

A PHENOMENOLOGICAL HERMENEUTIC STUDY OF THE LIVED  
EXPERIENCES OF SPANISH ELEMENTARY DUAL IMMERSION PRINCIPALS

by

Oswaldo Garcia

Liberty University

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Education

Liberty University

October 2019

A PHENOMENOLOGICAL HERMENEUTIC STUDY OF THE LIVED EXPERIENCES OF  
SPANISH DUAL IMMERSION PRINCIPALS

by Osvaldo Garcia

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment  
Of the Requirements for the Degree  
Doctor of Education

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

October 2019

APPROVED BY:

Jose Arturo Puga, Ed.D., Committee Chair

James A. Swezey, Ed.D., Methodologist

## ABSTRACT

The purpose of this qualitative phenomenological hermeneutic study was to describe the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals who have led or are leading in Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. At this stage in the research, Spanish elementary dual immersion schools were generally defined as educational institutions designed to provide instruction in English and Spanish. The following central research question guided the study: What is the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals? The researcher delved into the challenges, benefits, and transformational leadership traits of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals. The theory which guided my study was transformational leadership theory as theorized by Bass and Burns as it pertains to transforming a school site to face the unique challenges shared by dual immersion schools. In this study, 10 Spanish elementary dual immersion principals participated in semi-structured interviews, written letters to a future candidate, and photo narratives. Selective data analysis was utilized as a means of generating themes. My study found Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders are higher purpose-driven, social justice crusaders, use proactive stewardship, always on the defense, buffers, culture builders, educational shifters, and instructional leaders in language acquisition. My study concluded that Spanish Elementary dual immersion school leaders are transformational agents. I recommend the replication of my study in other school settings.

*Keywords:* dual immersion, principals, English language learners, transformational leadership theory

## **Dedication**

I would like to dedicate this dissertation to my Lord and Savior Jesus Christ. Through Him all is possible. Without Him nothing of any value can be accomplished. Through the guidance of Him and the Father, this dissertation has been made possible. It was through their guidance and inspiration that this study was formulated. It was their direct intervention that I was able to come to know and understand the significance of dual language learning. It is my hope that this dissertation can have a positive impact on students everywhere who are struggling to learn English.

I also dedicate this study to my wife, Rosario Garcia. She has been the bedrock on which I can trust. Through her diligence and caring, our household has been able to maintain sanity during my years of study. At times, often, sacrificing her own pursuits to make mine a reality. She has been my constant companion through hard times. Her steadfastness and willingness to put up with me have been invaluable.

I hope this dissertation becomes a living symbol of the dedication I have to life-long learning. It is my invocation that my children can one day read this document and be inspired to pursue knowledge to the fullest extent possible in their area of interest.

Lastly, I want to dedicate this document to my parents. The sacrifices they made throughout their lives have been an inspiration. As my mom has often stated, "It is through education that poverty can be erased." With this aim, I have endeavored to change the economic and social future of my family. This is built upon my parents' enduring sacrifice.

**Table of Contents**

ABSTRACT .....3

Dedication .....4

List of Tables .....9

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....11

    Overview.....11

    Background.....12

        Historical.....13

        Social.....14

        Theoretical .....17

    Situation to Self.....19

    Problem Statement .....23

    Purpose Statement.....25

    Significance of the Study .....26

    Research Questions.....27

        Central Research Question.....28

        Guiding Question One .....29

        Guiding Question Two.....29

        Guiding Question Three.....30

    Definitions.....30

    Summary .....31

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW .....33

    Overview.....33

Theoretical Framework .....33

    Transformational Leadership .....34

Theory of Second Language Acquisition and Hypothesis .....37

    Theory of Second Language Acquisition .....37

    Interdependence Hypothesis .....40

Related Literature.....41

    Bilingual Instruction in the United States .....44

    Background History of Dual Immersion.....52

    Subtractive and Additive Bilingual Program Models .....53

    Dual Immersion Variations .....55

    Current Academic Discourse on Dual Immersion .....57

Addressing Gaps in the Literature .....63

Summary .....64

**CHAPTER THREE: METHODS .....65**

    Overview .....65

    Design .....66

    Research Questions .....69

    Setting .....69

    Participants .....70

    Procedures .....72

    The Researcher's Role .....74

    Data Collection .....76

        Interviews .....77

Researcher Journal .....	80
Written Letter .....	80
Photo Narratives.....	81
Data Analysis .....	81
Trustworthiness.....	84
Credibility .....	85
Dependability and Confirmability .....	85
Transferability.....	86
Ethical Considerations .....	86
Summary .....	87
CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS .....	88
Overview.....	88
Participants.....	88
Results.....	102
Theme Development.....	103
Research Question Responses.....	139
Summary .....	148
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION.....	150
Overview.....	150
Summary of Findings.....	150
Discussion.....	151
Theoretical Findings .....	152
Emperical .....	160

Implications.....165

    Theoretical .....165

    Empirical.....167

    Practical.....168

Delimitations and Limitations.....169

Recommendations for Future Research .....170

Summary .....171

REFERENCES .....175

APPENDIX A: IRB APPROVAL .....198

APPENDIX B: RECRUITMENT LETTER.....199

APPENDIX C: CONSENT FORM .....200

APPENDIX D: THEME DEVELOPMENT .....202

APPENDIX E: CODE MATRIX.....203



**List of Tables**

<b>Table</b>		<b>Page</b>
1	Spanish Dual Immersion School Leader Participants.....	71

### **List of Abbreviations**

Basic interpersonal communication skills (BICS)

Cognitive academic language proficiency (CALP)

English Language Learner (ELL)

No Child Left Behind (NCLB)

## CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

### Overview

Latino/a students in the United States face a myriad of educational challenges. Compared to their counterparts, Latino/a students underperform academically based on standardized testing (Lauen & Gaddis, 2012), face low graduation rates (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015), and have low matriculation rates into higher education school settings (Vega & Martinez, 2012). A major contributing factor to Latino/a academic problems resides in their limited proficiency in English (Villares, Brigman, Webb, & Palus 2011). Educators have developed different solutions to meet the English language deficiencies of Latino/a students (Li, Steele, Slater, Bacon, & Miller, 2016).

In meeting the needs of Latino/a students, dual immersion curricular programs have emerged as one of the most promising means of ameliorating the English language deficiency of English Language Learners (Lindholm-Leary & Block, 2010; Steele, Slater, Zamarro, Miller, Li, Burkhauser, & Bacon, 2015). In dual immersion curricular program structures, students are taught in two languages. Students are taught in English and in their native language. Native language development instruction is believed to help ELL students access content while they develop English language proficiency (Burkhauser, Steele, Li, Slater, Bacon, & Miller, 2016). Students who undergo the program develop bi-literacy in English and their native tongue, develop bi-cultural awareness and knowledge, and perform at or better than their monolingual counterparts (Burkhauser, et al., 2016).

The efficacy of dual immersion programs has been well documented (Collier & Thomas, 2004; Lapkin, Hart, & Turnbull, 2003; Lindholm-Leary & Block, 2010; Marian, Shook, & Schroeder, 2013; Padilla, Fan, Xu, & Silva, 2013; Thomas & Collier, 2015). Although the

effectiveness of these programs has been the focus of research, few academic inquiries have been conducted in the area of leadership. Given that recent academic literature has produced positive findings on dual immersion as an effective curricular option of ameliorating the academic deficiencies of students, then what can be understood, through academic research, about school leaders who lead these schools?

The purpose of this hermeneutic phenomenological study is to describe the professional working lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. Through this inquiry, a deep rich description of the occupational lives of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals has been attained with the aim of providing insight into what it means to be a leader in this specific school setting. This research seeks to add breadth to the current literature on school leadership so as to inform current and future school administrators in this specific curricular program setting. Current and future school leaders may use the information gathered through this research to become better practitioners in this specified role. This chapter details the background of the problem as it relates to English Language Learners who are Latino/a, establishes the researcher's situation to the problem, and discusses the gap in the literature. In addition, key vocabulary terms related to the topic are defined. The chapter concludes with a summary of the introduction.

### **Background**

Latino/a students have academically underperformed compared to other students in school (Deamthew & Izquierdo, 2016; Lauen & Gaddis, 2012). Despite Latino/a student struggles, educators have implemented curricular program structures in an attempt to remedy their academic problem (Li et al., 2016). This section explicated the problem of Latino/a educational deficiencies through a historical, social, and theoretical discourse. In addition, the

section addressed how my study added to current research in the field of dual immersion education.

## **Historical**

Latinos have an extended history of living in the United States (Gratton & Merchant, 2016). Since the settlement of Spanish colonies in the new world and procreation of the Mestizo, the Americas were populated by people who presented a mixture of European and indigenous blood (Von Wobeser, 2012). Early Spanish settlements were not restricted by territorial boundaries. In the late 1700s, Spanish settlements were established in the southern lands of the United States (Louise Pubols, 2014). Mestizo populations helped Spanish Catholic missionaries establish settlements in the states of Arizona, California, Colorado, Florida, New Mexico, Texas, and Utah (Amaro-Aguilar & Watson, 2016). These early Mexicans established fortified roots. Some of them became the prominent wealthy elite of their time (Balderrama & Rodriguez, 2006). The U.S.-Mexico war changed the complete dynamic of ruling Mexican families. The Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo of 1848 forced Mexican families to be treated as foreigners in their own lands (Amaro-Aguilar & Watson, 2016). Although the treaty established certain rights for the Mexicans, their rights were eventually ignored by American settlers (Amaro-Aguilar & Watson, 2016).

Mexicans living in the United States were relegated to second class citizenship status (Acuña, 2015). Mexican children were primarily educated in public segregated Mexican schools (Donato, Guzmán, & Hanson, 2017; San Miguel, 2001). As San Miguel (2001) stated, “School board members, administrators, and teaching staff, for the most part, were Non-Mexican, did not speak Spanish, and were indifferent or, at times, hostile to these children. Most educators viewed Mexican children as racially or culturally inferior” (p. 19). Furthermore, Mexican

schools were ill funded, lacked materials, and used subtractive curriculum (San Miguel, 2001). Education for Mexican children aimed to Americanize them with subtractive education. In other words, erase their Spanish language and culture and substitute it with English and American ideals and values (Cha & Goldenberg, 2015; San Miguel, 2001). This was done despite the wishes of Mexican parents who preferred their children to learn Spanish and have supplemental instruction in English and American customs (San Miguel, 2001).

The Civil Rights Movement made it possible to de-segregate schools (Purdy, 2016). Despite these efforts, school boards continued to segregate Mexican children (San Miguel Jr., 2005). The dominant American population believed Mexican children benefitted from remedial English instruction (Gándara & Aldana, 2014). Segregation, as well, served to avoid exposure of Non-Hispanic children to slow and poor hygienic Mexican children (Gándara & Aldana, 2014).

Mexican children eventually benefitted from lawsuits that forced the school districts to desegregate (San Miguel Jr., 2005). A small percentage (5%) of Mexican children composed the student population in 1950 (Gándara & Aldana, 2014). The relatively low number of Mexican school children were augmented by an influx of immigrants from Mexico and South American countries. In 2010, Latino children constituted 16.3% of the population with a number of about 50.5 million (Gándara & Aldana, 2014).

## **Social**

Spoken language is a uniquely human characteristic (Baronchelli, Chater, Pastor-Satorras, & Christiansen, 2012). As humans, we are born into familial structures where socialization can take place (Bayley & Schecter, 2003). Part of the human experience is to learn the language of our parents. Chinese descendants learn Chinese, Latino/a learn Spanish, American descendants learn English, and so forth. However, Latino/a children living in the

United States find themselves in a unique language predicament. Some Latino/a children are spoken to exclusively in Spanish in a society where English is the dominant language (Sonnenschein, Metzger, Dowling, & Baker, 2016). Data from 2011 indicated that 37.6 million people aged five and older spoke Spanish at home (Ryan, 2013). In 2012, 85% of foreign-born people who resided in the United States spoke another language other than English at home (Gambino, Acosta, & Grieco, 2014).

Although Latino/a children may become strong fluent Spanish speakers, their interlocution skills have subordinate applicability for the dominant American culture of the United States (Lippi-Green, 2012). The English language is pervasively used throughout all facets of U.S society and is considered as the dominant language (Metz, 2018). Latinos have been politically marginalized for their limited English skills (De La Garza, & Yang, 2015). Daily interactions and communications require English interlocution, especially in school (Durán, Roseth, Hoffman, & Robertshaw, 2013). Latino/a students' risk academic stagnation if they do not proficiently acquire the dominant English language (De La Garza & Phillips, 2014).

Even though dual immersion programs have been consistent in improving academic gains in ELL student populations, the adoption of this curricular program has been limited. Only a small percentage of schools in the United States offer dual immersion programs (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016). The nature of political dynamics cannot be overlooked in discussing language learning. A history of nationalism combined with xenophobia has contributed to educational neglect (Kerr-Berry, 2016). Minority student issues have often been overlooked, not cared for, and ignored (Acuña, 2015; Bertocchi, 2015; Ladson-Billings, 2006; Parker & Villalpando, 2007; Yosso, 2006;). Although dual language programs help ELL students shorten their academic gaps in English (Lindholm-Leary & Block, 2010; Steele et al., 2015), dual

immersion opponents claim that teaching a foreign language is counterproductive to learning English (Borden, 2014).

The political climate has influenced the establishment and maintainability of dual immersion programs across the nation. Depending on the political climate of the state or local region, the establishment or evanesce of dual immersion programs is in constant flux (Maxwell, 2012). Establishing a dual immersion program is often fraught with heated political battles played out in school districts (Dorner, 2010; Soltero, 2016). The result has been a reduction or elimination of dual immersion programs with high ELL populations (Borden, 2014). Even in areas where dual immersion programs have been instituted, oppositional forces actively pursue their disintegration (Palmer, Henderson, Wall, Zúñiga, & Berthelsen, 2015).

Added to the political dynamic that influences dual immersion programs is the subject of race. The United States has a long history of racial inequality. This inequality has been historically prevalent in the realm of education (Bertocchi, 2015). Children from minority races have been subjected to segregation, differential treatment, and educational malpractice (Gooden, Jabbar, & Torres, 2016). As some dual immersion program structures strive to create congruence between dominant and minority students, this unique coupling may be considered an asset or a hindrance (Scanlan & Palmer, 2009).

Interlocution and the ability to produce appropriate language within a given society provides powerful functions (Baronchelli, Chater, Pastor-Satorras, & Christiansen, 2012). Our daily lives require constant communication to express our needs and desires (Dettenmeier, 2014). Individuals who have limited proficiency within the dominant societal language often find themselves limited to what they can do (Dettenmeier, 2014). In the American society, individuals who do not possess appropriate English skills find it difficult to access basic



necessities such as finding work opportunities, procuring healthcare, socially interacting with peers, interacting with government agencies and seeking and requesting assistance (Aichhorn & Puck, 2017; Dettenmeier, 2014;). The ability to communicate well within the English dominant American society is vital.

### **Theoretical**

Leadership is a well-researched topic (Derue, Nahrgang, Wellman, & Humphrey, 2011). Great leaders have been able to place their mark in history. The achievements of great leaders have made human-kind wonder, especially academics, what makes great leadership? Different leadership theories have emerged to explain and replicate great leadership (Munro, 2008). Some leadership theories include: Behavioral theory (Quirk & Fandt, 2000), systems theory (Boldman & Deal, 2013), situational leadership (Hersey & Blanchard, 1977), transactional leadership (Avolio & Bass, 2002), and transformational leadership (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1993; Burns, 1978).

My research utilized transformational leadership theory (Bass, 1990) as a lens to understand school leadership in Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. Transformational leadership uses elements of individual motivation (Bass, 1990). Leaders who follow transformational leadership aim to transform each individual in their organization (Khanin, 2007). This transformation calls for each organizational member to leave their individualistic self-interest behind and instead possess focused efforts in achieving grand organizational goals (Bass, 1995).

Transformational leadership posits the importance of the leader cultivating each individual member of the organization by practicing four elements in leadership (Bass, 1990, Harris & Mouse, 1999). These elements include: charisma, inspirational motivation, intellectual

stimulation, and individual consideration (Bass, 1990). By practicing these four elements, leaders transform each member of the organization into an individual who has a meaningful sense of purpose in the work they do (Bass, 1995).

One main goal of Spanish dual immersion schools is to develop students who are bi-literate (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016). Because my research is about schools where children are learning two languages, and school leaders must understand the pedagogical foundation for second language acquisition in order to guide teachers in achieving this curricular goal, my research necessitated the use of second language theory as a lens to illuminate the curricular foundation dual immersion schools use. These theories, as well, aid in understanding the leadership challenges in administering a Spanish dual immersion school. My study used Krashen's (1982) second language acquisition theory and Cummins' (1979) interdependence hypothesis.

In the educational realm, the aim has been to identify and use the leadership style or theory that is most conducive to effectively leading educational institutions (Munro, 2008). Dual immersion as a curricular program offering is very different than traditional program offerings (Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Soltero, 2016). Because students are taught in two languages at the same time, educational leaders guide faculty into accepting a paradigm shift. The leader of a dual immersion school has to transform the notions and functions of a traditional school environment into one that embraces culture, language, and divergent thinking. Thus, the nature of this research necessitates the use of transformational leadership theory as a guide.

Spanish elementary dual immersion principals face unique challenges (Menken & Solorza, 2015). In dual immersion programs, students are taught using two languages. Teachers share students as they transition from English to Spanish instruction. The coupling of teachers

creates a powerful but complicated relationship (Palmer et al, 2015). More than in other schools, teachers must learn to cooperatively work as teams (Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Palmer et al., 2015). The acquisition of learning materials is sometimes a challenge. Teachers who teach the target language, Spanish, are often devoid of curricular material. Preceptors are left to figure out or create material on their own. Language-communication is very important at a dual immersion site. In some places, teacher availability makes it difficult for school leaders. It may be often difficult to recruit foreign language teachers to teach in the target language of instruction (Rubinstein-Avila, 2002). Communication between school-site and parents, such as school informative flyers or homework, can be troublesome. Due to the unique nature of dual immersion, conflictive tensions may arise between district policy, procedures, and direction (Whitacre, 2015).

School administrators have a large role in establishing, maintaining, or evanescent dual immersion programs at the school level (Menken & Solorza, 2015). Dual immersion programs may offer the best opportunity for Spanish speaking students to close the achievement gap (Lindholm-Leary & Hernández, 2011). This study assumed that Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals are transformational agents as they administer their school sites. This phenomenological hermeneutic study used transformational leadership theory as a lens to understand the professional working lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals. As well, my study used the bilingual theoretical foundation of second language acquisition and interdependence hypothesis to understand the instructional challenges.

### **Situation to Self**

Growing up for me should have been easy, but it was not. Living in Mexico in my early years was pure joy. For our family, it seemed like we had everything. We owned our home, my

father had a secure job in a glass producing factory, my brother and I attended our local elementary school, and we attended church every Sunday. Although we did not have luxuries, we had the basic tenets that lead to happiness in life. One of my fondest memories was staring into our new color television my father had won at the company Christmas raffle. Life was good!

However, our parents always had the desire to provide a better life than what my brother and I had in Mexico. As they saw it, life was good, but it could only get better. Mexico had a lot of structural and political problems. Corruption was at the root of everyday life. Even the people that had been entrusted to keep and enforce the laws acted with hypocrisy. Police officers would stop pedestrians and motorists for money, regardless of an actual committed infraction. Since long ago, my parents had dreamed of getting away from the corruptive state of Mexico. They did not wish for a better life for themselves but for a better opportunity for their children. With that desire, they decided to leave their homeland and travel to the United States.

As a little boy, I did not quite understand what was transpiring. I remember, one day, our house being filled with neighbors and strangers. My mother was selling all of our possessions. Suddenly, a house filled with household items was dwindling to an empty hollow space. Our couches, tables, beds, everything disappeared before our eyes. My beloved color television was one of the first items to go. Looking around, I saw my brother who kept crying as neighbors carried off his pet rooster which had been a constant companion for him. Life as we knew it would change.

We entered the country legally. Our family had saved money and had procured enough to acquire tourist visas. As we entered through the border, the immigration agent asked to see how much my father had to spend. My father showed him the racks of dollar bills he had stashed

away. “With that, you can stay an entire year.” With that blessing, we were off.

With hopeful optimism, the plan was to get settled right away. My father would quickly learn English and we could establish ourselves once more. Our family headed to the state of California where my father’s sister resided. Our aunt had a small house in the city of Los Angeles. She was married and living with two children. Arriving in Los Angeles was not what I expected. Along the way, our parents had explained that we would have a better life in the United States. I envisioned a futuristic city with high rise skyscrapers and the surroundings of a prosperous nation. Los Angeles was not that at all. It looked like a town in decline. Trash littered the streets, old buildings abound, and signs of impoverishment were abundant. There was no comparison between the city I once lived into where I now was going to live. Aside from the infrastructural deterioration, we were living in a home which was not our own.

Life in the United States was not at all how my parents envisioned it to be. My father thought that acquiring a language would be easy. Yet after three months, he had not learned a single word. He had hoped to find a job and that was a disappointment as well. Added to my disappointment were the struggles I would face in school. My extremely limited social interlocution skills in English compounded with a limited knowledge of American culture created an educational gap that I constantly struggled to overcome.

Navigating my new educational system was a challenge. I did not know the language. I could not communicate as I once had. Instead of communication, I tended to listen and observe. Children who were also in the same predicament, my friends, became my interpreters. Although they did not know a lot of English, they could understand and translate what I needed to know. Each school year was a game of playing catch up. While other students were placed in advanced reading groups, I was to be stuck in books that were two grade levels behind. Each year I

yearned to be considered part of the advanced group. Eventually, I learned English well enough to compete with other students. Little did I realize, at the time, that my immigration and school experience, would serve as my life's work.

My educational experience as an immigrant boy struggling to learn English became an impetus for my intrinsic desire to approach this dissertation topic. This topic is personal in nature. During my professional career, I have made the amelioration of struggling English learners a priority. My life course, thus, has led me to dedicate 22 years of life to this desideratum. My professional work experience has been in bilingual, structured English immersion, and dual language educational settings. It is with this personal life experience and great passion to help students who were "just like me" that I situated myself to the topic of this study.

This research study used a constructivist research paradigm. It is my belief that learners are actively constructing their own interpretations and knowledge. Thus, I believe participants in this study, although having experienced the same phenomenon, may experience and learn from their experience in different ways. Although the participants may view and have different understandings of the phenomenon, I believe that certain commonalities do exist and can create commonalities among participants.

My unique life experience, as an immigrant boy, has provided multiplicity in the way I think. By living my life in the spheres of two cultures, I have developed an epistemological assumption that knowledge is gained by examining phenomenon through different lenses. Each lens may provide different analysis and findings. Further, I possess an axiological philosophical assumption that research is a human construct. Although researchers may attempt to limit their biases and values, it may be impossible to be perfectly objective. I believe biases and values

should be actively reported to contradict the natural human tendency of siding with one's own beliefs.

As a person who has been able to navigate the dominant English world and still retain my Latino cultural heritage, I have been exposed to different attitudes and beliefs. Thus, I understand that people can experience a phenomenon differently. This ontological assumption (Creswell, 2013) guides my understanding of the world. I understand that phenomenon are experienced differently depending on one's perspective. This is evident in the dual nature that two cultures have produced in me. For example, my Mexican culture has provided me with a strong affinity to familial unity. At the same time, my American influence has provided me with a sense of competitiveness and individuality. Through my exposure to two cultures, I have been able to contemplate situations through different cultural lenses. The ontological assumption of multiplicity in perspectives and experiences guided this study, as it described the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals.

### **Problem Statement**

The problem is many Latina/o emergent bilingual children come from low socioeconomic realities, are in the process of learning English as a second language and underperform academically when compared to other English-speaking peers (DeMatthews & Izquierdo, 2016). Deficiencies in English language production may lead to failure in school. ELL students are at risk of dropping out, failing to meet high school graduation requirements, and not enrolling in higher education institutions (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015). This leads to a population of students who earns less income over a lifetime as compared to others who earned a high school diploma or completed higher education (Luthra & Flashman, 2017).

English language learners demonstrate an academic achievement gap in comparison to their native-English peers (Polat, Zarecky-Hodge, & Schreiber, 2016). Several academic studies have suggested that dual language program structures help address the achievement gap of English language learners by fifth grade (Block, 2011; Steele, et al., 2015; Thomas, & Collier, 2002). Significantly, students who received dual language instruction performed at or above grade level upon their fifth year of completion on achievement tests when compared to their monolingual counterparts (Burkhauser, et al., 2016; Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Steele et al., 2015;). Thus, dual immersion programs may be a viable solution in helping English language learners close the achievement gap (Lindholm-Leary, & Block, 2010).

Dual immersion programs have consistently improved the academic progression of ELL students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Palmer et al., 2015). Although these programs show promise, dual immersion programs are subject to internal and external pressures. Dual immersion principals become central to the program's success or demise (Menken & Solorza, 2015). Few research studies have been conducted regarding the practice of educational leadership at these schools.

This research study contributed to the body of literature in this area by using a phenomenological approach (Creswell, 2013) to understand the lived shared experience of dual immersion school administrators in their current working daily lives. Students outcomes have been demonstrated to be correlated with good principal leadership (Coelli & Green, 2012). This research study provided educational leader participants a forum to share their voice and insights into what it means to live their working life as a school administrator of a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal as a means of helping current or future dual immersion principals be successful on the job. Understanding the occupational experiences may contribute to good



principal leadership and thus improving Spanish dual immersion programs to the benefit of ELL student outcomes.

Even though Spanish dual immersion programs are good for Latino/a students (Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Palmer et al., 2015), their progression or disintegration is subject to its school leadership (Menken & Solorza, 2015). The problem is current or future Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders may not understand the leadership experiences needed to perform the job well. This study added to the existing body of dual immersion research by providing a deep rich description of the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. By having examined their lived experiences, this study provided the essence of what it means to experience this phenomenon, thereby having filled the research gap that exists, and created a better understanding of the leadership needed to administer this program offering. By better understanding, the leadership of this select group, my study informs future and current Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders on best practices for their leadership role.

### **Purpose Statement**

The purpose of this phenomenological hermeneutic study of the working lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals was to describe their shared professional lives as they currently or formerly administer Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. In my research study, Spanish dual immersion schools are understood as educational school sites where instruction is taught in both English and in Spanish. In tandem, school leadership was generally defined as the process by which school administrators guide multiple school stakeholders toward the goal of improving educational attainment and progression of students. The theories which guided my study are transformational leadership theory as

theorized by Bass and Burns as it pertains to transforming a school site to face the unique challenges shared by dual immersion schools (Bass, 1990; Burns, 1978; Bass & Avolio, 1993).

### **Significance of the Study**

In empirical terms, this study added to the body of research in the field of bilingual education (Lindholm-Leary & Block 2010). Specifically, it filled the void as it aimed to understand the professional working lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals and gained insight into the administration of schools with this unique program dynamic (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015). At its core, this study uncovered “what is it like to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal?” By understanding the lived working experiences of Spanish dual immersion principals, my study filled the academic literature gap for dual immersion school leaders. Current and future Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders may learn from the results of my study as it explored the essence (Creswell, 2013; Husserl, 1968; van Manen, 1997) of this phenomenon. As I explored the essence, the significance of this research was shedding light on the challenges, benefits, and transformational underpinnings Spanish elementary dual immersion administrators use as they administer such a unique program offering.

Theoretically, my study added to the body of theoretical leadership frameworks (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1999; Burns, 1978;). Specifically, it applied transformational leadership theory to the important work of dual immersion principals. In the process, it solidified the theory in its application to school leadership. Central to this endeavor is the assumption that dual immersion school leaders are transformational change agents in a variety of regards. This research added to the body of literature for school leaders. Furthermore, it added to the

understanding of transformational leadership by elucidating the work of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders in their efforts to transform schools to reach programmatic goals.

This study focused on leadership practicality for Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. The exploration of this topic elucidated the manner in which dual immersion principals face challenges as they administer the program. In doing so, my study provided guidance for future and current educational leaders who have been tasked with this important job (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015). Furthermore, it provided practical information for dual immersion school leadership training programs. Most importantly, it offered leadership guidance in a curricular program model that research suggests ameliorates the academic gap of English Language Learners. As van Manen (1997) stated,

When I love a person (a child or adult) I want to know what contributes toward the good of that person. So, the principle that guides my actions is a sense of the pedagogic Good; at the same time, I remain sensitive to the uniqueness of the person this particular situation. (p. 24).

Like van Manen, to do pedagogic good, for me, is to help students, who were like my younger self, struggling English language learners. By understanding the working administrative realities of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals, my research has the ability to improve the leadership skills of current and future leaders of Spanish elementary dual immersion school sites. In turn, better educational leadership may help support English Language Learners.

### **Research Questions**

As humans, we seek to find meaning in the world we live (Patton, 2015). We want to understand how our world functions. Phenomenology is the study of understanding the world (Patton, 2015). It seeks to shed light into a phenomenon. A phenomenon is a shared experience

between people (van Manen, 1997). Essentially this means a phenomenon can be anything that can be experienced in the world (van, Manen, 1997).

Unlike and apart from quantitative research, which uses mathematical-statistical computations as a research tool, qualitative research uses the researcher as the instrument of inquiry (Patton, 2015). Therefore, the collection, reflection, and interpretation of the data are solely a construct of the researcher (Patton, 2015). As Patton (2015) stated,

“Your background, experience, training, skills, interpersonal competence, capacity for empathy, cross-cultural sensitivity, and how you, as a person, engage in fieldwork and analysis—these things undergird the credibility of your findings. Reflection on how your data collection and interpretation are affected by who you are, what’s going on in your life, what you care about, how you view the world, and how you’ve chosen to study what interests you is a part of qualitative methodology.” (Patton, 2015, p. 3).

Qualitative researchers aim to understand the phenomenon by using probing questions (Creswell, 2013). The researcher seeks out individuals who have all experienced the same phenomenon and develops open-ended questions that seek to understand the heart of the phenomenon (Creswell, 2013). Central and guiding questions lead academic research (Creswell, 2013). A central question is an overarching question that encompasses the heart of the phenomenon (Creswell, 2013). Guiding questions are sub questions that further the central question into a certain area (Creswell, 2013). This section detailed the central and guiding questions leading my study.

### **Central Research Question**

What are the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals?

Hermeneutic phenomenology research method aims to describe the essence of phenomenon (van Manen, 1997). My research studied the lived experiences of Spanish

elementary dual immersion school leaders. Current research has indicated that dual immersion principals perceive their job to hold five essential roles. These include immersion guru, immersion proponent, immersion overseer, cultural unifier, and agent of change (Rocque, Ferrin, Hite & Randall, 2016). This question beckoned dual immersion principals and had them contemplate their leadership in their school with the aim of finding leadership commonalities amongst participants. The question also allowed participants to share their personal stories which provided support of the leadership roles, qualities, or traits they exhibit on the job.

### **Guiding Question One**

What occupational challenges do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals face during the administration of a Spanish elementary dual immersion school?

Spanish elementary dual immersion schools have unique attributes making them different from traditional program offerings (Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Soltero, 2016). Because dual immersion principals face unique challenges in their leadership roles (Menken & Solorza, 2015), this question implored participants to share their challenges and experiences. With this information, this study used the transformational leadership lens to elucidate the essence of the challenges faced by the participants' lived experiences.

### **Guiding Question Two**

What benefits do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals find in their working lives?

Not every day experiences are fraught with challenging obstacles. Rather, life is filled with joys that bring about wonderful feelings of meaning and sentiment (van Manen, 1997). This question examined the joys and blithesome experiences Spanish elementary dual immersion

school leaders are involved as they perform their occupational functions (Ascenzi-Moreno et al., 2015).

### **Guiding Question Three**

How do Spanish elementary dual immersion principals apply transformational leadership as they administer their schools?

Transformational leadership serves to transform organizations through idealized influence, inspirational motivation, individualized consideration, and intellectual stimulation (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1993; Burns, 1978;). Transformative leaders shift self-centered individual pursuits of employees towards a meaningful coordinated collaborative goal. Spanish elementary dual immersion schools have the goal of shifting schools from a traditional model into an organization that fulfills the mission of developing high levels of bi-literacy and proficiency, developing high levels of student achievement, and developing cultural acceptance and understanding (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016; Soltero, 2016).

### **Definitions**

1. *Basic interpersonal communication skills*- Communication skills used for basic social conversation (Krashen, 1982).
2. *Cognitive academic language proficiency*- Higher academic language skills that are needed for academic learning (Krashen, 1982).
3. *Dual immersion*- A curricular program offering whereby students are taught in two languages (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
4. *English Language Learner*- A student who primarily speaks a language other than English and is learning English as a second language (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).

5. *Spanish dual immersion*- A curricular program offering whereby students are taught in two languages. Students are taught in English and Spanish (target language) (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).
6. *Transformational leadership*- Leadership that entails charisma, individual attention, and intellectual curiosity as a means of guiding subordinates to strive to achieve goals for the good of the organization (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1993; Burns, 1978).
7. *Transactional leadership*- Leadership that uses rewards and punishment as a means of achieving compliance from subordinates (Bass, 1990; Burns, 1978; Bass & Avolio, 1993).

### **Summary**

Latino/a students face educational struggles. Although other populations are impacted as well, Latino/a students often matriculate in schools with limited English competency. Research has demonstrated that dual immersion positively influences academic achievement. The purpose of this phenomenological study (Creswell, 2013) was to describe the working lived experiences of Spanish elementary school administrators who have led or are leading in Spanish Elementary dual immersion schools. This study employed a hermeneutic phenomenological approach as a means of understanding the challenges and benefits Spanish dual immersion principals encounter as they perform their occupational duties. As dual immersion school leaders are change agents in a school, this study used transformational leadership theory as theorized by Bass and Burns as it pertains to transforming a school site to face the unique challenges shared by dual immersion schools (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1993; Burns, 1978;). The purpose of my study was to help guide dual immersion school leaders in an effort to better understand how to administer dual

immersion programs. Additionally, my study may provide information for dual immersion leadership training.



## **CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **Overview**

The topic of language learning and bilingualism is extensive. Although dual immersion programs are a recent phenomenon, it, nonetheless, stems from vast and rich research in bilingualism. This chapter begins with the selection of theoretical frameworks. Particularly, transformational leadership and monitor and second language acquisition theories are selected as lenses by which to study the topic of the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. Afterward, a historical overview of language learning is explained. This historical explication transitioned into the emergence of dual immersion school programs as a viable bilingual curricular program option. Furthermore, the literature review covers recent related literature in the areas of leadership, challenges, benefits, and the intersection between language and race. The literature review concludes with a discussion of how this study fills the academic gaps in the academic discourse.

### **Theoretical Framework**

Dual immersion programs are unique program offerings (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015). These programs require a deep transformation of current monolingual pedagogical school structures into ones where bilingualism can flourish (Whitacre, 2015). Effective dual immersion school principals transform the school setting by developing a shared vision and motivating all stakeholders to become believers in dual language learning (Hunt, 2011). Dual immersion principals, it was assumed by this research, are transformational leaders as they shift monolingual pedagogical structures into bilingual formats. Thus, my study used the transformational leadership theory as a lens to study the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals. This research study furthered transformational leadership

theory by addressing its applicability in Spanish elementary dual language schools. This study demonstrated Spanish dual immersion school leaders viewed their administrative lives as congruent with the four facets of transformational leadership.

Dual immersion schools teach in English and another language (Soltero, 2016). One of the main goals of dual immersion programs is to develop bi-literacy in two languages (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016; Soltero, 2016). A pedagogical lens in language learning is necessary to understand the language acquisition process in dual immersion schools. This research used Krashen's Second Language Acquisition (1982) and Cummins' Interdependence Hypothesis (1979) to understand the language acquisition process evident in dual immersion schools. This research study furthered the advancement of Second Language Acquisition and Interdependence Hypothesis by illuminating the interactions school leaders face as students acquire a second language in Spanish elementary dual immersion schools.

### **Transformational Leadership**

Leadership may be categorized as the ability of an individual to motivate others toward a shared vision and mission (Ronald, 2014). Successful leaders motivate others to think less of their individual self-interest and instead focus their energies toward common goals (Ronald, 2014). Education leaders struggle to unite all stakeholders (Stoessel, 2013). Despite this struggle, effective leaders create synergy throughout the organization. Leaders aim to positively impact their working institutions. Different leadership theories have emerged as roadmaps to effective leadership. Some of these leadership theories are: Great Man (Kirkpatrick & Locke, 1996; McEwan, 2003), Iowa State (Lewin, Lippit, & White, 1939), and Ohio State leadership (Fleishman, 1953) research, McGregor's Theory X and Y (McGregor, 1960), Blake and Mouton's Managerial Grid (Blake and Mouton, 1960), and Transformational Leadership

(Thrash, 2012). For the purposes of this research, transformation leadership theory was used as a theoretical underpinning. Given that Spanish elementary dual immersion schools vary greatly from traditional schools, I assumed Spanish elementary principals use transformational leadership as they shift the way in which schooling functions.

Transformational leadership has been considered one of the most current and promising leadership theories. The theory is based on the ideas of Burns (1978) with the current exposition of his ideas in Bass (1990). Different from the other leadership theories, transformational leadership aims to transform organizational members. This type of leadership theory is based on motivation. Leaders motivate members to perform at higher levels and do more of what they are capable of. A leader uses four transformational elements that include: charisma, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration.

Influenced by the ideas of Weber and House (1988), Bass (1990) intersected the idea of the charismatic leader (Fiol, Harris & House, 1999). Since the leader must reframe (break old habits) of the organizations into a new shared vision, the leader possesses charismatic qualities to start the reframing process. The process consists of frame braking (negate conventional actions or thinking), frame moving (moving followers from a passive state to an active state), and frame re-aligning (initiating action into a new vision of innovation) (Harris & Mouse, 1999).

Using these processes, transformational leaders aim to elevate followers to a higher plain (Bass, 1995). Through inspirational motivation, followers work fervently and aspire to become like the leader (Khanin, 2007; Thrash, 2012). This is unlike transactional leadership, whereby the leader gives followers a series of consequences and rewards associated with their performance (Khanin, 2007). In contrast, transformational leadership attempts to elevate the followers' status to a collective good. As the group members understand their collective

achievement, they celebrate and receive fulfillment through their collective actions (Khanin, 2007).

Unlike transactional leadership, a transformational leader provides followers with intellectual stimulation (Bass, Avolio, Jung, & Berson, 2003). Whereas the transactional leader requires subordinates to perform menial repetitive tasks, the transformational leader enjoys giving followers occupational tasks that will stimulate their interest and will allow innovation in the organization (Khanin, 2007). Through a renewed interest in the follower, the organization is reinvigorated with novel new ideas and approaches.

In transformational theory, followers are at the heart of the organization. Unlike the transactional nature of rewards and punishment associated with a transactional leader, the transformational leader inspires followers to imagine and act on a new social reality (Lodewijk van Oord, 2013). At the heart of this change is the follower. Transactional leaders spend individualized time with followers. They attend and nurture their progression in the organization (Ronald, 2014).

This study used transformational theory as a means of understanding the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals. Because school leaders in this capacity must rapidly change various aspects of schooling – from monolingual to bilingual, this study will seek to understand whether their lived experience is congruent with transformational leadership qualities. As a result of understanding the leadership style of current and former Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders, future school leaders may begin to understand the leadership qualities and necessities needed for a dual immersion program structure.

My study utilized and furthered the transformational learning theory. Research into dual immersion schools has been limited and fairly recent. Research dealing with leadership and dual immersion is even more scarce. My study added to the area of educational leadership as it pertains to Spanish elementary dual immersion schools and furthered the applicability of transformational leadership. My study answered whether Spanish dual immersion school principals use the four aspects of transformational leadership as they lead.

### **Theory of Second Language Acquisition and Hypothesis**

Language is how humans communicate and socialize with others (Yules, 2006). The mid-1900s began an understanding and conceptualization of how language is acquired (Chomsky, 1986; Cummins, 2000; Krashen, 1982; Skinner, 1945). Several academics theorized the way young children acquire language communication. Some of the language theories include: Verbal Behavior (Abramson, 2013; Ediger, 2012; Goddard, 2012; Onghena, & Colpin, 2016; Skinner, 1945; Spilt, Leflot, Johnson, Kohler, & Ross, 2016; Suarez de Puga, 2013;), Universal Grammar Theory (Chomsky, 1986; Lin, 2017; Tomasello, 2009; Nair, 2015), Theory of Second Language Acquisition (Krashen, 1982) and Interdependence Hypothesis (Cummins, 2000). Dual immersion programs rely on second language theories as a means of providing an instructional foundation in supporting students as they acquire a second language. For the purposes of understanding language acquisition, my study used Theory of Second Language Acquisition and Interdependence Hypothesis.

### **Theory of Second Language Acquisition**

In 1982, Stephen Krashen wrote his influential work entitled *Principles and Practice in Second Language Acquisition*. The book established a language acquisition theory that continues to be commonly used in the pedagogical framework for second language instruction

(Ghaderi & Nikou, 2016; Payne, 2011). The theory consists of five underlining principles (Hsiao, Yu-Ju, Chia-Ling, & Ping, 2017). The five principles are: The Acquisition/Learning Hypothesis, Natural Order Hypothesis, Affective Filter Hypothesis, Monitor Hypothesis and Input Hypothesis (Hsiao, Yu-Ju, Chia-Ling, & Ping, 2017).

Krashen (1982) made a distinction between acquisition and learning. Language acquisition is what children do as they grow. They subconsciously assimilate the language they hear (Saville-Troike & Barto, 2017). In this subconscious learning, children acquire language without formal instruction. Through normal day to day interaction, children become familiar with the arrangement of words to communicate thought (Yim, Rudoy, Oetting, & Gillam, 2013). In contrast, learning a language involves formal conscious schooling. Students learn the language through grammar lessons. Students are formally and explicitly taught the grammar rules and structure of the language (Zhongganggao, 2001). Krashen (1982) believed language acquisition led to greater language internalization.

The Natural Order hypothesis is the idea that language is learned through an incremental order (Krashen, 1982). Simple language characteristics are learned first followed by more complex language morphemes and structures (Goldschneider, & DeKeyser, 2005). Complex language usage, such as writing, can be difficult for second language learners (Sağlamel & Kayaoğlu, 2015).

A students' language acquisition is influenced by their affective state (Joy, 2013). Krashen's (1982) Affective Filter Hypothesis described language learning to be aided or hampered by students' anxiety level in class. According to the theory, "Learning efficiency would be reduced when fear, anxiety, and other negative emotions appear, whereas positive emotions enhance learning outcomes (Lin, Chao, & Huang, 2015, p. 728)." Consequently, the

goal of the language instructor is to create an environment where students' anxiety levels are diminished (Soleimanirad & Shangarffam, 2016). The more students are made to feel comfortable even during exams (Joy, 2013; Soleimanirad & Shangarffam, 2016), the more students are likely to do well in using the target language. When instructors allowed students to support, encourage, and admire each other, better performances were achieved during examinations (Soleimanirad & Shangarffam, 2016).

One principal idea of second language acquisition is making language comprehensible (Saville-Troike & Barto, 2017). As theorized by Krashen (1982), children acquire language naturally by making associations between spoken words and tangible ideas. Thus, the aim of a second language instructor is to provide students with comprehensible input. This may include teaching lessons enriched with authentic contexts (Hsiao, Yu-Ju, Chia-Ling, & Ping, 2017).

Krashen called this idea the Input Hypothesis.

The Input Hypothesis stated language input must be comprehensible to second language student learners. In his theory, Krashen (1982) stipulated the idea of  $i+1$ . Language instruction needs to be within the students' language comprehension level in the target language but must also be intellectually stimulating so that new language learning can continue (Buri, 2011). Thus, the input must be neither too difficult nor too easy to understand (Liu, 2013). Instructors aim to make the language of instruction understandable and challenging at the same time. To this end, second language instructors use repetition, translation, visual aids, paraphrase, circumlocution, code switching, etc. (Buri, 2011). These teaching strategies and questioning techniques aid students to comprehend new content language.

## **Interdependence Hypothesis**

The Interdependence Hypothesis proposed by Jim Cummins (1979, 1990, 2000) theorized language acquisition has various levels of transferability between languages. The hypothesis has three individualized facets. Together, these facets, accumulate to make the claim of interdependence. The three facets of the hypothesis include BICS, CALP, and language transfer (Cummins, 2007; DelliCarpini, 2008; Khatib & Taie, 2016).

Cummins (1979) theorized second language learners experience different degrees of language learning. As second language learners acquire the target language, they can speak the social-communicative language. Cummins (1979a) referred to this type of language as BICS, Basic Interpersonal Communicative Skills. Interlocution production at this level requires language learners to use social conversational vocabulary to communicate with peers (Khatib & Taie, 2016). Often, language learners can start BICS speech patterns within a period of 2 years (Cummins, 1981; DelliCarpini, 2008; Huguet-Canalís, 2009). Although language learners can effectively communicate within normal social situations, they nonetheless have language deficits that are not fully expressed (Lorenzo & Rodríguez, 2014). Often, teachers have difficulty understanding the level of language proficiency of ELL students (Abedi, 2006; Bunten, & Hinchey, 2014; Kim, Erikson,).

Unlike BICS, Cognitive Academic Language Proficiency or CALP is language containing content-specific academic language (Lorenzo & Rodríguez, 2014). Instead of being socially applicable and generalizable, CALP is language found in academic subject areas. These comprise of words, definitions, and content suitable to different academic areas. Such as words relating to math, science, and history. Each content area contains specific content or jargon specific vocabulary (Lorenzo & Rodríguez, 2014).



Cummins believes language learning is interdependent and transferrable. He believes knowledge learned in the first language (L1) would transfer to the second language (L2) (Cummins, 1979b; Khatib & Taie, 2016). Thus, if language learners were competent in their first language, they would eventually use their prior knowledge to gain the same proficiency in the second language. Language learners who had a strong foundation in their mother tongue could use their skills in that language to acquire the second language (Cummins, 1979b; Khatib & Taie, 2016).

This research study was guided and used second language acquisition and interdependence hypothesis. Because Spanish dual immersion schools base their instructional language lessons based on these two current language theories, this researcher has deemed them as a "best fit" (Soltero, 2016). History provides a foundational basis for language learning throughout the world. The following sections provide further elucidation as to the nature of language and schooling and the formation of dual immersion as a curricular program option.

### **Related Literature**

One discerning human characteristic is the ability to use verbal communication. The spoken words, phrases, and sentences transmit contextual meaning that enables intelligible interaction. The ability to articulate is what distinguishes people from animals (Yule, 2006). After birth, human children are involved in several stages that lead them to fluidity in verbal communication. These stages include cooing and babbling (nonsense sounds made by a baby), one- word stage (use of one word to convey meaning), two-word stage (combination of two words), telegraphic speech (using a string of words), developing morphology (the use of inflectional morphemes to convey tense and plurality), developing syntax (forming questions and forming negatives), and developing semantics (understanding word meaning) (Yule, 2006).

These stages lead children to develop complex communication to express their thoughts, wants and needs, and establish social relationships (Yule, 2006). Similarly, children who do not develop clear communication skills may have an inability to form friendships, have increased isolation, and impaired relationships (Hattier & Matson, 2012).

Historically, effective communication has been important. Early civilizations understood the necessity of educating their posterity to produce eloquent prose. As early as the Homeric age (800-450 BC) educational philosophers aimed to educate its citizens with the goal of developing capable rational articulate participants in the political process (Too, 2001). These early civilizations held a strong belief that education would produce capable contributing citizens who would edify their existing form of governance (Too, 2001).

As civilizations merged through conquest or treaties, intercommunication between people became a necessity (Turan, 2011). It was not uncommon for the wealthy upper-class elite to seek bilingual instruction. In Greece, elite students' educational training involved the teaching of more than one language (Too, 2001). In early 160s BC, Roman parents supplemented their children's Latin instruction by soliciting or hiring Greek tutors (Too, 2001). In the first decade of the first century BC, schools offered rhetorical practice in both Greek and Latin (Too, 2001). Early educational practices pointed to a willingness and realization of benefits toward bilingualism.

Modern Europe continues the tradition of bilingual instruction (Relji, Ferring, & Martin, 2014). In Europe, the need for language learning has been promoted because of the geographical proximity of many nation-states speaking different languages (Mejia, 2002). A special relationship exists between Sweden and Finland based on proximity and tradition (Vincze & Henning-Lindblom, 2016). In 1917 Finland was declared a bilingual nation with the use of

Swedish and Finnish (Mejia, 2002). Countries throughout Europe have found a need to communicate in a language other than their mother tongue. Their economic interconnectedness requires individuals who are capable of understanding and initiating communication with persons within the same continent (*Europeans and their language*, 2012). The English and German languages are commonly used throughout Europe for business importance (Mejia, 2002). Belgium is an interesting country. It is the only country in Europe where French, Flemish, and German are the official languages (Bollen & Baten, 2010). An open attitude towards language learning has been evident in Europe through necessity (Mejia, 2002).

Dual language instruction is not limited to the European continent. Rather, many world nations have found language learning valuable in today's global business market (Kankaanranta & Louhiala-Salminen, 2010; Peters, 2014). In the western regions of Africa, there are about 20 spoken national languages. Most of these languages are used for communication and trade between areas (Hovens, 2002). Parts of Africa have used bilingual instruction to teach English and French (Kuchah, 2016). In the upper north part of Africa, the country of Morocco contains a deep-rooted history with France. The French protectorate nature over Morocco developed a close intricate bond that allowed a fusion of the two cultures (Mejia, 2002). A similar case exists in Eastern Africa. As a result of British colonial rule of Tanzania, English and Kiswahili are the official languages of the region (Mejia, 2002).

Similarly, the colonial conquest of Hong Kong by the British created a need to communicate in both Chinese and English. Citizens of Hong Kong have developed a duality nature to their use of both languages, preferring to speak Chinese at home and using English at work (Mejia, 2002; Sung, 2013). Even though Japan has had a natural tendency to "one culture-one language," contemporary Japan has also embraced the use of English (Mejia, 2002;

Friedman, 2015).

Colonization of the New World brought language diversity. Brazil was originally colonized by Portugal but also heavily visited by other peoples from Russia, the United States, and Africa. As a result, Brazil operates under the national language Portuguese but requires the instruction of a second language as early as 5<sup>th</sup> grade (Mejia, 2002). English has been a popular second language because Brazilians perceive English language proficiency as a catalyst for opening doors to social mobility and privileged status (Fortes, 2015). The same can be said true of other countries in Latin America. Reincarnations of different bilingual programs have been in Latin America for a period of 50 years (Catter, 2011). Countries such as Argentina, Colombia, Panama, Chile, and Mexico offer second language instruction in English with belief that the language will earn them an advantage over other children who can only speak Spanish (Mejia, 2002).

From early civilizations till today, second language learning has been part of the educational tutelage for youth all over the world. There is an old Spanish saying, “El que habla dos lenguajes vale por dos.” This translates to, “A person who is able to speak two languages is as valuable as two persons.” History and current times have demonstrated evidence for this statement. Parents enroll students in bilingual programs because a second language allows them to access communication with others they could not have otherwise. By speaking two languages, a student may be able to access future ventures in business, education, and recreation (Lopez, 2013).

### **Bilingual Instruction in the United States**

After the American Revolution, the founding young country was in educational disarray. Schools in the new world were few and the nature of schooling was debated (Zuckerman, 2012).

Different educational philosophers espoused their beliefs about the nature of education in the new world (Gutek, 2001). Education philosophers such as Rousseau envisioned a child-centered approach (Zuckerman, 2012). Others, like Horace Mann, envisioned a system based on the best educational models of Europe (Brickman, 2010). Despite these ideals, the reality was that education was a hotchpotch of educational movements, focused on strict discipline, and fairly localized (Zuckerman, 2012). Settlers established their own local schools. Often, these schools did not teach in English. Rather, the local communities decided the language of instruction. Immigrant groups primarily comprising of German, French, and Holland groups formed schools where they taught in their mother tongues with English being taught as a second language (Peleato, 2011). Thus, some immigrants established schools using the language of their mother country (Iancu, 2016). In the states of Ohio and Pennsylvania, where large populations of German immigrants settled, a large network of German schools was established (Del Valle, 2003). The large influx of immigrants from all over Europe influenced political discourse. In fact, Thomas Jefferson became worried that immigrants would threaten the nation into becoming a heterogeneous, incoherent, and distracted mass (Zuckerman, 2012). Consequently, a governmental aim was devised to establish education based on the English language with the purpose of solidifying the concept of American democracy and homogenizing society as a whole. Governmental efforts restricted the instruction of children to one language (Zuckerman, 2012).

Large immigrant waves at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century created a resurgence of nationalism by the populace and a staunch belief in one language instruction. The U.S. population feared the new immigrants' language would be a threat to national unity. They feared immigrant groups would not assimilate with the American way of life. Rather, they believed

these immigrant groups would cluster around their own culture and language. Governmental funds were diverted from bilingual public and private schools. Bilingual schools disappeared, and foreign language books were burned (Peleato, 2011).

World War I and World War II brought a wave of xenophobia throughout the United States. People exhibited hostile attitude towards immigrant community groups and the speaking of foreign languages. This was especially true with German immigrants. In 1923, the case of *Meyer v. Nebraska* highlighted the tensions that existed. Nebraska passed a law prohibiting the use of foreign language instruction in schools. A school teacher was prosecuted under the law when she used the German language to relate a bible story for a student in her class. The case found its way to the Supreme Court where the court ruled in favor of the school teacher. It found that no discrimination can occur based on linguistic differences (Peleato, 2011).

English language tutelage was the norm for most communities through the early 1900s. Although the instruction was strictly in English, many minority children who had an English language deficit found it very difficult to succeed in school (Peleato, 2011). In the state of California, nearly 50% of Mexican American students dropped out of school by the 8<sup>th</sup> grade (Petrzela, 2010). Despite these troublesome statistics, some state governments passed legislation limiting their ability to teach languages other than English (Imber & Van Geel, 2000).

Take for instance the case of *Meyers v. Nebraska*. In 1919, the state of Nebraska passed the Siman Act which prohibited the tutelage of foreign languages to youth prior to 8<sup>th</sup> grade (Imber & Van Geel, 2000). Roman Catholic and Lutheran German parochial schools mounted a defense against the act. Using the 14<sup>th</sup> Amendment, they argued that the enactment of the new law denied their freedom of liberty. In 1923, the case went forth to the Supreme Court. The

court ruled that states may not pass laws that attempt to prevent communities from offering private language classes outside of the regular school system (Imber & Van Geel, 2000).

In *Farrington v. Tokushige*, the Supreme Court struck down “Foreign Language School Act of the Territory of Hawaii” (Del Valle, 2003). The legislation aimed to bring 163 foreign language schools under control of the state. In its argument, the court stressed that such action would destroy the foreign language schools. In the midst of World War II, anti-foreign sentiments prevailed. Once again, the state government of Hawaii enacted what was called the “Act regulating the Teaching of Foreign Languages to Children.” The act aimed to prohibit language instruction during after-school hours. The Supreme Court ruled against the “Act regulating the Teaching of Foreign Languages to Children,” which prohibited the instruction of foreign languages in Hawaii (Del Valle, 2003, p.44).

Not all states passed similar measures, states with large immigrant populations, did continue to offer bilingual educational services to their minority populations. Places like Nebraska, California, New Mexico, Hawaii, and others provided language instruction in a language other than English (Del Valle, 2003). Several school districts experimented with bilingual education (Petrzela, 2010).

The 1960s and the Civil Rights Movement gave way to a resurgence of bilingual language instruction in the United States (Peleato, 2011). In the state of Tucson, three influential Mexican American educators, Adalberto Guerrero, María Urquides, Henry ‘Hank’ Oyama, served as catalysts to introduce a four-year honors program in Spanish language instruction that would later serve as a national model for bilingual education. Infused with cultural education, Mexican American students who enrolled in the courses, were able to develop “a positive self-image that translated into better performance in their other classes” (Trinidad, 2015, p. 317).

Because of its innovative program, the high school received national acclaim as a ‘Pacemaker School.’ This eventually influenced the passage of Title VII of the 1965 Elementary and Secondary Education Act which is known as the Bilingual American Education Act (BEA) (Trinidad, 2015).

The Civil Rights Movement led to legislation which addressed the need to educate children who were not proficient in English (Peleato, 2011; Petrzela, 2010). With the enactment of the BEA, the federal program promoted program development at the local district level (Trinidad, 2015). At the same time, existing programs saw the new federal oversight as burdensome (Trinidad, 2015). Although a federal mandate existed, the BEA did not provide specifics for implementing Bilingual programs (Trinidad, 2015). This led to experimentation by various school districts and states. Academics in the field of linguistic framed their hypothesis for bilingual learning (Skinner, 1945; Chomsky, 1986; Krashen, 1982; Cummins, 2000). These theoretical frameworks serve practical school applications (Almaguer & Esquierdo, 2016).

Latino/a students are an increasing minority group in the United States (National Center for Education Statistics, 2016). Throughout the country, school districts that once had homogeneous student populations are being demographically transformed into heterogeneous learning environments. Whereas prior immigrant populations would immigrate to traditionally receiving states such as California or New York, the new immigration has shifted to Midwestern or Southeastern states (Hopkins, Lowenhaupt, & Sweet, 2015). School districts throughout the nation are struggling to develop systems to handle the growing culturally and linguistically diversity (Hopkins, et al., 2015). Many of these sites were and are witnessing an increase of Latino/a student populations (Rocha & Matsubayashi, 2012). Although some believe cultural diversity adds to the breath to society, the increasing diversity poses educational challenges to



schools of today (Coronel & Gómez-Hurtado, 2014). Some of these challenges include acceptance, assimilation, tolerance, language acquisition, differentiation, motivation, etc. (Stuft & Brogadié, 2011). Federal programs such as No Child Left Behind aimed to ensure all children, regardless of position, race, or disability were able to reach yearly academic progress (Lauen & Gaddis, 2012). Through these endeavors, school districts performed mandatory year-end testing. Results from these tests showed an alarming trend for minority students. Students from diverse backgrounds or minority students often performed well below white students (Lauen & Gaddis, 2012). The testing disparity has catapulted some in the educational community to propose different educational solutions to ameliorate the problem (García, Woodley, Flores, & Chu, 2012; Leon et al., 2011; Madrid, 2011).

A tenet to educational progression is language (Spit, Koomen, & Harrison, 2015). Culturally diverse students often matriculate in the educational setting with English language deficiencies (Hammer, Jia, & Uchikoshi, 2011; Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Sonnenschein, Metzger, Dowling, & Baker, 2016). Students' English language deficiencies stem from a myriad of causes (Boyce, Gillam, Innocenti, Cook, & Ortiz, 2013; Lindholm-Leary, 2001). School sites make early attempts to identify and designate students as English Language Learners (Carroll & Bailey, 2015; Lindholm-Leary, 2001). Incoming matriculated students are asked to state the language being spoken at home. Students who speak another language other than English are designated as English Language Learners. Students who have been designated as ELL has increased by 53% within a 10-year span (Gottfried, 2014). As English language learners (ELL) struggle to make sense of a foreign language, dominant English speakers matriculate in school with the verbal communication skills needed to understand and function in the curricular setting. Early on, students with limited English skills experience inabilities to understand instruction

being espoused in schools (Leon et al., 2011). The lack of understanding at the onset of enrollment may contribute to a knowledge gap. In this way, an achievement gap is created between English language learners and dominant English speakers (Madrid, 2011). While ELL students may seem to learn the language quickly, this is only superficial. Students who do not possess the academic language capacities find it difficult to do well in school (Lindholm-Leary, 2001), let alone answer questions on standardized tests. As ELL students encounter unknown vocabulary or foreign cultural terms during assessments, their interpretations of such questions may lead to incorrect answers (Noble, Rosebery, Suarez, Warren, & O'Connor, 2014; Solano-Flores, 2014).

Although increasing test scores in minority populations are important, what is more, important is the inability of these student populations to increase their opportunity for higher learning. Minority students are less likely to matriculate to higher learning institutions (Cortez-Covarrubias, 2015). As more and more employers seek college diplomas, minority students risk economic stagnation. Thus, certain school districts have experimented with providing differing educational models targeting language as a means of ensuring academic progression (Li, et al., 2016).

Different curricular language models have been utilized in the past and present to ameliorate the problem of English language deficiency (Cummins, 2000; Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Yoon, Hutchison, & Winsler, 2015). Language models include English immersion, sheltered English immersion, bilingual, and dual immersion programs (Cummins, 2000; Lindholm-Leary, 2001; Yoon, Hutchison, & Winsler, 2015). The degree to which these programs have been effective in remediating minority students' English language deficiencies have been subject to debate (Pregot, 2013).

One of the most promising educational program structures has been dual immersion (Lindholm-Leary & Block, 2010; Steele, et al., 2015). In dual immersion programs, English Language Learners and English dominant students are integrated together. Within this interaction, students learn each other's language and culture (Ovando & Collier, 2003). Students who are learning English benefit from the social-communicative interaction they share with their English dominant peers, and interchangeably, English dominant peers learn a second language (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016).

Dual immersion programs teach instruction through the use of two languages. Instruction is divided between English and the target language. The target language being the language spoken by minority language students. In these programs, the target language is used significantly. Instruction of English and the target language are not mixed. Languages are taught separately by clear segmentations in class schedule or by separate classrooms where instructors use one language and not the other. The use of translation in either language is discouraged. Students are required to use English in English time or class. The same reality holds true for the target language. The idea is for minority language students to have access to the educational curricula using the students' native tongue for a segment of the school day. By teaching in two languages, students receive access to the curriculum via their native language and at the same time learn English. Native English speakers learn a new language in the process (Lindholm-Leary, 2001).

Dual immersion programs have three main encompassing goals. These goals include: developing high levels of language proficiency and literacy in two languages, demonstrating a high level of student achievement, and developing an understanding and appreciation for diverse cultures (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016). Several studies have demonstrated that, on

average, students who were enrolled in dual immersion programs after five years performed at or above grade level equivalency on standardized tests (Lindholm-Leary & Block, 2010; Steele et al., 2015). This seems to suggest that dual language programs may prove to be a way in which minority students can reduce achievement gaps due to language deficiencies (Lindholm-Leary & Hernández, 2011). Consistent with this notion, schools that have implemented dual language programs have noticed consistent academic gains.

### **Background History of Dual Immersion**

Increasing immigration from Mexico and Latin America increased greatly during the 70s', 80's, and 90's (Rocha & Matsubayashi, 2012; Hopkins, Lowenhaupt, & Sweet, 2015). Immigrant students with limited or no English skills matriculated into schools. The drastic demographic shift in some communities made it difficult for teachers and administrators to best educate these newly arrived students. Limited English Proficient (students demonstrating or no production in English) students were placed in classrooms where English was the sole language of instruction. Students spent time in classes where they understood very little of what was going on. As a result, LEP students academically lagged behind their English dominant peers. This led students to be improperly referred to Special Education by teachers. I.Q tests administered to the students showed these students to be below the necessary I. Q. score of 80 and hence were placed in Special Education course work (Petrezla, 2010).

In the 1990s bilingual education became a politically heated debate. Politicians in various states wanted to institute legislation to thwart bilingual education from public schools (Escamilla, Shannon, Carlos, & García, 2003). Politicians, such as Ron Unz, reasoned that students who were not being taught in English were being deprived of learning the language (De Jong, Gort, & Cobb, 2005; Escamilla et al., 2003). Some Latino parents agreed with their ideas

(Escamilla et al., 2003). Numerous propositions were placed in state ballots (Flores & Murillo Jr., 2001). The proposed legislations included proposition 227 in California, proposition 203 in Arizona, and other English- only proposals in other states (De Jonget al., 2005; Flores & Murillo Jr., 2001). Voters could decide educational issues in which they had very little knowledge over. This led to the passage of some of the propositions. Students in California and Arizona were forced into English only classrooms. A national debate about bilingualism was raised (Escamilla et al., 2003). Since there are many different models in which a Bilingual program could be implemented, the discussion evolved around which models are the most effective (Steele, et al., 2015).

### **Subtractive and Additive Bilingual Program Models**

The implementation of bilingual programs has been varied and continues to vary from state to state, school district to school district, and school to school (Soltero, 2016). Different types of bilingual programs were developed (Cloud, Genesee, & Hamayan, 2000). Bilingual instruction includes subtractive and additive models of instruction (Soltero, 2016).

Subtractive bilingual education programs aim to provide ELL an early exit from foreign language instruction and quickly transition students into English classes (Kijoo & Goldenberg, 2015). This type of bilingual model is often referred to as *early exit*. In this model, bi-literacy in two languages is not the goal. Instead, the purpose is to develop students who are literate only in English. The result is Latino/a students who may have started out with Spanish instruction in the early grades of Kinder and first grade but steadfastly transitioned into all English instruction in second. This resulted in students who did not receive sufficient L1 instruction to be literate in their mother tongue (Kijoo & Goldenberg, 2015).

Another form of subtractive bilingual education is *English Immersion*. In this bilingual program structure, ELL students are placed in classes with all English language instruction. Teachers use sheltered language and scaffolds to help ELL students understand the concepts being presented. Students who have very little English language skills find it difficult to learn until they begin to grasp some English (Jost, 2009).

Subtractive models of bilingual education also include English as a second language (ESL) (Soltero, 2016). ESL classes can take on a variety of forms. Differences are dependent upon the structural needs of the local site or district. Some ESL classes are taught as a push-in basis. ESL instructors visit classrooms and work with ELL students inside the class setting. Some ESL classes are conducted using a pull-out basis (Lihong, 2016). Students leave the classroom and report to a designated site on campus where students receive ESL instruction. In any form, ESL classes involve an instructor who promotes English language learning by using targeted lessons based on students' English language proficiency. Instruction usually lasts between 45 minutes to one 1 hour of the regular school day (Lihong, 2016).

In contrast to subtractive bilingual language models, additive versions promote three encompassing goals (Soltero, 2016). Additive bilingual models promote bi-literacy in English and in another language, cross-cultural competency, and academic achievement (Soltero, 2016). Additive bilingual language models promote the growth of the students' culture and primary language (Soltero, 2016). In the case of Latino/a ELL students, students are allowed and expected to keep learning Spanish and to be knowledgeable of their cultural heritage and traditions (Flores, 2016).

## Dual Immersion Variations

Dual immersion is an additive bilingual program model that aims to achieve the three encompassing goals of bi-literacy, cross-cultural competency, and academic achievement. In dual immersion programs, students are taught in English and a foreign language. Different forms of dual immersion program structures exist. Dual immersion programs vary on three criteria. These criteria include School implementation scope, language allocation, and student language population (Soltero, 2016).

Dual immersion programs can be implemented with a strand or school-wide model. In a strand model, the dual immersion program is not implemented school-wide. In a dual immersion strand model school, two curricular program models exist. Parents are provided with the option of matriculating their children into the dual immersion program or another option given at the school site. Whereas two curricular programs exist, there are separate missions and visions depending on the program option. Strand models may face challenging aspects. Some of the challenging aspects maybe differing visions and missions, competition for school resources, competition among school staff, tracking and segregation, and student attrition (de Jong, E. J., & Bearse, 2014).

In contrast, school-wide dual immersion implementation involves the entire school focused on one curricular program (de Jong, Ester, & Bearse, 2011). Schools that implement school-wide dual immersion efforts commit to the school's complete resources to a singular program. Matriculating students are not provided with divergent curricular programs. Parents and students approach school with the understanding that instruction will be taught in two languages. In certain aspects, the administration of a school-wide implementation dual

immersion programs is easier because teachers, parents, and resources are not competing against each other (de Jong, Ester, & Bearnse, 2011).

Dual immersion programs vary upon language allocation. Two forms of language allocation exist. They include total immersion and partial immersion. In the total immersion program options, students are exposed to dual language instruction based on a 90-10 or 80-20 language ratio. For example, students who matriculated into a Spanish total immersion program begin their Kinder instruction in Spanish 90% of the school day with 10% English instruction. The same holds true for the 80-20 ratio, with 80% of the instruction in Spanish with 20% English instruction. As students graduate from grade level to grade level, the amount of foreign language instruction is lessened until fourth grade where the ratio between the foreign language and English are 50-50 (Soltero, 2016).

Partial immersion dual immersion program offerings have balanced language allocations throughout all grade levels. Instruction in a foreign language and English are set at a 50-50 language allocation ratio. Students who enroll in this program structure receive 50% of their instruction in Spanish and 50% of the instruction in English. Partial dual immersion schools incorporate team-teaching by employing foreign language and English language instructors or employ a bilingual teacher who can instruct in both languages. Team teachers share students as they transition between English and foreign language instruction. Team teachers are designated to teach a designated content area. Language allocations can be arranged daily or weekly. For example, students can have their morning instruction in English and the remaining part of the day in Spanish. Another option is to have a full day of instruction in one language and then alternate every other day (Palmer et al, 2015; Soltero, 2016).



Dual immersion program structures are influenced by the student population of the area. It is best to have student populations that reflect the language and culture of the program. Dual immersion programs can be two-way or one-way dual language programs. In a two-way model, student populations are evenly split. For example, in a Spanish dual immersion program, 50% of the students would be native Spanish speakers with a Latino/a cultural background and 50% native English speakers. An even mixture of student populations helps fulfill one of the missions of the program which is to have cross-cultural interactions. Although this is the ideal, it is rarely the case. In a one-way model, dominant language speakers are involved in learning a target language. An example of this is the majority of English dominant speakers learning Spanish or majority Spanish dominant students learning English (Maxwell, 2012).

### **Current Academic Discourse on Dual Immersion**

Although dual immersion programs have been in existence for about 60 years, it is only until now that there has been an explosion of schools that have been implementing dual immersion programs (Valdez, Freire, & Delavan, 2016). As more and more school districts implement dual immersion programs, there has been an interest in scholarly research of dual immersion schools. The current research of dual immersion schools center around school leadership, challenges facing dual immersion schools, and the benefits of dual immersion school programs.

Current research has delved into unique factors encountered by dual immersion school principals (Forman, 2016; Schabsky, 2013; Whitacre, 2015). The occupational requirements of a dual immersion principal are different than other school leaders. Principals of dual immersion schools formulate and prioritize issues that are central to cultural and bilingual groups (Schwabsky, 2013). Dual immersion principals also face unique non-routine problems that are

not encountered at other school sites (Schwabsky, 2013). Whitacre (2015) explored the factors to the implementation of dual language programs as 13 schools shifted from a monolingual to bilingual program structures. The study found that a disconnect existed between the central district office and principals implementing dual immersion programs. Principals perceived the role of the central district crucial for implementation guidance. However, the central office was slow to act in professional and management development. Principals did not feel adequately prepared to make the language shift.

The language shift may be difficult for some principals to implement, but the process may create a powerful change dynamic. Ascenzi-Moreno et al. (2015) found that translanguaging (the process of shifting from monolingual to bilingual) as producing structural shifts in language policy, ideological shift about language learning, change of theories of language policy, and collaborative leadership structures. Structural shifts included allowing children to speak in their native tongue, bilingual signage, bilingual home-communication, and allowing children to access and test curricula using students' native language. Aside from the structural shifts, stakeholders changed their thinking about language learning from a deficit model to a contributing model. This means stakeholders underwent a mental shift believing language was beneficial instead of detrimental. Along with this mental shift, administrators and staff changed their attitudes toward theories of language. Researchers also noticed that school administrators modified their leadership method from hierarchical to that of delegation and collaboration (Ascenzi-Moreno et al., 2015).

The maintenance of dual immersion programs is in constant flux (Menken & Solorza, 2015). Although dual immersion programs have been effective in the reduction of the achievement gap in ELL students, they nonetheless, are subject to disintegration. The current

literature explored the leadership themes and the forces that help maintain or evanesce the implementation of dual immersion programs (Menken & Solorza, 2015). Researchers compared school leaders who were willing to maintain bilingual programs to school leaders who decided to eliminate them (Menken & Solorza, 2015). The study found two reasons why school principals had decided to eliminate bilingual programs. These included pressures to perform well on standardized English examinations and a lack of sufficient knowledge and training in bilingualism (Menken & Solorza, 2015). These results are similar to the pressures faced by teachers who are tasked with dual immersion task fidelity (Palmer et al, 2015).

Central to the maintenance of dual immersion programs is effective school leadership (Hunt, 2011). Successful dual immersion schools were allowed to be successfully sustained because school leaders observed four leadership structures. These four structures were: mission, collaborative and shared leadership, flexibility, and trust. School stakeholders were focused on the mission of developing cultural and bi-literate students. Principals allowed shared leadership among teachers. Teachers were allowed to give input and become departmental heads. Principals demonstrated trust and faith in their faculty to achieve the curricular mission. Similarly, teachers had trust that following the bilingual model would articulate into future assessment results. The school had the flexibility to adjust when needed to suit the needs of children. “Collectively, these four leadership structures are used to ensure that these programs endure and are able to build from their collective commitment to providing bilingual education that emphasizes academic rigor and multicultural understandings” (Hunt, 2011, p. 188).

One of the aims of dual immersion programs is to develop cultural acceptance and awareness (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016). Despite the goal, Hickman & Garcia (2014) found some dual immersion school principals favored student achievement over culture. Instead

of using students' cultural strengths to aid academic progression, the component of culture was diminished. In the principals' mind, academics trumped culture (Hickman & Garcia, 2014).

Current research has focused on dual immersion program challenges. Palmer et al. (2015) found teachers who were willing to dismantle their grade level implementation of dual immersion. Teachers implemented a 50/50 dual immersion model with fidelity within the beginning of the school year. As district benchmarks demonstrated limited growth, the instructors lost program fidelity reverting to a mainstream English instruction. Similarly, Forman (2016) studied the beginning implementation of a dual immersion program. The study found contradictions in program fidelity and self-interest. At the beginning stages of dual immersion program implementation, school staff members seemed interested in supporting program fidelity. However, staff had conflicting thoughts about program implementation as they weighed their own self-interest. The primary concern was job security. Program implementation required some staff reassignments because some teachers would not be able to lend their instructional services to support an operational dual language program.

Principals who led dual immersion programs faced non-routine problems (Schwabsky, 2013). The non-routine problems included: Problems of interpersonal communication, curriculum development, and teachers' work practices, organizational and administrative problems, teaching and learning, and divergent interpretations of social and cultural norms. Intercommunication problems existed between English teachers and target language instructors. Target language teachers found it difficult to find teaching materials and curricula, had the task of creating materials in the target language and felt they worked harder than their English counterparts. Organizational problems existed in the hiring and evaluating and hiring of teachers, selecting and retaining a student body, managing budgets, and managing different

program structures in strand model schools. Cultural and socio-economic differences caused problems between English and target language instructors.

Current educational research has also delved into the benefits of dual immersion schools (Ascenzi-Moreno et al., 2015; Esposito & Baker-Ward, 2013; López, 2013; Steele, et al., 2015). Lopez (2013) conducted a study to ascertain the reasons parents enroll their children in dual immersion schools. Mothers of English first language students enrolled them in Spanish dual immersion school because they believed these programs would give their children broader educational opportunities, increased communication, and cognitive benefits. On the other hand, mothers of Spanish first students tended to view the economic benefit, cultural heritage maintenance, and the ability to communicate with extended family members as reasons to enroll their children in the program.

Positive results have been reached by students who are enrolled in dual immersion programs. Dual immersion students perform at or above the performance of their English counterparts by 5<sup>th</sup> grade. In their casual comparative study, researchers used a randomly assigned sample and measured the summative state accountability tests in the areas of language arts, math, and science. The comparative study found that students in the dual immersion program outperformed students in general English instruction. The study found no statistical difference in the areas of math and science (Steele, et al., 2015).

Esposito and Baker-Ward (2013) found a positive relationship between dual immersion and higher executive function. Using the Sun/Moon task performance, the researchers found no performance difference between dual language students and traditional students solely taught in English in kindergarten. However, differences were observed in grades 2<sup>nd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> grade.

Students exposed to the dual language program performed much faster in trail making tasks associated with executive functions.

Latino/a students are a population that has been not cared for and overlooked (Bertocchi, 2015). Several studies have looked at the way dual immersion school programs provide social justice for Latino/a students. Garza (2015) found that dual immersion programs were able to shift teacher perceptions of students from low socioeconomic backgrounds. As teachers witnessed participation and knowledgeable insight from students in their home language, teachers shifted their perceived notions of student backgrounds.

Current research literature has described leadership implementation barriers of bilingual programs (Arroyo-Romano, 2016; DeNicolo, 2016; Lindholm- Leary, 2018). In schools where strand models exist, a reported feeling of division within the school existed. School leaders reported that the bilingual model was a “school within a school.” Physical separation of students, unfair distribution of students and resources, and differing opinions about bilingual education were reported as the main contributors of division (DeNicolo, 2016). Depending on the type of strand model created at the school site, bilingual children may be physically separated or isolated with other students who do not participate in the program. Teachers may feel resources, school rooms, and monies are diverted to sustain a bilingual strand. Teacher opinions differed about the effectiveness of bilingual education, the role they had in transitioning ELL students, and perceiving ELLs to be inferior (DeNicolo, 2016).

Other structural challenges have been reported. Linholm-Leary (2018) reported three structural dynamics necessitating further consideration. These dynamics include Time given to each language, accountability, and curricular challenges. In addition, bilingual Spanish teacher shortage and lack of Spanish language proficiency have been an ongoing challenge (Arroyo-

Romano, 2016). Higher educational institutions may not be producing candidates who can speak high academic Spanish. The low academic production in Spanish can have negative effects on students learning the target language (Arroyo-Romano, 2016).

### **Addressing Gaps in the Literature**

The implementation of dual immersion school programs has been on the rise (Center for Applied Linguistics, 2016; Valdez, Freire, & Delavan, 2016). Current academic research has been conglomerated into three segments: dual immersion school leadership (Forman, 2016; Schabsky, 2013; Whitacre, 2015), challenges facing dual immersion schools (Forman, 2016; Hickman & Garcia, 2014; Menken & Solarza, 2015), and benefits of dual immersion school programs (Ascenzi-Moreno, 2015; Esposito & Bakerward, 2015; Lopez, 2013; Steele, et al., 2015). Although research studies have analyzed the leadership traits of effective school leaders (Hunt, 2011), implementation of dual immersion programs (Whitacre, 2015), translanguaging in dual immersion schools (Ascenzi-Moreno et al., 2015), the effectiveness of dual immersion programs (Steele et al, 2015), the reasons mother's choose dual immersion programs (Lopez, 2013), positive results in executive brain functions (Esposito & Bakerward, 2015), conflicts in program fidelity and self-interest (Forman, 2016), placing academics as a priority (Hickman & Garcia, 2014), and maintenance of programs (Menken & Solarza, 2015), no study has been conducted to ascertain the essence of what it means to be a school leader administering a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. My study provided a rich description so as to understand what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal. This study added to the body of literature of dual immersion by focusing on the working lived experiences of Spanish dual immersion school principals.

Current research relies on an overabundance of qualitative case studies (Ascenzi-Moreno, Hesson, & Menken, 2015; DeMatthews & Izquierdo, 2016; Forman, 2016; Hickman & Garcia, 2014; Menken & Solorza, 2015; Steele et al., 2015). There is a need for another type of research design in the field of study. There exists a need for a hermeneutic phenomenological approach. Specifically, an approach to analyze the essence of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal.

### **Summary**

The literature review chapter provided a historical overview of the formulation of dual immersion programs. This included a history of language learning, a history of bilingual education, and the history of the formulation of dual immersion programs. A succinct discussion of relevant theoretical theories transpired. The theories of transformational leadership and Theory of Second Language Acquisition and Interdependence Hypothesis was utilized as a means of analyzing the subject of the lived experiences of dual immersion principals. In addition to illustrating theories, this chapter also delved into current research. The four explored topics of the current research were: educational leadership, challenges of dual immersion schools, benefits of dual immersion schools, and the intersection of race. Finally, this chapter discussed how this study addresses the gaps in the academic discourse. In specific, this study filled a gap in the literature by providing a rich thick description of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal.



## CHAPTER THREE: METHODS

### Overview

Phenomenology is the deep probing of people's lives to holistically understand what it is to be them (van Manen, 1997). It, therefore, attempts to understand the human experience (van Manen, 2014). It entails a systematic and rigorous approach to examine people's lived experiences (Creswell, 2003; Moustakas, 1994; van Manen, 1997). In its attempts, phenomenology seeks to understand our world through thoughtful participation of the world (van Manen, 1997). By being part of the world, we become better at understanding, what is it like to be human (van Manen, 1997). In the world of education, understanding the lived experiences of others, allows the educational practitioner to become a better educator (van Manen, 1997). Thus, with this in mind, my research delves into the lived experience of the participants and grasps the essence of being a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal.

Phenomenology is used to arrive at the essence of what it is like to be a school leader with the goal of educating students in Spanish and English. As a means of shedding light into this world, my research provides meaningful insight so other school leaders may learn from participants shared lived experiences. At the heart of this research is a firm belief that the lives of children, specifically English language learners, may benefit from school leadership that is built on the experiences of school administrators. Through the analysis of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals, future leaders may avoid pitfalls and build on strengths via the experiences of others.

This study probes the lives of Spanish dual immersion principals. In doing so, this chapter serves the function of exploring phenomenology as a research method. This chapter discusses the differences between quantitative and qualitative research designs. In the process, it

explicates the reasons why I selected the qualitative route as the best means of understanding the phenomenon.

This chapter begins by discussing what Hermeneutic phenomenology is and why it was selected for my research topic. As followed, the chapter lists the research questions guiding my study. It explicates the procedures that will be implemented. I interviewed 10 Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals in the southwestern section of the United States. Interviews, letters, and photo narratives were collected from participants. The data was collected and then analyzed to create a description and interpretable findings.

The chapter describes the analysis undertaken as part of this hermeneutic phenomenological research. It details the method by which themes were generated from the collected data. As well, this chapter covered the means by which my research maintains trustworthiness, credibility, dependability, and confirmability. Additionally, I discuss transferability and ethical considerations as they relate to my study.

### **Design**

Pedagogical research, in its efforts, offers a means to arrive at educational truths (van Manen, 2014). Some elements of the pedagogical realm may be explicated with quantitative or qualitative means (Creswell, 2003; Moustakas, 1994; van Manen, 1997, van Manen, 2014). The procedural, rational, and systematic means can, at times, bring light into an educational topic (van Manen, 2014). However, some topics are better explored through the use of qualitative means (van Manen, 2014). By definition, education is a social phenomenon (van Manen,1993). The daily learning interaction is a social co-construction between pedagogue and learner. Through this social interaction, learning exists. In this endeavor, I harkened to the belief that human interaction is unpredictable, unique, and at times, not rational. While some elements of

pedagogy may be better analyzed through experimentation, other topics are best met through social interaction (van Manen, 1997).

Phenomenology is the study of people's lived experiences (Creswell, 2013; van Manen, 1997, van Manen, 2014). Experiences in life are memorable moments (van Manen, 1997). The interactions humans have with objects, situations, and social interaction shape their worldview (van, Manen, 1997). These interactions define their perspective, guide their actions, and explicate their "place" in the world. Unlike quantitative statistical research, phenomenology does not seek to gather generalities (van Manen, 1997). Whereas qualitative research attempts to encounter findings that may be applied and generalized to similar educational situations, qualitative research instead aims to find meaning in the experience of study. Instead, its aim is to elucidate the human experience - to understand what individuals with varied lived experiences share as a common attribute of the phenomenon. Van Manen (1997) explained the difference between qualitative and quantitative research as,

Thus, at the risk of oversimplification one might say that the difference between natural science and human science reside in what it studies: natural science studies "objects of nature," "things," "natural events," and "the way that objects behave." Human science, in contrast, studies "persons," or beings that have "consciousness" and that "act purposefully" in and on the world by creating objects of "meaning" that are "expressions" of how human beings exist in the world. (p. 21).

The phenomenon in this study was lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. Thus, this study sought a deep insight into what it means to be living as an educational leader of this specific program offering and developed a rich deep understanding of

the phenomenon (Heidegger, 1972; Husserl, 1973; Moustakas, 1994; van Manen, 1997; van Manen, 2014).

A qualitative methodology was preferred for the purposes of this study. In this study, the aim was to arrive at the essence of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal. Arriving at a deep understanding requires in-depth questioning, thoughtful interaction, and well thought out analysis (van Manen, 2014). As a research method, the phenomenological approach incorporates the means by which human science can occur (van Manen, 1997). For these explications, phenomenology was the preferred method.

Two major branches exist as phenomenological research is concerned. The first branch is attributed to the founder of phenomenology, Edmund Husserl (1973), who advocated the use of transcendental phenomenology. This form of phenomenology consists of providing a complete rich description of the phenomenon. Here the researchers must bracket themselves from the subject of study (Moustakas, 1994). The objective of bracketing allows the researcher to suspend all previous notions of the phenomenon and instead allows the researcher the ability to look at the phenomenon with new sight. With this new sight, the researcher can allow the phenomenon to speak for itself (Moustakas, 1994; van Manen, 1997).

The other branch of the phenomenological tree, hermeneutic phenomenology, is the one proposed by Martin Heidegger (1972). A critic of Husserl, Heidegger advocated the use of interpretive phenomenology. In this research method, the researcher does not aim to bracket presuppositions and beliefs to arrive at meaning from the phenomenon. Instead, hermeneutic phenomenology is interpretive in its objective (Ray, 1994). Here, the researcher has an interpretive role as to what meaning can be derived from the phenomenon. Consequently, the researcher becomes a co-constructor of the phenomenon itself. In this way, the researcher

becomes one with the topic, revealing meaning through the interaction the researcher has shared with the subject of study.

Van Manen (1997) proposed an agglomeration of the phenomenological tree. In his view, the descriptive (Husserl, 1963) and interpretive (Heidegger, 1972) could be amalgamated. In his approach, the researcher provides a descriptive section in the study, whereby the participants' voices are "heard." Afterward, the researcher analyzes the shared lived experiences of the phenomenon, and the role of the researcher is one of an interpreter (van Manen, 1997). Thus, the role of the researcher is to conduct research through various data collection means, descriptively report the data, and then analyze the data with the purpose of allowing themes to be uncovered (van Manen, 2014). This research opted to employ a hermeneutic phenomenological method as a viable approach for this study as advocated by van Manen (1997).

### **Research Questions**

- What are the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals?
- What occupational challenges do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals face during the administration of a Spanish elementary dual immersion school?
- What benefits do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals find in their working lives?
- How do Spanish elementary dual immersion principals apply transformational leadership as they face these challenges?

### **Setting**

This study was conducted in Spanish elementary dual immersion schools located in the Southwestern areas of the United States. For this study, four different site selection criteria were followed. First, I selected participants from elementary schools. These schools were categorized

as being elementary schools by their grade offering. Only schools offering kindergarten through 8<sup>th</sup> grade were selected. The second selection criteria was for the school sites to provide either a 50/50 or 90/10 dual immersion program model. Third, sites were selected from schools where Spanish is the target language of instruction. Lastly, school sites were located in the Southwestern areas of the United States. For selection, the researcher focused on Spanish dual immersion schools that are located within 800 miles of my home location.

### **Participants**

The goal of this research was to gain insight into the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. As a means of gathering the voices of these participants, this study employed purposive sampling (Creswell, 2013; van Manen, 1997). Purposive sampling is the process whereby participants are chosen because they meet criteria deemed applicable to the purpose of the study. My study used purposive sampling as a means of selecting individuals who will speak and give voice to the phenomenon. Since I aimed to give voice to Spanish dual immersion principals; a selection criterion list was generated to fit this need. Participants were selected based on three criteria. Selected participants were current school administrators (principal or vice-principal) in Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. Participants were also selected if they have been a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal within the last five years. Former Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders had different experiences from current school principals. Because dual immersion was less understood and popular, these school leaders had to encounter different circumstances than those currently serving in the role. Finally, I attempted maximum variation in participant sampling by gathering principals from varied backgrounds (gender, race, education, experience, etc.). Table 1 below depicted the participants who were recruited for the study.

Table 1

*Spanish Dual Immersion School Leader Participants*

Name of Participant	Gender	Race	Education	Years of Experience
Maria	Female	Latina	Master's Degree	3
Bob	Male	Caucasian	Master's Degree	15
Lesly	Female	Latina	Master's Degree	2
Donovan	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	3
Victor	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	8
David	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	1
Juan	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	2
Natanael	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	1
Macy	Female	Caucasian	Master's Degree	1
Dagoberto	Male	Latino	Master's Degree	1

I sought 10 Spanish elementary dual immersion school administrators, and this was sufficient to achieve thematic saturation (Creswell, 2013). Thematic saturation is met when the researcher has gathered sufficient data to the point that no new patterns emerge (Creswell, 2013). Thus, my study sought and recruited the stated number of participants. The numbers of participants were sufficient as data patterns began to be repeated and no new information was forthcoming. Participants were recruited by locating Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. The Center for Applied Linguistics web site served this purpose. School site selection used the criteria listed above. Contact with district offices of potential participants was made.

Permission was granted from selected school districts. Once this was accomplished, school leaders matching the criteria were selected as potential participants. I contacted potential participants through phone, email, and school visits. Participants were informed about the nature of my study and asked to sign consent forms. Participants voluntarily signed the consent forms giving permission to participate in my study. Prior to consent, the research purpose and method were thoroughly discussed with participants using a recruitment and consent letter both of which may be found in the appendix. Once the participants were fully aware about the requirements of my study, consent was asked, and signatures were obtained.

### **Procedures**

Phenomenological research seeks a rich and deep understanding of the phenomenon (Moustakas, 1994). The researcher becomes the initiator of the process (van Manen, 1997). This involves the collection and analysis of data (Creswell, 2013). In doing so, the purpose of this section was to provide detailed steps that were conducted prior, during, and subsequent to research process.

Prior to conducting research, the researcher will obtain information for securing Institutional Review Board approval (Rockinson-Szapkiw & Spaulding, 2014). The Institutional Review Board policy procedure ensures human social science participants will not be harmed in the research process (Rockinson-Szapkiw & Spaulding, 2014). Part of doing no harm to participants entails consent, and confidentiality of individuals taking part in the study (Belmont Report, 1979). In my study, Institutional Review Board Approval was obtained. See Appendix A for IRB approval. I contacted 10 Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders residing in the Southwestern section of the United States. Spanish elementary dual immersion school sites were selected using the most current list of Spanish dual immersion schools available on the



Center for Applied Linguistics web site. Prior to data collection, I called school districts and requested approval to conduct my research. Once school districts approved, potential participants were individually contacted by phone, a brief explanation of the research was given, and a school visit was scheduled and made to further explain my study. During the school visit, I fully explained the purpose, requirements, and confidentiality of my study. Once participants were fully aware of the requirements, I asked them to sign consent. See Appenx B for participant consent form. Only participants willing consented participants completed participation in my study.

During the data collection phase, I conducted semi-structured interviews. (Creswell, 2013; van Manen, 1997). Semi-structured interviews consisted of 20 open-ended questions that allowed participants to openly share their thoughts on the phenomenon (van Manen, 1997). These interviews were used to delve deeply into “What it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal?” and the answers elucidated the essence of the phenomenon. In addition to conducting semi-structured interviews, participants wrote letters to a future aspiring Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal. Finally, participants created a photo narrative (Lapan, Quartaroli, & Riemer, 2012).

After the data was collected, it was analyzed. Unlike quantitative data analysis where the statistical software produces relevance in research, quantitative analysis places the demand for analysis on the researcher (Creswell, 2013; van Manen, 1997). I analyzed the data, gathered emergent themes, analyzed the themes for meaning, and co-constructed meaning in a written form (van Manen, 1993, van Manen, 2014). A research journal was written during the process with the purpose of facilitating the analysis. Data was analyzed by selective thematic analysis. By this process, the researcher reviewed the collected data, highlighted important elements

deemed important to the research questions, and combined common highlighted elements from various participants to produce themes (van Manen, 2014). The results of the findings were discussed, and in the end, suggestions were made.

### **The Researcher's Role**

Helping English language learners has been the crux of my professional career. As a person who has had personal life experiences learning a second language, participated in career choices with the amelioration of students in mind, and have dedicated two decades in educational preparation on the topic, it is impossible for me to bracket myself from the topic of study. It is my love and soul purpose of “being.” It is a defining part of myself. This section dealt with my association with the research topic. Particularly, I discussed my relationship with the participants, my role in selecting the research site, and the biases I bring to the topic.

A limited relationship exists between the participants and me. Although I have worked in three dual immersion schools as part of being a Spanish dual immersion instructor, I purposefully selected sites where I have not worked. I did, however, include a participant who I deemed to have a deep breath of experience of being a dual immersion principal. The participant is now retired, but he was a former dual immersion principal who was a pioneer in initiating a Spanish elementary dual immersion school in Utah. Because he was an early adopter of the program, his lived experience is invaluable as to the challenges posed in an era where dual immersion programs were so foreign.

I selected Spanish elementary dual immersion schools situated in Central California area of the United States because the location is near my residence. Currently, Spanish dual immersion schools reside in select states, mainly in states where larger Latino/a populations are present. Currently, I live in Central California. As a part of this study, I visited schools within

an 800-mile radius. I believe the breadth of difference between areas may produce variety in results.

As mentioned, my professional career has been dedicated to helping English language learners. I started my career in South Central Los Angeles. There I dedicated nine years teaching in a bilingual program that was made obsolete after the passage of proposition 227. I remember the educational difficulty of the time. It was difficult for English language learners to make academic gains when the bilingual model was replaced by structured English Immersion. Having been disillusioned with the political undoing of bilingual education and having witnessed the heartache students had with structured English immersion, I left the state of California feeling limited by what I could offer as an instructor.

However, my travels to Utah left me to discover a school where a new program was being offered, dual immersion. Hesitantly, believing that bilingual education was a superior program offering, I followed the dual immersion model. After two years, I witnessed the superiority of dual immersion over bilingual instruction and English-only instruction. I finally found something that could help children who were just like my younger self. It was amazing to witness the dynamics between children. Recent immigrants were succeeding in learning English and native English speakers were learning Spanish. Minority students and White students were learning from each other. Thus, it is fair to say that I am biased toward dual immersion programs.

I am an advocate because I witnessed so much academic progress because of this program structure. As mentioned previously, the researcher is an insider, and this may be considered a good thing. A large quantity of research in the United States is generated by individuals who come from a White middle-class upbringing. It is the hope of this researcher

that this research may bring a different perspective. Because of my love and assumptions, the researcher will make a concerted effort to espouse my biases when they surface.

Hermeneutic phenomenology does not hinge on bracketing biases (van Manen, 1997). Rather, it provides a description based on the collected data and then interprets the descriptions using the life experience of the researcher (van Manen, 1997). Research findings were addressed as if seeing with new eyes and were descriptively written. Then, data were selected, analyzed, and arranged in themes. Using my prior knowledge and experience in the area of dual immersion, I interpreted and reported findings by building a synergized marriage between data and my personal ruminations.

### **Data Collection**

Hermeneutic phenomenological researchers use different data collection methods. Some of the methods outlined by van Manen (1997) included: Using personal experience, tracing etymological sources, searching for idiomatic phrases, gathering experiential descriptions from others, and the use of art sources. Phenomenological research begins by collecting the personal experience the researcher has on the topic. Afterward, the researcher may also trace the etymological source of the topic they are trying to understand. Experiential data gathering becomes the bulk of phenomenological research. This may include: Protocol writing, interviewing, observing, gathering experiential descriptors in literature, journaling, logs, and using art as a lived experience (van Manen, 1997). This section of the chapter elucidated the three data collection methods employed in this Hermeneutic phenomenological study of the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals.

## Interviews

I gained insight into the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. This insight was arrived through the use of semi-structured interviews. Semi-structured interviews are a qualitative research interview method where open-ended questions are asked, and the structure is flexible (Patton, 2015). The interviewer allows the interviewee to explore themes that arise as a result of the question. In conjunction, the interviewer is flexible in asking follow-up questions based on the answers given by the interviewee. The following questions were used:

### Semi-structured Open-Ended Interview Questions

1. Please introduce yourself to me.
2. Please walk me through experiences in your life that have made an impact that have been instrumental in shaping the way you are today.
3. What experiences led you to become an educator?
4. Describe your experience in becoming a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal.
5. Explain your worries and delights when you heard about becoming a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal.
6. Describe a typical day for a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal.
7. Describe the daily challenges that you face as a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal. Please tell me experiences that exemplify the challenges.
8. Describe the benefits that you witness as a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal. Please tell me experiences that exemplify the benefits.
9. How is administering a Spanish dual immersion elementary different than administering other schools?

10. Describe your role towards teachers, parents, and students.
11. As a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal, how are you a change agent?
12. How do you make change happen? Tell me an experience you have had in the school setting dealing with change.
13. Please describe what transformational leadership means to you. How are you a transformational leader at this school?
14. Please describe societal pressures that impact dual immersion schools and how do you cope with them as a school leader. Please provide experience as an example.
15. What role does race play in a dual immersion school?
16. What is your motivational drive as a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal?
17. What do you expect from students who have graduated from your school?
18. What is the language acquisition process experience like for students at your school?
19. As an instructional leader, how do you facilitate language acquisition at your school?
20. Thank you so much for your participation. One final question... What else do you think would be important for me to know about your daily experience as a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal?

Questions one through four helped establish rapport between the researchers and the participant. The questions were designed to be non-threatening and provide a means by which the interviewee can feel comfortable and open-up to the interviewer (Patton, 2015). Question number four addressed how the participant became a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal. The question was important as differences in experiences arose from principals who were district-appointed and did not have a choice in their occupational placement as compared to those who had a desire to become Spanish elementary dual immersion principals.

Recent educational research (Palmer, Henderson, Wall, Zúñiga, & Berthelsen, 2015) in the field of dual immersion has focused on the challenges and benefits of dual immersion program structure. Questions six through nine were designed to provide an insight into what Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals believed to be the benefits and challenges of the program and how they are different.

Questions nine through 13 explored the interconnection between transformational leadership and being a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal. Transformational theory stipulated that leaders who motivate others to work for a goal greater than themselves employ three traits: charisma, individual attention, and intellectual opportunities (Bass, 1990; Bass & Avolio, 1993; Burns, 1978; Fiol et al., 1999; Jung, & Berson, 2003; Khanin, 2007; Lodewijk van Oord, 2013). These questions explored whether Spanish elementary dual immersion principals are change agents in their schools and how do they effect change in their campuses.

Questions 14 and 15 delved into the question of race. Since racial issues can be a testy subject for some participants, these questions were spaced out until the middle of the interview. My intention was to give the interviewee an opportunity to become relaxed until such poignant questions were asked. These were important questions that addressed the topic of race. The topic of race has been consistent in the dual immersion literature (Garza, 2015; Hickman & Garcia, 2014; Valdez et al., 2016). Because students and teacher from different racial backgrounds interact with each other, the topic of racial harmony or dissonance is always a concern. Added to this are the real socio-political influences impacting dual immersion programs. The questions attempted to gauge how Spanish elementary dual immersion principals deal with the intersection of race.

Questions 15 through 17 required the participants to think about the future. In this manner, participants took on the role of experts and became co-researchers (Creswell, 2013; Patton, 2015;). Question 18 and 19 addressed the language acquisition process (Cummins, 1979; Krashen, 1982) as it relates to Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. It sought principals' input on what their administrative experience has been dealing with their students learning two languages at the same time. Lastly, question 20 was a one-shot (Patton, 2015) question that encouraged participants to converse about topics that were not covered in the interview.

### **Researcher Journal**

Hermeneutic phenomenology seeks understanding through different data sources. A researcher journal is another type of data collection method that may be used in qualitative research (Cresswell, 2007). As such, I kept a researcher journal in which I wrote my ruminations during and after data collection. For my research, interviews were the main data collection source. The researcher journal documented my thoughts after each interview was conducted with a participant. In this way, I conducted an internal reflection of my thoughts, questions, and feelings. The journal served as a means to reflectively think about each interviewee and interview. This reflective thinking spurred thoughts about emergent themes and helped arrive at the essence of the lived experience of Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals.

### **Written Letter**

Writing allows for an internal reflection of the important aspects of past and present life (van Manen, 1997). Through writing, an individual may gain insight into their daily experiences (van Manen, 1997). As a means of collecting an internal reflection of the participants, I had participants write a letter to an aspiring future principal of a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. This writing exercise gave insight as to what participants believed are the most



important words of advice in their roles as school leaders. The participants' writing elucidated their past and present understanding of the phenomenon.

### **Photo Narratives**

Photo narratives are visual representations that may give insight into the lived experience of an individual. In this study, participants were asked to create a collage using three photos as a means of depicting their lived experiences as Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. Participants will write a short description as to why they selected their three photos. The photos along with the narrative will be used to create a congruence that will add to the essence of the phenomenon (Lapan et al., 2012).

### **Data Analysis**

The purpose of this hermeneutic phenomenological research was to gather a deep rich descriptive analysis of the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals. This study used the recommendations of van Manen (1997). In contrast to transcendental phenomenology (Moustakas, 1994), the procedural steps for hermeneutic phenomenology are less defined. However, van Manen (1997) describes different procedural techniques that are beneficial for analyzing human resource data. He describes theme analysis as the following:

The notion of the theme is used in various disciplines in the humanities, art, and literary criticism. In literature, "theme" refers to an element (motif, formula or device) which occurs frequently in the text. The term "theme" is often applied to some thesis, doctrine or message that creative work has been designed to incorporate. "Theme analysis" refers then to the process of recovering the theme or themes that are embodied and dramatized in the evolving meanings and imagery of the work. (p. 90)

He goes on to describe three approaches to thematic analysis: holistic, selective, and detailed. In the holistic method, the researcher generates a theme based on an entire section of data. The selective method employs a reading a portion and creating themes based on the segments. The detailed method requires a line by line analysis of the data (van Manen, 1997). In this study, a selective method was used to analyze themes. The researcher analyzed 10 transcribed interviews, 10 written letters, and 10 photo narratives. The researcher selected portions of the transcript interviews, written letters, and photo narratives deemed important in representing the essence of being a Spanish elementary dual immersion principal. In specific, portions were selected if they answer the central and guiding questions of my study. This included selecting portions of the data that were linked to the leadership experiences Spanish dual immersion principals encounter in their working lives. Selections centered around leadership experiences, occupational benefits and challenges, and portions relating to transformational leadership.

In hermeneutic phenomenological research, descriptive themes were generated and interpreted (van Manen, 1997). Themes are structures that give meaning to the phenomenon (van Manen, 1997). My research used the selective or highlighting approach. In this approach, the researcher reads a text several times and highlights the segments of the text that is most essential or revealing about the phenomenon (van Manen, 1997). Commonalities begin to appear as the researcher compares highlighted segments in the participants' lived experience (van, Manen, 1997). Essential themes were described by selecting material from the transcript text in which the participants shared commonalities. A research journal was kept with the aim of jotting important ideas and helping with the analysis. Themes were determined to be essential or incidental by imagining whether the phenomenon would change as a result of changing or deleting the theme (van, Manen, 1997). Ultimately, the marriage of themes and the interpretative

task of writing created a unison between emergent themes and interpretive analysis. I reflected on emergent themes and lent my voice to the conversation.

My study conformed to the descriptive and interpretive nature of Hermeneutic phenomenology as proposed by van Manen (1997). It did so by descriptively writing participant findings relating to the research questions and subsequently providing an interpretation of the findings by interjecting my thoughts, experiences, and ruminations by narrative. The descriptive portion were reported as if written through the eyes of the participants and as if the topic was being understood for the first time. In contrast, the interpretive section provided my insights into the topic. This included the vast amount of experience I have had as a bilingual and Spanish elementary dual immersion school instructor.

Data analysis were conducted differently according to the nature of the data collected. Oral interviews underwent a three-phase process. In the first phase, I read and reread the previously transcribed oral interviews. Important information was selectively highlighted in the transcription. In the second phase, oral interviews were highlighted according to the portions of the text which answer the central and guiding questions of my study. Portions of the text dealing with leadership experiences was highlighted in blue and labeled with the word “LEAD.” Portions of the text dealing with challenges was highlighted red and labeled “CH.” Selections about the benefits of the job were highlighted in green and labeled as “BEN.” Any portion of the oral transcription addressing transformational leadership were highlighted using a yellow marker and labeled as “TRANS.” Any subthemes that may arise from these four themes will be considered and labeled in a similar fashion if participants commonly shared the subtheme. In the third phase, similar transcriptions segments from each interview were combined to form patterns.

By combining the selected data, I generated themes and subthemes to address the central and guiding questions. The thematic findings were presented in narrative form.

Participant writings were collected after a 30 day-period time frame. The analysis of the writing underwent a two-phase process. In the first phase, participant writings were coded using the same highlighting and labeling technique that was discussed earlier. Following the first phase, I combined the selected portions to form patterns and themes relating to the central and guiding questions of my study. This included themes generated based on leadership experiences, challenges, benefits, and transformational leadership. The findings were interwoven in narrative form according to how it fit the themes.

Similarly, photo narrative findings were analyzed. For the description portion, participants were asked to describe their photo narrative. The short writing gave a description as to why the participant selected the pictures and what they meant. I deciphered what the pictures and statements meant and how it pertained to the research questions.

Ultimately with the goal of understanding what it is like to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal, I scheduled follow up interviews with participants so as to have hermeneutic conversations about the emergent themes and my interpretations of them (van Manen, 1997). In these sessions both the participants and I will asked, “If this what being a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal is really like?” Participants had an opportunity to modify or clarify both the descriptive and interpretive analysis.

### **Trustworthiness**

Trustworthiness has been described as the quality of a qualitative study or the goodness of the results of the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). This study lived up to the ethical standards and show good works. To accomplish this, the study used measures of credibility,

transferability, and consider ethics. By doing so, my research aimed to provide a solid foundation to its methods and procedures.

### **Credibility**

Credibility was maintained through triangulation of data sources, member checking to ensure participant views were accurate, and peer review (Shenton, 2004). Member checking allowed participants an opportunity to review research findings prior to publication (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The researcher provided participants with copies of the research study. Through the process of member checking, participants and researcher discussed the descriptive and analysis of the text. The researcher elicited thoughts and modified sections based on participant input and ensured participant views were accurate. Triangulation of the data was achieved through multiple data sources. The researcher collected multiple data sources such as interviews, letters, researcher journal entries, and photo narratives to arrive at the essence of the phenomenon. Research findings were peer-reviewed prior to publication. A total of three peers reviewed the research.

### **Dependability and Confirmability**

This study used overlapping methods to ensure the dependability of the data, very descriptive detail of the data gathering, and analysis procedures were detailed, and the researcher reflected on the effectiveness of the research inquiry (Shenton, 2004). Confirmability of the study was addressed through a dialogue of the role of the researcher in the study where I addressed my predispositions to the phenomenon under study. A detailed methods section and an audit trail was obtained for my study (Shenton, 2004).

## **Transferability**

Phenomenological research is unlike qualitative research in that it does not seek generalizability (van, Manen, 1990). However, it does seek transferability. Transferability refers to the ability of research findings to transfer to other contexts (Creswell, 2013). Although this study sought to gain an understanding of the shared experience to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal, the findings are only applicable to what has been discovered in the geographical settings in which the findings were uncovered. Further research needs to be conducted to truly understand if the findings contained in my study can be transferred to other areas.

## **Ethical Considerations**

The Belmont Report (1979) provided three essential elements for conducting research. Academic research must strive for respect, beneficences, and justice. Researchers respect participants. Participants are treated with respect when they are asked for their consent, are given honest information about the nature of the study and are provided with confidentiality. Beneficences refers to a benefit for the participants. Researchers aim to do no harm and instead provide some sort of benefit to the participants whenever possible.

To comply with the elements mentioned in the Belmont Report (1979), the ethical considerations my study include confidentiality, Internal Review Board approval, consent from participants, the authenticity of data, the security of data, and consideration for participants. Due to the sensitive nature of some of the interview questions, my study maintained confidentiality of participants' data. Real names were not used in the study. Instead, pseudonyms were used to maintain confidentiality. Consent was gathered from participants and participants were given the

option to opt-out of interview questioning or other data collection means. Data were collected and stored in a locked cabinet. Data resided in electronic form was password protected.

### **Summary**

The purpose of this chapter illustrated how my hermeneutic phenomenological study was be carried out. This chapter established the design choice, data collection, and analysis. For my study, a hermeneutic phenomenological research design was selected to explore the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. The interpretative capabilities of the hermeneutic approach lent input or insight opportunity for me. A total of 10 Spanish dual immersion principals from the Southwestern section of the United States were selected for my study. The participants underwent semi-structured interview sessions, wrote a letter to a future Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader, and created a photo narrative. Data was analyzed through the generation of themes using a selective method. I ensured trustworthiness and creditability by triangulating multiple data sources, considered the views of participants through member checking, and peer review. My study aimed to provide a deep and rich understanding of the working lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals as a means of understanding whether these principals are transformational leaders. My study helps current and future school leaders better administer the Spanish elementary dual immersion program structure.

## **CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS**

### **Overview**

The purpose of my study is to ascertain the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. My study recruited 10 Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. A description of each is presented in this chapter. Evidence was gathered from semi-structured interviews, letters to future Spanish elementary dual immersion leaders, and photo narratives were analyzed and grouped into themes. Themes were developed based on commonalities shared by the participants. This chapter presents the resulting themes of the data analysis. Excerpts from data are used and presented in narrative form. The chapter concludes by addressing the central and guiding questions of my study. Participant evidence is used to answer the questions my study posed. Finally, a summary of this chapter is presented.

### **Participants**

Spanish Elementary dual immersion school leaders in the Central Valley area of the state of California were recruited to participate in the study. A total of 10 participants consented to the study. Participants were not homogenous, instead, they varied in age, ethnicity, gender, and experience. All participants were employed as either a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal or vice-principal. The following is a rich description of each individual who participated in the study. Participants are presented in no specific order and their confidentiality is procured with the use of pseudonyms.

#### **Maria**

I walked onto the campus. The typical bulletin boards honoring students and advertising events hung on the walls of the school. A young staff greeted me by the counter. Walking into Maria's office, I did not quite realize what to expect. Maria is a Hispanic female in her late



twenties. At the time, I was amazed at how young she looked. Maria had been recently promoted to her position. She had been promoted to be a school principal from her teaching position about two years ago. She had a very confident demeanor. As we spoke, her tone was extremely optimistic. She was bright and cheery. She had an exuberant speaking tone. A big smile spread across her face.

Maria was a product of her local school system. As an immigrant child, she remembered feeling uncomfortable in the school system. Maria immigrated to the United States when she was of school age. She often felt bored during the time she did not understand English:

I was a great student, and then coming here and really start, you start at the bottom. You don't know the language. I found the instruction boring and I fell asleep in class a few times in third grade because I just was bored. Um, and then just struggling all the way through until my English caught up. And so, when I learned, I, I think I knew I wanted to be a teacher or wanted it to be an administrator. And then when we started to learn about dual immersion programs and what was available, I knew that if I could do that for all of those kids that come into our system and just offering a second language to all of our kids. So, for some of our kids to maintain their language and other kids to acquire a second language, um, it was just, it was perfect.

Maria mentioned how education is the “great equalizer” and she viewed the dual immersion program as giving students like her former self a way to get ahead.

As we conversed, Maria sat in her chair comfortably. She had taken the helm of a beloved school. It was not easy to fill the shadow of the former school principal. A man who had been on the job for some time and who was well-liked and respected. Although the school was beloved, not everything had been going well. Student enrollment had been down when the

former school principal retired. She was tasked to increase student enrollment while maintaining the culture of the school.

## **Bob**

I had known Bob for quite some time. In fact, my passion for Spanish dual immersion schools had developed because of him. Bob, a Caucasian male in his late 60's, was a retired Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal. He had been a school principal for 40 years and had dedicated half of that time school leadership roles in dual immersion. He was now living the "retired life" with his wife. During that time, they had managed to serve a mission for the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints. Years ago, at the age of 18, Bob had served a mission for his church in Argentina. Now in his late 60's, he served his mission alongside his wife in Chile.

Getting to hear Bob's voice was a treat. We had not seen each other in quite some time. His body was wrinkled more than what I had remembered. Yet, he still had a low toned passive voice. A voice of a person who would not hurt a fly.

We greeted each other exuberantly and caught up with what each other were doing. We talked about his mission trip to Chile. He had been kidnapped for two weeks. The people wanted a ransom for him and eventually decided to let him go. It was one of the scariest things in his life.

Bob recalled how he viewed his role as a school leader as a calling. Having returned from a Spanish speaking mission in Argentina, his whole world perspective had changed. He recalled his first experience gazing at a Black woman get off a bus in Utah. This was the first Black woman he had ever seen, ever. Because a person like that was so foreign to him, he did not quite know how to process the encounter. Later in his life, going on a mission in Argentina had

widened his world perspective. He had once believed America was the best country in the world. America had the best people, was the most industrious, and was superior to any other country. Yet, he explained the cognitive dissonance he encountered on his mission:

The other thing I would mention with the, I went on an LDS mission to Argentina. I learned Spanish. I've learned that there are other cultures in the world besides my own. And actually, uh, the culture of Argentina, I really liked, there were a lot of things that I liked about it. And, uh, I'd come to understand that people share a lot of commonalities, uh, even though they are from different cultures, uh, which changed my paradigm of the world really. Uh, because prior to that I had a limited view of what the world was like and what people were like. So, uh, that experience changed my paradigm of the world and actually made it more, uh, comprehensive and made me more tolerant about other people differences.

Bob had learned to love the Latino culture. When he came back to the United States, he began to teach and eventually became a principal of an elementary school. He remembered being overwhelmed by the problems of the school. Students misbehaved and parents seemed not to care. Although he had struggled as a new school principal, he found joy in making a difference until one day he had a spiritual experience that made him think twice.

He recalled a woman of small stature who came to see him. She was an older woman who was very indigenous in appearance. Because he knew Spanish, she went over to him. The woman was dressed in a traditional Central American attire. Her skin was of dark complexion and she wore sandals with soles made from ropes. Bob explained his experience in this way:

I came down to Provo and 30% of my school was Latino students. It was a little bit of a shock to me. And I was debating (to myself) and I thought most of them were there

illegally. And so, I was going back and forth thinking, well, you know what should my attitude be, I knew that I needed to, uh, educate them and I thought, I can do that, you know? But I had this little doubt in my mind, like, how supportive should I be? So I was, there was going back and forth in my mind, and I, I prayed about it. Help me understand this, what my attitude should be. One day I was standing out in the hall and some people were up there talking to me, a couple of teachers and another parent and this little Hispanic lady came in and she had on a pair of outside with a pair of alpargatas. You know what a pair of alpargatas are? They're pair of cheap shoes that have rope, they have twined rope as for a sole on the bottom, she had a pair of those. I know, I knew what they were because I saw people wearing them in Argentina. I even wore a pair of them, you know, cheap, cheap shoes. She had a pair of those on and she was dressed like she had just come from the fields of Peru, you know, meek little lady about, I don't know, 40 years old. And she came up to me and she said, Mr. Wilkinson (pseudonym), I need your help. And I looked at her and I thought, I'm not going to help you. And the other people left. And I turned and I walked down the hall. And I had these words come into my mind forcefully, these words were, uh, I love this woman who are you to not love her. And I thought, God 's trying to tell me something. So, I turned around and come back and talk to her and helped her with her problem. And I had to have a Hispanic people coming to me all the time with her problems. And I helped him every chance I could. So, I don't know, that was a spiritual experience for me, you know? And since then, I've come to believe that, that, okay, I think the president of France put this pretty good the other day. He said, patriotism is good, but nationalism is not. He said, patriotism says, I'm proud of my country. Nationalism says my country is a more important than anybody else. Then

let the rest of the world be damned. I'm taking care of my country. That's not good. You know? And I believe that.

Since then, Bob had been an advocate for every child and was an early pioneer of dual immersion as a means to help children who are learning a new language. The passage above is reminiscent of the essence of who Bob is. As a caring person who grew up with handicapped brothers and sisters, helping people who may not have had the best “life card” dealt to them had been his internal driving force. He has an internal desire to help the disadvantaged, or as he might say it, “the underdog.”

### **Lesly**

Meeting up with Lesly had been difficult. I had been in contact with her through email. Both times she had expressed her inability to participate in the study. She had been on the job as a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal for a period of a year and stated that she did not know much and could share very little in terms of her experience. I let her know that my study would rely on various perspectives from novice to experienced and precisely because she was new to the experience, she would be a perfect participant. With this in mind, she accepted.

Lesly, a Hispanic female in her late twenties, who has had the position of school principal for 3 years. During the second year of her principalship, the school district decided to have two elementary schools start a Spanish dual immersion program. She mentioned that the directive to make the change came from the “top”. The “top” meaning the central school district office.

Lesly grew up in the community she serves. She had once been a student at the school she now was responsible for. She had this sense of accomplishment and reward to be able to take the helm of a school she had once attended at a young age. She talked about the experience in this way:

Um, I think, you know, throughout my educational career I had a lot of great teachers that always encouraged me and motivated me to do my best and that I could accomplish anything I set my mind to. I think back to my fifth-grade teacher who probably was had the most impact. Uh, it was, I don't know if you're familiar with GATE, but it was considered the gate class. I was not a GATE student, but I was still put with this class and she never made me feel any different and I was able to keep along with everyone in the class. And so, um, that really, that was just an instrumental time in my educational career that really made an impact and, you know, made me want to pursue education. Once I got to high school, I always knew I wanted to become a teacher then because of how my educational career was. But, um, then when I got into high school, I had a vice principal who was just awesome. She's actually my current superintendent. Um, and she was just amazing. And so that is when I decided that I wanted to be a school leader, not just a teacher.

### **Donavan**

I met Donovan in a haphazard way. As part of my current occupation, I was responsible for chaperoning a group of students to Ivy League universities throughout the east coast. The Ivy League project, as it is called, provides California Central Valley students with the opportunity of visiting Ivy League schools. Donovan was one of the chaperones on the trip as well. As we began talking, we began to know each other, and the topic of dual immersion came up. To my surprise, he used to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal the year prior.

Donovan, a 50-year-old Hispanic male, had 20 years in education. Donovan is grown and raised in California's Central Valley. He attended a large university in Southern California.

Looking back at his life, he was proud of being a first-generation student to matriculate into what was considered and is still considered to be a top university in the state. After graduating, he moved back to the valley to start his teaching career. Primarily focused on the elementary classrooms and later teaching in junior high, he began looking towards getting his master's in administration. Within time, he was chosen to be a vice principal and then principal of a Spanish dual immersion school elementary school for a period of 3 years before becoming a high school assistant principal this year. Donovan was a former student of the school district in whom he works. Donovan recollected his desire as a young student to do well in school and not only do well but to be competitive with other students. He describes his experience in the following manner:

So, I have been, uh, the type of person that has had a really positive experience in school. Therefore, that's why I love education. I have also been very competitive when it comes to education and having good grades in school. So that's why I've always wanted to be an educator. And so, when I became a teacher that was like a dream come true. And, uh, becoming a bilingual teacher, even though it's not that I had a certification, but I was a bilingual teacher, that was also very helpful because I am fluent in Spanish and English because I did grow up in Mexico and in the United States because I was a migrant student.

Donovan was able to bring a Spanish dual immersion program to a district in Central Valley California. He had a complete desire to help students, especially Latino students. The following is the mindset in which Donovan operated:

(I had a) belief that all students can learn and that we want to have a people that are educated and that they're ready for life. Um, being also in our community, we were

thought of as not being able to do much or to, uh, to, to be failure. I wanted to prove to people that we are not failure. There's that we are people that can succeed. So that's one of the reasons, one big reason why I'm an educator. Besides the fact that I do love education, I want to prove to people that we are capable.

### **Victor**

Getting to know Victor was a pleasure. A teacher at heart, Victor exemplified a leader whose soul in education never left the classroom aisle. Growing up as a migrant student, Victor was appreciative of the help he received from his teachers and school leaders. He knew he wanted to be just like them. Victor, a Hispanic male in his early 50's, resided in the Los Angeles area early in his career. He taught as a Kindergarten teacher in the area until he moved to the Central Valley. This is where he was noticed for his teaching abilities and his leadership qualities. During the class size reduction period of the late '90s, Victor was asked to become a vice principal. Later, he would be asked by the Superintendent to become a principal of a school of his own. After 8 years, the Superintendent allowed Victor the flexibility of establishing a Spanish k-8 dual immersion school with a science emphasis. It would become to be known as a charter academy.

Victor wholeheartedly believes that achieving a vision is what makes a Spanish elementary dual immersion school effective:

But I think the vision has to be there and you, everyone on the staff has to be on board with the vision. Everyone needs to understand the vision of the school. Everything we do from the, from, from day one to the last day has to be towards the vision. So, we're gonna get professional development. That's a support, the dual immersion in the science we're



gonna provide. When we go into the classrooms and monitor the classrooms, we're gonna make sure that everything's done towards me to meeting those, uh, those expectations.

## **David**

Bursting with confidence and enthusiasm are the enduring elements I remembered from our conversation. David was an immigrant to the United States at an early age. He had moved from the northern regions of Mexico with his family to settle in the Los Angeles area. David is a Hispanic male in his early 40's. Although the move from Mexico had been tough, he recalled everyone treated him well. Given his light complexion and green eyes, people around him assumed he was born in the United States. During his high school years, David had sought out popularity over academics and his grade point average suffered. Nonetheless, he was able to matriculate into a mid-sized university in Southern California. With aspirations to become a doctor, he selected Biology as his major. Quickly though, David found out his lack of attention during his high school days would hurt his understanding of complex math. He turned toward education and never looked back.

David began his teaching career in a poor neighborhood in Los Angeles. As a natural teacher, he often received parent requests to have their child in his class. After extensive knowledge working with students, he received his master's in administration and became a vice-principal of a Spanish dual immersion elementary school in the Southwest. He harkened back to his immigrant experience as an impetus for his work:

My immigrant experience is the first thing that comes to mind. I am also a bright product of public education and I think those two things combined along with, uh, you know, a sense of, uh, wanting to exceed both the, uh, both at my personal level and in terms of

improving the family's financial wellbeing has shaped the way I do things and I handle things at, uh, at school for students.

David is a new vice-principal with one year of experience. Although he has just one year in his leadership role, he was a previous staff developer at the school. His interview lent a different perspective in the areas of curriculum and instruction.

### **Natanael**

A deep passion for the struggles of language learners was evident in my conversations with Natanael. Natanael, a late 30's Hispanic male immigrated to the United States at an early age. He recalled the way teachers treated him. Most did not allow him to speak his native Spanish. One teacher, in particular, deemed it necessary to keep him back a grade because he had not yet learned how to speak English. Although he had friends, it seemed he could not catch up to students who already understood and spoke English. He recalled learning English from watching cartoons when coming back from school. His childhood was marred by fear. Immigrating to the United States illegally, he had the constant fear of being separated from his family by immigration agents. He recalled on one occasion not being able to sleep through a hot summer night. It was then, he kept dreaming immigration agents would storm into the house and take him away. Despite his fears, he became an excellent student.

Through hard work and dedication, he was able to graduate early and attend a mid-sized university in Southern California. He graduated with honors and began his teaching career teaching elementary school-aged children. After 10 years of teaching, he wanted to pursue his administrative credential and was given the opportunity to serve as a vice-principal at a Spanish elementary dual immersion school in Southern California. He describes his passion for students in this way:

The joy to witness students, uh understand something that they could not in the past is amazing. One summer I worked as a realtor for a bit. It was a nice job. I remember we were in a meeting and the broker explained what a beautiful profession we were. Uh, we made a ton of money and helped families find a home. But, in my mind I thought, it's because you have never taught children before. The ability to nurture and cultivate young minds is an amazing one.

Natanael is a vice-principal at a Spanish elementary dual immersion school in Southern California. This will be his second year in that role. Although, he has taught in a bilingual classroom setting for about 14 years.

### **Juan**

A gentleman nearing retirement age, Juan was a Spanish dual immersion school leader 2 years ago. He had administered a Spanish elementary dual immersion school in Central California. His experience with the program had been mixed. Being an immigrant from Mexico, he understood the need to develop a school “where children are free to speak their own language.” He recalled this instance in his life:

We immigrated from Mexico to Texas in this small little town along the border. It was an ugly little town, really nothing to do. I remember my brothers and I playing outside when these White kids came to us. They started speaking English and, I, I could only answer in Spanish. As soon as I started speaking in Spanish, one of the White boys spat on my face and said, “Go back to where you come from wetback.” Um, you never forget those kinds of experiences and you wonder why that had to happen to me. What did I do?

Juan was a bit emotional when reminiscing about his childhood experience. For him, working in a Spanish dual immersion school, provided the ability to “say that it is ok to speak Spanish” and a step in the right direction.

### **Magdalena**

Walking into the door of Magdalena’s office was a different experience. Most principals have a picture of their family alongside inspirational quotes or even some portraits with a recreational activity they perform. Magdalena’s office was unique. It seemed like every square inch of her office was filled with a trinket, a stuffed animal, a family picture, or a quote. It was as if I had been transported to a Hallmark store instead of a principal’s office. Magdalena, an early 40’s Caucasian female, had recently been given the helm of administering a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. Throughout our interaction, differently intonational tones, and body language cues indicated that she was uneasy about her current role.

She had been a school principal 8 years prior to another school in the Southwestern area of the United State which had a track record of being the top-performing school. Being in an influential neighborhood, where the middle to upper class resided, Magdalena had enjoyed working in a school with a revered reputation. Her new school posed challenges and her answers and tones signaled her frustration with how to lead a school in which she had very little knowledge of. The following exemplifies her experience:

Um, there are so many challenges. I don’t, uh, I know where to even begin. Kids are not performing well. At least, not like my other school. Everyone says it’s great here, but have you looked at the scores. How can they say that it is great? I know the school earned a federal award, but how can that be? The teachers know a lot more than me. I

don't know about that. I am supposed to be the instructional agent and, uh, really, I, I am the student, not the teacher.

### **Dagoberto**

Dagoberto, a Latino educational leader in his late 40's, began his career in a very particular way. An English Language Learner, Dagoberto remembered his first days in his kinder class. His anticipation of starting things on the right foot shifted drastically as he was told not to speak Spanish and sternly warned to "never speak that language or you are going to the office."

Although Dagoberto had challenges, he was able to find educators who were supportive, and he dedicated himself to seek out a career in law enforcement. He trained in the police academy but found it difficult to find a job and this is when his life's path turned towards education. The following is how Dagoberto relates the story:

I applied for several police departments and did not get, you know, the, I didn't get any jobs, maybe like one or two, but they took like forever to, uh, to hire me. Well, by the time I got hired, you know, I was already working as a substitute teacher. And so, for me, what ends up happening is I got offered the job as a substitute teacher, but then all of a sudden, I got hired at Bell Gardens, police department to work for the police. And so, as I'm going in, I had a friend who was LAPD and he told me his all, you know, all my friends tell me not to tell you not to become a police officer. Cause I said, why? He's all, because you would do a lot more good being an educator and molding kids to be, become better citizens out in their community than being a police officer because you'll be, when you're a police officer, you're going to deal with the worst of the worst every day is that at least who has an educator. You can work with students and you know, mold them into

becoming, you know, good citizens. And so, I took that to heart, and you know, I ended up just quitting the whole police career, um, path and went into education.

Dagoberto had extreme confidence and had a passion to provide what “was best for the student.” As a vice-principal dealing with behavior issues in a strand model school, Dagoberto always chose, “what is best for the student and not what was best for the school or teacher.” He had pride in being child centered.

### **Results**

The process of phenomenological research is to create a text of the lived experience by a process of insightful invention, it is an act of “seeing” meaning (van Manen, 1997). A theme gives order and meaning to our research and writing (van Manen, 1997). Along this logic, van Manen (1997) stated

As I arrive at a certain thematic insights it may seem that insight is a product of all of these: invention (my interpretive product), discovery (the interpretive product of my dialogue with the text of life), disclosure of meaning ( the interpretive product “given” to me by the text of life itself).

As described by van Manen (1997), a theme is an element that occurs frequently in the text. A theme is a repeated element that occurs among most participants. My study provided a deep rich understanding of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader by analyzing three different participant data sources. As part of this interpretive product, my rich history in Spanish dual immersion lent insight in developing the themes. The following are the themes developed in my study.

## **Theme Development**

In my study selective theme analysis was used. I read the texts several times and highlights the segments that were most (van Manen, 1997). As the researcher reads, commonalities begin to appear as the researcher compares highlighted segments in the participants' lived experience (van Manen, 1997). In my study, essential themes were described by selecting material from transcribed texts from three participant data sources in which participants shared commonalities. All forms of data (interviews, letters, photo narrative, and researcher journal) were collected and analyzed.

From the collected data, themes were developed by the following process. After a thorough reading, rereading and contemplation, portions of the data were selected and coded if it answered the central and guiding questions of my study. I highlighted selected portions of the data with different highlighter colors. Different highlighter colors were used to signal how the selected portions addressed the central and guiding questions of my study. Portions dealing with leadership were highlighted in blue and labeled "LEAD." Selections relating to transformational leadership were highlighted in yellow and labeled "TRANS." Benefits were highlighted in green and labeled as "BEN." Selected portions relating to challenges were highlighted in red and labeled as "CH." Selected highlighted portions of the data were then synthesized into a one word or short phrase and written as side notes which served as codes. As I synthesized the selected portions, the codes served the purpose of bringing forth meaning or arriving at the essence of the participant's experience. A matrix was generated for each collected datum. The matrix included leadership experiences, challenges, benefits, transformational, and language acquisition as column headings. Each datum code was designated to one of the columns. Codes were then grouped together from all 10 participants to form themes and subthemes. Since the

aim of my study was to find the essence of the phenomenon, codes were grouped together to form themes if they were consistently present in the participant pool. Codes that were only applicable to one or a few participants were not selected as a theme or subtheme. The matrices of each of the participants can be found in appendix E. Included in the appendix are the subthemes and themes that were generated and it is labeled as appendix D.

Although these codes were used, hermeneutic theme analysis requires much more than categorizing. Each theme and subtheme were considered, mixed together with my deep insider knowledge, and along with participant conversations. Ultimately, a co-creation of the text occurred as themes surfaced and the interpretative task of writing was conducted. I reflected on emergent themes and provided my insider knowledge in order to create a stronger understanding of the phenomenon. A hermeneutic conversation (van Manen, 1997) was had with participants. In these conversations the aim was to bring an understanding of what it is like to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. It is with this opportunity, participants were able to modify and clarify the analysis. The following generated themes aim to make sense of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. These themes were organized in order of importance. Meaning, persistent and important themes related to the participants were presented first. While, themes with least prevalence or importance are placed last.

**Higher purpose driven.** Collectively, Spanish elementary school leaders have an internal yearning to achieve a higher purpose. This fervent notion dwells on the common shared background experiences of the participants. All of the participants had disadvantaged childhoods in one form or another. Some experienced economic disadvantages. Some were discriminated. Others experienced traumas. They all experienced these hardships during their childhood. Their less than perfect childhood experiences drove and continues to drive them to create a world in



which children may avoid their lived trauma. For example, Dagoberto's experience with discrimination in Kindergarten made an impact:

Well, um, probably it started in, uh, kindergarten when I came in as a Spanish speaking student into an English only classroom. I didn't have any type of English experience and a one, one, the scenario still is still engraved in my mind where I, um, I was in class and I remember the teacher was still was, um, putting colors up to see if we knew the colors and students who were raising their hand and answering. And so, I wanted to be, you know, kind of like the other students. And I saw the, I saw the, um, the color that I knew for sure it was red. And so, I raised my hand and when she called my name, I answered rojo. And so, when I said rojo, you know, I was like, you know, I thought, oh, I did a great job. I answered it correctly. And what ended up happening was that she came up to, you know, up to me, like close to face to face and she told me, and I still remember this, told me, you know, that if you ever use that language in my classroom, again, I'm going to send you to the office and something to the effect of, you know, if I'm going to use that language, I should go back to my country in front of all my peers. And so little by little, you know, I mean I'm melting there in front of everyone turning red and my body's like boiling because of embarrassment. And so that was my first introduction to the real world and to the world of discrimination.

Along those lines, Dagoberto wrote in his letter, "make every student feel special." Bob wrote it in another form, "remember everyone has value." Magdalena wrote, "regardless of position, come to work ready to work for them."

Natanael expressed his belief that he wanted to "avoid having children go through the struggles I went through." He recalled a feeling of vengeance he had with one particular teacher:

The teacher mentioned that the Mexican children, uh, we're, uh, only good for the field.

From that day, I wanted to prove him wrong. We were not just good for the field. We could be just as smart as anyone.

For Bob, his economically poor upbringing along with the mental handicaps of his siblings created a sense of urgency in supporting disadvantaged youth. Bob stated this sentiment this way,

Um, well I had, um, an experience that as a child. when, Um, uh, my family, my, I have three, two brothers and a sister. Well, my sisters passed away now, but they were all born with mental handicaps and they were kind of made fun of, you know, and uh, picked on I guess I would say. And uh, I was too a little bit and I can see in retrospect that that prepared me when I was an elementary teacher and a principal. And I think the reason that was, is because intuitively I sense that education was the solution to a lot of the problems that was faced by disadvantaged children and populations of which really, I was one. So, uh, I think, uh, you know, I think that underlining underlying sense that I had of the importance of education and that making the difference in the lives of people was the driving force behind it.

They share a common desire to change the world for the better. For them, changing the world means to make life for disadvantaged students better. It is what David recalled as, "I want these students to kick butt, so that they can affect change for their families and succeed in the future." He also referred it as "the expectation is for students to be happy; education is a means of providing happiness...so they know they know we care for them by providing opportunities for them in the future."

Lesly believed her internal drive to her dual immersion school was to give back to the community. She had been a migrant student who had the experience of moving from one community to the other to follow the crop harvest. “I know what it is like...and I want the kids to reach their goals, just like many of us have.” For her, providing the best form of education was her way of providing her students a way out of the migrant lifestyle.

Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals have a higher calling. They view themselves as change agents who are entrusted to help disadvantaged children achieve. They possess a grand perspective of their job functions. Instead of coming to work to get by, they instead have the higher purpose of educating children with the hopes of lifting children out of poverty, neglect, and discrimination.

**Social justice crusader.** All of the participants in my study administered schools whose populations were socially and economically disparaged. As one of the participants, Bob, termed it, “these kids are highly impacted.” Using this term, Bob meant to say students came from homes with poverty, low academic attainment, limited social skills, and minority status. These dynamics compounded in establishing a “highly impacted” status. Never mind students’ impacted state, the participants had firm beliefs and actions to remedy students’ deficiencies.

All participants mentioned in one form or another that their aim was to close the academic achievement gap exhibited by disadvantaged children and populations. The term “achievement gap” as characterized by the participants is the difference between the academic achievement achieved by students in their school when compared to other students who performed well on year-end standardized tests. Since all of the schools administered by the Spanish dual immersion school leaders contained disadvantaged students, the term closing the achievement gap meant establishing, as Bob states, “parity” with student counterparts who had

achieved higher scores on the year-end standardized test. When Bob started his career as a principal of a high minority and disadvantaged school in northern Utah, he wanted to find an answer that would help students close the achievement gap. He characterized his encounter this way:

A linguist at a large university and he sat down, and he explained to me that, uh, there was a way that that that was researched based and had a significant amount of research that would help children to achieve parity. Uh, low-income children to achieve parity with children who fair more uh, well, how do I want to put it, the, advantaged children. Um, which, you know, at that time we had a large disparity in the achievement levels of the advantaged children to the disadvantaged children. And he said he could show me a way to close that gap. And I was interested, and he told me it was bilingual education or dual immersion.

In this interaction, Bob gained insights into the power of dual immersion through a university expert. Understanding his mission as a leader was to achieve academic parity, he undertook the journey of instituting the program.

Donavan was emotional when talking about achieving social justice. Having started a Spanish elementary dual immersion school in the Central Valley in California had been a fruit of labor. He had a strong desire to demonstrate the ability of Latino children to the dominant culture. In Donovan's words:

Um, being also in our community, we were thought of as not being able to do much or be a failure. I wanted to prove to people that we are not failures. There's that we are people who can succeed.

Through his work as a dual immersion school leader, he had witnessed the success of the program. Speaking with emotion about having to convince parents of future success by quoting research, “Now not only are we quoting research, we are now quoting our own numbers.” The emotion came because what once was a school district with four Spanish elementary dual immersion schools had dwindled down to just one.

Part of being a social justice crusader means to achieve not only academic parity but also to bring about cultural and language equity. Latinos students find themselves living in a country where the dominant culture eclipses their own. The mantra “English only or Speak English,” was something most participants discussed. Participants in my study held an ideal to bring a balance to acceptance towards other languages and cultures. Donovan stated, “This program brings about equalization of both languages. English and Spanish are respected and valued.

Dagoberto bluntly expressed this notion:

Parents who visit our school are fascinated by it (dual immersion) because of, you know, the the way the students are talking, you know, their, their academic language. But also seeing the results of being in both classes and in that program, all of a sudden now changes the child's perspective and also parent's perspective and see that, oh wow. You know, if they, if they actually learned in both languages, you know, it'd be so much, you know, so beneficial for their child. Very different from when I was told to never speak that language (Spanish) in class.

Victor compared his schooling experience to what his dual immersion school is offering.

Growing up, he felt, his culture was not valued. “The food was not important to them. We never celebrated any cultural events but, in our school, we have cultural celebrations.” Anything from Día de Los Muertos (Day of the Dead) to Posadas (Mexican Christmas caroling) have become a

staple of not only Victor's school but of all participants. Magdalena pasted a picture of a Hispanic Heritage dance festival. Maria talked in-depth about her posada cultural celebration. One of her students was so excited because his mother was bringing the horchata, a traditional Mexican rice water drink to share. Natanael wrote in his letter, "Remember, one of the aims for the program is that two cultures are coming together. Parties always make that happen." Bob stated, "You know, we would arrange things where everybody was represented, uh, you know, everyone felt comfortable in participating, it was inclusive."

Most of the participants linked social justice by providing students with student enhancements. Natanael stated it best:

I once visited a private boarding school in Massachusetts. They had everything; I mean everything. They had a music building, a hockey rink, Olympic sized pools, art hall, you name it, they had it. Those are the benefits of the advantaged population and here we are scraping to keep simple things like basic music and art in the classroom. We (leadership) are constantly looking to see how we can enhance the educational experience of our children, whenever we can.

Bob continues this argument when speaking about music

As we started a full-time music teacher, we hired Mrs. H (Pseudonym), who I had knew of before and I knew she was a great teacher, a fabulous teacher who would get children excited about music and she would get parents excited about it. We began a violin program to boot. And then we had an orchestra after school. Uh, music just had a way of, of, um, lightening everything up. So, to give you an example, after we started the music program in that first year, uh, the superintendent came over to our school to visit.

Steven Miller (Superintendent pseudonym) came over and he, he heard the choir at our school singing. And so, he invited us to come to the, um, the district staff Christmas party mid-year. And we went over there, and they performed, and they sang in English and Spanish songs, both. And the violin group performed a little bit. They didn't, they weren't that good, but they look good cause we had red sashes and red bow ties and you know, and black and white shirts, black pants. And they looked pretty sharp. Uh, and so they performed for all of the, uh, staff of the district office. And afterward, Steven Miller said to me, that alone will convince people that you're doing the right thing, even though it really didn't have anything to do with bilingualism.

Not only does this idea of student enhancement apply to music, as David noted. “My objective is transforming the curriculum to be a little more like, I like to call it three dimensional. It is more project-based, moving more, it is more highly enriching.”

Participants in my study viewed their role as dual immersion administrators to be social justice crusaders. They openly had beliefs with actions that aimed to bring social justice by closing the achievement gap, seeking cultural and academic equity, and enhancing students learning through enriching means. Leaders in my study wanted their disadvantaged minority population to have the same pride and access to resources than those afforded to dominant advantaged populations.

**Always on the defense.** Spanish dual immersion programs are constantly being challenged through different avenues. Spanish dual immersion leaders have to be defensive against oppositional forces. Some of these forces whose goal is the dismantling of dual language education. As Bob stated, “I told them (professors of education at a large Utah university) at a meeting one time that I felt like I had a pen in one hand for the purposes of education and in the

other, I had a sword, uh, because I had to fight off opponents to the program.” The most predominant oppositional forces expressed by participants were anti-immigrant, ethnocentrism, and the desire to be identified and accepted within the dominant culture.

Outside oppositional forces impact Spanish dual immersion schools. One of the most vocal oppositional forces to impact dual immersion are people and groups who espouse anti-immigrant sentiment. Because Spanish dual immersion programs service students whose native language is Spanish, some anti-immigrant groups assume students who are enrolled in the program are residing in the United States illegally. Although some students may be residing in the country illegally, educators are not allowed to discriminate or deny educational services to students regardless of immigrant status.

Natanael voiced his experience with anti-immigrant forces at a decision-making board meeting deciding whether or not a dual immersion program was going to be implemented. As described by Natanael, the board meeting was separated by two entities, oppositional parents and teacher in favor of the program. Oppositional parents were furious. Natanael expressed it this way, “One parent got up and said we should be educating our own and not children of other people.” At that point, Natanael could not understand why parents would say something like that. It was then, another parent stood up and said, “We cannot educate those illegals.” Natanael felt very attacked. Addressing the board, Natanael said, “They are all our children, we need to educate all.” Bob had a similar experience with an individual who wrote to the local newspaper. Bob explains the scenario in this way:

You know, there's a resistance for Spanish, English because of the immigration issues that we have in the United States, you know, uh, I don't see that kind of problem in French immersion, French/English immersion. I don't see it with Chinese immersion, but



I do see it with (Spanish). So, the, the larger societal issues we have with immigration in the United States like that our government is absolutely ripping itself apart over right now. You know, that carries over into the setting of the school. Okay. But, you know, it's like I would, I would like, a parent wrote me and let her one time and demanded that I not teach, uh, Latino students that were, uh, children of illegal immigrants. And he wrote a letter and sent it to the newspaper. And I called him back and I said, look, um, I don't know who's legal and who's not, but it doesn't even matter because the law says that you will teach all students who are in your area not allowing, not prohibiting any from attending. And so, I would, I wrote to him about that law and I said, now I don't want to hear any more about it. And he wrote, he wrote me emails and stuff, but I never responded anymore to him. So, there's all kinds of societal pressures that the United States is facing and sometimes those carry over into our country today and into our schools of today in the bilingual classroom. Okay. And I think actually bilingual classrooms or dual immersion schools can help resolve that, you know, because they can prepare the upcoming generations to get over that, get past it, you know.

This sentiment expressed in the passage above is consistent with other views held by administrators. David talked about the “current political climate” affecting how people perceive immigrants. Dagoberto was blunter in his assessment, “We have a president, right now, who makes comments right out of the blue and creates controversy.” He continues to say that people listen to those arguments and think, “Why are we teaching children a second language, all students should learn English already.” David had similar perspectives involving Donald Trump, “We have the current president who loves attention.” According to David, the statements made by Trump cause stress within the minority community.

The bi-product of anti-immigrant statements cause stress in the community served by dual immersion schools as reported by participants. A critical job of a dual immersion school leader is to provide reassurance during times when anti-immigrant forces oppose the education of students. The Spanish dual immersion school leaders defend the educational right of all students.

Ethnocentrism may be characterized as a belief of one's own culture as superior to other cultures. Most of the participants defended their Spanish dual immersion schools from outside oppositional forces with strong beliefs in English as the only spoken language. Two common phrases were discussed to describe oppositional ethnocentric forces, "Speak English we are in America" and "English Only." Bob spoke to this English only movement:

Another experience that I would mention is the, my experience with bilingual education, it, um, changed me, uh, quite a bit because I encountered a lot of opposition to it, which surprised me, uh, because when I was, uh, a younger person, a teenager learning a foreign language was considered a mark of education. Uh, but I found out that, um, as a, as a principal trying to implement a bilingual program that I have, uh, there was a movement afoot in our country, in the United States to say that we should be English only. Now. It wasn't, everybody saying that, but there was a pretty good vocal group against that. And so, every day, as I tried to implement bilingual education, it was an uphill battle, um, because there was a lot of criticism. Um, but fortunately there was a lot of documentation studies and so forth that was very supportive of that. And in the end, that carried the day. And so, I was allowed to implement bilingual education even though there was a lot of opposition. But then it impacted how I view, um, education in the United States changed the way I view it because I've often thought that, you know, the

education, that United States was the best in the world, but some in some respects it's not. Uh, and so things can be improved upon. So that changed my, the way I looked at things that way.

Bob found that he needed to defend his Spanish dual immersion school from people who did not understand and did not see a benefit to learning two languages. Natanael referenced parents who were against learning another language other than English. Maria stated the same opposition at board meetings, "There was this one parent who was against teaching Spanish. He said that we don't need to be making America into Mexico."

Spanish dual immersion school principals also defend against the oppositional forces of a reluctant nature. It is reluctant because instead of being openly vociferous in opposition instead it is a silent force. Silent, but a force, nonetheless, is the desire of individuals to be identified and associate themselves with the popular culture. Both Maria, Bob, Lesly, and Magdalena had experiences where very capable Spanish speaking teachers were asked to teach in Spanish but refused. The following are excerpts from those experiences. Maria stated:

I have some teachers in the upper grade, they are not sure if they want to do Spanish.

They are good teachers, but they are not sure they want to associate with dual just yet.

Bob had an experience of trying to convince some teachers he knew of in Northern Utah:

I tried to hire a native Spanish speaking teachers and we had, we had a number here in our school district, but I had in, there was a number of them up in Northern Utah that I knew about and they would have come down and some of them did, but they didn't come to my school because they were native Spanish speakers. But they wanted to be identified with the, with the dominant culture, not with the Latino culture, am I making myself clear on that? Yes. So, so that was, that was one of the things that I learned and

one of the things that I had to, uh, minimize, you know, because um, you can't, you can't or you shouldn't place favoritism when it comes to cultures. You shouldn't say this culture is better than that culture. Every culture has things that have negatives to them, and they have positives to them. But most of them, it would be hard to say that one is actually better than another, you know, I just, you might find an example of one, but generally, no. Uh, so part of me, part of my activity was dealing with, with that kind of attitude and that was, that was different than things that I did before. I was a bilingual principal, you know, of an elementary school.

When I interviewed Lesly, she had just finished her first year. She was worried because her kindergarten teachers were new to both dual immersion and to teaching kindergarten. She explained her attempts to remediate a teacher's association with the dominant culture:

We're having some challenges as we've rolled it out this year. You know, its, um, first of all, I have in my program here at the site I had in Kindergarten. I had two teachers that have never taught kindergarten before, who are in the kindergarten dual immersion teachers. So that alone is a challenge because they're learning the curriculum for the first time. Teaching Kinder in itself is its own beast, if you will, you know, and so, um, we, we have had some like growing pains and just you know, expectations of students and um, it has been hard to convince teachers who I know are capable Spanish teachers to come over. They know Spanish, and good Spanish, but they just don't want to.

Magdalena spoke about the dilemma she was facing to staff the upper grades one year. She had been recruiting for two open Spanish positions for fourth and fifth grade. At the time, some Spanish teachers she knew of taught in the neighboring school district. Magdalena stated, "One teacher said that she did not want to teach Spanish, she wanted to be known for teaching

English.” That year, Magdalena had to travel to Texas to find some recruits. Juan mentioned that fighting against this silent oppositional force has to be addressed with students as well. This what he said:

Uh, one of the things that I encountered and what I learned was that people want to be identified with a dominant culture. They do want to, and they may not even realize they want to, but they do want to. Let me give you an example. When I was a principal up at my old elementary, there was a little second grader, a little girl who spoke Spanish and I would speak Spanish to her because she would just rattle. She would just talk a mile a minute. And so, it was just always fun to talk to her because she, once I started talking, she would just jabber to me. And so, I would talk to her every time I saw her, and I stopped and talked to her. Then one day we were talking, and this is, I think she was in the fourth grade now we were talking at the end of school and she had stopped in the hall and talk to me and there were kids passing. I was speaking in Spanish and she reached out her hand and grabbed hold of my forearm and she said, Mr. Smith (pseudonym), let's speak English. And I said, oh, okay. And so, I started speaking in English and then I got thinking about it. Why, why would she say that? And I realized, well, I read some, some things and I talked to some people, I talked to a professor about it as well, but children want to be identified with the dominant culture and teachers do too.

I did want to mention Donovan's experience whereby oppositional forces were hard at work to disintegrate the dual immersion program. As mentioned previously, Donovan had been instrumental in establishing four Spanish dual immersion programs in his district. These dwindled down to one. Here is the excerpt from Donovan about how outside forces were able to shutter three programs even though their programs were being successful:

The district decided to do that at one point actually wanting to get rid of the whole program. So, we were advocating for them to do no such thing because we had been, we had worked very hard to bring in the program to the, to the, to the entire district. And the students were learning, they were progressing. The students, uh, the, the principal at the high school had stated that those had gone through with the dual immersion program in the end of their bilingual programs that were, you know, scoring very well. And so, there were some, some vindication justification that we are doing great but there was different ways of thinking. People who came into power and to you know, um, into the district office and into the board had a different way of thinking. And they said, now we're just gonna have one school as a dual immersion program as a dual immersion school. And then there's, it is a strand within that school. And we have been, uh, advocating and, uh, fighting to keep the dual immersion program in that school because they also try to eliminate it. And they, they tried to say, you know how it starts? It's like, look how bad they're doing. This is not a good idea. And we're like, no, no, no, let's talk about it. Because obviously, you're not well informed as to what the dual immersion program does. So, we had to have those conversations with the people who were against it, uh, against keeping that last trend. Um, but, uh, it was obvious that they were moving towards getting rid of it. However, those that administration moved on and therefore the dual immersion program is still there. It is not just that by a change of administration that such a valuable program can just be removed. Um, but those are the, this is what we're fighting for.

In this experience, we find evidence of district changes and lack of instructional knowledge catapulted the end to programs. Donovan also spoke about people and teachers who were not

involved in dual immersion, did not have a child attending the school, but still offered their opinion towards the program. Donovan continued:

Like I mentioned that the parents are completely against it. When we were having the meetings about progressing to the next grade level, we would actually have parents who would come in and say, this is not so-and-so country as Spanish speaking country. And we had to explain once again that this not that kind of program. Again, just another social experiment, this is not a program that is going to turn this community into a certain country. It is a program that is going to have students who are bilingual and bi-literate by the end of sixth grade. And we wanted to expand even more into the seventh and eighth grade and some classes into, into high school. So, um, the challenges were there were people who started to influence the, uh, influence also the board and uh, the people who have got, um, uh, the people who were voted in elected board members and misconceptions. So, we had to, we had to deal with misconceptions and to clarify a lot of the questions, they would gladly do it, it just that the perceptions, the procession, the perceptions were there, and we had to mystify those perceptions,

Donovan kept harkening back to the phrase, “we are not a social experiment.” What he meant by this phrase was that implementation of dual immersion was researched based and given the research would yield at or above academic achievement by the fifth grade. He would often defend low test scores in the primary grades by informing skeptics about the program’s effectiveness.

**Buffer.** One of the most interesting and unexpected words that surfaced from many of the participants was the word “buffer.” Spanish dual immersion school leaders understood their role as being a protector of their school. At times, this meant, that they had to shield

stakeholders in the school from stressors. As Bob recounted, “I wanted my teachers to teach and not worry about anything else.” Dual immersion school leaders were buffers from strand model problems, school district disconnect, and outside oppositional forces.

Strand dual immersion programs may be characterized as a school within a school. Two entities exist, one is a Spanish dual immersion program and the other is regular English only instruction. Students are separated according to which program they are enrolled. Different sets of problems arise for school leaders of strand models. The problems include division and competition between two programs, juggling struggles, and program comparisons.

Bob started his dual immersion career in a school in Northern Utah. He had received funding from a grant and was allowed by the superintendent and board to implement a strand model. One day, Bob recalled receiving a call from the superintendent while he was taking his morning shower. She told him that they needed to shut down the dual immersion program at his school. The day before, a group of teachers from his school had told the superintendent that dual immersion program was destroying the school. Bob was dumbfounded, and he told the superintendent if they were going to shut down the program that she better talk with the 200 parents who were part of the program. It was then the superintendent realized that she needed to think things through. Bob and the superintendent had a meeting to discuss the matter. The superintendent said the teachers were telling stories about how the school was falling apart.

Bob was confident his school was not falling apart and invited the superintendent to come any day to visit. Hesitantly, the superintendent did visit. She analyzed test scores and visited classrooms. At the end of the day, the superintendent was pleased and told Bob to proceed with the program as planned.



Another problem was the juggling struggles in administering two programs at the same time. Maria stated, “It’s hard, you have two schools within one school.” According to her, it was difficult to remember everything about what each one needed. “There are so many demands from both sides, I just want to keep everything straight so that both sides are happy.” Lesly had similar views. “I am new to this, but I think when the program goes up through the grades, it will be more difficult to realize where everyone is at. Lesly discussed testing questions, “Do we test in English only or do we test in both English and Spanish? Are we just going to test then, you know, uh, we need time for instruction?” Strand model schools require the administrator to walk a balancing act as Victor posed:

You have teachers who think you are spending too much time in the Spanish program.

Uh, what I tried to do was if I was going to do something for Spanish, I would do it for English. For example, a PD or a conference, both would go, even though it may not have pertained to the English. At least they would know about it and would be more understanding of what the Spanish teachers were doing or undergoing.

Not everyone viewed a strand model as problematic. Magdalena, who administered a complete Spanish dual immersion school preferred to have a strand model. “It would be easier, parents can try the program out and if they don’t like it, go to the English,” reasoned Magdalena.

Donovan spoke in great length about buffering expectations about test scores. “At a point in time, the, the English does better, and then, in the upper grades, dual outperforms the English.” As a principal, he had to buffer comparisons at each level. “We would have difficult conversations, ok, well what are the other teachers doing to be successful?” At each instance, Donovan felt as though he needed to withhold information from one side so as to lessen the comparisons between the two instructional models.

Spanish dual immersion school leaders strived towards harmony and the strand model was described as a “chasm.” Juan explained:

If you're managing, if you're the principal of a strand model, the strand model really presents some problems because, uh, you, it, it automatically puts a division in your school. You're trying to build bridges over a chasm, you know, that's, that's built thereby, cause you had teachers in two different camps, and you treat them differently, you know, so that's a, a problem. And the other problem with, with the strand model is that when you get into the upper grades, you have a certain amount of attrition that occurs just naturally with, within all classes. But in, in the dual immersion classrooms, you can't add children in as easy as you can in the English classes. And so you end up with dual immersion classes that are smaller and that further, you know, aggravates teachers who were, uh, an English speaking class, you know, that has 35 kids in a, and a, a bilingual class that only has 20, you know, so that's another problem with, that's a problem with the strand model.

As teachers in two different curricular models requested and complained about their varying needs, administrators were quick to protect and withhold information to arrive at harmony between the two sides.

Some administrators, not all, served as buffers between the school and the school district. A disconnect between school and school district was evident where district personnel had antagonistic attitudes or lacked program understanding. This buffering was not evident in administrators that had the full support of the school district. As Victor stated he had “110% support” from the superintendent. This support was not always the case for all administrators.

A lack of familiarity with the dual immersion program promoted a disconnect between school and school district. Lesly explained the district personnel was new to the position and even though she was over the dual immersion program over the district, she did not fully understand the nuances of dual immersion. Here Lesly explains her role:

It is a new program and you want it to be successful. So, you want teachers to be able to feel like that. They have some control of it, versus, no, has it to be this way, cut and dry. And so, that's something that I think we're struggling with right now because our district is kind of telling us you have to just do the same assessments, the same assessments, and we're like, is there really value in just all this testing or should we kind of maybe pull back from the testing? And that's where I need to be their (teachers) voice. I need to talk to the district office people and make sure that, that we're, we really are doing what's best for students and not just trying to test.

Bob buffered information that was being sent from the district office to avoid unnecessary stressors for teachers. A district ESL coordinator wanted to require all schools in the district to send students to the computer lab to receive instruction from an adaptive ESL computer-based program. Bob recalled the event:

One of the problems that I faced was I had this school district demanding things of me because they expected it from all schools, but it didn't really fit into our model. You know, it didn't fit. Like for example, they want us to put this extra computer lab in there and have students do this uh, computer lab thing for an hour and a half. Do you remember that? And I didn't want to do it. I said it doesn't fit in with ours. We can't give up that time. We're already covering more curriculum than anybody else and we can't, we don't want to, I don't want to do it. But they forced me to do it. They said we won't give

you any title one money if you don't. And so, we did it. And guess what, now, you know, here it is like seven years later, where is that stuff that they, you said was so dang important, why they've done away with it. They said it wasn't effective. Great. You know, so that's one of the things that you have to put up with as a bilingual principal is the expectation that you really, it's a district problem and a board of education problem. They expect you to do everything that everybody else does, but you're a different kind of school. You know, you, you should not be, you should not be expected to be like everybody else when you are in fact not like everybody else, you know? And so, dealing with that was always problematic for me and that was different.

The way Bob was able to buffer the district's requirement was to send students to the computer lab in the morning and in the afterschool program. By limiting the impact on teachers and their curricular day, he was able to buffer the impact of the district's requirements on teachers.

Another way in which Bob was a buffer was to withhold information from his teachers.

As Bob explained:

The other role that I played there with teachers is trying to be a buffer, between teachers and the outside world, so to speak. Even the district office, you know, we, when we had our bilingual program going, I, there was a lot of opposition from, with within the district office. You know, one, one day I had the Reading Specialist came over and told me that I had to shut down the bilingual program because our reading scores weren't good enough and we just needed to do away with it. That was early on. And I went back to the superintendent and I said, superintendent, who is principal of this school, is it the Reading Specialist or the principal? He said, no. And I said, okay, I am the principal. We are not going to do this. And the district office needs to get their nose out of our business.

You know, we're going to do this. They're not going to micromanage us. You know, they're here to support us, not to, uh, not to tell us what we have to do and what we don't have to do. And uh, so that's an example of buffering, you know, and sometimes you do the, you have to be a buffer for teachers from entities outside of the school, you know, groups that oppose things. Um, you know, because teachers need to be protected. They need to be protected to do their job. I didn't want teachers involved in controversies all over the place. I wanted them to focus on their students. You know, and we even, we had some teachers that got involved in controversies and I tried to minimize that. Let's do our job, you know, let's educate kids. You know, so that's one of the roles that I play with teachers. Um, listening, being a buffer, uh, enabling them to do what they can do best.

The previous example demonstrated Bob's ability to withhold information. He never did tell the teachers that the District was telling him to dissolve the program. Instead, he refuted district claims without any of the staff really knowing about them.

All of the letters from dual immersion administrators addressed the issue of providing a buffer between oppositional forces. They addressed the "need to protect teachers from all that is going on" and to "pick your battles, sometimes the best thing is to ignore. Donovan in his letter wrote, "Take care of your teachers and let them know you appreciate them, they don't have to know everything that goes on, let them teach."

**Culture builder.** All participants addressed the issue of creating or bridging culture in their school. As two different cultures come together, in the case of Spanish elementary dual immersion schools, the merger of Latino with Caucasian and other students, principals become the bonding agent for different cultures to get along. A dual immersion school principal builds culture by building bridges, creating a welcoming positive school, and building cultural

sensitivity and awareness.

One of the ways that dual immersion school leaders build culture between the cultural groups is by providing synergistic opportunities through cultural activities. Victor recounted the “need to provide cultural celebrations.” According to Victor, his cultural celebrations included live mariachi, folkloric dancing, and food. This was not limited to Victor; dual immersion school leaders cherished the participation of all stakeholders in cultural events. Bob asked the music teacher to teach each grade level a specific cultural dance. The dances ranged from Japanese dancing, line dancing, and to traditional Mexican dancing. It was a “way to let parents and students know that all cultures have value.” Maria was ecstatic of how well attended each cultural celebration had been all year long. “Parents who had never come to activities before are now coming because they feel, uh, comfortable with what we do.” Lesly talked about, “Parents feeling welcomed because they get to see what they used to celebrate in their native countries.” David wrote, “One of your most important jobs will be to create an environment where two cultures can thrive. Establishing cultural celebrations and traditions is one way to unite a school.”

The perspective of Magdalena highlights the cultural shift in her as she assumed her leadership responsibilities of heralding an already existing dance festival. Magdalena voiced her perspective in this manner:

I was really not prepared coming in. Everyone had told me what a great event, uh, I have never been a big fan of dancing and I really did not know what to do. Was I supposed to speak, what did I have to do? The thing was a great event. I just had to let the kids dance their dances and be supportive. I don't know why I had been so nervous. If I think about

it, it, it has something to do with not really practicing or understanding my culture, pretty much. Well, it was great.

In this interaction, Magdalena had been cautious because she had never had cultural experiences in her culture. The event was a turning point as she understood cultural events could bring people together.

As mentioned previously, all of the participants included cultural celebration pictures for their photo narrative. One, in particular, stood out, it was a picture of three girls. A picture representing three cultures, African American, Caucasian, and Latino. Each girl was wearing a traditional folkloric dancing dress. They were sitting down hugging each other, smiling, and enjoying ice cream. It was a touching photo to see.

An aspect of creating culture is through creating a positive school culture. Positive school culture may be characterized as a curricular environment where a student feel joy, have a low academic filter and enjoy coming to school. Bob created a positive school culture by infusing celebration as a key component of the school year. He created a large wooden wall to celebrate student achievement, had regular awards assemblies, instructed the music teacher to create school songs to sing along with, and constantly promoted students to participate in competitions to showcase the school talent.

Victor created a positive school culture by rewarding teachers. In his office, he had different Oscar trophies, about six of them. Each one award was labeled with a different category, including, the best Spanish teacher, the best science instruction, the best dual immersion partnership, etc. He told me, “Teachers love that, they strive to get the award...it builds a positive culture for the school.” He also spoke about the positive interactions students had because of dual immersion. “When there’s more English introduced, the English only kids

are helping the Spanish speaking kids learn English. So, they're helping each other." A school where children from different backgrounds need each other throughout the school day creates a positive school bond.

Natanael talked in great length about creating a positive cultural shift at the school, especially with teachers who were of a different ethnicity than the students. Here is what he said:

I found some teachers who, maybe not seemingly aware, would say things that on the surface were harmless, but in reality, they were not. For example, I once had a teacher tell me, why are Spanish teachers leading staff development, it is almost like, they are more capable than English teachers. At that point, I had to say to her, um, um, well, they are bilingual and know two languages. She said, are you saying they are more than us? I told her no, but that does, does, mean that, they are linguistically more capable. In another exchange, I had one teacher say, all Latino students look the same. She meant they all seemed to share the same characteristics. Uh, uh, I told her, how would you feel if I said all Caucasian students looked the same. She said well, they don't. But I would not like it."

Natanael, through thoughtful articulation, was shifting the mindset of teachers who did not realize they were speaking in an insensitive manner.

Visual evidence expressing pride in academic achievement as a part of infusing an academic culture was evident in all photo narratives. All participants included pictures of students receiving academic awards. Magdalena placed a picture of the school's faculty which had won the federal award for improving end of year scores with large percentile increases.



Other participants included pictures of students receiving science fair medals, publishing bilingual books, and award assembly certificates.

**Educational shifter.** Change is a persistent theme of all participants. They effect change. Mainly, they are effecting a dynamic change in schools which were once monolingual to bilingual environments. Juan characterized this shift as a “paradigm shift.” I would have to agree with that assessment. Different facets of a school need to change in order to be a dual immersion school. Everything from language instruction, communication towards parents, activities, curriculum, professional development, and more. Spanish elementary dual immersion leaders are educational shifters. They are shifters because they act on a paradigm shift, are goal-oriented enthusiasts, and individual and community advocates.

A paradigm shift may be characterized as a shift in thinking. In education, a paradigm shift is moving away from the traditional way a school functions towards something different. Spanish dual immersion school leaders shake up the system in more ways than one. Maria stated:

When I became a principal, I was tasked bringing up the declining student population. We are the second smallest school in the district we have 280 students and we used to be, be 232. Well, I uh, thought, we could bring dual immersion. It changed the culture of the school and changed the culture of our community. Um, there's some really difficult conversations before the program came on. Um, a lot of our parents at the time didn't want the program to come on board. They didn't really understand it. And so, we had to navigate through some means and some really difficult things were said. So, when I started to share with them how engaged and excited our incoming to parents were and how much they were emailing me and just how involved they were going to be, that

really changed the minds because they felt like, oh, they're actually going to come and help and do these things. Yes, they are, and so it was just knowing different people and how to find what would work for them to get them to see the program and be open about it.

In this example, I was able to witness how Maria was able to shift her entire community. The negative mindset of some in the community was changed towards the program.

David was very confident in how he is able to change the paradigm at his school. The following excerpt not only showcases his confidence but illustrates how an educational paradigm necessitates a change in several areas:

We're, we're really no different than any other school is that, that uh, we have two languages, double objectives. It's double the work, double the challenges. But, um, in our school we don't, uh, see them as challenges. We see them as opportunities. The word change, the word challenge, anything. It's seen negatively. But we like to look at change as we like to look at challenges as opportunities. So, uh, the way we feel, we look at things because, um, we are, we are under the same, um, instructional days as any other schoolhouse. We face similar identical challenges as any other schoolhouse. And we have half of the time to do so. I think as a change; we like to look at a little thing as an opportunity. And when we look at things through a lens of opportunity, we see hope, we see light, we see the way we see research in action, we follow research, we, we put our faith in research and we take the leap of faith and, uh, we carry ourselves, uh, with, with our chins up and knowing that we're doing the right thing for children.

The quotes above highlight this desire to achieve and to be what I would term as goal-oriented enthusiasts. What I mean by that is someone driven to achieve results by taking the necessary

steps and being motivationally happy along the way. Bob mentioned, “You have to have enthusiasm. You have to believe in what you're doing and have an energy and enthusiastic energy for doing it, that, that carries over to other people.” Donovan talked in length about establishing goals and expectations. “We talked about having the knowledge in the room (staff) and we had to transform it. We had to transform our school, um, the low scored that we were getting, and we did.” Natanael was very goal-oriented and passionate as he talked. “We have the goal of having our children read in both English and in Spanish at the end of first grade.” Victor and Maria talked about providing high academic rigor and challenges. “I think, you know, the kids that are not Spanish speaking, they have to work a little harder because they are trying to figure out the second language.” Maria stated, “I never want my school to be water-downed because of where these kids are from, we have rigorous expectations.” Some of the participants wrote about “holding students to a high standard,” “raising the bar,” “setting high expectations,” “don’t settle for less,” and “ensuring students are reading and writing at high academic level in both languages.”

Lastly, administrators were educational shifters by being advocates in their community. Donovan talked about shifting the mindset of the dominant culture towards Latinos. “I want to prove to people that we are not a failure. That our people can succeed.” Lesly stated, “I feel like I need to advocate for the program to the community.” She continued, “For my teachers I am an advocate for them at the district office, for my parents, I want to be an advocate through what we at the school offer, and I am advocate so my children can succeed.”

**Proactive stewardship.** Some of the unique challenges faced by Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders required proactivity on their part. A proactive nature may be described as a tendency to act upon a situation without waiting for events to unfold. It requires

the leader to seek and make things happen without being ordered to or reacting to events. Most of the participants in my study exhibited this trait as they administered their school sites.

Many of the participants were proactive agents to establish Spanish dual immersion programs in their schools. Donovan had attended an annual conference in Southern California and brought the program back to his district. He explains:

We were part of the group that brought in dual immersion to our district. And um, we went in, we were trained. So, then we became mentor teachers and then we started to set up what is the, um, scope and sequence for the grade levels as we progress grade level by grade level every year to make sure that everybody was on the right page.

Bob went through extensive lengths to bring dual immersion to the small town of Utah where he established the program. After proactively seeking help from a large Utah university and hearing from a university professor about the benefits of dual language learning, Donovan convinced his superintendent to attend a dual immersion conference in Vancouver, Canada. At the conference, the district personnel did not stick around for the presentations and insisted used the trip as a vacation. Bob eventually convinced the superintendent to travel to see Donna Christian and Fred Genesee from the Center of Applied Linguistics in Washington DC. Although Bob's Superintendent had no motivation to bring dual immersion to her district, she eventually had to accept it because Bob proactively applied for and received a grant to start the program. Bob continued:

Um, there was \$500,000 grant for a five-year period, and it was tremendous. So, one of the things that really made a difference was the money to do it. You know, I could not get the support within the district to, you know, from other people. I just could not get support for it. But once I had the grant, I didn't need their support. You know, I went

ahead. Of course, they had to agree to it, the superintendent had to agree to it, the board had to agree to it. But once I had the grant, there were not going to stand in the way of that and so we started a dual immersion program.

Bob easily could have given up on his crusade to establish a dual immersion program because his superintendent had no real interest. However, he was proactive to seek knowledge from experts, funding, and eventually district support.

Victor had a similar situation in which he had to proactively exhibit leadership. Having been an established Spanish dual immersion vice-principal for 3 years in a strand model school, Victor was approached by his superintendent with the possibility of designing a permanent Spanish dual immersion school.

So, because they had this school within a school, this dual immersion program, uh, strand, it was very popular. Um, I felt like when the superintendent told me, hey, design the program, I felt like we had a 110% of support. He gave me the support that I needed. And so, he was able to say, hey, let's move this whole school, this, this, this vision that we have. Let's move it to Lincoln (pseudonym) and let's make it a reality. Let's make it the full k-8 school, Spanish dual immersion, all the way from k to eighth grade with science support. And I had, you know, I had some money, I had a, we had money to train the teachers with the dual immersion, send them to conferences. We had money to bring consultants at the County Office of Education that worked with our teachers were on science.

In this instance, Victor showed proactivity to design and implement the development of dual immersion school. Other leaders may have strayed away and avoided the task. However, fueled

by his proactive nature, Victor was able to develop a Spanish K-8 dual immersion school with a science enrichment emphasis.

Proactivity is also necessary for everyday activity tasks. Even though Maria's school has had only 1 year with dual immersion, she has already recruited teachers who are certified and are willing to teach in Spanish. Natanael, wrote in his letter, "Finding quality Spanish teachers is essential. You should be recruiting them 3 to 4 years in advance." Similarly, Lesly has been looking for her next first-grade teachers for the past 2 years.

**Instructional leader in language acquisition.** A revelation occurred as I asked questions about language acquisition. Although I have titled this theme as, "instructional leader in language acquisition", it nonetheless, is not representative of all participants. Half of the participants were strong instructional language leaders while the rest in the pool had poor language acquisition knowledge. This was hard to grasp because one would assume that a leader of a dual immersion school would be versed with language acquisition theories and strategies, however, most principals who were new to the position had a difficult time understanding what the term language acquisition meant. Nonetheless, it is an important theme and vital to understanding the role of a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. Dual immersion school leaders are instructional leaders in the language acquisition process because they hold to faith, are research knowledgeable, and allow translanguaging on campus.

Faith was a topic that was relevant in the area of language acquisition. Natanael stated, "Kids are going to learn to (be) bi-literate in both English and Spanish, a leader has to have faith that this will happen. If a leader doubts, then teachers will lose faith and it becomes a self-fulfilling prophecy." Alongside the same lines, David stated, "And we looked at, when we look at things through a lens of opportunity, we see hope, we see light, we see the way we see

research in action, we follow research, we, we put our faith in research and we take the leap of faith and, uh, we carry ourselves, uh, with, with our chins up and knowing that we're doing the right thing for children.

The topic of faith is also tied to what a leader believes what will occur. The following is what Bob talked about his beliefs:

In order to be a principal who has the motivation to do the right thing, you've got to, you've got to love children no matter who they are. You know, you've got to set aside prejudices that you've had. You know, you've got to want those children to succeed. You've gotta, you've gotta love helping people succeed, helping, uh, disadvantaged children succeed. Uh, that's one of the, the greatest joys that I had. I would see people succeed and you know, because if children find meaning in things, they enjoy it more, they'll participate more or they'll, they speak more deeply. Uh, so that if your curriculum is, is meaningful to the students, they will enjoy it. They'll love learning. They'll love speaking. They'll love, uh, writing even in a foreign language. They will like it. But also, uh, you know, uh, what you believe about people, uh, about children. And number, regardless of who they are. Uh, it, regardless of whether they're disadvantaged or whether they're a different race or a different culture, you know, that really doesn't matter. It doesn't matter. And you've got to feel that in your heart.

Donovan would educate parents, students, and staff about the efficacy of dual immersion.

According to him, “this (dual immersion) is not a social experiment. We are not experimenting; it has been proven.” Maria wrote about faith in her letter. “The faith I have in our students, our program, and our school is there, I know we are doing the best for our Latino and Caucasian students.”

As mentioned, half of the Spanish dual immersion school leaders were knowledgeable in the area of language acquisition. Donovan exemplified a strong knowledge of language acquisition strategies:

So, what I want to make sure that we have is the materials for the students to meet, to use, to scaffold into the next, into the next level. Also, we want to make sure that the teachers are trained in how to teach because we did find that, that they didn't know. It's like, okay, you're going to teach ELD because you have a CLAD (certificate to teach a foreign language). Right. But they didn't know. They didn't know necessarily know how to bring the students up the levels, what was required. Well, it was that academic language? Where were those academic conversations? What was the academic vocabulary that they needed to use? How did we say, how do we marry basically ELD with the classes that we're taking throughout the day? For example, language arts, language arts, yes. But um, social sciences and natural sciences, because that's the language that they're going to be exposed to.

For Donovan, language acquisition at his school meant having a firm grasp about what it takes for students to progress in their interlocation of the language. An important element was the use of academic language throughout core subject areas. Donovan also stressed the use of four domains in language acquisition. “So, we have those four domains, the things speaking, reading or writing and um, and making sure that they were progressing. And there was something that, that, uh, that is not easy, but it's, we have to, we have to do it.”

Another highly knowledgeable administrator in the area of language acquisition was David. For David, language acquisition meant individualized instructional professional development:



Once again, it comes down to modeling. Uh, there's a high emphasis and uh, we, we stress especially, uh, all throughout the grade levels, but primarily in the lower grades, more of a, uh, oral output. We have Kagan strategies that, um, my teachers have received training on and, and we promote that oral discussion. Uh, we go through the learning cycle when we're, they're able to explore different contents we do, uh, number talks. And so, there's, there's an ample opportunity for students to be engaged. And the way I, I develop lessons, like I said earlier, um, I planned them with (teachers), with those outputs in (mind), for our objectives in mind and I model specifically what stages we will be going through. We differentiate instruction based on the individual language production levels in the class. I model what the lessons should be like. So, this is kinda of like I'm front loading the language here and then I'm going to go into this. It's a structured interview, so kind of rapid-fire back and forth (between students) so that the students are feeling more comfortable with the language. These are the sentence frames for those (students) who are requiring and we, uh, will be engaged in developing the curriculum. These are some examples and how to use the sentence frames to afford our output and making, uh, and I'm lessening, um, the affective filter of students, so they'll feel more comfortable in the ELD in second language acquisition. And so, I model, I model these things.

Most of the participants mentioned the need to understand and learn about research in the field of dual immersion. A need to learn about the program was evident in the letters. Dagoberto wrote, "Learn everything you can, before going in." Maria recommended, "It is important to know the research behind dual immersion, it can convince critics, but you have the knowledge about it first." Magdalena wrote, "I would read as much as you can. I am still learning much about dual

immersion.” The writing concentrated on recommending future dual immersion school leaders to understand the intricacies of the program as a way to prepare them for the position. Once again, becoming knowledgeable in the field.

The subject of translanguaging was raised by some when discussing language acquisition. Translanguaging may be characterized as the use of switching between two languages while conversing. This is a common occurrence during language learning as students are using the new language but still may not have a complete vocabulary rapporteur. Administrators were split between the use of translanguaging in the classroom. Those who had more years as administrators had been inculcated in using strict language boundaries within the classroom. That is to say, the Spanish classroom would strictly use Spanish and no other language, and the English class would only use English. This was consistent in the letters. Donovan wrote, “Students should only be using the language of the classroom they are in.” Bob wrote, “It is important students’ use Spanish when they are in the Spanish class.”

Administrators with less experience did not share this view. Instead, they allowed children to speak in both languages at any time. Victor stated, “We allow kids to talk in both languages. You know, uh, they need to communicate, and research tells us to, to let them speak in what language they can.” Maria concurred with this notion:

Students need to practice the language they are learning. In the past, we, uh, uh, forced students to speak a particular language, you can only speak Spanish here or English there.

That is just not the case anymore. We now know, children need to experiment with the language, and we allow to speak both in, uh, all of their classes.

This type of reasoning was also shared by Natanael, “We want children to be comfortable talking and experimenting. They should feel free to talk in any language.”

As mentioned, not all Spanish Elementary principals were knowledgeable or even aware of language acquisition. Three participants, in particular, had to be explained what language acquisition meant. I found recently appointed dual immersion school leaders as less knowledgeable in this area, as well as, school leaders who were mandated to adopt a program they may have not wanted to implement.

### **Research Question Responses**

The purpose of my study was to understand the “essence” of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. Through my quest in this endeavor, a central question was generated. The question being, what are the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals? The answer to this question is developed through a collection of themes. These themes include: Higher purpose-driven, social justice crusader, and proactive stewardship.

**What are the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion principals?** Spanish elementary dual elementary school leaders are higher purpose-driven. They perform their job functions because they seek to impact changes in the lives of disadvantaged children. Bob stated, “Hopefully, I helped students who were like me, poor, and like my siblings mentally handicapped, to have a positive, uh, school experience.” Some of the participants had traumatic experiences as children and they feel the necessity to shelter children from experiences they underwent in their infancy. Natanael stated, “I would wake up at night believing that any day immigration agents would come in at night and take me away, uh, I never wanted any student to feel this way.” By in large, the participants in my study felt that a need to make the world a better place. They felt dual immersion was a perfect program to make this world change occur. Victor stated:

We are making this world a better place. Latino children are learning English and not just conversational language but academic language. English only students are learning Spanish. As a result, children are learning from each other and learning how to get along. Participants believed the program was creating a bridge between two cultures. Maria stated, “It’s wonderful to see children getting along and learning from each other’s culture.”

Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders through their role become social justice crusaders. They view their role as creating equity between Latino students and other students. They do so by closing the achievement gap. Donovan wrote in his letter, “Latino children can succeed. We proved it in our testing. They performed at or above children by the fifth grade.” They seek to provide parity to Latino children. Natanael stated, “We want our Latino children to be competitive with everyone else.” Consistently, David used the phrase, “we want them to kick butt.”

Dual immersion school leaders enhance student learning not just by providing students with access to dual language instruction, but by enhancing instruction through other means. Victor talked about “enhancing students through science, Juan talked about the “whole child” approach and using music to enhance math reasoning and infuse culture. David spoke about “enhancing” the curriculum through curriculum enriching activities that make “instruction more three dimensional.” A way to enhance instruction was to bring learning to life in experiential learning projects. The theme of enhancing student learning as a way of establishing equity or parity was a common thread with the participants.

Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders shared experiences of proactivity as they administered their schools. Bob was a perfect example of proactivity in action. In his quest to bring parity to Latino students, he attended conferences, sought the help from universities,

applied for grants, and eventually brought dual immersion to a district which had no interest in the program. This was evident in Donovan's experience as well, as he was able to bring knowledge of dual immersion and convince his district to approval Spanish dual immersion in four schools. It was evident with Victor, who designed a Spanish dual immersion program with a science emphasis from the ground up. Maria who was given the task to increase her student numbers turned to dual immersion. With her convincing, the school district approved the program despite backlash from the community.

**What occupational challenges do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals face during the administration of a Spanish elementary dual immersion school?** A guiding question of my research dealt with the challenging experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. Specifically, what challenges do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals find in their working lives? Spanish elementary dual immersion schools face a variety of oppositional forces. Some are internal in nature and others are oppositional outside forces.

One of the oppositional forces dual immersion school leaders face is from anti-immigrant groups. Natanael spoke about this, "We had one vocal group who did not want dual immersion in the school, they said we should educate our own." Bob was questioned about teaching illegal immigrant students in his school. David mentioned anti-immigrant groups who do not want illegal immigrants to receive public education. David stated, "There is negativism towards immigrants and immigrant families... they believe we are a mecca or a hub for harboring undocumented families and we service all children regardless of status." School leaders advocate for all students, including undocumented students.

Dual immersion school leaders confront the prevailing identification and the need to feel accepted by the dominant culture. Students in dual immersion are expected to be bi-literate in English and the target language. However, at a certain point, students begin to understand the dominance of the English language and they want to associate with the use of the dominant language. This was evident in Juan's experience with a girl who, at a time, was very proficient in her use of Spanish. Yet in the upper grades, found herself feeling embarrassed to speak Spanish in front of her friends. Similarly, Dagoberto experienced this same identification issue. When he as a child his teacher threatened to send him to the office if he spoke Spanish. But, when he moved to a neighborhood with more diversity, "I found it ok to speak Spanish to my friends. At school, I spoke English and Spanish with my friends." Identification and dominance were a prevalent problem with the recruitment of Spanish speaking teachers. Maria, Magdalena, and Lesly had problems recruiting Spanish teachers that worked in their districts but did not want to teach in a dual immersion school because "they did not want to be associated with teaching Spanish but wanted to be known for teaching English."

Some in the community felt threatened by Spanish dual immersion programs. These community members felt that English should be the only language taught in public schools. Spanish dual immersion school leaders faced backlash from these members. Natanael talked about having to defend the instruction for all students at a board meeting, "We need to teach all students." Maria recalled parents saying, "We don't want our neighborhood to become a Spanish speaking country." Similarly, Donovan stated, "Someone in the meeting said we don't want this to be Mexico." Bob said, "You don't find this type of antagonism with other dual immersion programs. You don't find it in French or Chinese." There exists an anti-Spanish movement rooted in antagonistic feeling towards Latinos. Some of the participants observed the

current political climate of America First has made some people more vocal in their opposition to foreign people, especially from Latin American countries.

As a result of the oppositional challenges posed by teaching Spanish, dual immersion school leaders had to be buffers to protect students, teachers, and parents. School leaders, at times, did not divulge all the oppositional forces who were at work. In Bob's case, he did not communicate about the open opposition from some community members to the staff. Bob said, "They don't need to know who said what about our program, teachers don't need that. I had one teacher actively on Facebook and had to tell her to get off. We don't need to seek out controversies." Donovan protected his teachers by withholding information about the new direction the school district was going:

New board members had gone in, and, uh, and some had received information from people who did not even have kids in the program, it was not good. I kept that to myself.

It is hard enough to be a teacher in dual and I did not want that added stress on them.

This is similar to David's view, "We want to protect our teachers and students from groups that do not have the best intentions."

Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders who administered strand models often buffered the interests of two competing programs. Bob experienced what could be considered a revolt as English teachers complained that "dual immersion was destroying their school." Victor said,

Being in a strand school, there is so much competition, teachers want this in English and Spanish don't have that, sometimes they think you have favorites. But, you don't.

Sometimes, you want to vent but you can't, you hold it in. When the whole school is dual, it is so much easier.

Similarly, Donovan had to withhold testing score results, “I had to protect dual scores when he first started, we, uh, could not compare them to the English only, because, they weren’t going to be equal until later on. And that was the case. By fifth grade, the dual excelled the English scores.”

Dual immersion school leaders faced challenges from their school districts. Problems arose because a disconnect existed between the two. School district demands did not correlate well with the structure of dual immersion schools. Lesly stated, “I don’t think they understand dual schools and how much of a time crunch we have. They want us to test and we just don’t have time to test in both languages for everything.” Bob experienced unrealistic program demands, “They wanted to bring in a program that we had to implement, and it just did not work for the amount of time in the school day.” Natanael stated, “All the district assessments are in English, but our students are learning Math in Spanish, I am not sure if they will do as well as if the assessment would have been made in the language of instruction.” Maria mentioned, “I have a really supportive district, but I know of other colleagues whose school district, there is no wavering. My district understands that we are different, and they give us flexibility. Not all school districts are like that.”

**What benefits do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals find in their working lives?** Another question posed by my study dealt with the benefits of administering a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. The question was, what benefits do Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals find in their working lives? Dual immersion school leaders experienced many benefits as they administered their schools. The benefits they experienced were encapsulated by being culture builders and educational shifters.



Most participants reported that they experienced great satisfaction as students were able to increase their academic achievement as a result of the dual immersion program. Donavan remarked, “It is one thing to give a testimony about what the program’s intended purpose, another, is to, uh, demonstrate it with your own numbers. Numbers don’t lie.” Natanael remarked the joy he witnessed as students performed a play in both English and Spanish. “Little kids in first grade were talking, singing, and dancing in both English and Spanish, everyone was amazed.” David said about his own children, “They have been in the program, and I can tell the difference, the ones who were able to start with it since the beginning are brighter, they can express themselves and think outside the box.” Bob stated, “We were able to turn a school that was the lowest academic title one school in the district to the highest performing title one school.” Dual immersion school leaders shared enthusiasm and relief to be able to enjoy having achieved academic results for students.

Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders experience benefits as they build culture in their schools. A dynamic of Spanish dual immersion programs is the mixing of Latino students with English dominant students. Dual immersion school leaders experienced these two populations coming together and creating a positive interaction within their school. Maria experienced joy as she wrote about students who had participated in cultural events, “My student was so happy to have his mom help in the event, the other parents thanked her for bringing food. White and Hispanics coming together brings joy.” Juan talked about the cultural exchanges in the school, “At one of our events, a parent comes up to me and says, thank you for showcasing our culture’s talent.” Victor and Bob talked about students helping each other in class. Bob remarked, “We have two cultures coming together and helping each other, dual immersion does that.” Victor stated, “The English students help the Latino students when they are in the English

class and the Spanish help them in the Spanish class.” Magdalena stated, “We have students who get along here at the school, we don’t have any problems.” Dagoberto continued this line, “Students in the dual immersion strand behave, for the most part, they seem happy and are dedicated to their work, I usually get to see students from the regular side (strand model with traditional school) in my office.”

Along with the commentary, all participants shared pictures in their photo narratives of students who were getting along together or involved in a cultural event. Magdalena had a picture of students participating in the dance festival. Natanael had pictures of students from different cultures participating in a math activity. David had a picture of students from different cultures playing together. Maria showed a picture of students celebrating a Day of the Dead celebration. Lesly showed a picture of a debate team strategizing with each other. The piece was an action shot with diverse students crouched around.

The bonding of the two cultures also contributed to positive school culture. Magdalena stated, “When I came here, I didn’t know what to expect but there everyone is so welcoming and nice, it’s one of the best schools I’ve been at.” Bob stated, “The superintendent came and said there is a positive culture here, it is just good.” Maria remarked, “At first no one knew how the school would change with dual immersion, but we feel closer to each other. Teachers have to plan in advance and really take a look at the curriculum, it’s great.” Lesly stated, “Teachers have really bonded with each other.” Natanael mentioned, “Teachers are committed to dual immersion.” This was reinforced with the comment from David, “Dual immersion brings teachers together and builds them into a cohesive unit that defend the program when it needs to be done.”

Another added benefit experienced by dual immersion school leaders is the increased cultural sensitivity and awareness from staff. Natanael expressed the manner in which some teachers changed their understanding as to how their perspective of Latino children had changed:

A teacher told me in confidence, I once thought some Latino children had little knowledge. But, now that I can see them in class helping other children who are struggling in Spanish, I understand that they come with knowledge but could, not, not express themselves in English.

In this exchange, the teacher was able to understand more in-depth on how speaking Spanish helped Latino children become engaged in class.

**How do Spanish elementary dual immersion principals apply transformational leadership as they face these challenges?** Another guiding question of my study dealt with transformational leadership. I ruminated about how Spanish elementary dual immersion principals apply transformational leadership as they face challenges in their schools? My study found profound instances where dual immersion school leaders experienced transformational changes through their leadership.

Dual immersion school leaders lead and experienced an educational paradigm shift. Turning a monolingual school into a school where students are taught two languages requires individually changing the mind of all stakeholders. Dual immersion school leaders shifted district level heads towards dual immersion. Bob exemplified this shift. Through hard work and proactivity, he was able to procure the funding necessary to implement a Spanish dual immersion program. Even when the superintendent threatened to close down the program because of teacher complaints, Bob insisted she come and visit the school. The visit convinced the superintendent of the program's worth. This was also evident in the leadership of Donovan. He

visited an educational conference, visited schools, and then went to his district to propose the curricular change. Loaded with ideas and enthusiasm, he was able to transform four elementary schools into Spanish dual immersion schools. Even when new district personnel and board members were set on reverting all 4 dual immersion programs, his school was able to survive. Donovan explained, “We wanted to inform them and educate them because they had been given so much outside information and it was not true.” David spoke about a “curricular shift,” a shift that included second language learning and enhanced education through “making the curriculum three dimensional.” It was evident in the way Victor spoke individually to parents, “I let them know that they are in it for the long haul, you’ll see these benefits until fifth grade.” Maria spoke to “enriching students through language.” Natanael continued this notion, “We are producing students who will be cognitively enhanced through language learning. A portion of their brain will be heightened in understanding the nuances of language.”

### **Summary**

The aim of this chapter was to present the generated themes based on data collection of 10 participants. As a start, I described the 10 participants who I recruited for my study. Selective data analysis was performed on three different forms of data which included semi-structured interviews, photo narratives, and written letters to future dual immersion school leaders. The data was grouped into themes based on participant commonalities to arrive at the “essence” of what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. From the data analysis, eight themes surfaced. They included: Higher purpose-driven, social justice crusader, proactive stewardship, always on the defense, buffer, culture builder, educational shifter, and instructional leader in language acquisition. A rich description of each theme was developed and supported by participant quotes. Further, this chapter answered the central and

guiding questions guiding this study. As a result, my study found evidence that Spanish elementary dual immersion schools' leaders are people who cultivate culture, help students achieve parity, defend their schools from oppositional forces, buffer their stakeholders from unnecessary stressors, and help effectuate an educational paradigm shift.

## **CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION**

### **Overview**

The purpose of my study is to understand the leadership experiences shared by Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. Currently, Latino students have an academic achievement gap. By understanding the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders, my study aims to provide leadership guidance to current and future school leaders who are tasked with administering Spanish dual immersion schools. This chapter provides a summary of the findings of my study. As well, I provide a summary of the findings and discuss the implication of the findings with relevant literature and theory. In addition, the implications of my study are discussed. Finally, this chapter concludes with the delimitations, limitations, and recommendations for future research.

### **Summary of Findings**

The central question I asked in my study is what are the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders? I found that Spanish elementary school leaders share common experiences relating to the shared phenomenon of administering and leading a school where two languages are taught. I found dual immersion leaders are higher purpose-driven. Their shared childhood trauma propels them to provide a better educational environment for young children. Dual immersion school leaders have proactive experiences. They do not wait for things to land on their lap, instead, they initiate change. Due to selected oppositional forces, such as anti-immigrant and English only sentiments, Spanish dual immersion school leaders are constantly defending their stakeholders and the program. In their aim to defend, Spanish dual immersion school principals act like a buffer from school districts and outside oppositional forces. They often hold back information to protect parents, students,

and staff. Spanish dual immersion school leaders experience cultural building as two cultures Latino and English only populations come together and help each other learn each other's language. Lastly, I found Spanish dual immersion school leaders experienced educational paradigm change as they transform monolingual school settings into bilingual places of learning.

Another question I posed in my study pertained to the challenges of administering and leading Spanish elementary dual immersion schools. School leaders faced external and internal challenges. Outside oppositional forces aimed to dismantle Spanish dual immersion schools. Individuals who associated themselves with anti-immigrant sentiments and English-only movements were vocal oppositional forces. Internal opposition came from a divisions in strand model schools. When two differing curricular models were implemented within a school, teacher conflict arose. Internal problems arose in schools were a central district office disconnect existed.

In my study, I also asked what benefits do Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders experience? I found that school leaders found joy as the curricular program goals were fulfilled. Students in the program were able to achieve academically, become bi-literate by the fifth grade, and increase cultural acceptance and tolerance.

### **Discussion**

The purpose of my study was to understand the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. With the aim of improving the educational experience of Latino/a students, my research provided a deep rich description of the leadership experiences, challenges, and benefits of administering a Spanish elementary school. Current and future school leaders may find valuable insights from the experiences of the 10 participants. My hope

is that current and future school leaders may learn from the participants' experience and apply leadership attributes in their schools which may provide positive student outcomes.

### **Theoretical Findings**

My study used the transformational leadership lens to examine the assumed leadership style of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. In my study I assumed that Spanish dual immersion leaders used transformational leadership elements as they changed traditional monolingual schools into bilingual pedagogical constructs. The question posed by my study was, do Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders use transformational leadership in their working lives? For most of the participants in my study, the answer to that question is yes. Participants in my study shared experiences which provided evidence of the use of the four elements of transformational leadership as they administer their school site. My study addresses a gap in the transformational leadership literature because for the first-time evidence exists aligning Spanish dual immersion leaders to the use of transformational leadership.

Consistent with transformational leadership literature, Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders unite stakeholders for a common good (Ronald, 2014). Because Spanish dual immersion school leaders faced childhood trauma in the form of discrimination and poverty, their aim is consistent with the impetus of a transformational leader. According to Ronald (2014), the transformational leader unites a group by shifting their individual self-interest towards a common goal. For the Spanish dual immersion school leader, they have a higher purpose in mind. They seek to ameliorate the conditions of disadvantaged Latino children. Consistent with Ronald (2014), they work with teachers to close the achievement gap and bring equity to academically challenged children. Stoessel (2013) discussed the struggles to unite stakeholders. Using the four elements of transformational leadership, Spanish dual immersion



leaders unite stakeholders against oppositional forces. The four facets of transformational leadership are charisma, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration (Bass 1990; Burns, 1978). The following sections discussed the four facets of transformational leadership and how they are used by the participants in my study.

An element of transformational leadership is the use of charisma (Fiol, Harrice & House, 1999). Some of the participants were very charismatic as they shared their experiences. Presented here are the participants who exemplified this charismatic leadership trait. Dagoberto, Juan, Bob, David, Natanael, Donovan, Victor, and Maria demonstrated charismatic elements in their interview answers and in the interview itself. One of the most charismatic individuals was Dagoberto. During the interview, I wrote the following in my researcher journal:

Dagoberto was calm during the interview. He was constantly smiling, using his hands to convey meaning. His voice tones ranged from high to low to emphasize his words. He seemed relaxed and confident as he spoke.

This was also evident in the manner in which Juan conducted himself through the interview. Juan used his hands to communicate often using gestures to emphasize and deemphasize meaning in his communication. Bob wrote in his letter, “An administrator of a dual immersion school has to have passion and charisma to get other people excited about the program.”

David and Natanael demonstrated charisma but in a different way. The passion shared by the participants was tangible. The following is what I wrote in my research journal:

David had a strong belief in improving the life of Latino children. He was very animated, and I could sense his passion and the joy he had to see kids “kick butt” after having met success.

Natanael's eyes opened widely as he discussed his school. He shared his experiences with passion as he told me of the wonderful activities they were having at his school. Both participants were very happy to share their experiences, especially the academic gains students had made.

Maria demonstrated joy as she talked. Each question that I posed was like if she had a story to share. She was emotional when she discussed how students from different backgrounds were getting along. Juan had a special talent of talking extensively, shifting his voice, and being passionate about Latino students. Here is what I wrote about Victor in my research journal:

It seemed to me that Victor's eyes smiled every time he was excited to share the good things that were happening at his school. They open really wide as if they laughed.

Together these eight individuals showed signs of charisma. They passionately talked about their school, they modulated their voice to emphasize meaning, they constantly smiled and were energetic and excited about their role as Spanish dual immersion administrators.

Inspirational motivation is an element of transformational leadership (Khanin, 2007; Thrash, 2012). All participants demonstrated inspirational motivation. This was evident in the interactions they had with their staff. Bob noted, "I tell my staff, we are here for students. We want to see them succeed at higher levels." Natanael recounted a staff meeting in which he recounted his immigrant story as a means to motivate school personnel:

I told my staff my immigrant experience and not being good enough as the other students. It took a while for me to get to the point where I wasn't in the remedial group. It was in sixth grade where I felt I belonged because I was able to, uh, perform like everyone else. I told my teachers to strive to get our students to achieve and to feel good about coming to school.

Juan talked about how he has some teachers who had left the school for various reasons would come back to thank him, “They come back and tell me how motivational I was and how I inspired them to educate children.”

Victor and Maria inspired their staff through praise. Victor recalled, “I go into classroom first thing in the morning and tell them all the positive things they are doing.” Maria coincided with this procedure, “Each morning, I walk in and observe and get inspired by what I see, and I let teachers know, how excited it was to go into their classroom.” All participants had similar stories about how they were able to stimulate their staff to achieve a higher purpose.

Part of the trait of a transformational leader is to offer intellectual stimulation to those who are in the organization (Bass, Avolio, Jung & Benson, 2003). Spanish dual immersion school leaders offer intellectual stimulation consistent with transformational leadership. Donovan was very consistent with this, “We train our teachers, and we discuss achievement in our PLC’s so that everyone can learn from each other.” David was adamant about what he termed as thinking “outside the box.” “We don’t want teachers to do the things just to do them, we want to challenge them to think outside of the box and make learning engaging and three dimensional.” Natanael spoke about their venture of establishing action research circles around dual immersion. “We have grouped teachers and they think of what theory they want to put into practice around a problem of practice. Teachers don’t like it at first but later like to listen to what went right in the action research.” Victor talked about using professional learning communities (PLC) to stimulate teachers to discuss areas of improvement and to get advice from other teachers. “Teachers learn from the teachers who are achieving high results, they model lessons.” Juan said, “I want all my teachers to be leaders, uh, they are leaders, so I give them opportunities around that. I give them leadership tasks, presentations around staff, and special

projects because I want them to, to grow as a leader.” Spanish dual immersion school leaders demonstrated intellectual stimulation of their staff consistent with the literature.

Transformational leaders work with individual stakeholders to make progress. For Spanish dual immersion principals, this task is dependent on the individual needs. They work with parents to educate them about the program. Donovan provided examples of this, “We had to sit down with parents and explain to them. This is not a social experiment, uh, it is a commitment. It will take until the fifth grade, but your child will be bi-literate.” In this example, Donovan would speak individually to parents who were jittery about the academic progress of their student around 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> grade. Maria did likewise, “I had parents who would say, my student is not speaking Spanish and they have been in the program for 3 years and, and I would have to show them their reading scores and tell them, look at this, they are reading and answering reading comprehension questions, they know Spanish.”

Individual consideration is part of building a solid faculty for Spanish dual immersion school principals. David, “I model for teachers individually, spend the time, so they feel comfortable with what they will be doing.” Donovan said, “You meet with teachers and I try to have them see their important role.” Bob stated, “Dual immersion requires principals to reach out individually, each teacher needs to understand and have faith in the program.” Natanael remarked, “I try to visit classrooms each day and motivate teachers and support them the best I can.”

Individual consideration then compliments the organization as a whole. Bob remarked the following:

One thing about dual immersion is that it brings teachers together. They become a solid unit. As a principal, I got to choose my teachers, I, uh, uh, had committees of teachers, of

course. But, in the end, the decision was mine to make. I always tried to choose the teachers I could work with. Who would work with the staff and had a passion for the program and Latino children? And when, when you get that going for each teacher, then you are an unstoppable force.

Spanish dual immersion school leaders build their teachers individually and this adds to a cohesive culture.

My study also utilized the theory of second language acquisition (Krashen, 1982) and interdependence hypothesis (Cummins, 1979) as a theoretical guide because a major curricular goal of Spanish dual immersion programs is to build biliteracy in two languages. My study found that half of the participants were knowledgeable about the language acquisition process and half the respondents struggled to describe the language acquisition process at their school site.

Some Spanish dual immersion school leaders understood the language acquisition process in their school. Natanael had an understanding of the nature of progression in language acquisition which is consistent with Krashen's (1982) theory of second language acquisition. Natanael stated, "Teachers understand the silent period some students go through, we wait for them to progress along, some, some, may last a year a more without saying a word, which is OK." This was consistent with Donovan's view, "I had some students who were able to speak Spanish so fast, Caucasian children who were had this language gift, others took more time." Bob talked about the need to infuse more Spanish into the school setting:

Learning English was very easy for students whose native language was Spanish, just because, because English is so predominant, but it took longer for everyone to learn Spanish. If I would do it all over again, I would use infuse more Spanish throughout the

day and throughout the school. Students need to hear more of it because English is so dominant everywhere else.

David talked about giving students ample opportunity for students to “practice their oral output” of the language they are learning. Maria was astonished by the progress students made throughout the grade levels, “It is amazing to see some of these students expressing themselves in Spanish in the upper grades.” Dagoberto said, “When parents walk into the upper-grade classrooms they are astonished.” These experiences are consistent with a natural order hypothesis as theorized by Krashen (1982) whereby students’ language acquisition increases from simple to complex. As students progressed through the grade levels, they were able to increase their locution in the target language.

Another manner in which Krashen’s theory played into the experiences of Spanish dual immersion school leaders was the emphasis in providing comprehensible input with an added amount of rigor. David was particularly adept in articulating this view:

We provide lessons where there’s ample opportunities for students to be engaged. With those objectives in mind, we develop objectives in in mind that model specifically the language acquisition stages we want to target. We front load the language and structure our students’ conversations so that students feel comfortable with the (language). We use sentence frames for those who require it and more open-ended assignments for those who are more proficient.

Donovan talked about how teachers in the classroom make things comprehensible:

If you walk into our classrooms, you’ll see lots of visuals on the walls. Teacher’s allowing students to repeat, using gestures, pantomiming, uh, it’s fun to see them doing some of the things.

Bob remarked about being amazed at how one of his teachers used writing as a means to build comprehension:

Um, well I believe writing is a very good tool. Probably the most powerful tool that we have. Uh, I remember one teacher teaching students about, uh, bats and they wrote a report about that. And I remember one little girl, an English-speaking girl of a school administrator from the district. Now this is in second grade, she wrote about a five-page report about bats in Spanish and she could read it. Um, so writing is a very powerful tool for them because, if you can write something down you know, you can, it's verifiable of what you know. He had high expectations, expectations for speaking the language.

Spanish dual immersion school leaders' experiences aligned with the interdependence hypothesis as theorized by Cummins (1979). Dual immersion school leaders experienced the transfer of knowledge between one language to another as well as understanding the need to develop academic language proficiency. Natanael expressed it well:

Um, what I have noticed, um, is that students who do well in their native language, do well in the target language. It seems to me if that an emphasis has to be learning your first language really well. And, and, we see that. Students coming into school who are reading in Spanish and talking well will pick up the English extremely quickly, the same is true for English students who are literate in English, they will be learning Spanish quickly as well. It is when they are not literate or have, um, limited vocabulary and cannot express themselves in their first language when we find it is difficult.

Donovan and Victor talked about infusing academic vocabulary. Victor stated, "We designed our school with Spanish-science emphasis because we wanted students to use the academic vocabulary to learn the content. Instead of using the content to learn the vocabulary." Donovan

remarked, “We get students to move from the conversational language and to use content-specific academic vocabulary. This is what we want to be using and have professional developments to show our teachers how to do that.” These experiences by these administrators are consistent with applying Cummins (1979) interdependence hypothesis.

### **Emperical**

My study adds to the body of empirical literature on the subject of dual immersion school leadership. Currently, a gap exists as limited studies have been completed to understand what experiences are shared by Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. My study has been a breath of fresh air as it provides a glimpse as to what it means to lead a school where two languages are taught. Unlike traditional monolingual school settings, dual immersion schools have unique challenges. In more specific terms, Spanish dual immersion programs face oppositional forces which aim to dismantle it. As a result, my study does not hold back in its treatment of its oppositional forces. Participants in the study were very open to talking about race, discrimination, and opposition. My study gives an accurate picture of the struggles Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders face every day in an effort to give clearer guidance to future school leaders who are tasked with this curricular model.

My study corroborated areas of the current empirical research and added to the existing literature by adding breadth and knowledge. A “deep rich” description of what it means to be a Spanish elementary school principal revealed insights that have not been evident in the current research. Using the hermeneutic phenomenological approach provided this new insight into this educational role in which little research has been performed.

My study confirmed current research about Spanish dual immersion school leaders. Consistent with Schwabsky (2013), my study found Spanish dual immersion school leaders



encounter problems that are unique to dual immersion. My study found Spanish immersion school leaders are constantly attempting to build culture as a means of combatting internal and external oppositional forces. Participants in my study were culture builders who understood the need to establish a cohesive group who eventually would stick together to fight against oppositional forces intending to dismantle the program. Consistent with Whitacre (2015), some participants felt a disconnect between the school and the central district office. They felt the district office did not understand the program, were inflexible, and at times were external oppositional forces. In addition, principals in my study who were mandated to implement dual immersion, in other words, did not have a say in how to run their school, felt the office did not provide them with the necessary support to accomplish their role.

Menken and Solorza (2015) discussed the difficulty in maintaining Spanish dual immersion school. My study confirms the difficulty Spanish dual immersion school leaders face as they encounter internal and external oppositional forces with the intent of disintegrating the program. Some faced internal forces in the form of parents and teachers, Bob recalled English teachers complaining to the superintendent about how “dual immersion was tearing their school apart.” Other spoke about their experiences with outside oppositional forces in the form of anti-immigrant groups and English only advocates.

At times, the internal forces at play are the school leaders themselves. Menken and Solorza (2015) found school principals who eliminated their bilingual programs because of pressure to do well on standardized tests and lack of sufficient program knowledge. My study found a couple of participants who were leaning towards shifting their school-wide implementation of Spanish dual immersion to a strand model. I consider the shift as a form of downgrading the availability of the program to the entire student population. Both participants

lacked sufficient pedagogical knowledge or faith that students would be score well by fifth grade.

Similar to the findings of Hunt (2011), my study found that successful dual immersion school leaders had a shared mission, shared leadership, flexibility, and trust. All of the participants in my study were able to successfully identify the program's mission of creating bi-literate students, increasing cultural sensitivity and awareness, and achieving academic success. Some but not all of the participants had shared leadership structures with grade-level chairs who participated in the decision-making process. Similarly, some participants were flexible with their staff and had faith in academic achievement by fifth grade. Study participants shared many experiences about “having faith” and convincing others to have faith.

My study did not concur with Hickman and Garcia (2014), all participants, even those considering downgrading the program towards a strand model, did not favor academics over culture. All participants viewed the cultural component as necessary even when they knew very little about cultural celebrations.

Inconsistent with the research findings of Forman (2016), all participants ensured teachers were adhering to program fidelity. School leaders in my study mentioned the need to go into the classroom and require teachers to instruct in the language with the correct delivery intervals. This does not mean that teachers may have strayed away from program fidelity, but this was not evident with the experiences of participants when classrooms were observed.

My study corroborated what Schwabsky (2013) termed as “non-routine problems.” Problems of interpersonal communication existed in the experience of one participant, Lesly. She mentioned Spanish teachers had days to collaborate with other Spanish teachers in the district and had little collaboration between English only teachers from the same grade level. All

participants spoke about the curricular difficulty Spanish teachers faced. Participants spoke to the lack of Spanish materials and professional development. A non-routine problem expressed by all participants in my study was the difficulty in hiring qualified Spanish teachers. Strand model administrators also reported difficulty in juggling two curriculum program offerings.

All dual immersion school principals who were able to experience Spanish dual immersion students testing in fifth grade reported students' performance was at or above comparable students who did not participate in the program. This was consistent with the findings of Steele, et al. (2015). Spanish dual immersion school leaders expressed relief and joy as students accomplished the intended academic achievement goal of the program. Strand model administrators reported difficulty in sharing fifth-grade test results with everyone because it raised a concern about the discrepancy between the dual immersion and English only strand.

A shift in teacher perceptions of Latino students was reported in my study. This is consistent with Garza (2015) as teacher perceptions shifted as students from low socioeconomic backgrounds increased their participation in class. School leaders in my study had teachers expressing their cultural shift as they witnessed students react to the school environment in their own language. Teachers perception students changed as they encountered students be active contributors in Spanish classes.

A divide existed in participants regarding the topic of translanguaging. Experienced participants recommended strict adherence to the language of the classroom. That is, students should only speak Spanish in the Spanish class and likewise only speak English in the English class. However, less experienced Spanish dual immersion school leaders allowed students to speak in their native tongue and the target language at any time. This may have to do with the shift in educational research around the strict use of language in dual immersion programs and

consistent with Ascenzi-Moreno et al. (2015) and the difficulty of some principals in making the language shift.

Many issues were reported by Spanish dual immersion administrators in my study. The phrase “a school within a school” was reported by the participants and consistent with DeNicolo (2016) findings. Further, the strand model was termed as a “chasm.” Participants in my study reported competition between the two curricular programs, lack of communication, and a sense of distrust. Spanish dual immersion leaders reported a sense of distrust directed at the school leader. In one instance, English teachers promoting the disintegration of the program.

Contrary to the findings of Linholm-Leary (2018), Spanish dual immersion leaders did not report accountability and curricular challenges. All of the participants spoke about actively observing classrooms. They questioned the increased accountability, one participant wondering, “are we just testing or are we going to instruct.” Linholm-Leary (2018) found time given to each language a problem. In my study, participants experienced time as a problem but not because the target language was not given its fair share. Rather, participants expressed Spanish teachers did not have enough time throughout the day to teach all of the curriculum they are expected to cover.

My study was consistent with Arroyo-Romano (2106) who reported teacher shortage and preparation problems. Spanish dual immersion leaders had a difficult time recruiting teachers for the program. Some of this stemmed from a lack of teacher candidates. In other instances, capable Spanish teachers did not want to teach Spanish because they wanted to associate themselves with the dominant culture. Problem with teachers’ Spanish language ability was also reported. Some considered the Spanish skills of teachers to be subpar to the linguistic

requirements of their grade. As Dagoberto stated, “A parent came in and told me that her daughter’s teacher does not speak Spanish very well and what did we need to do to change that.”

My study provided new insight into Spanish elementary dual immersion school leadership. One important new finding is the leadership impetus of these school leaders. Spanish dual immersion school leaders have an emotional drive to provide a better life for disadvantaged school populations. Specifically, they seek to ameliorate the conditions that impact Latino students. That is, they have a strong desire to lift Latinos out of poverty, seek a brighter future, and attain academic achievement. All of the participants had obtained this drive because they themselves suffered through childhood trauma in one form or another. The trauma was experience through discrimination, poverty, and disability. Participants had an intense desire to provide a better schooling environment so as to avoid similar childhood challenges for the students in their school.

### **Implications**

My study has broad implications for current and future school leaders who are tasked with administering a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. Findings from my research have theoretical, empirical, and practical applications. In this section, I analyze how my research findings are applicable to these areas and suggest recommendations for current and future Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders.

### **Theoretical**

Theoretically, my study solidifies and expands upon the theoretical frameworks used in my study. My study was able to link Spanish elementary school leadership experiences to the use of transformational leadership. Participants in my study used all four facets of transformational leadership and their experiences were consistent with their use. Because

Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders need to rapidly transform monolingual schools into bilingual schools, current and future candidates must be openly aware, not just subconsciously, of how to implement transformational leadership with various stakeholders. I would recommend district personnel who are contemplating the implementation of Spanish dual immersion program provide transformational leadership training to school leaders.

The ability to be fully aware of how to apply transformational leadership to certain situations may have avoided the conflict and disintegration of programs in certain school districts. I am thinking of Bob and Donovan, had Bob understood early on that he needed to provide individualized attention, even to teachers who were in the English only strand, could he have avoided teacher mutiny? Or could Donovan had understood how to apply inspirational motivation to create a cohesive unit so as to provide defense against district oppositional forces. Could this have avoided the disintegration of the program in three schools?

My study solidifies Krashen's and Cummins' language acquisition theories. All administrators in my study reported students were able to acquire language. The curricular goal of achieving bi-literacy were attained by the fifth grade. My study confirms and adds to the body of research promoting bilingual learning as a means of developing the academic language necessary for populations who have limited locution in their primary language. It is my recommendation that Spanish dual immersion school leaders and teachers receive constant professional development to further their knowledge in the area of language acquisition. Along with this recommendation, is the need for policy makers to consider the implementation of dual immersion curricular programs a necessity. Latino populations are on the rise, they often face problems within the school system. Spanish dual immersion has been deemed to be effective and my research confirmed academic results. It is recommended that policy makers think about

the future of Latino populations in their state and fight oppositional forces who either do not understand the pedagogical necessity or are aware and oppose it nonetheless.

My study also has implications for the use of translanguaging in Spanish dual immersion schools. Half of the school leaders had accepted the use of both languages in any time as an acceptable practice. However, seasoned and retire school leaders had not. As new research is being conducted, what is the language acquisition practice to implement? Once again, my recommendation is to provide the latest applicable language acquisition research to principals and staff.

### **Empirical**

Empirically, my study has implications for stakeholders who are involved in Spanish dual immersion schools. My study covered many topics and vast information regarding all aspects of Spanish dual immersion schools. In this section, I explicated the empirical implications for administrators and teachers.

Future and current Spanish dual immersion school leaders through my study can learn several empirical takeaways. One of the most important takeaways is the nature of school leaders who opt to assume this role. School leaders who are not adept in resolving conflict, holding information confidentially, have little understanding of the language acquisition process, or have a difficult time with culture should think twice before taking the job offer. Spanish dual immersion school leaders have passion to ameliorate the academic as well as temporal conditions of students. As they do so, they show transformational traits which aim to lift all stakeholders to achieve a higher goal. In this role, Spanish dual elementary school leaders aim to bring social justice and equity to disadvantaged student populations.

My study may be the first of its kind to gather the experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. By using the Hermeneutic phenomenology, my study was able to describe what it means to be a person in this role. It is not an easy job. Oppositional forces, external and internal are constantly at bay. However, for those school leaders who have vision and a spine will be able to benefit from the academic achievement results of students who may have been forgotten or diserved by the current pedagogical construct.

My study has implications for teachers. Since the occupational responsibility of a Spanish dual immersion school principal is so great, teachers can use the information contained in this study and be able to better understand, be supportive, and avoid conflict in Spanish dual immersion schools. I certainly hope teachers can stay true to the program's language fidelity and to refrain from teaching English because they feel the pressure to perform well on year end tests. I also recommend teachers to find ways to be kinder and united, especially in strand model schools.

### **Practical**

My study has implication for future and current Spanish dual immersion school leaders. As noted in my study, half of the respondents lacked the necessary language acquisition knowledge to understand how to increase students' locution of primary and target languages. School leaders in the program cannot be deficient in this area. It is my recommendation that Spanish dual immersion school leaders become knowledgeable about second language acquisition. Along with pedagogical knowledge, Spanish dual immersion school leaders may avoid internal and external oppositional forces by being aware of the facets of transformational leadership. Specifically, Spanish dual immersion school leaders may benefit from understanding the frame braking process. Future and inexperienced Spanish dual immersion leaders need to



have faith as part of their leadership responsibilities. It is my recommendation that school leaders understand current immersion school academic literature and be able to articulate the information to all stakeholders. In addition to understanding the research, school leaders must be able to cope with the internal and external oppositional forces many Spanish dual immersion programs face. I recommend future and current school leaders be trained in conflict management techniques.

### **Delimitations and Limitations**

Spanish dual immersion school leadership is a vast topic to study. Although, Spanish dual immersion programs are found in the elementary, junior, and high schools school settings, my study was confined to study school leaders who administered Spanish elementary schools. My decision to choose the educational leaders from the elementary school setting over other educational levels has to do with implementation differences between the higher and lower grades. Whereas elementary schools teach Spanish half of the day or every other day, junior and high school teach the language in periods. Strand models are also more heavily used in the junior and high school levels as opposed to primary schools. As well, the decision to choose elementary school leaders had to do with my level of comfort with primary schools. I have had 23 years' experience dealing with elementary school systems. Although I do have some junior and high school knowledge it pales in comparison to my level of comfort with primary schools. Thus, I made the decision to stick with what I know best.

My study utilized a phenomenological approach over other methods because previous research methods have been used extensively in this area. Two research methods have dominated current dual immersion research. The overreliance on quantitative or qualitative case studies on this topic, it seems to me, limit the breadth of findings. Rather, I specifically used the

qualitative hermeneutic approach because I wanted to understand the experiences of Spanish dual immersion school principals. I believe my study provides a more accurate picture of their lives because their experiences are at the heart of my study.

My study contained limitations. The findings of my study may only be applicable to the area of study. My research recruited participants in the Southwestern portion of the United States. Specifically, the Spanish dual immersion school leaders were recruited from Central and Southern California, and the Southern tip of Utah. Participants in other areas of the United States or the world may yield different results. As mentioned in previous chapters, the data analyzed in my study is subject to my biases. I have participated in Spanish dual immersion programs and have first-hand knowledge and experience. This knowledge may or may not have tainted my analysis of the data. Nonetheless, it my belief that my “insider knowledge” provides more breadth and insight compared to someone who may be learning about it for the first time. Another limitation of the study is the heterogeneous nature of the curricular program structures. A wide degree of program implementation variance existed. Some participants administered strand models, others were full, some had a 50/50 model, and others were 90/10. Program variations from participants’ schools may have yielded different results if participants administered the same type of dual immersion program structure.

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

In light of the limitations and delimitations, I recommend further research be conducted using the same Hermeneutical approach to different school settings. The study could be replicated in the junior and high school level to compare my study’s findings with these two higher level educational settings. As well, future research may want to focus on one form of Spanish dual immersion. For example, selecting participants from only one type, full immersion

or partial. Another recommendation for future research would be to conduct the same kind of study in different geographic areas in the United States.

My study raised several questions around Spanish dual immersion. One of them dealt with the cooperation between district office personnel and Spanish dual immersion school leaders. Since my research did not consider the perspective the central district office personnel, future research could shed more light into how they feel as they encounter dual immersion issues.

Participants in my study were very willing to talk about race openly. Although the topic of race was raised, the depth of which race was treated may be superficial. A research study to understand the dynamics that only race play into Spanish dual immersion schools would be an insightful and interesting research study.

### **Summary**

Latino/a students face academic challenges. Spanish dual immersion school programs have been demonstrated to positively impact the educational achievement of Latino/a students. With three encompassing goals, Spanish dual immersion schools aim to provide all students with academic achievement, biliteracy in English and in Spanish, and creating cultural awareness and acceptance. Research studies have primarily focused on the program's educational efficacy, challenges, and benefits. Limited research exists in the area of leadership. My study aimed to address the need to provide insights into the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders.

Through the utilization of a phenomenological hermeneutic approach, my study shed light on what it means to be a Spanish dual immersion school leader. My study utilized two theoretical frameworks, transformational leadership and Theory of Second Language Acquisition

and Interdependence Hypothesis in which to analyze the phenomenon. My study recruited 10 Spanish dual immersion school leaders. Three different data were collected a means to triangulate and arrive at the essence of what it means to be a Spanish dual immersion school leader. Interviews, photo narratives, and letter writings were conducted and collected from the 10 participants. Using selective data analysis, I was able to code and formulate themes and subthemes. Through my data analysis, eight themes emerged that encompassed what it means to be a Spanish dual immersion school leader. These themes included: Higher purpose-driven, social justice crusader, proactive stewardship, always on the defense, buffer, culture builder, educational shifter, and instructional leader in language acquisition.

My study posed three different research questions as a means of understanding the leadership experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. Central to my research was the leadership experiences of the 10 participants. Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders seek to ameliorate the conditions of disadvantaged Latino/a students. All of the participants had experienced childhood traumas in the form of poverty, discrimination, or disability. For the participants, their occupational calling was to provide students with the educational experiences needed to avoid such pain. They aimed to lift disadvantaged students by closing the achievement gap. They proactively seek to enhance students' learning. Further, they defend their stakeholders from internal and external oppositional forces. They withhold and buffer information in attempts to protect their stakeholders. As well, they are educational shifters who transform monolingual to bilingual learning structures. As they do this, they also build culture in their schools.

Spanish elementary dual immersion school principals face different challenges. Internal and external forces impact the program's future. Active external oppositional forces, English-

only proponents and anti-immigrant groups, aim to disintegrate Spanish dual immersion programs. Internal tensions may exist within strand model schools. Spanish dual immersion principals counteract oppositional forces by building positive school culture and buffering stakeholders from problems.

Spanish dual immersion school leaders encounter benefits that bring joy as they administering their school sites. These benefits are tied to the three encompassing goals of the program. Students in dual immersion schools achieve at or above their peers in standardized tests by the fifth grade. They become biliterate in two languages. This means they are able to listen, speak, and write fluently in their primary and target language. Another joy comes from building a positive school culture. As children from different cultures help each other learn each others' language, they form a bond. But, this is not limited to students, all stakeholders develop awareness and appreciation for each other.

My study has implications for all stakeholders in a Spanish elementary dual immersion school. These implications revolve around preparation. School leaders need to be prepared to helm dual immersion schools. It is highly recommended that leadership preparation programs provide training in several areas such as transformational leadership, conflict management, cultural sensitivity and awareness, and second language acquisition. Another key recommendation is that districts with large Latino/a populations have students' interests in mind. Educational research has documented the academic success of Latino/a students who have participated in dual immersion schools, district leaders and school board members should seriously consider implementing Spanish dual immersion programs.

What does this all really mean? What is it like to be a Spanish dual immersion school principal? The perfect example of this is my good friend Bob. Here was a man who is

Caucasian, not a Latino, who dedicated his life to Latino students. He is the semblance of what it means to be a Spanish dual immersion school leader. It is to care deeply about students, to make create equity and social justice, and do good in the world. It is to be able to receive the epiphany that all children have a right to receive the best education possible and have a brighter future.

## REFERENCES

- Abedi, J. (2006). Psychometric issues in the ELL assessment and special education eligibility. *Teachers College Record*, 108(11), 2282-2303. doi:10.1111/j.1467-9620.2006.00782.x
- Abramson, C. I. (2013). Problems of teaching the behaviorist perspective in the cognitive revolution. *Behavioral Sciences (2076-328X)*, 3(1), 55-71. doi:10.3390/bs3010055
- Acuña, R. (2015). *Occupied America: A history of Chicanos*. Boston: Pearson.
- Aichhorn, N., & Puck, J. (2017). "I just don't feel comfortable speaking English": Foreign language anxiety as a catalyst for spoken-language barriers in MNCs. *International Business Review*, 26(4), 749-763. doi:10.1016/j.ibusrev.2017.01.004
- Almaguer, I., & Esquiedo, J. J. (2016). Cultivating bilingual learners' language arts knowledge: A framework for successful Teaching. *International Journal of Instruction*, 6(2).
- Amaro-Aguilar, A., & Watson, M. E. (2016). *Introduction to Mexican American studies: Story of Aztlán and La Raza*. Dubuque, IA: Kendall Hunt.
- Arroyo-Romano, J. E. (2016). Bilingual education candidates' challenges meeting the Spanish language/bilingual certification exam and the impact on teacher shortages in the state of Texas, USA. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 15(4), 275-286.  
doi:10.1080/15348431.2015.1134539
- Ascenzi-Moreno, L., Hesson, S., & Menken, K. (2015). School leadership along the trajectory from monolingual to multilingual. *Language and Education*, 30(3), 197-218.  
doi:10.1080/09500782.2015.1093499
- Avolio, B. J., & Bass, B. M. (2002). *Developing potential across a full range of leadership: Cases on transactional and transformational leadership*. Mahwah, N.J.: Psychology Press.

- Balderrama, F. E., & Rodriguez, R. (2006). *Decade of betrayal: Mexican repatriation in the 1930s*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Baronchelli, A., Chater, N., Pastor-Satorras, R., & Christiansen, M. H. (2012). The biological origin of linguistic diversity. *Plos ONE*, 7(10), 1-6. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0048029
- Bass, B. (1990). From transactional to transformational leadership: Learning to share the vision. *Organizational Dynamics* 18 (3), 19-31.
- Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1990). *Transformational leadership development: Manual for the multifactor leadership questionnaire*. Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press.
- Bass, B.M., & Avolio, B. J. (1993). Transformational leadership and organizational culture. *Public Administration Quarterly* 17(1), 112-121.
- Bayley, R., & Schecter, S. R. (2003). *Language socialization in bilingual and multilingual societies*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Belmont Report. (1979). The Belmont Report: Ethical principles and guidelines for the protections of human subjects of research. Retrieved from <https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/regulations-and-policy/belmont-report/index.html>.
- Bertocchi, G. (2015). Slavery, racial inequality, and education. *IZA World of Labor*, 1
- Blake, R. R. (1978). *The new managerial grid*. Houston, TX: Gulf Publishing Company.
- Block, N. (2011). The impact of two-way dual-immersion programs on initially English-dominant Latino students attitudes. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 34(2), 125-141. doi:10.1080/15235882.2011.598059
- Bollen, K., & Baten, K. (2010). Bilingual education in Flanders: Policy and press debate (1999-2006). *The Modern Language Journal*, 94(3), 412-433. doi:10.1111/j.1540-4781.2010.01089.x



- Bolman, L. G., & Deal, T. E. (2013). *Reframing organizations: artistry, choice, and leadership*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass
- Borden, R. S. (2014). The English only movement: Revisiting cultural hegemony. *Multicultural Perspectives, 16*(4), 229-233. doi:10.1080/15210960.2014.956607
- Boyce, L. K., Gillam, S. L., Innocenti, M. S., Cook, G. A., & Ortiz, E. (2013). An examination of language input and vocabulary development of young Latino dual language learners living in poverty. *First Language, 33*(6), 572-593. doi:10.1177/0142723713503145
- Buri, C. C. (2011). Determinants in the choice of comprehensible input strategies in science classes. *Journal of International Education Research (JIER), 8*(1), 1. doi:10.19030/jier.v8i1.6691
- Burkhauser, S., Steele, J. L., Li, J., Slater, R. O., Bacon, M., & Miller, T. (2016). Partner-language learning trajectories in dual-language immersion: Evidence from an urban district. *Foreign Language Annals, 49*(3), 415-433. doi:10.1111/flan.12218
- Burns, J.M. (1978). *Leadership*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Casey, M. (2016, November). *Motivational factors that sustain experienced teachers in high-need, low-performing public schools: A phenomenological study* (Doctoral dissertation, Liberty University, 2016) [Abstract].
- Carroll, P. E., & Bailey, A. L. (2015). Do decision rules matter? A descriptive study of English language proficiency assessment classifications for English-language learners and native English speakers in fifth grade. *Language Testing, 33*(1), 23-52. doi:10.1177/0265532215576380

- Catter, T. V. (2011). Intercultural bilingual education in Nicaragua: Contextualisation for improving the quality of education. *International Review of Education*, 57(5-6), 721-735. doi:10.1007/s11159-011-9258-0
- Center for Applied Linguistics. (2016). *Two-way immersion*. Retrieved December 23, 2016, from <http://www.cal.org/twi/>
- Cha, K., & Goldenberg, C. (2015). The complex relationship between bilingual home language input and kindergarten children's Spanish and English oral proficiencies. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 107(4), 935-953. <http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy.liberty.edu/10.1037/edu0000030>
- Chomsky, N. (1986). 1986. *Knowledge of language: Its nature, origin and use*. New York: Praeger.
- Christian, D., Genesee, F., Lindholm-Leary, K., & Howard, E. (2004). Final progress report: CAL/CREDE Study of Two-Way Immersion Education. Retrieved from <http://www.cal.org/twi/CREDEfinal.doc>
- Cloud, N., Fred, G., & Hamayan, E. (2007). *Dual language instruction: A handbook for enriched education*. Boston: Thomson/Heinle.
- Coelli, M., & Green, D. A. (2012). Leadership effects: school principals and student outcomes. *Economics of Education Review*, 31(1), 92-109. doi:10.1016/j.econedurev.2011.09.001
- Cole, P., Hermon, G., & Yanti, n. (2015). Grammar of binding in the languages of the world: Innate or learned?. *Cognition*, 141138-160. doi:10.1016/j.cognition.2015.04.005
- Collier, V. P., & Thomas, W. P. (2004). The astounding effectiveness of dual language education for all. Fairfax, VA: George Mason University.

- Coronel, J. M., & Gómez-Hurtado, I. (2014). Nothing to do with me! Teachers' perceptions on cultural diversity in Spanish secondary schools. *Teachers and Teaching*, 21(4), 400-420. doi:10.1080/13540602.2014.968896
- Cortez-Covarrubias, E. (2015). *Latinas leading for social justice: Resistance and recognition through dual language programs* (Order No. 3729381). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1730284838).
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Cummins, J. (1981) The role of primary language development in promoting educational success for language minority students, in CALIFORNIA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (ed.) *Schooling and language minority students: A theoretical framework* (Los Angeles, CA, Evaluation, Dissemination and Assessment Center - California State University).
- Cummins, J. (1979a). Cognitive/ academic language proficiency, linguistic interdependence, the optimum age question and some other matters. *Working Papers on Bilingualism*, 19, 121-129.
- Cummins, J. (1979b). Linguistic interdependence and educational development of bilingual children. *Review of Educational Research*, 49(2), 222-251. doi: 10.3102/00346543049002222.
- Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, power and pedagogy: Bilingual children in the crossfire*. Clevedon [England]: Multilingual Matters.
- Cummins, J. (2007). Rethinking monolingual instructional strategies in multilingual classrooms. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(2), 221-240.

- de Jong, Ester. J., & Bearse, C. I. (2011). The same outcomes for all? High school students reflect on their Two-Way immersion program experiences.” In *Immersion Education. Practices, Policies and Possibilities*,
- de Jong, Ester. J., & Bearse, C. I. (2014). Dual language programs as a strand within a secondary school: Dilemmas of school organization and the TWI mission. *International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism*, 17(1), 15-31. doi:10.1080/13670050.2012.725709
- de Jong, E. J., Gort, M., & Cobb, C. D. (2005). Bilingual education within the context of English-only policies: Three districts' responses to question 2 in Massachusetts. *Educational Policy*, 19(4), 595-620. doi:10.1177/0895904805278065
- De La Garza, T. O., & Phillips, K. (2014). Latino English language learners: Facing obstacles bigger than language. *Global Education Journal*, 2014(4), 147-155.
- De La Garza, R. O., & Yang, A. (2015). Language Dominance, Bilingualism, and Latino Political Participation in the United States. *Political Science Quarterly (Wiley-Blackwell)*, 130(4), 655-699. doi:10.1002/polq.12399
- Del Valle, S. (2003). *Language rights and the law in the United States: Finding our voice*. Buffalo, NY: 2003.
- DelliCarpini, M. (2008). Success with ELLs. *English Journal*, 98(1), 98-101.
- DeMatthews, D., & Izquierdo, E. (2016). School leadership for dual language education: A social justice approach. *The Educational Forum*, 80(3), 278-293, DOI: 10.1080/00131725.2016.1173152
- Denicolo, C. P. (2016). “School within a school”: Examining implementation barriers in a Spanish/English transitional bilingual education program. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 39(2), 91-106. doi:10.1080/15235882.2016.1171811

- Dettenmeier, P. A. (2014). ¡Ayúdame! Mi esposo esta inconsciente! No hablo ingles! *Nursing*, 44(6), 60-63. doi:10.1097/01.nurse.0000441883.72501.6d
- Derue, D. S., Nahrgang, J. D., Wellman, N., & Humphrey, S. E. (2011). Trait and behavioral theories of leadership: An integration and meta-analytic test of their relative validity. *Personnel Psychology*, 64(1), 7-52. doi:10.1111/j.1744-6570.2010.01201.x
- Donato, R., Guzmán, G., & Hanson, J. (2017). Francisco Maestas et al. v. George H. Shone et al.: Mexican American resistance to school segregation in the Hispano homeland, 1912-1914. *Journal of Latinos & Education*, 16(1), 3-17. doi:10.1080/15348431.2016.1179190
- Dorner, L. M. (2010). Contested communities in a debate over dual-language education: The Import of “public” values on public policies. *Educational Policy*, 25(4), 577-613. doi:10.1177/0895904810368275
- Durán L., Roseth C., Hoffman P., & Robertshaw M.B. (2013). Spanish-speaking preschoolers' early literacy development: A longitudinal experimental comparison of predominantly English and transitional bilingual education, *Bilingual Research Journal*, 36 (1), 6-34, DOI: [10.1080/15235882.2012.735213](https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2012.735213)
- Ediger, M. (2012). Recent leaders in American education. *College Student Journal*, 46(1), 174-177.
- Escamilla, K., Shannon, S., Carlos, S., & García, J. (2003). Breaking the code: Colorado's defeat of the anti-bilingual education initiative (Amendment 31). *Bilingual Research Journal*, 27(3), 357-382.
- Esposito, A. G., & Baker-Ward, L. (2013). Dual-language education for low-income children: Preliminary evidence of benefits for executive function. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 36(3), 295-310. doi:10.1080/15235882.2013.837848

- Europeans and their languages* (pp. 1-141, Rep.). (2012). European Commission.
- Fiol, C. M., Harris, D., & House, R. (1999). Charismatic leadership: Strategies for effecting social change. *Leadership Quarterly*, *10*(3), 449.
- Fleishman, E. A. (1953). The descriptor of supervisory behavior. *Personnel Psychology*, *37*, 1-6.
- Flores, N. (2016). A tale of two visions. *Educational Policy*, *30*(1), 13-38.  
doi:10.1177/0895904815616482
- Flores, S. Y., & Murillo Jr., E. G. (2001). Power, language, and ideology: historical and contemporary notes on the dismantling of bilingual education. *Urban Review*, *33*(3), 183-206.
- Forman, S. (2016). Interest and conflicts: Exploring the context for early implementation of a dual language policy in one middle school. *Language Policy*, *15*(4), 433-452.  
doi:10.1007/s10993-015-9377-8
- Fortes, L. (2015). The emergence of bilingual education discourse in Brazil: Bilingualisms, language policies, and globalizing circumstances. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *20*(5), 574-583. doi:10.1080/13670050.2015.1103207
- Friedman, J. (2015). English education in the era of Meiji Japan. *World Englishes*, *35*(1), 3-17.  
doi:10.1111/weng.12169
- Gándara, P. C., & Aldana, U. S. (2014). Who's segregated now? Latinos, language, and the future of integrated schools. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, *50*(5), 735-748.  
doi:10.1177/0013161x14549957

- Gambino, C. P., Acosta, Y. D., & Grieco, E. M. (2014). *English-speaking ability of the foreign-born population in the United States: 2012 American community survey reports*. Washington, DC: U.S. Census Bureau.
- García, O., Woodley, H. H., Flores, N., & Chu, H. (2012). Latino emergent bilingual youth in high schools. *Urban Education, 48*(6), 798-827. doi:10.1177/0042085912462708
- Garza, E. B. (2015). Two-way bilingual education and Latino students. *Educational Leadership and Administration: Teaching and Program Development, 26*, 75-85.
- Ghaderi, M., & Nikou, F. R. (2016). The relationship between Krashen's affective filter hypothesis and Iranian EFL learners' writing skill. *Modern Journal of Language Teaching Methods, 6*(1), 264-276.
- Goddard, M. J. (2012). On certain similarities between mainstream psychology and the writings of B. F. Skinner. *The Psychological Record, 62*(3), 563-575.
- Goldschneider, J. M., & DeKeyser, R. M. (2005). Explaining the “Natural order of L2 morpheme acquisition” in English: A meta-analysis of multiple determinants. *Language Learning, 55*, 27-77. doi:10.1111/j.0023-8333.2005.00295.x
- Gooden, M. A., Jabbar, H., & Torres, J. S. (2016). Race and school vouchers: Legal, historical, and political contexts. *Peabody Journal of Education (0161956X), 91*(4), 522-536. doi:10.1080/0161956X.2016.1207445
- Gottfried, M. A. (2016). ELL school readiness and pre-kindergarten care. *Educational Policy, 31*(1), 39-72. doi:10.1177/0895904814558011
- Gratton, B. & Merchant, E. K. (2016). La raza: Mexicans in the United States census. *Journal of Policy History* 28(4), 537-567. Cambridge University Press. Retrieved August 8, 2018, from Project MUSE database.

- Gutek, G. L. (2013). *Historical and philosophical foundations of education*. Pearson.
- Hammer, C. S., Jia, G., & Uchikoshi, Y. (2011). Language and literacy development of dual language learners growing up in the United States: A call for research. *Child Development Perspectives, 5*(1), 4-9. doi:10.1111/j.1750-8606.2010.00140.x
- Hansen, B. D., Caldarella, P., Williams, L., & Wills, H. P. (2017). Managing student behavior in dual immersion classrooms: a study of class-wide function-related intervention teams. *Behavior Modification, 41*(5), 626-646. doi:10.1177/0145445517698418
- Hattier, M. A., & Matson, J. L. (2012). An examination of the relationship between communication and socialization deficits in children with autism and PDD-NOS. *Research in Autism Spectrum Disorders, 6*(2), 871-880. doi:10.1016/j.rasd.2011.12.001
- Heidegger, M. (1972). *On time and being*. (J. Stambaugh, Trans.). New York: Harper & Row.
- Hersey, P., & Blanchard, K.H. (1977). *The Management of organizational behavior*. Engelwood Cliffs.
- Hickman, P., & Garcia, S. B. (2014). Elementary principal leadership for equitable learning environments for diverse Latina/o students. *NYS Tesol Journal, 1*(2), 59-85.
- Hopkins, M., Lowenhaupt, R., & Sweet, T. M. (2015). Organizing English learner instruction in new immigrant destinations: District infrastructure and subject-specific school practice. *American Educational Research Journal, 52*(3), 408-439.  
doi:10.3102/0002831215584780
- Hovens, M. (2002). Bilingual Education in West Africa: Does It Work? *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, 5*(5), 249-266. doi:10.1080/13670050208667760



- Hsiao, I. T., Yu-Ju, L., Chia-Ling, K., & Ping, L. (2017). Visualization analytics for second language vocabulary learning in virtual worlds. *Journal of Educational Technology & Society*, 20(2), 161-175.
- Huguet-Canalís, Á. (2009). La hipótesis de interdependencia lingüística. Algunas consideraciones para la práctica educativa en aulas multilingües. *Revista Española De Pedagogía*, (244), 495-510.
- Hunt, V. (2011). Learning from success stories: Leadership structures that support dual language programs over time in New York City. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 14(2), 187-206. doi:10.1080/13670050.2010.539673
- Husserl, E. (1931). *Ideas: General introduction to pure phenomenology* (D. Carr, Trans.). Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press.
- Johnson, G., Kohler, K., & Ross, D. (2016). Contributions of Skinners theory of verbal behaviour to language interventions for children with autism spectrum disorders. *Early Child Development and Care*, 187(3-4), 436-446. doi:10.1080/03004430.2016.1236255
- Jost, K. (2009). Bilingual education vs. English immersion: Which is better for students with limited English?. *CQ Researcher*, 19(43), 1029-1052.
- Joy, J. L. (2013). The altitude of test anxiety among second language learners. *Language Testing in Asia*, 3(1), 10. doi:10.1186/2229-0443-3-10
- Kankaanranta, A., & Louhiala-Salminen, L. (2010). “English? – Oh, it’s just work!”: A study of BELF users’ perceptions. *English For Specific Purposes*, 29(3), 204-209. doi:10.1016/j.esp.2009.06.004
- Kerr-Berry, J. (2016). Peeling back the skin of racism: Real history and race in dance education. *Journal of Dance Education*, 16(4), 119-121.

- Khanin, D. (2007). Contrasting Burns and Bass: Does the transactional-transformational paradigm live up to Burns' philosophy of transforming leadership? *Journal of Leadership Studies*, 1(3), 7-25. doi:10.1002/jls.20022
- Khatib, M., & Taie, M. (2016). BICS and CALP: Implications for SLA. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 7(2), 382. doi:10.17507/jltr.0702.19
- Kijoo, C., & Goldenberg, C. (2015). The complex relationship between bilingual home language input and kindergarten children's Spanish and English oral proficiencies. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 107(4), 935-953. doi:10.1037/edu0000030
- Kim, Y., Erekson, J., Bunten, B. A., & Hinchey, P. (2014). Toward sustainable educational changes through school-based professional development on ELL assessment for new teachers. *Theory into Practice*, 53(3), 228-235. doi:10.1080/00405841.2014.916966
- Kirpatrick, S. A., & Locke, E. A. (1996) Direct and indirect effects of three core charismatic leadership components on performance and attitudes. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 31, 36-51.
- Kouzes, J. M., & Posner, B. Z. (2007). *The leadership challenge* (4th ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Krashen, S. D. (1982). *Principles and practice in second language acquisition*. New York, NY: Pergamon Press Inc.
- Kuchah, K. (2016). English-medium instruction in an English–French bilingual setting: issues of quality and equity in Cameroon. *Comparative Education*, 52(3), 311-327. doi:10.1080/03050068.2016.1185257
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2006). From the achievement gap to the education debt: understanding underachievement in U.S. schools. *Educational Researcher* 35(7), 3-12.

- Lapkin, S., Hart, D., & Turnbull, M. (2003). Grade 6 French immersion students' performance on large-scale reading, writing, and mathematics tests: Building explanations. *Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 49, 6–23.
- Lapan, S. D., Quartaroli, M. T., & Riemer, F. J. (2012). *Qualitative research: An introduction to methods and designs*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Lauen, D. L., & Gaddis, S. M. (2012). Shining a light or fumbling in the dark? The effects of NCLB's subgroup-specific accountability on student achievement. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 34(2), 185-208.
- Leon, A., Villares, E., Brigman, G., Webb, L., & Paluso, P. (2011). Closing the achievement gap of Latina/Latino students. *Counseling Outcome Research*, 2(1), 73-86.  
doi:10.1177/2150137811400731
- Lewin, K., Lippit, R., & White, R. K. (1939). Patterns of aggressive behavior in experimentally created social climates. *Journal of Social Psychology*, 10(2), 271-301.
- Li, J., Steele, J., Slater, R., Bacon, M., & Miller, T. (2016). Teaching practices and language use in two-way dual language immersion programs in a large public school district. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 10(1), 31-43.  
doi:10.1080/19313152.2016.1118669
- Lincoln, YS. & Guba, EG. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Lihong, S. (2016). Empirical study on learners' self-efficacy in ESL/EFL context. *College Student Journal*, 50(3), 454-465.
- Lin, F. Y. (2017). A refutation of universal grammar. *Lingua*, 193, 1-22.  
doi:10.1016/j.lingua.2017.04.003

- Lin, H. K., Chao, C., & Huang, T. (2015). From a perspective on foreign language learning anxiety to develop an affective tutoring system. *Educational Technology, Research and Development*, 63(5), 727-747.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Lindholm-Leary, K. J. (2001). *Dual language education*. Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.
- Lindholm-Leary, K., & Block, N. (2010). Achievement in predominantly low SES/Hispanic dual language schools. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 13(1), 43-60. doi:10.1080/13670050902777546
- Lindholm-Leary, K., & Hernández, A. (2011). Achievement and language proficiency of Latino students in dual language programmes: Native English speakers, fluent English/previous ELLs, and current ELLs. *Journal of Multilingual & Multicultural Development*, 32(6), 531-545. doi:10.1080/01434632.2011.611596
- Lippi-Green, R. (2012). *English with an accent: Language, ideology and discrimination in the United States (2nd ed.)*. New York: Routledge.
- Liu, Y. (2013). Applying comprehensible input and culture input methodology to inspire college students' learning motivation. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 3(11). doi:10.4304/tpls.3.11.2072-2077
- Lodewijk van Oord (2013) Towards transformative leadership in education, *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 16:4, 419-434, DOI: 10.1080/13603124.2013.776116

- López, M. (2013). Mothers choose: Reasons for enrolling their children in a two-way immersion program. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 36(2), 208-227, DOI: 10.1080/15235882.2013.818595
- Lorenzo, F., & Rodríguez, L. (2014). Onset and expansion of L2 cognitive academic language proficiency in bilingual settings: CALP in CLIL. *System*, 47, 64-72. doi:10.1016/j.system.2014.09.016
- Louise Pubols. (2014). Changing interpretations of California's Mexican past. *California History*, 91(1), 16-22. doi:10.1525/ch.2014.91.1.16
- Lowe, K. B., Kroeck, K., & Sivasubramaniam, N. (1996). Effectiveness correlates of transformational and transactional leadership: A meta-analytic review of the mlq literature. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 7(3), 385-425. doi:10.1016/s1048-9843(96)90027-2
- Luthra, R. R., & Flashman, J. (2017). Who benefits most from a university degree?: A cross-national comparison of selection and wage returns in the US, UK, and Germany. *Research in Higher Education*, 58(8), 843-878. doi:10.1007/s11162-017-9451-5
- Madrid, E. M. (2011). The Latino achievement gap. *Multicultural Education*, 18(3), 7-12.
- Maxwell, L. A. (2012). "Dual" classes see growth in popularity. *Education Week*, 31(26), 1.
- Marian, V., Shook, A., & Schroeder, S. R. (2013). Bilingual two-way immersion programs benefit academic achievement. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 36, 167–186. doi: 10.1080/15235882.2013.818075
- McGregor, D. (1960). *The human side of enterprise*. New York, NY: McGraw Hill.
- McEwan-Adkins, E. K. (2003). *10 traits of highly effective principals: from good to great performance*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

- Menken, K., & Solorza, C. (2015). Principals as linchpins in bilingual education: The need for prepared school leaders, *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 18:6, 676-697, DOI: 10.1080/13670050.2014.937390
- Metz, M. (2018). Challenges of confronting dominant language ideologies in the high school English classroom. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 52(4), 455-477. Retrieved from <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezproxy.liberty.edu/docview/2049976056?accountid=12085>
- Munro, J. H. (2008). *Roundtable viewpoints: Educational Leadership*. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Higher Education.
- National Center for Education Statistics. (2016). Fast facts: English language learners. Retrieved from <https://nces.ed.gov/fastfacts/display.asp?id=96>
- Nair, S. K. (2015). Mother tongue in the discourse of primary education: A cognitive approach. *International Journal of Mind, Brain & Cognition*, 6(1/2), 74-82
- Noble, T., Rosebery, A., Suarez, C., Warren, B., & O'Connor, M. C. (2014). Science assessments and English language learners: Validity evidence based on response processes. *Applied Measurement in Education*, 27(4), 248-260.  
doi:10.1080/08957347.2014.944309
- Ovando, C. J., & Collier, V.P. (2003). *Bilingual and ESL classrooms: Teaching in multicultural context*. (3rd ed.). Boston, MA: McGraw Hill.
- Padilla, A. M., Fan, L., Xu, Z., & Silva, D. (2013). A Mandarin/English two-way immersion program: Language proficiency and academic achievement. *Foreign Language Annals*, 46, 661-679. doi: 10.1111/flan.12060

- Palmer, D., Henderson, K., Wall, D., Zúñiga, C. E., & Berthelsen, S. (2015). Team teaching among mixed messages: Implementing two-way dual language bilingual education at third grade in Texas. *Language Policy, 15*(4), 393-413. doi:10.1007/s10993-015-9361-3
- Palmer, D. K., & Henderson, K. I. (2016). Dual language bilingual education placement practices: Educator discourses about emergent bilingual students in two program types. *International Multilingual Research Journal, 10*(1), 17-30. doi:10.1080/19313152.2015.1118668
- Parker, L. & Villalpando, O. (2007). A race(cialized) perspective on education leadership: critical race theory in educational administration. *Educational Administration Quarterly, 43*(5), 519-524. doi:10.1177/0013161X07307795
- Patton, M. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications. ISBN: 978-1412972123
- Payne, M. (2011). Exploring Stephen Krashen's 'i 1' acquisition model in the classroom. *Linguistics and Education, 22*, 419-429.
- Peleato, I. V. (2011). Educación bilingüe en EE.UU. Estudio de casos de una escuela primaria Bilingual education in the United States of America. Case studies of an elementary school. *Estudios Sobre Educación, 21*, 139-158.
- Peters, H. (2014). Global English online – a case study of a distance learning course in a business context. *Language and Literacy, 16*(1), 111. doi:10.20360/g28300
- Pregot, M. V. (2013). Bilingual education: A glorious goal within a political context. *International Journal of Language Studies, 7*(4), 45-56.

- Petrzela, N. M. (2010). Before the federal bilingual education act: Legislation and lived experience in California. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 85(4), 406-424.  
doi:10.1080/0161956x.2010.518021
- Polat, N., Zarecky-Hodge, A., & Schreiber, J. B. (2016). Academic growth trajectories of ELLs in NAEP data: The case of fourth- and eighth-grade ELLs and non-ELLs on mathematics and reading tests. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 109(5), 541-553.  
doi:10.1080/00220671.2014.993461
- Purdy, M. A. (2016). Blurring public and private: The pragmatic desegregation politics of an elite private school in Atlanta. *History of Education Quarterly*, 56(1), 61-89.  
doi:10.1111/hoeq.12149
- Quirk, M. P., & Fandt, P. M. (2000). *The 2nd language of leadership*. Mahwah, N.J.: Psychology Press.
- Ray, M. (1994). The richness of phenomenology: Philosophic, theoretic, and methodologic concerns. In J. Morse (Ed.), *Critical issues in qualitative research* (pp. 117-135). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Relji, G., Ferring, D., & Martin, R. (2014). A meta-analysis on the effectiveness of bilingual programs in Europe. *Review of Educational Research*, 85(1), 92-128.  
doi:10.3102/0034654314548514
- Rocha, R. R., & Matsubayashi, T. (2012). Latino immigration and representation in local politics. *Urban Affairs Review*, 49(3), 353-380. doi:10.1177/1078087412459719
- Rockinson-Szapkiw, A. J., & Spaulding, L. S. (Eds.) (2014). *Navigating the doctoral journey: A handbook of strategies for success*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Education.



- Rocque, R., Ferrin, S., Hite, J. M., & Randall, V. (2016). The unique skills and traits of principals in one-way and two-Way dual immersion schools. *Foreign Language Annals*, 49(4), 801-818. doi:10.1111/flan.12238
- Ronald, B. (2014). Comprehensive leadership review-literature, theories, and research. *Advances in Management*, 7(5), 52-66.
- Rubinstein-Avila, E. (2002). Problematizing the “dual” in a dual-immersion program: A portrait. *Linguistics and Education*, 13(1), 65-87.
- Ryan, C. (2013). *Language use in the United States: 2011 American community survey reports*. Washington, DC: U.S. Census Bureau.
- Sağlamel, H., & Kayaoğlu, M. N. (2015). English major students' perceptions of academic writing: A struggle between writing to learn and learning to write. *Journal of History, Culture & Art Research / Tarih Kültür Ve Sanat Arastirmalari Dergisi*, 4(3), 37-52. doi:10.7596/taksad.v4i3.477
- San Miguel, G. (2001). *Brown, not White: School integration and the Chicano movement in Houston*. College Station: Texas A&M University Press.
- San Miguel Jr., G. (2005). The impact of Brown on Mexican American desegregation litigation, 1950s to 1980s. *Journal of Latinos & Education*, 4(4), 221-236. doi:10.1207/s1532771xjle0404\_2
- Saville-Troike, M., & Barto, K. (2017). *Introducing second language acquisition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Scanlan, M., & Palmer, D. (2009). Race, power, and (in)equity within two-way immersion settings. *Urban Review*, 41(5), 391-415. doi:10.1007/s11256-008-0111-0

- Schwabsky, N. (2013). Exploring principals' nonroutine problems in bilingual immersion schools: Lessons learned for multicultural leadership. *Journal of School Leadership*, 23(5), 789+.
- Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information*, 22, 63-75.
- Skinner, B. F. (1957). *Verbal behavior*. New York, NY: Appleton-Century-Croft.
- Solano-Flores, G. (2014). Probabilistic approaches to examining linguistic features of test items and their effect on the performance of English language learners. *Applied Measurement in Education*, 27, 236–247.
- Soleimanirad, N., & Shangarffam, N. (2016). The effect of collaborative reasoning discussion on EFL learners' anxiety. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(2), 337.  
doi:10.17507/tpls.0602.15
- Soltero, S. W. (2016). *Dual language education: program design and implementation*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- Sonnenschein, S., Metzger, S. R., Dowling, R., & Baker, L. (2016). The relative importance of English versus Spanish language skills for low-income Latino English language learners' early language and literacy development. *Early Child Development and Care*, 187(3-4), 727-743. doi:10.1080/03004430.2016.1219854
- Spilt, J. L., Koomen, H. Y., & Harrison, L. J. (2015). Language development in the early school years: The importance of close relationships with teachers. *Developmental Psychology*, 51(2), 185-196.
- Spilt, J. L., Leflot, G., Onghena, P., & Colpin, H. (2016). Use of praise and reprimands as critical ingredients of teacher behavior management: effects on children's development in the

- context of a teacher-mediated classroom intervention. *Prevention Science*, 17(6), 732-742. doi:10.1007/s11121-016-0667-y
- Steele, J. L., Slater, R. O., Zamarro, G., Miller, T., Li, J., Burkhauser, S., & Bacon, M. (2015). *Effects of dual-language immersion on students' academic performance* (Working Papers Series. Arkansas: University of Arkansas: The Department of Education Reform.
- Stufft, D. L., & Brogadir, R. (2011). Urban principals' facilitation of English language learning in public schools. *Education & Urban Society*, 43(5), 560-575.  
doi:10.1177/0013124510380720
- Suarez de Puga, R. P. (2013). Watson, Skinner y algunas disputas dentro del conductismo. *Revista Colombiana de Psicología*, 22(2), 389-399.
- Sung, C. C. (2013). Accent and identity: exploring the perceptions among bilingual speakers of English as a lingua franca in Hong Kong. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 17(5), 544-557. doi:10.1080/13670050.2013.837861
- Thomas, W. P., & Collier, V. (2002). *A national study of school effectiveness for language minority students' long-term academic achievement*. Santa Cruz, CA and Washington, DC: Center for Research on Education, Diversity & Excellence. Available: [http://w.crede.ucsc.edu/research/la/1.1\\_final.html](http://w.crede.ucsc.edu/research/la/1.1_final.html).
- Thomas, W. P., & Collier, V. P. (2015). *English learners in North Carolina dual language programs: Year 3 of this study: School year 2009-10*. Fairfax, VA: George Mason University
- Tomasello, M. (2009). Universal grammar is dead. *Behavioral Brain Science*. 32, 470--471.

- Trinidad, M. D. (2015). Mexican Americans and the push for culturally relevant education: the bilingual education movement in Tucson, 1958–1969. *History of Education, 44*(3), 316-338. doi:10.1080/0046760x.2014.1002015
- Turan, N. S. (2011). Development of eastern philology and orientalist research area in turkey from the ottoman empire to Turkish republic. *International Journal of Turcologia, 6*(11), 5-22.
- Valdez, V. E., Freire, J. A., & Delavan, M. G. (2016). The gentrification of dual language education. *The Urban Review, 48*(4), 601-627. doi:10.1007/s11256-016-0370-0
- van Manen, M. (1997). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Vega, A., & Martinez, R. (2012). A Latino Scorecard for Higher Education. *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 11*(1), 41-54. doi:10.1177/1538192711435554
- Vincze, L., & Henning-Lindblom, A. (2016). Swedish, Finnish and bilingual? Multiple ethnolinguistic identities in relation to ethnolinguistic vitality in Finland. *International Journal of Bilingualism, 20*(4), 488-498. doi:10.1177/1367006915572169
- Von Wobeser, G. (2012). Historia de Mexico. *Economica, Sociedad, Y Territorio, 7*(38), 277-292.
- Whitacre, M. (2015). Attitudinal perspectives: A factor to implementation of a dual language program. *International Journal of Instruction, 8*(1), 35-46. doi:10.12973/iji.2015.813a
- Yim, D., Rudoy, J., Oetting, J., & Gillam, R. (2013). Implicit statistical learning and language skills in bilingual children. *Journal of Speech, Language & Hearing Research, 56*(1), 310-322. doi:10.1044/1092-4388(2012/11-0243)

Yoon, K. K., Hutchison, L. A., & Winsler, A. (2015). Bilingual education in the United States:

An historical overview and examination of two-way immersion. *Educational Review*,

67(2), 236-252, DOI: 10.1080/00131911.2013.865593

Yosso, T.J. (2006). *Critical race counterstories along the Chicana/o educational pipeline*. New

York: Routledge

Zhongganggao, D. C. (2001). Second language learning and the teaching of grammar. *Education*,

122(2), 326.

Zuckerman, M. (2012). *Beyond the century of the child: Cultural history and developmental psychology*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

**APPENDIX A: IRB APPROVAL****LIBERTY UNIVERSITY.**  
INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD

November 15, 2018

Oswaldo Garcia  
IRB Approval 3535.111518: A Phenomenological Hermeneutic Study of the Lived Experiences  
of Spanish Elementary Dual Immersion Principals

Dear Oswaldo Garcia,


We are pleased to inform you that your study has been approved by the Liberty University IRB. This approval is extended to you for one year from the date provided above with your protocol number. If data collection proceeds past one year or if you make changes in the methodology as it pertains to human subjects, you must submit an appropriate update form to the IRB. The forms for these cases were attached to your approval email.

Your study falls under the expedited review category (45 CFR 46.110), which is applicable to specific, minimal risk studies and minor changes to approved studies for the following reason(s):

6. Collection of data from voice, video, digital, or image recordings made for research purposes.
7. Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies. (NOTE: Some research in this category may be exempt from the HHS regulations for the protection of human subjects. [45 CFR 46.101\(b\)\(2\)](#) and (b)(3). This listing refers only to research that is not exempt.)

Thank you for your cooperation with the IRB, and we wish you well with your research project.

Sincerely,

  
**G. Michele Baker, MA, CIP**  
*Administrative Chair of Institutional Research*  
**The Graduate School**

**LIBERTY**  
UNIVERSITY.  
*Liberty University | Training Champions for Christ since 1971*

## APPENDIX B: RECRUITMENT LETTER

Dear Spanish Elementary Dual Immersion School Principal or Vice Principal:

My name is Osvaldo Garcia, a doctoral candidate at Liberty University's School of Education. I would like to invite you to consider participating in my study. I am conducting research to better understand the lived experiences of Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders. The purpose of my research is to understand the experiences and leadership role of Spanish elementary school leaders with the objective of helping current or future leaders who are assigned to this role, and I am writing to invite to participate in my study. In order to participate in this research study, you must meet the following criteria:

1. Be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school principal
2. Be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school vice principal

If you agree to participate in this study, I would ask you to do the following:

1. Participate in a one-on-one interview that should last between 45 minutes to one hour. This interview will be audio recorded. Your identity will be confidential in this study.
2. Write a letter to an aspiring Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader.
3. You will take 3 pictures and write a brief narrative that represents your job as Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. The photo narrative should take about 45 minutes to complete.

I have attached an informed consent document that provides more information about the study so that you can make an informed decision.

Thank you for taking the time to consider participating in this study. If you choose to participate in this study, please respond by email to [ogarcia7@liberty.edu](mailto:ogarcia7@liberty.edu) or you may call me at (559)827-9423. I will schedule a time to personally meet with you to collect the signed informed consent document to participate in the study. At that time, I will discuss the photo narrative and schedule a time to conduct the one-on-one interview.

Sincerely,

Osvaldo Garcia  
Doctoral student at Liberty University

## **APPENDIX C: CONSENT FORM**

A Phenomenological Hermeneutic Study of the Lived Experiences of Spanish Elementary Dual Immersion principals.

Osvaldo Garcia  
Liberty University  
School of Education

You are invited to be in a research study to understand what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. You were selected as a possible participant because you are or have been employed as a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. I ask that you read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to be in the study.

Osvaldo Garcia, a doctoral candidate in the School of Education at Liberty University, is conducting this study.

**Background Information:** The purpose of this study is to understand what it means to be a Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader.

**Procedures:** If you agree to be in this study, I would ask you to do the following things:

1. Participate in a one-on-one interview that should last between 45 minutes to one hour. This interview will be audio recorded. Your identity will be confidential in this study.
2. Write a letter to an aspiring Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader.
3. You will take 3 pictures and write a brief narrative that represents your job as Spanish elementary dual immersion school leader. The photo narrative should take about 45 minutes to complete.

**Risks and Benefits of being in the Study:** The risks involved in this study are minimal, no more than you would encounter in everyday life.

There are no benefits to participating in this study. However, current and future Spanish elementary dual immersion school leaders can benefit from the results of this study by gaining a better understanding of what it means to administer a dual immersion school.

**Compensation:** Participants will receive a \$10 gift card for participating in this study.

**Confidentiality:** The records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report, I might publish, I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely and only I will have access to the records.



Transcripts of interviews, logs, and photo narratives will be stored in a locked file cabinet and will be destroyed three years after the completion of the study. Each participant will have a pseudonym for the one-on-one interview to protect his/her identity. Information stored on the researcher's computer will only be accessed by the researcher and the computer can only be unlocked by a password.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study:** Participation in this study is voluntary. Your decision whether or not to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Liberty University. If you decide to participate, you are free to not answer any question or withdraw at any time without affecting those relationships.

**How to Withdraw from the Study:** If you choose to withdraw from the study, please contact the researcher at the email address included in the next paragraph. Should you choose to withdraw, data collected from you, will be destroyed immediately and will not be included in this study.

**Contacts and Questions:** The researcher conducting this study is Osvaldo Garcia. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact him at ogarcia7@liberty.edu. You may also contact the researcher's faculty advisor, Dr. Jose Puga at jpuga@liberty.edu.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and would like to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd, Green Hall 1887, Lynchburg, VA 24515 or email at irb@liberty.edu.

*Please notify the researcher if you would like a copy of this information to keep for your records.*

**Statement of Consent:** I have read and understood the above information. I have asked questions and have received answers. I consent to participate in the study.

(NOTE: DO NOT AGREE TO PARTICIPATE UNLESS IRB APPROVAL INFORMATION WITH CURRENT DATES HAS BEEN ADDED TO THIS DOCUMENT.)

The researcher has my permission to audio-record me as part of my participation in this study.

---

Signature

Date

---

Signature of Investigator

Date

### APPENDIX D: THEME DEVELOPMENT

<b>Higher Purpose Driven</b>	<b>Social Justice Crusader</b>	<b>Proactive Stewardship</b>
Helping the Disadvantaged	Closing the Achievement Gap	Seeking Help, funding, research
Changing the World	Seeking Academic Parity, Cultural and Language Equity	Providing professional development
Building Bridges	Student Enhancement	Active Recruitment

<b>Buffer</b>	<b>Always on the Defense</b>	<b>Culture Builder</b>
Strand Model Problems	Anti-immigrant	Cultural Bridge Builders
School District Disconnect	Identification and Acceptance within the Dominant Culture	Positive School Culture
Protecting from outside forces	Ethnocentrism	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness

<b>Educational Shifter</b>	<b>Instructional Leader in Language Acquisition</b>
Paradigm Shift	Faith
Goal Oriented Enthusiasts, Data Focused	Research Knowledgeable
Individual and Community Advocate	Translanguaging

### APPENDIX E: CODE MATRIX

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Maria	Helping the Disadvantaged pg.1	English Only Proponents pg. 8	Positive School Culture pg. 8	Language Equity pg.1	Knowledge of Language Acquisition Research pg. 31
	Changing the World pg. 2	Oppositional forces pg. 4	Development of a Committed Stakeholder Group pg. 12	Higher Purpose pg. 2	Spanish Language to be Predominant in the School pg. 32
	Seeking Parity pg. 2	Anti-Immigration pg. 8	Cultural Bridge Builder pg. 13	Closing the Achievement Gap. Pg. 3	Translanguaging pg. 33
	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 3	Threat to the English Language pg. 8	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 13	Seeking Parity pg. 4	Professional Development pg. 33
	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 12	Identification and Acceptance with the Dominant Culture pg. 10	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 18	Adherence to Research and Data pg.	
	Whole Child pg. 16	Difficulty with Teacher Recruitment pg. 11	Academic Results pg. 20	Community Buy-in pg. 8	
		Anti-Immigration pg. 10	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 24	Cultural Bridge Builder pg. 8	
			Long Term Benefits pg. 25	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 11	
			Long Term Benefits pg. 30	Strategic Attainable Goals pg. 19	
			Help from school District p. 30	Brighter Futures pg. 14	
				Whole child pg. 34	
				Active Recruitment pg. 34	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Bob	Helping the Disadvantaged pg.1	English Only Proponents pg. 1	Funding pg. 4	Language Equity pg.1	English Acquisition was quicker than Spanish pg. 21
	Changing Cultural Paradigms pg. 1	Oppositional forces pg. 4	Development of a Committed Stakeholder Group pg. 8	Higher Purpose pg. 2	Writing as a Language Acquisition Tool pg. 21
	Changing the World pg. 2	Anti-Immigration pg. 4	Cultural Bridge Builder pg. 8	Changing the World pg.2	Spanish Language to be Predominant in the School pg. 21
	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 2	Threat to the English Language pg. 4	Positive School Culture pg. 8	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 2	
	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 2	Identification and Acceptance with the Dominant Culture pg. 4	Student Enhancement pg. 9	Closing the Achievement Gap. Pg. 2	
	Seeking Parity pg. 2	Identification and Acceptance with the Dominant Culture pg. 10	Positive School Culture pg. 10	Seeking Parity pg. 2	
	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 3	Difficulty with Teacher Recruitment pg. 11	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 11	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 6	
	Funding pg. 4	School District Disconnect pg. 14	Academic Results pg. 12	Community Buy-in pg. 7	
	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 6	Lack of Time pg. 14	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 13	Cultural Bridge Builder pg. 8	
	Student Enhancement pg. 9	Strand Model Problems pg. 13	Academic Results for Disadvantaged Populations (Latinos) pg. 13	Student Enhancement pg. 9	
Whole Child pg. 14	Anti-Immigration pg. 18	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 14	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 11		

	Positive School Culture- feels like our school pg. 15	Overcoming Ethnocentrism. 19	Academic Results for Disadvantaged Populations (English Speakers with Disadvantaged backgrounds) pg. 14	Strategic Attainable Goals pg. 12	
	Principal as a buffer pg. 16		Long Term Benefits pg. 14	Brighter Futures pg. 14	
				Goal Oriented, Non-micromanagement pg. 15	
				Enabling others to their best pg. 15	
				Principal as a buffer pg. 16	
				Knowledgeable Leader – Speak their Language pg. 17	
				Enthusiasm pg. 17	
				Professionalism pg. 17	
				Higher Purpose pg. 19	
				Higher Purpose pg. 19	
				Everyone has Value pg. 20	
				Helping the Disadvantaged pg. 20	
				Helping the Disadvantaged pg. 22	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Donovan	Helping the Disadvantaged pg.1	Anti-Immigration pg. 4	Early School District Support pg. 2	Changing the World pg.1	Equalization of Language pg. 20

Developing Cultural Bridges pg. 1	English Only Proponents pg. 4	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 4	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Professional Development pg. 20
Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 1	Threat to the English Language pg. 4	Student Enhancement pg. 5	Searching for a Solution to Academic Gap p.2	Academic Language pg. 21
Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 1	Threat of Turning USA into Mexico pg. 4	Academic Results for Disadvantaged Populations (Latinos) pg. 10	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 2	Four Domains of Language Acquisition pg. 21
Seeking Parity, not a Failure pg. 1	School District Active Disintegration Pg. 5	Academic Results pg. 11	Closing the Achievement Gap. Pg. 2	Fidelity to Language pg. 22
Changing the World pg. 2	People actively talking negative about the program pg. 7	Achieving Parity Pg. 11	Seeking Parity pg. 2	
Adherence to Research and Data pg. 4	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 8	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 11	Seeking Help with District pg. 2	
Principal as a buffer pg. 14	Educating about Dual Immersion not being a Social Experiment pg. 8	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 13	Principal as a buffer pg. 9	
School District buffer pg. 15	School Board Opposition pg. 9	Cultures pg. 8	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 11	
	Educating about Dual Immersion not being a Social Experiment pg. 9	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 25	Providing Professional Development pg. 11	
	Teachers lack of faith pg. 8	Long Term Benefits pg. 25	Brighter Futures pg. 25	
			Helping Latinos, not a Failure pg. 25	
			Giving back pg. 26	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Victor	Proactive pg. 1	English Only Proponents pg. 5	Two Cultures Helping Each Other pg. 2	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Professional Development pg. 20
	Leadership Vision pg. 1	Threat to the English Language pg. 5	Student Enhancement pg. 8	Searching for a Solution to Academic Gap p.1	Academic Language pg. 22
	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 1	Strand Model Problems pg.6	Closing the Achievement Gap pg.8	Proactive: Seeking Help pg. 1	Translanguaging pg. 22
	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 3	Buffer in Test Scores pg. 7	Academic Results for Disadvantaged Populations (Latinos) pg. 10	Proactivity to Develop Curriculum pg. 3	Faith in Research pg. 22
	Student Enhancement pg. 4	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 7	Academic Results pg. 11	Principal as a buffer pg. 6	
	Principal as a buffer pg. 6		Achieving Parity Pg. 12	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 11	
	Supervising Language Fidelity pg. 25		Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 13	Providing Professional Development pg. 19	
			Brighter Futures pg. 25	Giving back pg. 23	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
David	Helping Latinos pg. 1	Anti-Immigration pg. 5	Student Enhancement pg. 8	Changing the World pg.1	Professional Development pg. 20
	Developing cultural bridges pg. 1	English Only Proponents pg. 5	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 9	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Making Curriculum 3-Dimensional pg. 21
	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 2	Threat of Turning USA into Mexico pg. 5	Academic Results for Latinos pg. 10	Seeking Parity pg. 14	Academic Language pg. 21

	Changing the World pg. 2	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 6	Achieving Parity Pg. 11	Challenges as opportunities pg. 15	Student Enhancement pg. 22
	Seeking Parity, Kicking Butt pg. 3	Current Political Climate, Trump pg. 6	Cultural Sensitivity and Awareness pg. 12	Hope pg. 16	Translanguaging pg. 22
	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 4	Protecting Teachers from Outside Groups pg. 6	Cultures Coming Together pg. 13	Faith in Data and Research pg. 17	Instructional Strategies pg. 23
	Building Brighter Futures pg. 28		Positive School Culture pg. 14	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 17	Instructional Modelling pg. 23
			Long Term Benefits pg. 22	Providing Professional Development pg. 18	Thinking Outside of the Box pg. 23
				Brighter Futures pg. 24	Practicing Oral Output pg. 23
				Student Happiness pg. 24	
				Giving back pg. 24	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Natanael	Changing the World pg. 1	Outside Oppositional Forces pg. 5	Student Enhancement pg. 10	Changing the World pg.1	Professional Development pg. 19
	Passionate about Student Learning pg. 1	District Opposition pg. 5	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 11	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Academic Language pg. 19
	Helping Latinos pg. 2	Board Member Opposition pg. 6	Achieving Parity Pg. 11	Teacher Individualistic Attention pg. 19	Instructional Strategies pg. 23
	Helping the Disadvantaged pg. 2	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 6	Academic Results for Latinos pg. 12	Hope for the Future pg. 17	Translanguaging pg. 20
	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 2	Anti-immigrant Forces pg. 7	Cultures Coming Together pg. 14	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 18	Practicing Oral Output pg. 21



	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 3	English Only Proponents pg. 8	Positive School Culture pg. 17	Providing Professional Development pg. 18	Making Learning Come Alive pg. 22
	Passionate of Bilingual pg. 3	Material Difficulty pg. 8	Bilingual pg. 17	Brighter Futures pg. 23	Quality Spanish Teachers pg. 22
	Seeking Parity pg. 4	Teacher Recruitment Problems pg. 8	Positive School Culture pg. 18	Giving back pg. 25	Faith in Research pg. 23
		Teacher Ethnocentrism pg. 9	Cohesive Teachers pg. 18	Social Justice pg. 25	
		Positive Cultural Shift pg. 10		Goal Oriented pg. 25	

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Juan	Proactive pg. 1	English Only Proponents pg. 5	Cultural exchanges pg. 10	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Professional Development pg. 21
	Leadership Vision pg. 1	Threat to the English Language pg. 5	Student Enhancement pg. 8	Whole Child Approach pg. 20	Fidelity to Language pg. 21
	Avoidance of Student Hardship pg. 1	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 6	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 8	Principal as a buffer pg. 9	Faith in Research pg. 22
	Principal as a buffer pg. 6	Strand Model Problems pg. 6	Academic Results for Disadvantaged Populations (Latinos) pg. 10	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 12	
	Supervising Language Fidelity pg. 22	Identification and Acceptance with the Dominant Culture pg. 7	Academic Results pg. 11	Providing Professional Development pg. 21	
	Leadership Training pg. 23	Paradigm Shift pg. 8	Achieving Parity Pg. 12	Giving back pg. 22	
			Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 13		
			Brighter Futures pg. 25		

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Lesly	Leadership Vision pg. 1	Not Knowing if we are Doing Things Right pg. 5	Cultural exchanges pg. 13	Principal as a buffer pg. 14	Professional Development pg. 21
	Avoidance of Student Hardship pg. 1	Teacher Ambivalence pg. 5	Biliteracy pg. 13	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 18	Translanguaging pg. 21
	Professional Development pg. 23	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 6	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 13	Providing Professional Development pg. 21	
		Strand Model Problems pg.7		Giving back pg. 21	
		Identification and Acceptance with the Dominant Culture pg. 7			
		Teacher Recruitment Problems pg. 8			
		District Problems pg. 9			
		Testing Problems pg. 10			
		Time management pg. 11			
		Strand Model Problems pg. 12			

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Magdalena	Rigor and Standards pg. 1	Unsure of the Program pg. 3	Cultural exchanges pg. 8	Adherence to Research and Data pg. 10	Did Not Know Much pg. 16
	Professional Development pg. 18	Teachers Know More, I am not the Expert pg. 4		Providing Professional Development pg. 15	

		Teacher Recruitment Problems pg. 5			
		Time management pg. 6			

Person	Leadership Experiences	Challenges	Benefits	Transformational	Language Acquisition
Dagoberto	Changing the World pg. 1	Outside Oppositional Forces pg. 5	Student Enhancement pg. 8	Changing the World pg.1	Professional Development pg. 17
	Passionate about Student Learning pg. 1	Teacher Preparation Problem pg. 5	Academic Results for Latinos pg. 9	Higher Purpose pg. 1	Translanguaging pg. 18
	Helping Latinos pg. 2	Parents not Understanding Dual Immersion pg. 6	Achieving Academic Parity Pg. 10	Providing Professional Development pg. 17	Practicing Oral Language pg. 19
	Helping the Disadvantaged pg. 2	Anti-immigrant Forces pg. 6	Academic Results for Latinos pg. 12	Brighter Futures pg. 24	Quality Spanish Teachers pg. 19
	Closing the Achievement Gap pg. 2		Parent Pride for their Students Pg. 13	Social Justice pg. 24	
	Seeking Parity pg. 3		Positive School Culture pg. 15	Goal Oriented pg. 25	
	Avoiding Childhood Trauma pg. 4		Biliteracy pg. 16		
			Cohesive Teachers pg. 16		