

DIVERSITY IN WORSHIP:
THE INTEGRATION OF HISTORIC WORKS INTO THE
CONTEMPORARY WORSHIP SERVICE, AS ILLUSTRATED BY THE OBOE

By

Bethany Butler

Liberty University

A LECTURE RECITAL PRESENTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT
OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS IN MUSIC AND WORSHIP

Liberty University

August, 2020

DIVERSITY IN WORSHIP:
THE INTEGRATION OF HISTORIC WORKS INTO THE
CONTEMPORARY WORSHIP SERVICE, AS ILLUSTRATED BY THE OBOE

by Bethany Butler

A Lecture Recital Presented in Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Arts in Music and Worship

Liberty University, Lynchburg, VA

August, 2020

APPROVED BY:

Rebecca Watson, D.M.A., Committee Advisor

Cassandra Hibbard, D.M.A., Committee Reader

Stephen Müller, Ph.D., Interim Residential Dean of the School of Music

ABSTRACT

Since the times of the New Testament, the church has inevitably found itself entangled in “Worship Wars,”¹ sparked by the introduction of new styles of music. Today, contemporary churches often only present one style of music while neglecting the rich history of sacred, instrumental music. When a single style of worship is exclusively offered in worship, the service can neglect to be multigenerational and multicultural, only relatable to some of the congregation, rather than the whole Body. If contemporary churches took a blended worship approach and integrated historic works into their worship services, the church would see growth in outreach, involvement of the congregation in worship, ministry opportunities and diversity.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many to whom I owe the success of this project. First, I am thankful for the faculty of the School of Music. Through both my undergrad and graduate work, each professor encouraged me in the development of my musicianship and demonstrated more grace than I deserved; to them I am deeply indebted.

I would especially like to thank my oboe professor and Committee Advisor, Dr. Rebecca Watson, for the impactful and significant role she has played in my development as an oboist and musician. Dr. Watson – not only are you an excellent musician and talented teacher, you are the epitome of kindness, gentleness and patience. You approach each of my lessons with intentionality and care deeply not only for my academic success, but also for my emotional and spiritual wellbeing. You have demonstrated to me how to graciously love and care for one's students and friends. Thank you for being a constant source of encouragement and a well spring of grace! I would not have completed this degree without you and I'm thankful God saw fit to bring you to Liberty, and in turn, into my life.

I'm also thankful for Dr. Cassandra Hibbard who graciously agreed to join my committee. Thank you for offering your valuable time and providing guidance in the "last hours" of my thesis, especially the guidance you offered for my presentation!

I am incredibly grateful for my family who have supported me at every step of my degree. Thank you for encouraging me and pushing me to the finish line. Mom and Dad – thank you for coming to all my many middle school, high school and university concerts, recitals and spending a fortune on oboe reeds. Thank you for investing in me and always believing in me, especially when I didn't believe in myself. God knew I needed you both in my life. I would not have completed this degree without you.

Thank you also to my Husband, Austin. Thank you for helping me make sense of music theory and spending hours in the songwriting lab doing homework with me. You have been a constant source of encouragement and love. I would not have finished this degree without you!

Lastly and most importantly, I would like to thank my Lord and Savior, Jesus Christ. He alone has graciously gifted me the ability and opportunity to study music. He alone sustains me and provides exactly what I need for each and every day. To God be the glory forever and ever.

Contents

CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION.....	2
Background.....	2
Statement of the Problem.....	3
Statement of the Purpose	4
Significance of the Study	4
Research Question and Sub Questions	4
Hypothesis.....	5
Definition of Terms.....	6
CHAPTER II: LITERATURE REVIEW	7
Introduction.....	7
Section One: The Lack of Historic Music in Contemporary Worship	7
Section Two: Biblical Support for Instrumental Music in Worship.....	8
Section Three: The Benefits of Historic Instrumental Music on the Mind and Spirit.....	9
Section Four: Opportunities in the Church.....	11
Section Five: Church Community and Diversity.....	12
Section Six: Practical Creation of the Blended Service.....	13
CHAPTER III: METHODS.....	15
Introduction.....	15
Design of Study.....	15
CHAPTER IV: RESEARCH FINDINGS	17
Section One: The Lack of Historical Music in Contemporary Worship	17
Section Two: Biblical Support for Instrumental Music in Worship.....	21
Section Three: The Benefits of Historical Instrumental Music on the Mind and Spirit.....	23
Section Four: Opportunities in the Church.....	26
Section Five: Church Community and Diversity.....	29
Section Six: Practical Creation of the Blended Service.....	33
CHAPTER V: CONCLUSION	36
Summary.....	36

Conclusion 37

Recommendations..... 38

BIBLIOGRAPHY..... 39

CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION

Background

The goal of the church in worship should be the bringing together of the whole Body of believers, using musical variety as a method to minister to all generations, cultures, and backgrounds. However, since the time of the New Testament, the church has inevitably found itself entangled in “Worship Wars,”² sparked by the introduction of new styles of music. These “Worship Wars” have continued through the history of the church, and today, one can see a battle waging. A struggle is experienced in many congregations between the music of the past and the contemporary music of today, which creates more division amid the church than that of denomination.³ Should there be a tug-of-war between new music and the old, or should both styles be equally presented? Integrating acoustic or auxiliary instruments, such as woodwind, brass or string instruments, into the contemporary church are an effective way of reaching a greater number in the church and community. For example, if the oboe is brought into modern worship services, opportunity is given to the congregation in offering their gifts in worship and engaging multigenerational worshippers with diverse worship music.⁴ Throughout this study, the oboe will be used as a method for practical application of historical sacred music in the contemporary worship service.

² “Worship Wars” are the intense differences of opinion in the Church caused by personal preference over issues such as song style, musical instruments, and approach to worship. Often “Worship Wars” result in serious discord and fallout in the Church body (Vernon Whaley, *Called to Worship: The Biblical Foundations of Our Response to God's Call* (Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2009), 26.

³ Michael Hakmin Lee, "Worship Style and Congregational Growth," *The Choral Journal* 58, no. 4 (11, 2017), 67.

⁴ Charlotte Yvonne Kroeker. *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*. (Herndon, VA: Alban Institute, 2011), 78.

Statement of the Problem

Many contemporary churches today present only one style of worship and exclude the use of historical, sacred music in their worship services. This should be a great concern for churches, as not every style of worship will ever sufficiently meet the needs of the congregation and the mission of the church.⁵ Not every member of the congregation prefers contemporary music over other styles of worship music, such as hymns, sacred tunes and instrumental music.⁶ Sometimes, even the purpose of the music can be different. Contemporary music has been described as “more as an experience of receiving blessing from God, rather than responding to God’s majesty with praise.”⁷ While contemporary music “has become an integral part of worship within many types of Christian congregations,”⁸ adding a variety of musical styles could better round out the worship presented in service. For “if the musical intensity of [contemporary worship music] is our benchmark for optimal worship, then singing at a church service filled with noisy kids, elderly folks, and people from different cultural backgrounds will let us down.”⁹ The goal as a church should be to minister to all generations, background and cultures found in the congregation, and variety in music can best serve all members.

⁵ Joseph Hellerman. *When the Church Was a Family: Recapturing Jesus’ Vision for Authentic Christian Community*. (Nashville: B & H Academic, 2009), 143.

⁶ Robin A. Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” *Choral Journal* 43, no. 7 (February 2003), 51.

⁷ Matt Merker, “How Contemporary Worship Music Is Shaping Us-for Better or Worse,” February 6, 2019, <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/reviews/singing-congregation-contemporary-worship/>.

⁸ Monique Marie Ingalls, *Singing the Congregation: How Contemporary Worship Music Forms Evangelical Community* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018), 12.

⁹ Merker, “Contemporary Worship.”

Statement of the Purpose

The purpose of this thesis is to present a model of how worship can reach more diverse backgrounds, cultures, and generations. By presenting more than one style of music in our worship, the church can broaden and deepen their influence in the surrounding community, while also providing opportunities for service, discipleship, and education.

Significance of the Study

This thesis will explore alternate models of worship and aim to present a perspective on improving outreach to people in our communities. By presenting diverse music in our worship, the church would involve a wider range of the congregation and community and encourages the participation in worship, service and using their gifts to the glory of God.

Research Question and Sub Questions

In the development of this paper, a variety of research questions were asked. For Research Question One, I asked “What role does other types of music play in a contemporary worship service?” was an important starting point. Once discovering the benefits of the blended style of worship, I explored Research Question Two: “What is the role of classical instrumentation in worship?” Once the role of the orchestra and classical instruments was identified, I studied Research Question Three, which asked “How would this enhance our worship?”, by looking at the opportunities for outreach in the community and the involvement of a wider range of generations in the church. Once the previous questions were answered, only Research Question Four remained: “What is the impact of this thesis on a contemporary worship service?” Now that all inquiries and studies had been made, how would all this information effect a modern Sunday morning service? This thesis calls for reform of the contemporary worship service by adding variety of music in worship, by involving a greater number and depth

of the congregation in service and the using of their talents in worship, by reaching a greater number in the community and increasing diversity and by providing greater methods of discipleship and ministry opportunities.

Hypothesis

This thesis explores and defends the presentation of historic, sacred music in contemporary worship services; if worship music is diversified, then a greater number of people in the congregation could be enriched and inspired in their worship.

Definition of Terms

Blended Worship: the blending or convergence of both contemporary and historical worship traditions.¹⁰

Historic Musical Works: any instrumental work in the public domain, or from which the composer has passed away 75 years before the present. For example, this would include music from the age of Gregorian Chant to the Impressionist movement of the 19th century.

Traditional Worship: a style of worship that that can be comprised of choirs, orchestras, organs, piano, and other acoustic instruments, while allowing for instrumental interludes and sacred liturgy. This style of worship generally involves the presentation of hymns and sacred tunes.

Contemporary Worship: a modern style of worship, generally reflective of contemporary music culture and mainstream worship music. This style of worship most commonly involves the electric and acoustic guitar, piano, drums and the worship leader accompanied by a small group of vocalists.

Blended Worship: a style of worship that incorporates more than one genre of worship music. Typically, this involves the combination of contemporary and traditional worship styles.

¹⁰ J. Ligon Duncan et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views* (Nashville, TN: B & H Academic, 2009), 183.

CHAPTER II: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

This chapter assesses current literature that investigates the impact of instrumental and historic music in the contemporary church. Section One discusses the lack and the drawbacks of historic music in contemporary worship. Section Two reviews the biblical support for instrumental music in worship. Section Three explores the great benefit and effect of instrumental music on both the mind and the spirit. Section Four discusses the various opportunities instrumental music creates for the church community, including outreach, service opportunities and the cultivation of multigenerational interaction. Section Five examines the practical creation of the blended service. Section Six evaluates the creation of diversity and community within the church body through the introduction of historic instrumental music. Lastly, Section Seven discusses the benefits and role of the oboe in worship services.

Section One: The Lack of Historic Music in Contemporary Worship

There are not many sources dedicated to the explanation of the lack of historic music in worship services. However, there are many that discuss how to conduct music in worship, and the majority exclude the inclusion of historic music. Instead, most sources explain how to create a modern “worship experience” and the importance of technology, lighting and design.¹¹

Robin Leaver, Emeritus Professor of Sacred Music at Westminster Choir College of Rider University, discusses the “Church Growth” movement. This movement can be defined as the disposal any and all historic music and replacing it with contemporary Christian worship

¹¹ Thomas S. Friedman, "Enhancing the Worship Experience," *Projection, Lights & Staging News* 17, no. 7 (08, 2016): 40-1.

music in an effort to grow the church.¹² Leaver suggests that the church should provide both contemporary and historic music in worship services.¹³ He also explores the common themes seen in worship music across the centuries, demonstrating that music composition tends to repeat past techniques and styles. Leaver then explores church composers throughout history, including Johann Sebastian Bach and Ernst Pepping.¹⁴

Leaver also shares that a barrier to sacred music in contemporary worship is the lack of time given to the Sunday morning anthem, special music or offertory. Also, if an attempt is made to perform historic music in the time given, a severely (and often badly) edited version is used in place of the original composition, which results in a musically-poor presentation.¹⁵ He also suggests that historic music should not be presented in worship unless it was composed with the intention of being used in a sacred setting. He believes this would distract from the flow of the worship, making the listener feel as if they were enjoying a concert interlude rather than another part of worship.¹⁶ His belief differs from many of the sources presented in this chapter.

Section Two: Biblical Support for Instrumental Music in Worship

Paul Westermeyer, Professor of Church Music at Luther Seminary and President of the Hymn Society, discusses the timeline of music as seen in the Bible. He examines the instruments found in the Old Testament temple, as seen through the book of Psalms.¹⁷ He also shares of the

¹² Leaver, "Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship," 51.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Ibid., 55.

¹⁵ Ibid., 58.

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Paul Westermeyer, *Te Deum: The Church and Music* (Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 1998), 22.

variety areas in Scripture where instrumental music is encouraged, such as in Ephesians, Psalms and 1 Samuel. Bob Kauflin, worship leader and Director of Sovereign Grace Music, shares that instrumental music is a method of meditation and reflection, while its diversity reflects the various characteristics of God.¹⁸ Mark Dever, Senior Pastor of Capitol Hill Baptist Church and president of 9Marks, a Christian ministry that provides a variety of resources (podcasts, articles, books, etc.) to churches across the globe, and Michael Lawrence, Associate Pastor at Capitol Hill Baptist Church, agree with Kauflin on the importance of variety in worship music. Dever and Lawrence suggest that by presenting music in a variety of styles, and reverence and awe of God is promoted.¹⁹

Section Three: The Benefits of Historic Instrumental Music on the Mind and Spirit

The benefits of instrumental music have been explored in a variety of works. One of the topics covered include the effect of historic instrumental music on the brain. Gary McPherson, music educator, musician and the Director of the Ormond Chair of Music at the Melbourne Conservatorium of Music, shares the impact of instrumental music on childhood development. He also explains the importance of exposure to a variety of musical styles, that by listening to more than one style of music, our brains are seen to reap great development and growth. Physicist Gordon L. Shaw and neuroscientist Matthew Peterson, cofounders of Music Intelligence Neural Development (MIND) Research Institute, support McPherson's stance on the effect of instrumental music on the brain. Shaw and Peterson write that music involves spatial-temporal reasoning, which assists us in a variety of problem-solving functions.²⁰

¹⁸ Kauflin. *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*, 104.

¹⁹ Ligon J. Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*. (Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2009), 208.

Instrumental music is also an effective avenue to communicate and share emotions.²¹ Iain McGilchrist, psychiatrist and Research Fellow at a variety of prestigious institutions, including the Royal College of Psychiatrists and Johns Hopkins University Medical School, shares that music allows the expression of something beyond mere words.²² Since the act of thought does not depend on the speaking of a language, instrumental music encourages deep thought and reflection.²³ Oliver Sacks, neurologist, naturalist, and historian of science, shares how music produces emotional, moving experiences.²⁴ Sacks writes about the ability of music to speak to and communicate our deepest feelings.²⁵ Instrumental music is a way to communicate and share in a variety of emotions, while also helping to process feelings and calm hearts.²⁶

Jonathan Arnold, Chaplain and Senior Research Fellow at Worcester College, agrees with McGilchrist, writing that instrumental music creates space for deep thought and reflection.²⁷ In addition, this allows the listener the space to be quiet and provides “encouragement to take attention away from ourselves and learn to take time to repeat the process of prayerful music-making, to listen, to be still, to be patient.”²⁸ Arnold also shares contemporary worship focuses

²⁰ Gordon L. Shaw and Matthew Peterson, *Keeping Mozart in Mind* (San Diego, CA: Elsevier Academic Press, 2004), 31.

²¹ Iain McGilchrist, *The Master and His Emissary: the Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019), 103.

²² *Ibid.*, 124.

²³ *Ibid.*, 109.

²⁴ Oliver W. Sacks, *Musicophilia: Tales of Music and the Brain* (New York, NY: Random House Publishing, 2007), 312.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 329.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 330.

²⁷ Jonathan Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014), 41.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, 106.

mainly on emotive experiences, while instrumental music paints a story in the mind of the listener, yet allows for reflection on scripture presented alongside the piece.

In addition, there are few sources that specifically discuss the benefit of the oboe in worship. However, William G. Whittaker, an English composer, musicologist, and Bach scholar, discusses the importance of the oboe in sacred, instrumental works. For example, Whittaker writes on the “very large part” the oboe plays in J.S. Bach’s compositions.²⁹ Whittaker noted Bach’s “fondness for accompanying a solo voice with oboes”³⁰ and how he frequently used the oboe to add richness, color and emotion to his pieces. Whittaker describes the oboe as having a “haunting beauty of tone and tenderness”³¹ which excellently supports the emotion and message of the Scripture presented through Bach’s work.

Section Four: Opportunities in the Church

A variety of sources have demonstrated the overall appeal of historic music in musical circles of secular society. Jonathan Arnold writes about the appeal of historic music in both religious and secular settings.³² He shares that the interest in historic, sacred works is growing in the secular world and how this interest demonstrates a desire for authentic spirituality.³³ Through this interest, the church has an avenue to share the gospel. Arnold also writes that both religious and sacred circles share a common respect and enjoyment of performing in a group.³⁴

²⁹ William G. Whittaker, "Some Problems in the Performance of Bach's Church Cantatas," *Proceedings of the Musical Association* 54, no. 1 (1927): 44, accessed July 29, 2020, doi:10.1093/jrma/54.1.35)

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 45.

³¹ Whittaker, "Some Problems," 48.

³² Jonathan Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, 44.

³³ *Ibid.*, 99-100.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 134.

Charlotte Kroeker, the Executive Director of Church Music Initiative (CMI) at the Institute for Church Life at the University of Notre Dame, agrees with Arnold about unique opportunities create by sacred music for community outreach. Sacred music casts a wider net of interest for the music ministry, attracting those who may not be interested in contemporary music. She also shares that instrumental music promotes diversity in the congregation by providing diverse music selection in worship.³⁵ David Elliot, Professor of Music and Music Education at NYU and creator of the Praxial Philosophy of Music, shares in Kroeker's view, writing that instrumental music has the ability to engage communities. He shares how participation in music has the ability to "engage people's beliefs about deeply important matters: about culturally shared expressions of emotion, culture-specific traditions of artistry, community values, or musical characterizations of socially shared events, personalities, or issues."³⁶

Section Five: Church Community and Congregational Diversity

There are a variety sources written on the topic of the diversity created by a blended worship service. Dever and Lawrence share that music should draw together the body of worshippers.³⁷ Kauflin believes that musical variety best depicts God's heart for all races, cultures, and generations.³⁸ Holly Allen, Professor of Family Science and Christian ministries at Lipscomb University, and Christine Lawton, Executive Director of Teacher Programming at PathLight International, agree with Dever, Lawrence and Kauflin in the diverse and

³⁵ Kroeker, *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*, 77.

³⁶ David J. Elliott, *Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1995), 205.

³⁷ Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*, 206.

³⁸ Bob Kauflin, *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*, 105.

multigenerational community of worship. They write that congregational worship should be focused on intergenerational worship through the presentation of a variety of musical styles.³⁹ Lawton and Dever also share that intergenerational worship should not only be presented in main services, but also in the children and youth ministries.⁴⁰ Joseph Hellerman, Professor of New Testament Language and Literature at Talbot School of Theology, concurs with Allen and Lawton about the importance of intergenerational worship.⁴¹

Sources have also shown the value of participating in musical ensembles, especially those made of a range of ages and generations. Eugene Roehlkepartain, Vice President of Research and Development at the Search Institute, shares a study on spiritual development, and how the best way to further one's faith is through participating in faith-based, age-integrated experiences.⁴² Kroeker agrees with Roehlkepartain's study, sharing that music is an excellent method in bringing people together of varying ages.⁴³ She also shares that time in a church ensemble has shown to benefit the member's spiritual growth.⁴⁴

Section Six: Practical Creation of the Blended Service

There are a variety of sources that touch on the topic of the blended worship service, but none share an in-depth process in creating a service containing both contemporary worship and

³⁹ Ross and Allen, *Intergenerational Christian Formation: Bringing the Whole Church Together in Ministry, Community and Worship*, 54.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 197.

⁴¹ Hellerman, *When the Church Was a Family*, 143.

⁴² Eugene Roehlkepartain, "Engaging International Advisors in Creating a Shared Understanding of Spiritual Development: Seeking Common Ground in Understanding Spiritual Development: A Preliminary Theoretical Framework," (Research Gate), Search Institute, 2012.

⁴³ Charlotte Yvonne Kroeker, *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*, 29.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 31.

historic, instrumental literature. Lawrence and Dever, “introduced” in Section Two, share the definition of blended worship. Both authors state that blended worship is not a blending of truths or truth-perspectives, diverse theological and liturgical traditions, or elements of worship;⁴⁵ rather, it is the “blending of contemporary and historical worship traditions.”⁴⁶ Kroeker, “presented” in Section Three, discusses methods of funding a music ministry containing a variety of musical ensembles, like choirs and orchestras. She presents her study, describing the way in which churches fundraised for music ministry resources, and through the funding raised, the ministries became self-sufficient. Kroeker also writes about the necessary relationship between the music minister and the worship leader, and how each must work together to create a strong program capable of presenting blended worship. In addition, she includes how to best reach a diverse group of people needed to create music ensembles, and also shares how new music should be introduced to a congregation. However, Kroeker does not discuss an effective method of introducing historic, classical literature to a primarily contemporary audience.

Mike Breaux, author and former Teaching Pastor for Heartland Community Church, and Robin Leaver discuss how sacred music might be introduced in the modern church service, especially when the typical five-minute time slot for special music cannot accommodate the lengthy timing of most historical works.

The method in which one can determine how sacred music can be introduced into worship services, along with the discovery of the many benefits of diversity in worship music, will be further discussed in chapter III.

⁴⁵ Ligon J. Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*, 184-186.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 183.

CHAPTER III: METHODS

Introduction

In researching for this project, source material was gathered using a qualitative research method with a historic approach. The aim of this study was to uncover the lack of historic music in contemporary worship services, discover the benefits found in historic instrumental music and the method in which instrumental historic music, with special application given to the oboe, could be practically and successfully integrated into the contemporary worship service.

Design of Study

By looking at examples of worship styles seen in throughout the history of the church, as well as current examples of modern, blended-style churches, I am able to accurately supply the best method for the integration of historic music in contemporary worship services. The research completed involved the reading of various church studies, which assessed the success of both contemporary, traditional and blended styles of worship, along with the method in which historic music has been successfully presented in modern churches. In addition to studies, I also reviewed numerous books and articles written on the impact of the various styles of worship in churches, including the drawbacks of a church presenting only one style of worship, and the benefits of blended worship. A vital area of my research included the exploration of instrumental music's effect upon both the spirit and the brain. This became a strong base to my research, as the benefits seen in brain development and spiritual growth are alone themselves arguments to the inclusion of instrumental music in the church. If the purpose of the church is to develop strong, mature Disciples of Christ, then the maintenance of one's spirit and mind must be a priority.

By reviewing literature on the topics of the brain, spiritual growth, church involvement, community outreach, benefits and the practical creation of the blended service, and the biblical

support for instrumental music, I was well equipped to develop sound reasoning for the integration of historical instrumental works in the contemporary worship service.

CHAPTER IV: RESEARCH FINDINGS

Section One: The Lack of Historical Music in Contemporary Worship

Conflicts between traditional and contemporary music have been a constant battle in the church, with traditional music, more times often than not on the losing side. According to Leaver, the decline of traditional, or simply instrumental music, is due to the “Church Growth” movement, which promotes the discarding of any and all historical music and replacing it with contemporary Christian worship music in an effort to grow the church.⁴⁷ If the work of the church is to be more than the promotion of “Christian propaganda and the marketing of a specific Christian package,”⁴⁸ then our worship must move beyond presenting only contemporary worship and should instead provide both contemporary and historical music in worship services. Therefore, by the omission of traditional and instrumental works in favor of the exclusive presentation of contemporary music, the mission of the church is negatively affected.

There are a variety of reasons traditional music is widely omitted from contemporary worship services. For one, only three to four minutes is generally given to the Sunday morning anthem, special music or offertory.⁴⁹ This short amount of time does not allow for the presentation of historical sacred music of earlier generations and if an attempt is made to perform historical music in the small time given, a severely and often poorly edited version is used instead of the original composition, which results in a poor presentation.⁵⁰ For example, Leaver describes revised versions of Bach chorales: “We use poor editions of earlier worship music that

⁴⁷ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 51.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 58.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

is trivialized by the editorial process, like three-part arrangements of Bach's four-part chorales--a contradiction in terms--or the omission of great sections of a piece that disturbs the musical logic and development carefully created by the composer.”⁵¹ As one can imagine, a poor presentation of historical works does not advocate well for its genre and does not encourage a repeated performance.

An example of an historic work devoid of poor editing is Gabriel Fauré’s *Sicilienne, Op. 78* from *Pelléas at Mélisande*.⁵² While this work is an arrangement and not the original composition, this work keeps the initial compositional structure intact. Being about four minutes long, this piece would fit within the customary three to four-minute time period given to special or offertory music. *Sicilienne, Op. 78* was arranged by Fauré in 1898 during the Romantic Era. Music during this period was characterized by a “great emphasis on the workings of the unconscious mind, on dreams and reveries, [and] on the supernatural.”⁵³ Distinctive of its time, this piece gently relays emotion and provides a moment for reflection and contemplation. This work would be perfect for opening hearts to prayer and readying the soul for the reading of Scripture.

Another reason historical works are neglected in contemporary worship services is the belief that, in order to grow in church attendance, “the first thing to do is fire traditional church musicians, discard all "historic" music from choir-room closets, and use only that music in

⁵¹ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 58.

⁵² Gabriel Fauré, “Sicilienne from Pelléas at Mélisande,” *Solos for Oboe*, Nancy Clauter, ed. (Canada: Carl Fischer, LLC, 2006), 53-59.

⁵³ Reginald P.C. Mutter and Michael Cordner, “English Literature,” *Encyclopædia Britannica* (Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., February 4, 2019), <https://www.britannica.com/art/English-literature/The-Romantic-period>).

worship that carries the Contemporary Christian label.”⁵⁴ This belief has allowed marketing to overtake that of evangelism and has placed an emphasis on the presentation of only one style of worship music. Leaver suggests that in choosing a music for worship, churches should pose the question “What is church music?” rather than “What is church music for?”⁵⁵ Church music should be “the vehicle of praise, prayer, aspiration, inspiration, acclamation, meditation, corporate response, individual response, etc.,” which no one musical style can support.⁵⁶ Therefore, a variety of musical styles is necessary for the spiritual growth and health of a church body.

In addition, historical music is often removed from contemporary services because many believe that music of the past no longer speaks to people of the present day.⁵⁷ However, this is entirely inaccurate. The reality of worship music is that it is both contemporary and historical in nature. The present is always built on the past, and “even if we consciously attempt to eliminate historic music from our worship, while we may be able to eradicate the types of music we identify as historic, nevertheless historic dimensions will always be heard.”⁵⁸ Leaver states that since the early centuries of music, “composers [have] use[d] specific, historical elements to create their new music.”⁵⁹ For example, seventeenth century composer Michael Praetorius “rework[ed] ancient chant forms, [and] adapt[ed] compositions of sixteenth-century masters such

⁵⁴ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 51.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid., 56.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid., 55.

Josquin,”⁶⁰ in order to create his large and diverse group of vocal, choral and congregational music for the Lutheran church. Eighteenth century composer Johann Sebastian Bach combined the melodies of sixteenth century cantatas with his new compositions, which were created by the combination of sixteenth century chant and contemporary dance forms.⁶¹ For example, *La Fiolia*, a European melodic theme composed in the late fifteenth century, inspired numerous musical variations, used by composers such as Bach and Antonio Vivaldi.⁶² Early twentieth century composers Ernst Pepping, Johann Nepomuk David, and Hugo Distler, who were considered “starkly contemporary composers of worship music,”⁶³ created compositions that echoed “Baroque forms and seventeenth-century contrapuntal techniques.”⁶⁴

An example of a piece that reflects more than one era of musical history is Gabriel Fauré’s “Pavane,” Op. 50. Composed in 1899, this piece reflects a slow processional from the 16th century, in which Faure imagined “that a little princess might, in former, times, have danced at the Spanish court.”⁶⁵ Reflective of an earlier time,⁶⁶ Pavane provides a unique style and communicates more than one period of musical history. In addition, seen through the arrangement for oboe and piano, this piece produces a calming emotion, heard through the quiet, fluid melodic line played by the oboe. In the middle of the piece, however, a different emotion is presented through the accented notes of the oboe, reflective of a storm and dramatic emotions.

⁶⁰ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 55.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² Ibid., 56.

⁶³ Ibid.

⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁵ Robert Andres, "An Introduction to the Solo Piano Music of Debussy and Ravel," BBC (accessed June 29, 2020, <https://www.bbc.co.uk/radio3/classical/raveldebussy/recital2.shtml>)

⁶⁶ Ibid.

The piece ends as it began, with the same calm sentiments expressed. This work would be perfect in reflecting one of David's many laments, such as Psalm 86 and 22. Both Psalms include emotions of calm praise and the communication of fear, anger and despair. The Psalms are an excellent example of the support of instrumental music in worship, which will be further discussed in Section Two.

Section Two: Biblical Support for Instrumental Music in Worship

Biblical scholars have noted the presence of instrumental music throughout the Bible, but it is significantly highlighted in the Old Testament. Throughout the Psalms, a variety of instruments are mentioned, such as the *kinnor* (similar to the violin), *nevel* (similar to the lute), *shofar* (similar to the trumpet), and *magrepha* (primitive pipe organ).⁶⁷ The temple is also believe to have contained an orchestra, comprised of “two to nine nevels, nine to limitless numbers of kinnors, one cymbal, and two to twelve halils, [with] a minimum number of twelve instruments required.”⁶⁸ Percussion was also used in the temple, including shakers, various types of cymbals, the *tof* (“little drum”), and bells on the priests' robes.⁶⁹ According to Westermeyer, in the Old Testament temple “instruments were prominent...especially in the rendering of the Psalms.”⁷⁰ For example, in Psalm 150, as David calls for the praise of God through the harp, lyre, timbrel, strings, trumpet and clash of cymbals (Psalm 150:3-5). Bob Kauflin discusses the word *selah*, which “appears frequently in the Psalms. Many scholars think it refers to a musical

⁶⁷ Westermeyer, *Te Deum: The Church and Music*, 21.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, 22.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 21.

interlude for meditation or reflection... There are numerous passages where God commends instrumental music to praise him (for example, Psalm 33:3; 71:22; 150:3– 5).”⁷¹

Through the Old Testament, one can see instrumental music providing moments for reflection on God and His character. Kauflin shares that “musical diversity reflects the varying aspects of God’s nature. He is transcendent and imminent. He splits mountains and clothes the lilies. We worship him as our Creator and Redeemer, King and Father. How can anyone think that a single kind of music could adequately express the fullness of God’s glory?”⁷² Instrumental music not only allows for reflection, but in the Scriptures, one can see how it is soothing and calming to the soul. In 1 Samuel, Saul is terrified by an evil spirit and calls for David to play the harp for him. As David plays the harp, “Saul would relax and feel better, and the evil spirit would go away” (1 Samuel 16:23).

Reflective of David and his harp, Camille Saint-Saëns’ *The Swan*, arranged for oboe accompanied by a harp-like piano part, is a beautifully relaxed work. The peace demonstrated by a swan as it gracefully glides through the water, heard through the gentle arpeggios of the harp, was Saint-Saëns’ inspiration for this piece.⁷³ Just as David’s playing calmed Saul during his time of distress, so would *The Swan* provide a time of peace and calm for all those in the congregation. At three minutes in length, this piece would be placed well during the time of offertory or as special music. In addition, not only is instrumental music supported by the Bible, one can also see the benefits of instrumental music on the mind and spirit.

⁷¹ Kauflin, *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*, 120.

⁷² *Ibid.*, 104

⁷³ Arnold Steinhardt, “A Violinist Reflects on His Love of Camille Saint-Saëns’ ‘The Swan,’” *Playbill*, July 3, 2018, (accessed August 6, 2020, <https://www.playbill.com/article/a-violinist-reflects-on-his-love-of-camille-saint-saens-the-swan>).

Section Three: The Benefits of Historical Instrumental Music on the Mind and Spirit

As the church, we are called to nurture and grow the body of Christ and to honor God with all our soul and mind (Matthew 22:37).⁷⁴ In order to further advocate for the use of historical, instrumental music in the church, it's important to explore the basic benefits of instrumental music, on both the mind and spirit.

Instrumental music is incredibly impactful on the mind. Research has shown that while babies are still in the womb, they can “respond to sounds with activations in the left auditory cortex.”⁷⁵ Instrumental music also helps a variety of other areas. Studies have shown that “children who participated in three years of instrumental music study had higher scores than control counterparts” in a variety of tasks, including auditory discrimination, fine motor skills, vocabulary and nonverbal reasoning skills.⁷⁶ Music has also been proven as a calming balm and has demonstrated the ability to produce positive behaviors in individuals with schizophrenia and autism.⁷⁷ From these studies, we see that instrumental music offers great benefits in development and in the stewarding of our minds. Also, there is importance in being exposed to a variety of musical styles. By listening to more than one genre of music, our mind is literally opening doors of understanding by creating various neural networks.⁷⁸ This is a strong advocate for the use of more than one genre of music in worship services.

⁷⁴ Unless otherwise noted, all biblical passages referenced are in the English Standard Version (Wheaton, IL: Crossway, 2008).

⁷⁵ McPherson, *The Child as Musician: A Handbook of Musical Development*, 56.

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, 58.

⁷⁷ Sacks, *Musicophilia: Tales of Music and the Brain*, 334-338.

⁷⁸ McPherson, *The Child as Musician: A Handbook of Musical Development*, 57.

One can also see the effect instrumental music has on the mind in regard to communication. According to McGilchrist, core purpose of why humans communicate is to share emotions.⁷⁹ Our thought does not depend on the speaking of a language, such as “complex reasoning and mathematical calculation”.⁸⁰ Music allows us to express “something beyond ourselves,” something that requires more than words to effectively and fully communicate.⁸¹ Most of our thinking takes place without the presence of words and some of our deepest thoughts, such as the use of our imagination, perceptive problem solving and spiritual reflection, “require us to transcend language.”⁸² Instrumental music is perfect for allowing space for thought and reflection during a service or as a prelude, such as contemplating on a passage of Scripture or a biblical teaching. Music “is essentially emotional, as it is essentially intellectual,” that when we listen to music, “we may be moved to the depths even as we appreciate the formal structure of a composition.”⁸³ Sacks writes about the ability of music to “piece the heart,” having the “unique power to express inner states and feelings.”⁸⁴ Music is a way to communicate and share in a variety of emotions, “for while such music makes on experience pain and grief more intensely, it brings solace and consolation at the same time.”⁸⁵

⁷⁹ McGilchrist, *The Master and His Emissary: the Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World*, 105.

⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, 109.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 124.

⁸² *Ibid.*, 107.

⁸³ Sacks, *Musicophilia: Tales of Music and the Brain*, 312.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 329.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 330.

For the spirit, historical sacred music creates space for deep thought and reflection, to be patient and still. Arnold shares the meditative nature of sacred music:

If music helps us to learn about something greater than ourselves, which we call ‘God’, then it is that encouragement to take attention away from ourselves and learn to take time to repeat the process of prayerful music-making, to listen, to be still, to be patient. Perhaps what we learn from good sacred music is what it means just to be.⁸⁶

In addition to reflection, historical instrumental music also creates a storyline for the congregation to follow and think upon while listening to the piece. While contemporary music generally encourages purely highly emotional experiences, which Arnold describes as “clouding the distinction between spirituality and mere feeling,”⁸⁷ sacred music instead carries a rich narrative and touches the heart deeply, in addition to emotion. Historic music, such as the work of Johann Sebastian Bach, was created with the intent to draw the listener into a state of contemplation and reflection on God, with the goal to “make their listeners feel like they were in heaven, so there might be a connection between complexity and the mind of God – the window onto the divine.”⁸⁸ Instrumental music not only communicates emotions, but it also has proven itself to be an effective method of the storytelling of biblical history.

An excellent example of music’s ability to express deep emotion without words is Sergei Rachmaninoff’s *Vocalise*. This piece was composed during the late Romantic period in 1916 and is described as having a “haunting beauty” and “is generally seen as giving

⁸⁶ Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, 106.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 107.

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, 42.

expression to a wide array of feelings—longing, tenderness, sorrow, struggle, resolution, and final rest.”⁸⁹ In the arrangement for oboe and piano, the oboe performs the lamentation, full of emotion and tenderness, projecting a “beauty, warmth, and rare simplicity.”⁹⁰ The piece would be excellent when the Scripture presented in service is reflective of those emotions. For example, the period of Holy Week provides a time of serious and heavy reflection, such as Jesus’ death on the cross and His agonizing struggle in the Garden of Gethsemane is presented (Matthew 26:36-46). While sacred instrumental music is excellent in depicting the message of Scripture, it also provides many opportunities in the church, from congregational participation to an avenue for community outreach.

Section Four: Opportunities in the Church

The nature of instrumental, sacred music can create opportunities in the church to encourage congregational participation and service, opening for outreach, and an avenue to teach faith and life-long musical skills. According to author Jonathan Arnold, interest in historic, sacred works are “as strong as they have ever been, and remain part of a tradition stretching back over a thousand years of musical and religious development.”⁹¹ This “huge level of interest” in sacred music demonstrates how the secular world is “seeking a deeper understanding of reality than can be grasped with a purely materialistic view of the world.”⁹² Interestingly, “a society that

⁸⁹ Richard D. Sylvester, *Rachmaninoff's Complete Songs: A Companion with Texts and Translations*, (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014), 220.

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, 221.

⁹¹ Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, 51.

⁹² *Ibid.*, 99-100.

seems to refuse to accept theology as part of everyday life still acknowledges and relates to the intrinsic theological essence of sacred works of art.”⁹³ While the world as whole seems totally indifferent in things of the Bible or in the Church, sacred music is the exception. Society is looking for something more, something greater than what the world currently has to offer. Through this interest, the church has an incredible opportunity to share the gospel and the love of Christ. Robin Leaver encourages the Church to not disregard this demonstrated curiosity in sacred music, for “contrary to what Church Growth gurus would have us believe, there is an extremely broad interest in historic worship music that we cannot afford to ignore.”⁹⁴

Not only is the music itself inviting to secular society, but the community of an instrumental ensemble is also attractive to those outside the church. Both religious and secular circles share a common respect and enjoyment of performing in a group, for “a community of completely distinct individuals all united in a common meaningful totality is a symbol of the social order...which is maybe what Western civilization is all about.”⁹⁵ When those outside the church are brought into a music ensemble, the church has the opportunity for teaching and discipling. Music ensembles, such as an orchestra, provides a method to teach Scripture, for “the integration of music-making with a coherent and well thought-out theology... establishes a foundation for catechesis— a means of teaching the faith —and focused outreach to the parish, the diocese, and the city.”⁹⁶

⁹³ Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, 122.

⁹⁴ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 57.

⁹⁵ Arnold, *Sacred Music in Secular Society*, 134.

⁹⁶ Charlotte Yvonne Kroeker. *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*. (Herndon, VA: Alban Institute, 2011), 25.

Sacred music also casts a wider net of interest among church members and invites those who may not be interested in contemporary music to participate in leading worship. Kroeker shares that “musical ability and enjoyment are God-given gifts... intended to be shared”⁹⁷ and a gift to be joined with other followers of Christ. Also, by providing diverse music selection in worship, a multicultural environment is created, where people are invited to find a “home there and an invitation by staff, choir, and congregation to join in the fun.”⁹⁸ Through this unique environment, church music ensembles offer discipleship opportunities. All ages are encouraged to be involved and to lead worship together. Ensembles created within a church present a unique opportunity that many general community ensembles do not. A church choir, orchestra or any other ensemble provides the opportunity to not only perform and rehearse excellent music, but to also have the mission of the ensemble reflective of that of the church. Only the church can offer the mission of performing music as an opportunity to serve and to love others as Jesus loved the world.

Participation in music “engage[s] people’s beliefs about deeply important matters: about culturally shared expressions of emotion, culture-specific traditions of artistry, community values, or musical characterizations of socially shared events, personalities, or issues.”⁹⁹ By creating a place for instrumental music in the contemporary church, more of the congregation can participate in leading worship by engaging in a variety of musical styles and through the playing their instruments.

⁹⁷ Kroeker, *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*, 69.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, 77.

⁹⁹ David J. Elliott, *Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1995), 205.

An example of piece that would be appropriate for a church service, while also appealing to the secular music community, is Johann Sebastian Bach's "Aria" [*Erbarne Dich*] from *St. Matthew's Passion*. This piece has been "universally acknowledged to be one of the world's supreme musical masterpieces" and the "greatest of Christian works."¹⁰⁰ Being loved by the secular music world and a sacred work inspired by Scripture, this piece is perfect for presentation in worship. The whole work of *St. Matthew's Passion* places chapters 26 and 27 of the Gospel of Matthew to music. "Aria," titled [*Erbarne Dich*], which means "have mercy," highlights Peter's regret in denying Jesus three times. This piece presents the anguish Peter experienced and is described as "heart rendering and moving,"¹⁰¹ and thus would be appropriate in a presentation during Holy Week, or on a Sunday when the reflection on the depth of our sins is called for, while recognizing that in our sorrow, God is gracious, loving and forgiving. Since this piece is attractive to those outside the church, due to the fame of Bach and the respect shown to this work by the music world, this piece would be an excellent method of outreach and ministry.

Section Five: Church Community and Congregational Diversity

By integrating historic works into the contemporary worship service, community and diversity can be created. As the church, "our worship should be unifying rather than individualizing."¹⁰² The music we select in worship should not "allow us essentially to have our private quiet times in a big room with lots of other people. Rather, the forms of our worship

¹⁰⁰ Celia Applegate, *Bach in Berlin: Nation and Culture in Mendelssohn's Revival of the "St. Matthew Passion"* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2005), 175.

¹⁰¹ Peter Williams, *Bach: A Musical Biography*, (New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2020), 639.

¹⁰² Ligon J. Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*, 205.

should deliberately bring us together as a body of worshipers.”¹⁰³ The goal of worship on a Sunday morning is to bring together the community of believers. In order to best reach those in our communities, musical variety is paramount, for “musical variety communicates God’s heart for all generations, cultures, and races.”¹⁰⁴ By presenting a blended worship service, with musical variety added in addition to the contemporary worship style, a service becomes something for everyone and “a truer picture of God and a truer picture of the Church.”¹⁰⁵ By integrating historic instrumental music into a contemporary worship service, diversity is produced and more of God’s creative character is presented.

Worship should bring the generations represented in the church together, as intergenerational worship is beneficial to the spiritual growth of the church.¹⁰⁶ Presenting a variety of worship styles is one way to create intergenerational worship. Allen and Lawton suggest that “one’s first music “language” is one’s heart music. What a blessing it would be if the next generation were to become “multilingual” musically from childhood...through a wide range of musical worship styles.”¹⁰⁷ Ross and Allen speak to the importance of exposing the church to a variety of musical styles:

Perhaps it can also be said that one’s first music “language” is one’s heart music. What a blessing it would be if the next generation were to become “multilingual” musically from childhood— that is, they would be able to express their spiritual praise, lament, adoration, petition and love through a wide range of musical worship styles. For this blessing to occur, it is keenly important that the worship music of our children and youth tap into the depth and breadth of theologically sound, melodically memorable,

¹⁰³ Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*, 206.

¹⁰⁴ Bob Kauflin. *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*, 105.

¹⁰⁵ Ross and Allen, “*Intergenerational Christian Formation*,” 195.

¹⁰⁶ *Ibid.*, 54.

¹⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, 196.

profoundly true songs, hymns and spiritual songs not only from the ages but also from the last several decades— and last week.¹⁰⁸

The key in successful worship is in the joining of the whole congregation, from the youths to the seniors.¹⁰⁹ By creating a place for intergenerational worship, an opportunity for spiritual growth is formed. During congregational worship and the interaction of instrumentalists in a musical ensemble, younger members are encouraged to grow as they watch and learn from those older than them and farther along in their faith journey.¹¹⁰ The older members are given opportunities to pour into those younger than them and to disciple and build the body of Christ.

Historic music also creates the opportunity for congregants to participate in a variety of musical ensemble settings, with a range of ages and generations. Roehlkepartain shares a study on spiritual development which found that, “one fundamental aspect of spiritual development is interconnecting,” and the best way to create this interconnection “is to participate actively in intentionally age-integrated experiences with others in those faith communities.”¹¹¹ A music ensemble is a perfect way to combine a variety of ages, and time in a church ensemble has shown to benefit the member’s spiritual growth.¹¹²

¹⁰⁸ Ross and Allen, *Intergenerational Christian Formation: Bringing the Whole Church Together in Ministry, Community and Worship*, 196-197.

¹⁰⁹ Hellerman. *When the Church Was a Family: Recapturing Jesus’ Vision for Authentic Christian Community*, 143.

¹¹⁰ Ross and Allen, *Intergenerational Christian Formation: Bringing the Whole Church Together in Ministry, Community and Worship*, 54.

¹¹¹ Roehlkepartain, “Engaging International Advisors in Creating a Shared Understanding of Spiritual Development: Seeking Common Ground in Understanding Spiritual Development: A Preliminary Theoretical Framework.”

¹¹² Kroeker. *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*, 31.

Individualism is prevalent in today's society and "we live in an age of narcissism and pursue loneliness."¹¹³ The church has the ability to offer society a place of belonging and community. Participation in a church music ensemble allows the members of the church to engage in "something bigger than themselves" and to truly act out the joining of the Body of Christ (1 Corinthians 12:12). By providing a community of musicians, the church draws the community together as brothers and sisters in Christ.

An example of works which would promote diversity in style and era are Claude Debussy's *Rêverie* and Tomaso Albinoni's *Adagio*. From different eras of musical history, *Rêverie* is from the impressionist twentieth century while *Adagio* is from the Baroque era. Typical of twentieth century music, *Rêverie*, which means "daydream," is very symbolic, representing a "dream-like" state, and "leaves in the ear an evanescent echo of faraway things."¹¹⁴ This piece is ideal for reflection and meditation, such as on a passage of Scripture presented during a time of offertory. *Rêverie* is peaceful and calming in nature due to the rippling arpeggios which, in this arrangement of oboe and harp, are gently played by the harp, with the melody line tenderly presented by the oboe. This piece would also be effective when placed as a prelude to the service, bringing peace to the heart and calming the mind, reading the soul for intentional worship. In contrast, *Adagio* presents a different style of music, characteristic of the Baroque Era. This work is "slow of pace [and] solemn of mood,"¹¹⁵ which, like the *Rêverie*, is excellent for contemplation and meditation. While in two different styles, both pieces can add

¹¹³ Albert Borgmann, *Crossing the Postmodern Divide* (Chicago: University Press, 1993), 3.

¹¹⁴ Teresa Davidian, *Experiencing Debussy: A Listener's Companion* (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2019), 62.

¹¹⁵ Betsy Schwarm, "Encyclopædia Britannica," in *Encyclopædia Britannica* (Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., 2017).

support to a worship service in a similar way, while engaging different members of the congregation and implementing diversity in style.

Section Six: Practical Creation of the Blended Service

According to Lawrence and Dever, blended worship is the “blending or convergence of both contemporary and historical worship traditions.”¹¹⁶ When integrating historic music into a contemporary worship service, it’s important the music selected is reflective of the Scripture and message presented.¹¹⁷ Robin Leaver shares that the music we select should be based on its ability to contribute to the service, to reflect the biblical lesson and worship being presented:

Music has its place in worship not for its own sake but for what it does. The term "liturgical" indicates that this music contributes to the worship and serves particular functions, especially at important junctures of the sequence of the different activities of worship, as we move from praise to prayer, from prayer to proclamation, from proclamation to acclamation, from acclamation back to prayer, and so forth. The music for worship should be carefully chosen in connection with the biblical lessons to be read, and it is important to bear in mind the place in the liturgical order the music is to be heard. Such planning should be a creative process.¹¹⁸

By planning selections for a service, the worship leader should be creative in their process. An instrumental piece should be selected based on its ability to reflect and represent the Scripture or sermon theme. Music that may have worked well in a concert setting may not be appropriate or effective in a worship setting, and we “need to train our ears to be able to anticipate the different effect this music will have if it is heard within the context of worship.”¹¹⁹

¹¹⁶ Ligon J. Duncan, et al., *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views*. (Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2009), 183.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 59.

¹¹⁸ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 59.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*

An excellent method for determining pieces for a church service is to reference the liturgical calendar. If we understand the “liturgical nature of worship music composed in earlier generations,” we can “learn how to use it creatively in our worship today.”¹²⁰ For example, during the period of Easter, the worship leader can select pieces that represent the seven days of Holy Week. Throughout those seven days, “Passion” compositions by various composers, such as Johann Walter, Leonard Lechner, Heinrich Schütz, Christoph Demantius, and Bach, can be used. Another piece that could be practically integrated in a contemporary worship service is Charles Gounod’s *Meditation*.

Meditation is a unique piece in that it successfully blends different ages and styles of music. Gounod composed and arranged this work in style characteristic of the Romantic Era and, in a way, modernized Bach’s original work, *Prelude No. 1*, composed in the Baroque era.¹²¹ Gounod had the utmost respect for Bach and wished to maintain his original composition while “utilizing the first prelude as accompaniment to religious melody.”¹²² In this work, we see a prime example of blending the old with the new. In addition to the stylistic diversity of this piece, *Meditation*, due to its meditative nature and prayer, is perfect for contemplation and reverence within a service. This piece could be played softly in the background as congregants entered for the service, or it could be presented during the offertory or as special music, creating a moment for personal and group prayer.

Another important aspect to consider is the placement of historic works in a contemporary service. Generally, most instrumental pieces are used during the “special music”

¹²⁰ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 59.

¹²¹ Marie Anne de Bovet, *Charles Gounod: His Life and His Works* (London: Gilbert and Rivington, Limited, 1891), 188.

¹²² Bovet, *Charles Gounod: His Life and His Works*, 189.

or offertory. A great way to better introduce an instrumental piece is to separate the message into two parts, thus giving the congregation context to the music presented and a concept or verse to reflection on throughout the piece. According to Leaver, a two-part sermon was common in Lutheran liturgy until the eighteenth century.¹²³ However, more often than not, very little time is given to the “special music” or offertory time slot, generally lasting only 3 to 4 minutes.¹²⁴ Instead of using poorly-arranged editions, which omits great sections of a masterful work, just one movement or section of a piece can be performed. A worship leader could also choose to present the entirety or parts of a piece in various places of the service. For example, during an Easter service, a worship pastor could select movements of *St. Matthew’s Passion*, paired with appropriate Scripture readings in between moments of contemporary congregational worship. Instead of the typical contemporary service structure with a lengthy sermon near the end of the service, the timeline of Holy Week could be followed as a storytelling of Christ’s sacrifice and resurrection. A worship leader could also select an appropriate piece to be performed by a solo instrument, such as the oboe.

¹²³ Leaver, “Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship,” 59.

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*, 58.

CHAPTER V: CONCLUSION

Summary

This thesis has presented a variety of benefits seen by integrating historic, sacred works into the contemporary worship service. First, I explored the lack of historic music in contemporary worship, and the drawbacks presented by presenting only one style of music in worship. Many contemporary churches discuss only how to lead with modern worship music and not how to lead and present historical instrumental music. Second, I reviewed the biblical support for instrumental music in worship. Throughout the Bible, there are many mentions of the beauty and benefits of instrumental music, such as through David and his harp, and in various Psalms, including Psalm 33 and 150. Third, I explored the great benefit and effect of instrumental music on both the mind and the spirit. Multiple studies show how instrumental affects both the brain, such as in our development and imagination, and our spirit by impacting our emotions and allowing space for thought and reflection. Fourth, I discussed the various opportunities instrumental music creates for the church community, including outreach, service opportunities and the cultivation of multigenerational interaction. Fifth, I examined the practical creation of the blended service. This included discussing the process in selecting historical instrumental works for a service and how to best integrate them. Lastly, we evaluated the creation of diversity and community within the church body through the introduction of historic instrumental music. By introducing variety into our worship, a greater number the congregation and surrounding community is reached, and the benefits of historical instrumental music are seen.

Conclusion

One can see the great benefit to be gained by contemporary churches in presenting more than one style of worship in their services. Not only do the members of the worship ministry and those participating in the music-making benefit from exposure to historical instrumental music, but so does the whole of the congregation. While the contemporary style of worship reaches some in the congregation, by adding diversity in musical styles a greater number of the congregation are reached, including those in different generations, from different cultures, backgrounds and interests. Those who are gifted in music are able to use their talents in praising God through the playing of auxiliary instruments. In addition, those in the community who are not interested in church, but are interested in notable historic works and composers, may be reached.

In order to integrate historical instrumental worship in the contemporary service, a church must create within their music ministry music ensembles, such as a choir and/or orchestra. Opportunities must be given to members in the church who have been blessed through gift of music and can play historical instrumental music, such as a clarinetist, cellist, trumpeter or oboist. The musical gifts of a woodwind or brass player should be honored and valued just as highly as the members of the contemporary rhythm section. When the church provides an environment for historical instrumental music, engagement is seen through a greater number of the congregation leading worship, the surrounding music community, and diversity is achieved. When determining the best pieces to introduce into a contemporary service, it's important to link the piece to the service. One can relate a to Scripture through the emotions projected by a piece or a work can be paired with an event on the church calendar, such as Easter and Holy Week. Since most historical instrumental works are longer than the typical 3-minute special music time slot, more time may need to be given to accommodate an instrumental piece. As these methods

of integration are considered, I recommend the incorporation of historical instrumental works in modern worship services.

Recommendations

Based on the research found and conclusions developed as a result of this exploration, the integration of historical, sacred works in the contemporary worship service is highly recommended. Churches should first focus on reaching a greater number and depth in their congregation before seeking to be “relevant” to popular church culture. The church is called to minister to all people, and this includes generations and circles within communities that value historic, sacred music. By diversifying our worship, we are also diversifying our outreach into the community and the world. As followers of Christ, we are called to use our musical talents for the Lord and celebrate diversity in our worship, for “there are varieties of gifts, but the same Spirit; and there are varieties of service, but the same Lord; and there are varieties of activities, but it is the same God who empowers them all in everyone” (1 Corinthians 12:4-6, ESV).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Andres, Robert. "An Introduction to the Solo Piano Music of Debussy and Ravel." BBC. Accessed June 29, 2020. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/radio3/classical/ravel-debussy/recital2.shtml>.
- Applegate, Celia. *Bach in Berlin: Nation and Culture in Mendelssohn's Revival of the "St. Matthew Passion."* Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2005.
- Arnold, Jonathan. *Sacred Music in Secular Society.* Farnham: Ashgate, 2014.
- Bovet, Marie Anne de. *Charles Gounod: His Life and His Works.* London: Gilbert and Rivington, Limited, 1891.
- Breaux, Mike. "A Mad Multi-Gen Strategy That Works, Dude." *Christianity Today*, Vol. 26 (Spring 2005): 32.
- Burgess, Geoffrey Vernon, and Bruce Haynes. *The Oboe.* New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2004.
- Davidian, Teresa. *Experiencing Debussy: A Listeners Companion.* Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2019.
- Diehl, David. "An Instrument in the Hands of God." *Reformed Worship: Resources for Planning and Leading Worship.* Accessed July 14, 2020. <https://www.reformedworship.org/blog/instrument-hands-god>.
- Duncan, J. Ligon, Dan Kimball, Michael Lawrence, Mark Dever, Timothy C. J. Quill, Dan Wilt, Daniel Wilt, and J. Matthew Pinson. *Perspectives on Christian Worship: 5 Views.* Nashville, TN: B&H Academic, 2009.
- Elliott, David J. *Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education.* New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Fenstermacher, Mark. "Just a Thought or Two: Tuning With the Oboe." *First Methodist.* November 16, 2018. Accessed June 24, 2020. <http://www.fumcb.org/just-a-thought/just-a-thought-or-two-oboe/>.
- Friedman, Thomas S. "Enhancing the Worship Experience." *Projection, Lights & Staging News* 17, no. 7 (08, 2016): 40-1.
- Fulcher, Jane F. *Debussy and His World.* Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 2001.
- Hansen, Mark C. "Blended Worship: A Reflection on Worship - Traditional, Contemporary, Or Both?" *Lutheran Theological Journal* 42, no. 2 (08, 2008): 86-91.

- Hellerman, Joseph H. *When the Church Was a Family: Recapturing Jesus Vision for Authentic Christian Community*. Nashville, TN: B & H Publishing Group, 2014.
- Higgins, Lee, and Lee Willingham. *Engaging in Community Music: An Introduction*. Florence: Taylor and Francis, 2017.
- Ingalls, Monique Marie. *Singing the Congregation: How Contemporary Worship Music Forms Evangelical Community*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2018.
- Kauflin, Bob. *Worship Matters: Leading Others to Encounter the Greatness of God*. Wheaton, IL: Crossway Books, 2008.
- Kroeker, Charlotte Yvonne. *The Sounds of Our Offerings: Achieving Excellence in Church Music*. Herndon, VA: Alban Institute, 2011.
- Leaver, Robin A. "Hallelujah!: Using Historic Music in Contemporary Worship." *Choral Journal* 43, no. 7 (February 2003): 51–61.
- Lee, Michael Hakmin. "Worship Style and Congregational Growth." *The Choral Journal* 58, no. 4 (11, 2017): 67-71.
- Lockyer, Herbert. *All the Music of the Bible*. Peabody, Mass: Hendrickson Publishers, 2004.
- Marschall, Richard. *Johann Sebastian Bach*. Nashville, TN: Nelson, 2011.
- Marissen, Michael. "Blood, People, and Crowds in Bach's St. Matthew Passion." In *Bach & God*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016. Oxford Scholarship Online, 2016. Accessed June 25, 2020. doi: 10.1093/acprof:oso/9780190606954.003.0007.
- Merker, Matt. "How Contemporary Worship Music Is Shaping Us-for Better or Worse," February 6, 2019. Accessed February 15, 2020. <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/reviews/singing-congregation-contemporary-worship/>.
- McGilchrist, Iain. *The Master and His Emissary: The Divided Brain and the Making of the Western World*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019.
- McPherson, Gary. *The Child as Musician: A Handbook of Musical Development*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.
- Mutter, Reginald P.C., and Michael Corder. "English Literature." Encyclopædia Britannica. Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., February 4, 2019. Accessed March 5, 2020 <https://www.britannica.com/art/English-literature/The-Romantic-period>.
- Nekola, Anna E., and Thomas Wagner. *Congregational Music-Making and Community in a Mediated Age*. London: Routledge, 2017.

- Page, Frank S., and L. Lavon Gray. *Hungry for Worship: Challenges and Solutions for Today's Church*. Birmingham, AL: New Hope Publishers, 2014.
- Page, Nick. *And Now Let's Move into a Time of Nonsense: Why Worship Songs Are Failing the Church*. Authentic Media, 2004.
- Parrott, Ruth. *The Importance of Music in Different Religions*. 2009. PDF file. July 14, 2020. <https://cpb-euw2.wp.mucdn.com/myriad.northampton.ac.uk/dist/8/5781/files/2016/04/WR70-1psuxta.pdf>
- Ross, Christine Lawton, and Holly Catterton Allen. *Intergenerational Christian Formation: Bringing the Whole Church Together in Ministry, Community and Worship*. IVP Academic, 2012.
- Sacks, Oliver W. *Musicophilia: Tales of Music and the Brain*. New York, NY: Random House Publishing, 2007.
- Schwarm, Betsy. "Encyclopædia Britannica." In *Encyclopædia Britannica*, Encyclopædia Britannica, Inc., 2017.
- Steinhardt, Arnold. "A Violinist Reflects on His Love of Camille Saint-Saëns' 'The Swan'." Playbill. Playbill, inc., July 3, 2018. Accessed June 4, 2020. <https://www.playbill.com/article/a-violinist-reflects-on-his-love-of-camille-saint-saens-the-swan>.
- Stocker, David. "Hallelujah!: Prayer-and-Praise Worship and Formal Worship." *Choral Journal* 49, no. 2 (08, 2008): 67-71.
- Shaw, G. L., and Matthew Peterson. *Keeping Mozart in Mind*. San Diego, CA: Elsevier Academic Press, 2004.
- Sylvester, Richard D. *Rachmaninoffs Complete Songs: A Companion with Texts and Translations*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014.
- Wag, John. "Orchestra Music by Faure." Notes. June 01, 2016. Accessed June 29, 2020. <https://www.questia.com/library/journal/1P3-4042287941/gabriel-faur-symphonie-en-fa-op-20-pavane-op>.
- Webber, Robert. *Planning Blended Worship: The Creative Mixture of Old and New*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1998.
- Westermeyer, Paul. *Te Deum: The Church and Music*. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 1998.

- Whaley, Vernon. *Called to Worship: The Biblical Foundations of Our Response to God's Call*. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson, 2009.
- Whittaker, William G. "Some Problems in the Performance of Bachs Church Cantatas." *Proceedings of the Musical Association* 54, no. 1 (1927): 35-61. Accessed July 29, 2020. doi:10.1093/jrma/54.1.35.
- White, Susan J. *Foundations of Christian Worship*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2006.
- Williams, Peter. *Bach: A Musical Biography*. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2020.