the

recruitment and retention of urban high school band directors. For years, urban high school band

directors have worked from the pure desire to achieve. Many urban high school band

directors have pride, passion, and love for the art of music. However, few music education

programs thoroughly prepare music educators to work in urban high schools. The perception of

what most see when they listen to music ensembles from schools in urban settings perform

is not close to the reality of what band directors experience daily in these underserved and many

times under-appreciated schools and communities. While often not discussed among schools,

racial disparities in schools continue to exist. Many urban schools lack adequate resources,

which contributes to inequities among schools and an uneven playing field.[1]

While teaching music can be a gratifying and fulfilling job for most, teaching in urban

school settings can be a very exhausting, discouraging, and frustrating experience, even for

seasoned directors.[2] Band directors teaching in an urban school dedicate a significant percentage

of their time building students' morale. This process often takes place before students receive

instruments. Band directors wear many hats, and band directors find more suitable jobs due to

---

[1] Karen Salvador and Janice Krum, "Music Teacher Evaluation, Teacher Effectiveness, and Marginalized Populations," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophical and Qualitative Assessment in Music Education*, ed. David J. Elliott, Marissa Silverman, and Gary E. McPherson (New York: Oxford University Press, 2019), 139.

[2] Dean D. Richards, "Signs of the Times: Sources of Professional Challenge and Sustenance for Veteran African American Teachers" (Ph.D. diss., University of Kansas, 2017), 290.

adverse situations and a lack of proper resources.[3] As a result of band directors leaving for better opportunities, urban schools experience a higher turnover rate of directors and experience challenges recruiting quality band directors.

Background

Ronald Kos, Jr., explains that research promotes advocacy for music education and the arts.[4] Many students have to make decisions such as choosing physical education or music education.[5] However, both are important for the creative development, social development, and physical training of students. Other factors band directors teaching in urban school settings must overcome stem from limited resources.[6] These limited resources also affect parents who invest in their child's education. As a result, parents are unwilling to risk educational and musical growth by placing their children in an environment that is not conducive to learning.[7] In addition, students with musical experience do not wish to attend urban schools because of inconsistent structure and learning outcomes. Recruitment, retention, and hiring qualified music educators in urban schools have also proven challenging for administrators.[8] Research has found that

---

[3] Christian Matthew Noon, "Cultivating Socially Just Concert Programming Perspectives through Preservice Music Teachers' Band Experiences: A Multiple Case Study" (Ph.D. diss., University of Miami, 2020), 121.

[4] Ronald Kos Jr, "Music Education and The Well Rounded Education Provision of Every Student Succeeds Act: A Critical Policy Analysis," *Arts Education Policy Review* 119 (2018): 204-216.

[5] Elisabeth Freer and Paul Evans, "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, And Elective Music Intentions," *Psychology of Music* 47, no.6 (2019): 783.

[6] Juliet Hess, "Equity and Music Education: Euphemisms, Terminal Naivety, and Whiteness," *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education* 16 (2017): 22.

[7] Chris Segrin and Jeanne Flora, "Fostering Social and Emotional Intelligence: What Are the Best Current Strategies in Parenting?" *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 13, no. 3 (2019): e12439.

[8] David H. Monk, "Recruiting and Retaining High-Quality Teachers in Rural Areas," *The Future of Children* 17, no. 1 (2007): 159.

beginning music educators will substitute teach and work part-time in other areas rather than accept full-time music education positions in urban areas.[9]

Many high school band directors overlook the importance of preparing students for success in music studies and music education careers in music after high school.[10] Meeting students' musical needs can become a secondary issue in schools.[11] While performances are essential, many directors neglect the overall musical needs of the students.[12] The idea of having students' performance-ready often stems from a desire to keep administration and community members satisfied with the program. However, this expectation repeatedly leads to the stagnation of the student's musical growth. Students frequently lack essential music performance skills because of the emphasis placed on performing.[13] For band directors who are educators first, the issue of establishing a heavy emphasis on performing and limited focus on student learning is stressful. This disparity is also a factor in the recruitment and retention of quality music educators.[14]

---

[9] Shauna S. Pickens, "Preservice and In-service Music Teachers' Perceptions of Teaching in Low-SES, Urban Middle School Band Programs" (Ph.D. diss., Texas Tech University, 2019), 18.

[10] Daniel C. Johnson and Wendy K. Matthews, "Factors Influencing Pre-Instructional Decisions: An Initial Investigation of Expert Music Teacher Perceptions," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 36 (2020): 67.

[11] Hasan Aydin, Burhan Ozfidan and Douglas Carothers, "Meeting the Challenges of Curriculum and Instruction in School Settings in the United States," *Journal of Social Studies Education Research* 8, no. 3 (2017): 76.

[12] Olivia Broslawsky, Marching Forth: "A Study of The Impact of Gender on The Professionalization of Marching Band Students in New Orleans," (Tulane University, New Orleans 2017), 44.

[13] Eleonora Concina, "The Role of Metacognitive Skills in Music Learning and Performing: Theoretical Features and Educational Implications," *Frontiers in Psychology* 10, (2019): 6.

[14] Ibid., 9.

Funding for music programs is a factor in recruiting and retaining qualified band directors for urban schools. Accountability placed in funding the arts, specifically music programs, is an issue that goes unaddressed, thus aiding in the adverse outcomes of musical growth and success for music programs.[15] Furthermore, funding in urban schools has proven to be an issue of equity.[16] Music educators in urban schools continue to advocate for resources, while educators in various curriculum areas compete for the same resources and additional funds.[17] Thus, advocacy for the arts is still a pressing issue. While some band directors desire to serve urban school students, these schools will continue to be a revolving door until schools provide adequate resources.

Theoretical Framework

With budget cuts to arts programs, urban high school band directors face many challenges. A grounded theory approach provides an effective means to explore urban high school band directors' lived experiences in the context of recruitment and retention. Kathy Charmaz posited that research is informative and guided by the researcher's beliefs of understanding the world.[18] The grounded theory offers a practical means of an inductive and

---

[15] Priscilla E. Almaguer, "A Case Study: A Thriving Secondary Arts Program in the Face of High-Stakes Accountability," (Doctoral, diss, University of Southern California, 2013), 24.

[16] Jennifer Wolch, John P. Wilson and Jed Fehrenbach, "Parks and Park Funding in Los Angeles: An Equity-Mapping Analysis," *Urban Geography* 26, no. 1 (2005): 7.

[17] Alfonso Echazarra and Thomas Radinger, "Learning in Rural Schools: Insights from PISA, TALIS, and Literature," *OECD Education Working Papers*, no. 196 (2019): 31.

[18] Kathy Charmaz and Robert Thornberg, "The Pursuit of Quality in Grounded Theory," *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 18, issue 3 (2020): 6.

deductive process of generating ideas derived from the participants' experiences.[19] Grounded

theory approach is appropriate when the goal is to explain or uncover an area of inquiry.

In grounded theory, a theory is generated or grounded through data collection and

analysis. Glaser and Strauss first developed the approach that is both a method of inquiry and an

investigation product. According to Kathy Charmaz, grounded theory is a qualitative research

method that focuses on creating conceptual frameworks or theories. Furthermore, Birks et al.

suggest grounded theory is a process by which the researcher generates an approach through data

analysis.[20]

The researcher constructs a grounded theory based on their worldview.[21] This theoretical

framework describes the perceptions of music teachers taking part in the study. However, more

importantly, it uncovers the reality of the lived experience of band directors teaching in urban

schools.

Problem Statement

Music education programs in urban settings face significant challenges related to music

education professionals' recruitment and retention in the twenty-first century. Advocates for arts

education suggest music education enhances student learning in all subject areas.[22] Although

reports show schools with extracurricular activities such as music programs gain higher SAT

---

[19] Tie Ylona Chun Melanie Birks and Karen Francis, "Grounded Theory Research: A Design Framework for Novice Researchers," *SAGE Open Medicine* 7, (2019): 2.

[20] Robert Thornberg and Kathy Charmaz, "Grounded Theory and Theoretical Coding," in *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis,* ed. Uwe Flick (Los Angeles: SAGE Publications, 2014), 155.

[21] Melanie Birks, Karen Hoare and Jane Mills, "Grounded Theory: FAQs," *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 18, (2019): 4.

[22] Jolene Wong, "Advocacy Now: The Importance of Music Education" (Master's thesis, University of Alberta, Canada, 2018), 6.

scores, higher graduation rates, and higher attendance rates than schools without music programs, funding and support for music programs remain significant concerns.[23] Funding and support also affect the teaching potential, recruitment, and retention of band directors teaching in urban schools.[24] Band directors' willingness to teach at urban schools is affected by factors limiting student's ability to participate in band. Widespread poverty, inadequate facilities, and outdated instruments also contribute to the lack of desire to teach in urban schools.[25] Members of the community and school administration notice the difficulty of recruiting highly qualified teachers. These schools face high turnover rates among teachers due to many factors hurting student achievement in music. Consequently, turnover rates among teachers diminish the learning experiences of students.[26]

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this grounded theory study is to explore urban high school band directors' lived experiences in the context of recruitment and retention. These experiences reflect fundamental issues of band directors teaching in urban schools. In addition, the research addresses issues limiting support of urban music programs and the potential effects of various school demographics.

---

[23] Howard T. Everson and Roger E. Millsap, *Everyone Gains: Extracurricular Activities in High School and Higher SAT® Scores*, (New York: College Board Publications, 2005), 2.

[24] Kevin Howard, "Motivating Factors Affecting the Recruitment and Retention of Suburban Middle School Band Students "(Ph.D. diss., Northeast Tennessee, 2019), 6.

[25] John Eros, "Becoming Part of The City: Influences on The Career Choice of An Urban Music Educator, International," *Journal of Music Education* 36, no. 3 (2018): 411.

[26] Ibid., 412.

Significance of Study

Recruitment and retention for high school band directors in urban schools are in decline.[27] Recruitment and retention issues affect music program quality, resulting in poor musical performances and student outcomes.[28] Reporting band directors' lived experiences could help education leaders and policymakers gain support for music programs in schools and positively affect attendance rates and academic achievement.[29] Findings could encourage further research of urban high school band directors' lived experiences. Future research may address and improve advocacy for music programs, facilities, and instruments available for instruction, feeder programs, and increased education resources. Furthermore, this project may inform policymakers of specific challenges band directors face teaching in urban schools.[30]

Study findings may also shed light on pressing issues such as equity and equal opportunity. Equity in education has played a factor in what students learn versus what they should know.[31] Thus, findings may help to guide decisions concerning equity. This study contributes to the existing literature on music education by addressing the literature gap concerning the recruitment and retention of urban high school band directors.[32] Music education

---

[27] Meredith L. Wronowski, "Filling the Void: A Grounded Theory Approach to Addressing Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Urban Schools," *Education and Urban Society* 50, no. 6 (2018): 550.

[28] Julia T. Shaw, Urban Music Educators' Perceived Professional Growth in a Context-Specific Professional Development Program," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 67, no. 4 (2020): 459.

[29] Ibid., 453.

[30] Gregory L. Denson, "A Phenomenological Exploration of the Experiences Gained During Pre-Service Music Teacher Preparation of Black Urban Band Directors" (Doctoral diss., Georgia State University, 2019), 30.

[31] Juliet Hess, "Equity and Music Education: Euphemisms, Terminal Naivety, and Whiteness," *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education* 16 (2017): 24.

[32] Frank J. Poolos, "Secondary School Band: Student Retention and Director Issues-Challenges and Strategies" (Master's thesis, Liberty University, 2019), 22.

programs may apply findings of this and future studies to effectively prepare students to teach in urban school settings.[33]

Central Research Questions

1. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe their experiences related to band director recruitment?

2. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe their experiences related to band director retention?

3. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe their experiences related to teaching?

The paradigm and framework of the grounded theory approach do not support a hypothesis. Thus, the study does not state hypotheses to avoid data collection and analysis bias as prescribed for grounded theory procedures. Instead, the researcher collected data to assist the development of new theories through epistemological research.[34]

Core Concepts

Music teachers in urban schools must overcome limited funding, limited resources, and inadequate feeder schools.[35] Stakeholders often evaluate music programs subjectively on performances; however, a program's overall needs frequently receive less attention. Performance-based evaluations require band directors to focus on performing rather than the needs of students. Correspondingly, band programs in urban schools emphasize the performing ensembles more than learning opportunities in music. Frequently, school districts provide limited

---

[33] Frank J. Poolos, "Secondary School Band: Student Retention and Director Issues-Challenges and Strategies" (Master's Thesis, Liberty University, 2019), 23.

[34] John W. Creswell, William E. Hanson, Vicki L. Clark Plano and Alejandro Morales, "Qualitative Research Designs: Selection and Implementation," *The Counseling Psychologist* 35, no. 2 (2007): 241.

[35] Casey L. Padron, "Rural Music Teacher Job Satisfaction, Retention, and Music Education's Career Ladder" (Ph.D. diss., Colorado State University, 2020), 16.

funding needed to help urban high school band directors create comprehensive music programs.[36] Providing band directors with the necessary resources may change and improve music educators' low recruitment and retention in urban schools. In addition, developing and applying reasonable solutions to recruit and retain band directors in urban schools may encourage better students and programs.[37]

Definition of Terms

Advocacy - The act of public support for or recommendation of a particular cause or policy.[38]

Educational Administration – Managing the resources, tasks, and communications involved in running a school.[39]

Equality- Ensuring every individual has an equal opportunity to make the most of their lives and talents.[40]

Music Education - A field of study associated with the teaching and learning of music and musical concepts. Music Education focuses on all learning domains, including the psychomotor

---

[36] Johanna E. Abril, "The State of Music Education in The Basic General Public Schools of Ecuador: The Administrators Perspective," *International Journal of Music Education* 37, no. 3 (2019): 144.

[37] Susan Conkling and Brian Kaufman, "Equality and Quality: The Influence of Private Funds on Public Arts Education in Boston and Baltimore," *Arts Education Policy Review* 121, no. 1, (2020): 18.

[38] Elizabeth J. Reid, "Understanding the Word Advocacy: Context and Use," in *Structuring the Inquiry Into Advocacy*, ed. Elizabeth Reid (Washington DC: The Urban Institute, 2000), 1-8.

[39] Anne Pyburn Craig, "Definition of Educational Administration," 2018, https://www.theclassroom.com/definition-educational-administration-5452428.html.

[40] Ronald Dworkin, "What is Equality? Part 2: Equality of Resources", *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 10, no. 4 (1981): 3.

domain (the development of skills), the cognitive domain (the acquisition of knowledge), and significant ways, the affective domain, including music appreciation and sensitivity.[41]

Nvivo software - Nvivo is a qualitative data analysis (QDA) computer software package produced by QSR International.[42]

Recruitment - The process of actively seeking out, finding, and hiring candidates for a specific position or job in music education.[43]

Teacher Burnout - A psychological condition leads to exhaustion, depersonalization, and decreased teacher achievement and self-worth.[44]

Teaching in The Trenches - The attempt to educate students through adverse circumstances and limitations.

Urban School - Primarily serves poor and ethnically diverse students in densely populated areas. Urban schools demonstrate lower academic achievement than suburban schools and high mobility rates by students.[45]

---

[41] Steven J. Holochwost, Cathi B. Propper, Dennie Palmer Wolf, Michael T. Willoughby, Kelly R. Fisher, Jacek Kolacz, Vanessa V. Volpe and Sara R. Jaffee, "Music Education, Academic Achievement, and Executive Functions," *Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts* 11, no. 2 (2017): 147.

[42] Lyn Richards, *Using NVivo in Qualitative Research* (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 1999), 11.

[43] Brian R. Dineen and Scott M. Soltis, "Recruitment: A review of research and emerging directions," *APA Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology* 2 (2011): 22.

[44] Kenneth Leithwood, Teresa Menzies, Doris Jantzi and Jennifer Leithwood, "School Restructuring, Transformational Leadership and the Amelioration of Teacher Burnout," *Anxiety, Stress, and Coping: An International Journal* 9, no. 3 (1996): 200.

[45] Richard H. Milner IV, "But What is Urban Education?" *Urban Education* 47, Issue 3 (2012): 556.

Chapter Summary

For many years, band directors teaching in urban schools have faced many challenges to create quality ensembles. Lack of funding, resources, and feeder schools continue to hurt music programs in urban school settings. While band directors advocate for their prospective programs, people with the ability to help frequently ignore requests. The idea of *teaching in the trenches* is not just a meaningless phrase. The lack of resources strongly affects the retention and recruiting of quality band directors.[46] New college graduates choose not to interview for schools in urban areas. Even the most experienced band directors become discouraged by unequal treatment between band programs in urban settings and other situations. The researcher explores urban high school band directors' lived experiences in this study and seeks to guide band directors' recruitment and retention in urban schools to foster student learning.

---

[46] Luis Aróstegui, "Exploring the Global Decline of Music Education*," Arts Education Policy Review* 117, no. 2 (2016): 115.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Overview

This literature review provides the necessary context, content, and knowledge related to theories and current trends that affect recruitment and retention in urban schools. In addition, the researcher cites essential information such as the findings, conclusions, and methodological issues related to the study. The first section highlights the history of music education. In section two, the researcher will explore the significant role of advocacy within music education. A third section recognizes the importance of recruiting teachers. The fourth section explores teacher retention in urban schools. The final section explores band directors' lived experiences teaching in urban schools.

History of Music Education

To understand why recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools are significantly different from that of nonurban schools, the researcher provides a brief overall of the history of music education dating back from its early conceptions to current practices. The history of music education offers many historical facts that support the differences in teaching in predominantly white and urban schools.

Much of music education is said to have started by Lowell Mason. Lowell Mason was born in 1792. Mason was known as the father of American music education and the first public school teacher.[47] *In the First Public School Music Teacher* journal, Perkins asserted, Mason believed that anyone could learn music. His influence and ideas went on to become the blueprint

---

[47] Victor H. Perkins, "First Public-School Music Teacher," *Music Educators Journal* 28, no. 1 (September 1941): 12.

for music education.[48] Mason petitioned the Boston school board to have music included in the public-school curriculum described by Perkins. Thus, helping to make music education an official study in schools.

While Perkins's research provided an overview of music education history, Patricia Campbell's music education approach analyzes music education's cultural and community aspects and its purpose in serving all and not exclusively purposed for a particular set of people. In the Music, Education, and Diversity: Bridging Cultures and Communities, Patricia Campbell explains how the science of music and music education centers on sound, feelings, understanding, and emotions. As a result, music educators develop skills for professional careers in teacher training programs. Furthermore, Campbell suggests that music is not an exclusive privilege to any color or creed. She further states, "music education is the responsibility of educators to decide to keep music with the set of common core understandings and skills to bring out the best in all students."[49]

Teacher Retention

Teacher Retention applies to all teachers regardless of the content taught. Therefore, it is no surprise that systematic changes at the secondary education level adversely affect teacher turnover. The first section will describe general issues that affect teacher retention, and the second section will describe problems with the retention of band directors.

---

[48] Perkins, "First Public-School Music Teacher," 13.

[49] Ibid., 17.

Teacher Retention in General

An article by Meredith Wronowski discusses issues of teacher shortage in urban schools. Wronowski examines teacher recruitment and retention by analyzing a qualitative study.[50] Wronowski asserts how different practices can help with recruitment and teachers' retention in urban schools in her outline. Furthermore, she suggests that it is vital to find those who have the ability and personality to work with students from urban communities when recruiting new teachers.[51]A grounded theory study performed by Meredith Wronowski gives insight into data such as interviews and observational studies on what causes retention problems in urban schools. Wronowski found that cultural awareness, personality traits, and effective student relationships were among the top reasons for low retention in urban schools.

Concerning retention amongst many schools in urban settings, Wronowski quotes, "Successful teachers in high-needs schools give their students much more than knowledge of content. The common theme that emerged from participants is that the ability to form a certain type of relationship with students is paramount to any other teaching skill in this setting, including content knowledge."[52] Wronowski concluded that for the retention of teachers in urban schools, stakeholders should prioritize teacher empowerment within the organizational frameworks.[53]

---

[50] Meredith L. Wronowski, "Filling the Void: A Grounded Theory Approach to Addressing Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Urban Schools," *Education and Urban Society* 50, no. 6 (July 2018): 566. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124517713608.

[51] Ibid., 551.

[52] Ibid., 558.

[53] Ibid., 573.

Substantial teacher turnover poses several challenges to staffing in public schools. Papay, John P., et al. asserts, as a result, the scope of teacher retention is a challenge across several school districts; however, it remains poorly defined.[54] Papay, John P., et al. also find considerable cross-district variation in critical results from the retention literature, including the relationship between retention and experience and estimated effectiveness. Moreover, observable characteristics do not easily explain this cross-district variation.[55]

<div align="center">Retention of Band Directors</div>

Student enrollment and retention amongst band directors in band programs in public-school systems recognize that music education is a positive organization for overall student performance and behavior in and out of school. Those factors mentioned about music being a positive organization for students contribute to favorable band director retention rates.

The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education examines the gap in the rising numbers of minority students and a shortage of minority teachers.[56] This research addresses the issues contributing to a lack of people of color teaching music. DeLorenzo and Silverman focus on the cyclical nature of teacher diversity. "The fact that so few Black and Latino students consider music teaching as a future goal is multi-faceted and goes beyond simplistic solutions. Perhaps the most important finding to emerge from

---

[54] John P. Papay, Andrew Bacher-Hicks, Lindsay C. Page and William H. Marinell, "The Challenge of Teacher Retention in Urban Schools: Evidence of Variation from a Cross-Site Analysis," *Educational Researcher* 46, no. 8 (2017): 441.

[55] Ibid., 445.

[56] Lisa C. DeLorenzo and Marissa Silverman, "From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 27 (2016): 14.

this data is that Black and Latino students/teachers have experiences that can inform the way we support future students of color."[57]

To gain more insight into retention issues, Frank Poolos builds a case for the positive impacts of students involved in band programs and the positive outcome on music teachers.[58] Pooles discusses how being in band programs can help students' academic and social development. This thesis also talks about how students involved in band programs have higher graduation rates; thus, increasing band students' retention.[59] As quoted by Poolos, "to improve student retention in secondary school band programs, the literature review will account for research questions and address strategies for successful growth in rural public-school systems."[60]

Jonathan M. Kraemer and Michelle Kraemer offer insight into new band directors' needs and strategies for a successful/effective program. Kraemer & Kraemer posited that music could provide students with emotional, cognitive, and cooperative experiences to build relationships with peers compared to other subjects.[61] *The Band Director's Guide to Success* discusses how many band directors lack practical knowledge outside teaching concepts. Kraemer & Kraemer asserts, "One of the most commonly misunderstood aspects of a new music teacher's life is requesting, setting up, and following a budget."[62]

---

[57] Lisa C. DeLorenzo and Marissa Silverman, "From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 27 (2016): 18.

[58] Frank J. Poolos, "Secondary School Band: Student Retention and Director Issues-Challenges and Strategies" (Master's Thesis, Liberty University, 2019), 22.

[59] Ibid., 25.

[60] Ibid., 27.

[61] Jonathan M. Kraemer and Michelle Kraemer, *The Band Director's Guide to Success: A Survival Guide for New Music Educators* (London: Oxford University Press, 2016), 200.

[62] Ibid., 202.

Recruiting students in music programs is one thing but keeping them interested in the program is another. Several experts share their advice on retention. Susan Poliniak explains how although a music director has little control over some variables, much can help keep students interested. For example, Poliniak asserts, one expert said a teacher's attitude and classroom strategies might be two of the most critical influences on the students.[63] "It's up to the teacher to create a cohesive group where every student is valued, an encouraging atmosphere, and an academically rigorous program, all of which can go a long way towards keeping students engaged and enthusiastic."[64]

In a study of the retention of music teachers using data from the National Center for Educational Statistics, Carl Hancock determined how music teachers viewed their careers one year after moving to a different school or leaving teaching altogether. The results found by Hancock indicated that transferring music teachers experienced numerous improvements to their professional careers, including making a difference in others, working at a school with better operating conditions, and feeling a sense of personal accomplishment, intellectual challenge, and support.[65] Music teachers transferred mainly because of school personnel actions, a desire for a better assignment, and dissatisfaction with administrators and working conditions. In addition, former music teachers experienced improved opportunities for advancement, manageable workloads, and work/life balance. Personal reasons, college enrollment, staffing actions, and retirement were principal motivations for leaving.

---

[63] Susan Poliniak, "Secrets of Retention,"*Teaching Music* 19, no. 4 (2012): 41.

[64] Ibid., 43.

[65] Carl B. Hancock, "Is the Grass Greener? Current and Former Music Teachers' Perceptions a Year After Moving to a Different School or Leaving the Classroom," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 63, no. 4 (2016): 444.

Teacher Recruitment

Teacher Recruitment of Band Directors

Building an Instrumental Program in Rural and Urban Schools magazine discusses areas that the author believes are critical to building and maintaining a thriving music program in an urban school setting. Shane Colquhoun discusses the importance of building relationships, student-centered instructions, non-traditional, culturally relevant music ensembles, integrating technology, and student ownership.[66] Colquhoun's purpose in this magazine write-up is to develop practical ways to engage students in learning music. "The goal every day in implementing the structure that we have in our program is to encourage students to be lifelong learners and musicians. In cultivating lifelong learners, you get lifelong teachers."[67]

Julia Shawn's article explores the changes needed to rectify music education perception in urban school settings, seeking insight into teacher recruitment issues. Julia Shaw asserted, "Urban educators should not require permission to teach in ways that are relevant to their specific learners and the educational contexts."[68] Shaw also makes suggestions for professional development opportunities to assist urban music educators.[69] This article speaks to the importance of professional development opportunities for band directors who teach students in urban schools. Professional development plays a factor in the retention of band directors.

---

[66] Shane Colquhoun, "Building an Instrumental Program in Rural and Urban Schools," National Association for Music Education, July 11, 2016, https://nafme.org/building-instrumental-program-rural-urban-schools/.

[67] Ibid.

[68] Julia T. Shaw, "Urban Music Educators' Perceived Professional Growth in a Context-Specific Professional Development Program," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 67, no. 4 (2020): 460.

[69] Ibid., 461.

Teacher Recruitment in General

Teacher Recruitment and Retention: *A Review of The Recent Empirical Literature* critically reviews the recent verifiable literature on teacher recruitment and retention. Guarino, Santibanez, and Daley examine the characteristics of individuals who enter and remain in the teaching profession, the elements of schools and districts that successfully recruit and retain teachers, and the types of policies that are effective in recruiting retaining teachers.[70] The article aims to provide researchers and policymakers with a comprehensive, evaluative, and up-to-date review. The up-to-date review of the particular articles selected for discussion purposes serves as available recent research on teacher recruitment and retention and guides the merit and importance of these studies chosen by the researcher.

This article describes and outlines a study conducted to gain informative insight into the essential factors contributing to African American college students deciding on a career course and the attractiveness of teaching. Veronica Shipp explains that the focus of the study was a comparison of education and non-education majors.[71] Based on the findings, non-education majors placed significantly more importance on salaries and advancement in their career choices than education majors.[72] However, both groups perceive salary and prestige as the least significant and attractive aspects regarding an occupation in the teaching profession.[73]

---

[70] Cassandra M. Guarino, Lucrecia Santibanez and Glenn A. Daley, "Teacher Recruitment and Retention: A Review of the Recent Empirical Literature," Review of Educational Research 76, no. 2 (2006): 187.

[71] Veronica H. Shipp, "Factors Influencing the Career Choices of African American Collegians: Implications for Minority Teacher Recruitment." *New York: Journal of Negro Education* (1999): 345.

[72] Ibid., 349.

[73] Ibid., 350.

Band Directors Lived Experiences in Urban Schools

In the article You Got to Know Us": *A Hopeful Model for Music Education in Urban Schools,* Martignetti, Frank, et al. illustrate how urban school students and teachers face adversity.[74] In this writing, the authors discuss how urban schools' conversation has had a minimal effect on music teacher education. In this article, Martignetti, Frank, et al., all having a combined thirty years of experience working in urban schools, examines several aspects of their experiences working in urban music education.[75] The authors hope to situate urban music education as a renewal, reform, and meaningful learning site by promoting the lived stories of successful urban music students, teachers, and programs.

A Practical Guide for Teachers discusses how different urban school settings are from their counterparts. In this book, Kate Fitzpatrick-Harnish encourages teachers in urban school settings to focus on students' strengths versus what they lack.[76] Highlighted are the opportunity gaps that students in urban schools face. Harnish also discusses the pedagogical teaching styles that meet the needs of their students. Harnish states that "urban schools describe schools not located in big cities but experience some of the challenges associated with schools in larger areas."[77]

---

[74] Frank Martignetti, Brent C. Talbot, Matthew Clauhs, Timothy Hawkins and Nasim Niknafs, "You Got to Know Us: A Hopeful Model for Music Education in Urban Schools," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 23 (2013): 9.

[75] Ibid., 11.

[76] Kate Fitzpatrick-Harnish, *Urban Music Education: A Practical Guide for Teachers* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015), 7.

[77] Ibid., 9.

Gabrial Arnold explores practical ways to maintain a comprehensive music program in a title 1 or urban school setting.[78] Arnold discusses beginning strategies from the author's lived experience as a high school band director who taught music in urban schools. Arnold discusses the importance of band directors having mentor directors.[79] Arnold quotes, "Among the many reasons to find an experienced educator as a mentor for yourself as a teacher, one of the best is to help you keep perspective. Keeping the bigger picture in mind helps deal with frustrations of daily teaching or the more challenging times that can crop up during any academic year."[80] Furthermore, this article aims to discuss and implement band directors' ways to succeed in title 1 and urban school settings.[81]

John Eros explains how the purpose of this case study was to examine and provide first-hand experiences of what influenced one music teacher's career choice to teach music to students in an urban school setting.[82] Does the primary research question center on what experiences influenced the participant to pursue urban music education as a career? The article used a "secondary analysis" of a survey, journal, and interview data collected in a more extensive investigation. Eros discusses implications for urban music education and music teacher education, as are suggestions for further research.[83]

---

[78] Gabrial Arnold, "Music For All, Effective Band Director Techniques for Teaching in Title I Schools" (Ph.D. diss., Florida State University, 2016), 3.

[79] Ibid., 8.

[80] Ibid., 9.

[81] Ibid., 13.

[82] John Eros, "Becoming Part of the City: Influences on the Career Choice of an Urban Music Educator," *International Journal of Music Education* 36, no. 3 (2018): 411.

[83] Ibid., 415.

This study aimed to develop a compelling urban music educator profile to provide strategies for university teacher training to prepare students to teach in urban schools. Vicki Baker examined urban music teachers' educational background, effective and ineffective characteristics, perceived challenges, and traits needed to sustain a long-term career. Baker asserts that the results indicated that participants who attended urban schools themselves had longer tenures in urban schools than those who had not.[84] In addition, an effective urban music educator was empathetic, patient, flexible, enthusiastic, and committed to students' learning.

The COVID-19 pandemic has done enough to change the world of music education forever. Educators worldwide have been forced to create new methods to teach, practice, and collaborate. Many of these newfound ways has become the new normal. But, unfortunately, the COVID pandemic has affected most of the antiquated methods of teaching.

George Shannon talks about life after the pandemic for band directors. In this article, he outlines the effects of music programs due to the global pandemic.[85] Shannon discusses how band directors have to become creative in their educational approaches to serve students during these trying times. Furthermore, Shannon discusses how we, as educators, must go away from Western European music traditions. Shannon quoted, "Music educators need to allow students to be more independently creative and encourage culturally responsive practices that permit students to display their culture through music."[86]

---

[84] Vicki D. Baker, Profile of an Effective Urban Music Educator, Denton, Texas: Texas Woman's University," *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 31, no. 1 (2012): 46.

[85] George W. Shannon, "An Unexpected Shift, Music the Sound of My Heart," *Teaching Music* (October 2020): 22.

[86] Ibid., 52.

Gap in Equity

Music education can develop many vital components to success. Some include creativity, which allows students to become artistic and think beyond the presented content, discipline, perseverance, pride in results, group cooperation, and higher than average confidence levels. Furthermore, social and communication skills, emotional maturity are all developed through music. Finally, music education provides exceptional preparation that should be fair and impartial. This concept is essential for success in all fields of human endeavor.

The achievement gap is the focus of an article by Ford and Moore. Ford and Moore's authors focus on the underachievement and low achievement among African American students in urban schools.[87] Ford and Moore further discuss the achievement gap in the literature provided for black students.[88] One of the fundamental components of this discussion is bringing to light a need for educators in urban schools to adopt a social justice or civil rights approach in their educational training. Ford and Moore explain how this concept should encourage an equity-based and culturally responsive practice in philosophy and action.[89]

Servet Celik and Zeynel Amac investigated pre-service teachers' beliefs about urban students and how well their teacher education programs address working in inner-city schools.[90] Outlined in this study is the significant gap in educating future teachers on the challenges of

---

[87] Donna Y. Ford and James L. Moore, "Understanding and Reversing Underachievement, Low Achievement, and Achievement Gaps Among High-Ability African American Males in Urban School Contexts, *The Urban Review* 45, no. 4 (2013): 402.

[88] Ibid., 404.

[89] Ibid., 413.

[90] Servet Celik and Zeynel Amaç, "Are Teacher Education Programs Failing the Nation's Urban Schools? *A Closer Look at Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs About Working with Inner-City Students," *The Journal of Multiculturalism in Music Education* 8 (October 2012): 20.

working in urban schools. Although there have been signs of progress, Celik and Amac concluded that further research is necessary to pinpoint teacher education programs' failings and adequately prepare teachers to work in urban settings.[91]

Influences of Segregation and Integration on the Bands at Historically Black High Schools in Duval County, Florida, discuss segregation and integration's challenges and effects on predominantly black band programs. In this review, Timothy J. Groulx explores how to inspire the unequal treatment and lack of resources, band directors in Duval county's urban schools could still put band programs together.[92] Groulx also gives an overview of the importance of having middle school feeder programs to assist with the high school band program. Groulx goes on to assert," with very few students with experience, little to no instruments, no practice facility, and suitable band equipment, my challenge was to produce a band comparable to the more advanced music programs in our district. Unfortunately, we had all the right ingredients for a low instructional program."[93]

Access to music teacher education programs in the United States higher education system has become a growing concern for music educators and scholars. Several factors play a role in who gains access to a particular instructional institution and program. Micael Palmer examines how race is still a significant factor that gives predominantly white institutions more power and

---

[91] Servet Celik and Zeynel Amaç, "Are Teacher Education Programs Failing the Nation's Urban Schools? *A Closer Look at Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs about Working with Inner-City Students,*" 20.

[92] Timothy J. Groulx, "Influences of Segregation and Integration on the Bands at Historically Black High Schools in Duval County, Florida, Jacksonville," *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 40, no. 1 (2018): 61.

[93] Ibid., 63.

privilege.[94] Palmer uses a critical race theory as a theoretical framework. Furthermore.[95] This paper details some significant challenges people of color face in accessing predominantly white institutions and music teacher education programs.

Importance of Music Education

Music education is essential because of its numerous benefits to students.[96] Exposing children to music can have positive effects on them. Music education can help foster academic performance, social skills, and overall creativity - all crucial to a child's development.[97] An article in Neuroimage by Koelsch and Schulze evaluates the functional neuroanatomy of music education. Music education catapults a child's learning to new heights, and because of this, it should be considered a pivotal and essential aspect of the educational curriculum. Music education is a vital aspect of learning that provides children with a well-versed education. When music is allowed to work in harmony with other subjects, music helps children grow in self-esteem, build necessary skills, and prepare students to become productive citizens.[98] This study further assessed the developmental aspects and effects of musical education.[99]

---

[94] Micael C. Palmer, "Challenges of Access to Post-Secondary Music Education Programs for People of Color," *Visions of Research in Music Education* 18 (2011): 16.

[95] Ibid., 19.

[96] Ibid., 20.

[97] Ibid., 22.

[98] Stefan Koelsch, Thomas Fritz, Katrin Schulze, David Alsop and Gottfried Schlaug, "Adults and Children Processing Music: An FMRI Study," *Neuroimage* 25, no. 4 (2005): 1068.

[99] Ibid., 1069.

In Ronald P. Kos Jr.'s book, he elaborated on the importance of fundamental approaches.[100] Kos reflects on how music educators feel they must actively seek public help and endorsement for music education.[101] Educators tried different methods to sway and change public opinion. New approaches have benefited music education and encouraged the development of music advocacy. In this article, Kos effectively "presents a framework that allows researchers to incorporate critical theory into policy analysis to emphasize music education's importance.[102]

Like Kos's perspective, Fiese and Decarbo examined the unique teaching situations music teachers face in urban schools and their methods to educate those students. In addition, Fiese and Decarbo's article explains how music educators in urban schools should explore various urban schools' viewpoints to provide a realistic vision of teaching music in urban schools.[103] Twenty music teachers in urban schools participated in the study to assess urban schools' different instructional practices.[104] All participants in this study made recommendations to improve music education in urban schools. However, Fiese and Decarbo found it interesting that most

---

[100] Ronald P. Kos Jr, "Music Education and The Well-Rounded Education Provision of Every Student Succeeds Act: A Critical Policy Analysis," *Arts Education Policy Review* 119, no. 4 (218): 216.

[101] Ibid., 209.

[102] Ibid., 215.

[103] Richard K. Fiese and Nicholas J. DeCarbo, "Urban Music Education: The Teachers' Perspective: Richard K. Fiese and Nicholas J. DeCarbo Look at Responses from Twenty Urban Music Teachers About the Unique Teaching Situations They Face," *National Associations for Music Education, Music Educators Journal* 81, no. 6 (1995): 27.

[104] Ibid., 28.

participants concluded that "post participants felt woefully unprepared to teach in urban schools."[105]

Music education is vital, yet many school systems offer few music courses.[106] Abril and Gault explain that many schools have begun to remove music from their curriculum to accommodate other subject areas.[107] To not have music courses deleted from the curriculum, Abril and Gault explain the benefits of music, why music is essential for student growth, and why it should remain in the curriculum. Abril and Gault discuss how music is a necessary subject for students to learn and grow. Music can lead to better brain development, increased human connection, and even stress relief.[108]

Lauren L. Brown discusses the usefulness and advantages of including music in the curriculum. In her PBS KIDS for Parents presentation, Brown discusses academic achievement, spatial intelligence, and how spatial intelligence benefits students and music education.[109] Brown's research shows that learning through word association helps children excel beyond the basic alphabets they understand. Furthermore, brown emphasizes how research has found that music instructions benefit students' ability to learn other subjects and enhances children's skills.[110] While the argument that making music makes you smarter is debatable, Brown provides

---

[105] Fiese and DeCarbo, "Urban Music Education: The Teachers' Perspective: Richard K. Fiese and Nicholas J. DeCarbo Look at Responses from Twenty Urban Music Teachers About the Unique Teaching Situations They Face," 30.

[106] Carlos R. Abril and Brent M. Gault, "The State of Music in Secondary Schools: The Principal's Perspective," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56, no. 1 (2008): 69.

[107] Ibid., 70.

[108] Ibid., 79.

[109] Laura Lewis Brown, "The Benefits of Music Education," PBS KIDS for Parents, May 13, 2012, https://www.pbs.org/parents/thrive/the-benefits-of-music-education.

[110] Brown, "The Benefits of Music Education."

evidence of her stance; Music does not make you smarter; however, the benefits of making children happier, more disciplined, and more self-aware demonstrate how music education significantly contributes to academia.

In connection with Lauren L. Brown's study, Jing He, Chi Wong, and Hui further discuss spatial intelligence's importance. Spatial intelligence, or visuospatial ability, has been defined as the skill or ability to generate, retain, and transform well-structured visual images.[111] It is considered to be what happens when we visualize shapes. Jing He, Chi Wong, and Hui explain that spatial intelligence benefits music education because music is viewed spatially rather than understood by analyzing chords, notes, and rhythms. Instead, spatial intelligence focuses on thinking that requires fostering the ability to recognize and visualize different elements that work together.[112]

Hodges and Bitar refer to Mary Luehrisen's important and influential ideas related to children's benefits from music education.[113] Mary Luehrisen is the executive director of the National Association of Music Merchants (NAMM) Foundation. The NAMM is a nonprofit association. Its purpose is to promote the potential benefits that can be associated with music.[114]

As Guhn, Emerson, and Gouzouasis explore, one benefit of music education is that music facilitates student academic achievement. Music expands students' artistic side, creates benefits

---

[111] Wu-Jing He, Wan-Chi Wong and Anna N-N. Hui, "Emotional Reactions Mediate the Effect of Music Listening on Creative Thinking: Perspective of the Arousal-and-Mood Hypothesis," *Frontiers in Psychology* 8 (2017): 1680.

[112] Ibid., 1682.

[113] Donald A. Hodges and Mary Luehrsen, "The Impact of a Funded Research Program on Music Education Policy," *Arts Education Policy Review* 111, no. 2 (2010): 72.

[114] Ibid., 73.

that extend to other academic areas, and leads to overall educational success.[115] The authors argue that music education's importance centers around "a systematic, developmental, and comprehensive music education should be at the heart of every child's formal education."[116]

While the voice and musical instruments are essential aspects of music, music-making involves much more. Jonathan Savage explains how learning music at an early age requires children to use various skills, sometimes while multitasking.[117] Savage goes on further, stating that "the benefits and importance of music education explore recent research data that demonstrates a decline in music education as a result of poorly designed policies."[118] This article is relevant to the topic of this study because it explores gaps in place that hinder a high level of musical excellence due to policies and procedures that affect student outcomes.

Chapter Summary

This literature review provides essential information related to the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools. The current study aimed to address current issues in recruiting and retaining band directors in urban school settings. In addition to providing information on teaching in urban schools, the researcher examined the following areas: History of Music Education, Teacher Retention, Teacher Recruitment, and Band Directors Lived Experiences, along with the Importance of Music Education.

---

[115] Martin Guhn, Scott D. Emerson and Peter Gouzouasis, "A Population-Level Analysis of Associations Between School Music Participation and Academic Achievement," *Journal of Educational Psychology* 112, no. 2 (2020): 308.

[116] Ibid., 309.

[117] Jonathan Savage, *Music Education for All* (Manchester: Manchester Metropolitan University, 2018), 71.

[118] Ibid., 72.

Recruitment and retention in urban high schools face many challenges. Teaching in environments that are not conducive to learning has caused many band directors to seek employment in schools that support the Arts. The lack of resources and funding are amongst several reasons that lead to urban schools having issues with attaining qualified band directors.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODS

Overview

This study employed a grounded theory approach to explore and describe urban high school band directors' perspectives on recruitment and retention.[119] To illustrate urban high school band directors' lived experiences, the researcher conducted in-depth interviews via Zoom Communications to collect data. The discussions were fifteen to twenty minutes long, consisting of sixteen questions. The grounded theory approach allowed coding interview data into meaningful categories and identifying valid themes and sub-themes. According to Kathy Charmaz, a grounded theory approach is appropriate when explaining or uncovering an inquiry area.[120]

Research Design

Qualitative approaches are essential to reporting philosophical perspectives in music education.[121] The researcher employed a purposeful sampling method to recruit and conduct interviews with ten high school band directors in urban school settings to explore the study population. Qualitative data was collected through interviews and subsequently analyzed using NVivo software. Once the researcher analyzed the data, it was coded into meaningful categories, then displayed using tables and figures to interpret the categories and emerging themes.[122]

---

[119] Jennifer Doyle, "Music Teacher Perceptions of Issues and Problems in Urban Elementary Schools," *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* 194 (2012): 36.

[120] Kathy Charmaz, *Constructing Grounded Theory* (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2014).

[121] Colleen Conway, "Collecting, Analyzing and Reporting Data," *An Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research in American Music Education*, ed. Collen Conway (London: Oxford University Press, 2020), 45.

[122] Harsh Suri, "Purposeful Sampling in Qualitative Research Synthesis," *Qualitative Research Journal* 11, no. 2 (2011): 23.

Central Research/ Sub Questions

1. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' recruitment?

    SQ1: How do band directors describe challenges in recruiting band directors in urban schools?

    SQ2: How do band directors describe suggestions to enhance recruiting band directors in urban schools?

2. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' retention?

    SQ3: How do band directors describe challenging retaining band directors in urban schools?

    SQ4: How do band directors describe suggestions to enhance retaining band directors in urban schools?

3. How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to teaching?

    SQ5: How do band directors describe the effect of teaching at an urban school on personal impact and wellbeing?

    SQ6: How do band directors describe the effectiveness of programs to meet the needs of students?

Setting

Each subject participated in an interview via Zoom in their band hall, music room, or office. The participants were interviewed in their directors' offices to avoid distraction and interruptions if possible. All interviews were conducted during noninstructional times set by the researcher and participant. Each site was an urban school that serves majority-minority students.

Participants

The participants for this study were band directors with five or more years of teaching experience at both urban and nonurban schools. Each of the band directors possessed state teacher certification. All of the band directors were selected using purposeful sampling techniques. This study focused on the information provided by five to twelve band directors' lived experiences. The researcher replaced the name of each participant with a pseudonym to protect their identity and provide anonymity.

Instructional Review Board

This study required the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at Liberty University to work with human subjects. The IRB approved the study after reviewing the research design, interview questions, and other documentation. With approval from the IRB committee, the researcher conducted interviews for the study (see Appendix A).

Recruitment

Each participant selected for the study received a consent form via email. Each responded by completing and returning the form. The consent form stated options to participate in the interview or opt-out of the study (see Appendix B).

Pilot Test

Two band directors with five or more years of teaching experience in urban and nonurban schools participated in a pilot study to examine the validity of the interview questions and better understand data coding via NVivo. The participants in the pilot study test followed procedures planned for the study. Results of the pilot test indicated that interview questions designed for the study were valid and interview procedures were reliable.

Interview Process

Ten questions addressed research questions. Six questions centered on participants' demographic information and teaching background. The researcher met with each participant to explore the ten interview questions and record responses. The entire interview process took fifteen to twenty minutes to answer via Zoom interviews. All discussions were kept private, stored in a secured place, and password-protected (see Appendices C and D).

Data Analysis

The researcher transcribed interview data into a spreadsheet using Excel and subsequently imported the Excel spreadsheet document to the NVivo software program. Analysis of data through NVivo provided code categories, themes, and sub-themes.

The Researcher's Role

The researcher's background is directly related to experience teaching in urban school settings. The researcher was aware of the potential for bias because of teaching experience in urban schools. Given the researcher's experience teaching in urban schools, every effort was made to eliminate data collection and analysis discrimination.

Chapter Four: Results

Introduction

This grounded theory study aims to describe the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools. The researcher explores issues that lead to what causes low recruitment and retention in urban schools amongst band directors. Furthermore, this chapter presents findings and results from data conducted, and the researcher reports the data collections. The sharing of this information is permissive to help gain more insight into issues that affect the recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools.

The information provided in this chapter centers on the real-life experiences of each participant. This data offers descriptions of each participant using pseudonyms to protect the privacy of each participant. Exploration of interview data led to the identification of four themes:

1. Understanding Band Programs

2. Understanding Band Directors

3. Understanding Students

4. Understanding Support

The identified themes address the research questions of this grounded theory study through the analysis and interpretation of interview data.[123] The researcher subsequently presents the findings and discusses the results.

---

[123] Kathy Charmaz and Robert Thornberg, "The Pursuit of Quality in Grounded Theory," *Qualitative Research in Psychology* (June 2020): 6.

Participants

This study employed high school and university band directors with teaching experience in urban schools. Each participant possessed at least five years of related experience. Each had started a band program with limited resources to assist students and teachers. Ten band directors participated in interviews by responding to ten in-depth interview questions. All ten graduated from historically black colleges and had taken additional courses at predominately white universities. Nine participants were male, while only one of the participants was a female band director.

All of the participants in this study identified themselves as African American. Each participant responded to interview questions to the best of their knowledge. Furthermore, the discussion of responses utilized a pseudonym for each subject's name to protect identity. In addition to the ten interview questions, participants responded to six additional demographic and background questions to enhance the discussion (see Appendices C and D).

Mr. Walker

Mr. Walker is a high school band director with fourteen years of teaching experience and lives in Mobile, Alabama. Steven has experience teaching at all levels, from elementary to college. He has taught at both suburban and inner-city schools. Mr. Walker is well-versed in dealing with students in urban schools as he has an extensive background in training most of his professional career in urban schools.

Mr. Hillard

Mr. Hillard is a high school band director with twelve years of teaching in predominantly urban schools and educating students in a majority Hispanic population. He is originally from Baton

Rouge, Louisiana. Mr. Hillard, in addition to being the band director at his school, also serves as the school's choir director.

Ms. Smith

Ms. Smith is currently the middle and high school director of bands at her school. She has been a music educator for thirteen years. Her music program, while predominately African American, does service students of several other races. Ms. Smith is from Lake Charles, Louisiana.

Mr. Johnson

Mr. Johnson is currently teaching at a small urban high school in Houston, Texas. He is in his seventh year of teaching. Mr. Johnson is currently seeking employment elsewhere because he feels it is challenging to teach in his current school due to the scheduling and working conditions.

Mr. Ackers

Mr. Ackers has been teaching for twenty-one years. He contributes his years of longevity to his love for music. Mr. Ackers has taught in both urban and nonurban schools. He has stated, "it is deplorable the conditions they place music educators in these urban schools." Mr. Acker is currently teaching in Stone Mountain, Georgia.

Mr. Harris

Mr. Martin currently serves as assistant director of bands at a historically black college. Before his new appointment, he served at an urban high school for nine years. Mr. Harris also has taught at middle school for five years. Mr. Harris is currently teaching in Lorman, Mississippi.

Mr. Simmons

Mr. Simmons is a high school band director in Baltimore, Maryland. He has been teaching for five years. In his five years of teaching, Mr. Simmons has taught two years in urban schools and three years in nonurban schools. Mr. Simmons is currently teaching in Chicago, Illinois.

Mr. Womack

Mr. Womack is a middle and high school band director with eleven years of teaching experience. He is currently teaching at an urban school in Shreveport, Louisiana. Mr. Womack is now the fine art chair at his school. He has also served as an assistant director of bands at a nonurban school for three years.

Mr. Bonds

Mr. Bonds is a high school band director with fifteen years of teaching experience. He has served at both urban and nonurban schools. Mr. Bonds is currently teaching high school band in Dallas, Texas.

Mr. Reed

Mr. Reed is the son of a popular band director in the same district he teaches. He has been teaching for eight years. In his eight years, Mr. Reed has stated that he has struggled to build a comprehensive program due to many factors that prohibit the program from growing. He is currently teaching in Memphis, Tennessee.

Procedures

The researcher interviewed ten band directors to gather data on their lived experiences teaching in urban schools. The interviews consisted of 16 questions: six demographic questions and ten open-ended questions. The researcher interviewed participants via Zoom then coded and analyzed data collected through NVivo software. Each participant shared their personal

experiences concerning the effects of recruitment and retention in urban school settings. Data collection and analysis allowed the researcher to identify common themes and sub-categories of themes based on the participants' lived experiences

Data Analysis

Data analysis allowed the researcher to gain insight into band directors ' lived experiences teaching in urban schools. The research also gained more knowledge on issues that affect the recruitment and retention of band directors teaching in urban schools. From this study, many meaningful themes emerged. One significant finding highlighted similarities in urban schools across multiple states. Also, participants frequently commented on working with limited resources and non-conducive working environments. Utilizing NVivo, the researcher placed comparable codes into code categories. Once the researcher completed the interviews, the created codes and categories supported the discussion of research questions. Tables 1 through 3 highlight the three main questions, sub-questions, and code categories.

Table 1: Central Question 1 Code Categories

CQ1: How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' recruitment?	
Sub-Question	Code Categories
SQ1: How do band directors describe challenges in recruiting band directors in urban schools?	- Band director recruitment - Urban Schools - Funding - Overall Resources
SQ2: How do band directors describe suggestions to enhance recruiting band directors in urban schools?	- Fine Arts - Elementary school program - Middle School Programs - Testing and Evaluation

Table 2: Central Question 2 Code Categories

CQ2: How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' retention?

Sub-Question	Code Categories
SQ3: How do band directors describe challenges retaining band directors in urban schools?	• Job satisfaction • Job requirements • Music technology • Challenge
SQ4: How do band directors describe suggestions to enhance retaining band directors in urban schools?	• Teacher education • Teacher support • Mentoring • Administration

Table 3: Central Question 3 Code Categories

CQ3: How do band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to teaching?

Sub-Question	Code Categories
SQ5: How do band directors describe the effect of teaching at an urban school on personal impact and wellbeing?	• Time management • Personal life • Family life • Job satisfaction
SQ6: How do band directors describe the effectiveness of programs to meet the needs of students?	• Performance opportunities • Facilities • Musical goals of students • College preparation

Theme Development

The study included ten participants who had five or more years of experience teaching in urban schools. This study provided an in-depth exploration into their lived experiences. The researcher imported data into excel and later into NVivo and discovered four main themes and nine sub-themes: (1) understanding band programs, (2) understanding band directors, (3) understanding students, and (4) understanding support. Each main theme includes three or four sub-themes, as displayed in Table 4.

Table 4: Main Themes and Sub-Themes

Urban Band Director Interviews	
Main Themes	Sub-Themes
Understanding Band Programs	• Measures of Success • Vertical Alignment • Facilities • Ethnicity
Understanding Band Directors	• Satisfaction • Preparation • Recruitment • Experience
Understanding Students	• Motivation • Musical Aspirations • Musical Development • College Preparation
Understanding Support	• Administrative Support • Parental Support • Level of Support

Understanding Band Programs

In many places, some administrators view band programs as an ancillary part of schools.[124] Often, band programs are essential to the school culture. Students in band programs are some of the most prominent advocates for schools. However, based on the participant's feedback, band programs in urban schools are underfunded. The participants believed band programs in urban schools did not receive the same support as neighboring schools in nonurban settings.

Furthermore, there is a consensus that many stakeholders, including administrators and politicians, are not well-versed in understanding the requirements to sustain a comprehensive band program. The lack of understanding perpetuated the recruitment and retention issues of band directors amongst urban schools. To this end, four sub-themes emerged: measures of success, vertical alignment, facilities, and ethnicity.

Measures of Success. This sub-theme revealed exciting insight from participants. Most participants believed their administration centered the band program's success on what the band did at Friday night football games. Little emphasis centered on classroom teaching and student engagement. Ms. Smith recalled, "During my observation, my observer stayed in my class for all of maybe five minutes and in my feedback mentioned how well the band sound and looked at our homecoming game" (Interview, May 6, 2021). All of the participant's measures of success were similar. Each participant stated that they felt that their success was measured on performances rather than the subject matter.

---

[124] Larry Scripp, "An Overview of Research on Music and Learning," Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development, December 31, 2001, https://www.americansforthearts.org.

Vertical Alignment. This sub-theme ensures that faculty and staff are on the same page about the schools' expectations for educating all students. In conjunction with understanding the school's expectations, the concept of vertical alignment helps to reinforce teaching concepts. One of the issues several urban schools face that affects vertical alignment is scheduling. Often, band students must take whichever music courses are available due to the school's master schedule. For many years band directors in urban schools argued the importance of scheduling band students in the correct music courses versus any band class. While candidly speaking off the record with Mr. Hillard, one of the participants in this particular study, he asserts, "music, in my opinion, is the only core subject that teaches across all other subject content. I do not understand why our profession is not respected and supported as it should be" (Interview May 6, 2021). Thus, vertical alignment further helps to prepare students for higher-level learning.[125]

Facilities. In this sub-theme, the researcher discusses the working conditions. The information provided in this section centers on lived experiences. Many band directors in urban schools feel that their facilities are not conducive to learning. "Access to the facility should not be allowed. The school administration has ignored the maintenance of the facility for years, so it predates me and my tenure here. Rodents overrun the facilities in my building, none of the restroom stalls work, it smells like a bar club restroom, ceiling tiles are buckling, brown, and falling" (Mr. Bonds Interview, May 6, 2021). On the contrary, not all urban schools band directors experienced "teaching in the trenches" in terms of facilities. Mr. Walker's experience, unlike Mr. Bonds, is much different. "Current facilities are in pretty good shape. Everything in

---

[125] D.E. Dover, "Vertical Alignment of Grade-Level Expectations for Student Achievement: Report of a Pilot Study," *The Council of Chief State School Officers* (2006): 75.

Rome did not get built in a day, and everything does not happen overnight, so I feel things are working well for us, and our facilities are nice in comparison to some others" (Interview May 6, 2021).

Ethnicity. This sub-topic discusses the social groups of students along with their cultural experiences and traditions. Band directors try to create a space where their programs are inclusive of all races and ethnicities. In the urban school setting, band directors outside of teaching music also have to work with students who unfortunately deal with many things in their environments that hinder their ability to remain focused on the band. Mr. Womack asserts, "much of our success centers on students feeling safe. Our program is a family" (Interview, May 6, 2021). Band directors in the study often mentioned the ability to provide safe places and their students and culture.

Understanding Band Directors

To better understand the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools, it is essential to understand the role of band directors in general. In understanding band directors, the information provided focuses on the feedback from interview responses. The participants felt as though they were misunderstood and underappreciated in urban schools. The participants formed several responses to their perspectives on understanding band directors. Mr. Ackers mentions, "My biggest challenge was not the students. My biggest obstacle was getting my administration to understand the needs for me to be successful as a band director" (Zoom interview May 5, 2021). The remaining participants used similar verbiage to that of Mr. Ackers. Four sub-themes emerged through this theme: satisfaction, preparation, recruitment, and experience.

Satisfaction. This sub-theme produced comparable results from each participant. While most were not satisfied with the overall product of the band, the participants all felt that they did the best that they could. Considering the situations of the schools, all of the participants expressed their level of satisfaction. Mr. Womack asserts, "the highest level of dissatisfaction was funding at my first school. Support was also one, and scheduling was a big thing as well. I did not always get kids scheduled into the classes I needed them in, forcing me to do many things after school. Most of my programs ran after school. For funding, we did not have anything like an allotment" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Preparation. This sub-theme focuses on the preparation that goes into teaching music in urban schools. While very rewarding at times, some band directors feel that teaching music in urban schools is more challenging than in other schools provided with the necessary resources. Mr. Harris detailed his preparation in the interview "Just doing my best to talk with or write to whomever I can. Last summer, in preparation to get better music instruments, I did a walk for funding, eight hundred miles, to draw awareness of this very situation we are discussing. Through peaceful demonstrations, writing the powers that be, and just trying to bring awareness to parents, students, and the community to voice and make a change" (Interview, May 6, 2006).

Recruitment. This sub-theme uncovers challenges that band directors faced recruiting in urban schools. Mr. Womack mentioned, "it is very challenging to recruit mainly because of implementing the interest in music and band to students when they have already had exposure and constantly reinforced the importance of sports are the love and life for sports outside of music. These students may not see much love or interest for many things as about the Arts" (Interview, May 6, 2021). Ms. Smith stated, "I think it is very challenging to recruit because we

do not have the necessary resources to adequately educate our students with the resources needed for a well-rounded program. With getting teachers to get hired in urban schools knowing that we will not be able to get the things that we need, we have to have that mindset to push and grind to get the resources that we need, which is tough for teachers to go in and get things done working at an urban school" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Experience. All of the participants in this study have at least five or more years of teaching experience in urban schools. Each participant also has at least a bachelor's degree from a historically black college. While the teaching experiences per participant vary, the consensus is that each band director has spent extensive time working in urban schools with minority students. In speaking of the record with one of the participants who taught at both urban and nonurban schools, he explains his experience; "The band's culture is much different in urban schools than that of nonurban schools, it is much more aggressive in sound and approaches. I often became less organized at my urban school due to random performances and the heavy emphasis on marching band. So, it was eye-opening, to say the least, from teaching at a nonurban school to an urban school with a popular marching band" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Understanding Students

A critical component of education is the ability to understand students. Identifying students' social, emotional, economic, and geographical roots is essential in fostering relationships. Based on the responses from the participants, the inability to effectively communicate with students in urban schools is a leading factor to some of the disciplinarian issues that most schools face. Based on the data provided, each participant felt that they comprehend students and connect with students in urban schools because of their similar experiences. Mr. Simmons asserts that "I identify with my students well because to some degree,

I walked in similar neighborhoods and sat in the seats of urban schools and know the struggle of having to do more with less" (Interview, May 6, 2021). Four sub-themes emerged through this theme: motivation, musical aspirations, musical development, and college preparation.

Motivation. Many of the participants emphasized how disheartening and challenging it is to cultivate music programs in urban schools. Many directors are poorly motivated because they are part-time and do not have the option of teaching full-time. Several participants expressed how to overcome noninstructional issues before getting the ensemble to play a musical note. One participant contributes his lack of motivation to the challenges he faces daily at work. "I see what the challenge is, and with any challenge, you have to have a goal, a plan, and adversity. What are the challenges that interfere with having that goal within my program? You do not eat an elephant as a whole, but rather piece by piece and meet those goals step by step. As long as everybody is on one accord as far as the ultimate goal, we all work towards that ultimate goal taking it piece by piece and step by step" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Musical Aspirations. Although the culture and morale of directors in many urban schools were low, this did not affect the goals and aspirations of the participants. Each participant is a well-accomplished band director still striving to do their induvial best despite their current circumstances. Mr. Hillard provides an example of musical aspiration:

"Once something is done once, the administration will always want to see what more one can do. Whether going on the field, playing a new song, or putting on an event, they will want to see something bigger and better year after year. With my musical aspirations, I think the biggest thing that I aspire to do is to be able to compete year after year. That was probably the most significant thing in sustaining a program, ensuring we were building on the previous year" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Musical Development. This sub-theme focuses on the musical development of music programs in urban schools. While some music programs experienced great success, most found recruiting and retaining students in urban schools challenging. Having to teach under much adversity, the musical development for all students needs much improvement. In addition, most participants do not have students scheduled in band classes due to schedule conflicts; most band directors and participants must create an after-school schedule that works for everyone. Due to not having time after school, the progress for musical development often is stagnated.

College Preparation. Based on the data collected from the participant's responses, most band directors in this study had mixed feelings. While they all generally agreed that their college prepared them to become effective teachers, the rebuttal was that most of their universities used antiquated approaches and were not up to date with today's students. Mr. Hillard shared his thoughts on being prepared: "Maybe I missed something, but most of what I learned in school is not what I faced in my first teaching job" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Understanding Support

How support is perceived varies based on one's definition. Based on the participant's comments, understanding support meant not just listening but understanding what was asked of band directors to help cultivate their perspective music programs. Furthermore, in comprehending what support is, what was evident from the responses from each participant was that they did not feel like administrators rendered sustenance in their efforts to help build their music programs. The participants also added that the lack of parental support aided in many urban schools' issues. Therefore, three sub-themes emerged through this theme: administrative support, parental support, and level of support.

Administrative Support. Many of the participants expressed their views on the importance of having administrative support. Mr. Womack describes his administration as "rather remarkable; I can say that the support there is fantastic. Whatever we need, our administration supports it. The administration is on board with whatever we need" (Interview May 6, 2021). Mr. Reed states, "the administration is very supportive. They give us plenty of feedback. They are also evident with the band. They see how much the students have taken into the program and parents as well. Parents, teachers, and administration are all viewed as stakeholders in the program, and the expectations are very high around here" (Mr. Johnson, Interview, May 6, 2021).

Parental Support. This sub-theme discusses parental support from the band director's perspective. While overlooked in many cases, parental support plays a significant part in the success of music programs. Students who feel supported do much better than those who do not feel encouraged. A common theme amongst band directors in urban schools was the lack of administrative support and parental support and involvement.

Level of Support. While various levels and interpretations of aid exist, the consensus defines support in general-purpose to render help to someone or something.[126] "With my administration, the support is fair. The student body loves the band and loves what the kids are doing. They love the direction that the band is going, and they are appreciative of student engagement. We can hold the students accountable for passing every week" (Interview, May 6, 2021). On the contrary, Mr. Harris explains how the support is low. "I am not bothered much, but I am also not supported much either" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

---

[126] Elisabeth Freer and Paul Evans, "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, and Elective Music Intentions," *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 6 (2019): 781.

Mr. Johnson goes on to state, "The administration loves to listen to the band, but I wouldn't necessarily say that the program is supported. We often have to go out and fundraise for what the program needs. I believe they don't understand how to support the band program. I have been trying to educate our administration on what we need and how they can help and support the efforts to assist."

Central Research Question One

Central research question one investigated how band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' recruitment. Based on collected data, band directors teaching in urban schools describe their perceptions and knowledge of recruitment as "challenging to say the least. It is hard to recruit band directors where they do not feel valued. It is hard enough to teach during these challenging times. Adding in band directors' feelings, like what they do not matter, creates frustration, resulting in low recruitment in urban schools" (Interview, May 5, 2021).

Recruiting band directors in urban schools, while challenging, is not impossible. Better incentives can help to ensure that urban schools hire quality teachers. While surveying band directors, one of the main questions is how supportive the administration is to the band program. Many band directors' experiences include their relationship with the administration. "Band directors do not leave good jobs; they leave bad situations" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Central Research Question Two

Central research question two explored how band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to band directors' retention. Band directors in this study describe their perceptions and experiences related to retention as problematic and vexing. In an interview conducted, one band directors assert, "Teaching music in urban schools is

challenging. I am the fourth band director in six years. Even though our job requirements are to teach music, teaching in urban schools requires more. We must wear many hats, such as being counselors, mentors, and mother and father figures" (Interview, May 6, 2021). "Until band directors gain the support needed to sustain a competitive and comprehensive music program, retaining band directors in urban schools will continue to be a difficult task" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Central Research Question Three

Central research question three examined how band directors teaching in urban schools describe perceptions and experiences related to teaching. Most band directors in this study describe their perceptions and experiences teaching as challenging yet very rewarding. "I knew that I wanted to teach students that looked like me. While it may not be packaged as glamorous as other teaching jobs, I enjoy teaching and learning" (Interview, May 6, 2021). "I have taught in urban schools for over ten years. Each year I find it more challenging. The emphasis placed on educating students is stagnated due to simply getting students to come to school" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Band directors in this study further describe their experience teaching in urban schools as an eye-opening experience. "I have been fortunate to have taught in urban and nonurban schools. To say that the level of teaching is different is an understatement. I never experience what it was like to "Teaching In The Trenches" until I began teaching in urban schools. The lack of resources, funding, and support made my job in urban schools difficult" (Interview, May 6, 2021).

Summary

This grounded theory study explored the experience and views of ten participants: nine male and one female band director. The researcher collected data via Zoom interviews, an online digital application, and later imported interview responses into an excel spreadsheet. After exporting the data into excel, the researcher used NVivo software to develop codes and themes to support this study. The researcher asked participants ten interview questions to explore their lived experiences. Each participant possessed teaching experience in an urban school setting. Results revealed that recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools are significantly less effective in nonurban schools. Participants stated that financial support, lack of feeder schools, non-conducive working environments, lack of administrative support, and limited community involvement were contributing factors.

Chapter Five: Conclusion

Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to provide a concise summary of the study, a summary of findings, and implications for practices. This chapter also describes and discusses the limitations and offers suggestions to help guide recommendations for future research. In conclusion, this chapter provides implications for prospective band directors who desire to teach music in urban schools.

Summary of Study

This qualitative research study identifies perspectives that have not yet explored or documented regarding the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools. The study also discusses issues that affect the recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools. The researcher developed research questions to explore and identify the thoughts and experiences of urban band directors. Based on the participant's response, one of the main recurring issues is the lack of financial support needed to sustain band programs in urban schools.

This study illustrates the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools and identifies issues that affect recruitment and retention in urban schools. The lived experiences based on the data provided by each participant create a narrative that contributes to the purpose of this grounded theory study. The qualitative approach offers a framework to build this study on band directors' lived experience teaching in urban schools. Their experiences reveal a perspective that connects the researcher to the study.

Summary of Findings

This grounded theory study consists of ten participants. Nine of the participants were African American males, and one was an African American female. All participants currently teach in urban schools. The researcher created a survey of interview questions designed to gather band directors' responses and viewpoints in urban schools. Data collection took place through individual interviews.

The researcher digitally recorded the interviews for transcription accuracy. All discussions used Zoom, a digital meeting application that allows participants in various locations to share their lived experiences. Findings from this study support the participants' outlook on the challenges band directors experience in urban schools. Furthermore, the research also addresses issues on the recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools.

The first interview question explored the challenges of recruiting band directors in urban schools. All of the participants answered that they thought it was challenging to recruit band directors in urban schools. Based on the participants' responses, band directors' lack of funding and resources contributed to the challenges of recruiting band directors in urban schools. Many participants expressed that urban school's music programs could thrive if more emphasis centered on providing adequate funding and the necessary resources to band directors in urban schools.[127] Furthermore, outside of funding and resources, all participants mentioned how challenging it was to recruit band directors in urban schools due to insufficient upkeep of facilities.

---

[127] Carlos R. Abril and Brent M. Gault, "The State of Music in Secondary Schools: The Principal's Perspective, Northwestern University," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56, no. 1 (2008): 70.

Interview question two discussed what would help urban schools to recruit band directors. Many participants asserted that more incentives must be provided to recruit band directors to serve urban schools. Teacher salaries increase, increased visibility, and support were among the top incentives mentioned by participants to help recruit band directors in urban schools. Furthermore, the participants also said improved funding for music programs was needed to recruit band directors. Band directors are not staying in environments that are not conducive to learning, so it is essential to provide adequate facilities for students to learn.[128] Lastly, to recruit band directors in urban schools, band directors need feeder programs at the elementary and middle school level that move students into the high schools.

The third interview question examined whether it is challenging to retain band directors in urban schools. Based on the responses from the participants, it is challenging to maintain band directors in urban schools because of the amount of extra work that comes with teaching music in urban schools. In addition to the extra work and extended hours, sometimes before and after school, not having resources is one of the leading issues that affect retaining band directors in urban schools.[129] During their interview, most band directors in neighboring districts make more money and have fewer responsibilities, along with more support and better facilities. A band director satisfied with their work environment rarely chooses to leave their job. Retaining band directors ultimately comes down to whether the band director feels supported, has room for

---

[128] Larry Scripp, "An Overview of Research on Music and Learning," Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development, December 31, 2001, https://www.americansforthearts.org.

[129] Eleonora Concina, "The Role of Metacognitive Skills in Music Learning and Performing: Theoretical Features and Educational Implications," *Frontiers in Psychology* 10 (2019): 9.

growth, has an environment conducive to learning, and has feeder programs and incentives in place.[130]

The fourth interview question investigated what would help urban schools retain band directors. The band directors who participated in this study believe that retaining band directors at schools for an extended time ultimately comes down to how invested school leaders are in helping to build comprehensive music programs. Band directors need support and resources. Along with resources and support, there must be a shared vision amongst administration, students, community, and parents to retain band directors.[131] Band directors need to have the autonomy to have creative control over the music program. Lastly, based on band directors' responses, an increased salary, or even matching the salary of neighboring districts that service nonurban school students, can help retain band directors in urban schools.

Interview question five discussed some of the struggles band directors face teaching music in urban schools. In the participants' responses, some of the struggles include just simply trying to teach music. Many participants mentioned that many urban schools do not offer music courses throughout the day due to scheduling conflicts with other courses students need. Another struggle involved students not only being behind educationally in some urban schools but also musically. Due to the lack of feeder schools, many urban school band programs have to start students on instruments in high school at the beginning level after school because of the scheduling conflicts mentioned. In addition to those struggles mentioned, band directors, based on participants' responses, felt that they must advocate the importance of their value to

---

[130] David H. Monk, "Recruiting and Retaining High-Quality Teachers in Rural Areas," *The Future of Children* 17, no. 1 (2007): 156.

[131] Carlos R. Abril and Brent M. Gault, "The State of Music in Secondary Schools: The Principal's Perspective," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56, no. 1 (2008): 77.

administration daily, arguing that band is much more than students performing for public events.[132]

Interview question six investigated how sustaining a band program at an urban school affected band directors. The majority of the participants mentioned that time spent away from family was a contributing factor. Band directors in this study asserted that lack of financial support and limited resources also influence band directors in efforts to cultivate music programs in urban schools. Multiple factors combine to affect the personal lives of these teachers.

The seventh interview question examined how individual programs met the needs of band students. The participants felt their program met the needs of students in several ways. Urban schools, in general, present many challenges. However, most band directors felt that their band program was a safe environment and conducive to learning. In addition, band directors in this study assert that, unlike issues students face in their home environment, their music program is a place where students feel protected, loved, and respected.[133]

Participants in this study further discuss how their band services student's physical, social, emotional, and educational needs. Hillard asserts, "before a student cares what you know, they have to know that you care. We cannot just play music and send them home. That is a disservice to the student and band program. These students have to learn to be productive young adults. While educating them musically, we must ensure that we do our part in preparing them for life after band; not all students will pursue music as a career (Interview May 6, 2021).

---

[132] Elisabeth Freer and Paul Evans, "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, and Elective Music Intentions," *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 6 (2019): 783.

[133] Servet Celik and Zeynel Amaç, "Are Teacher Education Programs Failing the Nation's Urban Schools? *A* Closer Look at Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs About Working with Inner-City Students," *The Journal of Multiculturalism in Music Education* 8 (October 2012): 18.

Interview question eight discussed how band directors addressed challenges to create success in their urban school band programs. The reactions from band directors indicated that their challenges were primarily internal. The participants felt the most considerable obstacle in addressing the challenges was educating their administration on the importance of the band program. School administrations were not well-versed in what it takes to sustain a music program. Many directors found it challenging to convey music's positive impact on education. Based on participants' responses, having a positive perspective is critical when addressing challenges to foster and create success in music programs in urban schools.[134]

The ninth interview question explored how band directors describe the support of their administration, teachers, and staff at your current school. Having the support of administration and staff is often essential to the growth and success of music programs. The majority of the band directors interviewed felt that despite not having the funding and resources as other schools in their district, predominantly nonurban schools, the administration, faculty, and staff support the band program.[135] Most participants' schools view the band program as the most extensive program in the school. Many faculty and staff members render their services to volunteer with the band programs. Several band directors assert that the feedback, in general, is positive and motivating. However, the administration is typically unfamiliar with musical content and infrequently provides input and instructional guidance.

Interview question ten examined how band directors described current facilities and support given to maintenance and condition of the facilities. Participants explained that having a

---

[134] Johanna E. Abril, "The State of Music Education in The Basic General Public Schools of Ecuador: The administrators perspectives," *International Journal of Music Education* 37, no. 3 (2019): 141.

[135] Elizabeth Freer and Paul Evans, "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, and Elective Music Intentions," *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 6 (2019): 781.

band hall conducive to learning helps to maintain a positive environment. Most participants in

this study were not fully satisfied with their antiquated working facilities. However, most agreed

that the maintenance and conditions of facilities were acceptable. In most cases, the

administration provided the best rehearsal space and maintenance of facilities to the best of their

ability.

Overall, band directors in urban schools experienced a lack of financial support, limited

resources, and student musical exposure. These factors appear to affect the recruitment and

retention of band directors in urban schools.[136] Band directors frequently do not feel supported in

their efforts to build and maintain a quality program. Analysis of interviews led to meaningful

connections and essential themes to describe band directors' lived experience teaching music in

urban schools. Further, this study outlines issues affecting the recruitment and retention of band

directors teaching in urban schools.[137]

Limitations

Few texts, articles, and studies exist on this specific research topic. As a result, a limited

amount of literature was available for review. The researcher made an extensive effort to review

all available resources. Organizing a meeting time with each participant was challenging due to

the recent COVID-19 pandemic. The band directors' instructional time was split between

teaching online and teaching in person. The researcher limited each interview to twenty minutes

to conduct successful interviews while coordinating with each participant's teaching schedule.

---

[136] Monk, "Recruiting and Retaining High-Quality Teachers in Rural Areas," 156.

[137] Kevin Howard, "Motivating Factors Affecting the Recruitment and Retention of Suburban Middle School Band Students" (Ph.D. diss., Northeast Tennessee, 2019), 6.

Recommendations for Future Study

Given the significant findings of this study, additional studies should explore band directors' lived experiences teaching in urban schools. Future research may further develop this study's themes and sub-themes and uncover new findings. Duplication of the study with a larger population may provide a deeper context for discussion and enhance the validity of findings. Future studies could utilize the same interview questions with schools in a variety of districts for comparison.

Implications for Practice

This study offers practical implications to guide band directors teaching in urban schools. The findings may also help administrators to improve procedures to recruit and retain band directors in urban schools.[138] Administrators in urban schools may choose to provide band directors with more support, such as an active music budget, improved teaching facilities, and additional resources for teaching and musical performance. This study indicates that urban school administrators do not fully understand band directors' daily struggles in cultivating music programs in urban schools. As a result, factors contributing to the low recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools frequently go unnoticed and unresolved. Band directors teaching in urban schools require assistance to encourage retention. Assistance may also enhance the recruitment of teachers, enable the music development of students, and enhance program growth.

Band directors may understand how to cope with the challenges of teaching in an urban school by reading and considering the finding of this study. The working environment must be conducive for both students and teachers to cultivate comprehensive and competitive music

---

[138] Monk, "Recruiting and Retaining High-Quality Teachers in Rural Areas," 161.

programs in schools. This is true of all schools to include urban schools. Attention to teaching facilities, financial support, and resources may encourage band directors to teach in urban schools and help eliminate band directors' low recruitment and retention.[139]

Summary

Understanding the needs of band directors teaching in urban schools is essential in building band programs. School principals and administrators must foster opportunities for growth and development for band directors to serve students in these schools. This study identified new perspectives to encourage and foster support for band programs in urban schools. Band directors communicated that music programs in urban schools lack the necessary resources to sustain quality teaching and learning. Even with band directors advocating for music education, the recruitment and retention of band directors in urban schools remain critical issues and require greater understanding and action.

---

[139] Elisabeth Freer and Paul Evans, "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, and Elective Music Intentions," (2019): 78.

Bibliography

Abril, Carlos R., and Brent M. Gault. "The State of Music in Secondary Schools: The Principal's Perspective." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56, no. 1 (2008): 68-81.

Abril, Johanna E. "The State of Music Education in Ecuador's Basic General Public Schools: The Administrators' Perspective." *International Journal of Music Education* 37, no. 3, (2019): 370-89.

Almaguer, Priscilla E. "A Case Study: A Thriving Secondary Arts Program in the Face of High-Stakes Accountability." Doctoral diss., University of Southern California, 2013.

Arnold, Gabrial. "Music For All, Effective Band Director Techniques for Teaching in Title I Schools." Ph.D. diss., Florida State University, 2016.

Aróstegui, José Luis. "Exploring the Global Decline of Music Education." *Arts Education Policy Review* 117, no. 2 (2016): 115.

Aydin, Hasan, Burhan Ozfidan, and Douglas Carothers. "Meeting The Challenges of Curriculum and Instruction in School Settings in The United States." *Journal of Social Studies Education Research* 8, no. 3 (2017): 76-92.

Baker, Vicki D. "Profile of an Effective Urban Music Educator, Denton, Texas: Texas Woman's University." *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 31, no. 1 (2012): 46.

Birks, Melanie, Karen Hoare, and Jane Mills. "Grounded Theory: FAQs." *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 18 (2019): 4.

Broslawsky, Olivia. "Marching Forth: A Study of The Impact of Gender on The Professionalization of Marching Band Students in New Orleans." Master's thesis, Tulane University, 2017.

Brown, Laura Lewis. "The Benefits of Music Education," PBS KIDS for Parents, Last modified May 13, 2012. https://www.pbs.org/parents/thrive/the-benefits-of-music-education.

Campbell, Patricia Shehan. *Music, Education, and Diversity: Bridging Cultures and Communities*. New York: Teachers College Press, 2017.

Celik, Servet, and Zeynel Amaç. "Are Teacher Education Programs Failing the Nation's Urban Schools? *A* Closer Look at Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs About Working with Inner-City Students." *The Journal of Multiculturalism in Music Education* 8 (October 2012): 18-20.

Charmaz, Kathy. *Constructing a Grounded Theory*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2014.

Charmaz, Kathy, and Robert Thornberg. "The Pursuit of Quality in Grounded Theory." *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 18, issue 3 (2020): 1-23.

Chun Tie, Ylona, Melanie Birks, and Karen Francis. "Grounded Theory Research: A Design Framework for Novice Researchers." *SAGE Open Medicine* 7, (2019): 2.

Colquhoun, Shane. "Building an Instrumental Program in Rural and Urban Schools." Last modified July 11, 2016. https://nafme.org/building-instrumental-program-rural-urban-schools/.

Concina, Eleonora. "The Role of Metacognitive Skills in Music Learning and Performing: Theoretical Features and Educational Implications." *Frontiers in Psychology* 10 (2019): 6-9.

Conkling, Susan, and Brian Kaufman. "Equality and Quality: The influence of Private Funds on Public Arts Education in Boston and Baltimore." *Arts Education Policy Review* 121, no. 1 (2020).

Conway, Colleen. "Collecting, Analyzing and Reporting Data." In *An Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research in American Music Education,* edited by Colleen Conway, 45. London: Oxford University Press, 2020.

Craig, Anne P., "Definition of Educational Administration." Last modified 2018. https://www.theclassroom.com/definition-educational-administration-5452428.html.

Creswell, John W., William E. Hanson, Vicki L. Clark Plano, and Alejandro Morales. "Qualitative Research Designs: Selection and Implementation." *The Counseling Psychologist* 35, no. 2 (2007): 236-64.

DeLorenzo, Lisa C., and Marissa Silverman. "From the Margins: The Underrepresentation of Black and Latino Students/Teachers in Music Education." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 27 (2016):18.

Denson, Gregory L. "A Phenomenological Exploration of the Experiences Gained During Pre-Service Music Teacher Preparation of Black Urban Band Directors." Doctoral diss., Georgia State University, 2019.

Dineen, Brian R., and Scott M. Soltis "Recruitment: A Review of Research and Emerging Directions." *APA Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology* 2 (2011): 22.

Dover, D.E. "Vertical Alignment of Grade-Level Expectations for Student Achievement: Report of a Pilot Study." *The Council of Chief State School Officers* (2006): 75.

Doyle, Jennifer. "Music Teacher Perceptions of Issues and Problems in Urban Elementary Schools." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* 194 (2012): 31-52.

Dworkin, Ronald. "What is Equality? Part 2: Equality of Resources." *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 10, no. 4 (1981): 3.

Echazarra, Alfonso, and Thomas Radinger. "Learning in Rural Schools: Insights from PISA, TALIS, and literature." *OEDC Education Working Papers*, no. 196 2019: 31.

Eros, John. "Becoming Part of The City: Influences on the Career Choice of an Urban Music Educator." *International Journal of Music Education* 36, no. 3 (2018): 411.

Everson, Howard and Roger Millsap. *Everyone Gains: Extracurricular Activities in High School and Higher SAT® Scores*. New York: College Board Publications, 2005.

Fiese, Richard K., and Nicholas J. DeCarbo. "Urban Music Education: The Teachers' Perspective: Richard K. Fiese and Nicholas J. DeCarbo Look at Responses from Twenty Urban Music Teachers About the Unique Teaching Situations They Face." *Music Educators Journal* 81, no. 6 (1995): 27-31.

Fitzpatrick-Harnish, Kate. *Urban Music Education: A Practical Guide for Teachers*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Ford, Donna Y., and James L. Moore. "Understanding and Reversing Underachievement, Low Achievement, and Achievement Gaps Among High-Ability African American Males in Urban School Contexts." *The Urban Review* 45, no. 4 (2013): 399-415.

Freer, Elisabeth, and Paul Evans. "Choosing to Study Music in High School: Teacher Support, Psychological Needs Satisfaction, and Elective Music Intentions." *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 6 (2019): 781-83.

Groulx, Timothy J. "Influences of Segregation and Integration on the Bands at Historically Black High Schools in Duval County, Florida." *Journal of Historical Research in Music Education* 40, no. 1 (2018), 58-78.

Guarino, Cassandra M., Lucrecia Santibanez, and Glenn A. Daley. "Teacher Recruitment and Retention: A Review of the Recent Empirical Literature." *Review of Educational Research* 76, no. 2 (2006): 173-208.

Guhn, Martin, Scott D. Emerson, and Peter Gouzouasis. "A Population-Level Analysis of Associations Between School Music Participation and Academic Achievement." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 112, no. 2 (2020): 308.

Hancock, Carl B. "Is the Grass Greener? Current and Former Music Teachers' Perceptions a Year After Moving to a Different School or Leaving the Classroom." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 63, no. 4 (2016): 444.

He, Wu-Jing, Wan-Chi Wong and Anna N-N. Hui. "Emotional Reactions Mediate the Effect of Music Listening on Creative Thinking: Perspective of the Arousal-and-Mood Hypothesis." *Frontiers in Psychology* 8 (2017): 1680.

Hess, Juliet. "Equity and Music Education: Euphemisms, Terminal Naivety, and Whiteness." *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education* 16, no. 3 (2017).

Hodges, Donald A., and Mary Luehrsen. "The Impact of a Funded Research Program on Music Education Policy." *Arts Education Policy Review* 111, no. 2 (2010): 71-78.

Holochwost, Steven J., Cathi B. Propper, Dennie Palmer Wolf, Michael T. Willoughby, Kelly R. Fisher, Jacek Kolacz, Vanessa V. Volpe, and Sara R. Jaffee. "Music Education, Academic Achievement, and Executive Functions." *Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts* 11, no. 2 (2017): 147.

Howard, Kevin. "Motivating Factors Affecting the Recruitment and Retention of Suburban Middle School Band Students." Ph.D. diss., Milligan University, Tennessee, 2019.

Johnson, Daniel C., and Wendy K. Matthews. "Factors Influencing Pre-Instructional Decisions: An Initial Investigation of Expert Music Teacher Perceptions." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 36, 2020.

Koelsch, Stefan, Thomas Fritz, Katrin Schulze, David Alsop, and Gottfried Schlaug. "Adults and Children Processing Music: An FMRI Study." *Neuroimage* 25, no. 4 (2005): 1068-1076.

Kos Jr, Ronald P. "Music Education and The Well-Rounded Education Provision of Every Student Succeeds Act: A Critical Policy Analysis." *Arts Education Policy Review* 119, no. 4 (2018): 216.

Kraemer, Jonathan M., and Michelle Kraemer. *The Band Director's Guide to Success: A Survival Guide for New Music Educators*. Oxford University Press: New York, 2016.

Leithwood, Kenneth, Teresa Menzies, Doris Jantzi, and Jennifer Leithwood. "School Restructuring, Transformational Leadership and the Amelioration of Teacher Burnout." *Anxiety, Stress, and Coping: An International Journal* 9, no. 3 (1996): 200.

Lipscomb, Scott D. "The Role of Technology in Music Education: A Pre-Conference Satellite Symposium for Tanglewood II." *The Journal of Technology in Music Learning* 4 (2007): 55-69.

Martignetti, Frank, Brent C. Talbot, Matthew Clauhs, Timothy Hawkins, and Nasim Niknafs. "You Got to Know Us": A Hopeful Model for Music Education in Urban Schools." *Visions of research in music education* 23 (2013): 9.

Milner, Richard H., "But What is Urban Education?" *Urban Education* 47, Issue 3 (2012): 556.

Monk, David H. "Recruiting and Retaining High-Quality Teachers in Rural Areas." *The Future of Children* 17, no. 1 (2007): 155-174.

Noon, Christian Matthew. "Cultivating Socially Just Concert Programming Perspectives through Preservice Music Teachers' Band Experiences: A Multiple Case Study." Ph.D. diss., University of Miami, 2020.

Padron, Casey Lee. "Rural Music Teacher Job Satisfaction, Retention, and Music Education's Career Ladder." Ph.D. diss., Colorado State University, 2020.

Palmer, C. Michael. "Challenges of Access to Post-Secondary Music Education Programs for People of Color." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 18 (2011): 1-22.

Papay, John P., Andrew Bacher-Hicks, Lindsay C. Page and William H. Marinell, "The Challenge of Teacher Retention in Urban Schools: Evidence of Variation from a Cross-Site Analysis." *Educational Researcher* 46, no. 8 (2017): 441.

Perkins, H. Victor. "First Public-School Music Teacher." *Music Educators Journal* 28, no. (September 1941): 12–14.

Pickens, Shauna Satrom. "Preservice and In-Service Music Teachers' Perceptions of Teaching in Low-SES, Urban Middle School Band Programs." Ph.D. diss., Texas Tech University, 2019.

Poliniak, Susan. "Secrets of Retention." *Teaching Music* 19, no. 4 (2012): 40-45.

Poolos, Frank James. "Secondary School Band: Student Retention and Director Issues-Challenges and Strategies." Master's thesis, Liberty University, 2019.

Reid, Elizabeth. "Understanding the Word Advocacy: Context and Use." In *Structuring the Inquiry Into Advocacy*, edited by Elizabeth Reid, 1-8, Washington DC: The Urban Institute, 2000.

Richards, Dean D. "Signs of the Times: Sources of Professional Challenge and Sustenance for Veteran African American Teachers." Ph.D. diss., University of Kansas, 2017.

Richards, Lyn. *Using NVivo in Qualitative Research.* Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 1999.

Salvador, Karen, and Krum, Janice. "Music Teacher Evaluation." In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophical and Qualitative Assessment in Music Education Teacher Effectiveness, and Marginalized Populations,* edited by David J. Elliott, Marissa Silverman, and Gary E. McPherson, 139. New York: Oxford University Press, 2019.

Savage, Jonathan. *Music Education for All.* Manchester: Metropolitan University, 2018.

Scripp, Larry. "An Overview of Research on Music and Learning." Critical Links: Learning in the Arts and Student Academic and Social Development, Last modified December 31, 2001. https://www.americansforthearts.org.

Segrin, Chris, and Jeanne Flora. "Fostering Social and Emotional Intelligence: What Are the Best Current Strategies in Parenting?" *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 13, no. 3 (2019): e12439.

Shannon, George W. "An Unexpected Shift, Music the Sound of My Heart." *Teaching Music* (October 2020): 22.

Shaw, Julia T. "Urban Music Educators' Perceived Professional Growth in a Context-Specific Professional Development Program." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 67, no. 4 (2020): 460.

Shaw, Ryan. "Jumping through hoops: Troubling Music Teacher Dilemmas in the New Era of Accountability." *Music Educators Journal* 105, no. 3 (2019): 23-29.

Shipp, Veronica H. "Factors Influencing the Career Choices of African American Collegians: Implications for Minority Teacher Recruitment." *Journal of Negro Education* (1999): 343-51.

Suri, Harsh. "Purposeful Sampling in Qualitative Research Synthesis." *Qualitative Research Journal* 11, no. 2 (2011): 23.

Thornberg, Robert, and Kathy Charmaz. "Grounded Theory and Theoretical Coding." In *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis*, edited by Uwe Flick, 153-69, Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2014.

Wolch, Jennifer, John P. Wilson, and Jed Fehrenbach. "Parks and Park Funding in Los Angeles: An Equity-Mapping Analysis." *Urban Geography* 26, no. 1 (2005): 4-35.

Wong, Jolene. "Advocacy Now: The Importance of Music Education." Master's thesis, University of Alberta, 2018.

Wronowski, Meredith L. "Filling the Void: A Grounded Theory Approach to Addressing Teacher Recruitment and Retention in Urban Schools." *Education and Urban Society* 50, no. 6 (2018): 548-74.

APPENDIX A: IRB Approval

LIBERTY UNIVERSITY.
INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD

May 3, 2021

Juvon Pollard
Brian Stiffler

Re: IRB Exemption - IRB-FY20-21-559 Teaching in the Trenches: A grounded theory study on recruitment and retention of urban High School band directors

Dear Juvon Pollard, Brian Stiffler:

The Liberty University Institutional Review Board (IRB) has reviewed your application per the Office for Human Research Protections (OHRP) and Food and Drug Administration (FDA) regulations and finds your study to be exempt from further IRB review. This means you may begin your research with the data safeguarding methods mentioned in your approved application, and no additional IRB oversight is required.

Your study falls under the following exemption category, which identifies specific situations in which human participants research is exempt from the policy outlined in 45 CFR 46:
101(b):

Category 2. (ii). Research only includes interactions involving educational tests (cognitive, diagnostic, aptitude, achievement), survey procedures, interview procedures, or observation of public behavior (including visual or auditory recording).
Any disclosure of the human subjects' responses outside the research would not reasonably place the issues at risk of criminal or civil liability or damage the subjects' financial standing, employability, educational advancement, or reputation.

Your stamped consent form(s) and final versions of your study documents can be found under the Attachments tab within the Submission Details section of your study on Cayuse IRB. Your stamped consent form(s) should be copied and used to gain the consent of your research participants. If you plan to provide your consent information electronically, the contents of the attached consent document(s) should be made available without alteration.

Please note that this exemption only applies to your current research application, and any modifications to your protocol must be reported to the Liberty University IRB to verify continued exemption status. You may write these changes by completing a modification submission through your Cayuse IRB account.

If you have any questions about this exemption or need assistance in determining whether possible modifications to your protocol would change your exemption status, please email us at irb@liberty.edu.

Sincerely,

Administrative Chair of Institutional Research
Research Ethics Office

APPENDIX B: Consent Form

Title of the Project: Teaching in The Trenches: A Grounded Theory Study on Recruitment and Retention of Urban High School Band Directors.

Principal Investigator: Juvon Pollard Sr., Doctoral Candidate -School of Music, Liberty University

Faculty Sponsor: Brian Stiffler, School of Music, Liberty University

Invitation to be part of a Research Study

You are invited to participate in a research study regarding the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools. You were selected as a possible participant because you have five or more years of teaching in urban schools. To participate, you must be 18 years of age or older. Participants also must have five or more years of teaching experience in music at urban schools. Taking part in this research project is voluntary.

Please take time to read this entire form and ask questions before deciding whether to participate in this research project.

What is the study about, and why is it being done?

The purpose of this grounded theory study is to explore urban high school band directors' lived experiences in the context of recruitment and retention. These experiences reflect fundamental issues of band directors teaching in urban schools.

What will happen if you take part in this study?

If you agree to be in this study, I will ask you to do the following things:
    Complete the online interview via Zoom or phone (30 minutes or less)

How could you or others benefit from this study?

Participants should not expect to receive a direct benefit from taking part in this study.
Both the researcher and participants can benefit from this study because it provides substantial evidence of the adversity that band directors face teaching in urban schools, along with the lived experiences of band directors teaching in urban schools. Thus, the benefits are gaining knowledge from first-hand experiences, helpful tips, and solutions to serve urban schools better.

What risks might you experience from being in this study?

The risks involved in this study are minimal, which means they are equal to the risks you would encounter in everyday life.

How will personal information be protected?

The records of this study will be kept private. Published reports will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely, and only the researcher will have access to the records/documents. Data collected from you may be shared

for use in future research studies or with other researchers. If data collected from you is shared, any information that could identify you, if applicable, will be removed before the data is shared.

- Participant responses will be kept confidential through the use of pseudonyms.
- Interviews will be conducted in a location where others will not easily overhear the conversation.
- Data will be stored on a password-locked computer and may be used in future presentations. After three years, all electronic records will be deleted.
- Interviews will be recorded and transcribed.
- Recordings will be stored on a password-locked computer for three years and then erased. After that, only the researcher will have access to these recordings.

How will you be compensated for being part of the study?
Participants will not be compensated for participating in this study.

Is study participation voluntary?
Participation in this study is voluntary. Your decision whether to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Liberty University. If you decide to participate, you are free not to answer any question or withdraw at any time without affecting those relationships.

What should you do if you decide to withdraw from the study?
If you choose to withdraw from the study, please contact the researcher at the email address/phone number included in the next paragraph. Should you decide to remove, data collected from you will be destroyed immediately and not included in this study.

Whom do you contact if you have questions or concerns about the study?
The researcher conducting this study is Juvon Pollard Sr. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact him at ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮ or email him at ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮ You may also contact the researcher's faculty sponsor, ▮▮▮▮▮▮ ▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮▮

Whom do you contact if you have questions about your rights as a research participant?
If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and would like to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd., Green Hall Ste. 2845, Lynchburg, VA 24515 or email at irb@liberty.edu

Your Consent
By signing this document, you agree to be in this study. Make sure you understand what the study is about before you sign. You will be given a copy of this document for your records. The researcher will keep a copy of the study records. If you have any questions about the study after signing this document, you can contact the study team using the above information.

I have read and understood the above information. Furthermore, I have asked questions and have received answers. Therefore, I consent to participate in the study.

☐ The researcher has my permission to audio-record/video-record/photograph me as part of my participation in this study.

_____

Printed Subject Name

_____

Signature & Date

APPENDIX C: Demographics Questions

A. What is your current job description?

B. How long have you been in your current position?

C. How long have you been teaching?

D. How many schools have you taught at in your career?

E. Where did you go to college?

F. Do you feel your college adequately prepared you to teach in an urban school?

APPENDIX D: Zoom Interview Questions

1. Do you feel it is challenging to recruit band directors in urban schools? If so, please briefly describe why.

2. What do you think would help urban schools to recruit band directors?

3. Do you feel it is challenging to retain band directors in urban schools? If so, please briefly describe why.

4. What do you think would help urban schools to retain band directors?

5. What are some of the struggles you have faced teaching music in urban schools?

6. How does sustaining a band program at an urban school affect you?

7. How do you feel your current program meets the needs of band students?

8. How do you address challenges to create success in your urban school band program?

9. How would you describe the support of your administration, teachers, and staff at your current school?

10. How would you describe your current facilities and support given to maintenance and improvement?

APPENDIX E: Thesis Defense Approval

The committee has rendered the following decision concerning the defense for

Juvon Pollard Sr.

on the Thesis,

TEACHING IN THE TRENCHES:

A GROUNDED THEORY STUDY ON THE RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF URBAN

HIGH SCHOOL BAND DIRECTORS

as submitted on Friday, August 13, 2021:

a. _____X_____ Full approval to proceed with no revisions. The document should be prepared for submission to the Jerry Falwell Library.

b. _____ Provisional approval pending cited revisions. The student must resubmit the project with cited revisions according to the established timeline.

c. _____ Redirection of project. The student is being redirected to take MUSC/WRSP 889 again, as minor revisions will not meet the expectations for the research project.

Brian D. Stiffler		**8/13/2021**
Print Name of Advisor/Mentor	**Signature**	**Date**
Stephen W. Müller		**8/13/2021**
Print Name of Reader	**Signature**	**Date**