

LIBERTY UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF MUSIC

**Music Appreciation Course Design:
Facilitating the Increased Participation of
Non-Music Majors in Collegiate Music Performance Ensembles**

A Thesis Submitted to
the Faculty of the School of Music
in Candidacy for the Degree of
Doctor of Music Education

by

Rebecka Rose

Lynchburg, VA

May 2021

Copyright © 2021 Rebecka Elizabeth Rose

ABSTRACT

The cessation of music performance after high school graduation can be mitigated through recruitment type course design methods interwoven within collegiate Music Appreciation courses. When appropriately designed, Music Appreciation could serve as a catalyst for resuming musical participation in music ensembles. This study investigated how the college level Music Appreciation course may renew interest in performing music by non-music major students. Best teaching methodologies and Music Appreciation curriculum components to engage non-music majors are examined in addition to music ensemble recruitment techniques that can be integrated within Music Appreciation course design. This study is of qualitative design and utilizes the historical-comparative method to investigate the most effective Music Appreciation course design, music performance ensemble recruitment techniques that may be incorporated within the Music Appreciation course, and non-music major ensemble participation motivators. This research is undertaken to discover best practices for integrating Music Appreciation course design elements that may increase non-music major university music ensemble participation thereby increasing music performance engagement beyond high school. Results of this study suggest the implementation of a learner centered curriculum approach that includes participatory musical elements and music performance ensemble recruitment methods as key aspects of course design within collegiate Music Appreciation courses leading to both positive student and institution outcomes.

Keywords: collegiate music appreciation, collegiate music ensemble recruitment, learner centered music courses, participatory music appreciation courses, music appreciation curriculum, increasing college student retention

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research is dedicated to the Music Appreciation students I have had the privilege of teaching currently, in the past, and in the future. You have each brought unique perspectives about music that energize my desire to grow, learn, and develop as a teacher within this field. Thank you for your love of music that inspires me.

I am forever grateful for the loving encouragement provided by my family throughout the entirety of this research project. My husband, son, and parents have never ceased to champion my efforts and have been my consistent foundation for support. I am endlessly blessed to be your wife, mom, and daughter.

Thank you, Dr. Rebecca Watson and Dr. Becky Morrison, for your advice, wisdom, and counsel. Your insights have proven invaluable.

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| List of Tables | ix |
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION..... | 1 |
| Background of Topic | 6 |
| Statement of the Problem..... | 7 |
| Statement of the Purpose | 11 |
| Significance of the Study | 12 |
| Research Questions..... | 13 |
| Definition of Terms..... | 14 |
| Summary | 14 |
| CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW | 16 |
| Section I: Background of Music Appreciation Course Design..... | 16 |
| Methodologies..... | 17 |
| Curriculum | 20 |
| Course Textbooks | 23 |
| Music Appreciation Professor Challenges..... | 24 |
| Online Music Appreciation Courses..... | 26 |
| Section II: Music Performance Ensemble Participation Beyond K-12 | 29 |
| Importance of Music Education..... | 29 |
| Importance and Access Does Not Always Result in Intended Outcome..... | 30 |
| Motivation Impacting Participation | 31 |
| Music Performance Ensemble Participation During College | 32 |
| Musical Engagement Beyond College..... | 32 |
| Section III: Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Techniques | 33 |
| Generating Interest..... | 33 |
| Maintaining Interest | 34 |
| Recruitment Messaging and Practices | 34 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Ongoing Recruitment Challenge..... | 36 |
| General Music Courses’ Role in Recruitment | 36 |
| Positive Retention Outcomes..... | 37 |
| | |
| CHAPTER THREE: METHODS..... | 38 |
| Research Design..... | 38 |
| Research Method | 38 |
| Research Sources | 39 |
| Major Research Categories..... | 39 |
| Conclusion | 40 |
| | |
| CHAPTER FOUR: DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS | 42 |
| Section I: The Collegiate Music Appreciation Course—Best Practices..... | 42 |
| Tradition Versus Innovation | 43 |
| Western, Classical Music <i>and/or</i> Popular and World Musics? | 46 |
| Learner Centered Course Design | 54 |
| The Online Music Appreciation Course | 63 |
| Section II: Collegiate Music Ensemble Non-Music Major Participation Trends..... | 68 |
| The College Years: One More Formal Opportunity | 69 |
| Collegiate Music Ensemble Non-Music Major Low Participation Factors..... | 70 |
| Music Majors Versus Non-Music Majors Music Interests | 74 |
| Lack of Continuity Between School and Collegiate Music Education..... | 74 |
| Private Lessons Study Opportunities Are Available for Non-Music Major | 75 |
| Students..... | 75 |
| Collegiate Performing Opportunities Exist for Non-Music Major Students | 75 |
| Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Population Make-Up | 76 |
| Open Enrollment Music Ensembles..... | 76 |
| Non-Music Major Existing Motivation to Participate in Performing Ensembles.. | 77 |

| | |
|---|---------|
| Benefits of Collegiate Music Ensemble Participation | 81 |
| Section III: The Music Appreciation Course Represents a Recruitment Opportunity | 85 |
| Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Deficiencies | 86 |
| Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Techniques | 88 |
| Recruitment of Non-Music Majors Music Students | 90 |
| CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS | 95 |
| Summary of Study | 95 |
| Summary of Findings and Prior Research | 96 |
| Limitations | 101 |
| Recommendations for Future Study | 101 |
| Implications for Practice | 102 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY..... | 104 |

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Prioritized Search Terms and Topics.....40

Table 2: Music Appreciation Methodology Best Practices67

Table 3: Non-Music Major Motivations to Not Participate in Collegiate Performing Ensembles....
.....73

Table 4: Non-Music Major Motivation Factors to Participate in Collegiate Performing
Ensembles80

Table 5: Benefits of College Non-Music Major Participation in Music Ensemble Courses85

Table 6: Possible Music Appreciation Course Recruitment Strategies93

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

The current decline of music student participation in performance ensembles after high school graduation, in America, is disconcerting due to the loss of beneficial musical experiences and emotional expression outlets for students. This study details the motivations of non-music majors to participate in performing ensembles at colleges and universities throughout the United States, collegiate Music Appreciation course curriculum best practices, and music ensemble recruitment techniques that may be incorporated within Music Appreciation course design. The intersections of these three focus areas present opportunities to continue musical expression and performance participation during the college experience. This continuance benefits music students, music educators, Music Appreciation professors, and collegiate Schools of Music.

School Music Programs' Attrition After High School

For many high school music students seeking to pursue a university degree concentration in an academic subject area other than music, musical experiences in performing music ensembles are likely to be completed upon graduation from high school. Research conducted by music educator and researcher, Sara K. Jones, states that "student participation in ensembles often ends when students graduate from high school."¹ The music ensemble participation study completed by Roger Mantie and Jay Dorman provide findings explaining that among high school students who participated in performing ensembles, "approximately 75-80% of those with high

¹ Sara K. Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation in Two Contrasting Collegiate Choral Ensembles," *Music Education Research* 20, no. 2 (2018): 252, accessed December 6, 2020, doi-org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1080/14613808.2016.1257594.

school experience do not continue.”² Unfortunately, the far too frequent progression of students ceasing to make music in community ensembles after high school causes students to relinquish the enduring benefits generated from continuing to make music beyond high school.

ESSA

Music education in America is predicated upon the belief that the inclusion of music in the life of each student provides important benefits that should not be prevented by lack of access. The Every Student Succeeds Act became federal law in 2015 and took the place of the No Child Left Behind law that preceded ESSA.³ ESSA legislation specifically mandates that educational opportunities should be equally available to all students and works to make up for differences in educational equity throughout the United States.⁴ As a result of ESSA, disadvantaged schools were prioritized to receive assistance in various forms. ESSA also represented an important step forward for music education. “ESSA’s passage is an historic victory for music education advocates because it includes for the first time a specific and separate mention of music as a part of a ‘well-rounded education.’”⁵ The music education secured through the implementation of ESSA should be extended beyond high school for the highest percentage of students possible.

² Roger Mantie, and Jay Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors on College Campuses." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 200 (2014): 54, accessed December 6, 2020, doi:10.5406/bulcouresmusedu.200.0041.

³ “Everything ESSA,” National Association for Music Education, November 1, 2020, <http://nafme.org/advocacy/essa/>.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid.

Lack of School Music Connection to Lifelong Music Making

The results of research conducted by Melissa Arasi indicate “that traditional performing ensembles in secondary schools may not provide the greatest opportunity for engaging school musical experiences that encourage lifelong involvement in music.”⁶ Roger Mantie and Lynn Tucker assert that music educators are sometimes teaching for the preparation for an upcoming competition instead of the development of a love of making music for a lifetime: “teachers do not view their teaching as leading toward the goal of lifelong participation.”⁷

The standpoint represented by Mantie and Tucker may be controversial because the primary reason that many music educators become teachers is to provide all the positive outcomes of music in their students’ lives that they themselves have experienced. Yet, former high school musicians may echo Mantie and Tucker’s perspective and view their music performance experience in middle school and high school as purely educational. After graduation, music students may not desire to continue making music beyond their formative school opportunities due to circumstances such as time conflicts.⁸ This unfortunate eventuality causes music students to view their music education similarly to the education they received in

⁶ Melissa T. Arasi, "Adult Reflections on a High School Choral Music Program: Perceptions of Meaning and Lifelong Influence," Order No. 3231924, Georgia State University, 2006: Abstract p. 2, In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, accessed, December 6, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fadult-reflections-on-high-school-choral-music%2Fdocview%2F305333250%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

⁷ Roger Mantie and Lynn Tucker, “Closing the Gap: Does Music-Making Have to Stop Upon Graduation?” *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 2 (May 1, 2008): 223, accessed December 6, 2020, doi: 10.1386/ijcm.1.2.217/1.

⁸ Michael J. Stewart, "A Study of First -Year Students within the Ohio State University and the Factors Influencing Nonparticipation in Band Programs at the Collegiate Level." Order No. 3262105, The Ohio State University, 2007. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, Abstract, accessed December 17, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fstudy-first-year-students-within-ohio-state%2Fdocview%2F304834432%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

other academic subjects that they do not wish to continue into adulthood, such as further studies in calculus for example.⁹

The Experience of High School Music Students

During middle school and high school, music students have had the opportunity to participate in concert bands, marching bands, choral ensembles, and orchestras as an important component of their formative school years. Students have dedicated countless rehearsal hours and personal practice hours—acquiring musicianship skills and experiencing enriching community music making. Many high school music students further engage within their schools' music education programs by taking private music lessons, auditioning for and participating in various all-county, all-district, and all-state ensembles. Music students excel at making music and enjoy the benefits of the current music education system that do not have to end after high school.

Music Education's Positive Benefits

Music students and their parents have repeatedly been told about the short and long-term benefits of music engagement and education. Wayne D. Bowman's article to understand music education explains its positive outcomes and benefits: "The worth of music and of musical instruction and of musical experience are ... functions of the consequences to which they lead: their value lies in the differences they make (or, in the case of negative value, the differences they fail to make) for human life and living."¹⁰ Parents and music students agree that music

⁹ Mantie and Lynn Tucker, "Closing the Gap," 224.

¹⁰ Wayne D. Bowman, "Music's Place in Education" in *Music and Music Education in People's Lives: An Oxford Handbook of Music Education*, Vol. 1, eds. Gary E. McPherson and Graham F. Welch (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018), 29.

education does not just benefit academic abilities but also impacts learning and development that extends into personal life skills and emotional support that would not be available to students without acquired musical skills to participate in music.

Enrollment Decline Despite Music's Proven Benefits

Complex issues, such as the lack of access for all students to comprehensive music education, exist in every school. Music educators, school boards, parents, and administrators continue working to improve these issues within today's music education system, yet many students graduate from high school and have difficulty finding opportunities to participate in music ensembles.¹¹ Music students may continue to play or sing privately, but their motivation to continue on their own often wanes as time passes. Students who engage in music performance opportunities in high school may decide to join a sacred music ensemble or a community band or choir later in life when they are established in a career, but they will miss out on the opportunities and benefits of continuing to make music through their college years and early adult years.¹² Varying levels of developed musicianship and valuation perceptions prevent these adult musical pursuits from being equally fulfilling for all participants.¹³

¹¹ Charles T. Menghini, "Getting Your Students Ready for College and University Band Programs When the Last Note is Played, Does the Music End?" *School Band & Orchestra*, 08, 2016. 18, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1812910242%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

¹² Sara K. Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 262.

¹³ Stephanie E. Pitts, Katherine Robinson, and Kunshan Goh, "Not Playing Any More: A Qualitative Investigation of Why Amateur Musicians Cease or Continue Membership of Performing Ensembles," *International Journal of Community Music* 8, no. 2 (June 2015): 129-47, accessed December 6, 2020, doi:10.1386/ijcm.8.2.129_1.

Background of Topic

Innovative Music Appreciation Course Design

Arts elective courses are usually included as a degree requirement for many collegiate degree programs. In an effort to accomplish their arts requirement, students who have participated in high school music ensembles, students who have never formally performed in a music ensemble but love listening to music, students who play the piano, and students who compose music through accessible technologies often elect to take a Music Appreciation course. Music Appreciation courses, both the traditional and the online delivery formats,¹⁴ customarily provide an overview of the development of Western, classical music (including musical eras, famous composers-their lives and works), some percentage of world musics, a short section on the development of popular music, and an understanding of the musical elements that make up all music in varying combinations.¹⁵ Though Music Appreciation includes a large amount of listening to music, the course is often structured as a history course—primarily academic in nature.

Re-Focusing

David Elliott’s prominent music education text states: “Welcoming students into musical praxes depends crucially on selecting engaging and motivating musical processes and products that excite and inspire students to make, listen, and ‘solve’ musical ‘problems’ in context. By a musical ‘problems’ we mean a musical process (performing, improvising, composing, etc.).¹⁶

¹⁴ Bethanie L. Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020) 3.

¹⁵ Barbara E. Lewis, “University Non-Major Student Reactions to Music Appreciation Course Content and Instructional Methods,” in *Advances in Social-Psychology and Music Education Research*, ed. Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman, (New York, NY: Ashgate Publishing, 2016) 39.

¹⁶ Elliott and Silverman, *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education*, 231.

The integration of Elliott's viewpoint may provide new perspective and purpose for Music Appreciation course design by approaching the course and included core content as a means to develop praxis instead of primarily focusing on a study of music history—informing how other people have made music in the past.

Statement of the Problem

When students enter a Music Appreciation course, usually in the freshman year of their university studies, they are excited to enroll in a class where they have the opportunity to interact, in some form, with music. As soon as Music Appreciation students receive their syllabus and their professor proceeds to explain the overall structure of the course, some students may begin to view the course with a degree of disappointment. Either they are disappointed to learn that the course will mainly be focused on classical music which they may not have experienced or particularly enjoy or they are disappointed that they will only be *listening* to music all semester instead of incorporating some element of making music in the course.¹⁷

Music Appreciation Course Expectations Versus Reality

Non-music major Music Appreciation students enter the course planning to study music, yet the way each student may define music is different and often is not comprised primarily within the classical music genre. Barbara E. Lewis explains that “If instructors were better informed about how non-majors perceive the Music Appreciation class experience and react as

¹⁷ Timothy D. Green, "Music Appreciation: Bridging the Gap between Generation Z & Classical Music," Order No. 10807742, Liberty University, 2018. In PROQUESTMS Dissertations & Theses @ Liberty University; ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, 32, accessed on November 11, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2046301204%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

they listen to classical music, they could teach the class in a way that is more meaningful for the untrained musician.”¹⁸

Learner Centered Curriculum

Non-music major students need a Music Appreciation course that is designed from their perspective of what music is and connects them to an understanding of a variety of music styles, including classical music, throughout the duration of the course.¹⁹ A learner centered curriculum approach is especially effective within the Music Appreciation course. Colleen M. Conway states that “A focus on learner-centered pedagogy and a move away from the transmission model of teaching requires the music professor to create a classroom that is open for questions, dialogue, and learning.”²⁰ Melanie Lowe explains that “our musical-historical teaching needs to reach our students in ways that profoundly impact their existence as twenty-first-century citizens of Planet Earth.”²¹

Music Appreciation Course Challenges

For Students

Music Appreciation students realize that there is a wide disparity in musical knowledge among their peers in the course. Some students inevitably feel insecure because they love music, yet they do not read music notation, have never played an instrument, or participated in a

¹⁸ Lewis, “University Non-Major Student Reactions, 44.

¹⁹ Melanie Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today: Making Tangible Connections to Here and Now,” *Journal of Music History Pedagogy* 1 (2010), accessed November 11, 2020, <https://www.amsnet.org/ojs/index.php/jmhp/article/view/17>.

²⁰ Colleen M. Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 2nd ed., (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020) 121.

²¹ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today,” 46-47.

performing music ensemble. Other students may think they know too much to be in the course when the professor begins to teach about melody, harmony, rhythm, dynamics, timbre, and form—aspects that their high school music educators have been teaching them about for years in their prior experiences in performing music ensembles.

For Professors

Student Backgrounds Discrepancies

The Music Appreciation professor faces the challenge of teaching core curriculum content to students who have experienced varying musical backgrounds. Lewis W. Gordon explains the Music Appreciation professors' dilemma:

How is it possible in a single semester to develop life-long skills and interests, to introduce chronology and style to students who, for the most part, lack an understanding of music terminology, cannot identify the sounds of orchestral instruments, and are unable to perceive aspects of rhythm, melody, and harmony? Would time be better spent developing skills and understandings formerly taught at the pre-college level?²²

Music Appreciation professors strive to teach the Music Appreciation course's information in ways that will be relevant and compelling for all enrolled students especially for students who have not formally studied or performed music before.²³

²² Lewis W. Gordon, "College Music Appreciation: Pedagogical Approaches and Preliminary Findings." *College Music Symposium* 36 (1996): 103, accessed December 17, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374287>.

²³ Aaron K. Yackley, "Enjoyment of Music by Non-Participants in School Music." Order No. 27712035, The Ohio State University, 2019. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, iii, accessed November 11, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2355993358%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

Teaching Music from a Different Perspective

The professor faces the challenge of teaching a subject that he or she has studied endlessly—primarily from a performance perspective instead of purely academic. Professors realize that they must translate their own understanding and experience of music for non-music majors without diminishing their passion for the subject.²⁴

Traditional and Online Formats

Many Music Appreciation professors also face the opportunity and challenge of maintaining the course's integrity within an online delivery format. Online Music Appreciation students deserve the same quality instruction and community interaction that students in a traditional, seated course receive. Typically, the online Music Appreciation professor works to engage their students in the course's content and to also inspire and motivate their students through music without ever physically meeting together. Most online, university Music Appreciation courses incorporate a discussion board element. The use of discussion boards within online learning environments fosters community interaction and learning.²⁵ In order to facilitate an equalization of course experience for both traditional and online Music Appreciation courses, the professor seeks curriculum content and course design that is able to be effective in both delivery formats.

²⁴ Marjorie Roth, "Music As A Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors," in *The Music History Classroom*, ed. James A. Davis, (Farnham Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2012) 144.

²⁵ Cass M. Johnson, "Rethinking Online Discourse: Improving Learning through Discussions in the Online Classroom," *Education and Information Technologies* 21, no. 6 (November 2016): 1483, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1812705670%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

Statement of Purpose

The Collegiate Music Appreciation Course Presents an Opportunity

The findings from this study's research questions inform the development of Music Appreciation course re-design by inviting students to become music makers instead of only informed listeners of music.²⁶ This study seeks to understand the grounding principles that define current approaches to Music Appreciation curriculum. This foundation will serve as the basis of course design that can be interwoven with music ensemble recruitment techniques to improve university music ensemble participation by non-music majors.

From Historical Academia to Musical Praxis

Sara K. Jones states: "It is important for the music education community to understand the musical motivation and experiences of university students from fields outside of music in order to better serve this demographic and possibly encourage more non-music majors to participate in university ensembles."²⁷ Through a redesign of Music Appreciation curriculum, this arts elective course has the opportunity to recruit students into the music making ensembles of the university, to provide the benefits of music performance to non-music major students, to provide beneficial community engagement opportunities on campus, and to increase enrollment in university music performing ensembles.²⁸

²⁶ Ruth Bures, "How Non -Music Majors Experience the Value of Participating in Music," Order No. 3358977, Saint Mary's University of Minnesota, 2009, 69, in PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F305070602%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

²⁷ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 252-253.

²⁸ Alexandra Lamont, "Emotion, Engagement and Meaning in Strong Experiences of Music Performance," *Psychology of Music* 40, no. 5 (September 2012): 574, accessed November 21, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735612448510>.

Significance of the Study

K-12 Music Educator Impacts

A significant body of research exists regarding curriculum development for Music Appreciation courses, yet this research only extends to providing students perspective into classical, some popular, and world musics through a variety of approaches. Music Appreciation course design becomes even more important if learning outcomes are extended to include the facilitation of student engagement in music performance during and after the course is completed. This study will provide important insights to determine how the collegiate Music Appreciation course may be best designed and taught. Barbara E. Lewis states, “making (Music Appreciation) attractive is an important step in encouraging students to choose either to continue any previous music study they might have had or to be introduced to music as an aesthetic resource for the first time.”²⁹ As a result of this study, high school music educators would be able to more confidently recommend the collegiate Music Appreciation course to all of their students knowing it would be a course where students would be motivated to continue their previously developed musical interests despite not pursuing music as a career.

University School of Music and Music Appreciation Instructor Impacts

Collegiate Schools of Music will find application in the outcomes of this research study because of their potential to increase enrollment within their music ensembles. Current and future university Music Appreciation professors are impacted by the results of this study through the recommendations and support provided for course new content elements that endeavor to help students become lifelong makers of music. David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman explain:

²⁹ Lewis, “University Non-Major Student Reactions to Music Appreciation,” 39.

“For the sake of their lifelong engagements with music, we should nurture students’ awareness of the many ways in which music arouses, comforts, bonds, and creates who we are as embodied, social beings.”³⁰ Based on the conclusions drawn from this study, Music Appreciation professors are able to provide substantial reasoning for including these new course design elements.

Research Questions

The primary questions for this study are:

RQ1: What Music Appreciation teaching methodologies and curriculum components have been recommended through research as highly effective for engaging non-music majors?

RQ2: What motivation factors are connected to non-music major participation in collegiate music ensembles?

RQ3: What music ensemble recruitment techniques may be integrated within Music Appreciation course design to increase non-music major ensemble participation and may reverse negative motivations of non-music majors not participating in collegiate music ensembles?

Working Hypothesis

The following hypothesis encompasses the research questions:

H1: Collegiate Music Appreciation courses can renew non-music major interest in participating in music performing ensembles through learner centered, constructivist, and collaborative teaching methodologies, integration of ensemble recruitment techniques, and through providing opportunities to make music during the course.

³⁰ David J. Elliott and Marissa Silverman, “Rethinking Philosophy, Re-Viewing Musical-Emotional Experiences,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega, (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012) 59.

Definition of Terms

Collegiate, Music Appreciation: A university level, arts elective that includes a study of musical elements, classical music, popular music, and world music.

Musics: A term used within ethnomusicology that references the varied music styles found in cultural music of non-Western cultures.

Music Appreciation Professors: Collegiate music professors teaching a course designed for non-music major students. These professors, simultaneously, may be teaching applied music and curriculum courses for music majors.

Music Major: A collegiate student pursuing an academic degree in a music specialized field.

Non-Music Major: A collegiate student who is pursuing an academic degree other than a music specialized field.

University Performing Ensembles: Collegiate music ensembles that perform choral and instrumental compositions.

Western Art Music: The classical music genre that finds its roots in the music that developed during the early Medieval Period and continues into the current post-modern era.

World Musics: Culturally relevant music from various cultures and ethnicities throughout the world.

Summary

As a result of the performance ensemble opportunities provided within current music education programs, students experience the benefits of making music within the communities of their elementary, middle, and high schools. Though research shows that music ensemble participation ceases for a high percentage of high school graduates upon completion of their high

school degree,³¹ collegiate music ensemble opportunities provide untapped possibilities for continuing to make music regardless of chosen academic major, extending the benefits of music education into early adulthood and increasing the likelihood that students will continue making music later in life. Through a research-based re-design of the Music Appreciation course, non-music majors could be recruited into collegiate music performance ensembles. Collegiate Music Appreciation professors have the opportunity to initiate music instruction for non-music major students by combining standard Music Appreciation course curriculum components with performance elements and recruitment techniques to renew non-music major student interest in participating in collegiate music performance ensembles.

³¹ Ardis R. Faber, "A Study of Factors that Influence First-Year Non-music Majors' Decisions to Participate in Music Ensembles at Small Liberal Arts Colleges in Indiana," Order No. 3426246, Ball State University, 2010: p. 6, In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, accessed December 6, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fstudy-factors-that-influence-first-year-nonmusic%2Fdocview%2F762400331%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Section I: Background of Music Appreciation Course Design

A representative perspective of Twentieth Century Music Appreciation education is presented in Kate H. Mueller's research from 1956.³² Mueller's work describes a rather grim picture of the Music Appreciation classroom explaining that students have difficulty learning significantly from complex listening examples and are at the mercy of the musical suggestions made by their teachers³³ causing the Music Appreciation instructor to make a concerted effort to seek out best teaching practices to provide a meaningful learning experience for students.

Music Appreciation course design has followed a developmental process that has come to include varying course outcomes and instructor perspectives. Edward Hafer, who researched the pedagogy of Music Appreciation, states that "approaches to training non-musicians in the art of listening have undergone a notable shift since the idea first entered the scholarly discourse in the eighteenth century."³⁴ Music educator and philosopher, Estelle Jorgenson, explains: "While it has often been interpreted as a closed system, curriculum design, as I see it, is in a constant state of 'becoming.' It is an open system or a dynamic process."³⁵ Each music professor will invariably teach Music Appreciation with a different approach. Collegiate schools of music vary

³² Kate H. Mueller, "Studies in Music Appreciation," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 4, no. 1 (1956): 3-25, accessed February 2, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3343835>.

³³ *Ibid.*, 24.

³⁴ Edward Hafer, "A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation," *Journal of Music History Pedagogy*. no. 3 (January 2012), 59, Accessed November 11, 2020, file:///C:/Users/Rebecka/Downloads/34-Article%20Text-346-3-10-20120823.pdf.

³⁵ Estelle R. Jorgensen, "The Curriculum Design Process in Music," *College Music Symposium* 28 (1988): 95, accessed December 23, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374590>.

in the expectations that are required of Music Appreciation professors according to Melanie Lowe. Lowe describes the pressures professors teaching this unique course experience including demands from both the School of Music and the larger institution where they teach.³⁶ Though learning objectives are clearly defined by course syllabi, the Music Appreciation instructor has the freedom to choose overall course strategy and creatively teach course content.

Music Appreciation course design is reflective of the instructor's perspective, personal music background, and music specialties. The music instructor is free to be creative when deciding exactly which composers and pieces of music will be studied. The course can focus on a broad spectrum of genres, styles, and musicians or can be narrower in scope. Due to the flexibility that the Music Appreciation course provides, professors of these courses may seek the most effective teaching methodologies for inclusion within their instruction.

Methodologies

Historical and Analytical Approaches

Available methodologies for teaching Music Appreciation are numerous. Jessica Halpern studied two popular approaches to Music Appreciation course design: the analytical approach that focuses on “the sounds and structure of the music” and the historical approach that focuses on “the background of the music and the composer.”³⁷ Most Music Appreciation courses include some combination of foundational music elements and Western, Art music's most notable composers. Nicholas J. Enz's article based on his analysis of available methodologies and curricula for the Music Appreciation course found agreement among the teaching approaches he

³⁶ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today” 45.

³⁷ Jessica Halpern, “Effects of Historical and Analytical Teaching Approaches on Music Appreciation.” *Journal of Research in Music Education* 40, no. 1 (1992): 39, accessed December 23, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345773>.

studied in three areas: “1) developing perspective listening skills is a primary goal, 2) the study of music for the non-major is important for reasons of personal development, societal development, and for the preservation of music, and 3) a single, widely accepted approach to teaching the non-major is unavailable.”³⁸

Enz also explains three areas of disagreement found among the authors he studied: “1) the appropriate content for the course, 2) the methodology for delivering instruction, and 3) the best way to improve the education of non-majors.”³⁹ The lack of consensus regarding the teaching of Music Appreciation causes concern for both instructors and institutions. A standard curriculum and teaching approach to the course, that includes room for instructor creativity, would provide the knowledge that the course’s content is appropriately constructed to meet predetermined outcomes and ensure course delivery provides for the needs and learning interests of non-music major students.

Learner Centered Curriculum

Maryellen Weimer’s book delves into the learner centered approach to teaching describing that true learning centered teaching does not need to only revolve around explaining to students what they should learn.⁴⁰ An article by Jared Keengwe, Grace Onchwari, and Joachim Agamba explains the positive application of a learner centered course design applied to

³⁸ Nicholas J. Enz, “Teaching Music to the Non-Major: A Review of the Literature,” *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 32, no. 1 (November 2013): 39, accessed December 17, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1177/8755123313502344>.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 39.

⁴⁰ Maryellen Weimer, *Learner-Centered Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice*, (Somerset: John Wiley & Sons, Incorporated, 2013) 10, accessed February 2, 2021, ProQuest Ebook Central.

the online classroom environment.⁴¹ Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba's work highlights the potential of the online Music Appreciation course to facilitate student led learning.⁴²

Constructivist Course Curriculum

The constructivist approach to music education and general educational contexts reveals an interconnected relationship with learner centered course design elements. Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba's constructivist pedagogy study calls for a grounded teaching approach that allows students to think collaboratively and solve problems.⁴³ The constructivist approach encourages student learner independence.

Collaborative Learning Curriculum

Colleen M. Conway's comprehensive book about collegiate music instruction details a broad coverage of music education focus areas at higher education institutions.⁴⁴ The book includes specifics about teaching music history courses. Best practices for the uses of discussions, technology, and the advantages and disadvantages of collaborative learning are investigated. Conway reflects that "I know of several music history professors who use case-based strategies in having students discuss and compare composers and historical contexts. Real stories of historic composers can provide excellent 'cases' for class discussion."⁴⁵ Conway's text

⁴¹ Jared Keengwe, Grace Onchwari, and Joachim Agamba, "Promoting Effective e-Learning Practices through the Constructivist Pedagogy," *Education and Information Technologies* 19, no. 4 (2014): 887-898, accessed November 11, 2020, <https://link-springer-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/article/10.1007/s10639-013-9260-1#citeas>.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 888.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 889.

⁴⁴ Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, 186.

provides contextual information about best methods regarding the teaching of college level music history courses.

Curriculum

Musical Content Perspectives

Choices regarding what styles of music will be studied may also be carefully considered within Music Appreciation course design. Timothy D. Green's analysis of historical Music Appreciation courses design explains that "even though the history of teaching Music Appreciation in America has been well documented, no existing curriculum has yet been created with a specific focus of connecting classical music to current students and music."⁴⁶ The inclusion of the development of popular music within Music Appreciation courses varies by school and instructor. Some courses devote a significant portion of the course to understanding the development of popular music and other courses focus primarily on the Western, Classical music tradition with short popular music tangents.

Studies such as Green's focus on the positive outcomes that may be realized by incorporating the study of popular music within Music Appreciation course design as a means of engaging students. Green suggests that classical music's foundational aspects will become more familiar and tangible when first understood in the music that they currently enjoy.⁴⁷ Phillip M. Hash's study to understand the musical preferences of non-music major college students proposes the development of targeted courses that investigate various popular music genres specifically offered to meet the interests of non-music majors needing to fill arts electives.⁴⁸ Due

⁴⁶ Green, "Music Appreciation: Bridging the Gap between Generation Z & Classical Music," 25.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

to diverse perspectives regarding the inclusion of popular music in Music Appreciation courses, the amount of popular music history students are exposed to varies widely.

Media Inclusion Approaches

John M. Geringer, Jane W. Cassidy, and James L. Byo conducted a study to investigate the affective and cognitive responses that non-music major students experience from listening to music with media versus listening to music alone.⁴⁹ The results of their study present an interesting dichotomy revealing that some visual stimuli can reduce productive music listening.⁵⁰

Further context is found in Annette H. Zalanowski's study of hemisphere orientation's relation to the study of Music Appreciation.⁵¹ Zalanowski's concludes that students' response to listening examples accompanied by visual media varied based on left versus right orientation.⁵²

Aural Listening Development Content Inclusion

Developing their students' aesthetic listening skills is often a high priority for Music Appreciation instructors yet finding sufficient course time to devote to this content area may sometimes be problematic. Lewis W. Gordon highlights the limited time that is available for the

⁴⁸ Phillip M. Hash, "Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music," *Contributions to Music Education* 36, no. 1 (2009): 21, accessed January 30, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fundergraduate-non-music-major-preferences-western%2Fdocview%2F1303529%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

⁴⁹ John M., Geringer, Jane W. Cassidy, and James L. Byo, "Effects of Music with Video on Responses of Nonmusic Majors: An Exploratory Study," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 44, no. 3 (1996): 249, accessed January 29, 2021, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345597>.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁵¹ Annette H. Zalanowski, "Music Appreciation and Hemisphere Orientation: Visual versus Verbal Involvement," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 38, no. 3 (1990): 197, accessed January 29, 2021, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345183>.

⁵² Ibid.

development of listening skills within the Music Appreciation course as a primary impediment of the course”⁵³ requiring the Music Appreciation instructor to decide if Bennett Reimer’s aesthetic approach or David Elliott’s praxial approach to music education will be furthered in their course’s approach or if a balanced approach of both will be incorporated.

Lauri Vakeva explains the approach of the aesthetic philosopher Alexander Baumgarten: “As a rationalist, Baumgarten thought that cultivation of aesthetic perception should be based on the reason-guided clarification of otherwise obscure and confused ideas...Such a refined, clarified sensory experience was, for Baumgarten, the basic for aesthetic ideas.”⁵⁴ David Elliott states that “our praxis should be fundamentally concerned with enabling students to apply their understandings of musical-emotional arousal and expression in their own music making and listening.”⁵⁵

Asking the Right Questions

James Davis discusses aesthetics and points out the necessity for teachers of Music Appreciation to discover the best ways to formulate questions to generate class discussions.⁵⁶ The conversations generated within Music Appreciation courses are meant to stimulate learning and creative thinking among students yet is often difficult for the instructor to initiate. The research of James Davis to understand questions asked in the music history classroom reveals the

⁵³ Gordon, "College Music Appreciation," 104.

⁵⁴ Lauri Vakeva, "Philosophy of Music Education as Art of Life: A Deweyan View," In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012) 93.

⁵⁵ Elliott and Silverman, *Music Matters: A Philosophy of Music Education*, 331.

⁵⁶ James Davis, "Aesthetic Questions and Questions of Aesthetics in the Music History Classroom: Questions and Students," *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 35, no. 3 (Fall, 2001): 92, accessed January 31, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Faesthetic-questions-aesthetics-music-history%2Fdocview%2F220638111%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

importance of carefully crafting the right questions for class discussions. Davis explains that “The discipline of philosophy has known from the first time that it is often the question which matters more than the answer, perhaps it is time that teachers adopted the same attitude and possibility our music history classes would move beyond mere required core course and emerge as engaging and inspiring musical and intellectual experiences.”⁵⁷ The approach of Davis seeks to foster good question reflection within the Music Appreciation classroom.

Course Textbooks

Collegiate Music Appreciation is often taught using one of several standard course texts. William E. Everett’s work regarding the development of a music history course suggests taking into consideration multiple factors when choosing a course text.⁵⁸ These factors include the type of higher education institution and what knowledge level students will enter the course already understanding.⁵⁹ Though Music Appreciation can be taught utilizing other resources than a course textbook, “especially in an undergraduate music history class, having a textbook’s systematic approach to which students can refer readily at hand can reinforce and support other course activities.”⁶⁰

Music history professor Linda Pohly’s experience teaching a graduate course on the teaching of Music Appreciation to non-music majors emphasizes the difficult decision of choosing a Music Appreciation course textbook.⁶¹ Pohly explains that Music Appreciation

⁵⁷ Davis, "Aesthetic Questions and Questions of Aesthetics," 92.

⁵⁸ William E. Everett, “Creating a Music History Course,” In *The Music History Classroom*, ed. James A. Davis (Farnham Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing. 2012) 9.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

instructors deal with the constant struggle to decide how to structure course content in a balanced way and that necessity dictates the inclusion of some topics causing other topics to be minimized due to time constraints.⁶² Pohly represents yet another voice highlighting the inconsistency of Music Appreciation course design that is evident regarding even textbook choices.

Music Appreciation Professor Challenges

Student Music Experience Variance

Depending on the university, prior knowledge of musical elements and performing experiences possessed by students enrolled in Music Appreciation spans a vast spectrum of musical learning. Many schools encourage both music majors and non-music majors to take Music Appreciation which results in a unique, pedagogical challenge for instructors. Hansen describes the perspectives found among Music Appreciation students of varying ages: “Students who enroll in Music Appreciation as a college elective are a mix of young adults and adult learners who need to satisfy general education requirements, some of which already love music and want to understand it better but do not have the academic background to understand music as a subject area.”⁶³ Hanson’s statement shows a trend shift from Lewis W. Gordon’s assertion that through the 1980s, Music Appreciation students often began the course with a satisfactory amount of prior music knowledge.⁶⁴

Melanie Lowe explains the formidable task facing collegiate music instructors when deciding on their course’s approach: “Despite the differences in our professional backgrounds,

⁶¹ Linda Pohly, "Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation—What We Can Learn from MGS Pedagogy." *College Music Symposium* 47 (2007): 127-38, accessed February 3, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374509>.

⁶² *Ibid.*, 133.

⁶³ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 33.

⁶⁴ Gordon, "College Music Appreciation," 103.

the wide variation in the level and musical experiences of our students, and the abundance of course formats and subjects, music history instructors often feel an imperative to be thorough and comprehensive, especially in survey courses.”⁶⁵ Because of the extreme musical knowledge variances found among Music Appreciation students, music professors experience pressure to teach a substantial amount of content to students. Music Appreciation students are expected to quickly absorb a high percentage of new content in one, short semester. This rapid assimilation of knowledge becomes even more difficult due to a lack of student musical background providing context for understanding new course information.

Relevance For All Students

Melanie Lowe summarizes the Music Appreciation professor’s challenge to provide relevant course content and delivery: “The real challenge for teachers of music history is to put this history in direct dialogue with our contemporary, every-day lives.”⁶⁶ Marjorie Roth further explains the Music Appreciation instructor’s task: “It will be your task to harmonize the classical repertoire you know so well with the popular or world music repertoire they will know equally well by examining them all within the context of human experience.”⁶⁷ Lowe additionally clarifies and supports Roth when stating: “In my experience, if given the opportunity, students readily relate musical-historical course content to their own contemporary cultural experiences.”⁶⁸

⁶⁵ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today,” 45.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 46.

⁶⁷ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 145.

⁶⁸ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today,” 48.

A Music Course for Non-Music Majors

Most music professors predominantly teach music courses that are designed to fulfill requirements for college music majors who already may possess a considerable amount of musical knowledge. A change of approach may be considered by the music professor teaching Music Appreciation for the first time due to the possibility that the non-music majors enrolled in the course may not have had the opportunity to develop high levels of music knowledge yet. Author of a comprehensive book regarding online Music Appreciation teaching, Bethanie L. Hansen references this obstacle for music professors: “Music educators focused on teaching music majors, performing ensembles, and other courses directed at students with backgrounds in music face the challenge of opening up to the possibility of teaching a general music course to nonmusicians.”⁶⁹ Though Music Appreciation often includes some of the same content as music history courses designed for music majors, understanding and application outcomes are usually different for non-music major students learning music history content for the first time. Professors may need to tailor their teaching approach in order to convey understanding and insights into the music studied.

Online Music Appreciation Courses

Transitioning best practices for Music Appreciation course design to the online classroom represents an important pedagogical area for study because of the prevalence of online Music Appreciation courses—developed to meet accessibility needs for arts electives. Kim Davenport’s experience developing an online Music Appreciation course is discussed in an article that describes how she designed curricula in order to develop a “course design (that) is an excellent

⁶⁹ Bethanie L. Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020) 33.

catalyst for increasing engagement between campus and community.”⁷⁰ Davenport states that “this comes out of necessity for UWT (The University of Washington at Tacoma) since this school has no music department to provide concerts.”⁷¹ Davenport’s experience of developing an online Music Appreciation course for deployment at a higher education institution that does not have a music school is a realistic situation found at many colleges throughout the United States—especially two year institutions and technical colleges.

Online Learning Positives

Hansen’s text thoroughly discusses transferring a seated course to an online course, planning necessities, methodologies, and curriculum content.⁷² The author speaks to the potential positives of online Music Appreciation courses when suggesting that online Music Appreciation courses may foster more interactive discussions between teachers and students than those that may occur in a traditional, seated course delivery format.⁷³ A significant percentage of Music Appreciation courses are taught in a solely online format. This book provides context for what techniques work in an online Music Appreciation course such as “alternative assessment methods and media presentations, websites, blogs, journals, wikis, worksheets, group projects, web quests, and other creations” providing targeted learning tools.⁷⁴

⁷⁰ Kim Davenport, "All My Students Are Non-Majors: An Online Music Appreciation Course for a Diverse Student Body." *College Music Symposium* 57 (2017) page number not available, accessed October 30, 2020, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26574455>.

⁷¹ *Ibid.*, page number not available.

⁷² Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*.

⁷³ *Ibid.*, 13.

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, 167.

Discussion Boards

Discussion boards, an element often included and regarded as essential within the online learning environment, are also discussed within Hansen's text. Hansen provides practical information regarding teaching Music Appreciation using discussion boards to benefit student learning. Hansen explains that the discussion board interactions that take place within the online Music Appreciation course often generate more interactive discussions.⁷⁵ As instructors seek ways to transfer student engagement ideas from a seated, traditional delivery format to the online delivery format, the online discussion board represents a significant resource for interaction and engagement.

The use of online discussion boards is also studied in Cass M. Johnson's research. Johnson definitively supports the use of online discussion boards within Music Appreciation courses for their potential to increase student learning significantly.⁷⁶ Johnson's study specifically targets the online course's discussion board interactions. The author studies how discussion boards help students and teachers to connect and increase student learning. A thorough explanation of the collaborative learning approach is discussed. The findings of Johnson's research and Hansen's experience highlight best practices for online discussion board interactions that can be directly applied to the online Music Appreciation course context.

⁷⁵ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 13.

⁷⁶ Johnson, "Rethinking Online Discourse," 1483.

Section II: Music Performance Ensemble Participation Beyond K-12

Importance of Music Education

Available research proving the emotional, physical, and mental benefits of engaging in music making is readily available. Scientific studies demonstrating positive outcomes from music education abound prompting the current inclusion of this subject area in most education systems throughout the United States. Music philosopher and educator, Bennett Reimer, explains that “Work in cognitive science has clarified the fact that human knowing and intelligence are multifaceted and that various musical involvements provide opportunities to operate at the highest levels of cognition that humans are capable of and to understand, to create, and to share meanings as only music allows people to do and to exercise the intelligence particular to and dependent on each musical role.”⁷⁷ Aside from data and scientific conclusions, the emotional connection and impacts of music are equally important to consider.

Author, Randall Pabich, speaks to the natural affinity for music that exists within people: “Nearly everyone loves some music, has music that speaks to her soul or that she loses herself in. Thus, to a degree that is uncommon even among the arts, music has an extraordinary ability to facilitate a relatively deep experience of attunement or interexpressive realization, an experience of a profound connection with something outside or beyond oneself.”⁷⁸ The author, V. A. Howard, summarizes philosophical music education perspectives:

It is seldom that famous philosophers agree, but here we have a remarkable consensus among the idealist R. G. Collingwood, the nominalist Nelson

⁷⁷ Bennett Reimer, "Facing the Risks Of the 'Mozart Effect'." *Phi Delta Kappan*, December 1999, 278. Gale In Context: Biography (accessed January 31, 2021). https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A58633518/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=1d4dbde9.

⁷⁸ Randall Pabich, “Learning to Live Music: Musical Education as the Cultivation of a Relationship Between Self and Sound.” In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012) 139.

Goodman, the pragmatist John Dewey, and the conceptual analyst R. S. Peters—otherwise world apart. From their very different technical perspectives they agree (1) that the arts are forms of understanding, of cognition and ways of world making; (2) that they are plagued by false dichotomies that disguise a proper grasp of understanding in and through the arts; and (3) that any education deserving of the name should include them for any and all theoretical and practical purposes, that as “frills” or “extras” but as essential.⁷⁹

Importance and Access Does Not Always Result in Intended Outcome

The federal law, Every Student Succeeds Act of 2015, describes the academic subject music “as a part of a ‘well-rounded education’⁸⁰ enabling the provision of music education for every child in the American education system. Though the benefits of music participation are highly touted and musical engagement opportunities are participated in by high percentages of students within American public education, many students do not continue to play or sing after graduation from high school as previously cited in the studies of Sara Jones⁸¹ and Roger Mantie and Jay Dorfman.⁸²

The undertaking to understand this trend is complicated by the many perspectives that have interconnected pedagogical implications within current music education standards. Randall Pabich explains that “a music education and indeed music itself does not end with a knowledge of these (music’s foundational elements and technical skills) forms and a degree of competence in these techniques; rather, these things serve something.”⁸³

⁷⁹ V. A. Howard, “Must Music Education Have an Aim?” In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012) 261.

⁸⁰ “Everything ESSA.”

⁸¹ Jones, “A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation,” 252.

⁸² Mantie, and Dorfman, “Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajor,” 54.

⁸³ Pabich, “Learning to Live Music: Musical Education,” 132.

Motivation Impacting Participation

Ryan V. Scherber's research to understand motivation factors that cause students to want to participate in performing music ensembles reveals that students chose to participate in music ensembles most often simply because they love music and getting better as a musician."⁸⁴ The importance of student self-concept in motivation is discussed within Richard E. Klinedinst's research.⁸⁵ Klinedinst states that the "results of this study also indicate that being sensitive to student self-concept may affect attitude towards music and ultimately retention. The strong relationship found between attitude towards music and self-concept in music has implications for teachers of beginning students."⁸⁶ Veronica O. Sichivitsa's research study sought to understand what inspirations have the greatest effect on generating music performance interest in students.⁸⁷ Sichivitsa found that parental support provided a significant influence in their children participating in music and gaining the resulting benefits.⁸⁸ Gregory C. Hurley's research reveals similar findings that focus on of the impact that parental influence has upon music student's motivation to perform music.⁸⁹

⁸⁴ Ryan V. Scherber, "Perceptions of Participation in a Youth Community Ensemble." Order No. 1504003, The Florida State University, 2011. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, 24, accessed February 5, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fperceptions-participation-youth-community%2Fdocview%2F897549459%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

⁸⁵ Richard E. Klinedinst, "Predicting Performance Achievement and Retention of Fifth-Grade Instrumental Students." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 39, no. 3 (1991): 236, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3344722>

⁸⁶ Ibid.

⁸⁷ Veronica O. Sichivitsa, "The Influences of Parents, Teachers, Peers and Other Factors on Students' Motivation in Music," *Research Studies in Music Education* 29, no. 1 (December 2007): 55-68, accessed February 5, 2021, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X07087568>.

⁸⁸ Ibid.

⁸⁹ Gregory C. Hurley, "Student Motivations for Beginning and Continuing/Discontinuing String Music Instruction." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 16, no. 6 (October 1, 2010): 44-55. Accessed November 13, 2020. <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/>.

Music Performance Ensemble Participation During College

Mantie and Dorman's research of music participation by college student non-music majors suggests "that playing or singing in a group is more of a niche rather than a widespread activity at least as such participation relates to bands, orchestras, and choirs in conjunction or as associated with schooling and education."⁹⁰ Mantie and Dorman additionally provide insight into the college student's perspective of his or her own musical engagement that has shifted since the 1980's by stating that "contrary to discourse since the 1980's that has emphasized the lifelong learning aspect of adult participation, results in this study did not support this as a primary reason for continuing to be musically active."⁹¹

Musical Engagement Beyond College

Stephanie E. Pitts, Katharine Robinson, and Kunshan Goh undertook a study interviewing adult, former music ensemble participants. They concluded that "reasons for ceasing participation related most often to a feeling of poor 'fit' with the ensemble, with a perceived decline or inadequacy of musical contribution often closely linked to a player's health or well-being."⁹² As part of a study of adult community music ensembles, Roger Mantie and Lynn Tucker's propose the following questions: "1) why do students not view community bands, orchestras or choirs as the object of their learning and 2) why do teachers not view community bands, orchestras or choirs as the object of their teaching"⁹³ drawing attention to the perspective sometimes found in students that school music programs are an academic discipline that ceases

⁹⁰ Mantie, and Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors," 54.

⁹¹ Ibid., 55.

⁹² Pitts, Robinson, and Goh, "Not Playing Any More," 142.

⁹³ Mantie and Tucker, "Closing the Gap," 225.

after high school graduation instead of the foundation for a journey of life-long musical engagement. Stephanie Pitts' article describes the understanding of the purpose of music education as a method to help students remain interested in making music throughout their lives.⁹⁴

Section III: Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Techniques

Generating Interest

Glenn E. Nierman, and Michael H. Veak explain that “before these valuable musical experiences can be realized, the student must be motivated to want to begin study on a musical instrument.”⁹⁵ Music ensemble participation is thoroughly investigated in James F. Kelley’s dissertation that contains four relevant topics.⁹⁶ Kelly presents research relating to the roles that gender, family identity, and musical self-concept play in music ensemble participation. Understanding of community music ensemble participation is also explored. Kelley explores the many influences such as social and personal influences that impact the choice to participate in music ensemble performing.⁹⁷

⁹⁴ Stephanie E. Pitts, “What Is Music Education for? Understanding and Fostering Routes into Lifelong Musical Engagement,” *Music Education Research* 19, no. 2 (June 2017): 165, accessed January 28, 2021, doi:10.1080/14613808.2016.1166196.

⁹⁵ Glenn E. Nierman, and Michael H. Veak, "Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies on Beginning Instrumentalists' Participation Decisions," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 45, no. 3 (1997): 380, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345533>.

⁹⁶ James F. Kelley, "Quantitative and Qualitative Investigations of Music Participation: A Multiple Study Dissertation." Order No. 3725043, University of Washington, 2015. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, iii, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1722533314%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

⁹⁷ Ibid.

Maintaining Interest

Ward Dilmore highlights the difference in orchestra and band ensemble participation during middle school versus high school.⁹⁸ Dilmore explains how he was able to increase enrollment in his beginning orchestra through specific recruitment techniques and explains how student enrollment in orchestra and strings programs can be maintained through high school.

To recruit and to retain members, a road needs to be defined, and all signs must point to the answers for the brain's constant question, "What's the use of doing this?" When presenting the roadmap that includes benchmarks and milestones, the brain is motivated by a clear understanding of what lies ahead and the benefits that will ensue. In the gym on that fateful morning, my presentation was summed up in a simple call-and-response manner.⁹⁹

Recruitment Messaging and Practices

Josepf Hanson's research study sought to understand common instrumental ensemble recruitment techniques for middle school instrumental music educators. Commonalities between the recruitment techniques of school instrumental programs and of the adult New Horizon ensembles' techniques were analyzed.¹⁰⁰ Specific recruitment studied revolved around recruitment messaging.

Recruitment narratives based around participants' experiences-testimonials, performance footage, and success stories featuring real people-might prove more effective than the hypothetical conjuring present in current messaging. Practitioners should consider developing recruitment rhetoric that emphasizes

⁹⁸ Ward Dilmore, "The Best Things in Life Have Strings Attached: How to Grow Recruitment and Ensure Retention in Your Strings Program," *School Band & Orchestra*, 06, 2017. 32, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1914141623%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

⁹⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰⁰ Josef Hanson, "A Content Analysis Of Beginning Instrumental Music Recruitment Materials: Comparing Elementary And Adult Learning Contexts," *Journal of Band Research* 53, no. 2 (Spring, 2018): 9-10, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2082513686%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

creativity and the uniquely musical features of participation, highlights diversity and inclusiveness, and that decentralizes instrument choice and deemphasizes the encumbrances of membership.¹⁰¹

Charles P. Schmidt's study reveals that students "on average tended to agree that they learned the most or did their best when working with other students. The results suggest that students may respond best to the intrinsic or cooperative aspects of instrumental music, rather than its extrinsic or competitive aspects."¹⁰²

Demonstrations and Participation Opportunities

Dale Bazan and Jonathan Bayley's discussion of effective recruitment strategies include the following suggestions: "plan a demonstration lesson that sparks student interest and perform music that is interesting and captivates students."¹⁰³ Nierman and Veak's research to seek out effective recruitment techniques reflects upon the importance of hands on opportunities within recruitment.¹⁰⁴ Their research focuses on the impact that music making experiences such as playing the recorder has on student learning. Nierman and Veak recommend the prioritization of these active, participatory learning experiences over demonstration.¹⁰⁵

¹⁰¹ Hanson, "A Content Analysis Of Beginning Instrumental Music Recruitment Materials," 9-10.

¹⁰² Charles P. Schmidt, "Relations among Motivation, Performance Achievement, and Music Experience Variables in Secondary Instrumental Music Students," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 53, no. 2 (2005): 134-47. Accessed February 10, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345514>.

¹⁰³ Dale Bazan and Jonathan Bayley, "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students: Effective Strategies for a Strong Program." *Canadian Winds: The Journal of the Canadian Band Association* 7, no. 2 (Spring, 2009): 72, accessed February 6, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Frecruiting-band-students-effective-strategies%2Fdocview%2F753589791%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

¹⁰⁴ Nierman, and Veak, "Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies," 380-89.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, 387.

Ongoing Recruitment Challenge

Dean Luethi's article identifies the problem that music ensemble directors face—necessary and continual recruitment efforts.¹⁰⁶ This article makes a variety of suggestions to increase ensemble enrollment that could be incorporated into a Music Appreciation course such as contact with ensemble directors. Luethi also suggests developing a sense of community within music ensembles to help with recruitment. "The reality is that people don't show up in our classrooms without motivation. We need to understand what motivates students, so they'll want to be part of our ensembles. With this information, we can devise ways to increase our numbers."¹⁰⁷

General Music Courses' Role in Recruitment

David M. Rolandson conducted a study investigating the participation motivation differences that exist between high school students taking performance music courses and students taking a more academic type of course that focuses on popular music.¹⁰⁸ Roland concludes: "Although additional self-concept motivation research is needed, it is reasonable to hypothesize that popular music students' musical self-concept would increase over time with continued instruction and performing opportunities."¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁶ Dean Luethi, "Idea Bank: Ten Steps to Recruiting Singers," *Music Educators Journal* 102, no. 1 (2015): 25, accessed November 12, 2020, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24755624>.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid.

¹⁰⁸ David M. Rolandson, "Motivation in Music: A Comparison of Popular Music Course Students and Traditional Large Ensemble Participants in High School." *Contributions to Music Education* 45 (2020): 105-26, accessed February 5, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fmotivation-music-comparison-popular-course%2Fdocview%2F2404065675%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., 118.

Julianna E. Frost 's 2015 study examines what elements of general music courses impact music ensemble participation in high school.¹¹⁰ A variety of elementary music curriculum programs are analyzed by Frost in addition to targeted technologies. Frost also studies the use of Dalcroze, Orff-Schulwerk, and Kodály music education approaches. Frost explains that her “thesis looks at whether the methods of the general music teacher and typical activities associated with these methods are related to the numbers of students who choose band, choir or orchestra as the secondary level.”¹¹¹

Positive Retention Outcomes

Don R. Crowe’s research to understand factors influencing college student retention emphasizes the potential benefits to the college or university from increased student participation in music performing ensembles.¹¹² Crowe asserts that college students who participated in music performing ensembles were much more likely to complete their sophomore, junior, and senior years at the school causing increased rates of overall retention.¹¹³

¹¹⁰ Julianna E. Frost, "Recruitment and Retention: The Influence of General Music Teachers Methodology on Secondary Music Ensembles." Order No. 10306791, The University of Toledo, 2015. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, iii, accessed November 13, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1867481645%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

¹¹¹ Ibid.

¹¹² Don R. Crowe, “Retention of College Students and Freshman-Year Music Ensemble Participation.” *Journal of College Student Retention: Research, Theory & Practice* 17, no. 3 (November 2015): 373–80. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1521025115575918>.

¹¹³ Ibid., 373.

CHAPTER THREE:

METHODS

Research Design

The research design for this study was qualitative and employed a historical-comparative method.¹¹⁴ Patricia Leavy's comprehensive book on research designs describes qualitative designs as "approaches (that) rely on inductive designs aimed at generating meaning and producing rich, descriptive data. Qualitative approaches are most commonly used in exploratory or descriptive research."¹¹⁵ Instead of seeking numerical data or statistics, this study sought to gain understanding of existing music education trends occurring in current collegiate Schools of Music through comparison and analysis of past findings and recommendations.

Research Method

A historical-comparative method arms the researcher with relevant, existing research data from broad sources to be used for new analysis based on the need for solutions in a specified application area. The historical research method employed in this study can be defined "as the class of techniques used for the compilation, description, and critical analysis of primary and secondary historical sources with the intention to provide a contextualized explanation and interpretation of the phenomenon of interest."¹¹⁶

¹¹⁴ Patricia Leavy, *Research Design: Quantitative, Qualitative, Mixed Methods, Arts-Based, and Community-Based Participatory Research Approaches*, (New York: Guilford Publications, 2017) 15, accessed November 15, 2020, ProQuest Ebook Central.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 124.

¹¹⁶ Nicholas S. Argyres, Alfredo De Massis, Nicolai J. Foss, Federico Frattini, Geoffrey Jones, and Brian S. Silverman. "History-informed Strategy Research: The Promise of History and Historical Research Methods in Advancing Strategy Scholarship." *Strategic Management Journal* 41, no. 3 (2020): 345, accessed February 11, 2021, <https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/doi/full/10.1002/smj.3118>.

Research Sources

This study undertook a comprehensive search of available research literature, professional music journals, dissertations, and subject area specific books that focused on best practices in Music Appreciation course design for both traditional and online course deliveries, successful music performance ensemble recruitment techniques, and the participation trends and motivations of non-music major students attending institutions of higher learning. This study endeavored to include as much pertinent research literature as possible from the past ten years while still including earlier dated research literature where relevant. All related resources were not accessible causing some limitations on the research sources analyzed for this study.

Major Research Categories

An interdisciplinary search was conducted to discover research literature, best practices, and recommendations related to this study's primary focus areas: Music Appreciation course best methodologies and content, motivations of non-music majors to participate in collegiate music ensembles, and recruitment techniques that may renew interest in performing music by collegiate non-music majors. By using bibliography tracing, sources were discovered that may not have been found through available search engines alone. Existing research literature and other sources were searched for pertinent information and/or previously completed findings resulting in connections being made through comparison. The interweaving of past findings, trends, and research recommendations from available research literature relating to this study's three primary focus areas provided new understanding of the inherent possibilities that are realized when connecting Music Appreciation course design, music ensemble recruitment, and collegiate music performing ensembles. Table 1 details the study's major categories that were used to complete searches for research studies, journal articles, and other related sources.

| Prioritized Search Terms and Topics¹¹⁷ <i>Table 1</i> | |
|--|--|
| Music Appreciation | Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Deficiencies |
| College Music Appreciation | Music Ensemble Recruitment |
| University Music Appreciation | Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Participation |
| Music Appreciation Engagement | Music Ensemble Recruitment Techniques |
| Music Appreciation Course Textbooks | High School Music Student Attrition Rates Into College |
| High School Music Students Elect To Take Music Appreciation In College | Non-Music Major College Recruitment |
| Non-Music Major Ensemble Participation Trends | Music Appreciation Best Practices |

Conclusion

Though the connected results of this study's three primary focus areas have not been researched extensively previously, numerous separate studies have been conducted to understand how the Music Appreciation course may be taught best, how to effectively recruit vocalists and instrumentalists for collegiate performance ensembles, and the performance ensemble participation motivation trends of non-music major collegiate students. Employing interdisciplinary search criteria provided a diverse and expansive compilation of sources for analysis and inclusion in this study that a discipline specific search would have not supplied. The

¹¹⁷ Rebecka Rose, "Prioritized Search Terms and Topics," (March 23, 2021).

plethora of existing research and information sources related to this study's focus aspects allowed for in depth analysis and identifiable recommendations to be derived as a result of this qualitative, historical research study.

CHAPTER FOUR: DISCUSSION OF RESEARCH FINDINGS

Section I: The Collegiate Music Appreciation Course—Best Practices

Attention given to the careful crafting of collegiate Music Appreciation courses is warranted due to the educational impact that the course may have on students who have an interest in music but have not yet fully engaged in campus music studies or performing ensembles as a college student. Enz explains that “Educating the non-major is a topic of particular importance at specialized institutions that offer no degree programs in music or offer only liberal arts music degrees. These schools have special responsibilities to provide liberal arts music courses for the general university student, as well as elective experiences in applied music...Such programs can be thought of being devoted entirely to educating the non-major.”¹¹⁸ Regardless of the institution where Music Appreciation is taught, students should have the opportunity to experience an engaging and worthwhile experience within the Music Appreciation course context.

Music Appreciation course design should receive the same attention to detail and planning that all music courses receive to generate meaningful and long-lasting course learning outcomes. Determining how the course will be constructed and taught is of primary importance for the Music Appreciation course instructor, department, and institution. The varied methods and perspectives of Music Appreciation courses reflected within higher education instruction throughout the United States makes planning the Music Appreciation course challenging.

¹¹⁸ Enz, “Teaching Music to the Non-Major,” 34.

Analyzing the course design and content of Music Appreciation courses from the past and from various institutions and instructors provides insights to follow when designing the course for current and future students in the most effective ways possible. Kate H. Mueller explains the rationale behind this searching and reflects on the influence that Music Appreciation instructors have on their students' musical learning and perceptions: "At least two general principles seem to be emerging and may possibly be confirmed in greater detail in future studies: (a) the more difficult the initial impact of the concept, the less likely is the listener to make any gain in achieving it. Repeated hearings only confirm his initial tendency to error. (b) There is probably an inclination on the part of the amateur to accept any suggestion at its face value and to attempt to incorporate it into his perceptual process"¹¹⁹ necessitating the careful consideration of design and direction provided by the instructor.

Music Appreciation students know that they love music, know what types of music they love, but do not have a solid foundation for musical elements and foundational music principles leaving them vulnerable to accepting inadequate or leading instruction as good enough. Mueller further exhorts that "Music Appreciation must be taught not only widely but well, and must include any material, any approach which enlivens the music for the listener."¹²⁰ Though Music Appreciation course designs vary, the course offers a unique opportunity to be creative in course creation and to involve the best teaching practices that research and experience can divulge.

Tradition Versus Innovation

As the Music Appreciation course instructor begins preparations for a new semester, excitement is generated when deciding upon all the exceptional pieces of music that students will

¹¹⁹ Mueller, "Studies in Music Appreciation," 24.

¹²⁰ Ibid., 3.

be exposed to that they have likely never heard of before. Yet, before the instructor even begins deciding what music will be included within the semester's course, he or she must decide how to approach teaching the course.

Student Centered Course Delivery

Hansen explains that "Music Appreciation is most commonly taught using a lecture method in face-to-face courses, with methods that include guided listening during the class meetings, in which instructors play a significant role."¹²¹ Most music history courses have traditionally been taught through a lecture and teacher focused instructional method that revolves around the teacher telling students what composers and pieces of music should be studied. This is the traditional course delivery method that is most likely to be used within the collegiate music appreciation course classroom currently.

As a result of their study to understand the change in perspective Music Appreciation students have after taking the course, Harry E. Price and Pamela Swanson conclude that "If the purpose of the course is to assist the students in developing the ability to experience greater enjoyment from listening to music of the type that is taught, then one must consider an approach that is different from the typical lecture/demonstration model that predominates in the music education profession."¹²² Linda Pohly's experiences teaching *Music History 100* have caused her to make some specific choices regarding how she teaches the course differently presently than when she initially began teaching the course providing insight for Music Appreciation instructor teaching methodology choices:

¹²¹ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 53.

¹²² Harry E. Price, and Pamela Swanson, "Changes in Musical Attitudes, Opinions, and Knowledge of Music Appreciation Students," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 38, no. 1 (1990): 45, accessed March 7, 2021, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3344828>.

The list of changes I see in myself would include: focusing more on listening and describing music and less on historical ‘facts;’ creating situations where the students can work with each other in talking or writing about music; incorporating more ‘world music’ into the semester’s topics; experimenting with and alternating the daily methods of content delivery (especially working toward less lecture and more discussion and student responses); and offering choices that accommodate students’ learning style and interests whenever feasible for testing, assignments, and projects.¹²³

Deciding on an appropriate balance between course time spent on listening to music versus time spent lecturing and discussing composers and musical era’s is an unending dilemma for professors endeavoring to best engage students.

Bridging the Music Genre Divide Between Professors and Students

Further Music Appreciation teaching experience is provided by Melissa Silverman who describes her reflections on incorporating the standard, traditional approach: “I was a victim of the ‘Music Appreciation convention,’ which had its roots in: (1) my background as a classical performer; (2) my inherited common sense of Music Appreciation as the teaching of classical masterpieces; and (3) the textbooks I encountered that focused on teaching the structural elements of classical pieces. As it turned out, my students quickly became bored, resentful, and disconnected.”¹²⁴ Silverman expresses a negative description of teaching Music Appreciation using the traditional approach. Silverman’s perspective is commonly shared by Music Appreciation instructors seeking to connect their own musical backgrounds to the music history they will be teaching for a diverse student population—each of whom possess varied musical backgrounds. Music Appreciation instructors genuinely want to share their love of music with their students to enable all the positive benefits that understanding and appreciating various

¹²³ Pohly, "Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation," 135-136.

¹²⁴ Marissa Silverman, “Rethinking Music ‘Appreciation.’” *Visions of Research in Music Education* 13 (2009) accessed February 25, 2021, <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/v13n1/Vision/aut1.pdf>.

music genres provides, yet a communication and connection divide is often represented between instructors and their students. Teachers and students will invariably relate to different music genres in distinctly individual ways.

Deborah L. Pierce presents possible and lofty goals for the Music Appreciation course:

How might we create a world empowered by music? How might we change our culture to accept music as an innate intelligence and assist others in discovering the joy, enchantment, mystery, and power of music in their daily lives? Answers to these questions might be found in redefining the content and pedagogy of Music Appreciation or music courses offered to non-majors in higher education by including elements discovered through music and pedagogical research along with active learning.¹²⁵

Experiences of Music Appreciation course instructors suggest that a revitalized course design may provide the answers to many of the current issues dealt within the Music Appreciation classroom and by the course's instructors and students. The inclusion of new ideas, new musics, and new teaching methodologies does not rule out entirely the traditional model for the course but, instead, represents a curiosity to develop a course that is effectively regenerated for today's students.

Western, Classical Music *and/or* Popular and World Musics?

Many current Music Appreciation courses continue in the firmly established historical precedent of primarily studying Western Art Music as the main body of content discussed and listened to within the course. The development of music notation within European sacred music contexts is seen as a natural starting point for the beginning of the course's content and gradually extends to including the musical developments of the Medieval period and continuing through the musical developments that extend into the post-modernist period of Western, classical music.

¹²⁵ Deborah L. Pierce, "Redefining Music Appreciation: Exploring the Power of Music," *College Music Symposium* 55 (2015) 1, accessed February 25, 2021, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26574401>.

This primary focus forms the foundation from which a detailed investigation of the foundational building blocks of music known as melody, harmony, rhythm, texture, and form are based. Students learn that these foundational music elements are found in varying combinations in classical music, popular music genres, and world musics with the primary content focus area being Western, classical music development.

Silverman provides a contrasting perspective as she negatively describes the Western, classical music focus of a free online Music Appreciation course offered by Rice University: “one can learn to ‘properly’ appreciate music by being educated through an elements-based curriculum because, supposedly, the elements cross stylistic boundaries. However, an education about the elements in Western, classical music may not yield an appreciation for ‘other’ musics.”¹²⁶ Silverman’s proclivity to include more than only classical music content is clear from her previous statement and provides insight into the unending dilemma about how much of popular and world musics content should be included in Music Appreciation courses.

Varied Research and Instructor Perspectives

Professor approaches regarding music curricula within the Music Appreciation course differ greatly. Each professor may choose what percentages of course time will be devoted to classical music, popular music, and world music respectively. Harry E. Price’s study found a “lack of a significant relationship between gains in knowledge about formal tradition music and composers and subjective rankings of composers” in student awareness upon completion of a Music Appreciation course.¹²⁷ Yet, a study by Robert H. Woody and Kimberly J. Burns

¹²⁶ Silverman, “Rethinking Music ‘Appreciation,’” 3.

¹²⁷ Harry E. Price, “The Effect of a Music Appreciation Course on Students’ Verbally Expressed Preferences for Composers,” *Journal of Research in Music Education* 36, no. 1 (1988): 43, accessed February 28, 2021, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345012>.

“suggest(s) that young adults who have had past emotional experience with classical music are more responsive to the expressive qualities of classical music and are more willing to listen to this style of music on their own time. In light of these findings, one might theorize that an integral part of Music Appreciation instruction is the opportunity for students to experience first-time emotional responses to classical music.”¹²⁸ Melanie Lowe states that her music history students “can articulate how and why such issues, concepts, and ideas as those encountered in the history of Western European music have value in their everyday lives today—as musicians, students, responsible citizens, and thinking and sensitive human beings.”¹²⁹

Mark C. Ellis explains that “In recent years, the concept of Music Appreciation has broadened to the point that both course content and approach vary considerably across institutions and instructors.”¹³⁰ Some instructors have determined that they will primarily focus on music other than classical music because most of their students are not familiar with it. Some instructors agree with Silverman’s perspective based on her research and experiences teaching Music Appreciation when she states: “it became evident early on that my students’ resentments of and discomfort with certain styles of music, and my teaching thereof, were symptomatic of much deeper issues related to issues of social justice, diversity, democratic teaching and learning, and multiculturalism.”¹³¹ These specific issues should be taken into consideration by every instructor teaching any subject including Music Appreciation.

¹²⁸ Robert H. Woody, and Kimberly J. Burns, "Predicting Music Appreciation with Past Emotional Responses to Music," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 49, no. 1 (Spring, 2001): 67, accessed March 7, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fpredicting-music-appreciation-with-past-emotional%2Fdocview%2F214475958%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

¹²⁹ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today,” 55.

¹³⁰ Ellis, "Student Perceptions of the Effects of a Course in Music Appreciation," 67.

¹³¹ Silverman, “Rethinking Music ‘Appreciation,’” 5.

Jack Talty expresses that “Formalized and structured music curricula inevitably prioritize certain components of a musical culture over others. The extent to which they accommodate diverse perspectives on a given music determines the extent to which music education eschews the construction of inflexible canons.”¹³² This perspective may result in the application of terminology such as “inflexible canons” to music development that was gradually occurring through the creativity of individuals expressing their emotions and ideas through music just as current composers continue to do—building on the creativity of past music history development. Of necessity and due to time limitations, all musical development cannot be covered within the one semester Music Appreciation course. The individual creativity and proclivities of the instructor to augment syllabus listed learning outcomes is a critical element of designing a comprehensive course.

Marjorie Roth’s perspective guides the Music Appreciation instructor to pair Western Art Music with popular music culture that students are familiar with in her earlier mentioned suggestion: “It will be your task to harmonize the classical repertoire you know so well with the popular or world music repertoire they (students) will know equally well by examining them all within the context of human experience.”¹³³ Melanie Lowe suggests that today’s students are well able to learn from traditional, classical music: “In my experience, if given the opportunity, students readily relate musical-historical course content to their own contemporary cultural experiences.”¹³⁴

¹³² Jack Talty “Noncanonical Pedagogies for Noncanonical Musics: Observations on Selected Programs in Folk, Traditional, World, and Popular Musics,” in *College Music Curricula for a New Century* ed. Robin D. Moore, (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2017) 103.

¹³³ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 145.

¹³⁴ Lowe, “Teaching Music History Today,” 48.

Balance and Respect

A balanced approach to included genres of music within the Music Appreciation course generates an attitude of respect for music preferences that will invariably surface throughout the duration of the course. Silverman explains her chosen pedagogical approach to the course: “I had one basic operating principle. All students must respect ‘otherness.’ By this I meant that everyone’s musics and musical cultures are of equal value and should be respected accordingly.”¹³⁵ This perspective is inclusionary in nature and does not force the Music Appreciation instructor to eliminate classical music content from course curriculum in an effort to prioritize world musics or popular music—or the reverse. Instead, classical music should be included in course curriculum and highly regarded for all it can teach about the development of music just as popular and world musics have the ability to also provide insights and appreciation about music development.

Student Music Preferences

Understanding how students relate to the various types of music studied with the Music Appreciation classroom guides the instructor in content delivery choices. Phillip M. Hash performed a study to understand the classical music preferences of non-music majors.¹³⁶ Though Hash suggests “acknowledge(ing) the value of multiple genres”¹³⁷ and “not misrepresent(ing) this music (classical) as superior to that of other cultures and traditions,”¹³⁸ Hash found that “repertoire of the Classical era might have received the highest preference ratings because it is

¹³⁵ Silverman, “Rethinking Music ‘Appreciation,’” 19.

¹³⁶ Hash, “Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music.”

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, 21.

¹³⁸ *Ibid.*

the most similar in structure and organization to contemporary popular music—demonstrating well-defined phrases, slow harmonic rhythm, and an obvious melody within a homophonic texture.”¹³⁹ Hash’s study indicates a change to standard Music Appreciation course content delivery timeline that traditionally begins with the music of the Medieval Era and concludes in Post-Modernist repertoire. Hash’s findings suggest that Music Appreciation instructors may consider beginning the course studying the music of the Classical era because of the connections that may be made between today’s popular music and the music of the Classical Era providing a viable strategy for developing student understanding of classical music. This entry into classical music can then be progressively built upon by studying the evolution of classical music before and after the Classical era.

Possibilities For Teaching the Elements of Music in Various Musical Genres

Connecting elements of classical music that may seem foreign to music or concepts that are relatable to students provides an avenue for appreciation for non-music major students. Timothy Green states that “Students will discover the elements of music in their own music and then discover and connect those elements in classical music. By asking exploratory questions during this process, students will learn to think critically about music.”¹⁴⁰ Green seems to suggest introducing the elements of music to students in music they are familiar with first. The traditional introduction of these elements is usually taught by referencing the classical music historical eras that these elements developed within—in varying combinations during the Medieval, Renaissance, Baroque, and Classical eras.

¹³⁹ Hash, "Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music," 18.

¹⁴⁰ Green, "Music Appreciation: Bridging the Gap between Generation Z & Classical Music," 25.

Practical Solutions

Roth provides an example of a practical solution for introducing one of the foundational elements of music—form, more specifically the sonata form structure to students: “Sonata form, another important structure in Western, classical music, can be made more accessible to non-musicians by introducing it as a kind of narrative drama. The development section can be explored by considering the impressions made by the way the composer chose to dissect and deploy the characteristics of each theme.”¹⁴¹ These types of practical teaching practices make classical music more relatable to Music Appreciation students.

Music Appreciation Course Outcomes

Though debate continues regarding the inclusion of popular music within traditional Western, classical Music Appreciation course curriculum, a study conducted by Mark C. Ellis concluded that “Whereas respondents rated their pre-course ‘appreciation of classical music’ lowest among the seven appreciation questions, they also rated this quality as the most changed as a result of the course.”¹⁴² Effective teaching within the course can result in successful student understanding of new genres of music including classical music—further supporting its continued inclusion in curriculum content.

Textbook Choice

The same controversy appears when the Music Appreciation instructor determines a course textbook. Hafer explains that Music Appreciation textbooks “carefully cultivate an applied awareness of musical elements reinforced by examples drawn largely from Western Art

¹⁴¹ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 151.

¹⁴² Ellis, “Student Perceptions of the Effects of a Course in Music Appreciation,” 79-80.

Music.” Variations on this basic model—and, indeed, variations on Appreciation courses in general—are contingent upon the learning outcomes developed at the outset of the class.”¹⁴³ The Music Appreciation instructor is reminded yet again of the importance of determining course design and choosing a textbook that reflects this choice. The textbook of choice should maintain the chosen course design and approach providing continuity to enhance student learning.

Pohly states that Music Appreciation instructors deal with a “choice of balance - covering some topics in depth and others less so, teaching fewer topics in greater detail, or tackling more topics but each in a more general way. In my opinion, this choice is difficult, and it contradicts those who think that anyone on the music teaching staff can easily teach non-majors.”¹⁴⁴ Pohly’s reflection on the difficulty of finding balance in choosing a course textbook further highlights the Music Appreciation instructor’s necessary focus on course direction in order to make a correlating textbook choice.¹⁴⁵

Textbook Solution

Pohly states: “My experience has shown that finding a textbook and adding lecture notes that create a contextual balance between ‘cut and dried,’ concrete information and more subtle ideas and developments is important.”¹⁴⁶ Roth additionally suggests “Choose the music you love most when you teach non-majors; you will be most convincing when you do so.”¹⁴⁷

¹⁴³ Hafer, “A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation,” 59-60.

¹⁴⁴ Pohly, “Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation,” 133.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., 132-133.

¹⁴⁷ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 150.

Learner Centered Course Design

Active Learning Components

Pierce reflects on the use of active learning mechanisms within Music Appreciation courses: “While the benefits of active learning are well established, it is rarely included in music classes beyond K-12. Even though music is a natural active learning partner and has been widely used to teach other concepts in non-music classrooms, the focus of non-major music courses in higher education is still predominantly the historical survey.”¹⁴⁸ Pierce’s observation echoes Hansen’s previously referenced statement about the commonly used lecture based format covering primarily Western Art Music within Music Appreciation courses.¹⁴⁹

Woody and Swanson explain that “One might envision a course that includes participatory experiences, teaching of cognitive knowledge and positive affect for works, followed by attempts to make the necessary transfers to all music of the genre taught, so that students might leave the classroom with a positive feeling about the music and possibly choose to pursue it independently through further study, concert attendance, and/or recording purchases.”¹⁵⁰

Nierman and Veak’s research also points to the positive impact of participatory musical learning experiences: “It seems that the concrete experience of playing recorder is more effective than a demonstration curriculum or no instruction of any kind in increasing students’ selection of playing an instrument over other activities.”¹⁵¹ Nierman and Veak additionally explain that “the

¹⁴⁸ Pierce, “Redefining Music Appreciation,” 2.

¹⁴⁹ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 53.

¹⁵⁰ Price, and Swanson, “Changes in Musical Attitudes,” 45.

¹⁵¹ Nierman, and Veak, “Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies,” 387.

tendency to achieve success is influenced by the probability of success and the attractiveness of achieving it. Thus, a successful exploratory experience with the recorder is likely to make a similar experience (such as playing a wind or stringed instrument) attractive.”¹⁵² Though the playing of recorders in Music Appreciation may not be a realistic possibility, participatory Music Appreciation course elements would have the potential to be applied to the understanding of classical, popular, and world musics equally.

Student Centered Curriculum

Amanda E. Krause and Jane W. Davidson’s research to understand how to facilitate life-long makers of music perspectives in education describes that: “Educators needed to think beyond their own musical experience and knowledge in order to incorporate additional musics to provide more culturally diverse experiences for their own students. This seemed to involve creating opportunities in which they could guide students in their pursuits via learner-centered and learner-directed environments.”¹⁵³ By incorporating a learner centered curriculum, Music Appreciation courses engage student interest through the invitation to students to help guide course learning.

Teachers and students may need an acclimation period when incorporating a learner centered curriculum. Conway states that “True learner-centered classrooms challenge the power structures that are traditional in educational settings...Students will need to ‘learn how to learn’ in the learner-centered classroom as many students have come from other classroom settings that did not allow for student interaction, dialogue, and contribution.”¹⁵⁴ Initially, students may be

¹⁵² Nierman, and Veak, "Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies," 381-382.

¹⁵³ Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson, "Effective Educational Strategies to Promote Life-Long Musical Investment: Perceptions of Educators," *Frontiers in Psychology* 9, (2018): 7, accessed March 7, 2021, <https://doi.org/article/41e4952c898a4f908951a0124bbb9752>.

surprised that their instructors are allowing them to have a meaningful role in directing student learning in the learner centered classroom, but will eventually become invested in their new learning role.

Collaborative/Constructivist Learning

A learner centered approach that is possible within the Music Appreciation classroom is the collaborative learning methodology that engages students as active participants in directing their learning. Maryellen Weimer's 2013 book states: "Teaching that promotes learning is not teaching that endlessly tells students what they should do and what they should know. Rather it promotes learning by facilitating the acquisition of knowledge. The hard and messy work of learning can be done only by students."¹⁵⁵ Students in the Music Appreciation classroom will always need the facilitating of a knowledgeable instructor to guide learning, but the instructor should also guide learning in a way that students realize the importance of what they are learning and understand the possibilities that learning represents in their daily lives. The musical knowledge gained and experienced within the Music Appreciation course enables future music listening enjoyment and has the potential to impact the music performing interest of students for the rest of their lives.

Colleen Conway explains the positives and negatives of incorporating a collaborative learning perspective when she explains that "Learning to be independent thinkers and problem solvers is important for students in music classes. Collaborative learning provides a place for this learning. However, the restrictions of the real world in regard to syllabus, policies, curriculum,

¹⁵⁴ Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 122.

¹⁵⁵ Weimer, *Learner-Centered Teaching*, 10.

and assessment make a purely collaborative approach to teaching music classes difficult.”¹⁵⁶ Conway’s realistic approach suggests that the Music appreciation course instructor pursues avenues of collaborative learning interwoven with other teacher prescribed learning methodologies in order to allow for learner centered knowledge acquisition in addition to maintaining adherence to necessary course learning objectives. Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba further support Conway’s perspective. Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba explain that “Cognitive constructivists advocate for anchored instruction whereby the learning environments are designed to provoke the kinds of thoughtful engagement that helps students develop effective thinking skills and attitudes that contribute to effective problem solving and critical thinking. As a result, students should be able to independently explore an information space to obtain content, higher level concepts and learn how to learn.”¹⁵⁷

Course Presentation Materials

Equally Accessible Information for All Students

Another Music Appreciation course aspect that requires careful consideration is the use of various information delivery formats. Jessica Halpern states “analytical information containing written musical examples, which is useful and interesting to the music major, will be virtually valueless to the average student taking such a course. Analytical information presented without written musical examples, however, is often perceived as wordy, confusing, and dull, and according to the results of this study, such an approach may do little to enhance non-musicians’ overall appreciation of music.”¹⁵⁸ Music Appreciation instructors must continually

¹⁵⁶ Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 184-185.

¹⁵⁷ Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba, "Promoting Effective e-Learning Practices," 889.

¹⁵⁸ Halpern, "Effects of Historical and Analytical Teaching Approaches," 45.

seek to provide course content in delivery formats that are relevant for students with musical background experiences and that are equally understandable and relevant for students with only minimal amounts of musical background experience and for those who may not read music notation.

Media

Lewis' study of the responses of non-music student to various instructional methods in Music Appreciation courses found that "The mean for Videos/DVDs was above 4.5; therefore, this strategy was 'strongly liked' by the students. The means for the CDs, Live Performances, Slides, and Computer Demonstrations were between 4.0 and 4.49, indicating that they were 'liked.' Lecture, with a mean of 3.63 was the lowest mean in the 'like' category."¹⁵⁹ Students seemed to respond poorly when instructors choose to lecture for the majority of the course's class periods, yet students were more engaged when other instructional strategies for providing important information were used such as media presentations and live performances. Woody and Burns' findings point out that: "Although there remains uncertainty regarding the most effective approach for delivering Music Appreciation instruction, the results of this study suggest that music educators should consider their students' emotion-related musical experiences and beliefs and plan instructional activities that facilitate students' emotional responses to presented pieces of classical music."¹⁶⁰

¹⁵⁹ Lewis, "University Non-Major Student Reactions," 46-47.

¹⁶⁰ Woody and Burns, "Predicting Music Appreciation," 68.

Meaning Through Questions

James Davis causes the Music Appreciation instructor to analyze the specific questions being asked within the course: “Though sometimes appearing to be simple questions, what I termed aesthetic questions often entail numerous layers of pre-processing. Though the teacher may have a very specific thought or issue in mind when asking such a question, it may actually inhibit the students and put them in the position where they cannot answer even the most basic aspects of the original question.”¹⁶¹ Questions that may initially seem to be completely open ended, may essentially be suggesting a specific type of response without the instructor or student realizing the inference. Sometimes an implied focus in a question is helpful for students to generate an answer, but sometimes it prevents the very creativity that the question was meant to provoke.

Listening Skill Development

A significant portion of the Music Appreciation course is devoted to helping students who do not yet have a musical vocabulary and are not used to analyzing music to develop tangible listening skills and verbal terminology in order to identify what they are hearing in music. Enz explains that “The music community seems to be in agreement that the development of perceptive listening skills is a primary concern in college music courses for non-majors.”¹⁶²

Students taking Music Appreciation courses will have very definite ideas and observations about the music examples studied in class but may be discouraged in the course because they do not have the tools to express their ideas specifically enough. Hafer offers pedagogical suggestions to assist with this difficulty: “I have found that juxtaposing extremely

¹⁶¹ Davis, “Aesthetic Questions and Questions of Aesthetics,” 92.

¹⁶² Enz, “Teaching Music to the Non-Major,” 36.

different musical excerpts is a useful tool to generate audience participation. Listeners seem to gain confidence as they respond to music that is unmistakably dissimilar.”¹⁶³ As students hear stark differences in musical examples, they are able to confidently identify contrasting musical excerpts and gradually build understanding and terminology at the same time.

Attendance Policy

Music Appreciation courses devote a high percentage of class time to listening to musical examples. Though the student that argues that he or she can listen to these musical examples at any time and being at class does not affect their ability to complete listening assignments, only *in class* does the student have the benefit of listening to musical examples with analysis provided by the instructor and the other students in the class. Hafer states: “I suggest that they maintain a fairly stringent attendance policy since there is no way for an absentee to recapture the lost experience of guided, critical listening.”¹⁶⁴ Students must be in class participate in repeated guided listening experience with input from their peers in order to gain the full benefit of the course.

Music Making

Roth recommends extensive inclusion of student music making within Music Appreciation courses to facilitate experiential learning.¹⁶⁵ Roth suggests including clapping games, simple Gregorian chants, and the use of small percussion instruments.¹⁶⁶ Roth continues

¹⁶³ Hafer, “A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation,” 66.

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, 64.

¹⁶⁵ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors.”

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 152-153.

to explain that “Even rudimentary experience with composition is possible in a Music Appreciation classroom.”¹⁶⁷ These opportunities to make music in the Music Appreciation course also serve as opportunities to re-engage students in making music as a continuation of their school music education experiences.

Music Appreciation Instructor Preparation

Teachers of Music Appreciation courses rarely are provided with targeted instructional pedagogies for teaching music history and musical elements to non-music major students. Collegiate music students’ preparation includes music history but does not traditionally include preparation to teach music history—especially to non-music majors. Conway explains reasons why: “Since so much of music instruction focuses on the ‘apprentice’ model that is common in the applied studio it is sometimes difficult for the new professor or graduate instructor to find what might be called their ‘teaching persona’ in a learner-centered larger classroom context.”¹⁶⁸ Several music degree graduate programs have made a conscious effort to begin offering a course to specifically prepare music students to teach Music Appreciation in their future.

Ball State University

Linda Pohly provides insights about preparing Music Appreciation instructors from her experiences teaching the course, Music History 602: Teaching Introduction to Music at Ball State University.¹⁶⁹ Pohly’s insights not only encompass a graduate course to prepare music students to teach Music Appreciation in the future, but also specific advice from her teaching of

¹⁶⁷ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors.”

¹⁶⁸ Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 121.

¹⁶⁹ Pohly, “Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation.”

Music Appreciation.¹⁷⁰ From this background of teaching knowledge, Pohly makes specific recommendations to future Music Appreciation instructors that are applicable to all instructors in the field: “the most common flaw that I detect among the students in their mock teaching is trying to cram too much material into the time allotted. A teacher should seek a balance between ‘so much, so fast that the student is overwhelmed’ and ‘so little or such general information that the topic seems irrelevant.’”¹⁷¹

University of Southern Mississippi

Edward Hafer teaches a similar type of graduate level Music Appreciation teacher preparation course at the University of Southern Mississippi: Pedagogy of Music Appreciation seminar.¹⁷² Hafer makes parallel suggestions to those of Pohly regarding the amount of content prepared for each class period by Music Appreciation instructors.¹⁷³ “The sometimes daunting prospect of talking for fifty minutes distracts inexperienced teachers from realizing that it often takes longer than they think to explain and reinforce basic material. They (instructors) need to think about covering fewer topics so that each lesson has a clear introduction, explanation of relevant points, active listening, and a final summary.”¹⁷⁴

¹⁷⁰ Pohly, “Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation.”

¹⁷¹ Ibid., 137.

¹⁷² Hafer, “A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation.”

¹⁷³ Ibid.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid., 64.

The Online Music Appreciation Course

Curriculum

Online Music Appreciation courses require the same thoughtful and careful decision making process that is afforded to traditional, seated Music Appreciation courses in order to provide the best online learning experience of Music Appreciation course content adapted to the online environment. Hansen explains “As you consider designing curriculum for an online Music Appreciation course or transitioning an existing curriculum to the online platform, your chief concerns will be to determine goals for the course, select the content and curriculum, and determine the most effective methods through which to engage students in learning.”¹⁷⁵ Music Appreciation instructors must continually keep in mind intended learning outcomes regardless of traditional or online delivery format.

Approaches

Course design approach and curriculum content is equally important in the online Music Appreciation course delivery format. Hansen states “Along the way, you may consider whether you will focus entirely on the repertoire of Western Art Music, whether you will attempt to feature a significant instructor-lecturing role, or whether you will strike out into new methods and approaches while exploring the online course as something novel with its own opportunities rather than an attempt to duplicate traditional, live courses.”¹⁷⁶ Hansen’s statement is again representative of the existing controversies regarding content inclusion of various music and learning approaches.

¹⁷⁵ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 53.

¹⁷⁶ *Ibid.*

Resources

Online Music Appreciation courses may mirror the learning experiences of a traditional format course in approach and design while also including specialized resources that are modified from those used in a seated course to help ensure equitable learning outcomes for the online course format. Kim Davenport's experience designing an online Music Appreciation course yielded specific resources for online Music Appreciation teachers since she did not use a traditional textbook and, instead, used sources such as YouTube and the Naxos Music Library.¹⁷⁷ Davenport further explains that "using the lecture-capture software Panopto, I am able to share with students a single presentation which includes PowerPoint slides, video of my accompanying lecture, as well as musical examples."¹⁷⁸ By using these types of technologies, the Music Appreciation instructor is well supplied with resources to replicate the in-person classroom experience for the online classroom format.

Online Classroom Discussions

An area of significant difference between the in-person learning environment and the virtual learning environment is found within the aspect of course discussions. Peer discussions about musical excerpts listened to during the course are critical for the learning that occurs in the Music Appreciation course. These discussions initially seem to be more easily enabled in the traditional course delivery method, yet the positives to implementation of online discussion boards are well known such as the ability for all students to confidently take part in online discussion boards even if they may not feel comfortable speaking up in a regular course format

¹⁷⁷ Davenport, "All My Students Are Non-Majors."

¹⁷⁸ Ibid.

as is highlighted in Cass M. Johnson's research.¹⁷⁹ Of the students who participated in Johnson's study, they

freely exchanged ideas and expounded upon each other's concepts. As a group they began with an artifact and prompt provided by the instructor, carried the ideas to new levels, and opened up new avenues for exploration and understanding. Despite the fact that these students were all considered "developmental" learners, their discussions reflected insight and connection to personal experience, and a willingness to exchange stories and ideas in such a way that they understood the nature of connecting ideas and developing deeper meanings within a group context.¹⁸⁰

Johnson summarizes her work and the positive potential of using discussion boards within the online classroom by stating:

This study shows that students within the online classroom were able to construct deeper meanings in classroom dialogues through thoughtful and personal contributions, thereby reaching new understandings through collaborative discussion. This study contends that through insightful planning and guided responses, instructors can manage online classroom discussions to better direct student communications in order to improve collaborative learning and knowledge construction.¹⁸¹

Hansen supports Johnson's claims regarding the viability of interaction that occurs within the online Music Appreciation course's discussion boards: "There are engaging things inherent in online learning that are different from traditional, live courses. Because online education is conducted through the Internet and involves computer technologies or mobile devices, it can be a more interactive experience for both the learner and the teacher."¹⁸² Hansen further explains that: "Forum discussions have the advantage of being able to host YouTube links, presentations, and virtually anything that is available online or in a presentation format."¹⁸³ Students have the

¹⁷⁹ Johnson, "Rethinking Online Discourse."

¹⁸⁰ Ibid., 1501.

¹⁸¹ Johnson, "Rethinking Online Discourse," 1483.

¹⁸² Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 13.

ability to watch media presentations within the discussion board setting and directly discuss the content with their peers in a similar manner to the discussions that would take place in a classroom, yet students have the advantage of taking their time in responding and not feeling pressured to talk in front of a group of people.

Hansen's experience and Johnson's findings characterize the positive learning activity that is possible when utilizing online discussion boards to facilitate peer discussions within the virtual classroom environment that can be equally as effective as the class discussions that occur within the traditional delivery course format.

Learner Centered

The research of Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba's highlights the learner centered possibilities of the online Music Appreciation course: "E-learning is learner-centered in multiple ways. First, is it primarily designed around the learner, allows for self-paced learning, and provides students with opportunities to speed up or slow down as necessary."¹⁸⁴ Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba point to the opportunities that exist for transferring the learner centered approach of the traditional, seated Music Appreciation course format to the online classroom environment. Students are able to approach the content they will be learning about in their own unique ways and then use course discussion boards to explain their learning to course peers.

¹⁸³ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 17.

¹⁸⁴ Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba, "Promoting Effective e-Learning Practices," 888.

| Music Appreciation Methodology Best Practices¹⁸⁵ <i>Table 2</i> | |
|--|--|
| Source of Recommendation | Best Practices |
| Linda Pohly (2007) | “Seek a <i>balance</i> between ‘so much, so fast that the student is overwhelmed’ and ‘so little or such general information that the topic seems irrelevant.’” ¹⁸⁶ |
| | “Focusing more on listening and describing music and less on historical ‘facts.’” ¹⁸⁷ |
| Edward Hafer (2012) | “Covering <i>fewer topics</i> so that each lesson has a clear introduction, explanation of relevant points, active listening, and a final summary.” ¹⁸⁸ |
| | “ <i>Juxtaposing</i> extremely different musical excerpts.” ¹⁸⁹ |
| | Relatively <i>strict attendance</i> policy. ¹⁹⁰ |
| Phillip M. Hash (2009) | Begin course classical music content with music from the <i>Classical Era</i> . ¹⁹¹ |
| Cass M. Johnson (2015) | Online courses should include <i>teacher led discussion boards</i> . ¹⁹² |
| Marjorie Roth (2012) | The instructor should <i>choose the music he or she loves most!</i> ¹⁹³ |

¹⁸⁵ Rebecka Rose, “Music Appreciation Methodology Best Practices,” (March 23, 2021).

¹⁸⁶ Pohly, “Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation,” 137.

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 135-136.

¹⁸⁸ Hafer, “A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation,” 64.

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 66.

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 64.

¹⁹¹ Hash, “Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music,” 19.

¹⁹² Johnson, “Rethinking Online Discourse,” 1501.

¹⁹³ Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 150.

| | |
|---|---|
| Barbara Lewis (2016) | Including more <i>media presentations and live performances and less lecture</i> for better student response. ¹⁹⁴ |
| Harry E. Price, and Pamela Swanson (1990) | “One must consider an <i>approach that is different from the typical lecture/demonstration model</i> that predominates in the music education profession.” ¹⁹⁵ |
| Robert H. Woody, and Kimberly J. Burns (2001) | “Opportunity for students to <i>experience first-time emotional responses to classical music.</i> ” ¹⁹⁶ |
| Amanda E. Krause, and Jane W. Davidson (2018) Jared Keengwe, Grace Onchwari, and Joachim Agamba (2014) | “Learner-centered and learner-directed environments.” ¹⁹⁷ 198 |
| Colleen M. Conway (2020) | Collaborative Learning ¹⁹⁹ |

Section II: Collegiate Music Ensemble Non-Music Major Participation Trends

All students graduating from high school in the United States have experienced some amount of music education, yet lifelong music making is not engaged in by most American adults. Mantie and Tucker state that “we stand by our assertion that at present, far too few graduates of school music programs continue to actively participate in music making.”²⁰⁰ Understanding this lack of continuance in music making is necessary in order to find ways to change this trend. Mantie and Dorfman state that:

¹⁹⁴ Lewis, “University Non-Major Student Reactions,” 46-47.

¹⁹⁵ Price, and Swanson, “Changes in Musical Attitudes,” 45.

¹⁹⁶ Woody and Burns, “Predicting Music Appreciation,” 67.

¹⁹⁷ Krause and Davidson, “Effective Educational Strategies,” 7.

¹⁹⁸ Keengwe, Onchwari, and Agamba, “Promoting Effective e-Learning Practices,” 888.

¹⁹⁹ Conway, *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 184-185.

²⁰⁰ Mantie and Tucker, “Closing the Gap,” 218.

A primary rationale for music in U.S. schools cited in professional literature from the 1930's to the 1970's was that school music learning should result in adult music production (i.e., making) not just consumption (i.e., listening)...Notwithstanding the music appreciation movement following the introduction of the phonography and radio in the earlier part of the century and prior to its eventual eclipsing during the "aesthetic education" movement of the late twentieth century, the concept of carry-over serves as a reminder of a long-standing belief that the proof of school music's success was to be measured not according to an individual's developed sense of aesthetic appreciation, but according to the percentage of school music graduates whose musical learning "carried over" into adult life as singers or players.²⁰¹

The College Years: One Last Formal Opportunity

This decline in music making perpetuation may be mitigated by taking advantage of the opportunity to develop or continue developing lifelong makers of music during the collegiate experience. The educational efforts completed by school music educators can be solidified through music courses taken in college—expanding the impacts of school music education programs in the lives of students for many decades to come. Mantie states that "If the collegiate years as a period of emerging adulthood are indeed liminal (part child, part adult), they would seem an optimal time for solidifying the potential for viewing active music making as part of a healthy, desirable lifestyle."²⁰² The capstone of school music programs could be found in music courses for non-music college students paired with opportunities to perform in collegiate music ensemble groups. This inclusionary focus of collegiate Schools of Music would extend the work of school music programs and provide a wealth of musical options to college students when deciding if and how they would like to maintain their music making habits into adulthood.

²⁰¹ Mantie, and Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors," 41-42.

²⁰² Roger A. Mantie, "Structure and Agency in University-Level Recreational Music Making." *Music Education Research* 15, no. 1 (2013): 56-Conclusion, accessed December 17, 2020, doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2012.722076.

Collegiate Music Ensemble Non-Music Major Low Participation Factors

University music ensemble participation by non-music majors usually tends to be low. A range of factors have been shown to impact this trend. Michael Stewart's research focus regarding non-music majors' participation in music ensembles at Ohio State University found that the decisions on the subject of music ensemble participation made by non-music majors are usually made before students begin their university level education.²⁰³ Stewart's work found that a variety of considerations influence non-music majors away from continuing to make music during their higher education experience including "(a) time conflict with other courses; (b) an overall declining interest in band; (c) concerns about academic course load; (d) musical proficiency; (e) fear of auditioning; (f) lack of information about the college band program; and (g) negative high school band experiences."²⁰⁴ Mantie and Tucker's joint research also confirmed the concern non-music majors may feel regarding not possessing a high enough level of music skill as a factor preventing non-music students from fully engaging in possibilities for collegiate music ensemble participation.²⁰⁵

These types of factors cause new college students to have apprehension when determining if they would like to include a music ensemble experience as part of their extracurricular activities during college since students realize that significant time resources must be devoted to their primary academic focus and they are not sure how the college scheduling experience will work out yet. High school schedules are packed full of academics and activities,

²⁰³ Stewart, "A Study of First -Year Students within the Ohio State University," Abstract.

²⁰⁴ Ibid.

²⁰⁵ Mantie and Tucker, "Closing the Gap," 225.

and students have not experienced the differences in college scheduling that allow for the inclusion of additional educational and enriching activities such as music ensemble participation.

Ardis R. Faber provides additional information involving possible contributing factors to the low participation trends in music ensembles by non-music majors phenomenon resulting from research conducted to understand non-music major participation in music ensemble courses in colleges in Indiana:

This study grew out of three major trends that the writer has observed over several years while teaching in a small college setting in Indiana. First, there has been a noticeable decline in participation of non-music majors. Second, students are not generally encouraged by college advisors to consider participating in music ensembles on the college campus and thus miss an important benefit gained through exposure to the arts as young adults. Third, the motivation for students to participate in musical activities appears to be more extrinsic than intrinsic, rather than a balance of the two.²⁰⁶

Faber's study provides insight into how college students need to be provided with information about musical opportunities by the same advisors that are explaining all the other opportunities available to students on campus. A simple lack of information can result in a squandered opportunity for musical engagement for students.

Faber's identification of intrinsic and extrinsic motivation factors being relevant to non-music major collegiate music ensemble participation suggests the importance of incoming freshman non-music majors being exposed to musical opportunities that exist for them on campus. Many campuses expend significant resources in generating exciting introductory experiences that often include special music elements. If the college's own music ensembles were included in these types of events (not just in School of Music recruitment events), students

²⁰⁶ Faber, "A Study of Factors that Influence First-Year Non-music Majors' Decisions," 6.

in attendance would immediately be able to envision themselves performing with these musical ensembles.

Lack of Prior Musical Collaborative Learning

If the perspective towards music making that music students develop regarding their individual music practices during middle and high school revolve primarily around short-term performance goals, a cessation of music ensemble performance may be considered natural after completion of high school. Mantie and Tucker explain this possible factor leading to declining participation in music ensembles after high school: “When students do not see themselves as co-participants, the motivation for learning is distorted. Students turn their attention to such things as test marks, grades, or the next festival or performance. They simply do not envision what they do as leading towards an in-the-world social practice.”²⁰⁷

Engaging students consistently as leaders in their own educational efforts promotes a mindset of participation when learning for students. Practicing for a scales test and extra rehearsals because of an upcoming competition are short-term musical goals that are necessary and useful but must also be connected with real world musical application. Music students must understand how the development of these basic technical skills allows them to be comfortable enough making music to really enjoy the process, instead of being always held back from the creative process because they do not possess thorough and maintained musicianship skill. Students will not be able to pick up their instrument and spontaneously join in group music making if they cannot play in every key easily, if they cannot play with correct intonation, or if

²⁰⁷ Mantie and Tucker, “Closing the Gap,” 221.

they do not know how to play by ear. Students need to understand how the process of acquiring these musicianship skills paves the way for their easy and enjoyable future music making.

**Non-Music Major Motivations to Not Participate in
Collegiate Performing Ensembles²⁰⁸**

Table 3

| Source of Recommendation | Motivation Factors |
|--------------------------|---|
| Michael Stewart (2007) | “Time conflict with other courses.” |
| | “An overall declining interest in band.” |
| | “Concerns about academic course load.” |
| | “Musical Proficiency” |
| | “Fear of Auditioning.” |
| | “Lack of information about the college band program.” |
| | “Negative high school band experiences.” ²⁰⁹ |
| Mantie and Tucker (2008) | Lack of Musical Skill ²¹⁰ |
| | Students “simply do not envision what they do as leading towards an in-the-world social practice.” ²¹¹ |
| Ardis R. Faber (2010) | College advisors not providing enough information. ²¹² |

²⁰⁸ Rebecka Rose, “Non-Music Major Motivations to Not Participate in Collegiate Performing Ensembles,” (March 23, 2021).

²⁰⁹ Stewart, "A Study of First -Year Students within the Ohio State University," Abstract.

²¹⁰ Mantie and Tucker, “Closing the Gap,” 225.

²¹¹ Ibid., 221.

²¹² Faber, "A Study of Factors," 6.

| | |
|--|--|
| | Lack of a balance between extrinsic and intrinsic motivation. ²¹³ |
|--|--|

Music Majors Versus Non-Music Majors Music Interests

Music majors entering their college years may be interested in different musical pursuits than their non-music major counterparts. Music majors are often concerned with the musical skill level of an ensemble and specific classical genre repertoire, but non-music majors may have a very different perspective. As previously highlighted in this study's literature review, Jones explains that "It is important for the music education community to understand the musical motivation and experiences of university students from fields outside of music in order to better serve this demographic and possibly encourage more non-music majors to participate in university ensembles."²¹⁴ Gaining an understanding of factors that influence non-music majors to want to participate in music performing ensembles provides invaluable information to music schools and to the conductors of music ensembles to enable these institutions to meet the musical needs of non-music major students.

Lack of Continuity Between School and Collegiate Music Education

High school music educators and collegiate schools of music need to form a cohesive association that links high school music students to collegiate music opportunities. This connection allows students to have a vision of continuing to play or sing music in college after high school graduation. Sara K. Jones states: "Regardless of whether university students' lack of participation in ensembles is due to missing social structures or factors such as time, schedule

²¹³ Faber, "A Study of Factors," 6.

²¹⁴ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 252-253.

conflicts, and declining interest, music educators should not ignore the attrition of music students after high school.”²¹⁵ These realities form significant impediments that may prevent non-music majors from making the investment of time necessary to participate in a music ensemble during their college experience. Non-music majors may be far more likely to participate in a collegiate sports team or club due the time investment being perceived as much less than a music ensemble performing group. Disregarding the steep participation decline in music ensembles by college non-music majors after high school reflects an attitude of acceptance of the trend that impacts students negatively.

Private Lessons Study Opportunities Are Available for Non-Music Major Students

The valuable resource of applied private music lessons taught by either graduate music major students or by the music department’s faculty are commonly available within university music departments for non-music majors. Students who have never played an instrument or taken formal voice lessons are able to take lessons and improve as makers of music with an instructor who is proficient in the student’s chosen vocal or instrumental specialty. If incoming college freshmen students do not realize that an avenue for musical skill development such as private lessons are available to them as non-music majors, the Music Appreciation course provides an opportunity to direct students to this possibility.

Collegiate Performing Opportunities Exist for Non-Music Major Students

High school students need to understand that collegiate music ensembles are interested in them even if these high school musicians are not planning on majoring in music. Most universities do not limit music ensemble participation to only those students who are pursuing a

²¹⁵ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 252.

music major or minor degree program. Some universities will have one or two music ensembles that are only open to music-major students but will also have several additional music ensembles that allow open enrollment to any university student who is interested in the ensemble regardless of chosen degree program.²¹⁶ The Music Appreciation course provides an ideal opportunity to expose non-music majors to these opportunities that they may have not found out about yet through other avenues.

Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Population Make-Up

Music ensembles at institutions that confer four-year degrees are primarily made up of students who are pursuing a music major or minor with concentrations in music performance, music education, music theory, music composition, sacred music, music business, or music technology.²¹⁷ These degrees all require music ensemble credits generating the high percentage of music major population enrollment found within university performing ensembles. This situation often causes non-music majors to think that these ensembles are only for music majors or that they must pass an audition to participate in these ensembles.

Open Enrollment Music Ensembles

Open enrollment music ensembles usually do not require an audition and include repertoire from a wide variety of musical genres. Some of these music ensembles go on tours just like the audition required music performing ensembles that are made up primarily of music majors. Open enrollment ensembles may sometimes still be made up primarily of music majors but offer the opportunity for non-music majors to continue making music after completion of

²¹⁶ Menghini, "Getting Your Students Ready for College and University Band Programs," 18.

²¹⁷ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 255.

their high school music education program. Charles T. Menghini states, “Students who will be attending college and don’t plan on majoring in music need to know that most colleges and universities have a place for them. Although they may not make the premier ensemble as a non-music major, there are bands and orchestras where they can continue to play their instrument and they can also arrange to study privately.”²¹⁸ The Music Appreciation course should make this information available to students.

Non-Music Major Existing Motivation to Participate in Performing Ensembles

Sara K. Jones’ study investigated the influences that cause non-music majors to partake in collegiate music ensembles.²¹⁹ Though the previously discussed factors cause a high percentage of non-music majors to not participate in music ensembles in college, Jones explored the motivation factors of non-music majors that do chose to participate in music ensembles in college. Despite the perceived time commitment, the feelings of not possessing enough skill, and not having enough information initially, some non-music major students choose to participate in college music performance anyway. Jones provides understanding of the motivational factors of these students: “All of the participants in Harmonix (a student-led mostly non-music major a capella group) indicated that they wanted both a musical and social experience.”²²⁰

Providing a contrasting context, Jones’ study also investigated the motivations of music majors to participate in another vocal performing group—Campus Choir which was made up mainly by music majors. Jones explained that the students who were performing with the Campus Choir were more focused on musical experiences instead of social experiences based on

²¹⁸ Menghini, "Getting Your Students Ready for College and University Band Programs," 18.

²¹⁹ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation."

²²⁰ Ibid., 256.

their survey responses.²²¹ Of the differing perspectives reflected between music major and non-music major performance ensemble participation motivation Jones explains that: “While an a capella ensemble may be a natural fit for students seeking a means for building relationships through music, the traditional choral ensemble might be more suited for students who are solely seeking a musical outlet.”²²²

Non-music majors are seeking to continue making music, but they are also very much interested in gaining a musical community from participating in collegiate music ensembles. A music major may be more concerned with performing in an ensemble that will improve their ability to be achieve a future audition, but the non-music major seeks great music making while enjoying the social connections of being involved in that musical ensemble also. These generalities will not apply to all students, but research results such as these provide insight about what musical ensembles could be created specifically for various student types.

Though college students are experiencing the freedom of choosing what activities they will participate in outside of their academic pursuits, the parental support they experienced prior to their college experience and the parental support experienced during college continues to motivate students to participate in performing music ensembles. Veronica O. Sichivitsa’s findings disclose that “the analysis showed that students whose parents were involved in music and supportive of their children’s musical participation developed better self-concepts in music, consequently felt more comfortable in choir academically and socially, valued music more, and as a result developed higher motivation to participate in various musical activities in the

²²¹ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 256-257.

²²² Ibid., 257.

future.”²²³ Gregory C. Hurley’s research further reveals the importance of parent support in generating interest in music performing:

While the students in this study did not address parental influences as affecting their motivations for beginning string instrumental instruction in a direct manner, the sheer number of students who had a parent involved with instrumental music presents a convincing argument that parents, indeed, did influence the child's initial expectations and values. Even though the parents of these students rarely verbalized that participation in an instrumental class was expected of the student, the students' recognition that parents played instruments for enjoyment led to the perception that instrumental music instruction would be worthy of study.²²⁴

Non-Music Majors' Enjoyment of Making Music

Music major students make their primary academic focus the further development of musical skill because they envision a career in music and they love making music. Ryan V. Scherber’s research explains that non-music major students experience that same love of music.²²⁵ “The most popular factor has been that of a love for music. Many of these participants appear to enjoy participating for intrinsic reasons, such as improving their skills and experience high quality repertoire instead of extrinsic reasons including college preparation or developing friendships.”²²⁶ Choosing an academic major in fields other than music does not preclude the same love of making music for non-music major students. Roger Mantie and Jay Dorfman’s study to understand non-music major participation in music ensembles explains that “It is...clear

²²³ Sichivitsa, “The Influences of Parents, Teachers, Peers,” 55.

²²⁴ Hurley, “Student Motivations,” 52.

²²⁵ Ryan V. Scherber, "Perceptions of Participation in a Youth Community Ensemble." Order No. 1504003, The Florida State University, 2011. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, 24, accessed February 5, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fperceptions-participation-youth-community%2Fdocview%2F897549459%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

²²⁶ Ibid.

that those who participate do so not for strictly ‘educational’ reasons, but because they love to sing and play; they reported music making to be an enjoyable and healthy activity, not something that might be described as ‘lifelong learning.’”²²⁷ Non-music major students may feel even more free to fully enjoy their music making experiences because they are exempt from the pressures of future auditions and job opportunities related to their music making that music majors experience.

| Non-Music Major Motivation Factors to Participate in Collegiate Performing Ensembles ²²⁸ <i>Table 4</i> | |
|--|--|
| Source of Recommendation | Motivation Factors |
| Roger Mantie and Jay Dorfman (2014) | “Because they love to sing and play; they reported music making to be an enjoyable and healthy activity.” ²²⁹ |
| Sara K. Jones (2018) | “Both a musical and social experience.” ²³⁰ |
| Veronica O. Sichivitsa (2007) Gregory C. Hurley (2010) | Prior and current parental support. ^{231 232} |

²²⁷ Mantie and Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors," 56.

²²⁸ Rebecka Rose, "Non-Music Major Motivation Factors to Participate in Collegiate Performing Ensembles," (March 23, 2021).

²²⁹ Mantie and Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors," 56.

²³⁰ Jones, "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation," 256.

²³¹ Sichivitsa, "The Influences of Parents, Teachers, Peers," 55.

²³² Hurley, "Student Motivations," 52.

Benefits of Collegiate Music Ensemble Participation

The positive outcomes that are reflected in the lives of people who make music are well known and identified, but the benefits that result specifically for students and for colleges with higher rates of participation in music performing ensembles are not reflected upon adequately. Increasing music ensemble participation by non-music majors is advantageous for both non-music major students and for institutions of higher learning.²³³ Darrin H. Thornton explains positive benefits that adults enjoy from continued participation in music making during adulthood as “connection to humanity, sense of fulfillment, and choice”²³⁴ prompting the significance of non-music majors being included in music performance ensembles.

Belonging

During the freshman year, college students are often experiencing one of the first major transitions they will experience throughout their life—moving away from home for the first time. This transition can have positive and negative impacts on the mental, emotional, and physical health of college students as they learn to adjust to full time living away from family and friends and the search to find belonging in a new situation. Research conducted by Stephanie E. Pitts, Katharine Robinson, and Kunshan Goh to understand the cessation of music making in performing ensembles by amateur musicians explains that “Our interviewees also showed how

²³³ Beverly Kaye Lapp, "Something to Think about the Rest of One's Days: Music in a Liberal Arts Education," Order No. 3511038, Teachers College, Columbia University, 2012, 181, in PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, accessed November 21, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1022180399%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

²³⁴ Darrin H. Thornton, "Adult Music Engagement: Perspectives from Three Musically Engaged Cases." 2010. In PROQUESTMS Social Science Premium Collection, Abstract, accessed December 17, 2020, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fadult-music-engagement-perspectives-three%2Fdocview%2F964182378%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

personal vulnerabilities, such as moving house or coping with illness, can themselves be a motivation to join an ensemble, so heightening its social impact and leaving players more sensitive to feelings of belonging and rejection.”²³⁵ Don R. Crowe’s research suggests that “through these ensembles, students can bring some continuity to that new environment. The routines and expectations of ensemble participation provide a familiar experience in an unfamiliar environment, as well as opportunities for success and thus more positive outlooks and self-images.”²³⁶

Crowe’s study and Pitts, Robinson, and Goh’s study highlight the benefits that students may achieve from engaging in a music ensemble as a way to mitigate negative issues arising from life’s stresses. As college students adjust to being college students, participation in collegiate music performance ensembles can provide an important social environment to feel comfortable within and to find a place to fit in on campus.

Social Adaptation

Amy M., Bohnert, Julie Wargo Aikins, and Jennifer Edidin’s research to understand organized college activities that positively impact the transition to college reflects that the “findings of this study suggest that organized activity involvement plays an important role in facilitating social adaptation during the transition to college, particularly for adolescents who were at risk for poor outcomes.”²³⁷ Bohnert, Aikins, and Edidin’s research further explains that:

Involvement in organized activities appears to be a protective and promotive context of friendship development that is associated with fewer feelings of

²³⁵ Pitts, Robinson, and Goh, “Not Playing Any More,” 144.

²³⁶ Crowe, “Retention of College Students,” 379.

²³⁷ Amy M., Bohnert, Julie Wargo Aikins, and Jennifer Edidin, “The Role of Organized Activities in Facilitating Social Adaptation Across the Transition to College.” *Journal of Adolescent Research* 22, no. 2 (March 2007): 206, accessed January 28, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0743558406297940>.

loneliness and social dissatisfaction. Given the importance of friendships across the life span, future work should consider how to identify emerging adults who are high risk for poor social outcomes so they can be encouraged to get involved in activities that reflect their unique needs in making a successful transition.²³⁸

A highly prioritized goal for institutions should be the encouragement of all collegiate students to become engaged in specific organized activities on campus during their college years. More specifically, participation within collegiate music performance ensembles has the potential to significantly encourage, motivate, and propel college students forward academically and socially during their college experience. Negative college experience outcomes may be avoided by exposure to and then engagement within collegiate performance ensembles by non-music major college students.

Continuance of Musical Journey for Students

College students should have the opportunity to experience and enjoy the many positive effects of participating in collegiate music performance ensembles. Jones explains the specific musical benefits that may be enjoyed by college students such as “gaining musical benefits like performance opportunities, developing musical and listening skills, enjoyment of singing, and learning new repertoire, and non-musical benefits such as having an emotional and physical outlet, achieving life balance, and for some, have a social outlet.”²³⁹ Current collegiate music school structure is designed to allow continued participation in music ensembles by non-music university students. The university Music Appreciation course provides the opportunity to encourage university freshmen who are not studying music to continue in the musical journey

²³⁸ Bohnert, Aikins, and Edidin, “The Role of Organized Activities,” 206.

²³⁹ Jones, “A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation,” 261.

that their elementary, middle, and high school music educators helped them begin and develop until that point in their lives.²⁴⁰

Institution Benefits

Not only does continued music ensemble participation provide substantial benefits for college students, but this possibility also brings recognizable benefits to the institution of higher learning that prioritizes the engagement of non-music major students in on campus music performance ensemble opportunities. Don R. Crowe's research explains that: "The data shows that those who enrolled in music ensembles returned for the subsequent three years at a significantly greater rate than those who did not, and that the difference in retention increased in each of these years."²⁴¹ Crowe also points out that "the results of the study suggest that institutions should encourage students who have an interest in such ensembles to participate in them in their first semester, regardless of their major, as a means of improving retention."²⁴²

If the college or university will seek to promote music ensemble participation, the institution will experience higher student retention ratios based on Crowe's findings. Institutional enrollment percentages will remain higher when more students are actively encouraged to enroll in music performance ensembles as freshmen. Crowe explains how this occurs: "The diversity of participants provides ensemble members with a broad view of the university and their place in it, as well as a reservoir of experience to draw on as they navigate their way through their new environment."²⁴³

²⁴¹ Crowe, "Retention of College Students and Freshman-Year Music Ensemble Participation," 373.

²⁴² Ibid., 349.

²⁴³ Ibid., 373.

| Benefits of College Non-Music Major Participation in Music Ensemble Courses²⁴⁴ <i>Table 5</i> | |
|--|--|
| Source of Recommendation | Benefits |
| Stephanie E. Pitts, Katharine Robinson, and Kunshan Goh (2015) | Increased student sense of belonging. ²⁴⁵ |
| Amy M. Bohnert, Julie W. Aikins, and Jennifer Edidin (2007) | Easing of social adaptation in the new college environment. ²⁴⁶ |
| Sara K. Jones (2018) | Continuance of musical journey for students ²⁴⁷ |
| Don R. Crowe (2015) | Overall institutional attrition decreases. ²⁴⁸ |

Section III: The Music Appreciation Course Facilitating Recruitment

Music Appreciation may represent the last opportunity for college students to be involved in music study during the formative training period of their lives. Students enrolled in collegiate Music Appreciation courses often graduate with an accrued background of high school musical experiences and take a Music Appreciation course to meet an arts elective. Music Appreciation students have likely taken music classes in grade school, middle school, and/or high school prompting the interest in taking the course instead of an alternative arts elective. Many of these

²⁴⁴ Rebecka Rose, “Benefits of College Non-Music Major Participation in Music Ensemble Courses,” (March 23, 2021).

²⁴⁵ Pitts, Robinson, and Goh, “Not Playing Any More,” 144.

²⁴⁶ Bohnert, Wargo, and Edidin, “The Role of Organized Activities,” 206.

²⁴⁷ Jones, “A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation,” 261.

²⁴⁸ Crowe, “Retention of College Students,” 373.

students have played or sung in performance ensembles previously as a result of school music educators' successful and effective recruitment techniques.²⁴⁹

Kelley explains that the “synthesis of research findings from extant literature suggests that personal beliefs or characteristics, social influences, and socio-cultural influences impact music participation choices.”²⁵⁰ Kelley’s findings “reveal the importance of the roles of the participants, the role of the facilitator, the agency of the individual, the fixity of musical forms, and musical texture to promote participatory experiences.”²⁵¹ If Music Appreciation instructors engage in recruitment techniques within the collegiate course, many students will realize that performing in a college music ensemble is an achievable opportunity and an available option that they may not have participated in otherwise. Music Appreciation students can be reengaged in a music practice that they may have thought reached its conclusion upon high school graduation through recruitment type Music Appreciation course design elements.

Collegiate Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Deficiencies

Unfortunately, the above referenced attention to K-12 music ensemble recruitment and participation continuance ceases after high school. Though extensive recruitment takes place for high school seniors who are interested in pursuing music major specialties at various conservatories, universities, and colleges throughout the United States, recruitment for non-music major participation in collegiate music performance ensembles is less likely to be a priority for music schools. Colleges expect their music ensembles to be filled with music majors

²⁴⁹ Bazan and Jonathan Bayley, "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students," 72.

²⁵⁰ Kelley, "Quantitative and Qualitative Investigations of Music Participation," iii.

²⁵¹ James F. Kelley, "Quantitative and Qualitative Investigations of Music Participation," v.

and expect that non-music majors will be recruited to the institution through the recruitment that is initiated by its other than music academic programs.

Collegiate Marching Band Exception

An exception to this scenario is the recruitment that takes place for higher education institutions' marching bands. Marching bands regularly seek participation from both music majors and non-music majors. Jason P. Cumberledge credits Millard Straw's research that reveals specific music department marching band recruitment practices when referencing the following recruitment techniques: "University music departments use a wide array of recruitment techniques in efforts to sustain enrollment including brochures, phone calls, personal visits from faculty, and videos of performing ensembles."²⁵² High school marching band students are thoroughly briefed on the benefits of continuing to perform within the marching band of the university they will be attending the following year regardless of their intended academic major. Marching band competitions provide a chance for students to experience the level of expertise that exist within the marching bands of various colleges promoting student excitement and interest in joining a higher level of marching band ensemble than they experienced during their high school marching band experience.

Though collegiate marching band recruitment is effective in reaching non-music majors, the extensive time commitments and physical fitness requirements that are necessary to be eligible for membership in collegiate marching bands often discourage non-music majors from participating. Stewart found that the chief reason that students choose to not participate in

²⁵² Jason P. Cumberledge, "The Benefits of College Marching Bands for Students and Universities: A Review of the Literature," *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 36, no. 1 (October 2017): 45, accessed December 6, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1177/8755123316682819>.

collegiate music ensembles is the perceived time commitment involved.²⁵³ The challenges of participation in collegiate marching bands may preclude students from joining the collegiate marching band and may cause prior music students to think they will not be able to participate in any college level music ensembles.

Music Performance Ensemble Recruitment Techniques

School band directors commonly employ specific recruitment techniques to engage student interest in participating in middle school band and then again in high school band. A middle school band ensemble will often visit its feeder elementary schools to perform at least one concert for fourth and fifth graders to spark participation interest. Eighth grade students will often have the opportunity to play with their local high school band in order to maintain interest in participating in either marching band and/or various other instrumental ensembles in high school. Recruitment efforts such as these allow younger students to become enthusiastic about the music ensemble performing opportunities that will be available to them when they move on to the next phase of their educational journey. These types of recruitment efforts should not cease when students graduate from high school. Instead, they should continue through college and university music department recruitment *and* in the Music Appreciation classroom—causing students to be excited about college music opportunities available to them regardless of their chosen academic major.

Dale Bazan and Jonathan Bayley recommend the following specific recruitment methods: “Visit feeder schools more than once during a semester..., plan a demonstration lesson..., perform music that is interesting..., involve model band students..., allow prospective recruits to

²⁵³ Stewart, "A Study of First -Year Students," Abstract.

discuss the band program in a question-and-answer period with veteran band students, demonstrate instrument choices..., invite students to a beginning-band rehearsal so that they can envision their future participation.”²⁵⁴ These methods all find replicable application within Music Appreciation courses to generate the music ensemble participation interest of college students.

Daniel J. Albert conducted research to understand how to encourage music ensemble participation that specifically targets low socioeconomic school districts.²⁵⁵ Albert’s study highlights several successful recruitment strategies that may be applied by collegiate Schools of Music to reach all non-music major students. Albert concludes: “Results suggest that proactive teacher strategies, culturally relevant ensembles, and student ownership of ensemble processes can aid in the recruitment and retention of students in low SES districts.”²⁵⁶ Albert explains proactive teacher strategies as the following techniques: “creating visibility,... advertising that appeals to students, such as apparel and compact disc recordings.”²⁵⁷ Albert’s study further reveals that “the teacher participants also believed that stimulating media and presentations may be the most highly effective recruiting tools, especially if the performing group and teachers are perceived as being ‘cool.’”²⁵⁸ These types of recruitment methods are not unique to the band ensemble. Middle school and high school choral and string ensembles employ similar

²⁵⁴ Bazan and Bayley, "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students," 72.

²⁵⁵ Daniel J. Albert, "Strategies for the Recruitment and Retention of Band Students in Low Socioeconomic School Districts," *Contributions to Music Education* 33, no. 2 (2006): 53, accessed March 13, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fstrategies-recruitment-retention-band-students%2Fdocview%2F1305772%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

²⁵⁶ Ibid.

²⁵⁷ Ibid., 66.

²⁵⁸ Ibid., 53.

recruitment practices to reach students with information and experiential understanding of musical opportunities that are offered.

Recruitment of Non-Music Majors Music Students

High School Music Educator Generated College Recruitment Actions

Non-music major students should be recruited to a wide variety of collegiate music ensemble opportunities—providing avenues for the possibility of music ensemble performance continuation during college. Charles T. Menghini describes that actions he took as a high school band director to facilitate college schools of music recruitment of the high school band seniors in his band program.²⁵⁹

I spoke with every senior member of the band and asked for permission to send their name, contact information, and major instrument to college and university music programs...I wrote a letter that introduced them to the college director and let them know that some of these students are considering majoring in music and some are not. But many of them will be attending college, were great contributing musicians in high school and I wanted them to continue to play...Within a short time, college and university band programs from across the country began sending these students letters and information about the opportunities that awaited them should they decide to attend their institution...In the end, students who had graduated from our program were participating in over 20 colleges and universities.²⁶⁰

This example provides insight into how a collaboration between high school music educators and college schools of music can result in the continuation of students' music making journey even if the band director and the faculty at various schools of music do not personally know each other. Since statistics such as the results of Stewart's research state that "83.6% of respondents had made the decision not to participate in bands at The Ohio State University prior

²⁵⁹ Menghini, "Getting Your Students Ready."

²⁶⁰ Ibid., 21.

to enrollment into the university,”²⁶¹ significant participation increases may be generated by reaching high school music students before enrollment in college with the available collegiate music performing opportunities that will be available to both music major and non-music major students.

College Music School Recruitment of High School Seniors

Stewart advises that “college band directors should continue to increase communication with high school band directors and potential students, focusing specifically on benefits to non-music majors, audition requirements, and time commitments.”²⁶² These types of specific recruitment techniques allow students to actively consider participation in music performing ensembles while they are still juniors and seniors in high school just as they envisioned the exciting possibilities of participating in high school music ensembles as middle school eighth graders.

Millard Straw’s study researching the collegiate marching band recruitment experienced by high school music students explains possible recruitment techniques that are effective:

Six items within control of the music department were effective to more than 70% of the students who experienced them. These include attending music classes on campus, receiving music department publications, receiving a telephone call from a music department alumni recruiter, having a music department representative visit your school, receiving a telephone call from music department student recruiter, and being invited to have an individual off campus interview or audition. Receiving music department publications was experienced by more than 90% of the subjects. The rest were experienced by fewer than one third. Based on the high effectiveness of these other five items, it would be reasonable for departments to explore their greater use.²⁶³

²⁶¹ Stewart, “A Study of First-Year Students,” Abstract.

²⁶² Ibid.

Planning for Recruitment

Dale Bazan and Jonathan Bayley recommend the following steps for planning for successful recruitment: “define goals: the setting of goals is fundamental to any successful activity, create a plan: after you have educational and musical goals, create an agenda and timeline, and evaluate your plan: check to see that your plan has been followed and adapt as necessary for future years.”²⁶⁴ Bazan and Bayley also point out: “While recruiting strategies may seem common sense, they are not always implemented as thoroughly as they could be.”²⁶⁵ Recruitment ideas need to be thoroughly carried out in a consistent way. Offering one opportunity is not enough. Higher percentages of students will participate if opportunities are presented more than once. Within the Music Appreciation classroom, any recruitment efforts should be planned in advance to be carried out several times throughout a semester instead of only once.

²⁶³ Millard M. Straw, "Missouri High School Music Students' Perceptions of Recruitment Techniques Utilized by College and University Music Departments." Order No. 9823326, University of Missouri - Columbia, 1996. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, 94, accessed March 19, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fmissouri-high-school-music-students-perceptions%2Fdocview%2F304276043%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

²⁶⁴ Bazan and Jonathan Bayley, "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students," 72.

²⁶⁵ Ibid.

| Possible Music Appreciation Course Recruitment Strategies²⁶⁶ <i>Table 6</i> | |
|--|---|
| Source of Recommendation | Recruitment Strategies |
| Dale Bazan and Jonathan Bayley (2009) | Demonstrations ²⁶⁷ |
| | Attending music performances that are interesting. ²⁶⁸ |
| | Exposure to current, model music students. ²⁶⁹ |
| | Question and answer sessions with students from performing ensembles. ²⁷⁰ |
| | Invite Music Appreciation students to music ensemble rehearsals. ²⁷¹ |
| Daniel J. Albert (2006) | Incorporating information that there are “culturally relevant ensembles” available for students to join. ²⁷² |
| | Incorporating information that some on campus ensembles involve “student ownership of ensembles.” ²⁷³ |
| | Providing apparel and ensemble recordings as advertising for on campus ensembles showcasing great music. ²⁷⁴ |
| | “Stimulating media and presentations” from on campus music ensembles-live or recorded. ²⁷⁵ |

²⁶⁶ Rebecka Rose, “Possible Music Appreciation Course Recruitment Strategies,” (March 23, 2021).

²⁶⁷ Bazan and Jonathan Bayley, "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students," 72.

²⁶⁸ Ibid.

²⁶⁹ Ibid.

²⁷⁰ Ibid.

²⁷¹ Ibid.

²⁷² Albert, "Strategies for the Recruitment and Retention," 53.

²⁷³ Ibid.

²⁷⁴ Ibid., 66.

| | |
|---|--|
| Millard Straw (1996) | Music ensemble representative visiting Music Appreciation course class period (this could include student musicians and/or conductors). ²⁷⁶ |
| | Invitation to join ensemble from ensemble conductor and/or student musicians in ensemble. ²⁷⁷ |
| Glenn E. Nierman and Michael H. Veak (1997) | Encouraging music making participatory experiences leads to interest in music making outside the course. ²⁷⁸ |

Though course time management must be carefully planned within Music Appreciation to allow students to be exposed to the high volume of course content, including recruitment techniques enables students to envision making music themselves. This inclusion allows the Music Appreciation course to serve as an avenue for renewed music making engagement for all non-music major college students who were actively performing previously but did not imagine being able to pursue music performing throughout their higher education experience.

²⁷⁵ Albert, "Strategies for the Recruitment and Retention," 66.

²⁷⁶ Straw, "Missouri High School Music Students' Perceptions of Recruitment Techniques," 94.

²⁷⁷ Ibid.

²⁷⁸ Nierman, and Veak, "Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies," 387.

CHAPTER FIVE:

CONCLUSIONS

Summary of Study

This research sought to interweave music ensemble recruitment methods within best practices for Music Appreciation course design. If recruitment practices become a standard element of Music Appreciation course instruction, collegiate institutions may realize an increase in the participation trends of non-music majors in on campus music performance ensembles. This research endeavored to address the challenges faced by Music Appreciation students and professors by reorienting the focus of the course's design to that of developing and encouraging the music making interests of non-music majors. As Ellis states, since "it is not unusual for Music Appreciation courses to account for one-third or more of the total credit hours generated within a school or department of music,"²⁷⁹ collegiate music schools must determine the best ways to teach Music Appreciation and determine ways that this course can serve as a recruitment tool to encourage non music major students to participate in collegiate performance ensembles.

For non-music majors who decide not to take any other music courses while in college, Music Appreciation represents the possible end point of music education despite countless hours of music education under the tutelage of school music educators. Collegiate non-music major students making their own choices about extracurricular activities should be advised that there are musical performance opportunities that are available to them. Supporting Hansen's statement: "Regardless of a student's motivation level, Music Appreciation reaches the population who otherwise might not understand music well, and whose understanding and

²⁷⁹ Ellis, "Student Perceptions of the Effects of a Course in Music Appreciation," 67.

appreciation of music can be further developed to enrich their lives. In short, by teaching Music Appreciation to both eager and reluctant students, you can influence their lives for the better.”²⁸⁰ This research supports the importance of the Music Appreciation course within elective, arts offerings at all collegiate institutions.

Summary of Findings and Prior Research

Music Appreciation Course Design

Determining Which Music Genres to Study

The Music Appreciation course should provide a multi-genre music approach founded in the development of Western, classical music and a learner centered environment that is collaborative and filled with opportunities for students’ active participation. Instructors should incorporate standard Western, classical music course content along with the development of popular music and world musics to provide a diverse and comprehensive development of Music Appreciation. This inclusion of popular musics provides a framework for students to understand other music genres that are less familiar to them while understanding the foundational elements of music that are represented in all music in various percentages. Though some instructors and institutions lean in the direction of more popular and world musics and less classical music for inclusion within Music Appreciation, the teaching of Western Art Music in Music Appreciation should not be forgotten in favor of only studying familiar popular music due to the breadth of music development that would be ignored.

If as Hash²⁸¹ suggests, there are connections between today’s popular music genres and the music of the Classical Era that untrained musical listening recognizes, this supposition

²⁸⁰ Hansen, *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*, 33.

²⁸¹ Hash, "Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music," 18.

suggests the importance of maintaining the presence of at least some Western Art Music within current and future Music Appreciation curriculum. Education's purpose is to allow students to explore something new that they would not have been exposed to without educational opportunity. This exploration has the opportunity to expose students to new music of all genres growing from a classical music foundation and expanding into popular and world musics.

Including Multiple Teacher Approaches During a Course

When making the decision about how much classical, popular, and world musics to include within the Music Appreciation course, an absolute and definitive answer cannot be found causing the instructor's perspective to rule the debate within the individual classroom. A true appreciation of music may only be gained from taking the course four or five times—each with a different teacher. The unrealistic nature of taking the course multiple times can be mitigated by including various teachers' perspectives within a semester of the course. By involving many of the college's music instructors as *guest artists* throughout a semester long course, students are exposed to many musical perspectives providing a more thorough appreciation of music as a result of the course.

Instructor Attitude Toward Course

Awareness of the course's importance significantly impacts the mindset of instructors when designing the course. Music Appreciation is not just a course that teaches basic music concepts to non-music major students. Instead, it is an opportunity to further the music education received in school music programs, a chance to engage students in music making, and a means to help students understand the emotional connection to music that occurs which supports Roth's sentiment:

“As a fine artist you will occasionally miss those exquisite pedagogical moments when you can savor some truly heart-stopping goose bump-rendering harmonic progression, or some astonishingly sophisticated formal innovation with like-minded music students. But what the fine artist in you must sacrifice in purely musical depth, the liberal artist in you will gain back many times over in breadth of human response and continued confirmation of the universal significance of music.”²⁸²

Ultimately, professors should include composers and musical pieces that they individually have had performing or educational experiences with in their own professional and academic backgrounds. Teaching music that the professor is passionate about conveys the significance and value of music that will inspire students to develop their own independent love of various genres of music and specific selections within those genres.

As Little Lecture as Possible

The Music Appreciation course should be comprised of learner centered and active participatory components. Some elements of instructor led lecture may be necessary but should be kept to a minimum. The course instructional delivery should instead favor far less lecture and far more learner-centered, learner directed, and collaborative activities to best engage students. Instead of some lecture components, mixed media presentations and live, in-class performances can be incorporated. Research conducted by Geringer, Cassidy, and Byo asserts that “Although certain visual effects may enhance memory of specific music elements, these effects seem to reduce listeners’ use of verbal descriptors that focus on the aural stimuli.”²⁸³ This study found that attention span and interest did increase with use of a visual aid accompanying a musical listening excerpt. Despite this finding, students were better able to describe the music itself when

²⁸² Roth, “Music as a Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors,” 154.

²⁸³ Geringer, Cassidy, and Byo, “Effects of Music with Video,” 249.

listening to musical excerpts without a visual aid seeming to indicate against the predominant use of media within Music Appreciation courses.

Annette H. Zalanowski's research clarifies the work of Geringer, Cassidy, and Byo by explaining: "that there were significant interactions between activity and hemisphere orientation. Right-oriented subjects had the highest appreciation scores in the visual condition, while left-oriented subjects had the highest scores in the verbal condition. The visual condition interfered with mental imagery in left-oriented subjects. Right hemisphere subjects drew more accurate visual representations than did left."²⁸⁴ These results indicate in favor of offering a variety of learning progressions that include listening alone and listening accompanied with written descriptions and written drawings.²⁸⁵ A multifaceted approach is recommended instead of narrowly focused set of teaching techniques according to the findings of Zalanowski and separately in the work of Geringer, Cassidy, and Byo.

Active Participation Generating Performance Interest

A focus on including participatory elements within the Music Appreciation course directly connects with the inclusion of performance ensemble recruitment elements within Music Appreciation course design. Involving students in the active making of music within the course provides participatory opportunities that also reengages students in music making and sparks interest in continuing to make music outside of the course. Instructors should encourage singing of music within the course that can be accompanied by the element of rhythm produced by clapping or foot tapping. Elements of elementary school music curricula such as Orff principles

²⁸⁴ Zalanowski, "Music Appreciation and Hemisphere Orientation," 197.

²⁸⁵ Ibid.

and digital instruments could be interwoven within the course to provide students additional music making opportunities if they do not want to sing.

Recruitment Efforts Generating Performance Interest

Understanding the recruitment techniques that proved effective at encouraging students to join school music performance ensembles and to recruit non-music majors to join collegiate marching band provides techniques that Music Appreciation instructors may implement within their courses. Elements such as the following options should be included: 1.) exposing Music Appreciation students to School of Music opportunities that are available on campus by having Music Appreciation students attend music concerts on campus, 2.) inviting music ensemble conductors to be a guest lecturer, 3.) inviting current music students (majors and non-majors) to play and/or sing for Music Appreciation students, 4.) providing information about available introductory private music lessons, and 5.) providing information about renting instruments.

Music Appreciation Either Serves or Fails Students

Institutions that maintain the traditional, lecture-oriented Music Appreciation course are failing today's non-music majors. This approach fails to engage students in the class and ignores the opportunity to prompt students to make music for themselves in a community with their peers. The Music Appreciation course represents an opportunity to continue the work of music educators and renew or possibly even initiate interest in performing music.

Collegiate Schools of Music Support of Music Appreciation Students

This research study suggests that performance ensembles be developed to specifically prioritize the needs of the non-music major supporting Albert's suggestion that "Perhaps instead of maintaining an ensemble with a teacher-centered focus for both organizational and music

making decision, creating an organization that interweaves teacher and student centeredness can foster a feeling of value and importance, possibly assisting with retention efforts.”²⁸⁶ The suggestion to develop performance ensembles for non-music majors is also supported by Mantie and Dorfman’s study referencing the “failure to adequately respond to the musical interests of school music graduates by providing a more appealing range of participation options.”²⁸⁷ Collegiate schools of music could develop a capella ensembles and instrumental ensembles that are partially or entirely student directed incorporating informal performing opportunities and music making as a social outlet. These types of targeted music ensembles help to mitigate perceived ensemble access barriers for non-music majors.

Limitations

This study was limited by only being able to include research studies and pertinent resources that were accessible through libraries and online resources. Search engine explorations were used to find relevant material yet also limited results that were included in this study. Though this study sought to be inclusive of all current, available, and relevant research material, not all sources could be encompassed.

Recommendations for Future Study

Meaningful understanding and insight would be gained from further studies to understand if the included suggestions for Music Appreciation course methodologies would impact students outside of the United States in the same way due to the variable of cultural background influence on student preferences for classical music or popular music. Further research to identify the

²⁸⁶ Albert, "Strategies for the Recruitment and Retention," 67.

²⁸⁷ Mantie and Dorfman, "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors," 56.

influences that continue to cause college music performance ensemble participation rates to decline would generate principles of application for School of Music recruitment efforts of both music majors and non-music majors. Understanding the role academic advisors have in generating participation in music performance ensembles would facilitate the student communication practices of college advising departments for use in interactions with incoming freshmen and transfer students.

Implications for Practice

Collegiate Music Appreciation courses could be designed with a collaborative and constructivist focus to increase student engagement. Instructor chosen preferred content covering Western classical music, popular music, and world musics provide a balanced perspective that prioritizes student exposure to a wide spectrum of music and showcases the instructor's passion for music. Non-music major ensemble participation may be increased through exposure to instrumentalists and vocalists performing during the course; exposure to university music ensemble performances including their music, musicians, and conductors in the course; and by making music with fellow students during class as inclusionary and participatory aspects of the collegiate Music Appreciation course. If recruitment elements, active participatory elements, and a learner centered approach generate increased percentages of non-music majors joining collegiate music performing ensembles, then numerous benefits may be expected. Students participating in music ensembles may feel more comfortable with the transition to the college environment. Students making music in performing groups may enjoy increased feelings of belonging, the continued development of their musical journey, and the many holistic well-being benefits of musical engagement. As a result of these student benefits, the higher education institution is also positively affected. In addition to developing creatively as musicians, students

are less likely to cease their education journey when they have a sense of belonging in their college community. This cause and effect relationship may result in higher rates of consistent student enrollment through graduation. The course, Music Appreciation, should be thoroughly utilized and valued for the potential it represents to positively impact both students and institutions if taught from a learner centered perspective, interwoven with active music making, and viewed as a path to performance for non-music majors.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Albert, Daniel J. "Strategies for the Recruitment and Retention of Band Students in Low Socioeconomic School Districts." *Contributions to Music Education* 33, no. 2 (2006): 53-72. Accessed March 13, 2021.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fstrategies-recruitment-retention-band-students%2Fdocview%2F1305772%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Arasi, Melissa T., "Adult Reflections on a High School Choral Music Program: Perceptions of Meaning and Lifelong Influence." Order No. 3231924, Georgia State University, 2006: Abstract. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed, December 6, 2020.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fadult-reflections-on-high-school-choral-music%2Fdocview%2F305333250%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Argyres, Nicholas S., Alfredo De Massis, Nicolai J. Foss, Federico Frattini, Geoffrey Jones, and Brian S. Silverman. "History-informed Strategy Research: The Promise of History and Historical Research Methods in Advancing Strategy Scholarship." *Strategic Management Journal* 41, no. 3 (2020): 343-368. Accessed February 11, 2021. <https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/doi/full/10.1002/smj.3118>.
- Bazan, Dale and Jonathan Bayley. "Recruiting: Recruiting Band Students: Effective Strategies for a Strong Program." *Canadian Winds: The Journal of the Canadian Band Association* 7, no. 2 (Spring, 2009): 72-4. Accessed February 6, 2021.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Frecruiting-band-students-effective-strategies%2Fdocview%2F753589791%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Bean, John P., and Barbara S. Metzner. "A Conceptual Model of Nontraditional Undergraduate Student Attrition." *Review of Educational Research* 55, no. 4 (1985): 485-540. Accessed December 17, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1170245>.
- Bohnert, Amy M., Julie Wargo Aikins, and Jennifer Edidin. "The Role of Organized Activities in Facilitating Social Adaptation Across the Transition to College." *Journal of Adolescent Research* 22, no. 2 (March 2007): 189-208. Accessed January 28, 2021.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0743558406297940>.
- Bowman, Wayne D. "Music's Place in Education" in *Music and Music Education in People's Lives: An Oxford Handbook of Music Education*, Vol. 1, eds. Gary E. McPherson and Graham F. Welch. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018/
- Bures, Ruth. "How Non -Music Majors Experience the Value of Participating in Music." Order No. 3358977, Saint Mary's University of Minnesota, 2009. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest

- Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed November 21, 2020.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F305070602%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Conway, Colleen M. *Teaching Music in Higher Education*, 2nd ed. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020.
- Crowe, Don R. "Retention of College Students and Freshman-Year Music Ensemble Participation." *Journal of College Student Retention: Research, Theory & Practice* 17, no. 3 (November 2015): 373–80. Accessed January 28, 2021.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1521025115575918>.
- Cumberledge, Jason P. "The Benefits of College Marching Bands for Students and Universities: A Review of the Literature." *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 36, no. 1 (October 2017): 44–50. Accessed December 6, 2020.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/8755123316682819>.
- Davenport, Kim. "All My Students Are Non-Majors: An Online Music Appreciation Course for a Diverse Student Body." *College Music Symposium* 57 (2017). Accessed October 30, 2020. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26574455>.
- Davis, James. "Aesthetic Questions and Questions of Aesthetics in the Music History Classroom: Questions and Students." *Journal of Aesthetic Education* 35, no. 3 (Fall, 2001): 87-94. Accessed January 31, 2021.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Faesthetic-questions-aesthetics-music-history%2Fdocview%2F220638111%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Dilmore, Ward. "The Best Things in Life Have Strings Attached: How to Grow Recruitment and Ensure Retention in Your Strings Program." *School Band & Orchestra*, 06, 2017. 32, Accessed November 13, 2020.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1914141623%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Elliott, David J. and Marissa Silverman. "Rethinking Philosophy, Re-Viewing Musical-Emotional Experiences," in *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Ellis, Mark C. "Student Perceptions of the Effects of a Course in Music Appreciation." *Contributions to Music Education* 29, no. 2 (2002): 67-83. Accessed February 28, 2021.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/24127102>.
- Enz, Nicholas J. "Teaching Music to the Non-Major: A Review of the Literature." *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education* 32, no. 1 (November 2013): 34–42.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/8755123313502344>.

- Everett, William E. "Creating a Music History Course." In *The Music History Classroom*, ed. James A. Davis. Farnham Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2012.
- "Everything ESSA," National Association for Music Education, November 1, 2020, <http://nafme.org/advocacy/essa/>.
- Faber, Ardis R. "A Study of Factors that Influence First-Year Non-music Majors' Decisions to Participate in Music Ensembles at Small Liberal Arts Colleges in Indiana," Order No. 3426246, Ball State University, 2010. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed December 6, 2020. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fstudy-factors-that-influence-first-year-nonmusic%2Fdocview%2F762400331%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Frost, Julianna E. "Recruitment and Retention: The Influence of General Music Teachers Methodology on Secondary Music Ensembles." Order No. 10306791, The University of Toledo, 2015. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed November 13, 2020. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1867481645%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Geringer, John M., Jane W. Cassidy, and James L. Byo. "Effects of Music with Video on Responses of Nonmusic Majors: An Exploratory Study." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 44, no. 3 (1996): 240-51. Accessed January 29, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345597>.
- Gordon, Lewis W. "College Music Appreciation: Pedagogical Approaches and Preliminary Findings." *College Music Symposium* 36 (1996): 103-13. Accessed December 17, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374287>.
- Green, Timothy D. "Muzic Appreciation: Bridging the Gap between Generation Z & Classical Music." Order No. 10807742, Liberty University, 2018. In PROQUESTMS Dissertations & Theses @ Liberty University; ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed November 11, 2020. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2046301204%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Hafer, Edward. "A Pedagogy of the Pedagogy of Music Appreciation." *Journal of Music History Pedagogy*. no. 3 (January 2012), 57-75. Accessed November 11, 2020. <file:///C:/Users/Rebecka/Downloads/34-Article%20Text-346-3-10-20120823.pdf>.
- Halpern, Jessica. "Effects of Historical and Analytical Teaching Approaches on Music Appreciation." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 40, no. 1 (1992): 39-46. Accessed December 23, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345773>.

- Hansen, Bethanie L. *Teaching Music Appreciation Online*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2020.
- Hanson, Josef. "A Content Analysis Of Beginning Instrumental Music Recruitment Materials: Comparing Elementary And Adult Learning Contexts." *Journal of Band Research* 53, no. 2 (Spring, 2018): 1-15,71. Accessed November 13, 2020. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2082513686%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Hash, Phillip M. "Undergraduate Non-Music Major Preferences for Western Art Music," *Contributions to Music Education* 36, no. 1 (2009): 9-24. Accessed January 30, 2021. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fundergraduate-non-music-major-preferences-western%2Fdocview%2F1303529%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Howard, V. A. "Must Music Education Have an Aim?" In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Hurley, Gregory C. "Student Motivations for Beginning and Continuing/Discontinuing String Music Instruction." *Visions of Research in Music Education* 16, no. 6 (October 1, 2010): 44–55. Accessed November 13, 2020. <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/>.
- Johnson, Cass M. "Rethinking Online Discourse: Improving Learning through Discussions in the Online Classroom." *Education and Information Technologies* 21, no. 6 (November 2016): 1483-507, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1812705670%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Jones, Sara K. "A Comparative Case Study of Non-Music Major Participation in Two Contrasting Collegiate Choral Ensembles." *Music Education Research* 20, no. 2 (2018): 252-264. Accessed December 6, 2020. DOI-org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1080/14613808.2016.1257594.
- Jorgensen, Estelle R. "The Curriculum Design Process in Music." *College Music Symposium* 28 (1988): 94-105. Accessed December 23, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374590>.
- Keengwe, Jared, Grace Onchwari, and Joachim Agamba. "Promoting Effective e-Learning Practices through the Constructivist Pedagogy." *Education and Information Technologies* 19, no. 4 (2014);: 887-898. Accessed November 11, 2020. <https://link-springer-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/article/10.1007/s10639-013-9260-1#citeas>.
- Kelley, James F. "Quantitative and Qualitative Investigations of Music Participation: A Multiple Study Dissertation." Order No. 3725043, University of Washington, 2015. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global,

<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1722533314%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

- Klinedinst, Richard E. "Predicting Performance Achievement and Retention of Fifth-Grade Instrumental Students." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 39, no. 3 (1991): 225-38. Accessed November 13, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3344722>
- Krause, Amanda E. and Jane W. Davidson. "Effective Educational Strategies to Promote Life-Long Musical Investment: Perceptions of Educators." *Frontiers in Psychology* 9, (2018): 1-9. Accessed March 7, 2021, <https://doaj.org/article/41e4952c898a4f908951a0124bbb9752>.
- Lamont, Alexandra. "Emotion, Engagement and Meaning in Strong Experiences of Music Performance." *Psychology of Music* 40, no. 5 (September 2012): 574-594. Accessed November 21, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735612448510>.
- Lapp, Beverly Kaye. "Something to Think about the Rest of One's Days: Music in a Liberal Arts Education." Order No. 3511038, Teachers College, Columbia University, 2012. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, accessed November 21, 2020. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1022180399%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Leavy, Patricia. *Research Design: Quantitative, Qualitative, Mixed Methods, Arts-Based, and Community-Based Participatory Research Approaches*. New York: Guilford Publications, 2017. Accessed November 15, 2020. ProQuest Ebook Central.
- Lewis, Barbara E. "University Non-Major Student Reactions to Music Appreciation Course Content and Instructional Methods." In *Advances in Social-Psychology and Music Education Research*, ed. Patrice Madura Ward-Steinman. New York, NY: Ashgate Publishing, 2016.
- Lowe, Melanie. "Teaching Music History Today: Making Tangible Connections to Here and Now." *Journal of Music History Pedagogy* 1 (2010): 45-59. Accessed November 11, 2020. <https://www.ams-net.org/ojs/index.php/jmhp/article/view/17>.
- Luethi, Dean. "Idea Bank: Ten Steps to Recruiting Singers." *Music Educators Journal* 102, no. 1 (2015): 25-27. Accessed November 12, 2020. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24755624>.
- Mantie, Roger A. "Structure and Agency in University-Level Recreational Music Making." *Music Education Research* 15, no. 1 (2013): 39-58, accessed December 17, 2020, doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2012.722076. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?qurl=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F1812910242%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

- Mantie, Roger, and Jay Dorfman. "Music Participation and Nonparticipation of Nonmajors on College Campuses." *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, no. 200 (2014): 41-62. Accessed December 6, 2020. doi:10.5406/bulcouresmusedu.200.0041.
- Mantie, Roger, and Lynn Tucker. "Closing the Gap: Does Music-Making Have to Stop Upon Graduation?" *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 2 (May 1, 2008): 217-227. Accessed December 6, 2020. DOI: 10.1386/ijcm.1.2.217/1.
- Menghini, Charles T. "Getting Your Students Ready for College and University Band Programs When the Last Note is Played, Does the Music End?" *School Band & Orchestra*, 08, 2016, 18-21.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocvie>
- Mueller, Kate Hevner. "Studies in Music Appreciation." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 4, no. 1 (1956): 3-25. Accessed February 2, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3343835>.
- Nierman, Glenn E., and Michael H. Veak. "Effect of Selected Recruiting Strategies on Beginning Instrumentalists' Participation Decisions." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 45, no. 3 (1997): 380-89. Accessed February 6, 2021.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345533>.
- Pabich, Randall. "Learning to Live Music: Musical Education as the Cultivation of a Relationship Between Self and Sound." In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Pierce, Deborah L. "Redefining Music Appreciation: Exploring the Power of Music." *College Music Symposium* 55 (2015) 1-16. Accessed February 25, 2021.
<https://www.jstor.org/stable/26574401>.
- Pitts, Stephanie E. "What Is Music Education for? Understanding and Fostering Routes into Lifelong Musical Engagement." *Music Education Research* 19, no. 2 (June 2017): 160-68. Accessed January 28, 2021. doi:10.1080/14613808.2016.1166196.
- Pitts, Stephanie E., Katherine Robinson, and Kunshan Goh. "Not Playing Any More: A Qualitative Investigation of Why Amateur Musicians Cease of Continue Membership of Performing Ensembles." *International Journal of Community Music* 8, no. 2 (June 2015): 129-47. Accessed December 6, 2020. DOI:10.1386/ijcm.8.2. 129_1.
- Price, Harry E. "The Effect of a Music Appreciation Course on Students' Verbally Expressed Preferences for Composers." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 36, no. 1 (1988): 35-46. Accessed February 28, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345012>.
- Price, Harry E., and Pamela Swanson. "Changes in Musical Attitudes, Opinions, and Knowledge of Music Appreciation Students." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 38, no. 1 (1990): 39-48. Accessed March 7, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3344828>.

- Pohly, Linda. "Teaching Teachers of Music Appreciation—What We Can Learn from MGS Pedagogy." *College Music Symposium* 47 (2007): 127-38. Accessed February 3, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40374509>.
- Reimer, Bennett, *A Philosophy of Music Education: Advancing the Vision* 3rd ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 2003.
- Reimer, Bennett. "Facing the Risks Of the 'Mozart Effect'." *Phi Delta Kappan*, December 1999, 278. Gale In Context: Biography (accessed January 31, 2021). https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A58633518/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=1d4dbde9.
- Rolandson, David M. "Motivation in Music: A Comparison of Popular Music Course Students and Traditional Large Ensemble Participants in High School." *Contributions to Music Education* 45 (2020): 105-26. Accessed February 5, 2021. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fmotivation-music-comparison-popular-course%2Fdocview%2F2404065675%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Roth, Marjorie. "Music As A Liberal Art: Teaching Music to Non-Majors." In *The Music History Classroom*, ed. James A. Davis. Farnham Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2012.
- Scherber, Ryan V. "Perceptions of Participation in a Youth Community Ensemble." Order No. 1504003, The Florida State University, 2011. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed February 5, 2021, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fperceptions-participation-youth-community%2Fdocview%2F897549459%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Schmidt, Charles P. "Relations among Motivation, Performance Achievement, and Music Experience Variables in Secondary Instrumental Music Students." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 53, no. 2 (2005): 134-47. Accessed February 10, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345514>.
- Sichivitsa, Veronica O. "The Influences of Parents, Teachers, Peers and Other Factors on Students' Motivation in Music," *Research Studies in Music Education* 29, no. 1 (December 2007): 55-68. Accessed February 5, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103X07087568>.
- Silverman, Marissa. "Rethinking Music 'Appreciation.'" *Visions of Research in Music Education* 13 (2009). Accessed February 25, 2021. <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/v13n1/Vision/aut1.pdf>.
- Stewart, Michael J. "A Study of First -Year Students within the Ohio State University and the Factors Influencing Nonparticipation in Band Programs at the Collegiate Level." Order

- No. 3262105, The Ohio State University, 2007. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed December 17, 2020.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fstudy-first-year-students-within-ohio-state%2Fdocview%2F304834432%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Straw, Millard M. "Missouri High School Music Students' Perceptions of Recruitment Techniques Utilized by College and University Music Departments." Order No. 9823326, University of Missouri - Columbia, 1996. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. Accessed March 19, 2021.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fmissouri-high-school-music-students-perceptions%2Fdocview%2F304276043%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Talty, Jack. "Noncanonical Pedagogies for Noncanonical Musics: Observations on Selected Programs in Folk, Traditional, World, and Popular Musics," in *College Music Curricula for a New Century* ed. Robin D. Moore. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2017.
- Thornton, Darrin H. "Adult Music Engagement: Perspectives from Three Musically Engaged Cases." 2010. In PROQUESTMS Social Science Premium Collection. Accessed December 17, 2020.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdissertations-theses%2Fadult-music-engagement-perspectives-three%2Fdocview%2F964182378%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Vakeva, Lauri. "Philosophy of Music Education as Art of Life: A Deweyan View," In *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy in Music Education*, eds. Wayne D. Bowman and Ana Lucia Frega. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Weimer, Maryellen. *Learner-Centered Teaching: Five Key Changes to Practice*. Somerset: John Wiley & Sons, Incorporated, 2013. Accessed February 2, 2021. ProQuest Ebook Central.
- Woody, Robert H. and Kimberly J. Burns. "Predicting Music Appreciation with Past Emotional Responses to Music." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 49, no. 1 (Spring, 2001): 57-70. Accessed March 7, 2021.
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fscholarly-journals%2Fpredicting-music-appreciation-with-past-emotional%2Fdocview%2F214475958%2Fse-2%3Faccountid%3D12085>.
- Yackley, Aaron K. "Enjoyment of Music by Non-Participants in School Music." Order No. 27712035, The Ohio State University, 2019. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global,
<http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.proquest.com%2Fdocview%2F2355993358%3Faccountid%3D12085>.

Zalanowski, Annette H. "Music Appreciation and Hemisphere Orientation: Visual versus Verbal Involvement." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 38, no. 3 (1990): 197-205. Accessed January 29, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3345183>.