

MENTORING WORSHIP LEADERS TO BECOME MENTORING WORSHIP LEADERS

By

Robert Todd Craig

Liberty University

A THESIS PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF WORSHIP STUDIES

Lynchburg, Virginia

April 2020

MENTORING WORSHIP LEADERS TO BECOME MENTORING WORSHIP LEADERS

By

Robert Todd Craig

A Thesis Presented in Partial Fulfillment
Of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Worship Studies

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

April 2020

APPROVED BY:

Jamie Coates, DWS, Committee Chair

Sean Beavers, DM, Committee Member, Online Dean

ABSTRACT

Although Jesus provides the biblical example for the process and significance of mentoring others, today's ministry leaders often fail to take up this mantle. Much research exists on the value of mentoring, especially in the corporate world where those at the highest levels intentionally mentor those who display significant potential. Recent literature addresses the importance of ministry leaders mentoring others, such as veteran pastors showing those expressing a call to ministry *how* to be a minister. However, a gap exists in the body of literature regarding the importance of the mentoring relationship between veteran and novice worship leaders. Due to the high level of expectation placed on a worship leader in the twenty-first century, current college curricula alone cannot adequately equip the novice worship leader for a pathway to effective ministry. Veteran worship leaders can and should mentor novice worship leaders in terms of spiritual formation, leadership development, and organizational skills. There is a great need for more experienced worship leaders to answer the call to mentor novice worship leaders. Linking the corporate, academic, and pastoral facets of mentoring, this study will use a qualitative historical approach to convey a cohesiveness specific to the subject of veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders. Beyond this, an additional goal of the study is to inspire and equip those mentoring worship leaders to instill a passion for mentoring within their protégés.

Keywords: mentor, mentoring, mentorship, worship leaders, discipling, discipleship, biblical model of mentoring

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many I wish to thank and acknowledge. The first above all is my Savior, Jesus Christ, who reached down into the depths of depravity to pull me to Himself, to give me hope, and, quite literally, give me a reason to live. My wife, Heather, for her unending love and support that has been fuel for living and completing this pursuit. I thank my girls, Evangeline, Eliza, and Melody, for being patient with me being away so much to write. I would not be where I am today without the love, encouragement, and support of my mom and dad, as well as my sister who first prompted me to begin in formal music training in the fifth grade. I love you all greatly.

Many teachers, guides, and mentors have influenced me immeasurably along the way. Cynthia Kaylor, Freddie Meadows, Reggie Tolbert, John Parks, and Jon Remley were influential band directors as well as Timothy Banks, Milburn Price, and Gene Black as choral directors. Other instructors with great influence include Doris Chitwood, Rebecca Remley, David Music, and Bruce Leafblad. In addition, I would like to thank the many professors of the Doctor of Worship Studies program at Liberty.

I would also not be who I am without the many pastoral/musical influences of Darryl Wood, Jim McCoy, Frankie Jones, Don Campbell, Jerry Campbell, B. R. Johnson, Michael Stovall, Greg Ware, Joe Jossey, Kris Barnett, and Jeff Blackburn. It would be an incomplete list without the friendship and camaraderie of the “Kirkely Krew,” Ben, Laura, Kchristian, Jackie, and Kyle. For my readers and proofreaders, Laura Hancock, Wendy Fields, and Sean Beavers, I am grateful. This project was also greatly influenced by my wonderful advisor, Jamie Coates. Last, but not least, I thank the many friends that have helped mold me into the man I am today.

Contents

Abstract.....	iv
Acknowledgements	v
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
Background.....	1
Statement of the Problem	4
Purpose of the Study.....	6
Significance of the Study.....	7
Research Questions.....	9
Hypotheses.....	10
Core Concepts.....	14
Research Methods.....	17
Research Plan	17
Definition of Terms	18
Summary.....	19
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	21
Introduction	21
Mentoring Defined	21
Mentoring Amplified.....	24
Mentoring	24
Discipling.....	25

Teaching and Coaching	27
Mentoring Described	28
Corporate/Business	28
Church/Pastoral	29
Biblical.....	30
The Need for Veteran Worship Leaders to Mentor Novice Worship Leaders	32
The Biblical Basis for Mentoring	35
The Relationship Between Discipleship and Effectiveness	38
The Lack of Practical/Real-World Opportunities beyond Trial and Error.....	41
Academia’s Shortfalls in Educating Worship Leaders.....	44
The Untrained/Uneducated yet Naturally Talented Musicians Thrust into Worship Leader Roles	48
Contents/Elements Needed in the Mentoring Relationship.....	50
Spiritual Formation.....	54
Leadership Development.....	57
Organizational Skills	61
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	69
Introduction	69
Research Design	69
Research Questions.....	70
Hypotheses.....	70
Process of Gathering Literature.....	71
Synthesis of Research.....	73

CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS.....	75
Etymology of Mentoring	75
The Need for Mentoring Exposed	76
Three Primary Areas for Pastor-to-Pastor Mentoring	79
Summary.....	81
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS	83
Summary of Study, Purpose, and Procedure	83
Summary of Findings and Prior Research.....	84
Limitations of the Study	86
Recommendations for Application.....	87
Recommendations for Future Study	92
BIBLIOGRAPHY	94

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Background

In most churches, the one who selects the music for corporate worship events is often referred to as the worship leader. This person may go by Worship Pastor, Music Minister, Song Leader, Pastor of Creative Arts, or any number of other creative titles. No matter the title, the duties of the worship leader are a significant undertaking, a massive iceberg, if you will. The tip of the iceberg that most congregants see is the weekly choice of songs for worship services. What remains unseen, however, is the much larger part of the iceberg below the surface. It takes countless hours and immeasurable effort to lead an effective worship ministry. Equal to the effort in leading such a ministry should be the effort that goes into developing effective worship ministry leaders. Where does this effort originate? Byron Spradlin affirms, “There appears to be a clear need in our North American churches for more spiritually maturing, artistically skilled worship leadership; leaders who are clearly called, biblically sound, spiritually dynamic, pastorally oriented, artistically skilled, and specifically trained for worship ministry in our churches and their missional assignments.”¹ Each element of Spradlin’s statement about leaders, except the calling to the ministry by God alone, is gained through three potential origins: natural giftedness, academic training, or intentional mentoring. There are certainly places where each of these areas may overlap. Academic training, for example, might enhance natural giftedness; but

¹ Byron L. Spradlin, “Discipling Worship Leadership: Biblical and Theological Rationale for Discipling Worship Leaders” (DMin diss., Liberty Baptist Theological Seminary, 2012), 4, <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/542>.

the focus of this study is on how integral, yet overshadowed mentoring is to the process of becoming a complete worship leader.²

With this in mind, it is essential to understand how phenomenally instrumental the worship leader has become to the development of foundational doctrinal beliefs in believers. If a lifestyle of worship in the everyday mundane is key to biblical living, then one must invest every available resource in those called by God and tasked by the local church to lead believers to lives of worship.³ While there is no way to make any sort of investment to yield natural giftedness, and there is little that can be done by those outside the academic establishment to change academic training methodologies, something can be done about intentionally mentoring novice worship leaders in order that they may become effective worship ministry leaders for the kingdom of God.

However, “few worship leaders are ever intentionally disciplined.”⁴ By definition, being “disciplined” is essentially the same as being “mentored.” Both terms mean to advise, train, or teach. Though both definitions are alike in many ways, mentoring in this context carries additional connotations. Mentoring entails the daily *doing* of ministry with a more-experienced leader training the less-experienced, whereas discipling connotes the guidance of one’s spiritual growth by another, more mature Christ-follower. The two terms can be seen as *part* of one another, but neither *fully* describe the necessary relationship between veteran worship leaders and novice worship leaders. This will be addressed in greater detail in Chapter Two. The point

² Kevin John Navarro, “Becoming a Complete Worship Leader” (DMin diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1998), <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/304481974?accountid=12085>.

³ Spradlin, “Discipling Worship Leadership,” 94.

⁴ Ibid.

here is that worship leaders cannot obtain all they need to know about leading worship ministries by natural giftedness. Similarly, no amount of academic training in colleges or seminaries can prepare one for such a ministry. However, a veteran worship leader *can* and *should* intentionally invest in a novice worship leader through a process of mentoring.

There are two primary responsibilities in this process. The first is that the mentor must be intentional about the process. Mentoring does not occur by accident. The mentor needs to know whom they are mentoring, why this person should be mentored, and in what specific areas this person needs mentoring. The second responsibility lies with the protégé. There must be an attitude of acceptance of the process, a humility toward following the mentor's leading, and a continual mindset of learning or absorbing as much as possible from the mentor.⁵

As both mentor and protégé accept their respective responsibilities, they must also accept the biblical mandate for the nature of the process of mentoring. The Great Commission from Matthew 28:18-20 contains Jesus' final words to His disciples before His ascension into Heaven. Often shortened simply to "Go and make disciples," the English translation loses the original Greek emphasis. By placing the weight on "go," the emphasis in English becomes a command to stop whatever one is doing, go somewhere, do something, and disciples will be made as a natural result. However, the nuance of the Greek verbiage emphasizes "make," yet not in the sense of a singular point-in-time occurrence. Instead, it is a present, active imperative verb. The original meaning is still a command, but in addition, it is an ongoing action in the present tense. This understanding now helps define Jesus' intent of the Great Commission: "As you are going, as

⁵ Spradlin, "Discipling Worship Leadership," 97-98.

you live your life day-in and day-out, be always making disciples who are baptized and taught to obey my commands.”⁶

Another part of the misunderstanding of the Great Commission is “make *disciples*.” One part of becoming a disciple of Christ is undoubtedly a point-in-time occurrence, where the old has become new (2 Corinthians 5:17). This is where many halt in their following of Christ. However, Paul teaches that there is a second sense of the term “disciple,” where one is continually working out one’s salvation (Philippians 2:12-13) evidenced by the day-in and day-out following and obeying of Christ’s commands. This is where the process of mentoring takes place. Too many leaders stop intentionally relating to an individual once they have become a disciple in the first sense of the term. What is lacking is an emphasis on the second sense of the term.

Therefore, worship leaders should not only take up the general call of Jesus to make disciples but must also—due to their distinct calling—intentionally mentor novice worship leaders. The veteran worship leader’s understanding of how to lead a worship ministry is invaluable to a novice worship leader’s effective impact on the kingdom of God through their present and future worship ministry. There must be a stronger emphasis on every front to teach, train, empower, and equip veteran worship leaders to teach, train, empower, and equip novice worship leaders.

Statement of the Problem

Although the biblical example of Jesus shows the process and significance of mentoring others, today’s ministry leaders often fail to take up the mantle of actually doing so. This is

⁶ Spradlin, “Discipling Worship Leadership,” 97-98.

especially evident in the role of the worship leader in three specific areas of concern. The first is spiritual formation. Michael Plank says that worship musicians, through various circumstances, “can be driven either to madness in pleasing people, to anxiety over job security, or to conceit from praise. The lack of training in personal discipleship makes it very difficult for the worship leader to thrive and succeed in this environment, but *it will frequently be overlooked if ministry performance is good* [emphasis mine].”⁷ Plank’s point is that as long as a worship leader *seems* to be doing his job well, very little (if any), attention is given to his personal discipleship growth. The second area is in leadership training. “Leadership is influence,” as John Maxwell teaches.⁸ A worship leader has significant influence over the congregation, yet often has very little focused leadership training. Included in this is how the worship leader functions in pastoral care. By nature, very few musicians have natural inclinations toward the compassion and empathy needed to minister effectively to the volunteer base they serve.⁹ The third area of concern is time management.¹⁰ This would include practical applications for worship ministry leadership. Often, the best musician is given the role of worship leader and too frequently has no inherent ability to lead a comprehensive ministry with multiple volunteers in various roles. Time management is a core concept for success.

⁷ Michael Plank, “The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation” (DMin diss., Biola University, 2016), 20-21, <https://search-proquestcom.ezproxy.liberty.edu/central/docview/1786894695/ADF4242288324F0BPQ/1?accountid=12085>.

⁸ John C. Maxwell, *The 5 Levels of Leadership: Proven Steps to Maximize Your Potential* (New York, NY: Center Street, 2013), 2.

⁹ Rory Noland, *The Heart of the Artist: A Character-Building Guide for You and Your Ministry Team* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1999), 31-81.

¹⁰ Initial research pointed toward time management, which thereby became a component of Hypothesis 2. However, in further research, organizational skills became apparent as the prominent need. Therefore, the first chapter refers to time management whereas the following chapters refer to organizational skills.

Church leadership, in these instances, will often ignore the biblical instructions to provide mentorship modeling to the novice worship leader. The results of such ignorance can be catastrophic not only to the church's ministry but also to the worship leader's faith and future ministry. The problem is that this lack of mentoring is not just exemplified in one or two highly publicized instances. It is not relegated to small, medium, large, or even mega-churches. It is not geographical. It is all too often a result of the prevalent ignorance of the biblical principle and responsibility to mentor novice worship leaders.

By pursuing an understanding of why churches often fail to mentor worship leaders, and why worship leaders are not prepared to mentor other worship leaders, it became evident that little research has been attempted in diagnosing, addressing, and solving this issue. Kenley Hall's study specifically looks at the Paul/Timothy mentoring relationship and how it relates to pastors.¹¹ Elisabeth Selzer's study shows favorable results from Denver Seminary's implementation of a mentoring program for pastors in their graduate school.¹² Many other studies dance around this subject matter. What is missing is a study on the need for the mentoring of novice worship leaders specifically by veteran worship leaders.

¹¹ Kenley D. Hall, "The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation," *The Journal of Applied Christian Leadership* 11, no. 1 (Spring 2017): 44, accessed July 18, 2019, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquestcom.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/2093227576?accountid=12085>.

¹² Elisabeth H. Selzer, "Effectiveness of a Seminary's Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates," *Journal of Research on Christian Education* 17, no. 1 (Jan-Jun 2008): 25-53, accessed July 22, 2019, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/603597224?accountid=12085>.

Purpose of the Study

Novice worship leaders at any age or level of school need a balanced approach to learn how to effectively lead a worship ministry, including spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management. Mentoring in spiritual formation is important because few worship leaders have been intentionally taught how to practice the spiritual disciplines of prayer, Bible reading, Bible study, personal worship, and meditation. The novice worship leader also needs training in leadership development in order to be an effective leader within the worship ministries they serve. There must also be guidance in developing the time management skills necessary to fulfil all the roles expected of today's worship leader positions. Learning in each of these areas is expedited by methodical mentoring from experienced, veteran worship leaders.

The purpose of this qualitative historical thesis is to expose the lack of intentional mentorship of novice worship leaders, highlight practical applications on the efforts of corporate, academic, and pastoral mentoring, while also presenting the biblical mandate and example of Jesus to make prominent the calling on each veteran worship leader to embrace and pursue intentional mentoring relationships with novice worship leaders. Further, there must be a concerted effort to motivate veteran worship leaders to embrace the role, while also training and equipping them to fulfill the role. The process has to begin somewhere. This study should be the catalyst for mentoring (*v.*) worship leaders to become mentoring (*adj.*) worship leaders.

Significance of the Study

The significance of this study is the premise that young worship leaders will be shaped for ministry in one of two ways: trial and error or mentorship. What is being studied in this paper is “that a mentor either guides pastoral formation or it will be shaped by the surrounding ethos

and culture.”¹³ Current trends in liberal doctrines not congruent with biblical exegesis must not be the novice worship leader’s teacher. Worship leaders must obtain ministry direction from biblically solid mentorship.

Many elements of a worship leader’s ministry can be attributed to natural gifting by God’s design. Other elements can be formed during rigorous academic pursuits in the realm of worship leadership training. The gap, as shown by the lack of research sources, is the connection between natural gifting and academic training as it relates to and is amplified by an intentional mentorship from more experienced, veteran worship leaders.

Hall points out that “pastoral formation” and “pastoral training” are separate entities.¹⁴ Whereas pastoral training is the process of acquiring certain and necessary skills, “Pastoral formation focuses on what the person is becoming.”¹⁵ *What they do* is certainly important and necessary, but *who they are* is equally, if not more important, in the future of the novice’s lifelong vocational ministry and effectual impact in the kingdom of God.¹⁶

It is vitally important to understand that ministry is more than learning certain skills. More importantly, ministry is about becoming a minister with biblically guided influence on those with whom one ministers. It is imperative that someone, namely veteran worship leaders, take seriously the biblical call to train up and mentor novice worship leaders in the areas of spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management. Though each of these contains elements of learning “skills,” the emphasis must be on mentoring the novice worship

¹³ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 44.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Ibid.

leader as to *who* they should be in Christ as they perform these skills within the context of ministry.¹⁷

Research Questions

Research questions concerning the mentoring of worship leaders should address two major issues: (1) what biblical precedent calls for veteran worship leaders to develop mentoring relationships with novice worship leaders and (2) what aspects of mentoring should be included in these intentional mentoring relationships? The research questions for this study are:

RQ1: In what ways can the biblical model of mentorship guide veteran worship leaders to become mentors to novice worship leaders?

RQ2: In what ways can veteran worship leaders mentor novice worship leaders?

Research Question 1 is significant because the biblical model of mentorship provides a foundation for RQ1's applications. If worship is to be formed on biblical principles, then the characteristics of those who lead worship should also be derived from biblical principles. By viewing the Bible as the ultimate authority, an examination of Jesus as the primary biblical example for intentional mentoring relationships will lead to a greater understanding of the current need for veteran worship leaders to become mentoring worship leaders.

Research Question 2 is significant because worship leadership is so much more than the musical elements of a weekly worship service. The multiple aspects of worship leadership outside of musical training are best learned within a mentoring relationship. Though most structured worship leadership training programs spend ample time on the worship leader's musical and technological skillset, there is evidence of insufficient emphasis on the worship

¹⁷ Hall, "The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation," 44.

leader's character, specifically as it relates to spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management. The final goal of the thesis is to define constructive ways in which experienced worship leaders can spread their knowledge of the field to other worship leaders through these three areas.

Hypotheses

Hypotheses concerning the mentoring of worship leaders include two major issues: the biblical precedent that calls for veteran worship leaders to develop mentoring relationships with novice worship leaders and the aspects of mentoring that should be included in these intentional mentoring relationships. The hypotheses for this study are:

H1: The biblical model of mentorship exemplified by Jesus can be applied to the process of the veteran worship leader becoming a mentor to novice worship leaders.

Hypothesis 1 explores biblical evidence of Jesus as the ultimate example of mentorship. He was intentional about those he chose to be his disciples.¹⁸ Jesus *modeled* for the disciples how to be a mentor. He also *taught* the disciples to be mentors.

Luke 6:12 shows that He prayed for the process. The biblical narrative often attributes high places like mountains to be both nearer to God and a place where spiritual activity or divine encounters occur. There are no indications as to what Jesus prayed as He went up the mountain in Luke 6:12. However, considering Jesus' prayer for the disciples in John 17, while also bearing in mind the weight of the forthcoming calling of the disciples on the following day, it would not be much of a stretch to imagine that Jesus' prayers that evening likely included prayer that His Father would guide Him to the disciples as well as prayer for their acceptance of the call.

¹⁸ Spradlin, "Discipling Worship Leadership," 97.

Likewise, because of Jesus' example, it would be in the veteran worship leader's best interests to pray significantly for guidance to the right protégés as well as to pray for their acceptance of the call to join the process.¹⁹

Mark 3:13-15 shows that Jesus initiated the process. "Historically, disciples made the decision as to which master they would follow, but in Jesus' case, it is the Master who chooses his disciples."²⁰ Protégés do not become protégés by asking for an appointment as such. In a mentoring process based on the biblical principle of mentoring, they become protégés by invitation of the mentor. The full onus of the initiation of the mentor/protégé relationship rests on the mentor. Though the mentor must make the invitation with the full intention of implementing the mentor/protégé relationship, the protégé bears the weight of accepting the offer. Without the protégé's acceptance, there is nothing the mentor can do to fulfill the role of a mentor, as outlined in the next section.

Mark 6:7-13 shows that He gave a practical application of the process to the disciples. Indeed, Jesus lived the example, and that is enough. However, Jesus did not leave it to the disciples to figure out on their own how to live like Him. He spent a significant amount of time and energy training, teaching, and sending them to "go and do likewise" (Luke 10:37).²¹ Do *what* likewise? Jesus showed and taught them how to be consistent in a daily walk

¹⁹ Matt Thomas, "The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership: Implications from Christ's Methods of Leadership Development in Mark's Gospel," *Perichoresis: The Theological Journal of Emanuel University* 16, no. 3 (July 1, 2018): 112-113, accessed July 31, 2019, <https://content.sciendo.com/view/journals/perc/perc-overview.xml>.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 110.

²¹ Luke 10:37 (NLT).

with God, have a daily meeting with God in His Scriptures, pursue daily fellowship with other believers, and daily serve others on God's behalf.²²

John 13:16-17 shows that He charged His disciples to imitate His leadership style as they went out. Matt Thomas says, "Jesus' plan involved a pattern of transforming the individual in order to transform the world."²³ That plan, according to Thomas, is, "the combined effort of action and agenda purposing to intentionally influence others."²⁴ In other words, it is some action performed as a result of an intentional agenda that was designed to influence others.

H2: Veteran worship leaders can and should mentor novice worship leaders in the areas of spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management.

Hypothesis 2 explores how veteran worship leaders can and should mentor novice worship leaders in three specific areas: spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management. The opportunity for multifaceted applications exists within each of these three domains. More will be discussed relating to each of these elements in subsequent chapters.

The first area is the practice of personal discipleship. This area is not about the practical applications of the necessary skills for *doing* the ministry, but instead includes character building in *being* a minister. This means a portion of the mentor's energy must be expended on teaching, challenging, and holding accountable the novice in their personal, daily spiritual growth.²⁵ Becoming a Christ-follower, even one called into ministry leadership, does not inherently imbue one with the indispensable tenets of personal discipleship, which include:

²² Spradlin, "Discipling Worship Leadership," 98-99.

²³ Thomas, "The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership," 110.

²⁴ Ibid., 108.

²⁵ Ibid., 98-99.

prayer, personal worship, Bible reading, Bible study, fellowship with other believers, and acts of service.²⁶

This area of personal discipleship includes the theological foundations of worship. In Deuteronomy 6:5, Moses calls God’s people to “Love the LORD your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your might” (ESV). With love being the motivating factor behind the worship of God, then this verse could also be rendered “*Worship* the LORD your God with all your heart, soul, and might.” This is not a one-time event or even a series of events experienced from Sunday to Sunday. “Worship is the highest priority in all of life—for each believer, as well as every Christian congregation,” as Spradlin reminds us.²⁷ The veteran worship leader must mentor the novice worship leader to respect and honor this high calling as a worship leader.

The second area in which a veteran worship leader should mentor a novice worship leader is in leadership development. Now famous for the phrase, “Leadership is influence,”²⁸ John Maxwell contests that influence over others is a power to be wielded with the utmost integrity and care. The position of worship leader, by its very nature, carries a natural influence that must be refined. Those leadership skills need to be developed and are better learned within a mentoring relationship. A prime feature encompassing this position is compassionate pastoral care. Becoming a believer, even with a special calling of God to ministry leadership, does not give one inherent capabilities to show compassion toward the flock to which one is appointed. Examples of pastoral care can include hospital and nursing home visitations,

²⁶ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 99.

²⁷ Spradlin, “Discipling Worship Leadership,” 36.

²⁸ Maxwell, *The 5 Levels of Leadership*, 2.

counseling with couples facing marital issues, or comforting one who has lost a loved one. Tõ Lehtsaar and Maire Ivanova define pastoral care as “the support provided in local churches for personal and spiritual growth as well as coping with various crises.”²⁹ More of this is caught than taught, and very few worship leadership degrees even attempt to address the subject of pastoral care.

The third sphere is time management. Worship ministry leadership hinges upon this central component. Many areas of the practical side of *doing* worship ministry can be learned to some degree in post-secondary education. Some are the result of natural gifting. Nevertheless, these skills may be honed through intentional mentorship from a veteran worship ministry leader. Hall sums it up, “Most of the men and women graduating from seminary will be placed into two or three church districts where they will either learn to swim on their own or drown.”³⁰ This is, unfortunately, the norm, not the exception.

Core Concepts

It is essential to understand the different connotations of the key terms of mentoring, discipling, teaching, and coaching in order to grasp how this study approaches their usage fully. A mentor is most often understood within a corporate or business context. “Apprentice” might be a closely related term except that a mentor is usually more personally invested in their protégé than one supervising an apprentice. Mentor carries with it a basic premise that someone more experienced at something helps someone less experienced get more knowledge and skill at

²⁹ Tõ Lehtsaar and Maire Ivanova, “Opportunities for Church Related Pastoral Counseling in Estonian Evangelical Churches,” *International Journal of Practical Theology* 15, no. 2 (2011): 279, accessed July 31, 2019, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1114442354?accountid=12085>.

³⁰ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 43.

whatever is being taught through the mentoring process. This is a very generalized description and does not take into account the additional preparation and plan of the mentor regarding what is being shared with the protégé. Nor does it address the idea that the mentor not only imparts skills but also teaches foremost by modeling best practices for the protégé, whatever the focus of the mentoring may be. The term “mentor” can refer to the one doing the mentoring, or it can refer to the action of mentoring. A “mentorship” would then be the relationship between mentor and protégé, most often intentionally designed for the purpose at hand.

A disciple is one who follows another, usually in a religious context. For this study, its definition will remain within the religious context. “Disciple” is also a verb that speaks of the action of discipling another. The form of “disciple” that mirrors the same form of “mentor” would be a “discipler,” which is not a word in the Merriam-Webster Dictionary as of 2019. There is no perfect word for the one who disciplines, which is partly why the waters get so muddy among these four terms. “Discipleship” is the process of being a disciple. Note here that, as discussed in the Introduction, a disciple of Christ carries two time delimiters: (1) the singular point in time when one becomes a disciple where the old becomes new as the lost person experiences personal salvation through Christ and (2) the continual passage through time as one persistently pursues growth in learning more about how to live like Christ on a daily basis.

The other two terms are likely more familiar: “teach” and “coach.” However, in the context of this comparison of terms, they both find ambiguity as well. It could probably be argued that teachers generally communicate broader concepts and principles, whereas coaches more likely guide the development of specific skills. While valid on both accounts, swapping “teachers” and “coaches” in the previous sentence would not be in error, either. “Teach” is only in verb form. One who teaches is the “teacher.” Furthermore, the process the teacher takes to

teach something is “teaching.” “Coach,” on the other hand, is both the process of coaching and the one doing the coaching.

Nonetheless, even with the ambiguity and crossover with so many definitions, it is important to understand that all four terms are part of each of the other terms’ best practices. A “discipler” must mentor, teach, and coach. According to best practice, the coach should mentor, disciple, and teach. For this study, “mentoring” and “mentor” generally are intended in this way by often including concepts of discipling, teaching, and coaching.

Another core concept is the usage of “worship leader.” Being the center of the attention of this research, understanding who the “worship leader” is will become paramount to the necessities laid out for how to mentor a worship leader to become a mentoring worship leader.

In many, if not most, contemporary churches, the worship leader is seen primarily as having one duty: leading the congregation in worship from the stage within the confines of a worship service. So as not to get into any discussion about titles like Worship Pastor, Minister of Music, Pastor of Creative Arts, and the like, “worship leader” for this study means the one called by God and tasked by the local church to develop and lead a comprehensive worship ministry. “Comprehensive” denotes more than just leading the singing portion of worship services each week. Those various duties will be discussed further in Chapter Two. With that, it is imperative to grasp that within the context of this paper, “worship leader” is the all-inclusive leader of a church’s comprehensive worship ministry.

Three main models of organized mentoring programs will be discussed. The corporate mentorship model has received the most attention through research and publications. In church circles, “corporate” is concerning what we do *together* as a church body; however, in the context of corporate mentoring, it is almost always used to describe business models. This might be

where a CEO takes a promising newer employee and shows them how the company runs from the inside in the hopes that they will progress into higher management. A second model, collegiate mentoring programs, looks purposefully toward academic models that assign students to specially trained mentors. The third area of study will address intentional pastoral mentorship. In this usually informal approach, a senior pastoral figure will take a less-experienced person aside for intentional mentorship toward a future in ministry.

Research Methods

The method of research will be qualitative historical. The qualitative design approach, as described by Creswell, is appropriate to this method because the researcher will be making interpretations of the literature concerning other avenues of mentorship and, by inductive reasoning, making application as it pertains to veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders.³¹ The historical method, as Carr describes it, is appropriate to the paper because it will look at the body of existing literature that defines mentoring from corporate, academic, and pastoral perspectives and presents innovative solutions to current issues in worship leader mentorship.³² The study will attempt to qualify the need for more veteran worship leaders to accept their God-given role as mentors to other, less experienced worship leaders by amalgamating multiple sources of research on mentorship not explicitly aimed at worship leaders and expressing the great need for peer-to-peer mentorship from veteran to novice worship leaders.

³¹ John W. Creswell and J. David Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches, Fifth Edition* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publishing, 2018), 183.

³² Edward Hallett Carr, *What is History?* (New York, NY: Random House Inc., 1961), 35.

Research Plan

The existing literature pertaining to this study is related to corporate mentoring models, academic mentorship programs, and intentional pastoral mentorships. Looking at how CEOs and other company leaders train up promising employees to higher ranks of leadership is helpful for practical guidance but also as a theoretical necessity. Just as businesses cannot continue to grow without the process of mentorship, worship ministries are also dependent upon continual development of leadership. The recent attempts at academic mentorship programs by schools such as Denver Seminary³³ and Charleston Southern University³⁴ are excellent sources of positive influences on the success of ministry students following graduation. By studying examples of pastoral mentorships, one can see more of a personal, one-on-one, ministry-related, and often biblically sound mentorship process.

Definition of Terms

Mentoring: a process for the informal transmission of knowledge, social capital, and psychosocial support perceived by the recipient as relevant to work, career, or professional development; mentoring entails informal communication, usually face-to-face and during a sustained period of time, between a person who is perceived to have greater knowledge, wisdom, or experience (the mentor) and a person who is perceived to have less (the protégé).³⁵

Mentor: the one performing the processes of mentoring.

³³ Selzer, "Effectiveness of a Seminary's Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates," 25-53.

³⁴ Allen Sherman Hendricks, "A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education" (DMin diss., Liberty Baptist Theological Seminary, 2012), accessed July 22, 2019, <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/592>.

³⁵ Tim Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts: Helping Others Find Their Voice* (Chicago, IL: GIA Publications, Inc., 2011), 26.

Disciple: a disciple is someone who follows Jesus Christ as Savior and Lord and is actively learning and obeying His teaching and is involved in a meaningful or significant way in its mission of making disciples.³⁶

Protégé: a protégé wants to observe a congruent individual who has not only achieved some degree of success within his or her field but also has demonstrated success in balancing life with the profession.³⁷ This is the one being mentored, sometimes referred to as apprentice, disciple, or mentee.

Worship Leader: a faithful worship leader magnifies the greatness of God in Jesus Christ through the power of the Holy Spirit, skillfully combining God's Word with music, thereby motivating the gathered church to proclaim the Gospel, to cherish God's presence, and to live for God's glory.³⁸

Summary

Of everything the church needs, veteran worship leaders taking up the mantle to mentor novice worship leaders is one of the most overlooked. It may not seem like such a key component to a novice worship leader's totality of ministry; after all, one plus one is still only two, so what difference could one veteran worship leader make? The math is not wrong, but the equation is. Instead of looking at mentoring as addition, the church must begin looking at mentoring as multiplication. When one plus one becomes two, each of those two can individually

³⁶ Rob Morgan, "Balance and Discipleship 3: Part 1" (Video Lecture), accessed November 1, 2018, Lynchburg, VA: Liberty University Online, https://learn.liberty.edu/webapps/blackboard/content/listContent.jsp?course_id=_454576_1&content_id=_26362739_1.

³⁷ Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 131.

³⁸ Bob Kauflin, *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God* (Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2008), 55.

begin another one plus one mentoring relationship. This now multiplies into four mentored worship leaders ready for the critical task of the calling. When each of these four now-veteran worship leaders takes on four novices, the equation produces eight, then sixteen, then thirty-two, then sixty-four, and the multiplication continues. If this could somehow be a perfect process, without losing one, this equation only takes approximately eighteen to twenty iterations before fostering a fully mentored worship leader in every church in America.³⁹

By considering the influence worship leaders have on the theology, doctrine, and belief of every congregant in America, the importance of this multiplicative effect of mentorship is overwhelming. This study will address the gap in current research. Further, this study will also offer practical guidance to the veteran worship leader who desires to fulfill the high calling to mentor novice worship leaders.

³⁹ Based on the estimate of 300,000 to 350,000 evangelical churches in the United States by Brent H. Burdick, “The Status of the Church in North America” *Review & Expositor* 115, no. 2 (May 2018): 201, DOI:10.1177/0034637318771354.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

This chapter reviews literature pertaining to many aspects of mentoring. It consists of three main sections. In the first section, mentoring is defined, amplified, and described. Before understanding the need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders or developing strategies for doing so, it is beneficial to explore the concept of mentoring. Since the process of mentoring is central to this thesis, the reader needs to know how this author uses the term. In the second section, the literature review examines the need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders. The importance of discipleship, the difficulty of trial and error learning, the shortfall of academia's approach to worship leader training, and the rise of untrained/uneducated yet naturally talented musicians thrust into worship leader roles is addressed. In the third and final section, the elements needed within a mentoring relationship are discussed, including those of spiritual formation, leadership development, and organizational skills.

Mentoring Defined

In order to understand the term, a brief history of mentoring is helpful. The term was first used in ancient Greek literature when Odysseus, seeking to educate his son, turned to a close friend whose name was Mentor.⁴⁰ Though history shows that the French writer François Fénelon based his 1699 novel, *Les aventures de Télémaque*, on the characters of Homer's *Odyssey*, including Mentor,⁴¹ it remains unclear when the proper name of Mentor began to be used as a

⁴⁰ "Mentor (Noun)," in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster), accessed October 25, 2019, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/mentor>.

⁴¹ Ibid.

noun or verb. In this theme, Yvette Bynum quotes Colley, “Mentor is commonly referred to as being a wise and kindly elder, a surrogate parent, a trusted advisor, an educator and guide.”⁴² “Since then, wise and trusted advisors have been called ‘mentors.’”⁴³ The noun mentor is now most often used to describe one who is usually older, more experienced, and generally wiser guiding and influencing one who is younger and less experienced in a positive manner.⁴⁴

In a text devoted to promoting and elevating mentorship within music ensembles, Tim Sharp’s research gives further definition to the concept of mentoring. He says, “In a study conducted by Smith, Howard, and Harrington, the term ‘mentor’ refers to ‘a more senior person who takes an interest in sponsorship of the career of a more junior person.’”⁴⁵ This gives credence to the nature of the relationship from older to younger, experienced to inexperienced, wiser to naïve, and veteran to novice. Sharp continues, “Tepper further describes the mentoring relationships as existing in order to ‘facilitate junior colleagues’ (protégés’) professional development and career progress.”⁴⁶ Quoting Murray, Maake Massango points to the same outcome of mentoring, “It is a deliberate pairing of a more skilled or experienced person with a lesser skilled or experienced one, with the agreed-upon goals of having the lesser skilled person

⁴² Yvette P. Bynum, “The Power of Informal Mentoring,” *Education* 136, no. 1 (September 22, 2015): 70, https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/A428998434/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=57b7f609.

⁴³ Olya Kovnatska, “Say Yes to Mentoring!” *Strategic Finance; Montvale* 95, no. 11 (May 2014): 48. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1525995646?accountid=12085>.

⁴⁴ Maake Masango, “Mentorship: A Process of Nurturing Others,” *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 67, no. 1 (June 6, 2011): 3, <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v67i1.937>.

⁴⁵ Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 25.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*

grow and develop specific competencies.”⁴⁷ In these instances, the advancing of the career of the protégé is central to the relationship. Bynum echoes this point with an observation from Tareef, “Mentoring relationships involve a more skilled and knowledgeable professional serving as a supportive and guiding example for another professional that is less practiced in the field.”⁴⁸ Sue Hall-Heimbecker describes it this way, “Besides communicating particular knowledge, skills, and attitudes, the role of a mentor includes guidance in planning future career paths and evaluating strengths and weaknesses of the learner.”⁴⁹

Though Simonetti, Ariss, and Martinez say, “no one word currently in use can convey the nature of the mentoring relationship,”⁵⁰ all of the previous definitions give a shade of this mentoring relationship in some form or another. However, Sharp’s research led him to a comprehensive definition of mentoring written by Bozeman and Feeney. This definition is broad and encapsulating, and therefore is a standard definition from which many others are derived.

They define it this way:

Mentoring: a process for the informal transmission of knowledge, social capital, and psychosocial support perceived by the recipient as relevant to work, career, or professional development; mentoring entails informal communication, usually face-to-face and during a sustained period of time, between a person who is perceived to have greater knowledge, wisdom, or experience (the mentor) and a person who is perceived to have less (the protégé).⁵¹

⁴⁷ Masango, “Mentorship,” 5.

⁴⁸ Bynum, “The Power of Informal Mentoring,” 69.

⁴⁹ Sue Hall-Heimbecker, “Mentoring Artists” in *Worship and Mission for the Global Church: An Ethnodoxology Handbook*, James R. Krabill et al., eds., (Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 2013), 408.

⁵⁰ Jack L. Simonetti, Sonny Ariss, and Joan Martinez, “Through the Top With Mentoring,” *Business Horizons* 42, no. 6 (November 1, 1999): 8, https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/A58381521/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=39004a10.

⁵¹ Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 26.

While Bozeman and Feeney’s definition seems to address the nuts and bolts of *what* mentoring is, it only glances at the overwhelmingly positive outcomes of such a relationship. Sharp turns to Kram and Isabella to expand the understanding of the influence on the protégé: “Mentors provide young adults with career-enhancing functions, such as sponsorship, coaching, facilitating exposure and visibility, and offering challenging work or protection, all of which help the younger person to establish a role in the organization, learn the ropes, and prepare for advancement.”⁵²

In addition to the multitude of career benefits and character enhancements, an included connotation within the etymology of the French root word, *protéger*, is the concept that the protégé is under an umbrella of protection by the mentor.⁵³ In any case, Young and Perrewe suggest that the strength of mentoring relationships relies heavily upon the “tangible (e.g., promotions) or intangible (e.g., encouragement) benefits” outweighing the “tangible (e.g., money) or intangible (e.g., effort) costs.”⁵⁴

Mentoring Amplified

Mentoring

“Mentor” can be either a noun or a verb.⁵⁵ In the noun form, the term refers to the one doing the mentoring, most often the more senior or veteran member of the relationship. In the

⁵² Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 27.

⁵³ “Protégé (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster), accessed October 30, 2019, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/protégé>.

⁵⁴ Angela M. Young and Pamela L. Perrewe, “What Did You Expect? An Examination of Career-Related Support and Social Support Among Mentors and Proteges,” *Journal of Management*, 26, no. 4 (August 2000): 615, https://bi-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/global/article/GALE%7CA66497894?u=vic_liberty&sid=summon.

⁵⁵ “Mentor (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster).

verb form, the term refers to the intentional process of the veteran’s relationship to the novice specifically related to any actions contained therein. Likewise, “mentoring” can have several grammatical functions. Depending on context, the term mentoring can refer to the actions or process used by a mentor, or can also be used as a modifier. For example, “He is a *mentoring* worship leader” uses the term as an adjective. In this context, one of his functions as a worship leader is being a mentor. In another form, “mentorship” refers to the entirety of the relationship between mentor and protégé including the people, plans, processes, and actions.

There are several other words related to “mentor” and its various forms. Merriam-Webster lists some of the synonyms as coach, counsel, guide, lead, pilot, shepherd, show, tutor.⁵⁶ One similar concept in the Christian context is “disciple” (as a verb) or “discipleship” (as a noun). In any of these cases, there are considerable similarities with generally minute nuances that are specific to each individual word, as the study on spiritual transformation by Williamson and Hood indicates.⁵⁷ It is noteworthy to understand that these terms are often interchangeable within this thesis and the nuances will be noted when appropriate or necessary to distinguish.

Discipling

Aaron Keyes, in Boswell’s *Doxology and Theology*, defines discipling as “giving your life away so that others can do what you do, even better than you.”⁵⁸ He goes further, “If we’re merely teachers, and those under our care merely students, then our highest hopes for the next

⁵⁶ “Mentor (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster).

⁵⁷ W. Paul Williamson and Ralph W. Hood, “The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation: A Faith-Based Approach to Recovery from Substance Abuse,” *Pastoral Psychology* 64, no. 1 (February 2015): 135–52, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11089-013-0558-0>.

⁵⁸ Aaron Keyes, “The Worship Leader and Disciple-Making” in *Doxology & Theology: How the Gospel Forms the Worship Leader*, Boswell, Matt, (Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2013), 155.

generation of worship leaders is that they learn some information. . . . The greatest man to ever live planned to be surpassed by His disciples.”⁵⁹ A biblical exemplification of the process of discipleship is summed up by Jesus in Matthew 4:19, “And he said to them, ‘Follow me, and I will make you fishers of men.’”⁶⁰ In this passage, it is inferred that Jesus begins by calling the disciples to come to Him (Come). Then, the next phase is to follow Jesus (Follow). In following Jesus, He will form them into fishers of men (Be made). Again, by inference, Jesus is stating that he will train them to be fishers of men so they can go out and do this ministry of calling all people to Christ (Do). Jesus’ method of discipleship was Come, Follow, Be made, Do.⁶¹ The outcome of a discipling relationship is a disciple who, according to Jim Putman, is surrendered to “following Christ” as the head of his life (Come, Follow), “being changed by Jesus” in his heart (Be made), and “committed to Jesus’ mission to save people from their sins” through the actions of his hands (Do).⁶²

While *mentoring* is most often associated with business models, Williamson and Hood show that *discipling* is most often exclusively used within church or Christian models.⁶³ However, the two terms are similar and, in many instances, can be interchangeable. Williamson and Hood note that the nuances of mentoring that differ from discipling are that mentoring tends

⁵⁹ This refers to John 14:12 when Jesus said His followers would do greater things than He. Boswell, *Doxology & Theology*, 155.

⁶⁰ Matthew 4:19, ESV.

⁶¹ Jim Putman, Bobby Harrington, and Robert E. Coleman, *DiscipleShift: Five Steps That Help Your Church to Make Disciples Who Make Disciples*, Exponential Series (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2013), 45-51.

⁶² Jim Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship: Building Churches That Make Disciples* (Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress, 2010), 32-33.

⁶³ Williamson and Hood, “The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation,” 137.

to address the protégé’s future in leadership functions within industry while discipleship “helps mentees acquire spiritual disciplines and a disciplined lifestyle.”⁶⁴ Nonetheless, as Williamson and Hood studied the Lazarus Project,⁶⁵ both mentoring and discipling contain aspects congruent with the other and, in many cases, can be identical in function, process, and application.⁶⁶ In the current context of worship leaders, the two are particularly intertwined as this process of mentorship is concerned doubly about the protégé’s future leadership potential as well as their spiritual growth.⁶⁷ As such, in this paper, the concept of *mentoring* is presented as synonymous with the concept of *discipling*.

Teaching and Coaching

Two other terms amongst the study by Williamson and Hood are worthy of relating to this discussion: teaching and coaching.⁶⁸ As stated in Chapter One, it could be argued that teachers generally instruct or impart broader concepts and principles,⁶⁹ whereas coaches more often are associated with training one in specific skills or fundamentals.⁷⁰ While valid on both accounts, swapping “teachers” and “coaches” in the previous sentence would not be in error,

⁶⁴ Williamson and Hood, “The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation,” 137.

⁶⁵ “A Pentecostal-based 12-month residency program that believes the only successful path to overcoming drug and alcohol addiction is a spiritual one that begins with accepting Christ as savior and lord.” Ibid., 137-138.

⁶⁶ Ibid., 141-143.

⁶⁷ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 44.

⁶⁸ Williamson and Hood, “The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation,” 137.

⁶⁹ “Teacher (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster), accessed January 30, 2020, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/teacher>.

⁷⁰ “Coach (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster), accessed January 30, 2020, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/coach>.

either.⁷¹ Adding these clarifying definitions, one seeking to be a mentor must also be concerned with teaching and coaching.⁷² With this ambiguity in terms, it is beneficial to examine mentoring in corporate/business models, church/pastoral models, and biblical models.

Mentoring Described

Corporate/Business

Masango's article, "Mentorship: A Process for Nurturing Others," describes a nuance of mentoring in corporate/business models that is different than most church models. "Industry is generally more task oriented than people centered. The aim of mentorship is therefore to uplift the learner to a certain level of operation. . . . The effective relationship between them (the mentor and protégé) will not only benefit the mentee (or protégé) in the end, but also the industry."⁷³ Maxwell, in *How Successful People Lead*, says it this way, "There is a real temptation for leaders on the Production level to neglect relationships in pursuit of achieving a good bottom-line result."⁷⁴ Masango agrees:

This mentoring process requires the time of a senior person who creates the space for the mentee to learn. The difficulty faced by both is that the industry, in which they are working, requires production. Caring methods of nurturing can fall by the wayside under the pressure for production. One of the consequences of industrialisation [*sic*] is that at times the product becomes more important than the human beings.⁷⁵

Likewise, Thomas shows the difference by contrasting terminology,

⁷¹ "Instruct" and "train" are common in the definitions of both "teacher" and "coach" in the Merriam-Webster references.

⁷² Williamson and Hood, "The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation," 137.

⁷³ Masango, "Mentorship," 2.

⁷⁴ John C. Maxwell, *How Successful People Lead: Taking Your Influence to the Next Level*, First Edition. (New York, NY: Center Street, 2013), 128.

⁷⁵ Masango, "Mentorship," 2.

This is the primary distinction between mentors and managers. As a mentor, the relationship with a protégé is characterized by depth and personal commitment, focusing on broader objectives and encouraging mentees to ask relevant questions and think in new creative ways. Alternatively, managers manage for profitability, productivity, and business outcomes.⁷⁶

Even so, Michael Lindsay has studied hundreds of business models and says, “I am now convinced that the most gratifying part of leading a major institution has little to do with achieving organizational goals or redirecting a company culture. Instead, the dividend of power comes from relatively small deeds, the most common example being investing in young people.”⁷⁷ The corporate/business model of mentoring has the end in mind (profit), yet the most productive businesses invest in the means (mentoring of leadership) in order to meet their goals.

Church/Pastoral

Bob Kauflin has one of the best summaries of the importance of relationships in church/ministry contexts: “The church doesn’t need leaders who love to lead people in worship but don’t love the people they’re serving. Working on musical transitions and flow is secondary in importance to bridging relational gaps that may exist on our team.”⁷⁸ It is out of relationship with people that a worship pastor is able to effectively minister to those in the congregation and on their teams. Focusing on the bottom line, like the business model, does not meet the discipling side of the mentorship equation. This is of utmost importance to grasp. “Christianity has always seen the worship service as the nucleus of disciple making. . . . Worship stands at the center of

⁷⁶ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 111.

⁷⁷ D. Michael Lindsay and M. G. Hager, *View from the Top: An inside Look at How People in Power See and Shape the World* (Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2014), xix.

⁷⁸ Kauflin, *Worship Matters*, 216.

what it means to make disciples.”⁷⁹ Zac Hicks states further, “Corporate worship’s elements, practices, structures, and expression all have a shaping effect on us.”⁸⁰ Not only is mentorship (*discipleship* in this context) a one-on-one relationship, but it is a congregational relationship in this manner. Beyond this, a worship leader’s role includes the mentoring/discipling of the artists under their care (band, vocalists, choir, technicians). Rory Noland says, “I’ve come to the conclusion that the best person to lead artists is someone who’s an artist.”⁸¹ Sharp takes this concept further by relating the church mentoring artist to the arts throughout history, “The process of apprenticeship was a necessary step in earlier times, and an absolute requirement in the arts.”⁸² This is no less true for church artists, specifically the musicians under the worship leader’s direction.

Biblical

Much about discipleship can be learned from books, seminars, classes, and teaching. It is important to gain some knowledge from these sources. However, simply transferring information cannot be the “sum total of discipleship”⁸³ as Aaron Keyes states. “Discipleship is more than working through curriculum, more than learning intellectual content of the Bible. Discipleship involves allowing the Word to work through us.”⁸⁴ Jesus said that He did nothing “on His own,

⁷⁹ Zac Hicks, *The Worship Pastor: A Call to Ministry for Worship Leaders and Teams* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2016), 52.

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, 54.

⁸¹ Noland, *The Heart of the Artist*, 250.

⁸² Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 38.

⁸³ Keyes, “The Worship Leader and Disciple-Making” in *Doxology & Theology*, Boswell, 154.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*

but only what He sees the Father doing”⁸⁵ and spoke only words that “belong to the Father who sent [Him].”⁸⁶ The bottom line in the biblical description of mentoring is that one is changed by the Word of God. Paul asks in Romans 10:14 (NIV), “How can they hear about him unless someone tells them?” Paul also challenges his protégé, Timothy, “What you have heard from me in the presence of many witnesses entrust to faithful men who will be able to teach others also.”⁸⁷ Likewise, Paul encouraged the believers in Corinth to imitate him in how he lived and taught.⁸⁸

There is a pertinent example of Old Testament discipleship in Exodus 18. After Moses had been leading the Israelites in the wilderness for some time, he became overwhelmed with the expectations placed on him. Jethro, his father-in-law, noticed this burden and encouraged Moses to appoint able-bodied men over some of these affairs. In doing so, Moses was relieved of much burden but also empowered others to the work of ministry. Leslie Veen argues:

This passage contains three core elements for effective supervised ministry: relationships, reflection, and re-action. The first, relationships, refers to the vital web of personal rapport and support that is necessary for creating a space for deep learning to occur. The second, reflection, alludes to the vital work of observing and pondering not only the actions that make up the work of ministry but also the meanings the said actions give to that ministry. And finally, re-action indicates the all-important work of giving space for supervisees to try on new ways of ministry (new actions) that spring from the work of reflection while they are still being held in a safe, supported, supervised setting.⁸⁹

⁸⁵ John 5:19, HCSB.

⁸⁶ John 14:24, NIV.

⁸⁷ 2 Timothy 2:2, ESV.

⁸⁸ 1 Corinthians 4:16.

⁸⁹ Leslie Veen, “Jethro and Moses: A Biblical Model for Supervision from Exodus 18,” *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry* 38 (2018): 221–222, <http://journals.sfu.ca/rpfs/index.php/rpfs/article/view/564/544>.

Veen shows a biblical model of mentorship flourishes within relationship, marked by reflection, and proven by re-action.

This concept is exemplified in Jesus' life. When Jesus first began his public ministry, His first words were "Repent, for the kingdom of heaven has come near."⁹⁰ This was His message. His second words were calling fishermen out of their profession of fishing to follow Him as His disciples, "Come, follow me, and I will make you fishers of men."⁹¹ As stated earlier, this calling encapsulates the process of mentoring. In the next chapter of Matthew, Jesus went up on a mountainside and began to teach the disciples (Matthew 5-7). Commonly called the "Sermon on the Mount," the only recorded full sermon by Jesus began with the inner circle of the disciples, yet drew a crowd that were amazed at His teaching. But, following this large gathering and after ministering to the crowd in Matthew 8 and 9, Jesus takes His disciples aside, gives them authority (Matthew 10:1), and sends them out to minister. Jesus exemplified mentorship.

The Need for Veteran Worship Leaders to Mentor Novice Worship Leaders

The onus of this paper is affirmed in Spradlin's statement: "There appears to be a clear need in our North American churches for more spiritually maturing, artistically skilled worship leadership; leaders who are clearly called, biblically sound, spiritually dynamic, pastorally oriented, artistically skilled, and specifically trained for worship ministry in our churches and their missional assignments."⁹² He continues further to address the cause of his assessment: "few

⁹⁰ Matthew 4:17, NIV.

⁹¹ Matthew 4:19, NIV.

⁹² Spradlin, "Discipling Worship Leadership, 4.

worship leaders are ever intentionally disciplined.”⁹³ If, as stated earlier by Zac Hicks, “Worship stands at the center of what it means to make disciples,”⁹⁴ then it stands to reason that the discipleship of worship leaders should be of utmost concern and made a priority. Echoing Spradlin’s statement about the need for more worship leaders with those characteristics, Stephen Miller, in *Worship Leaders: We Are Not Rock Stars*, says to worship leaders directly, “We are not exempt from living as disciples or making disciples.”⁹⁵ In 2 Timothy 2:2, Paul instructs Timothy, his protégé: “The things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable men who will also be qualified to teach others.”⁹⁶ With this, J. Oswald Sanders echoes Miller’s statement, “If he is to carry out his trust fully, the leader will devote time to training others to succeed and perhaps even supercede [*sic*] him.”⁹⁷

Conversely, Edward Marton points out that the church has become focused on the wrong thing,

According to Kinnaman, the reason that the church in the United States has a shallow faith problem is because it is trying to mass-produce disciples, fails to provide meaningful rituals, expects too little from the next generation, and fixates on quantity of attendees over quality of those present. (Kinnaman, *You Lost Me*, 120-125) As a whole, it is time for the Church to shift its focus back to Christ-centered values and for mature Christians to focus more on the relational aspect of connecting with people so that a more long lasting impact will develop through the process of mentorship and discipleship.⁹⁸

⁹³ Spradlin, “Discipling Worship Leadership, 4.

⁹⁴ Hicks, *The Worship Pastor*, 52.

⁹⁵ Stephen Miller, *Worship Leaders: We Are Not Rock Stars* (Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2013), 28.

⁹⁶ 2 Timothy 2:2, NIV.

⁹⁷ J. Oswald Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership: Principles of Excellence for Every Believer* (Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2017), 179.

⁹⁸ Edward R. Marton, “Mentoring and Discipling Through Missional Small Groups” (DMin diss., United Theological Seminary, 2015), 97, <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1706899504?accountid=12085>.

If, as also shown in the next section, the church's primary function is to make disciples and see those disciples making disciples,⁹⁹ there must be a transformation in how churches evaluate effectiveness.¹⁰⁰ Stetzer and Rainer call for a new scorecard. The all-too-common metrics of attendance and baptisms are good for statistical relevance, but they cannot be the *only* metric, and as Stetzer and Rainer challenge, should never be the primary metric.¹⁰¹ Instead, "This [new] scorecard would count what's important—people coming to Christ and living in Christian community—but also counts the other important issues as well. At its essence the new scorecard must measure how well the church is making disciples."¹⁰² If this is truly the case, Marton sums up the solution, "Discipleship is important in the Christian life, therefore the church is in need of mentors who know how to lead in discipleship and also know how to mentor future mentors."¹⁰³ Putman takes this thought one step further, "when done right, discipleship will produce the leaders every church needs to succeed. God has placed leaders *within* every church because He cares for the people the church needs to reach."¹⁰⁴

⁹⁹ Matthew 28:18-20.

¹⁰⁰ Ed Stetzer and Thom S. Rainer, *Transformational Church: Creating a New Scorecard for Congregations* (Nashville, TN: B & H Pub, 2010), 25-26.

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, 26-27.

¹⁰² *Ibid.*, 31.

¹⁰³ Marton, "Mentoring and Discipling Through Missional Small Groups," 107.

¹⁰⁴ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 19.

The Biblical Basis for Mentoring

A discussion of the biblical basis for mentoring is wrapped up in examples of mentorship set forth in Scripture. There are many examples of successful mentorship in the canon of Scripture, but none compare to the impact of the methods set forth by Jesus Christ.¹⁰⁵ When most people think of *discipleship*, they likely think of Jesus' call in the Great Commission to *make disciples* as found in Matthew 28:18-20. This is a good place to start, but some misnomers must be addressed before further study in a biblical methodology of mentorship.

First, as Putman, Harrington, and Coleman say in *Discipleshift*, too many churches hear this passage and think Jesus is calling His disciples to make *converts*.¹⁰⁶ They point out the difference between *converts* and *disciples*: “We make disciples, the text tells us, by baptizing people who respond to the gospel message and by teaching them to obey everything Jesus commanded.”¹⁰⁷ “Following Christ,” they say, “is a nonnegotiable part of the Great Commission.”¹⁰⁸

A second misnomer to address is in the confusion of emphasis between “go” and “make.” The nature of our English translations often “give the impression that ‘go’ is the emphasis of the command, but the main verb of the sentence is ‘make disciples’, with three subordinate participles hanging off it: going (or ‘as you go’), baptizing and teaching.”¹⁰⁹ The meaning

¹⁰⁵ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 108.

¹⁰⁶ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 32.

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁹ Colin Marshall and Tony Payne, *The Trellis and the Vine: The Ministry Mind-Shift That Changes Everything* (Youngstown, OH: Matthias Media, 2009), 12.

Marshall and Payne intend to point out is that the primary calling here is to make disciples *by* going, baptizing, and teaching.¹¹⁰ “*It’s a commission that makes disciple making the normal agenda and priority of every church and every Christian disciple.*”¹¹¹ Further, Michael Crow states, “The command to make disciples who obey Jesus includes obeying this command as well. We are to make disciples who make disciples who make disciples.”¹¹²

Jesus said in John 6:38 that He came down from heaven not to accomplish His own will, but rather to do that which God the Father had sent Him to do. He said this within the context of talking about His relationship with His followers. Matt Thomas develops this thought, “For Jesus, discipleship was a relationship before it was a task, it was a who before a what.”¹¹³ Jesus’ primary mission on Earth was to secure the salvation and restoration of believers, but secondary to that, He was tasked with mentoring others to take His message to the ends of the Earth (John 20:21). As Crow relates, Jesus developed this through relationships, “An intensified relational network was the immediate context of mentoring.”¹¹⁴ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman say, “Most Christians have divorced the teachings of Jesus from the methods of Jesus, and yet they expect the results of Jesus.”¹¹⁵ Teaching what Jesus taught is certainly a part of the Great Commission, but the inference is also to teach the *way* in which Jesus taught; as Putman relates,

¹¹⁰ Marshall and Payne, *The Trellis and the Vine*, 12.

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, 13.

¹¹² D. Michael Crow, “Multiplying Jesus Mentors: Designing a Reproducible Mentoring System: A Case Study,” *Missiology: An International Review* 36, no. 1 (January 1, 2008): 89, <https://doi.org/009182960803600107>.

¹¹³ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 113.

¹¹⁴ Crow, “Multiplying Jesus Mentors,” 91.

¹¹⁵ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 33.

“Jesus was *with* his disciples because His relationship with them was the conduit by which He could deliver all that they needed.”¹¹⁶

The gospel of Mark shows the progression of Jesus’ model of mentorship: “And he went up on the mountain and called to him those whom he desired, and they came to him. And he appointed twelve (whom he also named apostles) so that they might be with him and he might send them out to preach and have authority to cast out demons.”¹¹⁷ Thomas summarizes this approach:

Examining the paradigm of Jesus’ leadership development reveals that he initiated this paradigm (Mark 3:13-19), he prayed for the success of this paradigm (an elaboration found only in Luke 6:12), he applied this paradigm (Mark 6:7-13), and he commended this paradigm to his disciples through his instruction to maintain the biblical mentoring of other disciples (John 13:16-17).¹¹⁸

Maintaining the biblical mentoring of other disciples can be observed in Paul’s relationship to Timothy, whom he deemed close enough to consider as his own son in the faith (1 Timothy 1:2). Through many letters, specifically 1 and 2 Timothy, Paul teaches Timothy just as Jesus taught His disciples by teaching him how to *be* a Christ-follower more so than what to *do* as a Christ-follower. But it was not just about this transference from Paul to Timothy; Paul also charged Timothy to teach others what he had been taught by Paul (1 Timothy 4:13, 5:7, 6:2). Specifically, in 2 Timothy 2:2, Paul charged Timothy to find faithful men to teach and entrust the truths of Christ. In summary, Matt Thomas says, “In order to ensure a succession in Christian leadership, Christian mentors must be concerned with developing Christ-likeness before

¹¹⁶ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 48.

¹¹⁷ Mark 3:13-16, ESV.

¹¹⁸ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 112.

developing leaders.”¹¹⁹ “The success or failure of a young minister,” as Hall conveys, “is ultimately determined not by what they do, but by who they are. Pastoral formation focuses on what the person is becoming.”¹²⁰

The Relationship Between Discipleship and Effectiveness

Every person, including worship leaders, is driven by the inertia of *habitus*.¹²¹ This phrase, coined by Pierre Bourdieu but effectively used by James K. A. Smith, “refers to the physical embodiment of cultural capital, to the deeply ingrained habits, skills, and dispositions that we possess due to our life experiences.”¹²² *Habitus* can be so ingrained in one’s psyche that it is not even perceived but almost instinctual.¹²³ This is not just an issue for individuals. Groups of like-minded people can often have their own group *habitus*, groups like the local church.¹²⁴ This complexity of “inclinations and dispositions [makes] us lean into the world with a habituated momentum in certain directions.”¹²⁵

McIntosh and Rima, in *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership*, point to the trend in which church leaders seek to find their validity as leaders in their success in areas such as “how many people you have attending your service, the size of the facility you have, the number of

¹¹⁹ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 113.

¹²⁰ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 44.

¹²¹ James K. A. Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom: How Worship Works* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2013), 79.

¹²² Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom*, 79 and “Habitus,” *Social Theory Re-Wired*, accessed February 9, 2019, <http://routledgesoc.com/category/profile-tags/habitus>.

¹²³ Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom*, 79-80.

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*, 80.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, 79.

staff members you have, how many user-friendly programs you have, and the size of the budget you have.”¹²⁶ It is a vicious cycle that when they find this sort of success in large congregations, large facilities, high numbers of attenders, large staff, number of programs, or the commercial promotion of events, they find no more fulfillment than before and they often leave that church for another one in order to continue this pursuit.¹²⁷ They are “driven manically to *have* success.”¹²⁸ This *habitus*, this ambition, McIntosh and Rima say, is “easily disguised in Christian circles and couched in spiritual language” like promoting their efforts to “fulfill the Great Commission and expand the church.”¹²⁹ In *DiscipleShift*, the authors rebuke this attitude, “In our obsession with bigger numbers of converts, far too little attention has been given to the nurture of believers in how to live their faith.”¹³⁰

Ultimately, as MacIntosh and Rima point out, living for this sort of *habitus*, an idea of success like this, “will leave us feeling frustrated and empty if we do not understand and accept our true identity in Jesus Christ.”¹³¹ They challenge church leaders to “come to the point where we recognize that our value is not dependent upon our performance, position, titles, achievements, or the power that we wield. Rather, our worth exists independently of anything we

¹²⁶ Gary McIntosh and Samuel D. Rima, *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership: How to Become an Effective Leader by Confronting Potential Failures*, Rev. (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2007), 20.

¹²⁷ Ibid., 20.

¹²⁸ Ibid.

¹²⁹ Ibid., 21.

¹³⁰ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 11.

¹³¹ McIntosh and Rima, *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership*, 213.

have ever done or will do in the future.”¹³² Miller says, “God does not have one ounce of concern to make you like that person you keep comparing yourself to. . . . No identity that you can create is better than the one that God has given you in Christ.”¹³³

There is also a concern with *knowing* more. Peter does challenge believers to grow in the knowledge of Christ (1 Peter 3:18), but it is often forgotten that he said to grow in the *grace* and knowledge of Christ. Grace is not only the grace received from God, but also in grace shown to others. The way one expresses that knowledge and grace in increasing measures of grace toward others is the point Peter is trying to make. Quoting Smith, Zac Hicks points out, “Being a disciple is not primarily a matter of getting the right ideas and doctrines and beliefs into your head in order to guarantee proper behavior; rather, it’s a matter of being the kind of person who *loves* rightly.”¹³⁴ What one loves and how they love is what drives what one does and how they do it.

In the light of this biblical truth, the worship leader is determined to be effective by the fruit of what he loves and how he loves it. If he loves numbers, buildings, programs, and recognition, the outcome of each of those is a remnant of the worship leader’s ego. However, if what he loves is people and seeing them grow in maturity in Christ, the outcome is a beautiful picture of biblical discipleship.

¹³² McIntosh and Rima, *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership*, 213.

¹³³ Miller, *Worship Leaders*, 49.

¹³⁴ Hicks, *The Worship Pastor*, 54.

The Lack of Practical/Real-World Opportunities Beyond Trial and Error

With more on academia's influence in the next sub-section, there is a trend noted in Hendricks' Doctor of Ministry dissertation, "A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education." Hendricks studied twelve college institutions that offer some sort of a degree in worship leadership (plus Charleston Southern, where he taught and sought to develop a worship leadership degree through the research of his dissertation). Of those thirteen top institutions in this particular educational market in America, Hendricks noted trends of instruction in three specific areas. The first is in key basics of music entailing music history, music theory, conducting, orchestration, applied studies, and music technology. The second is in worship and is generally "taught from a worship leadership perspective by music and worship faculty."¹³⁵ Courses here include worship leadership and administration, biblical foundations of worship, development of a philosophy and theology of worship, and components of congregational song, almost always including hymnology. The third part is in biblical studies which include Old and New Testament surveys, biblical worldviews, world religions, and doctrinal studies.¹³⁶

Though this provides an excellent foundation for worship leadership in each school's program, of the thirteen schools studied, four of the thirteen schools had no experiential component in a real-world scenario. Of those that did, six of the nine only required one semester of an internship or practicum in an active worship ministry.¹³⁷ Without a significant shift in focus from these thirteen schools and others like them, "Most of the men and women graduating

¹³⁵ Hendricks, "A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education," 110-111.

¹³⁶ Ibid., 109-113.

¹³⁷ Ibid., 159.

from seminary will be placed into two or three church [positions] where they will either learn to swim on their own or drown.”¹³⁸

Lindsay and Hager, after collecting data from and interviewing 550 top leaders in secular and religious contexts, were able to deduce many elements of effective leadership. In one portion of their study, they were able to interview several White House Fellowship interns. These interns are in close proximity to the nation’s highest officials, are able to observe them in their elements, and are often given assignments of their own to further a productive government.¹³⁹ One participant, in particular, spoke about the necessity of real-world experience: “Effective development of leadership has to include an experiential component. . . . There is no substitute for trying to *do* it. And the earlier you start trying to do it, the more likely you’ll get good at it.”¹⁴⁰ Lindsay and Hager quote John P. Kotter, a professor of organizational behavior at the Harvard Business School:

*Perhaps the most typical and important [career experience for a leader] is significant challenge early in a career. Leaders almost always have had opportunities during their twenties and thirties to actually try to lead, to take a risk, and to learn from both triumphs and failures. Such learning seems essential in developing a wide range of leadership skills and perspectives.*¹⁴¹

James K. A. Smith adds another dimension to this need for experiential learning. Diving deeply into research by Mark Johnson, the way one interacts with one’s world, and specifically with artistic creativity in the world, is not only determined by one’s current, in-the-moment mindset, but also by one’s varied past experiences. The meaning derived from any art does not

¹³⁸ Hendricks, “A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education,” 159.

¹³⁹ Lindsay and Hager, *View from the Top*, 40-53.

¹⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 43.

¹⁴¹ *Ibid.*

simply “happen” but is informed by each individual’s present mindset and past experiences. Johnson’s proposition is that the entirety of one’s mind (including attitudes, outlooks, beliefs, and convictions) is developed more so than instinctually ingrained.¹⁴² Smith’s connection to this concept of experiential learning is not simply about what one *does*, but also who one *is*: “Perhaps the mind of Christ [1 Corinthians 2:16] is also something that is *acquired* through practice and formation, something that emerges as a result of sanctification rather than an informational deposit.”¹⁴³ Combining all of this, one can surmise that, along with practical “how to” experience learned through on-the-job training, one’s growth in discipleship to be more and more like Christ, striving to attain the mind of Christ, is not merely information-based but also experiential.

What is concluded by these authors is that there is no substitute for on-the-job training. Education is important. As a worship leader, being called by God is certainly important. And there is much credence in the saying that “God doesn’t call the equipped, but He equips the called.” However, there must be a better way to learn worship ministry leadership than trial and error. Mentorship from veteran worship leaders to novice worship leaders is a viable solution.¹⁴⁴ After studying mentorship programs in two seminaries, Selzer concludes, “Learning experientially and being mentored prior to entry into full time ministry positions should better prepare people for ministry.”¹⁴⁵

¹⁴² Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom*, 103-150.

¹⁴³ *Ibid.*, 114.

¹⁴⁴ Selzer, “Effectiveness of a Seminary’s Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates,” 26.

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

Academia's Shortfalls in Educating Worship Leaders

Formal instruction is a key element to ministerial preparation, but it cannot be the sole source of learning. Referring to ministers as disciple-makers, Putman, Harrington, and Coleman say, “Effective disciple-makers do not exclude formal instruction, but they understand its limitations.”¹⁴⁶ In a study on this subject, with results specifically from Denver Seminary, Selzer shows concern for a “lack of continuity between what seminary students are learning in their classes and what they need to know once they enter the ministry context.”¹⁴⁷ There is a disconnect in that “what is learned remains in the cognitive realm of students’ minds instead of being put into action.”¹⁴⁸ Selzer points out the traditional emphasis in seminary study “has been on practical professional skills, predominantly those of theological and biblical study”¹⁴⁹ and shows that “passive learning should no longer be seen as a viable approach to learning.”¹⁵⁰ Further, she refers to Morgan’s belief that mentoring and experiential learning “should be the *center* of seminary training, above increasing intellectual capacities.” [emphasis mine]¹⁵¹ Similarly, Hall quotes Denver Seminary’s handbook in its section on training and mentoring and follows with his own summation:

“Many [men and women] in ministry vocations have been left to find their own way once their formal education is complete. Highly motivated, well-intentioned and highly educated [young pastors] may struggle and even flounder in ministry after receiving

¹⁴⁶ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 48.

¹⁴⁷ Selzer, “Effectiveness of a Seminary’s Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates,” 25.

¹⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 25.

¹⁴⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, 26.

¹⁵¹ *Ibid.*

stellar academic training” (Denver Seminary, p. 1). Denver Seminary’s mentoring handbook is not trying to negate the importance of formal academic training. However, it does make it clear that formal academic training alone does not prepare someone for ministry.¹⁵²

Introduced previously, Hendricks’ study of thirteen universities providing degrees in worship leadership shows a lack of emphasis on practicums or internships. The goal of his study was to research the needs as he developed a worship leadership program for Charleston Southern University.¹⁵³ This gap in experiential learning was noticeable enough that he specifically addresses the need for “sufficient practical experiences in planning and leading worship”¹⁵⁴ in his proposed curriculum for CSU.

Worship Leader magazine, a prominent voice in worship leadership of today’s churches, shows that schools have begun to address this gap. Seven years after Hendricks’ study, and including some of the same institutions, in the Winter issue of 2019, nine different colleges, universities, and specifically designed worship intensives are featured due to their influence in the field of worship leadership. Common language for each program includes “mentoring,” “internships,” and “practicums” while also highlighting that students will learn from faculty that are presently active in worship leadership and who are not just “academics.”¹⁵⁵

¹⁵² Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 43.

¹⁵³ Hendricks, “A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education,” 5.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 121.

¹⁵⁵ “Spiritual Direction,” *Worship Leader*, March 29, 2019, https://issuu.com/wlmag/docs/wl_1812_proof_2.

Even though schools are beginning to address this gap, in Selzer's study at Denver Seminary, several respondents felt the mentoring program was "forced,"¹⁵⁶ "superficial,"¹⁵⁷ and "too short in time."¹⁵⁸ Selzer says that when participants, students in this case, "felt forced into the process, the perceived benefit of the program was diminished."¹⁵⁹ She then points to Garrison's research which "asserts that externally imposed mandates for performance can reduce willingness to accept personal responsibility for learning."¹⁶⁰ According to Selzer, being a "hoop to jump through" to meet the needs of accredited degree completion can too often work against the intended goal of structured mentoring programs within worship leadership degree programs.¹⁶¹

Beyond this gap between academic knowledge and practical application, Plank uncovered an even more dire disconnect in university and seminary training. "Overwhelmingly, worship leadership degree programs require little, if any, discipleship or spiritual formation coursework."¹⁶² Worship leadership degrees are often secluded to the music schools with little or no interaction in the theology departments.¹⁶³ Likewise, theology students, often training to be

¹⁵⁶ Selzer, "Effectiveness of a Seminary's Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates," 31.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., 30.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., 32.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., 34.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid.

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Plank, "The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation," 8.

¹⁶³ Ibid., 14-15.

pastors, who eventually become the ones hiring worship leaders, do not venture into the music departments.¹⁶⁴ “The result in many evangelical churches is now skillful musicians without the means to develop a deeper spirituality, and theologically sound preachers without an understanding of biblical worship.”¹⁶⁵

In studying an annual report from 2014-2015 by *Worship Leader* magazine, “Worship Leader’s Guide to Higher Education.” Plank’s research supports the above claims with sobering reality:

The purpose was to investigate the number of hours required in the area of discipleship in the worship degree programs. When a course title appeared to be instructional for the student’s inner spiritual development, understanding and/or practicing spiritual disciplines, or how to be a lifelong Christ-follower, the course description was noted in order to confirm the required hours. A percentage of the worship degree program was calculated in order to reveal how much of the degree required a discipleship element.¹⁶⁶

An overview of forty-five worship degree programs in both undergraduate and graduate schools revealed 2.28% of the degree programs contain a required discipleship component. . . . Half (twenty-two out of forty-five) of worship leadership degree programs required no discipleship coursework at all.”¹⁶⁷

Summarizing Plank’s findings, half (twenty-two) of the worship leadership degrees in these forty-five programs do not have any coursework devoted to discipleship and of those twenty-five that do, only 2.28 percent of the entire degree program is devoted to a discipleship component.

¹⁶⁴ Plank, “The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation,” 15.

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, 19.

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 8-9.

¹⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, 14-15.

The Untrained/Uneducated Yet Naturally Talented Musicians Thrust into Worship Leader Roles

Page and Gray, as well as Harland, speak to the issue of churches where “experienced worship pastors are being unceremoniously dumped and replaced with newer, trendier models,”¹⁶⁸ and where “ministers of music started ‘aging out’ and Christian artists were taking their places.”¹⁶⁹ Page and Gray point to two primary factors that contribute to this trend:

First, the modern worship renewal ushered in new skill requirements in the areas of contemporary Christian music and technology. Many worship pastors trained prior to 1990 do not have these skills due to the breakdown in seminary and Christian college education for worship pastors. Second, because of a desire to connect with culture, a growing number of churches intentionally target younger leaders to be the “face” of worship services.¹⁷⁰

Mike Harland agrees: “Pastors started looking for someone just to ‘do the music.’ The expectations of the worship leader became more narrow and centered on performance.”¹⁷¹ A natural progression of this performance-based criteria for worship leaders is that talent in a musician begins to trump any sense of pastoral calling or presence of educational credentials.¹⁷² Page and Gray’s research speaks to this: “Although the number of worship related positions is increasing, the number of students involved in church music-related academic programs is

¹⁶⁸ Franklin S. Page and L. Lavon Gray, *Hungry for Worship: Challenges and Solutions for Today’s Church* (Birmingham, AL: New Hope Publishers, 2014), 141.

¹⁶⁹ Mike Harland, *Worship Essentials: Growing a Healthy Worship Ministry Without Starting a War!* (Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2018), 95.

¹⁷⁰ Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 142.

¹⁷¹ Harland, *Worship Essentials*, 95-96.

¹⁷² Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 62.

declining. This infers the worship positions are being filled with worship leaders who have little formal musical and theological training.”¹⁷³

It is not uncommon for worship leaders to be seen as “rock stars.”¹⁷⁴ Miller says that “we are in a culture that makes ‘idols’ out of men and women who can sing”¹⁷⁵ and that “we have a fundamentally flawed understanding of greatness that says our worth and significance is found in what we do and how well we do it.”¹⁷⁶ McIntosh and Rima further describe this “dark side” of ministry as they speak about culture’s emphasis on *having* or *doing* being in direct correlation to one’s *being*. The more one has or does has become a measure of his/her worth to the world. “*Being* has become inextricably linked to *having*.”¹⁷⁷ Cherry echoes this: “The *person* who you are in ministry will affect your ministry more than any skill or quality you possess.”¹⁷⁸ Harland connects this idea to church music: “[because] church leaders began to associate church growth with a contemporary music style,” this perpetuates a high-priority emphasis on the musical talent of a worship leader while also increasing the pressure a worship leader feels to perform at a high level.¹⁷⁹ Neither are healthy, yet churches tend to cast the talented as their worship leaders without regard for any other qualifying factors. Page and Gray challenge this practice: “Many

¹⁷³ Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 88.

¹⁷⁴ Miller, *Worship Leaders*, 11-18.

¹⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, 17.

¹⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, 47.

¹⁷⁷ McIntosh and Rima, *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership*, 21.

¹⁷⁸ Constance M. Cherry, *The Music Architect: Blueprints for Engaging Worshipers in Song* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2016), 4.

¹⁷⁹ Harland, *Worship Essentials*, 96.

problems associated with performance-driven worship can be eliminated if churches focus on securing men and women who are called, rather than simply skilled, to fill ministry positions.”¹⁸⁰ Without both musical and theological education accompanied by some form of a mentoring discipleship, David Bronson, writing in *For the Church: Gospel-Centered Resources from Midwestern Seminary*, says that worship leaders too often feel their job is to “produce (what a loathsome word!) an attractive group-based participation concert experience in order to draw people into the church. . . . to be a crowd-pleasing juke box.” He continues, “Believing the lie that their job in the church is to finagle some kind of emotional response during the musical portion of the service, they have no awareness of the fact that the task they’ve undertaken is of a pastoral nature.”¹⁸¹ John Witvliet brings sobering reality to this pastoral nature of worship leadership:

As worship leaders, we have the important and terrifying task of placing words of prayer on people’s lips. It happens every time we choose a song and write a prayer. We also have the holy task of being stewards of God’s Word. Our choices of Scripture and themes for worship represent a degree of control over people’s spiritual diets, over how they feed on the bread of life. For holy tasks such as these . . . the church needs pastoral people to plan and lead its worship.¹⁸²

Contents/Elements Needed in the Mentoring Relationship

In *The Trellis and the Vine*, Marshall and Payne describe a ministry in which they are involved that promotes the value of apprenticeship. In this two-year program, apprentices are immersed in working for a church or other Christian ministry. The strength of such a lengthy

¹⁸⁰ Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 62.

¹⁸¹ David Bronson, “Disciple a Worship Leader,” *For the Church: Gospel-Centered Resources from Midwestern Seminary* (blog), October 26, 2017, <https://ftc.co/resource-library/blog-entries/disciple-a-worship-leader>.

¹⁸² John D. Witvliet, *Worship Seeking Understanding: Windows Into Christian Practice* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2003), 282.

program is that “Their convictions, character and competencies are tested and developed. Under the supervision of an experienced minister, they ‘catch’ the nature and rhythms of Christian ministry, picking up valuable lessons and skills, and testing their suitability for long-term gospel work.”¹⁸³ This apprenticeship follows a biblical model exemplified in Jesus.

Putman and Harrington condense Jesus’ method of discipling into three simple phases. In the first, Jesus *demonstrated* how to minister in front of the disciples. In the second, Jesus *delegated* ministry tasks to the disciples. In the third, Jesus provided *supervision* (sometimes called coaching) to make his disciples accountable.¹⁸⁴ Throughout the three phases, Putman sees “three keys to His success: 1. Jesus was an *intentional leader* in every sense. 2. He did His disciple-making in a *relational environment*. 3. He followed a *process* that can be learned and repeated.”¹⁸⁵

This relational environment, as Putman describes it, must include five behaviors. The first is real teaching. “The right kind of teaching explains the Word so that those in the group can understand it right where they are, whatever their stage of spiritual growth.”¹⁸⁶ The second behavior is biblical shepherding. This includes leading the disciple to spiritual nourishment in the Word and fellowship. It includes protecting them from spiritual attacks they are not ready to fight themselves. It also includes caring for them enough to bring them back into the relationship when they falter or fall away.¹⁸⁷ A third behavior is transparency. Being transparent means both

¹⁸³ Marshall and Payne, *The Trellis and the Vine*, 143.

¹⁸⁴ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 160-162.

¹⁸⁵ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 35.

¹⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, 52.

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 52-54.

parties knowing each other well enough to know the good, the bad, and the ugly of each other's lives. This creates an "authentic, safe environment."¹⁸⁸ The fourth behavior Putman points to is accountability. Within this relational environment, each party needs "to be held accountable to live out the changes Jesus wants to make in their lives."¹⁸⁹ The fifth behavior involves guided practice. Putman describes this process: "It starts with 'You watch; I do' and moves to 'Let's do it together' and then to 'You do; I watch.'¹⁹⁰

J. Oswald Sanders' influential text, *Spiritual Leadership: Principles of Excellence of Every Believer*, includes reproducing leaders amongst its many biblically informed principles every believer should adopt. Within this theme, speaking about the need for mature disciples to mentor newer believers, Sanders says, "Younger people should feel the weight of heavy burdens, opportunity for initiative, and the power of final decisions."¹⁹¹ Thomas refers to Bawany, Russell, and Nelson to expound upon this subject:

"Mentors can advise you in making decisions to progress your career, expose you to opportunities you may not have previously considered, or had access to" (Bawany 2014: 52). Russell and Nelson agree and even indicate that the intent of leadership development through mentoring should consist of three specific stages of influencing others: training, educating, and giving experience, all of which can be identified in Jesus' pattern of leadership development. They conclude that mentoring is about developing people with the objective of helping them achieve their full potential (Russell and Nelson 2009: 40).¹⁹²

¹⁸⁸ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 56.

¹⁸⁹ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 59.

¹⁹¹ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 179.

¹⁹² Thomas, "The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership," 109.

This process, according to Smith, cannot be a one-time occurrence. He encourages the need for repetition: “There is no formation without repetition. There is no habituation without being immersed in a practice over and over again.”¹⁹³

Jake Gosselin, a popular influencer to worship leaders through his ministry Churchfront, lists five pillars of worship leading. When he speaks of worship leading, it is not just about the one hour of leading songs each Sunday from a stage, but about the entirety of what one does as the worship leader in a comprehensive worship ministry. Thorough understanding and genuine practice of these pillars is a necessity for effective ministry as a worship leader. Though he is young and would fit into the Millennial generation, it is interesting that his five pillars are nearly identical to those of Bob Kauflin’s, a well-respected leader in all things worship-related for nearly half a century. Gosselin’s five pillars are pastoral/spiritual, musical, administrative, leadership, and technology.¹⁹⁴ Kauflin’s four “pillars” (not his term but Gosselin’s) are leadership, musicianship, communication, and technology.¹⁹⁵ Kauflin’s “communication” pillar could easily encompass Gosselin’s administrative and pastoral/spiritual pillars. Vernon Whaley simplifies this even further into three segments, spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management.¹⁹⁶ Whaley promoted his three segments (or pillars) in his role as dean of the school of music and professor of worship studies at Liberty University. He holds significant

¹⁹³ Smith, *Imagining the Kingdom*, 183.

¹⁹⁴ Jake Gosselin, “The 5 Pillars of Worship Leading,” *Churchfront* (blog), August 16, 2018, <https://churchfront.com/blog-churchfront/2018/8/16/the-5-pillars-of-worship-leading>.

¹⁹⁵ Kauflin, *Worship Matters*, 38-41.

¹⁹⁶ Vernon Whaley, “*Principles of Team Leadership*” (Video Lecture), accessed April 22, 2018, Lynchburg, VA: Liberty University Online, https://learn.liberty.edu/webapps/blackboard/content/listContent.jsp?course_id=_419055_1&content_id=_22058018_1.

influence in worship leadership. Though his three segments are not as clean cut and easily divisible as Gosselin's or Kauflin's, the strength in his three segments is in their interconnectivity. Growth in Spiritual Formation will bleed over into Leadership Development. Developing as a leader includes managing one's organizational and time management skills which must include giving attention to one's spiritual growth. Though the three are intertwined, they also have distinctly different purposes and realms of effect on one's role as a worship leader. Thus, they are the three indispensable factors in the content of a mentoring relationship.

Spiritual Formation

As noted above, "At its core pastoral formation is about more than just imparting knowledge and skills," says Hall. "Shaping people into the image of Christ is at the heart of pastoral formation. Smith (2008a) reminds both mentors and mentees that 'pastors fail in ministry because their spiritual and personal lives fall apart—rarely do they fail because their skills were inadequate.' (p. 341)"¹⁹⁷ Further, as already discussed, "The church cannot afford to settle for worship leaders who are capable musicians but who are incompetent theologians."¹⁹⁸ Plank adds, "Without the worship leader progressing in discipleship to Christ, what the congregation is being led in may be something other than Christian worship."¹⁹⁹ With this in mind, a sobering reality is exposed by Williamson and Hood's statement, "Little research in the

¹⁹⁷ Hall, "The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation," 47.

¹⁹⁸ Michael Bleeker, "The Worship Leader and Scripture" in *Doxology & Theology*, Boswell, 48.

¹⁹⁹ Plank, "The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation," 6.

psychology of religion has considered what seems to be an important dynamic involved with spiritual transformation—the role of spiritual mentoring.”²⁰⁰

For Thomas, it is important to note his admonition that “Christian mentors must be concerned with developing Christ-likeness before developing leaders.”²⁰¹ “Leaders today—those who are spiritual—must take to heart their responsibility to pass on the torch to younger people as a first-line duty”²⁰² because “without a strong relationship to God, even the most attractive and competent person cannot lead people to God.”²⁰³ Plank notes, “Many who are hired in worship positions possess musical skill but are deficient in knowing how to walk with Christ. Very few have been discipled through their worship training or have been taught how to use the spiritual disciplines in ways that develop one’s daily liturgy.”²⁰⁴

Jerry Bridges, in *The Pursuit of Holiness*, shows how spiritual formation comes through a developing and growing relationship with Christ by quoting Jay Adams, “You may have sought and tried to obtain *instant* godliness. There is no such thing . . . We want somebody to give us three easy steps to godliness, and we’ll take them next Friday and be godly. The trouble is, godliness doesn’t come that way.”²⁰⁵ This is a process not an achievement. Discipleship, or the process of becoming more like Christ, has at its root the concept of discipline, or, as Sanders

²⁰⁰ Williamson and Hood, “The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation,” 136.

²⁰¹ Thomas, “The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership,” 113.

²⁰² Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 19.

²⁰³ *Ibid.*, 18.

²⁰⁴ Plank, “The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation,” 7.

²⁰⁵ Jerry Bridges, *The Pursuit of Holiness*, A Navigator Book (Colorado Springs, CO: Navpress, 1978), 98-99.

says, “Without this essential quality [discipline], all other gifts remain as dwarfs: they cannot grow.”²⁰⁶ This is not solely the idea similar to a parent using negative-consequence discipline on their misbehaving child. Though that is part, the real key is what Paul describes to Timothy as training oneself to be godly (1 Timothy 4:7). This echoes Paul’s teaching in 1 Corinthians where the pursuit of godliness is like an athlete who trains their body to compete for a prize. It is not haphazard, but structured training. The definitions of discipline at *Merriam-Webster.com* include concepts like control, obedience, order, pattern of behavior, self-control, “a system of rules governing conduct or activity,” and “training that corrects, molds, or perfects the mental faculties or moral character.”²⁰⁷

There are many elements often cited as necessary spiritual disciplines. Bridges notes that “Discipline toward holiness begins with the Word of God.”²⁰⁸ This involves hearing it, reading it, studying it, memorizing it, and meditating on it,²⁰⁹ all while paying close attention to the nudging of the Holy Spirit so that one can apply it in daily living. C. Randall Bradley also adds that spiritual formation should include both public and private worship, renewing retreats for silence and listening, spiritual mentoring from a more mature believer, and being involved in ministry outside of one’s responsibility as a vocational minister.²¹⁰ In any case, a spiritual

²⁰⁶ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 61.

²⁰⁷ “Discipline (Noun),” in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster), accessed October 30, 2019, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/discipline>.

²⁰⁸ Bridges, *The Pursuit of Holiness*, 99.

²⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, 102.

²¹⁰ C. Randall Bradley, *From Postlude to Prelude: Music Ministry’s Other Six Days* (Fenton, MO: MorningStar Music Publishers, 2004), chap. 6, “Spiritual Development,” Nook.

mentor should help their protégé to develop in each of these areas that they may grow in godliness for the benefit of the Kingdom of God.

Leadership Development

Being a “Worship Leader” has the significant connotation that one “leads.” Rob Redman states that “The real key to success is leadership, not talent and resources.”²¹¹ “Leadership, in the Christian context, is also about moving the people of God (through community) to accomplish (through organization) God’s purposes (through vision).”²¹² “At root, *leadership is the exercise of influence in the service of a shared cause.*”²¹³ Additionally, Maxwell says in *How Successful People Lead*: “Top-level leaders should spend 80 percent of their time and energy developing the top 20 percent of their people.”²¹⁴ It is equally important that the spiritual mentor not only develop the protégé’s practice of continual spiritual formation, but also develop their leadership savvy.

Leadership development is best gained through intentional, one-on-one relationships as Sanders states: “Leadership training cannot be done on a mass scale. It requires patient, careful instruction and prayerful, personal guidance over a considerable time.”²¹⁵ Lindsay and Hager agree, “More than just delegating and vision casting, leading well requires relational

²¹¹ Hendricks, “A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education,” 60.

²¹² Navarro, “Becoming a Complete Worship Leader,” 140.

²¹³ Lindsay and Hager, *View from the Top*, xiv.

²¹⁴ Maxwell, *How Successful People Lead*, 122.

²¹⁵ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 183.

intelligence.”²¹⁶ Being able to relate to one’s protégé is the key that unlocks the door for further development.

As discussed above, learning to be a worship leader must include an experiential aspect. This would involve Maxwell’s twelfth leadership law, the Law of Empowerment.²¹⁷ His process is to find leaders, build them up, give them resources, authority, and responsibility, and then turn them loose to achieve their own success in leadership.²¹⁸ “This level of leadership,” as Sandra Van Opstal states, “takes an immense amount of emptying on the part of the worship leader.”²¹⁹ Unfortunately, there are several key issues that too often *prevent* worship leaders from emptying themselves for the sake of a protégé. Van Opstal lists ego, fear of failure or risk taking, control, inefficiency, pride/insecurity, and self-sufficiency as contributing factors.²²⁰ Her proposed cure for this is simple: “Empty yourself and make room for other people to serve with their gifts.”²²¹

One element of leadership uniquely appointed to pastors is that of pastoral care.²²² “The true leader,” as Sanders defines, “is concerned primarily with the welfare of others, not with his own comfort or prestige.” He continues, “[The true leader] shows sympathy for the problems of

²¹⁶ Lindsay and Hager, *View from the Top*, xvii.

²¹⁷ John C. Maxwell, *The 21 Irrefutable Laws of Leadership: Follow Them and People Will Follow You* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1998), 121-131.

²¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 125-126.

²¹⁹ Sandra Van Opstal, *The Next Worship: Glorifying God in a Diverse World* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2015), 90.

²²⁰ *Ibid.*, 92-94.

²²¹ *Ibid.*, 94.

²²² The concept of pastoral care could just as easily fit under the section on spiritual formation as the protégé grows through the counsel of his mentor; but it is placed here because it is not simply the protégé’s growth, but also the growth of those under his shepherding care that is at hand.

others, but his sympathy fortifies and stimulates; it does not soften and make weak. A spiritual leader will always direct the confidence of others to the Lord.”²²³ Echols points to research on emotional intelligence that “reminds us that task accomplishment is important but relationships with people are more important.”²²⁴ Concerning pastors, Steve Echols also shows that “research by LifeWay has confirmed that the lack of interpersonal and leadership skills is the major factor in forced termination.”²²⁵

Pastoral care can certainly involve things like helping a parishioner move furniture or building a ramp for a homebound member, but most often it could be synonymous with pastoral counseling, or as Benner says, “Pastoral counseling should be at the very heart of pastoral care and ministry.”²²⁶ Benner notes the significant time and effort pastoral counseling takes in ministry in *Strategic Pastoral Counseling*:

Research indicates that the average pastor spends between six and eight hours each week in counseling. Very few pastors are able to avoid counseling responsibilities altogether, and those that do seem generally to be on the staff of churches where others are providing these services. For the vast majority of pastors, some counseling responsibility is a given that cannot be avoided. The needs of their parishioners demand that they see people in counseling relationships, whether they are adequately prepared to do so or not.²²⁷

Benner’s research shows that only 13 percent of the pastors surveyed felt “adequately prepared” for the counseling needs of the pastoral ministry. Additionally, “87 percent reported a need for

²²³ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 152.

²²⁴ Steve Echols, “Emotional Intelligence and Spiritual Maturity,” in *Interpersonal Relationship Skills for Ministers*, ed. Jeanine Cannon Bozeman and Argile Asa Smith (Gretna, LA: Pelican Pub. Co, 2004), 153.

²²⁵ *Ibid.*, 147.

²²⁶ David G. Benner, Preface to the First Edition (as printed in Second Edition) of *Strategic Pastoral Counseling: A Short-Term Structured Model* (St. Louis, MO: Morning Star Music Publishers, 2015.) ProQuest Ebook Central, <http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/liberty/detail.action?docID=570127>.

²²⁷ *Ibid.*

further training in pastoral counseling.”²²⁸ He states, “They know counseling is an important part of their overall responsibilities and therefore feel guilty if it is minimized or ignored.”²²⁹ Part of the uniqueness of pastoral counseling is that many pastors claim a general psychologist simply cannot understand the complexities of pastoral counseling.²³⁰ Though general psychology and its methods are beneficial, the realm of spiritual connectivity to each unique individual brings a new level of methodology the pastor must become acquainted with.²³¹ Werner Klan’s article speaks to this concept as well: “Pastoral care in a biblical understanding and carried out by and within the church has, in the first place, to take into account the condition of sinfulness in all human beings and the merciful, selfless, helpful and salutary action taken by God to change this situation for the better for his beloved children. This approach distinguishes pastoral care from all non-Christian kinds of counselling [*sic*](Rolf 2003:4).”²³²

Speaking to the disparity between pastoral counseling and non-Christian counseling, pastoral care can encompass many specific situations. Based on research by Clebsch, Jaekle, and Clinebell,²³³ the following definition of pastoral care is comprehensive:

²²⁸ Benner, Preface to the First Edition (as printed in Second Edition) of *Strategic Pastoral Counseling*.

²²⁹ Ibid.

²³⁰ Ibid.

²³¹ Ibid.

²³² Werner R. A. Klan, “‘He heals the brokenhearted and binds up their wounds’ (Ps 147:3): Perspectives on Pastoral Care.” *HTS Theologiese Studies* 74, no. 4 (2018). *Gale Academic OneFile* (accessed March 4, 2020). https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/A562807588/AONE?u=vic_liberty&sid=AONE&xid=940a820f.

²³³ The unknown author of this blog made slight alterations in wording from Clebsch and Jaekle and affirmed Clinebell’s addition of a fifth function. See William A. Clebsch and Charles R. Jaekle, *Pastoral Care in Historical Perspective* (New York, NY: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 1994) and Howard John Clinebell, *Basic Types of Pastoral Care & Counseling: Resources for the Ministry of Healing and Growth*, Rev. and Enlarged (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1984).

Pastoral care consists of helping acts, done by representative persons, directed towards the healing, sustaining, guiding, reconciling and nurturing of persons whose troubles and concerns arise in the context of daily interactions and ultimate means and concerns.

1. Healing – a pastoral function that aims to overcome some impairment by restoring the person to wholeness and by leading them to advance beyond their previous condition.
2. Sustaining – Helping a hurting person to endure and to transcend a circumstance in which restoration to their former condition or recuperation from their malady is either impossible or so remote as to seem improbable.
3. Guiding – assisting perplexed persons to make confident choices between alternative courses of thought and action, when such choices are viewed as affecting the present and the future state of human wholeness.
4. Reconciling – seeking to re-establish broken relationships between man (sic) and fellow man and between man and God. Historically, reconciling has employed two modes – forgiveness and discipline.
5. Nurturing – enable people to develop their potentialities, throughout the life journey with all its valleys, peaks, and plateaus.²³⁴

No matter the difficulty or challenge, a mentoring worship leader *must* expend the energy to invest in the leadership skills of their protégés. Not only does it enhance the protégé’s current ministry, but it is also essential to the continuation of healthy, biblical worship for future generations.

Organizational Skills

1 Corinthians 14:33 teaches that God is not a God of disorder but of peace. This is within the context of the orderliness of corporate worship but is nonetheless true of God’s character. His ordering of creation, the Ten Commandments, the building of the Tabernacle and the Temple, and many other instances point to God being systematic and efficiently organized. Robert

²³⁴ “The Five Crucial Functions of Pastoral Care,” *The Scots College, Sydney, Australia* (blog), September 26, 2019, <https://www.tsc.nsw.edu.au/tscnews/the-five-crucial-functions-of-pastoral-care>.

Morgan teaches, “God is not a God of confusion, therefore all things must be done properly and in an orderly manner.”²³⁵

Stacey Brown reminds that “Worship does not exist only on the platform at church on Sunday morning.”²³⁶ Not only is she referring to the concept of all of life being an opportunity to worship, but in the context of this statement, she is speaking about the work of the worship pastor outside of Sunday mornings. Referred to earlier in this paper as a “massive iceberg,” Brown says, “The majority of the ministry not only takes place off the platform, but should also fuel and enhance the time spent on the platform. The ability to succeed off the platform should lead to success on the platform.”²³⁷ Brown describes this ministry of worship leadership:

The list of roles and requirements for the worship leader is long. Some are activity specific while others are philosophical or based on characteristics or attitude. The longest list, based on activity-focused roles comes from Dr. Vernon Whaley, author, lecturer, and Dean of the Liberty University School of Music. In his text, *The Role of the Worship Leader Workbook*, Whaley defines fifteen separate roles in which the worship leader will serve in his ministry; worshiper, theologian, disciple, professional, artist, musician, servant-leader, pastor, staff member, administrator, team member, teacher, student, counselor, and family person. (Whaley, *The Role of the Worship Leader Workbook*, Appendix A) Whaley later expands the list to eighteen, adding, evangelist, mentor, and producer. (Whaley, *Introduction*, Video Lecture) Skill in all areas allows the worship leader to adequately serve God, his church, and his family.²³⁸

²³⁵ Robert J. Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late: 10 Biblical Strategies for a Lifetime of Purpose* (New York, NY: Howard Books, 2015), 81.

²³⁶ Stacey N. Brown, “Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader” (DWS diss., Liberty University, 2016), 15, <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/1217/>.

²³⁷ *Ibid.*, 6.

²³⁸ Brown, “Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader,” 18.

With this massive list, Brown concludes, “No one can implement all of the roles and responsibilities assumed without some sort of plan; there is simply too much to do.”²³⁹ This sort of planning requires exceptional organizational skills from the worship leader.

Brown’s research has an interesting twist. Her research respondents (worship leaders) saw great benefit from organizational skills. However, of the worship leaders in Brown’s study, over 60 percent did not begin their ministry with any sort of organizational system yet all of them had implemented one which they currently use.²⁴⁰ When asked if they could write an article about three things they wished they had known starting out in ministry, organization skills received the most suggestions.²⁴¹

Morgan speaks to ministry success (or effectiveness): “Leadership means doing the right things, whereas management means doing things right. When management does things right, we call that efficiency. When leadership does things right, we call that effectiveness.”²⁴² He goes further, “Patient plodding produces durable results.”²⁴³ Long-lasting effectiveness is derived from leadership that patiently plods along. As such, this plodding must be organized. Bradley agrees, “Simply stated, time management [organization] is learning to achieve maximum results from the time we are allotted. Ministers of music have a responsibility not only to themselves for

²³⁹ Brown, “Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader,” 38.

²⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 62.

²⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 66.

²⁴² Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late*, 48.

²⁴³ *Ibid.*, 230.

how their time is used but also to the church they serve. In addition, we have a spiritual responsibility for the stewardship of our lives.”²⁴⁴

No single system of organization will work for every individual. Before and above all others, Morgan attests that one’s personal spiritual walk with Christ should take priority. “Everyone has a morning protocol of some sort, and our morning rituals are like magnets bending the arc of our whole day. They go a long way toward defining who we are and determining the demeanor of our unfolding hours.”²⁴⁵ Pointing to many individuals in the Bible, like David, Moses, Ezekiel, the Psalmist, and ultimately Jesus, Morgan demonstrates the value of this morning ritual or protocol having at its core an emphasis on spiritual devotion to God.²⁴⁶ In one specific biblical instance, David shows the importance of devoting oneself to God first thing in the morning, “Let the morning bring me word of your unfailing love, for I have put my trust in you. Show me the way I should go.”²⁴⁷ Before any issues of productivity are addressed, Morgan sums up the significance of this daily spiritual devotion, “The Lord is more concerned about our *walk with Him* than our *work for Him*.”²⁴⁸

Another principle of organization is that the worship leader needs to set goals. Goals guide and give the worship leader direction. Goals are accomplished through objectives. Those objectives can be developed through monthly, weekly, and daily tasks.²⁴⁹ “By doing this, you

²⁴⁴ Bradley, *From Postlude to Prelude*, Chapter 6.

²⁴⁵ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 108.

²⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 109.

²⁴⁷ Psalm 143:8, NIV.

²⁴⁸ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 119.

²⁴⁹ Bradley, *From Postlude to Prelude*, Chapter 6.

will assure that the important things get done.”²⁵⁰ Bradley challenges the reader to ask this question at the beginning of each day, “What is the best task for me to do today?”²⁵¹

Tasks are governed by the objectives that are governed by the goals.²⁵² This does not mean other tasks do not appear, or that other tasks do not need to be done. Bradley promotes the idea that tasks fall into one of four quadrants: Urgent, Not Urgent, Important, Not Important.²⁵³ Some tasks call for urgent action but they may not be important. Others might be important but they are not urgent. He gives an excellent list of choices for tasks: do it, plan to do it, delegate it, file it, or pitch it.²⁵⁴ To-do lists are another helpful principle that can be developed from these tasks. There are many ways to organize a to-do list, but if the worship leader is truly seeking to fulfill all of the eighteen jobs and roles as described above, a to-do list is indispensable. Bradley offers the additional suggestion of grouping similar tasks. He says, “Many people become inefficient because they do not group similar tasks.”²⁵⁵ Morgan says, “We need to have a receptacle or tool for ‘capturing all the things that need to get done—now, later, someday, big, little, or in-between—into a logical and trusted system outside of your head and off your mind.’”²⁵⁶ In amplifying the need to write things down, Morgan, describing a character in a Tom

²⁵⁰ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late*, 194.

²⁵¹ Ibid.

²⁵² Bradley, *From Postlude to Prelude*, Chapter 6.

²⁵³ Ibid.

²⁵⁴ Ibid.

²⁵⁵ Ibid.

²⁵⁶ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late*, 101.

Clancy novel, quotes her philosophy on the matter, “It isn’t safe, she explained, to entrust important matters to memory alone.”²⁵⁷

Part of this organization must also include calendaring. If one does not schedule his time, it will find a way of escaping him. What escapes cannot be returned or regained and often, the important things remain undone. Morgan teaches:

What is important in life? Time for prayer, Bible study, reading, thinking, and soul refreshment; time with our spouse, time with our children or grandchildren; time to rest; time for working on those major projects that will establish our legacy. Each morning as we review our calendar, we simply have to make sure those items are in place before the rush of the day floods our schedules. If we block off time for the truly important, we’re well on the way to controlling our schedules rather than our schedules controlling us.²⁵⁸

Bradley continues with other principles of organization. The worship leader needs to make wise choices in when to say “no” and when to say “yes.” By saying “yes” to one thing, one is automatically saying “no” to another thing. Determining which is the better choice is a difficult skill gained through life experience and mentoring. Bradley also challenges the worship leader to “solve the clutter problem.”²⁵⁹ Morgan echoes this sentiment saying that one’s desk and office should be tidy and organized where the only “mess” is related to whatever the current project is.²⁶⁰ Once that project is completed, that gets cleaned up and put away. This keeps one’s focus on the task at hand. But he also cautions against being obsessed with having a clean

²⁵⁷ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 103.

²⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 63.

²⁵⁹ Bradley, *From Postlude to Prelude*, Chapter 6.

²⁶⁰ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 91-96.

workspace. Simply put, “Everything should be done with minimal complexity and maximum simplicity.”²⁶¹

Something most worship leaders do not recognize as an important part of organizing is the scheduling of rest. Just as God rested on the seventh day after His magnificent six days of creation, so should the worship leader plan rest stops. Morgan quotes Mrs. Charles M. Cowman, “Many are slowly succumbing to the strain of life because they have forgotten how to rest. . . . Rest is not a sedative for the sick, but a tonic for the strong. . . . It saves us from becoming slaves even to good works.”²⁶² With this in mind, Morgan shares a pertinent story:

Robert Murry M’Cheyne was a famous Scottish pastor, one of the most powerful preachers ever to stand in the pulpit of Edinburgh and Dundee, but he died at the age of twenty-nine partly because he had weakened his constitution by overwork, excessive busyness, and chronic fatigue. He reportedly said as he was dying, “The Lord gave me a horse to ride and a message to deliver. Alas, I have killed the horse and cannot deliver the message.”²⁶³

The point of Morgan’s story is that the worship leader needs to take heed to his own physical and spiritual health. Acts 20:28 urges this concept, “Therefore take heed to yourselves and to all the flock, among which the Holy Spirit has made you overseers.”²⁶⁴ Morgan notes the order of this verse highlights taking heed of oneself is *before* taking heed of the flock under one’s care. How can the worship leader take care of those under his leadership if he is not physically or spiritually healthy enough within himself? Morgan bluntly says, “Fatigue is counterproductive.”²⁶⁵ Fatigue

²⁶¹ Morgan, *Mastering Life before It’s Too Late*, 93.

²⁶² *Ibid.*, 137.

²⁶³ *Ibid.*, 143.

²⁶⁴ Acts 20:28, NIV.

²⁶⁵ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 143.

can often come from simply doing too much. There are certain parts of the worship leader's duties that only he can do. But, Morgan presses with this question, "*What are the things that only I alone can do? (Or, to put it bluntly), What am I currently doing that I can persuade, hire out, assign, delegate, or somehow shift to someone else—or release undone?*"²⁶⁶

In summary, considering all of these items dealing with organization, one may be better suited to think more along the lines of *life management*. Taking care of one's own spiritual health in personal discipleship and in their physical health in proper rest, among other things like diet and exercise, emotional health is also important to complete the trifecta. Family time and hobbies outside of the "work" of ministry are beneficial to emotional health. In any case, when in the ministry, being "pleasantly productive" is an all-of-life pursuit not marked by simply tangible outcomes or products. It must be more, as Matt Perman states:

We often think of productivity as getting concrete things done—emails sent, widgets made, and assignments completed. These things are important, but they do not exhaust the scope of our productivity. More and more, productivity is about intangibles—relationships developed, connections made, and things learned. We need to incorporate intangibles into our definition of productivity or we will short-change ourselves by thinking that sitting at our desks for a certain number of hours equals a productive day.²⁶⁷

²⁶⁶ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late*, 155.

²⁶⁷ Matt Perman, *What's Best Next: How the Gospel Transforms the Way You Get Things Done* (United States: Zondervan: Made available through hoopla, 2014), 15-16, <https://www.hoopladigital.com/title/11617736>.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

Introduction

The subject of mentoring has been one of much research in necessity, methodology, and practice. Though its historical terminology is often nuanced by various roles, mentoring is an essential part of passing along knowledge, attitudes, and skills from one generation to the next. It is therefore important to study mentoring within the broad scope of history as one begins to address the specific, learned roles of worship leadership. Within the large body of literature on the subject of mentoring, including pastoral mentoring, there is very little written specifically about the experienced, veteran worship leader's needed influence in the life and practice of the novice worship leader through a process of mentoring. Beyond this, it is necessary to develop an understanding that mentorship cannot be simply about acquiring skills for completing a task. As Hall states, it is of equal importance to address the protégé's character, who one is, when mentoring for pastoral effectiveness.²⁶⁸ This calls for critical research not only in historical literature on the subject, but also subjective evidence of pastoral formation.

Research Design

The qualitative historical design was used to amalgamate various sources of research, such as books, journal articles, and dissertations, and study historical influences of past approaches to mentoring relationships so as to develop a contemporary model of mentorship to address a perceived gap in research related specifically to veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders. As Creswell describes, qualitative research is the process of making interpretations of existing literature and, by inductive reasoning, providing application to an

²⁶⁸ Hall, "The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation," 44.

identified gap in the research.²⁶⁹ The recognized gap in this instance is the lack of literature on the specific, necessary mentoring relationship of veteran worship leaders to novice worship leaders. The historical method, as Carr describes it, is appropriate to this paper because it looks at the body of existing literature that defines mentoring from corporate, academic, and pastoral perspectives and presents innovative solutions to current issues in worship leader mentorship.²⁷⁰ The qualitative historical approach combines the qualitative design of intentionally selecting and examining existing research in order to *understand* the research problem and research questions with the historical approach of using the literature found to make predictions and conclusions to *address* the research problem and research questions.

Research Questions

The research questions addressed in this study are:

RQ1: In what ways can the biblical model of mentorship guide veteran worship leaders to become mentors to novice worship leaders?

RQ2: In what ways can veteran worship leaders mentor novice worship leaders?

Hypotheses

The hypotheses for this study are:

H1: The biblical model of mentorship exemplified by Jesus can be applied to the process of the veteran worship leader becoming a mentor to novice worship leaders.

H2: Veteran worship leaders can and should mentor novice worship leaders in the areas of spiritual formation, leadership development, and time management.

²⁶⁹ Creswell and Creswell, *Research Design*, 183.

²⁷⁰ Carr, *What is History?* 35.

Process of Gathering Literature

The first stage of gathering research was to find general literature on mentoring that spoke in broad terms across many disciplines. This stage led to several definitions of the concept of mentoring, but also revealed a need for further research in various discrepancies in mentoring terminology, including, but not limited to, mentor, disciple, teacher, coach, protégé, apprentice, mentee and numerous forms of each word, i.e., mentor, mentoring, mentorship, and mentored. Once a connection was made between the two most common uses of the concept, mentoring and discipling, further study on corporate/business examples, church/pastoral examples, and biblical examples of mentoring relationships proved necessary.

In the early search for sources related to mentoring within worship ministry, a noticeable gap became apparent relating to veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders. The general concept of mentoring was shown to be important, and even biblical, but initial research did not reveal the specificity sought in regard to veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders. The first goal was to find evidence that Jesus' example of discipling His followers could be applied specifically to this sort of relationship between worship leaders. Though few sources spoke directly about worship leader to worship leader mentoring, a plethora of sources revealed much about pastor to pastor mentoring, and even more sources spoke to the general call of believers to "go and make disciples."²⁷¹ As Creswell and Carr define the qualitative historical design of research, Jesus' example could be applied to the specific need for mentoring from veteran to novice worship leaders.

This research also began to reveal some common themes about issues causing a greater need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders. One theme emerged

²⁷¹ Matthew 28:19-20.

concerning a pastor's effectiveness in ministry being directly related to his personal spiritual formation. Therefore, this researcher sought sources in order to discover what was included in spiritual formation. A second theme emerged around how few pastors enter their first ministry assignment with any practical, real-world experience. In regard to this gap, this researcher selected sources which provided narrative, personal accounts of pastors' perceived deficiencies in early pastoral ministries. This perceived inadequacy was often noted as a result of both informal and formal pastoral training. Regarding the latter, the third theme that began to coalesce showed an alarming deficiency in academia's training of pastors in general, and worship leaders specifically. The researcher found surveys of colleges and universities and their course requirements for graduation to be inadequate in several areas. Findings in those areas initiated further research that will be discussed in the next section about what needs to be included in this sort of mentoring relationship between veteran worship leaders and novice worship leaders. A fourth area of concern was a new phenomenon noted by several sources that shows an increase in the untrained or uneducated, yet highly skilled musician being thrust into worship leadership roles. Most sources spoke in generalities regarding such instances in order to protect the identity of those inexperienced worship leaders. Due to this roadblock, the researcher turned to discovering *why* this phenomenon was becoming more and more prevalent.

With a desire for this paper to be practically helpful to those veteran worship leaders seeking to implement the mentoring of novice worship leaders, sources were gathered to discover and develop specific areas of pastoral leadership that were missing yet essential for effective ministry. With previous research from literature specifically containing personal testimonials from pastors combined with literature uncovering academia's shortcomings, three areas of concern began to become priorities. The first is in spiritual formation. As already noted,

sources dealing with the contents of spiritual formation were gathered and researched. The second area is in leadership development. For this necessity, literature on leadership, and more specifically how to develop one's leadership acumen, was collected and studied. This led to the discovery of another noticeable gap in the literature. Most of the literature about leadership was related to developing one's own leadership abilities while little was related to the necessity of one's leadership being expressed in mentoring others to become better leaders. Further, most leadership texts were about business/corporate models of leadership with few teaching the necessary leadership skills for ministry contexts. Though the third area of concern was originally hypothesized to be time management and some early research showed this concern, the wider research pool showed time management to be a *part* of a larger issue of organizational skills. Because of this discovery, research began to turn more toward this larger area of organizational skills.

Synthesis of Research

Sources included in this study were selected with care. Validity and reliability of these sources were considered. Beginning with a broad subject of mentoring worship leaders, as themes were discovered as mentioned above in these sources, further research was pursued. With the convergence of evidence around these themes from various sources and types of sources, i.e., books, journal articles, and dissertations, the research was identified as credible. As these themes were recognized, sources were arranged into three broad groupings: (1) providing definitions and examples of mentoring, (2) showing the need for these mentoring relationships between worship leaders, and (3) revealing the most pressing elements necessary in such mentoring relationships. As quotes from various authors and sources were grouped along with results of surveys of pastors and academic institutions, sources were again analyzed for validity and adherence or

opposition to the themes. Synthesizing the research in this way allowed the researcher to interpret the emerging themes as valid for inclusion in this study as well as determine the necessity for addressing those themes with further research findings. The researcher also sought to expose and address gaps existing in the literature regarding this subject.

CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS

This chapter presents the findings of research conducted in an effort to define and describe mentoring, uncover the need for mentoring, and develop a process or plan for mentoring, specifically as it relates to the veteran worship leader's spiritual and vocational responsibility to novice worship leaders. In response to the first research question, the literature examined reveals Jesus to be the best and primary example of biblical mentorship for any pastor seeking to fulfil the Great Commission. Concerning the second research question, the research suggests three categories lacking any sort of emphasis in pastoral training: spiritual formation, leadership development, and organizational skills. These two research questions bookend a third section of research that reveals several challenges facing a mentoring relationship as it specifically relates to worship leaders. Research findings are presented and discussed concerning each area of the study.

Etymology of Mentoring

The etymology of mentoring has come to be inclusive of a plethora of terms, each coming with its own nuance to give greater insight into the concept of mentoring as a whole. Terms included in this study are disciple (v.), teach, and coach. Each term was considered in various forms to uncover the gradations of the grander whole of mentoring. The verb forms of mentor, disciple, teach, and coach were contrasted with their respective noun forms and adjective forms. Other terms for further research in these nuances could include counsel, guide, lead, pilot, shepherd, show, and tutor. Though research reveals an overabundance of definitions for mentoring, Bozeman and Feeney developed a broad and encapsulating definition from which many others are derived:

Mentoring: a process for the informal transmission of knowledge, social capital, and psychosocial support perceived by the recipient as relevant to work, career, or

professional development; mentoring entails informal communication, usually face-to-face and during a sustained period of time, between a person who is perceived to have greater knowledge, wisdom, or experience (the mentor) and a person who is perceived to have less (the protégé).²⁷²

Due to the pastoral emphasis of this study's research, the similarities and differences between mentoring and discipling are of particular interest to this study. The results of the research show that, though the processes and desired outcomes are nearly identical in many ways, "mentoring" is the term used most often in business/corporate examples whereas "discipling" is the term most often used in church/pastoral examples.²⁷³ This etymology of "mentoring" is important in order to develop answers to both of the research questions.

The Need for Mentoring Exposed

In a biblical summary of mentorship, Paul instructs Timothy in 2 Timothy 2:2: "The things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable men who will also be qualified to teach others."²⁷⁴ In regard to the first research question, the results of this study strongly support a biblical model and mandate for the believer, especially those in leadership or positions of influence, to engage in intentional mentoring relationships. With the added results showing Jesus' mentorship of the twelve disciples as the best model, the first hypothesis was found to be accurate in that Jesus' model is the best biblical model to follow. Though other models were studied, including Paul's mentorship of Timothy, Jesus' model was found to be the most inclusive and revealing, primarily because there is a more thorough biblical record present in Jesus' influence over the disciples than is present in any other example. The

²⁷² Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 26.

²⁷³ Williamson and Hood, "The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation," 137.

²⁷⁴ 2 Timothy 2:2, NIV.

gospel of Mark in verses 13-16 of Chapter 3, shows the *progression* of Jesus' model of mentorship. Thomas summarizes this approach:

Examining the paradigm of Jesus' leadership development reveals that he initiated this paradigm (Mark 3:13-19), he prayed for the success of this paradigm (an elaboration found only in Luke 6:12), he applied this paradigm (Mark 6:7-13), and he commended this paradigm to his disciples through his instruction to maintain the biblical mentoring of other disciples (John 13:16-17).²⁷⁵

Putman and Harrington condense Jesus' *method* of discipling into three simple phases. In the first, Jesus *demonstrated* how to minister in front of the disciples. In the second, Jesus *delegated* ministry tasks to the disciples. In the third, Jesus provided *supervision* (sometimes called coaching) to make his disciples accountable.²⁷⁶ Throughout the three phases, Putman sees "three keys to His success: 1. Jesus was an *intentional leader* in every sense. 2. He did His disciple-making in a *relational environment*. 3. He followed a *process* that can be learned and repeated."²⁷⁷ This is the model by Jesus that can and should be applied to the mentoring relationship between veteran worship leaders and novice worship leaders, affirming hypothesis one.

Though not specifically related to RQ1, this noticeable absence of literature on the mentoring of worship leaders raised questions about the gaps in the actual practice of training worship leaders. In order to understand this gap, it was necessary to research sources specifically related to the formal and informal training of worship leaders. Many of these sources spoke about pastors in general with no link to any one type of pastor (i.e., senior pastor, worship pastor,

²⁷⁵ Thomas, "The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership," 112.

²⁷⁶ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 160-162.

²⁷⁷ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 35.

student pastor) leaving this researcher no apparent reason to not apply these findings specifically to worship leaders. Some of the research spoke about the lack of spiritual preparedness of many graduates training to be pastors. Sources show that as a result of a lack of spiritual training, many pastors fail to lead an effective ministry in their first pastorates. This called for further research to determine if there was a direct correlation between a pastor's effectiveness and level of discipleship (or training in the spiritual disciplines). Related to a pastor's readiness for serving, the following three areas were uncovered and research proved necessary: (1) practical/real-world training opportunities while still in pastoral school through internships or practicums, (2) portions of academia's pastoral training programs that address competencies other than practical skills, (3) and understanding the noticeable rise in the number of untrained/uneducated yet naturally talented musicians thrust into worship leadership roles.

This process of research addressed RQ1 and confirmed H1 while also uncovering a set of major shortcomings in H1's relation to RQ2. If Jesus is the model by which novice worship leaders must be trained (H1), then an answer to RQ2 requires one to understand and address the gaps in pastoral training in order to better determine what elements need to be included in pastoral mentoring relationships. The following research results are related to these findings.

The research exposed a lack of emphasis on the need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders, as summarized by Spradlin's aforementioned statement: "There appears to be a clear need in our North American churches for more spiritually maturing, artistically skilled worship leadership; leaders who are clearly called, biblically sound, spiritually dynamic, pastorally oriented, artistically skilled, and specifically trained for worship ministry in our churches and their missional assignments."²⁷⁸ Further research indicates a strong connection

²⁷⁸ Spradlin, "Discipling Worship Leadership," 4.

between a pastor's personal discipleship and effectiveness as a minister. This is addressed in greater detail later under the first part of the third section of this study concerning spiritual formation. More practically, research also suggests a lack of real-world experience for many students training to become pastors. The studies by Hendricks and Selzer, along with two other studies in *Worship Leader Magazine*, show a general lack of emphasis on giving pastoral students practical experiences through internships or practicums, while also showing severely limited courses in spiritual formation. Plank's study revealed, "Overwhelmingly, worship leadership degree programs require little, if any, discipleship or spiritual formation coursework."²⁷⁹ Beyond the unequipped pastoral college graduates, Page and Gray, as well as Harland, speak to the issue of churches where "experienced worship pastors are being unceremoniously dumped and replaced with newer, trendier models,"²⁸⁰ and where "ministers of music started 'aging out' and Christian artists were taking their places."²⁸¹ This influx of untrained and uneducated worship leaders has a direct correlation to "the breakdown in seminary and Christian college education for worship pastors."²⁸²

Three Primary Areas for Pastor-to-Pastor Mentoring

To answer RQ2, the research of this study suggests three primary areas of concern for pastor-to-pastor mentoring, including spiritual formation, leadership development, and organizational skills. As noted above, in each of these three areas, Putman and Harrington point

²⁷⁹ Plank, "The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation," 8.

²⁸⁰ Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 141.

²⁸¹ Harland, *Worship Essentials*, 95.

²⁸² Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 142.

to Jesus as the example in how he *demonstrated* how to minister in front of the disciples, *delegated* ministry tasks to the disciples, and provided *supervision* (sometimes called coaching) to make his disciples accountable.²⁸³ Putman also points to three keys to Jesus success, “1. Jesus was an *intentional leader* in every sense. 2. He did His disciple-making in a *relational environment*. 3. He followed a *process* that can be learned and repeated.”²⁸⁴

The research concerning spiritual formation is summed up in Hall’s statement: “At its core pastoral formation is about more than just imparting knowledge and skills. Shaping people into the image of Christ is at the heart of pastoral formation.”²⁸⁵ Sanders amplifies this thought: “without a strong relationship to God, even the most attractive and competent person cannot lead people to God.”²⁸⁶ Research related to leadership development suggests a lack of emphasis on relational intelligence, especially in many young pastors, and must be “more than just delegating and vision casting.”²⁸⁷ As the veteran pastor pours into the novice pastor in leadership development, one significant area of concern is in pastoral care, or that area of pastoring that concerns oneself with the welfare of others, specifically those in one’s congregation.

Regarding the third area of organizational skills, the research is summed up by Brown, “The majority of the ministry not only takes place off the platform, but should also fuel and enhance the time spent on the platform. The ability to succeed off the platform should lead to

²⁸³ Putman, Harrington, and Coleman, *DiscipleShift*, 160-162.

²⁸⁴ Putman, *Real-Life Discipleship*, 35.

²⁸⁵ Hall, “The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation,” 47.

²⁸⁶ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 18.

²⁸⁷ Lindsay and Hager, *View from the Top*, xvii.

success on the platform.”²⁸⁸ Her conclusion is, “No one can implement all of the [pastoral] roles and responsibilities assumed without some sort of plan; there is simply too much to do.”²⁸⁹ Her research with multiple pastors in various positions asked pastors what they would suggest if they could write an article about three things they wished they had known starting out in ministry. Of them, organization received the most suggestions.²⁹⁰ Of the original hypotheses, this was the only area that needed modification, as the third area of concern was thought to be time management by early research results. As this researcher began to uncover more sources on this matter, organizational skills became a broader topic of need than simply time management, which is a *part* of organization skills. The research also illuminated a need to expose novice worship leaders to the importance of spiritual preparation for one’s day, goal setting, task organization, calendaring, when to say “no,” keeping a clutter-free work environment, and the scheduling of rest. In this light, organizational skills might be better understood as life management, or as Morgan calls it, “mastering life.”²⁹¹

Summary

The research of this study revealed many nuances of mentoring, leading to peeling back the layers of the need for more mentoring relationships to be undertaken, in general as well as specifically, between veteran and novice worship leaders. Connecting to Jesus’ model of mentorship, the conclusion of the research shows three primary areas of concern for the

²⁸⁸ Brown, “Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader,” 6.

²⁸⁹ *Ibid.*, 38.

²⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 66.

²⁹¹ Morgan, *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late*, 16.

mentoring relationship: spiritual formation, leadership development, and organizational skills.

Novice pastors, specifically worship leaders in this study, need a balanced approach to learn how to effectively lead a successful ministry. The suggestions for action regarding the findings of this study are shared in Chapter Five: Conclusions.

CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS

The final chapter begins with a summary of the study, its purpose, and the procedures used in the process of research, followed by a summary of the findings in relation to prior research. The next section addresses any limitations of the study. Recommendations for application of principles garnered from the study are then offered. The final section submits recommendations for future study related to veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders.

Summary of Study, Purpose, and Procedure

The demands placed upon worship leaders in the twenty-first century church are heavy. There is a high level of expectation not only in *what* gets done, but also in *how* it gets done, often with nothing less than perfection being tolerated by senior pastors, church leaders, and congregations. An even heavier weight comes to bear when one considers the tremendous influence worship leaders have on the doctrinal health of individuals in their congregations. No worship leader can have natural giftedness or a perfect educational path that grants them the facilities to lead an effective worship ministry as soon as they step foot into the field. The demands are too great. However, intentional mentoring can connect natural giftedness to academic training as well as address the shortcomings of both. This study purposed to examine the great need for veteran worship leaders to spend the time and exert the energy necessary to develop novice worship leaders through intentional mentoring.

The procedure of the study followed the historical qualitative approach. The research was focused on the amalgamation of literature relating to mentorship within ministry circles, specifically in the worship leadership circle. The researcher also sought to find anecdotal evidence to support the research findings. This procedure included research in the form of books,

peer-reviewed journal articles, magazines, and dissertations. Most of the information was collected via online, thematic searches within Liberty University's library and various other databases such as ProQuest and JSTOR. As research was gathered on the subject at hand, the author separated the findings into thematic groups and began to develop an outline to serve as the backbone for sharing the results of this study.

Summary of Findings and Prior Research

The results of the study fell into three thematic groups. The first theme was centered around defining mentoring, which included definitions from the dictionary of Merriam-Webster²⁹² and one written by Bozeman and Feeney,²⁹³ while also comparing mentoring to discipling, teaching, and coaching. In its final part, the first theme also included examples and descriptions of mentorship within corporate/business contexts, church/pastoral relationships, and biblical foundations as exemplified by Jesus and Paul. The primary research finding within the first theme is that Jesus serves as the perfect example of what mentoring should look like and what the potential of proper mentoring outcomes can be.

Before research could be undertaken on the focus of the study (how veteran worship leaders can mentor novice worship leaders), it was necessary to research what became the second theme: the *need* for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders. Answering this question was paramount to the study, "Why is there a need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders?" The need was revealed in several ways. First, Jesus calls for all believers to "make disciples" in Matthew 28:18-20. There is no exclusion for worship leaders.

²⁹² "Mentor (Noun)," in *Merriam-Webster* (Merriam-Webster).

²⁹³ Sharp, *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts*, 26.

Second, several authors make a direct connection between a pastor's effectiveness in ministry and personal discipleship.²⁹⁴ A pastor may have every necessary skill to do the work of ministry, but without a strong personal spiritual formation, the pastor's work is devoid of the power of the Holy Spirit. Third, there is a severe lack of emphasis on practical, real-world experience for a pastor under the guidance of a mentor. This causes too many pastors to resort to a trial-and-error approach to doing the actual work of ministry. Many pastors leave the ministry during this trial-and-error period due to either personal moral failures or a sense of burnout due to the stress of developing ministries through such haphazard tactics. This concept is amplified in the fourth part of this theme which shows the inability of academia to fully educate worship leaders in *all* of the skills necessary for leading today's high-profile worship ministries. Concerning pastor and worship leader training, several studies²⁹⁵ show the alarming *absence* in higher education of personal discipleship and spiritual formation courses as well as practical, real-world apprenticeships through practicums and mentorships. The fifth and final part of this theme shows one significant result of academia's shortfall in educating worship leaders: the untrained/uneducated yet naturally gifted musicians who are thrust into worship leader roles. With academia's shortfalls, coupled with the felt need of churches to be "relevant," many gifted musicians are put into worship leader roles with little or no formal training, musically or theologically. Very few of these talented musicians, though musically skilled at leading worship, can maintain an effective worship ministry, musically, spiritually, or relationally.

The third and final overarching theme of the study is to give practical guidance to the veteran worship leader in how one may approach the mentorship of a novice worship leader.

²⁹⁴ McIntosh, Rima, Putman, Harrington, Coleman, and Miller, specifically.

²⁹⁵ Selzer, Hall, Hendricks, Plank, and *Worship Leader Magazine*, specifically.

This theme is divided into three areas of focus. The first is to help the novice worship leader become grounded in personal discipleship or spiritual formation, which includes training and guidance in reading the Bible, studying the Bible, worship, prayer, and meditation. Second, the novice worship leader likely has little or no leadership training or giftedness in being the kind of leader a worship ministry needs. One particular aspect of this need includes pastoral care. Very few pastors are given much, if any, training in general pastoral care of their flocks. Leadership training must be a focus of this sort of mentorship. Finally, the demands on a worship leader and the expectations for a comprehensive, effective worship ministry call for the veteran worship leader to help the novice worship leader to develop organizational skills, including emphasizing one's own spiritual formation, goal setting, division of tasks, calendaring, and planning for rest.

Limitations of the Study

This researcher recognizes that there are certain limitations to the study. The conclusions drawn from this research should be understood through the following limitations:

1. Even though mentoring is a broad subject, there is very little research regarding veteran worship leaders mentoring novice worship leaders. Therefore, research on general mentoring as well as veteran pastors mentoring novice pastors was extended to make conclusions about mentoring relationships between worship leaders. Although there are many similarities and differences between pastors and worship leaders concerning necessary skills for ministry, those similarities and differences were not discussed in this study.
2. The studies concerning academic institutional offerings for ministry leaders included examples from academic catalogues. For the purpose of those studies, the catalogues were often dated from the previous year. This limitation means that even the most

recent study²⁹⁶ involved the previous year's statistics. More recent years may show great strides forward in addressing academia's shortfall, but the study did not address if there were any steps in the right direction.

3. Spiritual formation, leadership training, and organizational skills are not the *only* needed aspects of a mentoring relationship between veteran and novice worship leaders. However, these are the three most noted areas this study uncovered.

Recommendations for Application

In 2 Timothy 2:2, Paul instructs Timothy: "The things you have heard me say in the presence of many witnesses entrust to reliable men who will also be qualified to teach others."²⁹⁷ It is the duty of a leader to train up future leaders. Oswald Sanders says it this way, "With [these words] Paul presses home a leader's responsibility to train others to lead. If he is to carry out his trust fully, the leader will devote time to training others to succeed and perhaps even supercede [*sic.*] him."²⁹⁸ Aaron Keyes is involved in a worship movement called "10,000 Fathers." He connects this concept from Paul directly to worship leaders in the stated purpose of "10,000 Fathers," "Nurturing worship leaders who lead songs into pastors who lead people."²⁹⁹ Page and Gray add more to this argument by promoting the future gains of veteran worship leaders

²⁹⁶ Plank, "The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation," 2016.

²⁹⁷ 2 Timothy 2:2, NIV.

²⁹⁸ Sanders, *Spiritual Leadership*, 179.

²⁹⁹ Harland, *Worship Essentials*, 163.

mentoring novice worship leaders: “By intentionally building mentoring relationship, worship pastors can encourage, disciple, and influence worship for years to come.”³⁰⁰

The call to mentor is in Paul’s instruction to Timothy as well as in Jesus’ method of developing His disciples to take the gospel into all the world. The need for mentoring is especially prevalent within worship leadership training. The application, however, is ambiguous at best. Though formal training and academic pursuits can and do instruct the novice worship leader in some of the skills necessary to be an effective pastor, the nature of the wide scope of worship leadership prevents formal training and academia from meeting every need of the worship leader’s preparation. The most beneficial guidance can and should come from another worship leader who has already been navigating the worship world with success and effectiveness. Reinforced by the Scriptural support above, this gap must be filled by the veteran worship leader’s intentional mentorship of novice worship leaders.

Of the multitudinous opportunities for the content of such an intentional mentoring relationship, the research of this study shows three primary areas of concern. The first area of concern is spiritual formation. The veteran worship leader must first display his own grasp of spiritual formation by living it out in front of the protégé. Seeing a life of faith in action should be supported with intentional studies guided by the mentor. The following texts offer guidance in this area of a believer’s walk with Christ and are suggestions for use within the intentional mentorship of novice worship leaders. Nothing replaces actually reading the Bible itself. Beyond this, some examples on Bible study might include *Living By the Book* by Hendricks and Hendricks (2007) and *Knowing the Bible 101* by Bickel and Jantz (1998). Texts about the holiness of God like *The Knowledge of the Holy* by Tozer (1961) and man’s quest for personal

³⁰⁰ Page and Gray, *Hungry for Worship*, 151.

holiness like *The Pursuit of Holiness* by Bridges (1993) are excellent resources. Learning how to pray is a key concept of spiritual formation as well. Some exceptional resources include *The Kneeling Christian* by an unknown Christian (2013), *A Praying Life* by Miller (2009), and *Old Paths, New Power* by Henderson (2016). Learning to be a better worshiper is also important in spiritual formation. An exemplary text on worship theology is *The Purpose of Man* by Tozer (2009). Anne Ortlund provides anecdotal examples of true worship in practice in *Up with Worship* (2001). Morgan's *Reclaiming the Lost Art of Biblical Meditation* (2017) will help guide a mentorship study on the necessity of meditation on God's Word.

The second area of concern for a veteran worship leader's mentorship of the novice worship leader is in leadership development. Like spiritual formation above, Lindsay says, "leadership is better caught than taught."³⁰¹ Seeing one's mentor display leadership in everyday operations of a worship ministry cannot be undervalued for the novice worship leader's growth in leadership abilities. Along with the display of leadership, one can also develop this area through reading. The mentor should use the following suggested texts as content for study in the mentorship of their protégés. These texts should include much of John Maxwell's work, including *The 5 Levels of Leadership* (2011), *How Successful People Lead* (2013), and *The 21 Irrefutable Laws of Leadership* (1998). Oswald Sanders text, *Spiritual Leadership* (2017) brings much support on the subject of leadership within the spiritual context. Likewise, Zac Hicks has a strong text on leadership as it relates specifically to the worship leader in *The Worship Pastor* (2016).

Finally, the third area of most concern is in the development of organizational skills in the novice worship leader. When mentoring the novice worship leader in this area, the veteran

³⁰¹ Lindsay and Hager, *View from the Top*, 42.

worship leader should share his personal organizational strategies in the ministry he serves. Sharing specific past successes and failures in organization can also be beneficial. Seeing in real-world scenarios what is taught from the following texts is an important part of learning organizational skills. Teaching through these books and discussing real-world applications in the context of daily worship ministry is suggested. Though primarily intended for pastors in general, this author found no better text on this subject than *Mastering Life Before It's Too Late* (2015) by Robert J. Morgan. Other notable sources include *Can't Wait for Sunday* by Walters (2006), *Worship Matters* by Kauflin (2008), and *From Postlude to Prelude: Music Ministry's Other Six Days* by Bradley (2004).

The above represents potential *content* of a mentorship, but it does not address the *format* of such a relationship. This, unfortunately, cannot be prescribed in any sort of blanket, one-size-fits-all suggestion. Every mentoring relationship looks different in *how* it is accomplished. Some might meet face-to-face on a weekly basis for an hour or two. Others might be on opposite sides of the country and only communicate via e-mail or voice calls. Some mentorships are much more structured with homework assignments and deadlines while others are more casual and less specific. Some last a few months toward a specific, short-term goal while others last decades in an ongoing relationship. Nonetheless, the following represents suggestions for mentoring relationships.

There are three specific arenas in which this study indicates the veteran worship leader should take action toward mentoring the novice worship leader. It is unlikely any veteran worship leader will be able to simultaneously undertake all three of these suggestions, but it is completely possible to develop all three within different stages of the veteran worship leader's ministry. The first arena that must be addressed is in academia. Many schools training worship

leaders are filled with instructors who have never led a successful and effective worship ministry. They may be teaching excellent musical and practical skills while also teaching important principles, but they lack real-world experience to help the novice worship leader develop functional usage of those skills and principles in actual, everyday worship ministry. The veteran worship leader should offer to share their vast experience within the academic programs by becoming adjunct faculty, offering to participate in specific class segments for practical application of class material, or by volunteering to be a mentor to the worship leaders in training through structured or unstructured mentorships.

Second, a veteran worship leader should prayerfully seek to find local or regional churches that have recently hired or currently have new, inexperienced worship leaders and offer to be a mentor. As stated earlier, mentorships are only successful when the protégé agrees to follow the guidance of a mentor. If the first few offers to mentor are rejected, move on to the next church and the next opportunity. If God has made it clear that one is to pass along what they have learned (2 Timothy 2:2), then God will also guide the veteran worship leader to a novice worship leader eager to accept the guidance and instruction.

A third arena for the veteran worship leader to engage is within their own church ministry. There is a high likelihood that God has placed one or more future worship leaders within the congregation to which one serves. Whether or not these future worship leaders have experienced a “calling” to vocational ministry in worship or if they have intentions to pursue worship ministry in college, they are almost certainly out there and can most certainly benefit from the veteran worship leader’s guidance through intentional mentoring. This sort of mentoring can take the form of a one-on-one purposeful relationship or a class-room type

mentorship that guides a group of future worship leaders. The author of this study has personally seen and experienced positive results from both formats.

In any case, one thing is for certain, the most successful and effective mentorships are accomplished by the *intentional* effort of the mentor to develop these qualities, skills, and characteristics in their protégés. Intentionality is the key component to seeing the veteran worship leader mentor the novice worship leader toward growth in the protégé's spiritual life and the ministries they serve.

Recommendations for Future Study

With the plethora of literature on the subjects of mentoring, worship theology, worship leading, and pastoring, the following suggestions for future study would add much breadth to understanding the need for veteran worship leaders to mentor novice worship leaders:

1. In this study, the latest data concerning academia's emphasis on spiritual formation, leadership training, and organizational skills originated prior to 2016. Future studies would benefit from comparing and contrasting this older data to more current data. If these new studies show the pendulum swinging in the right direction, toward more emphasis on these three things, then future studies should examine the impact this has made on the students graduating those institutions as well as the impact made in the churches where these graduates served after graduation.
2. It would benefit many worship leaders if a future study would consider a quantitative survey of a broad swath of worship leaders who have been intentionally mentored or disciplined in general, if their mentorship was from another worship leader, or if they did not receive any mentoring at all in their education or career. This sort of future study would give evidence to support the qualitative research provided here. The

results of such a study could help academia better prepare their graduating pastoral students as well as help churches support their worship leaders and pastors in pursuing personal and ministerial mentorships.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Benner, David G. *Strategic Pastoral Counseling: A Short-Term Structured Model*. St. Louis, MO: Morning Star Music Publishers, 2015. ProQuest Ebook Central, <http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/liberty/detail.action?docID=570127>
- Bleeker, Michael. "The Worship Leader and Scripture" in *Doxology & Theology: How the Gospel Forms the Worship Leader*, Boswell, Matt, 43-57. Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2013.
- Boswell, Matt. *Doxology & Theology: How the Gospel Forms the Worship Leader*. Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2013.
- Bozeman, Jeanine Cannon, and Argile Asa Smith, eds. *Interpersonal Relationship Skills for Ministers*. Gretna, LA: Pelican Pub. Co, 2004.
- Bradley, C. Randall. *From Postlude to Prelude: Music Ministry's Other Six Days*. Fenton, MO: MorningStar Music Publishers, 2004.
- Bridges, Jerry. *The Pursuit of Holiness*. Colorado Springs, CO: Navpress, 1978.
- Bronson, David. "Disciple a Worship Leader." *For the Church: Gospel-Centered Resources from Midwestern Seminary* (blog), October 26, 2017. <https://ftc.co/resource-library/blog-entries/disciple-a-worship-leader>.
- Brown, Stacey N. "Five Principles to Empower the Worship Leader." DWS diss., Liberty University, 2016. <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/1217/>.
- Burdick, Brent H. "The Status of the Church in North America." *Review & Expositor* 115, no. 2 (May 2018): 200-213. DOI:10.1177/0034637318771354.
- Bynum, Yvette P. "The Power of Informal Mentoring." *Education* (September 22, 2015): 69-73. https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/A428998434/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=57b7f609.
- Carr, Edward Hallett. *What is History?* New York, NY: Random House Inc., 1961.
- Cherry, Constance M. *The Music Architect: Blueprints for Engaging Worshipers in Song*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2016.
- Clebsch, William A. and Charles R. Jaekle, *Pastoral Care in Historical Perspective*. New York, NY: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 1994.
- Clinebell, Howard John. *Basic Types of Pastoral Care & Counseling: Resources for the Ministry of Healing and Growth*, Rev. and Enlarged. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1984.

- Creswell, John W., and J. David Creswell. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches, Fifth Edition*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publishing, 2018.
- Crow, D. Michael. "Multiplying Jesus Mentors: Designing a Reproducible Mentoring System: A Case Study." *Missiology: An International Review* 36, no. 1 (January 1, 2008): 87–109. <https://doi.org/009182960803600107>.
- Echols, Steve. "Emotional Intelligence and Spiritual Maturity," in *Interpersonal Relationship Skills for Ministers*, ed. Jeanine Cannon Bozeman and Argile Asa Smith, 147-155. Gretna, LA: Pelican Pub. Co, 2004.
- "The Five Crucial Functions of Pastoral Care." *The Scots College, Sydney, Australia* (blog). September 26, 2019. <https://www.tsc.nsw.edu.au/tscnews/the-five-crucial-functions-of-pastoral-care>.
- Gosselin, Jake. "The 5 Pillars of Worship Leading." *Churchfront* (blog), August 16, 2018. <https://churchfront.com/blog-churchfront/2018/8/16/the-5-pillars-of-worship-leading>.
- "Habitus," Social Theory Re-Wired, accessed February 9, 2019, <http://routledgesoc.com/category/profile-tags/habitus>.
- Hall, Kenley D. "The Critical Role of Mentoring for Pastoral Formation." *The Journal of Applied Christian Leadership; Berrien Springs* 11, no. 1 (Spring 2017): 42–53. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/2093227576?accountid=12085>.
- Hall-Heimbecker, Sue. "Mentoring Artists" in *Worship and Mission for the Global Church: An Ethnodoxology Handbook*, James R. Krabill et al., eds., 408-416. Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 2013.
- Harland, Mike. *Worship Essentials: Growing a Healthy Worship Ministry Without Starting a War!* Nashville, TN: B&H Publishing Group, 2018.
- Hendricks, Allen Sherman. "A Renewed Approach to Undergraduate Worship Leader Education." DMin diss., Liberty Baptist Theological Seminary, 2012. <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/592/>.
- Hicks, Zac. *The Worship Pastor: A Call to Ministry for Worship Leaders and Teams*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2016.
- Kauflin, Bob. *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2008.
- Keyes, Aaron. "The Worship Leader and Disciple-Making" in *Doxology & Theology*, Boswell, 149-160.

- Klan, Werner R. A. “‘He heals the brokenhearted and binds up their wounds’ (Ps 147:3): Perspectives on Pastoral Care.” *HTS Teologiese Studies* 74, no. 4 (2018). *Gale Academic OneFile* (accessed March 4, 2020). https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/A562807588/AONE?u=vic_liberty&sid=AONE&xid=940a820f
- Kovnatska, Olya. “Say Yes to Mentoring!” *Strategic Finance; Montvale* 95, no. 11 (May 2014): 47–51. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1525995646?accountid=12085>.
- Krabill, James R., Frank Fortunato, Robin P. Harris, and Brian Schrag, eds. *Worship and Mission for the Global Church: An Ethnodoxology Handbook*. Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 2013.
- Lehtsaar, Tõ, and Maire Ivanova. “Opportunities for Church Related Pastoral Counseling in Estonian Evangelical Churches.” *International Journal of Practical Theology* 15, no. 2 (2011): 279-292. Accessed July 31, 2019. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1114442354?accountid=12085>.
- Lindsay, D. Michael, and M. G. Hager. *View from the Top: An inside Look at How People in Power See and Shape the World*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley, 2014.
- Marshall, Colin, and Tony Payne. *The Trellis and the Vine: The Ministry Mind-Shift That Changes Everything*. Youngstown, OH: Matthias Media, 2009.
- Marton, Edward R. “Mentoring and Discipling Through Missional Small Groups.” DMin diss., United Theological Seminary, 2015. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/1706899504?accountid=12085>.
- Masango, Maake. “Mentorship: A Process of Nurturing Others.” *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 67, no. 1 (June 6, 2011): 5 pages. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v67i1.937>.
- Maxwell, John C. *How Successful People Lead: Taking Your Influence to the Next Level*. First Edition. New York, NY: Center Street, 2013.
- . *The 5 Levels of Leadership: Proven Steps to Maximize Your Potential*. New York, NY: Center Street, 2011.
- . *The 21 Irrefutable Laws of Leadership: Follow Them and People Will Follow You*. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1998.
- McIntosh, Gary, and Samuel D. Rima. *Overcoming the Dark Side of Leadership: How to Become an Effective Leader by Confronting Potential Failures*. Rev. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2007.
- Miller, Stephen. *Worship Leaders: We Are Not Rock Stars*. Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2013.

- Morgan, Rob. “*Balance and Discipleship 3: Part 1*” (Video Lecture). Accessed Number 1, 2018. Lynchburg, VA: Liberty University Online. https://learn.liberty.edu/webapps/blackboard/content/listContent.jsp?course_id=_454576_1&content_id=_26362739_1.
- Morgan, Rob. *Mastering Life Before It’s Too Late: 10 Biblical Strategies for a Lifetime of Purpose*. New York, NY: Howard Books, 2015.
- Navarro, Kevin John. “Becoming a Complete Worship Leader.” DMin diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1998. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/304481974?accountid=12085>.
- Noland, Rory. *The Heart of the Artist: A Character-Building Guide for You & Your Ministry Team*. Grand Rapids, MI.: Zondervan Pub. House, 1999. <http://www.loc.gov/catdir/enhancements/fy0633/99018211-d.html>.
- Page, Franklin S., and L. Lavon Gray. *Hungry for Worship: Challenges and Solutions for Today’s Church*. Birmingham, AL: New Hope Publishers, 2014.
- Perman, Matt. *What’s Best Next: How the Gospel Transforms the Way You Get Things Done*. United States: Zondervan : Made available through hoopla, 2014. <https://www.hoopladigital.com/title/11617736>.
- Plank, Michael Shawn. “The Relationship Between the Discipleship and the Effectiveness of the Worship Leader in the Local Congregation.” DMin diss., Talbot School of Theology, 2016. <https://search-proquestcom.ezproxy.liberty.edu/central/docview/1786894695/ADF4242288324F0BPQ/1?accountid=12085>.
- Putman, Jim. *Real-Life Discipleship: Building Churches That Make Disciples*. Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress, 2010.
- Putman, Jim, Bobby Harrington, and Robert E. Coleman. *DiscipleShift: Five Steps That Help Your Church to Make Disciples Who Make Disciples*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2013.
- Sanders, J. Oswald. *Spiritual Leadership: Principles of Excellence for Every Believer*. Chicago, IL: Moody Publishers, 2017.
- Selzer, Elisabeth H. “Effectiveness of a Seminary’s Training and Mentoring Program and Subsequent Job Satisfaction of Its Graduates.” *Journal of Christian Education* 17, no. 1 (June 2008): 25–53. <https://doi-org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1080/10656210801967309>.
- Sharp, Timothy W. *Mentoring in the Ensemble Arts: Helping Others Find Their Voice*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications, Inc., 2011.

- Simonetti, Jack L., Sonny Ariss, and Joan Martinez. "Through the Top With Mentoring." *Business Horizons* (November 1, 1999): 1-12. https://link-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/apps/doc/58381521/BIC?u=vic_liberty&sid=BIC&xid=39004a10.
- Smith, James K. A. *Imagining the Kingdom: How Worship Works*. Cultural Liturgies, v. 2. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2013.
- "Spiritual Direction." *Worship Leader*, March 29, 2019. https://issuu.com/wlmag/docs/wl_1812_proof_2.
- Spradlin, Byron L. "Discipling Worship Leadership: Biblical and Theological Rationale for Discipling Worship Leaders." DMin diss., Liberty Baptist Theological Seminary, 2012. <https://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/doctoral/542>.
- Stetzer, Ed, and Thom S. Rainer. *Transformational Church: Creating a New Scorecard for Congregations*. Nashville, TN: B & H Pub., 2010.
- Thomas, Matt. "The Indispensable Mark of Christian Leadership: Implications from Christ's Methods of Leadership Development in Mark's Gospel." *Perichoresis* 16, no. 3 (2018): 107–117. <https://doi.org/10.2478/perc-2018-0019>.
- Van Opstal, Sandra. *The Next Worship: Glorifying God in a Diverse World*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, an imprint of InterVarsity Press, 2015.
- Veen, Leslie. "Jethro and Moses: A Biblical Model for Supervision from Exodus 18." *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry* 38 (2018): 220–228. <http://journals.sfu.ca/rpfs/index.php/rpfs/article/view/564/544>.
- Whaley, Vernon. "Principles of Team Leadership" (Video Lecture). Accessed April 22, 2018. Lynchburg, VA: Liberty University Online. https://learn.liberty.edu/webapps/blackboard/content/listContent.jsp?course_id=_419055_1&content_id=_22058018_1.
- Williamson, W. Paul, and Ralph W. Hood. "The Role of Mentoring in Spiritual Transformation: A Faith-Based Approach to Recovery from Substance Abuse." *Pastoral Psychology* 64, no. 1 (February 2015): 135–152. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11089-013-0558-0>.
- Witvliet, John D. *Worship Seeking Understanding: Windows Into Christian Practice*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2003.
- Young, Angela M., and Pamela L. Perrewe. "What Did You Expect? An Examination of Career-Related Support and Social Support Among Mentors and Proteges." *Journal of Management*, 26, no. 4 (August 2000): 611–632. https://bi-gale-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/global/article/GALE%7CA66497894?u=vic_liberty&sid=summon.