

MUSIC AND CONFLICT RESOLUTION:

ISRAELI-PALESTINIAN CONFLICT

A MASTER'S THESIS

SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE FACULTY

LIBERTY UNIVERSITY

BY

TERESA LEE ENYART

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS

FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS IN ETHNOMUSICOLOGY

April 27, 2018

Copyright April 27, 2018 by Teresa EnYart

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank Katherine Morehouse at Liberty University for accepting me into the Ethnomusicology program in a few years ago. The acceptance into this program came very timely in my life when I needed to move forward. Next, I would like to thank Harry Anastasiou at Portland State University. Several years ago, during my undergrad at Portland State, I took every one of Harry's conflict resolution classes; and it's from those classes that I have formulated and applied those concepts here in this thesis. I would further like to thank Harry for taking the time, twice in the past year, to sit down with me to discuss thoughts and ideas about conflict resolution. Also, to Jeffrey Meyer for being the primary reader of my thesis.

Next, I would like to thank all the participants and those involved in my research. Starting with the founders of Ukuleles for Peace, Paul Moore and his wife Daphna Orion for immediately taking me under their wing the first week of my research in Israel. These two very kind individuals invited me into their home and personal lives and made me feel very welcome. I would like to thank every member of Ukuleles for Peace for allowing me to take part of your rehearsals for the two months I was there. This includes the parents of the members for not only allowing me into your home, but along with Paul and Daphna, saw to it that I got back and forth from the Hod HaSharon train station to the rehearsal every week.

Second, I would like to thank Avi Gilboa at Bar-Ilan University for graciously and spontaneously fitting me into his schedule that day when I randomly showed up at his office; and thereafter, had been consistently faithful in helping me acquire the information that I needed from him. Next, I would like to Abigail Wood at Haifa University for networking on my behalf. This includes the Arab-Jewish Orchestra and its participating members: Taiseer Elias, Shehady Nassar, Sireen Elias, Samar Jacob, and Haima Sleman. Also, to Nizar Rohana for his help.

Many thanks to the Kassis family of Rama village in Upper Galilee who have always made me feel so welcome every time I come to Israel. I truly feel as if I am at home each time I return. I further thank them for allowing me to stay with them on the weekends and feeding me wonderful Arab food. In addition, to Maher, Tarek and Halim who sought out music contacts for me. Moving forward, I would like to thank my friend Ken who graciously took care of my dogs while I was in Israel and who humored me while I Skyped with my dogs.

I would like to thank my family for their love and support that they have shown me through my education. I would especially like to thank my grandmother, Sigrid, who has always encouraged me to excel and has inspired me artistically. I would further like to thank her for sharing many aspects of her life with me, including her childhood memories of growing up in Germany during WWII. There were many things that she witnessed during the war including her father, my great-grandfather, as a Nazi SS officer who was a participant in Kristallnacht. In discussing these painful memories through the years, I also saw her adopt a Jewish surname for herself and shop at Jewish businesses. I viewed this as a way that she internally coped with whatever she felt or had experienced when she was a child. I can't help but feel that a part of my interest and love for Israel has somehow stemmed from this. Having said that, I would like to dedicate this thesis to my best friend, my grandma, Sigrid.

Psalm 150

Praise the Lord.

Praise God in His sanctuary;
praise Him in his mighty heavens.

Praise Him for His acts of power;
praise Him for His surpassing greatness.

Praise Him with the sound of the trumpet,
praise Him with the harp and lyre,

praise Him with the strings and pipe,
praise Him with the clash of cymbals
praise Him with resounding cymbals.

Let everything that has breath praise the Lord.

Praise the Lord.

Abstract

Music in relation to peace and conflict, whether constructive or destructive, has had deep and profound effects that unite people based on commonality and shared interest. The Israeli-Palestinian conflict is no different when it comes to these two dichotomies. There are those who use music for protest to either escalate conflict or use it as a social and political platform. Then, there are those who use music for resolving their differences, to promote peacemaking and peacebuilding, further unifying and embracing the diversity that's between them. The ethnographic approach that I took in this research gives insight and a perspective to those who may dismiss the ethnomusicological aspect to this topic of study. Understanding how music speaks in the context of a culture can also give insight to understanding a people. Once we gain this understanding, then we know how to approach them. Additionally, through my exploration of the construct of modern identity, I examine musical identity and how both can affect each other. Moving through these identities and addressing them can bridge the interethnic gap. The applied methods and theories behind such movements, as peacemaking and music, is what I have sought to explore in my research; further aiming to discover if there is anything tangible and sustainable in their attempt to build lasting relationships through music.

Contents

Chapter I: Introduction	1
Statement of Problem	1
Need for Study	2
Research Questions	4
Glossary of Terms	5
Defining Term: Musical Semiotics	5
Defining Term: People of Interest	6
Defining Term: Conflict Resolution/Transformation	7
Defining Term: Empathy, Musicking, and Interfaith	8
Participants in the Study	9
Ukuleles for Peace	10
Arab-Jewish Orchestra.....	11
Let’s Talk Music.....	12
Limitations of Study	13
Assumptions	13
Chapter II: Methods, Themes, Literature Review	15
Historical Context	16
Identity and Nationalism	17
Identity and Music	23
Protest Music	28

Musical Identity	30
Music and Peacemaking	32
Applied Methods and Concepts in Peacemaking	38
Conclusion	42
Chapter III: Methodology	45
Overview of Research Design	45
Descriptions of Research Tools	48
Fieldwork Procedures	49
Methods for Data Collection	49
Chapter IV: Research Findings	51
Ukuleles for Peace	52
Arab-Jewish Orchestra.....	58
Let’s Talk Music	63
Answering the Research Questions	66
Common Themes	70
Openness.....	70
Safe Spaces/Community Building	71
Music Selection.....	73
Identity Transformation	74
Cross-Cultural Template.....	77
Successful Outcomes	78

Chapter V: Summary, Conclusions, Recommendations	80
Summary	80
Conclusion	80
Recommendations	84
Appendix: A	88
Appendix: B	90
Appendix: C	93
Appendix: D	94
Appendix: E	96
Appendix: F	99
Bibliography	100

Chapter I: Introduction

Music in the context of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict has been used as a tool in building a bridge to the “other.”¹ From the vantage points of both conflict resolution and ethnomusicology I discovered and searched for new applied methods which addressed the deconstruction of cultural barriers while bringing cultural awareness through music. In the past several years I have invested a considerable amount of time and energy experiencing and getting to know the culture. While obtaining a bachelor’s degree in Middle East studies, several trips to Israel gave me direct contact and experience with the culture. My time in Israel allowed me to develop personal relationships with the locals which helped me better understand their way of life and who they were. This personal connection is a major factor of my passion with this topic of music and conflict resolution. In addition, my cultural experience includes time in Egypt where I spent a semester at the American University in Cairo in 2006. While there I studied Arabic and Middle East culture/politics as well as joined the university’s Arab music ensemble. My experience and knowledge gained from both my degrees in International Studies (concentration: Middle East) and Music prepares me for a certain level of success in my research. Because of the time spent in both Israel and Egypt, I have a genuine love and heart for the Arab and Jewish people.

Statement of the Problem

While in Israel, my discussions with the locals revealed that many of them want peace and a life away from strife and conflict. Yet, they may not spend enough time listening or hearing each other to resolve their differences. Finding a commonality in music could be just one

¹The term “other” in quotation marks is used many times in discussing the opponent or adversary in interethnic conflict. Using it in this way, makes it clear what “other” refers to outside of the normal use of the word. Therefore, I will use it when necessary to make this distinction.

step in the right direction when other lines of communication are not possible. Knowing how they build, sustain, develop or even tolerate their own relationships and how they use music to fuse or merge their differences in a non-violent way is worth researching.

Need for the Study

The need for this study comes at a time when ethnic division and interethnic conflict are still very prevalent in our society and world. Taking steps to bridge the gap between two peoples by bringing cultural awareness can help eliminate the escalation of violence and conflict. Meeting people where they are and understanding who they are is a starting point for bringing down barriers and for mending relationships. Finding a commonality is one bridge that can be built, and that one commonality can be music. Music is a very impactful tool or method as music can touch the inner most depths of a person's being. Having that commonality, especially with the "other" can lead to open dialogue and that open dialogue to empathy, reconciliation and even perhaps forgiveness. If music can be used in this way, knowing how and why is worth the effort. Understanding how and why music is used in promoting peacebuilding and peacemaking as a means in interethnic conflict might also give insight to something deeper. Some of these answers could come about through discovering the desired and intended outcomes of those involved and what they look to achieve. For example, is the music used to instigate a discussion about more serious subjects like faith and politics or is it about another purpose? Discovering projects or collaborations that have proved to be fruitful and successful over time could also be the key to understanding the conflict better.

The significance of this study also includes a genuine concern about people and lives outside of my own. Reaching out to the world around us by taking steps in getting to know others can make a tremendous impact on the lives around us. Letting people know that you care,

even if it is on the other side of the world, makes people realize that they are not alone in their struggles. With that, I knew that I would not be able to just walk away from my “data collecting.” Therefore, I would have to ask myself in what ways I could not only continue to partake, but how I could use what I have learned once I move forward in my own daily life. As well, I hope I can also inspire a shared interest with those who are like-minded, locally or internationally, whom share the same vision to strengthen the effort towards interethnic peaceful engagements. In addition, the significance of this research can only hope to inspire a public awareness, if it hasn’t already, to join in such like initiatives. I hope to discover that the importance of my work will help serve others in a way that would give an insight to an ethnomusicological approach to the music and conflict resolution. As I have already found that there is a gap in most research efforts concerning this area. It might inspire future researchers, at least in conflict resolution, to consider an area or vantage point (ethnomusicology) which is very significant that otherwise usually gets skimmed over. It could further inspire other researchers in applied ethnomusicological approaches that live among interethnic conflict to consider conflict resolution-transformation, peacebuilding, or peacemaking in developing or initiating a like concept in their area.

Considering that an effort in conflict resolution-transformation, peacebuilding, peacemaking and music already exists in Israel, this research will have life beyond this thesis. The continuation of interest, research, and applied effort on this topic by not only myself but others, will help develop the applied approach in its attempt to deconstruct mind-sets, resolve conflict, and build bridges while finding a common interest with the “other.” In the last few months, I have talked to various people about my thesis topic. I have had several suggestions that I should bring this concept and method back to the United States and apply it here, as Americans

are in need of bridging the racial gaps in the United States. To accomplish this task, I must first evaluate if the Israeli application would work cross-culturally, and if so, how and why? Finally, discovering answers to the several questions proposed will hopefully lead to theories and concepts that prove applicable elsewhere.

Research Questions

In addressing my initial research questions which seek to define and answer how and why conflict resolution, peacebuilding and peacemaking can develop through music, I sought to answer why it matters. However, before attempting to answer that, I explored questions which looked to answer the bigger question. That bigger question is, if the very mind-set based off identity that was used to separate two people groups could be deconstructed or reconstructed to unite them on the premises of new ideals, one that would include the acknowledgement that there are overlapping and shared traditions between them, and one that would include acceptance and tolerance. With that in mind, the initial questions I proposed led me to the understanding if that was even a possibility.

During my fieldwork I first sought to answer the question of who was behind or initiates this endeavor of peacemaking and music, and if any of them included outsiders. This helped me hone in on the participants behind the scenes which revealed their intents and motivations; and as I suspected, this approach led me to an informed local expert. Finding out the answer to this question answered the concern of why it matters and to who. Next, I wondered how the informant or participant connected or built friendships with the “other” (Arab or Jew) through music. The answer to this inquiry varied because of how individual methods differed in their intent and design. I also researched the type of music that was applied or preferred between the two participants and how is it chosen and why. I explored the historical context of the two people

groups and how their current cultural setting played a part in their building relationships with each other. I found it to be specific to the situation or project which gave me a broader scope in my inquiry.

Then, I explored the possibility that there might be a tangible way to measure the success of any given project. I saw this as a fundamental question that could help me to answer the bigger thesis question which would reveal if the Jewish and Arab identities once found in common traits and traditions, that was separated from nationalist rhetoric, could bring them back together. As a part of measuring this success, I inquired as to what that would look like or what that would mean. I further looked to see if there was a general application or blueprint that could be applied cross-culturally. Furthermore, I wanted to understand why music was used as a process to achieve something that is seemingly unrelated to it.

Finally, I wanted to know the methods and intents of those who initiate and promote peacemaking through music, and if they were all seeking the same end results. Some involved in this effort seem to have various intentions of what they are trying to achieve. While they all come together in hopes of peacemaking and peacebuilding, in the end they don't all use the same method or have the same intent. In addition, I explored participant's mind-set, background, and identity which helped in this process. In exploring these research details, I was able to come to an overall understanding of what the projects desired outcomes were.

Glossary of Terms

Defining Term: Musical Semiotics

Musical semiotics debunks the myth of music as a universal language. Music does not always translate in the same way cross-culturally.

There is no question but that music serves as a symbolic function in human cultures on the level of affective or cultural meaning. Men everywhere assign certain symbolic roles

to music which connect it with other elements in their cultures. It should be emphasized that on this level we do not expect to find universal symbolism ascribed to music; rather, this symbolic level operates within the framework of individual cultures.²

The semiotic factors within music function or communicate differently within each culture, and certain musical elements and aesthetics that mean something in one culture can mean something else in another. The music that is chosen for musical interaction between two parties could translate differently dependent upon what it is and the cultural, social and educational background of the participants. The assumption cannot be made that a particular musical style will have the same meaning for those involved. This is an important element in my research considering that some different, yet, overlapping cultures hold music as an important part of their identity. This aspect is a potential defining factor within my research because the music chosen between the participants could reveal other unspoken relational elements or other elements all together. Music used as an identifier regarding one's own identity will be explained in more detail below, for it is an important aspect in my research.

Defining Term: People of Interest

The people of interest within the Israeli-Palestinian conflict comprise various ethnic, social, and cultural backgrounds. Considering that Israel is a fairly new created nation-state with a continual influx of immigrants, the demographics of the area are diverse. Defining and making clear distinctions of the people are important because their identities at times can overlap. First, using the term "Israeli-Palestinian" when referring to the conflict is the most precise, rather than using "Israeli-Arab," for the reason that "Israeli-Arab" can also refer to an Arab who is an Israeli citizen. Additionally, the term Palestinian refers to those in the occupied territories (Gaza and the

²Alan P. Merriam, *The Anthropology of Music* (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1964), 246.

West Bank) and to those within Israel, even though the Arabs in Israel can also be referred to as Arab-Israeli. The Arabs that pertain to this research are those that hold Israeli citizenship.

Arabs within Israel and occupied territories are mostly indigenous to the land and those who are not, most likely come from the eastern part of the Middle East (mainly Iraq) and are Jewish; these Arab-Jews are referred to as Oriental. The religion of the indigenous Arabs are mainly Muslims, Druze, and Christians. Yet, the Jewish people (referring to race and religion or both) come from multiple cultures with only very few being indigenous. The Ashkenazi, who are the majority, are Jews that came from mainstream Europe, Eastern Europe and the United States. The Sephardic are Jews are from Spain or Morocco (and other North African countries) though they are sometimes confused with the Oriental Jews from the East. The Ethiopian Jews are another minority group within Israel and their immigration to the country has transpired over the last twenty-five years. The Jews who came from Russia make up the second largest majority in the country. The Messianic Jews who are Jewish by race and Christian by faith are a very small minority. A couple of other Christian minorities live in Israel, but they are a very small group. The Jewish people also can be classified somewhere between ultra-orthodox to secular. These main people groups within Israel have multicultural backgrounds, leaving much room for diversity as well as potential conflict.

Defining Term: Conflict Resolution/Transformation

The term conflict resolution is sometimes used in a broad sense for other terms which include conflict transformation, peacemaking and peacebuilding. Conflict resolution essentially started as a peacemaking process in the early twentieth century, though as conflicts were resolved, the parties began to realize that various elements and levels in peacemaking efforts existed. For example, the relations between Israel and Egypt today is referred to as a cold peace.

A cold peace is where each party tolerates each other's existence with no relational aspect. Is not necessarily seen as peacemaking or peacebuilding but a quick resolution to conflict.

Conflict resolution attempts to understand the underlying causes that lead to the inevitable disputes that will occur and works to find approaches that will lessen the negative impacts of conflict on individuals, in society and between nations....The aim of conflict resolution is not necessarily to alleviate conflicts, but to work creatively to contain destructive conflicts, and to provide clarity that can channel, alter and ultimately transform that relationship or facilitate mutually acceptable solutions...³

If conflict resolution only looks for ways to avoid conflict by coming to an agreement or finding mutually acceptable solutions, then that does not solve the heart of the problem and has over time left those involved to take additional steps in the direction of relationship building. The term conflict transformation is taking conflict resolution to another level and seeks to do more than maintain a cold peace.⁴

...conflict transformation [is] 'a process of engaging with and transforming relationships, interest, discourses and, if necessary, the very constitution of society that supports the continuation of violent conflict'... Instead of simply working an agreement and moving on with an impression that the conflict is over, conflict transformation seeks to dig deeper in the causes that resulted in a conflict in the first place and to transform the relationship involved.⁵

Defining Terms: Empathy, Musicking, and Interfaith

A part of that transformation includes empathy and interaction between the two parties. Felicity Laurence defines empathy, a key element in conflict resolution-transformation, as "...to 'get inside' each other's minds, feel each other's suffering and recognize each other's shared humanity – that is, in common understanding, to have *empathy* for each other."⁶ As Parfait

³Mindy Kay Johnston, "Music and Conflict Resolution: Exploring the Utilization of Music in Community Engagement" (master's thesis, Portland State University, 2010), 10-11. Accessed April 23, 2017. http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/open_access_etds/43710.15760/etd.437

⁴ We could also add peacemaking and peacebuilding which will be addressed below.

⁵Johnston, 13.

Bassele states: "...empathy is generally defined as one's ability to understand and share another's emotional state..."⁷ A way to encourage empathy is to start a form of interaction between the two participants which can include music-making or "musicking" as coined by Christopher Small:

The act of musicking establishes in the place where it is happening a set of relationships, and it is in those relationships that the meaning of the act lies. They are to be found not only between those organized sounds which are conventionally thought of as being the stuff of musical meaning but also between the people who are taking part, in whatever capacity, in the performance; and they model, or stand as a metaphor for, ideal relationships as the participants in the performance imagine them to be; relationships between person and person, between individual and society, between humanity and the natural world and even perhaps the supernatural world.⁸

If engaging in musicking encourages empathy, then this can lead to other interactions or developing relationships and perhaps even interfaith dialogue. Interfaith dialogue promotes religion as a peacebuilder instead of promoting interfaith animosity or conflict and "...interfaith encounters can prompt changes in attitudes towards the 'other.'"⁹ These terms of interfaith, empathy and musicking will be addressed and developed as needed throughout this study.

Participants in the Study

First and foremost, participants in the study potentially included those who were the initiators or leaders as well as students or cooperating subjects which were either informants, musicians, music directors, educators, family members, mediators, outsiders, directors, and

⁶Felicity Laurence, "Music and Empathy," in *Music and Conflict Transformation: Harmonies and Dissonances in Geopolitics*, ed. Olivier Urbain (London: I.B.Tauris, 2008), 14.

⁷Parfait Adegboye Bassele, "Music and Conflict Resolution: Can a Music and Story Centered Workshop Enhance Empathy?" (master's thesis, Portland State University, 2013), 13. Accessed October 1, 2016, http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2121&context=open_access_etds

⁸Ibid., 15.

⁹ Roberta King and Sooi Ling Tan, introduction to *(un)Common Sounds: Songs of Peace and Reconciliation among Muslims and Christians*, by Roberta King (Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2014), 35.

employees of organizations. Though the participants in my study are just a handful of those involved with peacemaking and music in Israel, my selection of those represented a wider spectrum of approaches which included music therapy, high-art, and a grassroots initiative. Additionally, the leading participants in my study who were directors of the projects, are a Jew, an Arab, and an outsider. My participants also represented a variety of communities throughout Israel.

Ukuleles for Peace

In 2004, Paul Moore founded the Ukulele's for Peace organization. This is a youth based program that involves students from elementary to high school who seeks to promote interethnic collaboration and shared coexistence between Arabs and Jews. The creation of this project came as a direct result of Paul and his experience of being in New York City on 9/11. In creating this project, he sought an instrument that he found relatively easy and suitable for younger children to grasp, like the ukulele. The ukulele, and indigenous instrument from Hawaii, represents a neutral meeting ground that is a good way to build bridges between the two ethnically divided people. Paul, who is from England, could also be viewed in the same respect acting as an "outsider," even though he has lived in Israel for some time.

Paul selects the students for his project through the two schools at which he teaches ukulele. The location of the two schools are in the suburbs of Tel Aviv, one in Hod HaSharon (Jewish) and the other in Al-Tira (Arab). A part of Paul's plan is that shared coexistence goes beyond the four walls of his classroom. This includes getting the parents involved with scheduled outings and events, as well as hosting a rehearsal at their home. Along with Paul is his wife, Daphna Orion, an Israeli, who has just recently taken over the weekly rehearsals. Paul focuses his time on teaching only at the two schools. Paul and Daphna give their time freely to

this organization and are currently looking to expand it to the Galilee area. The reputation of this project has received national and international recognition including a performance in Hawaii.

Young Arabs and Jews succeed at what adults have not been able to do through many years of an ongoing conflict: By playing music together, they get to learn about their different cultures and form a relationship without any stereotypical prejudice. Moreover, children of both nationalities involve their families in trips, picnics and concerts, which encourage friendships and inter cultural dialog and trigger the families to spread the idea of a shared society in their communities in particular and the Israeli society at large. We hope that these young musicians - representatives of the young generation, will be our future's leaders. We believe that they are the ones who will lead the Israeli society to peace and prosperity as a united and just society.¹⁰

The project's main goal is to create opportunities for Jews and Arabs who live near each other to meet, interact and make friends.¹¹ This project has had a certain amount of success and sustainability. I would argue that a main part of it comes from the heart and passion of Paul and Daphna who continue despite financial support. The couple have sought financial support through various sources but have been rejected, it was either because the project didn't have enough social status or they needed a certain level of backing before anyone else would, a kind of catch-22. Regardless, Paul and Daphna continue with no pay because they are so deeply passionate, committed and believe in their cause.

Arab-Jewish Orchestra

The Arab-Jewish Orchestra, under the direction of Taiseer Elias, has recently been relocated to Haifa University. Even though the orchestra attracts university students, it is still open to members of the community. This orchestra promotes interethnic collaboration through its various members, and its musical repertoire mostly reflects that of traditional Arab and Jewish

¹⁰“Ukulele’s for Peace,” *The Jacob’s Ladder Festival*, <http://www.jlfestival.com/spring-festival/artists/ukuleles-for-peace/>

¹¹Ukuleles for Peace, Facebook page, Accessed January 3, 2018, <https://www.facebook.com/groups/ukulelesforpeace/about/>

music. This orchestra has not only performed nationally throughout Israel but has also made several international appearances, including Argentina and Spain. The group consists of both musicians and singers and it is made up of a mixture of traditional Western orchestral instruments along with indigenous instruments, like the oud and the qanun. This orchestra draws those that have been formally trained or have acquired a certain level of musicianship in Western or Eastern music or both.

Let's Talk Music

The *Let's Talk Music* model is a concept that seeks to use individual's musical identities to address or create dialogue with the "other." This concept is applied through an academic course at Bar-Ilan University. Bar-Ilan is a conservative Jewish university which also attracts conservative Muslims as an alternative to the neighboring secular Tel Aviv University. Even though both Jews and Arabs coexist on this campus together, there isn't much interaction or friendship building between them. Avi Gilboa, a music therapist, started this academic course as a way to use music to create dialogue as bridge-building method to the "other."

"Music Dialogue between Arabs and Jews" is the actual title of the course which is offered as an elective to any of the Bar-Ilan University students regardless of major. Prior to taking the class, the students understand that they will be asked to use music to not only initiate communication between the "other," but that music will be used as a way to get to know each other better in the process.¹² The students that take the class are a vary in their level of interest; some are only exploring their curiosity and not necessarily making through the entire course. Though most seem to benefit making it through the course with a certain level of success, with some returning to take the class again.

¹²Avi Gilboa, Skype Interview by author, February 26, 2018.

Limitations of the Study

The limitation of the study makes the research difficult to conduct from just books and articles; considering it requires an applied ethnographic approach. Even though books and articles are a great resource for content and information, they cannot replace one-on-one interaction called for by the method of conflict resolution through music. This limitation did not allow me to complete my research or argue any theories or methods without the hands-on experience. In addition, most of the published resources are by scholars and researchers who, for the most part, did not include many personal thoughts and opinions of the participants. This fieldwork allowed me to explore those viewpoints of the participants.

As I suspected, my fieldwork was limited by time and timing of people's schedules and events. Having the expectation that everything was going to coincide at the exact moment when I needed to, I knew, was unrealistic. The other limitation that I foresaw was a language barrier. Considering my previous experience in Israel, I knew that there were a fair amount of people that could speak English. While I found this to be true, there was still a limitation in the quality of data that I could receive from them in English, dependent upon their level of fluency. Nevertheless, I found the limitation to be minimal.

Assumptions

In starting my fieldwork, I assumed that I would find a certain level of success in the current endeavors of music and peacemaking in Israel. I also assumed that most of these efforts were aimed at youth based programs that were mainly directed towards Jews and Arabs (versus the ethnic division between the Jews which is also a problem in Israel). Using these assumptions, I put a plan in motion through ethnographic fieldwork which explored these community based

programs. In doing so, I was not only able to position myself as an advocate in this applied work, but I was able to see how much this research could uncover within the limited time frame I had.

Chapter II: Methods, Themes, Literature Review

Music used as a method or tool in peacemaking or conflict resolution-transformation in Israel has achieved a certain level of success. It has educated and brought about cultural awareness while battling the efforts of those who use music to perpetrate or escalate conflict in the region. Music as a method in the creative peacemaking and peacebuilding process within Israel has been used to resolve religious, social, racial and ethnic issues. Through various organizations, musicians, and individuals the peacebuilding process has sought to bridge the cultural gap by implementing a variety of music genres through song and organized events. It has further helped break down the walls of misunderstanding and hate that have existed among the Israeli people. Yet, music can also be used to encourage hate and conflict further causing harm as described by Roberta King:

Instances of ethnic nationalism and religious activism in relation to music production playing into the recent rise of global unrest feature prominently. The point has been to show “through field research how music either promotes peace or perpetuates discord,” resulting in a continuum of roles for music from “war” on one end to “peacemaking” on the other.¹³

Music used as a method in peacemaking or conflict (protest music) in Israel has revealed certain aspects and functionality of the modern Israeli society. In that, it can be used to support various ideologies having very different and dichotomous intents. Thus, it also allows for the discovery of new ways to open dialogue between two conflicting parties, which is also an important element in resolving conflict. Music, taken as an approach to the creative peacemaking process, allows for the exploration of new ways of communication between a people through its

¹³Roberta King, “Music, Peacebuilding, and Interfaith Dialogue: Transformative Bridges in Muslim-Christian Relations,” *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 40, no. 3 (July 2016): 204.

semiotic factors. Knowing that a certain level of success has already happened in music and peacemaking, finding out exactly what role music plays as a mediator in this process is an important aspect. If music can be used as a mediator or even a mobilizer, then how does it function in this role; how do people intersect at this junction and why? Additionally, why has music been so successful at opening lines of communication that were otherwise closed? Finding out the answers to these questions helps in drawing some foundational conclusions. In this literature review, I first start by outlining the history and demographics of the Israelis and Palestinians. Next, I explore the topic of identity which is a defining element in conflict. Then, I touch on music in relation to protest/conflict and music as a process of peacemaking, peacebuilding, and conflict resolution-transformation. Lastly, I discover based on the evidence provided, that shared commonality, such as music, is a great way to open doors of communication.

Historical Context

As mentioned, the modern demographic make-up of Israel consists mainly of Jews and Arabs. Since the formation of the modern nation-state of Israel in 1948, an influx of immigrants from various cultures and backgrounds have had to coexist with the indigenous people of the land. However, the history between these people is nothing new; it goes back to biblical times with two of the coexisting cultures sharing the same ancient lineage. In addition, the formation of Israel has led to the displacement of indigenous Arab people, both Muslims and Christians, who lived on the land for centuries. The return of the Jewish people to the region has led to an increase of hate, bitterness, and resentment which has escalated the conflict in the region. This conflict has had repercussions and ripple effects throughout not only the region, but also the world. Even though most of the conflict stems from the existence of the Jewish state of Israel and

the resistance of the Arab-Israelis/Palestinians (mainly Muslims), tension also exists among the various Jewish sects and ethnicities. Palestinians, whether inside Israel or the occupied territories, have been viewed as second class citizens by the state of Israel. Israel confirms that it is a Jewish nation with a national Jewish identity and therefore cannot be a fully democratic state giving the Arab-Israeli (those who have Israeli citizenship) equal rights. As stated by Efraim Karsh:

Without equal citizenship on a national basis that is without recognition of the Arabs as a national minority – the “integration” of the individual is illusory and can collapse overnight...its Arab citizens can change instantaneously from “tolerating” individual demanding equality with the existing Zionist framework to seeing them as enemies who can be shot.¹⁴

Arab-Israelis/Palestinians are looking for a place or a land that they can call their own. They are still fighting for their identity and homeland that, according to them, existed before the state of Israel. This interest and topic is important because it not only has brought damage among the immediate people in the region, but to the rest of the world who also have felt the effects of the conflict and at times have been forced to engage. Resolving conflict through various means, including music, is something worth researching in any region. Examining case studies in Israel is just one of several that can prove to be useful and perhaps used and applied in other such efforts. We can also analyze if music is a means to an end or of greater importance in the role of conflict resolution-transformation and peacemaking. Depending on how music functions in this context we can further reevaluate its semiotic role, its use as a tool or means, its use as an expression, and its role in the public arena not to mention other variables.

Identity and Nationalism

¹⁴Efraim Karsh, “Resurrecting the Myth: Benny Morris, the Zionist Movement, and the Transfer of Idea,” *Israel Affairs* 11, no. 3 (2005): 480.

Identity is such an important factor in this research. It is not only embedded in this conflict but almost every other interethnic situation. The historical context behind the construct of modern identity is important to understand because coincidentally it can also lead to the resolution of interethnic conflict. Nationalism is where the modern construct of identity arose. By exploring the mind-set behind it, helps with understanding in how to approach it.

Nationalism can be defined psychologically as the conviction that one belongs to a certain human grouping, associated with a particular territory held together by common history, language, customs, laws, social institutions, values, religion, way of life, kinship or radical characteristics, which differ significantly from those of other peoples, and set one apart even from neighbors who live in close geographic proximity.¹⁵

Nationalism came as a response to the newly industrialized modern nation-state system. It is a cultural and historical phenomenon that is not only linked to the age of industrialization but the French Revolution; these two historical events had an enormous impact on the rise of nationalism. The way in which people started to formulate nationalist ideas began with the political and social shift that was transpiring around them. This shift left people uncertain about who they were while still looking for a place to belong. They needed to find an identity that fit in a rapid changing world which no longer had the characteristics of a traditional society that they once knew. During the times of the French Revolution when the political structure was changing from a monarch to a state-form run democracy, the individual became the building block for the new regime's structure. When this happened, the current identity had to be recreated because the old identities belonged to the old regime. This was one of the first transitions to an ethno-national identity, which in turn allowed people to form an identity as being "French." Under the conditions of a state formed society, everyone was a citizen and held equal status with one

¹⁵John E. Mack, "Nationalism and the Self," *Psychohistory Review* 2 (1983): 48.

another; which meant liberty, fraternity, and equality for all.¹⁶ The French Revolution further encouraged individual creative thinking that led to the Industrial Revolution which ripened the conditions for nationalism.

During the Industrial Revolution people integrated in masses unlike previous times. This accelerated the creation of urbanization. Urbanization displaced people from their traditional communities of close personal relationships that gave them a sense of belonging to a place of disconnect and isolation. Additionally, this led to the rise of mass population and new social stratifications which produced the proletarian class. The proletarian class had a displacement in identity that left them alienated in two ways: in their repetitious factory job and in their new living conditions amongst a mass community of people. The state's function became important because it affected the daily lives of all. It was then that political parties started to form which gave individuals a way to access the state and a right to participate. Under the nationalist ideal, the state was looked upon as sacred; it became God-like.¹⁷ The people's view of the state was as if it could do no wrong. This is the point where the nationalist mind-set began to form. People started to build up an idea of who they were and where they were from, and how special they were compared to the "other." Yet, they were more alike than different. Out of this arose ethnocentrism, a belief that one's values and ideals are better than another's. Ethnocentrism is an unbalanced image of one's self and the image of the "other."

Identity has always been an issue of values...positive evaluation of oneself logically leads to a negative view of otherness of others. This is the problem of ethnocentrism.¹⁸

¹⁶Harry Anastasiou, *The Broken Olive Branch: Nationalism, Ethnic Conflict, and the Quest for Peace in Cyprus, Volume One: The Impasse of Ethnonationalism* (New York, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2008), 23.

¹⁷Harry Anastasiou, "Encountering Nationalism: The Contribution of Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution," In *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution*, ed. Dennis D. J. Sandole, Sean Byrne, Ingrid Sandole-Staroste, and Jessica Senehi (New York: Routledge, 2009), 33.

People started to see the nation as an extended part of themselves and the nation and its identity was inclusive of one big family. They started to identify themselves and their new nation-state as people of one blood with common ideals and historical past.¹⁹

The nationalist movement all began in the mind. It is a mind that creates these ideas of who and what and how individuals relate to each other. It began out of an uncertainty of one's identity or out of a void that needed to be filled. The nationalist mind-set starts with a uniqueness of the culture and history. A society unites through a common shared belief of who they are. It is in these common traits and characteristics they create this same sense of likeness with each other. In their minds, they are set apart from others who are not like them. History includes a shared historical language, ethnicity, customs, and beliefs in the nationalist mind-set.²⁰ The past is always seen as the times of the golden era; where things were always perfect in the past.²¹ The present is when such things as customs and language have been diluted and need to be restored to their pure condition. This kind of historical past only strengthens the appeal of nationalism and draws nationalist closer together.

Ethnoscape is the term that is used to describe a mystical connection of the people to their homeland that usually had a religious leader of the past attached to it. A prime example is the nation-state of Israel. This has led them to reclaim their ancestral historic homeland of Caanan. This land was where the great kings David and Solomon had lived and built a great temple.

¹⁸Jorn Rüsen, "How to Overcome Ethnocentrism: Approaches to a Culture of Recognition by History in the Twenty-First Century," *History and Theory* 43, no. 4 (2004): 120.

¹⁹Anastasiou, 2009, 37.

²⁰Anastasiou, 2008, 19.

²¹Anastasiou, 2009, 34.

These types of historical leaders from the past, which are attached to the ancestral land, draw a strong emotional connection to the land.

Rise of the Jewish national identity around the turn of the twentieth century and the suffering of their people during the Holocaust; helped the Jews to reclaim a land their ancestors had not inhabited for some two thousand years. With the influence of nationalism came a counter-nationalist-reaction by the Palestinians. The Palestinians didn't have this nationalist mind-set until the nation-state of Israel was established using the nationalist mentality. Thus, the Palestinians retaliated against the Jewish people in attempt to reclaim the territory they believed was their homeland too. Both Jews and Palestinians believe that they have a right to the land. The mind-set of the nationalist leads them to believe that they are always right and the "other" is always wrong.²² Under the name of nationalism leaders have sought to mobilize the people of their nation-state in order to unify them. Under nationalism violence is moral, and this morality justifies the taking of human life, not only of the enemy but of oneself.²³ Because the nation is viewed as the end all to life, life can be easily given for the sake of the nation. Those who lose their life in defense of the nation become a part of the national memory and their memory is kept alive in it.

In the nationalist mind-set, sacrificing your life for your country has become a top priority and heroic act.²⁴ The only way to defend the national identity seems to be through war, and thus the nation becomes militarized in the defense of their identity. The nation has become, in the minds of the nationalists, the savior of their identity and therefore it must be protected at

²²Ibid.

²³Ibid., 37.

²⁴Ibid.

all costs. Heroically defined events keep nations moving towards their future destiny. As mentioned by David MacDonald, the Palestinian musicians were “...willing to sacrifice their careers, families, and bodies for a nationalist ideal.”²⁵ War can also be justified because the nation sees itself as a victim, because of their national identity is at stake. Even when leaders have been wrong or have failed the nation, the individual identity of the nation and who they are is always right. This is the rhetoric of nationalism, which is to form identity between the nation-state and the people.

In addition, the individual can acquire characteristics for themselves even if the characteristics are not a part of his or her personality, just to fit into the nationalist mold. They can further shift their entire intentions to that of the collective society too. This is a part of the psychological mind-set of the individual, which has the desire to belong to a group that they see as their own. A form of narcissism is the essence of nationalism.²⁶ This prevents relationships with the “other” because of self-absorption. The threat of an enemy usually comes from the exaggerated imagination of the nationalist. The enemy can be analyzed as a similar person who has the same thoughts and actions that are promoted by nationalist ideas. They have become two egotistical opposing forces that both clash. This is when real conflict arises and causes power struggles and wars. To have any peace and resolution, the mind-set of the people must change on both sides. As seen in Benjamin Brinner’s book *Playing Across a Divide: Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters*, musical collaborations have started to deconstruct the nationalist mind-set by using music as a bridge for peace.²⁷

²⁵David A. McDonald, *My Voice is My Weapon: Music, Nationalism, and the Poetics of Palestinian Resistance* (London: Duke University Press, 2013), 14.

²⁶Anastasiou, 2009, 34.

.....and it is not hard to find corroborating evidence from other sources for the imagining of a community in a non-nationalist sense, a space where Jews and Arabs come together to partake in music rather than to fight. This brings us, once again, to the questions of identity, but this time, identity constituted by the experiences that the subject undergoes rather than by circumstances of birth.²⁸

Identity and Music

It has been widely acknowledged that music in general, and popular/folk music is a major tool in the construction of modern national, ethnic, and other collectives and in the evocation of a sense of place.²⁹

Identity is a subject that cannot be ignored when talking about music or conflict resolution. Therefore, the subject of identity and music is worth exploring before proceeding with the main concern of this review which is how these people groups identities can overlap. Music in the context of identity has been reflected upon, constructed, and further defined by nations and groups of people who use it as a form of expression and a tool for communication. It has either restricted and separate diverse cultures causing conflict, or it has united them on the common ground of the art form itself. According to Martin Stokes, many theoretical generalizations can be found on the topic of identity in the context of music.³⁰ The construct of identity in the nation-state included music within the newly defined boundaries of that identity, and any particular music that was not viewed as a representation of the ideal sound and tradition of a people was seen as backwards.³¹ Music can be used as an identity marker in several ways:

²⁷ Benjamin Brinner, *Playing Across the Divide, Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

²⁸Ibid., 34.

²⁹Motti Regev and Edwin Seroussi, *Popular Music and National Culture in Israel* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), 5.

³⁰Martin Stokes, *Introduction in Ethnicity, Identity, and Music*, ed. Martin Stokes and Jonathan Webber (Oxford, UK: Berg, 2014), 339.

³¹ "...in the contexts of the official nationalist discourses which explicitly reject their internal 'orients' as aspects of the backward past." Ibid., 16.

first, it can be used to mobilize people by, secondly, the way that individuals share a collective emotional experience; and thirdly, music can be used by minority groups as a tool or form of communication as a means to be heard.³² Taking this into considering, music being used as a form of identity that can become more intricate with variables such as various ethnics, religions, migrates, and people groups which all have their own cultural ideas, thoughts, habits and traditions.

According to Timothy Rice, constructed identities become an issue in situations of change where the weak and the more powerful are fighting over identity issues where identity is always constructed out of difference against the “other;”³³ resulting in, as both Stokes and Rice mention, a formation of hybrid identity.³⁴ Newly constructed hybrid identities can come from the assimilation of migrants and refugees, or an indigenous minority group imposed upon by outside intruding forces that bring about political, social or even economical change.

“Ethnomusicologists have noted with great frequency the fact that musics are seldom stable in the context of social change.”³⁵ Though some basic stable identities of nation-states seem to exist, some scholars note that too many other identities seem to shift and change a little too often in this world of globalization. As Brinner states,

...the landscapes of group identity - the ethnoscaples - around the world are no longer familiar anthropological objects, insofar as groups are no longer tightly territorialized,

³² “...music can literally give voice to the powerless to label themselves and to express their existence as a group and their ‘nature’ in context where the powerful either do not acknowledge their existence or label and identify them in ways they find objectionable.” Timothy Rice, “Reflections on Music and Identity in Ethnomusicology,” *Musicology* 10, no. 1 (2001): 31.

³³Ibid., 25.

³⁴Ibid., 18, Stokes, 25.

³⁵Stokes, 17.

spatially bounded, historically self-conscious, or culturally homogeneous...what is the nature of locality as a lived experience, in a globalized, deterritorialized world?³⁶

As mentioned earlier, music and identity can be viewed as a part of nation-state construct or as a reaction to power struggles and globalization. This can apply to both the Palestinians and the Israelis, including the current political situation between them. The formation of the nation-state of Israel in 1948 led to the need to confirm, establish, and solidify both seemingly threatened Palestinian and Israeli identities. Through various ways and tactics, an ongoing battle has continued to do so, and one of those ways included music.³⁷ As in the case of the Palestinians, their need to construct identity through music comes from the approach of a minority group that is looking for an outlet to be heard and in their desire for self-determination.

Heretofore, the literature on Palestinian folklore and nationalism has by and large constructed music, poetry, and dance as epiphenomenal tools for mobilization of oppositional politics and ideology.³⁸

As mentioned by Motti Regev and Edwin Seoussi, during certain times a music genre has been constructed to merge with or create a new identity:

We can see that in Israel the idea of a new nation is thoroughly interwoven with the creation of a new culture and arts...popular music is a particularly important locus where the definition of the new culture is both constructed and contested...popular music is the cultural form that most strongly signifies Israeliness (second, perhaps, only to the reemergence of Hebrew as a living language), and that it represents convincing “proof” of the existence of Israeliness as an indigenous cultural entity...Having accepted the cultural significance of popular music, a major argument of this book is that popular music in Israel should be understood primarily as a leading area in the symbolic representation of Israeliness.³⁹

³⁶Brinner, 292-293.

³⁷“Nationalist movements throughout the world have revived, invented, or preserved various cultural arts in the assertion of a strategically engineered national identity. Music, given its shared indexical associations of time and space, participatory dynamics, and group formative capacities, is a particularly powerful means of fostering national sentiment in the service of a political agenda.” MacDonald, 28.

³⁸Ibid., 31.

³⁹Regev and Seoussi 2.

While Regev and Seoussi only focuses on the main “Israeliness” identity and musical genres pertaining chiefly to various Jewish heritages, these still combine to make up a good starting point in dissecting the music culture in Israel. The main interest of popular music that they are referring to is folk (cultural/historical depth), pop/rock, and ethnic (traditional and rock) that represents minorities.⁴⁰

...popular music in Israel focuses on nationalism, identity, ideology, and artistic belief as the major concepts determining changes of style and meaning in Israeli popular music, the role of the music industry, the media, and relevant institutions cannot be underestimated.⁴¹

The creation of the genre *misrahiyut* and *musica mizrakhit* acted as a hybrid and a cross-over; the cross-over refers to the Arab-Jews that migrated from the Orient (mainly Iraq). An attempt was made by the Zionist to de-Arabize them, yet their connection to the Arab countries were too strong to erase.⁴² So, through popular music different Jewish ethnicities express themselves and through their struggle for legitimacy and dominance as each genre seeks recognition as the true Israeli national music. Using *misrahiyut* and *musica mizrakhit* Israeli society attempts to construct and invent indigenous and authentic Israeli music.⁴³ Yet, as they state “...identity is always an ideal, what we would like to be, not what we are and music gives us a real experience of what the ideal could be.”⁴⁴

⁴⁰Ibid., 7.

⁴¹Ibid., 26.

⁴²Ibid., 211.

⁴³Ibid., 2.

⁴⁴Regev and Seoussi, 244

Stanley Waterman explores identity and music in Israeli society regarding the Ashkenazi elites and their chamber music.⁴⁵ Ashkenazi, accustomed to European culture, sought to dominate Israeli culture and society with the “high culture” of classical music, and even more specifically chamber music which was viewed as *crème de la crème*. The Ashkenazi sought to keep their identity separate from that of the Oriental/Sephardic Jews who, in their opinion, were not like minded. Since the Oriental/Sephardic Jews could not relate or identify with classical or chamber music, their reaction was to formulate an identity through the music genre of *musica mizrakhit*, which was a combination of Middle Eastern styles of music.

As Rice said, music is sometimes created out of difference or when the weak and the powerful are fighting over identity issues.⁴⁶ Interestingly, the *musica mizrakhit* eventually became mainstream which caused tension between the two identities who continued to seek and defend their identity. The cassette/CD made *musica mizrakhit* marketable and popular, resulting in a counter-reaction from the Ashkenazi and their elitist chamber music who sought to do the same. This conflict led to a sudden need to protect and solidify chamber music’s desirability over mainstream “low culture” music of the Oriental/Sephardic Jews. As stated by Nassar Al-Tae:

...*musica mizrakhit* attempts to appeal to Israel’s modern Western audience. Being familiar with both cultures (Israeli and that of their native land), and suffering from discrimination of their own adopted land, Oriental Jewish artist can serve as a bridge between Israelis and Palestinians...In its ability to fuse Eastern and Western elements, *musica mizrakhit* is a reflection of the social and cultural infrastructure of modern Israel.⁴⁷

⁴⁵Stanley Waterman, “Place, Culture and Identity: Summer Music in Upper Galilee,” *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 23, no. 2 (1998): 257.

⁴⁶Rice., 25.

⁴⁷ Nassar Al-Tae, “Voices of Peace and the Legacy of Reconciliation: Popular Music, Nationalism, and the Quest for Peace in the Middle East,” *Popular Music* 12, no. 1 (Jan. 2002): 50.

The Oriental Jews also share another musical heritage with the Arabs: sung-poetry, which is much overlooked and could be used as another useful tool to help build a bridge between a people. “Poetry was the breathing soul of the Arabic language and Arab society, a medium through which an amalgam of issues – aesthetics, intellectual and otherwise – were expressed.”⁴⁸ Several years ago, poets were censored in Israel and seen “...just as dangerous to the occupation forces as the rebels and militiamen.”⁴⁹

Protest Music

MacDonald’s argues in *My Voice is My Weapon: Music, Nationalist, and the Poetic of Palestinian Resistance* that not only do the Palestinians use songs to express their discourse or in protest, but they also use sung-poetry.⁵⁰ This sung-poetry, whether composed or improvised, is used to convey their heritage through historical traditions (such as poetry) in relation to current social and political struggles.

Protest music is one of the most distinguishable intersections of music and politics.... Music is here used as a weapon or tool of propaganda to alter opinion and motivate actions through persuasion...such music ‘brings people together and evokes for them collective emotional experience to which common meanings are assigned.’⁵¹

Another aspect of not only protest music but poetic music in rhymes, comes from a younger modern generation of Arab-Israelis/Palestinians influenced by Rap and Hip-Hop, which no longer identify with the traditional Palestinian music. MacDonald mentions this growing trend in his example of the group DAM. Having identified with “ghetto” life in extremely poor

⁴⁸Atef Alshaer, “Identity in Mahmoud Darwish’s Poem ‘The dice player,’” *Middle East Journal of Culture and Communication* 4 (2011): 91.

⁴⁹Ibid., 52.

⁵⁰MacDonald.

⁵¹Hakki Tas, “Melodies of Resistance: Islamist Music in Secular Turkey,” *Social Compass* 61, no. 3 (2014): 372.

areas of Israel, DAM latched on to their American counterparts who live under the same conditions, that include social issues like discrimination and ethnic diversity. This group of young men have been able to use their music, Rap and Hip-Hop, in ways that not many other Palestinians have been able to do. Their rap in English, Hebrew, and Arabic reflects their Arab-Israeli identity. “Their goal was to develop a new sound that reflected their Arab ancestry, their Israeli upbringing, and their love for American hip-hop culture.”⁵² Though they appeal to both Jewish and non-Jewish Israelis, they still can communicate the struggles of the Palestinian people. Even though they draw a diverse audience, their aim seems not to be about building a bridge to the “other” or even causing conflict but just having a place to be heard. Israel’s social and political structure along with its identity could be assumed to be shifting, just as the Jewish Ethiopians in Israel have taken up Rap as a part of their identity, and as a result, out of their minority oppression.

In 1991 the state of Israel brought Ethiopian Jews to Israel through operation Moses and Solomon in attempt to unite them with their fellow Jews. Unfortunately, over time the Ethiopians did not integrate well into Israeli society. They experienced discrimination on various levels including racial. This situation further alienated them from Israeli society. As a result, they started to look back to their African roots. They began mixing the musical genres of Rap and Reggae which gave them a sense of belonging to a larger community of African descendants around the world. “Black music is a powerful cultural resource in the processes by which Ethiopian young people seek identity and belonging.”⁵³ Because the Palestinians and Ethiopians

⁵²MacDonald, 243-244.

⁵³Malka Shabtay, “‘RaGap’: Music and Identity Among Young Ethiopians in Israel,” *Critical Arts* 17, no. 1-2 (2003): 101.

share similar struggles in Israeli society, is it possible that they can share the same identity through music? This reveals that Israeli society is very diverse and is operating on extremely different levels. Also, I suspect that identity and music in this situation has reflected globalization, or as Stokes and Rice state, a hybrid identity constructed out of difference,⁵⁴ which, per Waterman, is socially constructed out of a reflection of cultural trends.⁵⁵

Musical Identity

Since national identity and music are a big issue within the context of this research, taking a brief look at the formation of musical identity would not only provide insight but would help to understand a particular method and concept that will be addressed later. In the early stages of adolescence when self and social identity are being formed, music can play a central role.⁵⁶ During this time, musical identities can be linked to music preferences which can reveal how the individual sees oneself. During this time of adolescents, individuals begin to emphasize peers and deprioritize families in their development; musical identity helps in the process of strengthening their ties to their peers.⁵⁷ Yet, "...musically trained individuals are likely to have increased exposure to different genres of music which should enhance...the maturation of musical identities."⁵⁸ As noted by Beatriz Ilari, musical identities consists of two forms: identities in music where one plays the role as a musician, and then other aspects of music where

⁵⁴Rice, 18, 25. Stokes, 25.

⁵⁵Waterman, 254.

⁵⁶Sebastian P. Dys, E. Glenn Schellenberg, and Kate C. McLean, "Musical Identities, Musical Preferences, and Individual Differences," in *Handbook of Musical Identities* ed. Raymond MacDonald, David J. Hargreaves, and Dorothy Miell (Oxford: OUP Oxford, 2017), 247.

⁵⁷Jennifer E. Symonds, Jonathan James Hargreaves, Marion Long, "Music in Identity in Adolescence Across School," *Ibid.*, 512.

⁵⁸Dys, Schellenberg, McLean, 252.

one develops their identity.⁵⁹ Furthermore, the construct of our identities, including musical, are many times formed out of who we are not.

As social and psychological constructions, identities are founded on perceived differences, as we define ourselves in relationship to the “other.” That is, who we are in partly defined in reference to who we are not.⁶⁰

Even so, Goran Folkestad addressing post-national identity talks about the importance of popular culture and cultural identity in music. This topic of post-national identity has been a transcending force that further gives individuals multiple cultural identities. He believes that multiple cultural identities provide a greater base in finding commonality with the “other.”⁶¹ He believes that post-national identities are a good foundation for musical identities in a post-national global musical arena.

Global youth culture and its music, because it is the same regardless of national, ethnic or cultural heritage of the context which it operates, might have a non-segregating and uniting function... a post-national perspective might be helpful in understanding today’s youth engagement in hybridized and globalized musical practices... a post-national perspective not only challenges the significance of national identity, but also questions the emphasis placed on identity in general.⁶²

Gilboa, the *Let’s Talk Music* participant, uses one particular concept to describe musical identity. This concept includes liked, disliked, and unknown music as a part of our personal identity. Gilboa describes those identities as circles within a circle, or circles that overlap:

The inner circle, *My Music*, includes all of the musical styles that one likes and defines as part of his or her musical taste.... The second, more encompassing circle, *My culture’s music* includes musical choices that are not necessarily connected to one’s personal taste but more to his or her cultural environment.... The third and fourth circles define the negative sides of one’s musical identity, that is, the types of music that he or she dislikes or even disapproves of (third circle) and the types of music that he or she simply does not

⁵⁹Beatriz Ilari, “Children’s Ethnic Identities Cultural Diversity, and Music Education,” *Ibid.*, 528.

⁶⁰*Ibid.*, 529.

⁶¹Goran Folkestad, “Post-National Identities in Music,” *Ibid.*, 123.

⁶²*Ibid.*, 124

know about (fourth circle). The third circle is actually a person's *musical alter-ego*. It contains types of music that the person knows but resists and disregards. The fact that there is a negative attitude towards these types of music implies that the person has an emotional connection to the music.⁶³

The negative emotional connection that is attached to those musics in third circle can be at times attributed to cultural stereotypes and prejudices or values and ideas that are associated with them. So, Gilboa believes we can also form our identity out of a negative side in that "...music many times is about values, style, culture, and identity and choosing music or un-choosing music [that] would give the idea of who you are and give you the idea of who you want to be."⁶⁴ Therefore, many times musical choices can be very intentional for that reason; which further signifies one's personality, social identity, and culture that forms a musical fingerprint.⁶⁵ Gilboa applies this idea through a method that will be discussed later.

Music and Peacemaking

Music and peacemaking efforts and initiatives in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict have been approached through various methods and ideas. In recent years, the Christians in Bethlehem use musical endeavors during Christmas to promote peace. During this time a public parade and festival occurs that includes Christmas, nationalist, and folk music.⁶⁶ The participants are not just Christians within the West Bank, but are also Jews and Muslims who are in favor of peace. Although the objective is peace, collaboration is not promoted among the participants. This

⁶³Avi Gilboa, "Let's Talk Music – A Model for Enhancing Intercultural Communication: Trying to Understand Why and How Music Helps," *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy* (online) 16, no. 1 (Feb. 2016): 3-4.

⁶⁴Avi Gilboa, Interviewed by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

⁶⁵Gilboa, 3, 5.

⁶⁶Jennifer Sinnamon, "Palestinian Christmas Songs for Peace and Justice in Sacred Place and Politicized Space," in *The Oxford Handbook of Music and World Christianities*, ed. Jonathan Dueck and Suzel Ana Reily (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), 555-80.

scenario falls somewhere in between the two dichotomous situations of music that encourages conflict, and music that fosters peacemaking.

Additional attempts in Israel have transpired through education, musical collaborations, and music festivals. These musical efforts usually show commonality between the multiple parties outside of social, political, and religious pressures. Musical festivals try to engage the public in these same efforts bringing various ethnic majorities and minorities together under a shared interest. The educational efforts usually start at a young age when they are more open and responsive to such interaction with each other. Building those bridges at a young age has a stronger chance of tearing down the walls of hate before they begin. As mentioned, Arab-Christians in the region have also played a part being the mediator between the Muslims and Jews in various ways. Their strategy is just one aspect or approach that should be taken into serious consideration. Just how and why music has been chosen as a tool to build a bridge can be examined through multiply vantage points and case studies of musical collaborations and applied methods.

Brinner's book *Playing Across the Divide: Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters*⁶⁷ touches on the musical collaboration between Jewish Israelis and Arab-Israelis/Palestinians in their message for a peaceful coexistence. He evaluates a few case studies of collaborations of musical groups that consist of both Palestinians and Jewish Israelis together. Some of them have taken Western and Eastern instruments and used them to write original compositions in hopes of creating a new music genre, like Bustan Abraham.⁶⁸ These group of Israelis, both Jewish and Arab, have taken it among themselves to create a new style of music that reflects who they are as

⁶⁷Brinner, 124.

⁶⁸Ibid., 124.

musicians. Their music hybrid or fusion consists of "...both Eastern and Western styles of music forms without sacrificing the musical integrity of either."⁶⁹ How they came together as musicians and created something entirely new speaks volumes of their coexistence and added a perspective of the interpersonal dynamics between them. Brinner noted that Bustan Abraham's mission statement was to "...pave the way for other joint creative efforts between Arabs and Jews."⁷⁰ Additionally, Brinner's case study of Yair Dalal exemplified how identity can overlap. In the case of an overlapping identity, it can be used to reach both Jewish-Israelis and Arab-Israelis/Palestinians.⁷¹ Dalal is an Oriental Jew of Iraqi decent whose identity gives him a greater platform when it comes to reaching or building a bridge between both Jews and Palestinians for peace. "Yair capitalizes on his 'Eastern' heritage in ways that Zohar Fresco and Shoham...do not... Yair's heritage serves as a means of legitimization."⁷² This is a great example of how Oriental Jews can be mediators for peace; yet, timing plays a part as well. Brinner mentions how conditions were ripe in the 1990s (with the Oslo Accords) for movements of activism for peace through musical collaboration in relation to how the identity issue could be reconstructed to breakdown cultural barriers.⁷³

While Brinner gave a great understanding on the musical collaboration between Jewish-Israelis and Arab-Israelis/Palestinians, he did not leave any suggestions or ideas for applied methods in how to be a mediator, an initiator for peace, or an active participant. Brinner could

⁶⁹Ibid., 123.

⁷⁰Ibid., 128.

⁷¹Ibid., 155.

⁷²Ibid., 155.

⁷³Ibid, 156.

have also suggested how musicians could unite or bring cultural awareness through music not only in Israel but throughout the world. Yet, this book is still beneficial in that it gives an understanding of the background and context of such movements in Israel which could inspire those who want to follow in their footsteps. In a more active approach, the following theses explore and research the topic of music and conflict resolution, interfaith dialogue, and peacebuilding in various ways.

Bassale's thesis on music and conflict resolution comes out of his interest in empathy and if music carries the characteristics to develop it.⁷⁴ He took into consideration that empathy is one of the foundational elements necessary for conflict resolution.⁷⁵ Understandably, his vantage point is conflict resolution, not of ethnomusicology. While it should prove useful on the side of conflict resolution, the testing and measurement of music was not thorough. The applied side to his data collecting consisted of playing music in a classroom setting for a group of people and handing out a questionnaire, and although he was detailed in his statistical methods, his measure effectiveness unfortunately was lacking. Bassale gives a very Westernized approach and generalizations about music and conflict without any other cultural comparisons. Though he can be given credit for trying to incorporate and test music against people's emotions or finding that it has the ability to draw empathy, this thesis has big musicological and ethnomusicological gaps. This can be seen with statements like: "Music is the first articulation of this pedagogy because of its ability to convey emotions that are shared cross-culturally despite language barriers."⁷⁶ As

⁷⁴Bassale, 26-27.

⁷⁵"...empathy-motivated actions effectively de-escalate the non-cooperative pattern in human relations. Urbain (2008), suggests...relationships suggesting that Empathy is a fundamental node in human 'relatedness' and a 'binding' force between people." Ibid. 15.

⁷⁶Ibid., 8.

addressed above in musical semiotics, music does not necessarily convey the same message cross-culturally. He did conclude that music enhanced empathy in the context of conflict resolution though he said that his results were not consistent.⁷⁷ This inconsistency could be because of a cross-cultural situation of which he was unaware.

Sharenda Roam's dissertation on interfaith peacebuilding is closely related to that of my own research and interest.⁷⁸ Roam's research in Israel investigates conflict resolution through music touching on interfaith, identity, and peacebuilding. Roam addresses the topic of identity which is essential when talking about conflict resolution and peacebuilding.

Pluralism is a practice of maintaining identity while relativism submits to the loss of identity...ultimately it enables the individual to prioritize love of human brothers and sisters over disagreements. And at best it can break cycles of hatred and war based on definitions of absolutisms.⁷⁹

As stated here, maintaining identity and celebrating diversity is a must and pluralism becomes a necessary practice to engage in peacebuilding.⁸⁰ Roam goes on to make very good points about using arts in peacebuilding efforts. This includes creating spaces outside of oneself which transcend cultural and religious differences that result in a shared experience with the "other."⁸¹

The very spiritual things which we cannot comprehend directly are investigated through the bridge of the symbol, meaning here the natural sign-language of music. Music as a peacebuilding tool becomes a way in which learning about the "other" is possible. When words don't present enough material for interpretation due to language barriers and the limitations of vocabulary, music becomes a bridge for experiential learning. The

⁷⁷Ibid., 62.

⁷⁸ Sharenda Roam, "Taking it to the Bridge: The Arts of Interfaith Peacebuilding" (PhD diss., George Fox University, 2015) file:///C:/Users/primary/Downloads/Literature%20Review%20George%20Fox.pdf

⁷⁹Ibid., 9.

⁸⁰Ibid., 11,15.

⁸¹Ibid., 17.

acoustical measurements and symbols are gathered into an individual's reason and there take shape and form.⁸²

By this statement, Roam is somewhat aware of different elements of musical semiotics and the multiple possibilities it may lead to. Though she has many great ideas about interfaith dialogue and peacebuilding efforts in Israel, her ideas on how music is a universal language is like that of Bassele. Additionally, even though she knew the difference between Middle East and Western music theory, she made assumptions about Middle East music and people, that led me to believe that she thought that music communicated in the same way to everyone. The only thing lacking in her dissertation is more of an ethnomusicological approach to the Middle East music culture. Her research concluded with examples of successful attempts that have enhanced and built relationships that had sought to resolve conflict and encourage interfaith dialogue through music in Israel.

Micah Hendler's essay on music for peace was very much aligned with my own research and interest on the topic.⁸³ His own research takes him to peacemaking initiatives between the Jews and Arabs within Israel and in other parts of the world. Hendler explores ways that identity-transformation and prejudice-reduction can come because of interactions through music.

Music can facilitate identity-formation and prejudice-reduction, both in tandem with, and in the absence of, explicit political dialogue. It can tap into the notions of a shared past, call attention to a shared present, and point the way to a shared future through musical transcendence of societal boundaries. Finally, it can empower its members – individually and collectively – to make passionate statements in the political realm...arts-based peacebuilding processes can play an important role in helping to foster interaction in divided societies and help facilitate reconciliation.⁸⁴

⁸²Ibid., 62.

⁸³Micah Hendler, "Music for Peace in Jerusalem" (Senior Essay, Calhoun College, 2012), 38.
<https://traubman.igc.org/hendlerpaper.pdf>

⁸⁴Ibid., 39.

Understanding that there is a shared past, addressing the shared present, and making a way for a shared future are exactly my thoughts in approaching my own research. As well, his research design had several good approaches and questions. He sought how the individuals in the organizations were selected or why they joined, if there were political discussions, and what the basis of their interests were. Additionally, Hendler assessed the strategies in each program used to locate musical ground whether by a shared past, performing a contemporary present, or pointing the way to a possible future. He went on to say that he studied the advantages and disadvantages of each organization's strategy in the context of the literature to better understand the successes and shortcomings of each project.

Applied Methods and Concepts in Peacemaking

Various case studies involving Christians and Muslims in specific concentrated applications of peacemaking and peacebuilding can be found in King and Sooi Ling Tan's book: *(un)Common Sounds: Songs of Peace and Reconciliation among Muslims and Christians*.⁸⁵ In this book they pull apart terms and ideas that help construct the process of sustainable peace specifically through music. Two of these terms are peacemaking and peacebuilding. Peacemaking involves activities that include musicking which, as mentioned earlier, is the process of a collaborative effort of rehearsing or performing together. Peacebuilding occurs after the initial stage of peacemaking has transpired, the creative process of music-making takes place, and personal relationships between the parties involved develops.

At the junction of music and peacebuilding lies the core value of fostering human relationships as they promote sustainable peace... Music-making, music performance, and

⁸⁵Roberta King and Sooi Ling Tan, ed., *(un)Common Sounds: Songs of Peace and Reconciliation among Muslims and Christians* (Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2014).

musicking, offer critical spaces as human interaction as non-violent means to pursue peace in profound ways.⁸⁶

King also makes clear the difference between conflict resolution and conflict transformation. Conflict resolution is thought of as a cold peace which is a behavioral change to tolerance and coexistence, where "...conflict transformation, like peacebuilding, is a process-structure set in place to develop quality relationships of mutual understanding and respect in face-to-face interactions and in the structure of society."⁸⁷ In my own observation, some reoccurring terms worth pointing out appeared in the works of almost every author. These terms are commonality, sharing, catalyst, relating, engaging, rights/justice, solidarity, empathy, dialogue, and mutuality. As suggested, for peacemaking, peacebuilding and conflict resolution-transformation concepts to develop and occur, so do the previous terms mentioned, though I don't believe that this list is exhaustive. Reconciliation and forgiveness need to be added to the list as they were also mentioned, but not as much.

Jared Holton's levels of engagement in the music-making process are worth mentioning. They are: "Steps to Peacebuilding through Music'... 1) shared listening; 2) performing music for Other; 3) playing together; 4) shared performance, and eventually 5) joint composition."⁸⁸ These levels of engagement encourage not only collaborating and shared experience, but also the terms of engaging, relating, and mutual. This activity helps break down the barriers of misunderstanding that gives a new starting point from which to work.

When music is performed by artists representing conflicted groups, there is the possibility of imagining mutual understanding and reconciliation on a larger public scale based upon

⁸⁶Ibid., 25.

⁸⁷Ibid., 25.

⁸⁸James R. Krabill, "Preforming Toward Peace: Investigations into the Process of Peacebuilding through Sacred Music in Libya," in *(un)Common Sounds: Songs of Peace and Reconciliation among Muslims and Christians*, ed. Roberta King and Sooi Ling (Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2014), 100.

the deepened relationship between the musicians. The trust forged between the musicians becomes a bridge that the audience may utilize. By viewing the shared performance of musicians that have found a deeper harmony and peace in relationship, audience members can participate in these realities... When audiences participate in the peacebuilding process in this way, it provides the possibility of exposing others within the wider cultural cohort to reconciliation, thus broadening the base of peacebuilding in a realm of conflict.⁸⁹

Using a similar method, Gilboa employs a variation of those methods just mentioned with an application of what he calls the *Let's Talk Music* model.⁹⁰ This method aims to use music as a tool that creates a safe space where the participants are comfortable discussing larger issues that surround their conflict. The *Let's Talk Music* model consists of a series of sessions that are grouped in three stages. The first stage is naturally the introduction stage of getting to know the “other” and what the future class sessions will entail; though Gilboa mentioned that the introduction can take up to a few sessions.

I would say that the first few sessions are getting to know each other and getting to know the concept... it is very difficult to explain this course, it is so different from what they are used to. So, it is not exactly clear to where music, verbal speech, politics, and culture comes in. These things become clear as we go.⁹¹

One goal in the beginning stages is to get a feel for the dynamics of the class by asking them what are their expectations and what their apprehensions or fears may be. By doing this, realistic boundaries can be set while making the classroom a safe place where fears can be addressed and set aside. This initial stage also includes an instructor who introduces music and/or instruments which the students listen to and talk about. When the instruments are introduced to the class, the

⁸⁹Jared Holton, “Performing Towards Peace: Investigations into Process of Peacebuilding through Shared Music in Libya,” *Ibid.*, 170.

⁹⁰Gilboa, 8.

⁹¹Avi Gilboa, Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

students are given a chance to choose from the selection which could be an entirely new musical experience for some.

The second stage is the critical one where the students present themselves musically within a presentation of musical pieces that they believe identifies who they are. In preparing a presentation, this is also a time where individuals are introspective and through this process learn about themselves and their own personal and cultural identity.⁹² The presentations are also a method that gets the students into an active listening mode while learning about the “other,” and thereafter can engage in dialogue with the presenter by asking questions. This gives the students not only time to get to know one another more intimately but it further can initiate conversations about sensitive cultural issues.⁹³ There is also a segment during this stage which allows for a duel presentation between a Jew and an Arab.

We have had some very powerful presentations with a right-winged Jew and a right-winged Arab...doing the presentations together, putting very powerful stuff and very powerful music together in the same presentation, which is a statement [in] itself. So, it becomes sensitive. It becomes conflicting ideas. It becomes music that I like, that reflect my values. Then there is music that I don't like and it reflects values I cannot believe in.⁹⁴

Gilboa went on to say that two seemingly opposing individuals who could come together and make this presentation happen as a joint effort is an achievement. The third stage is the reflection stage. The participants talk about what they have learned, and perhaps, if they haven't already,

⁹²Gilboa, 12.

⁹³Ibid., 9.

⁹⁴Avi Gilboa, Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

have a joint activity before parting ways.⁹⁵ In Gilboa's experience with this method, he has found that music is a great mediator because of its indirectness.⁹⁶

It is my claim that the processes that take place in *Let's talk music* work precisely to promote recognition of different identities and different cultures. *Let's talk music* provides the comfort zone required for music dialogue, for people to come out and be heard and yet to listen, acknowledge and recognize others who do the same. *Let's talk music* is a perfect playground for practicing politics of equal recognition...*Let's talk music* participants are thus encouraged to acquire tools for enhancing recognition of others, tools that they can apply not only among their group peers but also later on in social life in general.⁹⁷

At one point during the course, an outing is scheduled. This includes going out in society and interacting with Arabs and Jews who coexistence in a community together, or meeting clergyman from Muslim, Jewish, and Christian places of worship. It's in these places that students learn about beliefs, traditions, and habits of the "other" while observing a peaceful shared coexistence. One of Gilboa's main goal is to use the *Let's Talk Music* model to broaden the inner circle (1st) or music identity which in turn can result in a higher tolerance and acceptance towards the "other."⁹⁸ In addition, he seeks to use the modal as a way to "experience knowing each other, experiencing music as a part of it and understanding that there are different ways to interact."⁹⁹

Conclusion

As I look back on the evidence presented in various forms and cases, certain claims can be made about how various applied methods and theories are at some level functional. For

⁹⁵Gilboa, 8-11.

⁹⁶Ibid., 13.

⁹⁷Ibid., 19-20.

⁹⁸Ibid., 8.

⁹⁹Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

example, if there is a willingness to collaborate through musical efforts, which encourages dialogue and cooperation, then we know that there is a likelihood that other forms of dialogue can transpire opening new pathways for other relations. Further, if people are willing to come together on common, mutual and shared interests or experiences, this leads to the possibility for ignorance to be defeated through personal one-on-one experience of the “other.” These experiences can come through a neutral ground of what some call created spaces.

Musical events provide social spaces for gathering people together... Although musical gatherings are most often made up of participants who share musical traditions and similar taste affinities for music, people who otherwise might have very little in common or who would not otherwise choose to meet with each other find themselves gathering around a musical event.¹⁰⁰

As previously stated, music used as a method or tool in peacemaking or conflict resolution-transformation in Israel has achieved a certain level of success in its endeavor, and has also brought about cultural awareness while battling the efforts of those who use music to perpetrate or escalate conflict in the region. Further noting, music as a method in the creative peacemaking and peacebuilding process within Israel has been used to resolve religious, social, racial and ethnic divisions and differences among the people. Music has brought cultural awareness through planned public events, whether secular, religious, or culturally based. Through musical collaborations, music and peacemaking has sought to counter-act music that perpetrates conflict, and music has been a mediator or a tool that has brought diverse people together on common ground. Yet music is not the only way that people come together on a level of commonality; they can also do this through other avenues, such as ideals and beliefs (though not necessarily religious).

¹⁰⁰King and Tan, “Musical Pathways Towards Peace and Reconciliation,” *Ibid.*, 271.

If people can find something in common with the “other,” it gives them an opportunity for engagement which can lead to a relationship. Therefore, activities such as sports or other art forms, can also be a mediator for peacemaking or conflict resolution-transformation. Yet, music has a stronger and more powerful force than those other shared interests because music produces or initiates some level of emotion which makes people vulnerable. This also permits barriers to come down making it a humbling experience. This exposure allows for those sharing the same experience to connect and relate to each other further bonding them and allowing them to enter a space that is mutual and non-threatening. When people see eye-to-eye and relate on a personal level, then they can see the “other” as being familiar or like them.

Nevertheless, I contemplate the actual likelihood of lasting peace through this endeavor of music and peacemaking alone without there being something more. Music is a great tool in bringing people together, but there must be something more that keeps them together. Music is a great way to unite people, or light the fire so to speak, but it must also function in such a way that it leads to something else or a next step. Music alone cannot be the sole answer to a people’s larger problems; that next step could make or break the peacemaking initiative.

Chapter III: Methodology

Overview of Research Design

The approaches to ethnographic research come through various research paradigms and designs which can assist and aid the researcher to achieve a higher quality of data through multiple perspectives. With research paradigms, the scholar uses methods in measuring accuracy which over time becomes a standard until proven otherwise. Through these methods or paradigms, the scholar or ethnographer tests the subject at hand to discover the truth or perhaps even the unknown. Research designs also seek to bring about results and answers but in a more tangible way. Both quantitative and qualitative research designs have their practical applications. Quantitative designs attempt to collect data in a precise calculated way which produces a seemingly logical or valid answer. This design also gathers statistics through surveys, experiments and comparisons which aim for more exacting results or solutions. In qualitative designs the ethnographer seeks to find ways to obtain data that is less rigid or fixed, but still with a valid explanation. The approach to my research was a qualitative method in a blended design of a mini-ethnographic case study which captured the social implications and meanings that cannot be found strictly by using quantitative means.¹⁰¹

For qualitative field research, ethnography involves learning the feelings, beliefs, and meanings of relationships between people as they interact within their culture or as they react to others in response to a changing phenomenon for the research takes place within the culture being studied. The researcher enters the culture and becomes the primary data collection instrument in an effort to understand the culture and then disseminates the researcher's interpretations to those outside the culture.¹⁰²

¹⁰¹ Patricia I. Fusch, Gene E. Fusch, and Lawrence R. Ness, "How to Conduct a Mini-Ethnographic Case Study: A Guide for Novice Researchers," *The Qualitative Report* 22, no. 3 (2017): 923-941.

¹⁰²Ibid., 925.

The mini-ethnographic case study design fits my research as it takes into consideration the novice researcher who is usually limited in time and resources. The mini-ethnographic case study design uses various methods to collect the data that is encompassed within a fieldwork setting. During my fieldwork, the methods that I applied under this design consisted of direct observation, formal/informal interviews, a reflective journal, and field notes (observation, coding, etc.). The qualitative ethnographic approach allowed me to become immersed and embedded in the culture of interest, with that came the challenge of separating myself from the research. I also had to be aware of making biased interpretations of the data.

Besides the mini-ethnographic case study, the research critical paradigm also was applicable to my individual research. The critical paradigm, mainly used by social scientist, focuses on the power struggles of the people and the state or government.¹⁰³ The involvement of the researcher in this context is usually of the applied approach and in many cases the research acts on the behalf of those that they are researching.

Critical theorist...believe that researchers can capture reality accurately in the specific historical and geographical context they study. However, they also assume that interpretation of the cultural products (words and texts, norms, behaviors, symbols, physical objects, etc.) they examine is influenced by the context in which they are produced and reproduced. Because critical theorist view cultural behavior and beliefs as situated within a specific historical era, they believe that these behaviors and beliefs change over time.¹⁰⁴

The critical approach from the applied researcher also seeks to implement change by being an advocate or activist in that those being studied are usually those who don't have a social or political voice; once in the field, the applied researcher discovers the implications of those who

¹⁰³Margaret D. LeCompte and Jean J. Schensul, *Designing & Conducting Ethnographic Research* (Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press, 2010), 63.

¹⁰⁴Ibid., 63-64.

have been affected by national and international situations.¹⁰⁵ This statement reveals that the paradigm consists of semiotics, phenomenology and social behavior and a construct of reality that overlaps with historical context. Through these constructs comes a way of communicating and relating that brings about meaning. The applied application of the ethnographer can be seen in the following statement:

...many scholar activists/applied ethnographers can be drawn into action by the needs of participants; some also do initiate their research dialogue with change-oriented positions. These then are negotiated with and modified by participants.¹⁰⁶

This paradigm closely matches my own research in. First, my role in this study is of an applied approach and at times can be viewed as advocate to those (minorities) who use music as a platform to be heard. Second, my research can also be considered from a social science perspective which includes the historical and geographical context such as the focus of the social and political phenomenon of nationalism.

...in order to bring about change, the critical approach requires congruence among the aims, objectives, and values of the researcher and those of the group(s) involved in the study. To bring about such congruence, all participants, and researchers, should be involved in the research process because the research is intended to be empowering – i.e., to demonstrate how and in what ways participants are in positions of subordination or domination (or in some cases, both), and how they can act to change both either own situation and that of others.¹⁰⁷

Though I only used the qualitative method, quantitative research still serves a useful purpose. The quantitative design is great at producing seemingly exact or precise results, though it does not consider why and how things have transpired or the context of the answer: “Surveys cannot provide much historical or contextual data to explain why people responded as they did,

¹⁰⁵Ibid., 77.

¹⁰⁶Ibid., 71.

¹⁰⁷Ibid., 65.

beyond the individual respondent's own experience."¹⁰⁸ Again, while useful in getting immediate feedback or data, quantitative design does not allow for other possible explanations that give way to a bigger picture or more thorough answer. "Qualitative designs are good for pulling apart or understanding the reasons why perhaps things have come to be as they are....they allow us to assess and describe what really is happening over time rather than at one point in time..."¹⁰⁹ In many cases life does not always adhere to the quantitative regimen leading to the positive qualities of the qualitative design. On the other hand, one downfall of the qualitative design is that participants or informants may intentionally not give the correct information to protect their culture, a behavior that could reflect situations hidden from the researcher.¹¹⁰ As I proceeded with my research, I was able to find one individual, Gilboa, who had applied a quantitative research method to the research of interest.

Descriptions of Research Tools

Various studies have proven so far that music has brought cultural awareness through structured public events, whether secular, cultural, or religious based. My own research focused on community and academic based programs. Through both types of projects and programs, I sought to find answers to research questions using various methods, as mentioned earlier, which included interviews, direct observation, previous research discoveries, case studies, and narratives. In narratives and interviews, I explored every individual's identity and how it related to their current involvement, including any relation to the music that had been chosen. In the case that the music has been chosen for them, I inquired how they felt about the music in relation to

¹⁰⁸Ibid., 101.

¹⁰⁹Ibid., 113.

¹¹⁰Ibid., 119.

their preferred music. In turn, that gave me a better understanding of each musical identity, and how it may have played a part in their involvement. This research was more than just exploring the methods behind the initiative; it revealed how an individual's background can lead to the success of the method used. In conducting interviews with each participant, their personal background and mind-set outside of their musical identity or preferences were also be studied to gain a well-rounded perspective.

Fieldwork Procedures

Fieldwork procedures consisted of having professional manners and respect for those that were willing to allow me to partake in their initiative. This included showing up on time (though this can be culturally relative as I learned living in Egypt), educating myself on common courtesies in Israel by what was proper and what was not, and keeping aware so not to overstep my boundaries. When I was not engaged with the participants, I was analyzing collected data using various means such as coding to identify common themes. During these times of analysis, I was able to reconstruct some of my questions or approaches to further fit the needs of my research.

Methods of Data Collections

The methods from which I sought to collect the data were of various sorts. First, I took audio/video recordings and photos. The convenience of a video recorder was beneficial because it not only recorded every word (for later dictation) but it picked up on physical behavior that could be missed through audio or the note taking method.

People talk in spurts and fragments. They accentuate or even complete a phrase with a gesture, facial expression, or posture. They send complex messages through incongruent, seemingly contradictory and ironic verbal and nonverbal expression as in sarcasm or polite putdowns. Thus, ethnographers must record the meanings they infer from the bodily expression accompanying words- gesture, movement, facial expression, tone of voice. Furthermore, people do not take turns smoothly in conversation: They interrupt

each other, overlap words, talk simultaneously, and respond with ongoing comments and murmurs. Such turn taking can be placed on a linear page by bracketing and overlapping speech.¹¹¹

The photos were beneficial in capturing the participants or the surroundings of the collective individuals in an atmosphere of activities. After the event was finished, reviewing the photographs many times reveals data missed during the actual observation, such as how they engaged with each other outside of the intended activity.

Next, jotting down quick notes was helpful while in an impromptu setting whether that was through direct observation or informal interviews conducted in passing. Lastly, another data collecting method consists of spending informal time with the participants getting to know them in a more personal way which I was able to do in some instances. This also allowed for everyone, myself included, to let down the professional guard, which can freely give way to real interaction, insight, and information that flows more readily.

¹¹¹Robert M. Emerson, Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes* 2nd ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 65.

Chapter IV: Research Findings

Indeed, many fieldworkers find it difficult to achieve the sort of emotional distance required to subject to analysis those with whom he has been deeply immersed. Some fieldworkers report discomfort at “examining under a microscope” the lives of people with whom they have become deeply involved, in many cases, care about. For some, analysis comes close to an act of betrayal...¹¹²

As I started to put my research notes together and dissect all the information, I found it hard to do so in a way that, as mentioned above, would seem like an act of betrayal. However, given some time and distance away from my research, I was able to justifiably compartmentalize things. Exploring three different approaches to the projects conducted by three different individuals was advantageous, providing a broader perspective in the multiple ways that music can be used to build a bridge. Paul Moore, an outsider, Taiseer Elias, an Arab, and Avi Gilboa, a Jew, all use music in different ways. Each one of their approaches also reflects their own personal musical training and education that has directed them in their path. Though they share common goals of coexistence, their ideas, thoughts, and understanding in how they go about it are all different; yet, all three are effective. In addition, every one of their projects share the commonality of a supporting school system. Ukuleles for Peace has the support of the individual school districts in Tel Aviv. The Arab-Jewish Orchestra has been able to recently continue through the support of Haifa University, with Bar-Ilan University supporting the *Let's Talk Music* course. Though school systems are not the only ones in Israel that support these types of programs, it seems to be a common trend which could be a reflection or signify a shift in society, especially when it comes to a conservative university like Bar-Ilan. Gilboa had mentioned Bar-Ilan's support of this project:

The reason I am doing it is not because I was told to do it, but because I wanted to do it. And then [Bar-Ilan] said “ok, go ahead.” I do have to give credit to [them] because they

¹¹²Emerson, Fretz, and Shaw, 174.

backed it and they are paying for a big deal of it. They are really for it. They could have cut in the beginning but they didn't. They let it grow and thrive and I am thankful for that.¹¹³

There are other common themes that each of them share, yet, every project has other elements that make it specifically unique to itself. Starting with the Ukuleles for Peace, I will analyze every project before listing their commonalities from which I draw conclusions.

Ukuleles for Peace

During my time with the Ukuleles for Peace, I spent two months attending rehearsals and getting to know the aspects of the organization and its members, who are its heart. As mentioned earlier, the rehearsals are held at a different member's home every week; this is one of the parental responsibilities and participation elements of joining. Additionally, carpooling is also a requirement, making sure that everyone takes turns getting the students back and forth to the rehearsals between the two suburbs. Considering I was at the mercy of using local transportation while in Israel, I was able to experience this carpool system first hand. I arrived every week to Hod HaSharon by train, and from the station either Paul, Daphna, or one of the parents would see that I got back and forth to the rehearsals. This gave me a great opportunity to get to know and talk to the parents in an informal way (that is, if there wasn't a language barrier). This was a great aspect of the Ukuleles for Peace grassroots concept, to build a community where people build trust and rely on each other through such activities as carpooling and hosting the rehearsals in the home. I saw these two aspects of their project as a way of taking the shared coexistence one step further. It is easy to meet in a neutral space somewhere, but it is another thing all together to allow someone, especially the "other," into one's own personal space. Allowing someone into your home is a very personal gesture and, in this case, speaks volumes. This

¹¹³Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

project goes beyond just “musicking;” it seeks to bring the immediate community in and make it part of the process as well.

As an observer, I could detect and gauge the various levels of comfortability that the members had with each other and how they interacted musically and personally. During rehearsals, the students were given a break where they were provided with an assortment of snacks or something to eat. It was then where the members took the time to talk, laugh, and occasionally play games, like fussball or air hockey in a relaxed fun atmosphere. In addition, this was the time where Paul and Daphna held casual conversation with the parents until the rehearsal resumed.¹¹⁴

When the rehearsal resumed, everyone, myself included, sat in a circle that either consisted of chairs or cushions on the floor.¹¹⁵ Daphna would generally allow the members to self-direct themselves as she would observe. When she did direct, it was relaxed and informal, so much so, that it seemed at times she was not actually conducting, at least not in the traditional sense. Since I could not understand Hebrew, I had to make very careful observations by the response that the members would make when Daphna gave them direction. Additionally, there were times when the older Arab members would communicate in Arabic to the younger Arab members who were not yet fluent in Hebrew. When Paul gave direction, he spoke English with the expectation that the members were completely fluent in the language. This also added another dynamic to the interpersonal communication style in that they had to be diverse and flexible with each other. When not taking direction from Paul or Daphna, the members did a

¹¹⁴Considering Paul has taken a sabbatical from directing the evening rehearsals and I only saw him one night of my observance, Daphna had become my main point of reference here in my direct observation with the project.

¹¹⁵Couple of times I tried to sit outside of the rehearsal space just as an observer, but I was invited to sit among them.

great job in leading themselves with the older ones generally leading the younger. There were times when Daphna would separate them into groups to work on their individual parts. Every member had various levels of music education with some of them having no prior knowledge. Taking this into account, Paul and Daphna catered to each learning style. If the members could not read music notation or guitar chords, they learned by ear from the help of others or YouTube. For example, there were times when Daphna would sing the melody slowly in order for them to learn their part better. Paul thought that the students became better at rhythm when they didn't learn by music notation. Yet, he did admit that he was never into music notation or music theory.¹¹⁶ I concluded that perhaps his own music interest and learning style reflected his approach. The students did have a great sense of time and rhythm, even though some of them could also read music.

When instructed to separate into groups according to music parts, the members would adjust to each other's learning style as they worked together. This was a great bonding activity, especially among those of inter-ethnicities. They had to learn to rely on one another for correct information to play the part right. This is a major trust and communication building activity. If this can be done at this level then it most certainly can be done at other levels. The songs that were sung were in Hebrew, Arabic, and English which is a reflection of the member themselves, including Paul. The content and choice of songs sometimes promoted topics about peace, like John Lennon's "Imagine." Other songs were traditional Jewish or Arabic music, and the remaining were Western pop. One of the ways that they liked to perform a song was to sing a single song in Arabic, Hebrew, and English, just repeating and rotating out the verses and chorus. In recent times, Paul said that he has allowed the students to choose the music that they

¹¹⁶ Paul Moore, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, October 23, 2017.

would like to play. This had become a reflection of their own interests and message that they wanted to convey.¹¹⁷

Throughout these rehearsals I was able to sit down with the students one-on-one and ask them about their involvement in the project.¹¹⁸ There are about 12 students who are currently from 12-19 years old, and almost equally split by gender and ethnicity. I asked them a series of questions, for example, about how they viewed themselves, what music they liked or didn't like, why they joined the project, and what they had learned besides music. By this, I drew some interesting conclusions. First, as a result of being part of this project, their music exposure has broadened in addition to their musical identities. As mentioned earlier, studies show that during the time of adolescences when musical identities form, it becomes a bonding peer experience with the enhanced opportunity to broaden those identities.¹¹⁹ While every student said that their music exposure expanded in getting to know other types of music, Dana, who is 19 and oldest current member of the group, specifically said because of the project she now likes rock music. Even though some expressed that they didn't like some of the songs that were chosen, several of them said that it didn't matter as long as they were having fun.

Second, communication and interest of the "other" have been enhanced. Almost all of them said they learned more about the "other" as a result of this project and that their communication with the "other" had increased too. For instance, Alon, Yuval, and Michael each said that their Arabic improved, and they were all encouraged to learn it better. The reverse was

¹¹⁷Ibid.

¹¹⁸Raseel Abd Alhai, Dana Bishara, Ismaeel Bishara, Mai Bishara, Yotam Dishon-Kolodny, Itamar Drori, Machael Halavi, Hala Qasim, Razi Ransour, Yuval Ras, Alon Sulujon, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, October 30, 2017, November 6 & 20, 2017.

¹¹⁹ Dys, Schellenberg, McLean, 247, 252. Symonds, 512.

also true. While the Arab members all learn Hebrew fluently, they don't start learning it until they are of school age. So, when the Arab members join the group when they are young, they are still in the process of learning Hebrew. I observed this firsthand when a new member joined the group during my research. This young Arab girl was still not fluent in Hebrew and was not able to understand everything Daphna was instructing them to do, so a couple of the Arab students had to translate for her.

Thirdly, and as a result, because of the communication between them improving, stereotypes have been defied or broken. Razi, Ismaeel, and Raseel all said that their point of view of the "other" has changed since joining the group. Raseel also mentioned that the things you hear in the media and from others about Jewish people are not true. She then made the comment that she feels extremely connected to the group and that she cannot leave them because they are a very big part of her life. This is a very big statement; not only were the stereotypes broken down, but she feels an attachment to the other group members; she has bonded whole-heartedly with the "other." I could believe that her statement was true because I started to feel the same way after only two months of knowing them; she has been a part of this group for seven years. Ismaeel mentioned that after he joined the group he realized that we are all humans and that we are all the same. He believed that coexistence is possible in that we all have some sort of commonality.

Lastly, a common theme among them was of having a certain level of openness to the "other" prior to joining the group. This could come from several influences early in life. On the way to one of the rehearsals one evening, Dailia, the mother of Alon, said that her son became involved in the project because of her two older children who were also previously involved.¹²⁰ I

¹²⁰Dailia Sulujon, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, October 30, 2017.

later discovered that several other current students also joined the project because of their older siblings. I asked Dailia why her children had joined and she said that it was for the interest of music more than it being any reason for shared coexistence. Yet, she thought that it was wonderful that it could be used in that way, that her children could be a part of it. She mentioned growing up in a part of New Jersey where she lived in a diverse neighborhood and it was no issue for her, so she viewed that it should not be an issue for her children. Her background could have influenced her children which could be the case for the other students as well. Like Dana and Ismaeel's mother who also encouraged and influenced them to become involved in it the project. Even though there were a few students who told me that the reason they joined the group was because their friends or siblings had, they still had a willing attitude or openness towards the "other" in joining this project.

Like with Razi, he said that it was his goal to meet people from other cultures and that he has succeeded in doing so by joining the Ukuleles for Peace. He was also pleased that he had made lasting friendships with them. I further inquired if any of them encountered any resistance or harassment because of their involvement with the project. They all said that most of their family and friends were very supportive and open to this idea. Yet, to those who were not, their own ideas and stereotypes also started to change because of the member's involvement. Ismaeel said that his friends in school laughed at him when he first joined the project and thought it would not last like the other school programs. After two years, when his friends started to see how the group was taken seriously by the international community. Demonstrated by their travel to Hawaii, and they too started to believe in the project and long-term coexistence.

Paul and Daphna's relationship is a symbolic representation of coexistence. They are from different cultures, Paul from England and Daphna from Israel. They speak both Hebrew

and English in their household, though more English than Hebrew. Paul is also symbolic of a bridge that the students have between each other. A large part of the success of this project would be the draw of Paul and his own uniqueness of self. With a warm and friendly personality, he creates this safe space that makes children interested in or curious about the ukulele. As mentioned earlier, Paul teaches the ukulele at the local schools in two suburbs of Tel Aviv. Paul establishing a rapport with the students, at the individual schools, before bringing them together, is a big factor in the success of the project. By doing this, he gains their trust in him first, and once this trust is established, he becomes this safe link to the “other” side. This trust building is also extended to his wife Daphna, who acts as a mother figure to them. I observed this many times over, especially with a new Arab girl who joined the group. The first day the Arab girl was in awe of the group, being very timid and sitting close to Daphna in a way that she seemed safe with her. However, I don’t know how many would join if it weren’t for Paul’s bridge building personality. Michael said that the reason he joined was because this “cool” guy was at his school teaching the ukulele. Michael admitted that it was more about Paul and who he was in the beginning that drew his interest. Paul, as the “outsider” acts as the mediator and symbolizes the bridge to the “other” side, which I believe is a key factor in the level of success in the Ukulele’s for Peace.

Arab-Jewish Orchestra

I was only able to meet up with the Arab-Jewish Orchestra towards the end of my stay because of timing issues and rehearsal cancelations. I attended two rehearsals, conducted one quick group interview with three of its member, and a 30-minute interview with the director Taiseer Elias. However, I was able to get to know one other member a little more extensively as I was taking weekly oud lessons from him for the two-month duration. During the two rehearsals,

the orchestra played a variety of traditional Jewish and Arab music. The construct of the orchestral seating arrangement was in the manner or likeness of a Western orchestra. Elias used traditional Western conducting methods, including classical music (Italian) dictation and terminology. He spoke mostly in Hebrew, with a little Arabic from time to time. When it came playing the music, all but one musician was reading off sheet music with the singers more or less doing the same. In this sense, this orchestra had the look and feel of the Western orchestral style but with an Eastern sound. The members of this orchestra were an equal mix of both Arabs and Jews. In my group interview, I was able to talk with Samar (riqq/ tambourine), Haima (singer), and Sireen (piano), and, in a separate interview, Shehady (oud).¹²¹ After the fact, I realized that I only interviewed all Arabs, yet, I really didn't have a choice because those in the group interview were chosen for me by Elias.

I found the four members quite accommodating and happy to be participating in the research. I inquired as to how and why they joined the orchestra, if they liked the music that they played, and if or why they thought that this orchestra was different from others. Haima and Shehady had heard about the orchestra from their enrollment with the university, though Shehady joined mainly because he believed the instrument that he plays, the oud, an indigenous Arab instrument, would not be suitable in other university music groups. As the director's daughter, Sireen has heard of the orchestra because of her father's involvement in it prior to Haifa University. They all have had some level of formal music training, with Sireen classically trained in Western music. Each of them mentioned that they like the music they play. Yet, from time to time they make suggestions to Elias who oversees the music selection. When discussing

¹²¹Sireen Elias, Samar Jacob, Shehady Nassar, Haima Sleman, Interview by author, Haifa, November 16 & 27, 2017.

Jewish music, Shehady stated: "...I don't think that 'their' music is not good. I think that opposite, it's very good." He went on to say that the Jewish people in the orchestra also think the same about Arab music and they are also very interested in Arab music.

I further inquired if Shehady was bothered by the title of the orchestra in reference to "Arab-Jewish" instead of the Haifa University Orchestra. He said he was not bothered by it. Nevertheless, before Shehady joined, he made sure that the music was not going to be overly political. One friend of his, who is very involved in political issues, asked him why he joined the orchestra, not to mention also going to Argentina under the title of "Arab-Jewish" or "Israeli." He told his friend that he did not care about these things and that it was ok for him. According to Shehady, the members of the orchestra don't really discuss politics. I commented that politics can't be completely avoided just because of the title of the orchestra; for it is also the reason that they get invited to perform, especially internationally. He agreed, and said that in other countries people also ask him the same question. Shehady believed, as an orchestra, they can show others that we can make peace from just playing music together.

I see music as a language that connects people from all kinds and races. Whenever we as a [group] compose or play a piece of music we do it as one, as a unit. Even though each member comes from a different background. Those differences [are] what makes our ensemble unique and in some way whole. We – members of the [ensemble] – do not think of each other in terms of race or religion. We see the artist in every player. In some way, [and] because of that, we are able to coexist and embrace our differences...that is something made easier with music. In today's reality, Palestinians and Israelis do not have many ways to connect [the] past [on] the mere idea of race, but in my opinion, music is one of the best ways to do so.¹²²

Of the four that I interviewed, they all said that they were open to the idea of playing together prior to the actual experience. Sireen stated that you must be open-minded and by being

¹²²Shehady Nassar, Facebook messenger to author, April 13, 2018.

so “you can bring the people together and make a new style...”¹²³ This is what she believed was currently happening in this orchestra and that, to her, was amazing. Sireen was also of the opinion that “if you take two people from two different cultures with two different languages they can’t understand each other so well, but if they have instruments they will.”¹²⁴ Samar agreed, and is also of the belief that any and all music connects people. If the music brought them together, I asked them how and why they thought it did.

Sireen believed that the Arab-Jewish orchestra was unlike other classical orchestras, where they just play written notation. “We are not playing music that is written, like in classical music, [and then they] have rehearsal and that’s it. No, we are building something new and that’s the connection.”¹²⁵ I got the implication that they also built their friendships outside of the orchestra, as Samar replied: “like now we go and eat together.”¹²⁶ This also included traveling together as they were able to become close very quickly as Shehady mentioned. I concluded that traveling together, especially internationally, unifies them more by their commonality in their shared identity as “Israelis” than necessarily the music.

In my talk with Elias, I grasped a fuller understanding of the orchestra and how his personal background and experience helped shaped the idea behind it. Elias was classically trained in Western music and self-educated in Eastern music. A part of his self-education in Eastern music was the oud, where he not only taught himself to play the instrument, but he developed his own technique in doing so. Playing the oud brought him recognition as a member

¹²³Sireen Elias, Interview by author, Haifa, November 27, 2017.

¹²⁴Ibid.

¹²⁵Ibid. As mentioned above, the Arab-Jewish Orchestra also plays from written music notation.

¹²⁶Samar Jacob, Interviewed by author, Haifa, November 27, 2017.

of Bustan Abraham, which became a very successful internationally recognized Israeli band in the 1990's. As mentioned earlier, as an example from Brinner's book, this band exemplified the everyday coexistence of the Arab and Jews in Israel, further creating and reflecting it in a musical fusion. Elias said that they did not come together under the idea of coexistence in the beginning, but it was about the music. It just so happened that there was a mix of Arabs and Jews which reflected the reality that he lives in in Israel.¹²⁷ This is also apparent and applies to the members of the Arab Jewish Orchestra.

The very fact that Arabs and Jews work together and can come together and create this nice music together is really great. It means that coexistence is not only possible but it can be a very nice experience because when you want to create music together you cannot hate each other you have to have mutual respect. We are like brothers. That is why I say that music can tear down wall of hatred and misunderstanding because I am not able to sit down with you and create with you if I have presumptions or I hate you, or I don't like you, it cannot work. It's not just sit and play something and read the notes.¹²⁸

Elias' involvement with the orchestra stems from the Jerusalem Music Academy, before it relocated to Haifa University. With the relocation came a few changes, like the music selection, the number of musicians, and with that, now the inclusion of singers. Elias chooses the music based on what, he says, he has to work with or the current instrumentation of the orchestra. A part of that deciding factor is that he also because he is the one making the orchestral arrangements. According to Elias, some of the members of the orchestra have expressed that they only want to play Arab music, and others would like to play Western classical music. He said that there must be a compromise and the members must be open-minded, and they must find a commonality in the music. In that regard, he chooses traditional

¹²⁷Taiseer Elias, Interviewed by author, Haifa, November 28, 2017.

¹²⁸Ibid.

Arab and Jewish music which reflects who they are. Considering the title of the orchestra:

“Arab-Jewish,” I asked him if he considers himself an activist.

I don't know. I don't feel that [way] and I don't mean to do that what I am trying to do and I believe that I am doing is artistic musical activity and it is important for me in different areas and levels musically, artistically, humanly and socially. I don't mean to be [an] activist and in the end what is the most important thing for me is the musical result. I want the orchestra to play the best it can do even though they are students...I want the best results, musically.¹²⁹

Let's Talk Music

My time with the *Let's Talk Music* project was limited by scheduling issues while in Israel. I was only able to meet with Gilboa at Bar-Ilan University for one interview, in addition to a second Skype interview thereafter. Nevertheless, I was able to get a good understanding of the intended objectives and outcomes of the project. In my discussions with Gilboa, I explored how he used musical identity in an applied approach to create dialogue and enhance communication at the junction of others and their musical identities. I also sought the reasons behind this applied approach in addition to any tangible results or outcomes.

One aspect of the *Let's Talk Music* course is that it does not require musicianship, even though this course is offered by the music department and includes playing instruments. Gilboa said that about twenty-five percent of the class has had formal music training.¹³⁰ Taking into consideration the studies on musical identity and those having formal training in music generally tend to be open to various music genres (an expanded musical identity), I asked Gilboa if he thought that this would have an advantage to those that this would apply to. He said he was not too sure that they would have this advantage because it can go in different directions. Gilboa went on to say that he didn't know if the advantage would be, politically, ideologically, or

¹²⁹Ibid.

¹³⁰Avi Gilboa, Skype Interview by author, February 26, 2018

musically; and that it didn't necessarily overlap.¹³¹ He believed that the students who have had a music background are "closed" to a very specific culture, especially Western music culture because it's so well defined.¹³² He concluded that those who flourish musically in this course aren't necessarily musicians or non-musicians and it was more dependent upon the person and other factors.¹³³ During the introduction of this group exercise, Gilboa said that he will lead the class in dictating the rhythm. Yet, as things progress, and dependent upon the class, the group could become less reliant on him to lead musically.¹³⁴ This gives times for those to learn to listen and rely on each other.¹³⁵ There also have been times when sensitive social matters have come to a heated debate and the use of playing instruments or making music together has been able to turn it into a positive interaction. This is where musicking brings positive meaning or act between the two and relieves the tension.¹³⁶

¹³¹Ibid.

¹³²He also included Arab high-art music because it also strives for professionalism like Western high-art. This made it difficult for those who thought this musicianship was reserved for the professionals. This also included those who could not participate in the music engagement with the rest of the class unless they had sheet music. Ibid.

¹³³I must note here that while this may be true a student in his class stated that: "When I was preparing my musical presentation I tried to think about the values that I regard as basic to my identity, and I 'constructed' my presentation based upon these values...the songs that I chose for my presentation reflected my (religious and national) ideals and values but these choices were not necessarily connected to what I listen to on a daily basis...This disparity between who I am on a daily basis and what I believe in could be a result of my rapid and recent development in music studies, which may have alienated me from the music that I grew up on." Gilboa, 13. By this statement we see that the student is fully aware that her exposure to music through her studies does affect her musical identity or the ability to be more open and receptive.

¹³⁴ From our conversation, I gather that most of the instruments are percussion. As a side note, he thought that there was an interesting phenomenon in that people like to adopt a certain instrument as theirs and don't necessarily want to share the instrument. Avi Gilboa, Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

¹³⁵Gilboa, 8.

¹³⁶EMarcom Group, "Let's Talk Music," YouTube Video, 7:32, November 27, 2013
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6UOG8qXIQ5U>

Gilboa has found within every group there are those who are at different levels or phases within this process of understanding and connecting with the “other.” At the end of the course, some have left confused and angry, yet

...they did a very important process because that anger is combined with appreciation to the “other.” Sometimes complexity is regression. This course is very complex and people come out more confused sometimes than they were in the beginning. They have some very clear ideas in how things are and how they are supposed to be and the ideologies seem to be in order but suddenly things get mixed up and then one has to shuffle and find your ideology again.¹³⁷

However, some have already gone through that process before taking the course and are looking for ways to reconcile. He is very empathetic towards those who are confused about it and very happy when people find new answers and new ideas.¹³⁸ He also believes empathy is a strong component of his class and that listening to one another’s music can lead to empathy.

Furthermore, the act of listening is one of the main ideas behind the *Let’s Talk Music* model which further encourages safe spaces for positive interaction with the “other.” Gilboa highly stressed the act of listening in Israel should not be taken for granted because people in Israel usually will interrupt you in anything.¹³⁹

So, just sitting and listening to your music would be an empathetic gesture. But then also listening to it and asking you about it and telling you what I thought about it really works on that muscle.¹⁴⁰

It also becomes more than just listening but an interaction of dialogue of how someone else hears your music and interprets that music. This is something that Gilboa believes can be very

¹³⁷Avi Gilboa, Interviewed by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

¹³⁸Ibid.

¹³⁹Ibid.

¹⁴⁰Ibid.

personal.¹⁴¹ So, the act of listening is a very important element in the success of the *Let's Talk Music* model. In both of my discussions with Gilboa I asked if there was a way that he could measure the success of the project. He said that there are those who show outward progression. This is apparent because they tend to stay in contact with one another after the course is over. Yet, inward is very hard to measure.

Other more implicit ways would be change in the perspective and that is difficult to see and to quantify. But many people tell in reflection and say I did not change my ideas or political views but I did change my perspective on it.¹⁴²

He went on to say that progress is also shown in those who have come back to take the class again, on their own time, with no credit. He believes that this also demonstrates a certain level of success. In addition, I was pleasantly surprised to find out that Gilboa, at one point, attempted to measure the success through quantitative means.¹⁴³ He had described an implicit attempt to measure if stereotyping had decreased after an individual had gone through the *Let's Talk Music* course. He used a scientific method that flashed male or female names with a profession on a screen followed by a push of a button. This tried to measure certain stereotypes that people associated with them. In the end, though, there were not conclusive results. Gilboa speculated that it was because it came at beginning stages of the *Let's Talk Music* model and they perhaps didn't know the right questions to ask. As of now, there are not any allotted resources that will allow them to reattempt this method.

Answering the Research Questions

¹⁴¹Ibid.

¹⁴²Avi Gilboa, Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

¹⁴³Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017. Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

The aim and goal of the research is to answer the research questions which could prove, confirm or deny previous studies. The main research question is if the deconstruction of the nationalist identity mind-set, that once separated the Jew and Arab, could be reconstructed to unite them on the premises of new ideals. These new ideals or identity might include the acknowledgement of overlapping or shared traditions that points the way to acceptance and tolerance of the “other.” Furthermore, I looked to answer other questions that would reveal and explore if the reconstruction or even an expanded identity that included the “other” would even be a possibility.

First, in understanding how music can be used as a mediator or mobilizer, I sought to understand how music functions in this way and how people intersect at this junction and why they choose to do so. Returning to King and her idea of creating safe spaces where people find commonality, I found that there must be something more. So, before sharing this commonality with the “other,” there first must be a sense of openness. Pre-existing willingness or desire to meet in that safe place. The *Let’s Talk Music* video shows those who are open to the idea to have “other” friends, but there isn’t always a safe or created space to do so.¹⁴⁴ So, creating programs that provide spaces, such as classrooms settings, gives opportunity or an outlet for this longing to connect. Commonality is a factor but it can’t be the only factor as people can still fight over commonality, which means an openness needs to proceed it. This leads to the question of why and how peacemaking and peacebuilding can develop through music.

It is possible that peacemaking and peacebuilding through music can transpire in a space where dialogue, listening, understanding, and empathy happen. Positive interaction and

¹⁴⁴EMarcom Group, “Let’s Talk Music,” YouTube Video, 7:32, November 27, 2013
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6UOG8qXIQ5U>

relationship building can take place within the context of making music. These elements happen when there is an openness to new thoughts and ideas. When one humanizes the “other,” then they can see the “other” like themselves. Stopping the de-humanizing of the “other” can bring them up to the same level, eye to eye, while meeting them in a space where it is safe to interact, and this can happen through the interaction of music.

I also looked to answer the question of who was behind or initiated these kinds of endeavors and if it included any outsiders and why. Those that were behind the peacemaking initiatives were mostly insiders (with one exception) who are working at grassroots or the academic level. Yet, every one of them had various intended outcomes that they were looking to achieve outside of the initial coexistence or peacemaking process. As the participants and projects revealed, some came together to achieve the best music quality possible, with others seeking to understand the “other” by creating dialogue through music experience. This helped further answer my question if music was used as a tool to instigate dialogue. In the end, they all seek to build a bridge to the “other,” yet, all have their own way of achieving it.

The next question addressed how the informant or participant connected their personal relationship or sense of connection to the “other” through playing music or music interaction. As I talked to some of the members of the Arab-Jewish orchestra, they believed their sense of comradery was closer than those playing in other orchestras that play Western classical music.¹⁴⁵ They thought that by playing Arab and Jewish music, which brought them together culturally, unified them. In the Ukuleles for Peace, the members initially connect with the “other” through the instrument itself. This brought commonality between them even if the music did not at first.

¹⁴⁵Yet, I wondered if this was so, considering the West-Eastern Divan Orchestra whose members are Arab and Jewish, come together based on Western classical music.

Playing the same instrument brings them together to where they can meet on the same level and learn the instrument together. As well, the way that they learn to play the songs can also bring various communication and learning methods to the forefront where they are encouraged to interact with each other. The students were expected to become familiar with, if not learn, the songs on their own outside of rehearsal time; but taking the time to learn the songs together also helped them come together in a safe space where they could interact together one-on-one. Through this space, while they learned to play a new instrument, they not only found commonality, but something that connects them in a new shared experience. The *Let's Talk Music* model connects those in one or two ways. First, if there is a shared musical identity then it can connect them with the "other," and if not, the experience of making new music together allows them to have a joint shared interaction. Knowing how they intersect or connect through music can be just as important as what type of music is played or preferred between the two and how is it chosen and why. I will address this in the following section.

Considering that there has been a certain level of success in Israel using music as a tool in peacemaking and peacebuilding, finding out if the approaches can be applied cross-culturally or if they are culturally-specific was something that I was interested in finding out. Methods and concepts used for peacemaking and peacebuilding through music don't seem to be culturally-specific in Israel, or at least not in the scope of a broader global culture. Meaning, I am not able to speak about more remote groups, like in Africa or the Amazon, that are isolated and where perhaps these approaches would not apply at all. Each project or program in my research is cross-culturally applicable in a broader sense. This will be explained in more detail later. I believe that all involved in such projects, myself included, really must ask ourselves how we really know if this endeavor has a lasting and measurable effectiveness to be worthwhile. I was

pleasantly surprised when Gilboa told me that he has attempted to measure this through quantitative means, though unfortunately has not had any conclusive results. Even though there isn't anything tangible, at least not in a scientific way, and not yet, does not mean that we don't continue to have hope until we do. So, returning to the larger question; if identity has separated the Jew and the Arab, then can it unite them through a new construct. Redefining the nationalistic lines that separates them in a newly found social context can help them rediscover their identities that were once shared in the past but now created on the premises of something new, something fresh. In dissecting the projects and the answers to the questions, a set of common themes emerged that led me to draw certain conclusions.

Common Themes

Openness

Based on an energizing motivation derived from music, people bring with them a certain degree of initial openness towards the "other." Thus, musical events open one another to paths that lead to breaking stereotypes and growing together in neighborly ways as they facilitate moving people from positions of enmity and exclusion toward more intimate interaction.¹⁴⁶

Every one of these project's participants had a sense of openness to the "other" prior to their involvement with it. In my discussions with the participants there was already a pre-existing mind-set towards coexistence. The project itself acted as a platform or place that the participant could explore this idea while making a way to build the bridge to the "other." When there is an openness, then that is when commonality could be explored, and not necessarily the other way around. In prepping for my fieldwork and research, I consulted a long-time mentor and conflict resolution professor at Portland State University, Harry Anastasiou. During our discussion, he

¹⁴⁶Roberta R. King and Sooi Ling Tan, *Ibid.*, 272.

had mentioned how commonality in cultural traditions can be fought over, including music.¹⁴⁷ I concluded that commonality didn't necessarily bring people together. I had mentioned this to Gilboa, as he said that Arabs and Jews fight over traditions, like food, but he had never had a situation where it applied to music; though he thought that it was possible that they could do so.¹⁴⁸ Having an open mind towards the "other" is initially the first step towards knowing and understanding them.

Safe Spaces/Community Building

Although the act of listening is usually taken for granted, it is an essential ability when attempting to communicate with one another. Emphasizing and developing this shared ability of people, no matter what types of music they prefer, can be of great help in intercultural groups.¹⁴⁹

Creating safe spaces where people listened, interacted respectfully, and built friendship were all a part of the success of each project. As a result, there were certain levels of community building with each one. Ukuleles for Peace and the Arab-Jewish Orchestra have both traveled internationally. Members from both projects mentioned that it became a great bonding activity and because of this, they believed their friendships were closer than the other music groups they were involved in. Their international travel could also be viewed as a way to directly or indirectly involve the international community. The *Let's Talk Music* course specifically addresses people's fears by asking them to write them down and discuss them openly. This is to ensure that the classroom becomes a safe space which further emphasizes the act of listening.¹⁵⁰

¹⁴⁷Harry Anastasiou, a Greek-Cypriot, has experienced interethnic conflict firsthand in his own country. He had mentioned to me about a time when he played Turkish music for his Greek friend (unbeknownst to him), which led to a very interesting conversation between him and his friend. Interview by author, Portland, February 21, 2018.

¹⁴⁸Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

¹⁴⁹Gilboa, 7.

The act of listening and relating can create empathy which can build a bridge to the “other.”

This project also involves the community as a part of their process when they go out into society and explore coexistence around them.

The Ukuleles for Peace had the best concept for including the immediate people or community around them as they did not just make it about the members. Instead of the rehearsals taking place in a rehearsal room at a neutral meeting place, the rehearsals were at a different member’s house every week. This engages the families with one another making it more than just about the members. The families are also required to be involved in other outside events (besides the Ukulele’s music concert) where they get to know each other. The required carpooling shared among the parents every week has them reliant and in contact with each other on a regular basis. These activities seek to build trust, reliance, and friendships outside of its immediate members.

Another common relationship building activity mentioned was the act of going out to eat together. I noticed or heard this mentioned in every project. In the context of this culture, it can say more than just two people spending time together and building a friendship. When conservative Jews and Muslims have strict dietary restrictions, it becomes a compromise as to where and what they are going to eat.¹⁵¹ This can become a very bold statement. To make this kind of gesture states how important the relationship is to that individual, in that one is willing to

¹⁵⁰“...we give out two pieces of paper. On the pink paper they write something of expectation for the course and then on the green paper something they fear or is anxious about in this course. Then each person has a chance to write this down and then we have a chance to hear those things. This enables us to [get a] feel [for] the group and what their expectations are and where they are fearful and where they are at and explain to them...But then if he has something that he is fearful of then we see if it is reasonable. It could be. [Then] we will do everything we can to keep [them] safe. By this, we get a feel for the group and set the boundaries in what the group will be doing and what the group will not be doing.” Avi Gilboa, Skype interview by author, February 26, 2018.

¹⁵¹Ibid.

compromise their beliefs for it. As Gilboa stated: “It actually means something. It means finding common ground and finding ways to compromise. Like math, finding the right equation.”¹⁵²

Music Selection

The music that was chosen was not necessarily a defining factor on the success of each project though they each had their thoughts and opinions on the subject. The members of Ukuleles for Peace (in general) found the process of choosing the music together, as a group activity, much more rewarding than the actual music selection itself. To them, it was about coming into an agreement together. In the beginning, Paul said that he chose the music but now he leaves it up to the members. The songs that they choose range from various Western classic rock and pop, to culturally local relevant songs which include both classic and pop Israeli Arab and Jewish songs. Sometimes songs are also chosen dependent upon what their audience demographics are.

For in the Arab-Jewish Orchestra, embedded cultural meaning within the aesthetics of the Arab and Jewish music reflect the members themselves and their desire for their music to be heard. This also bonded them together culturally as they sought to achieve the best music quality. The Arab-Jewish Orchestra music is mainly selected by Elias, though occasionally, the music selection is chosen or suggestion by a member. Elias said that he chooses the music based on what instrumentation and the limited resources that he has to work with. He cannot select music from Mozart, Beethoven, or even Umm Kulthum because he does not have the orchestra to do so.¹⁵³ Regardless, he tends to lean towards traditional Arab and Jewish music.

¹⁵²Ibid.

¹⁵³Taiseer Elias, Interview by author, Haifa, November 28, 2017.

For *Let's Talk Music*, there is a different approach. The music selection comes in two different forms. The first form is one's own personal music (identity) choice (or the lack thereof), and the second is a newly composed improvised piece which the group spontaneously creates together in a music session. After the learning process which included acceptance, acknowledgement, and/or tolerance of the "other," musicking together brought meaning between them regardless of their musical (identity) preferences.¹⁵⁴ In general, though I initially speculated and found those that thought music was a universal language, they all were happy to be musicking together; that is what they thought unified them. If the idea among them was that they are making something new, and this connected them, then I would conclude that it is not necessarily specific to the music itself. As Elias stated:

When we make collaborations between different musics and musicians, we have to know what to choose, and how to do what is possible and what is not... We should make compromises, listen, and respect each other.¹⁵⁵

As I thought about why or how music was chosen, I noticed that their choices were also based on and reflected a changing or expanding identity, meaning a part of their identity started to include the "other." "...The more that people expand their musical identities...the more they will be tolerant towards the other."¹⁵⁶

Identity Transformation

There were certain levels of noticeable musical and social identities that were common to every project. With the participants in Ukuleles for Peace, there were several who stated that

¹⁵⁴As mentioned earlier by Small, musicking is where the meaning of the act lies, where the relationships are established. Though too, as he mentioned, meaning can also be found within the music itself.

¹⁵⁵Taiseer Elias, email message to author, February 21, 2018.

¹⁵⁶Gilboa, 7-8.

because of their involvement with the project, they now liked other music genres. Though many of them mentioned that they liked culturally traditional music, most of their collaborative music choices were pop songs. This might be an example of Folkestad's post-nationalist identity.¹⁵⁷ In the post-national global musical arena, there are multiple cultural identities which leaves greater room for finding commonality with the "other." This addresses my original question: whether identity experienced through music could be reconfigured to define something new. If music can be used as a mobilizer through a collective emotional experience, then it could be done so through a positive interaction with the "other." Breaking down old nationalist identities and ideals to reconstruct new ones that include the "other" is what is taking place within these projects. One important step in this process is empathy, which is needed in deconstructing the nationalist ethnocentric mind-set that further exposes the dehumanizing aspect of it. As Brinner states, this new identity would no longer be based on birthright (nationalist ideal) but rather out of shared lived experience.¹⁵⁸

This identity construct would be optimal in that it includes the "other" in the process. This is unlike the new hybrid identities which emerged out of political, social, and economical forces that Rice and Stokes refer to, which don't necessarily include the "other." So, if identities are already unstable in the context of the greater global world as Rice, Stokes, and even Brinner have implied, then why can't it be constructed out of something else, something more concrete?¹⁵⁹ Brinner's idea of a shared experience is closer to a new identity which would not only include acceptance and acknowledgement of the "other," but would actively engage in

¹⁵⁷Folkestad.

¹⁵⁸Brinner, 34.

¹⁵⁹Rice, 18,25. Stokes, 17,25. Brinner, 292-293.

friendships. This new identity needs to include a relationship with the “other” and not one that still includes segregation and isolationism. As Thomas Turino states: “. . .the dynamics of identity formation is whether we are interested in differentiating ourselves from or uniting ourselves with those that we are interacting with.”¹⁶⁰ I believe that the post-national global musical identity helps bridge the gap through global pop culture, like in the Ukuleles for Peace.

In the wake of this globalized identity, the pluralism that Roam mentioned can only be maintained dependent upon what those characteristics are.¹⁶¹ If that identity does not celebrate diversity, as pluralism calls for, then it will not work. Folkestad’s exploration of post-nationalist identity seems the most applicable in this case where music and identity would transcend cultures, further making it possible to build a bridge to the “other” side.

Most cultural utterances, such as music, typically originate from popular forms developed either long before today’s national boundaries were drawn, or among groups of people sharing the same musical preferences. . . . This means that cultural identity has a direct bearing on the music itself, and the musical context in which it exists. This also means that an individual can have more than one cultural identity, and it might be that the global multicultural person of today is characterized by having the possibility of and ability to choose and change between several cultural identities.¹⁶²

There are also social constructionist theories that believe that we are constantly developing or expanding our identities through interactions with others; therefore, we don’t have a core identity but many identities.¹⁶³ For instance, a famous musician would have one identity professionally, and another identity in their private life.

¹⁶⁰Thomas Turino, *Music, as Social Life: The Politics of Participation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008), 104.

¹⁶¹Roam, 9.

¹⁶²Folkestad, 123.

¹⁶³David J. Hargreaves, Dorothy Miell, and Raymond MacDonald, “What are Musical Identities, and Why are They Important?” MacDonald, Hargreaves, and Miell, *Ibid.*, 10.

In social constructionist terms, identities are also always evolving and shifting—each interaction can lead to new constructions...music is a fundamental channel of communication, and we argue that it can act as a medium through which people can construct new identities and shift existing ones in the same way as spoken language. The continual construction and reconstruction of the self through autobiographical narratives can occur in music as well as in language...¹⁶⁴

Whether it's a musical identity over-lapping with a new global cultural identity, or an ever evolving one as the social constructionist state, there must be one that includes the "other" as a part of the process.

The project that best demonstrates a transformative identity and the ability to do so is *Let's Talk Music*. This project directly addresses the situation, and therefore has the ability to be an exemplary model. Gilboa uses the musical identity to reach or explore the national identity that attempts to expand or reconstruct it through a transformative and therapeutic guided process. In *Let's Talk Music*, musical identities were also explored introspectively to understand oneself better before attempting to create something new with the "other." The approach directly initiates dialogue about sensitive political, social, and cultural issues that is overseen by a psychologist or music therapist. I found the *Let's Talk Music* project had the best potential to bring reconciliation and healing among its participants.

Cross-Cultural Templates

A mentioned earlier, all three of these different approaches could function cross-culturally in the context of a greater global culture. The Ukuleles for Peace idea, in using an instrument such as the ukulele, could be applicable cross-culturally. The ukulele does not have to be the instrument of choice, but introducing any simple type instrument, as well as a basic music selection could be easy and fun for children to learn. The Arab-Jewish Orchestra approach of

¹⁶⁴Ibid., 10.

using music that reflects the local musical traditions of each ethnic group, could be applicable in most interethnic societies. This is a great way to get to know and enjoy each other's music. The *Let's Talk Music* design is most relevant cross-culturally, considering Gilboa has also applied a multi-cultural version of it, it is still applicable in a bi-culturally elsewhere as well. Exploring musical identities within the context of any culture would be beneficial. More than being concerned if these approaches could be applied cross-culturally, I sought to find out if there were some defining elements that made them successful.

Successful Outcomes

In measuring the success of the projects, I looked for tangible characteristics that would convince me that these approaches could be applied in other circumstances. As stated by Holton earlier, music jointly performed by interethnic (conflicted) groups publicly gives the audience the understanding that there is trust and reconciliation among the members and therefore the audience can participate in these realities.¹⁶⁵ This is what Shehady, of the Arab-Jewish Orchestra, also believes; that they can show others just from their performance that they can make peace rather than having open dialogue about it.¹⁶⁶ Ukuleles for Peace and the Arab-Jewish Orchestra in their collaborations efforts are a testimony in their public performances, to the audience members, of how coexistence can work.

Measuring the success in the *Let's Talk Music* project, even though it could not be measured quantitatively, could be measured in other ways. Some outwardly signs included its participants staying in touch on social media, with some of them returning for another course. I also discovered that the success of these projects did not revolve around anyone's musical

¹⁶⁵Holton, 170.

¹⁶⁶Shehady Nassar, Interview by author, Haifa, November 16, 2017.

ability. In *Ukuleles for Peace* and *Let's Talk Music*, some did not have any prior music experience at all, and in *Let's Talk Music* project those that did have musical training did not guarantee them success in the course. In *Ukuleles for Peace*, a part of their outwardly success was apparent when members' siblings and friends wanted to join. In addition, the stereotypes not only changed among the members but those around them that witnessed over time the success they had as a group. The common factor that they all share is longevity. No school system would continue to support them if they weren't succeeding on some level. This also indicates a desire within the community to create and support outlets for such efforts.

Chapter V: Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations

Summary

Music used as a bridge-building tool between the Arabs and Jews in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict has achieved a certain level of success through various approaches and methods. It has brought communities together through the enjoyment of music and opened doors of communication. Creating safe spaces where people can explore their curiosity of the “other” and have positive interactions, also leaves opportunity for barriers to come down. The act of musicking, within these safe spaces, has created meaningful connections with the “other,” further creating the empathy needed to relate. This empathy seeks to humanize the “other,” further challenging the nationalist mind-set. In this case, it has defied and broken stereotypes, leaving some to reconsider what they had believed. It further challenged the current identity causing it to be reconfigured and reconstructed out of a new experience. This new experience of positive interaction led to acknowledgement and acceptance.

In most circumstances, the selection of music did not necessarily matter, even if it didn't culturally speak in the same way to everyone. What mattered was that they were enjoying the music together in the process. Sharing music as a universal phenomenon was more of the intent and goal of the participants. Taking this viewpoint, the methods and approaches used in every project can be applied cross-culturally in the context of the greater global cultural. It is in that greater global cultural that a post-nationalist musical identity can be found. This post-nationalist musical identity is where the commonality lies, and in that commonality a bridge.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the three projects that I researched all had their effective strong points in how they use music to build a bridge to the “other.” The Ukuleles for Peace was great at starting

at the elementary level when children are more open to new ideas, giving them something to build on. The project has a strong sense of community building beyond the four walls of a typical rehearsal space. Paul can be seen as a mediator or a metaphoric bridge that builds trust to the “other” side. The Arab-Jewish Orchestra is an excellent place where those who want to excel at music while connecting culturally with the “other” can do so through “high-art.” The *Let’s Talk Music* approach has the best atmosphere for addressing social and political issues; and more than that, it is a place where forgiveness, healing, and reconciliation have the possibility of taking place.

Through each project, I aimed to learn more about how music intersects at the junction of peacemaking and peacebuilding. I sought to understand the powerful effects and elements that music embodies and the capabilities it has to unite people. It was during this process that I also learned about myself. Even though there were times that I tried to be a neutral, outside bystander as the sole research instrument, I found it not to be completely possible. Being human, with thoughts and feelings which included carrying the viewpoint of my own culture, I also tried to wear a filtered lens that would take away those things. I soon realized it is because of those things, that might also add to my research. Furthermore, my personal interactions with others that could bring about a more thorough study.

There were a couple of defining moments during my research that I felt personally involved or an active participant. In my observations with the Arab-Jewish Orchestra, there were a few songs, like Fatafik AlSukar, that I knew from my time playing with the Arab ensemble in Cairo. It was in those moments that I felt like I should be joining in, that I was also a part of them. This is where the “outsider” and “insider” became blurred. Then, during a rehearsal for Ukuleles for Peace, there was a song that negatively affected me to the point where I could no

longer make research observations until they moved on to another song. Thanks to my prior knowledge of Gilboa's musical identity concept, I was aware of what was going on inside of me at that moment. I was challenged by my own musical identity and the ability to conduct research. It was a great learning experience in not only how my own musical identity affects me, but how it affects me as a qualitative researcher and being able to accurately collect data. In my first meeting with Gilboa, I mentioned this situation to him. He inquired what it was that I didn't like about the music. I told him that I felt like that particular type of music resembled people wasting time with no purpose. He said that I must always ask myself why I feel this way and what is wrong about wasting time sometimes. He went on to say that this should give us a lot of information about ourselves.

If you hate something, then it is a part of you. When someone does not like a music, then it tells more about them than the music that they do like; if you explore into it.¹⁶⁷

As I became introspective during this process, I thought about my approach to the critical paradigm. This includes how the applied ethnographer is considered to be an activist. I had to question my own involvement in this research. Was I more than just an innocent bystander; was I also an active participant promoting and supporting social change through the act of research itself. Additionally, the critical paradigm includes both the researcher and participants working together to bring about change.¹⁶⁸ With that in mind, I asked the director of each project if they thought that of themselves as an activist or if they considered what they did activism. Paul of

¹⁶⁷ He also talked about his own personal negative emotions associated with a particular music, and then asked himself the same questions. I concluded that the music we were both effective by, in this way, represented the same type of societal class within each of our own culture. Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

¹⁶⁸As stated earlier, "To bring about congruence, all participants, and researchers, should be involved in the research process because the research is intended to be empowering...and how they can act to change both their own situation and that of others." LeCompte and Schensul, 65.

Ukuleles for Peace said: “Funny, I would not call myself one. I guess I am actively doing something to change the situation between Jews and Arabs, so I am...[a] grassroots activist.”¹⁶⁹

Yet, his wife, Daphna mentioned: “I do consider our work at Ukuleles for Peace activism. We are taking active steps to change a social situation.”¹⁷⁰ Their viewpoints of their involvement in the project were slightly different. As stated above, Elias, of the Arab-Jewish Orchestra, mentioned that he would not call himself an activist as his view on what he was trying to achieve was something of high music quality.¹⁷¹ In this case, activism may be an indirect result of what he aims to achieve. Gilboa, of *Let’s Talk Music*, stated that he would consider himself:

...a soft activist, like soft power...activist says to me it is something very direct and forceful and I don’t think that is what I am doing. It’s softer because that would be ironic to use force to talk about [resolving] conflict. I am trying to use soft power, so to speak, and introduce ideas. Activism, I think, in the name of passion, you are actually forgetting that you will not be able to change the world. Activist sometimes have this illusion. I think that we will be able to change the world just a bit, maybe, hopefully, which means we are more vulnerable than activist, because I get despaired much more than an activist.¹⁷²

In the past, my perception of an activist is one that seems abrasive, irrational, and unrealistic, which has always left me with a negative view towards those that considered themselves as such. It is not to say that whatever their cause was, was not worthwhile or that they were not correct, but it seems like their way about it was not appealing. Whatever the case, if we are to promote or initiate social change, then we must do it in a way that is not so harsh. So, in the same way, I have had to ask myself the same question. Am I promoting social and political change through my research? Yes, I guess that I am. So, that would mark me as an activist. I just hope that my

¹⁶⁹Paul Moore, Facebook messenger to author, March 16, 2018.

¹⁷⁰Daphna Orion, WhatsApp text to author, March 15, 2018.

¹⁷¹Taiseer Elias, Interview by author, Haifa, November 28, 2017.

¹⁷²Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

activism is not in a way that would be abrasive, irrational, unrealistic, or unappealing, but rather it would be evenhanded, empathic, and humble.

So, what does this all mean and why does it matter? Why should we care about how music functions in this way? We should care because it may be the only avenue between some people to relate to one another. If we were to disregard it, we might not be able to reach those in some other form. If this is the case, music must be taken seriously as a method and a mediator used in conflict resolution. Music used as a launching point to connect and understand the “other” is an impactful concept in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. Using creative and artistic measures when dealing with serious issues helps relieve tension among two opposing forces. Therefore, music must not be disregarded as a serious method in bridging the gap.

As such, music and the arts provide significant platforms for interfaith encounter and engagement that contribute to overcoming fear of the “other,” dispelling demonization, and breaking stereotypes. Further, the integrating relational dynamics inherent within music foster recognizing one another’s common humanity, acknowledging differences and coming to live within such parameters. Most importantly, music-as-a-relationship-building promotes a respect for each person and each community, and promotes the ascription of dignity and autonomy on each other.¹⁷³

Recommendations

In the conclusion of chapter two, I mentioned that music alone cannot be the sole answer to a people’s larger problems; what that next step is could make or break the peacemaking initiative. In the context of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, I find it hard to recommend what that next step might be or what that might even look like. In my understanding of terms and concepts related to this study, like empathy, I wondered if this was all that was needed to bring the two conflicting groups together. I started to explore other ideas and approaches that dealt with reconciliation and forgiveness. I found that there are so many opinions in how those two

¹⁷³King and Tan, “Employing Musical Pathways of Peace and Reconciliation” *Ibid.*, 296.

concepts should be approached in relation to public policy. Regardless, I feel that without these two concepts, that this conflict is on a vicious cycle that never seems to move past a certain point. With that in mind, I sought opportunities during my fieldwork that might reveal these elements.

Considering the *Let's Talk Music* approach that specifically creates dialogue for raising social and political issues, I asked Gilboa about terms like empathy, reconciliation, and forgiveness. I further mentioned how once empathy has been achieved then it still did not necessarily mean that there was reconciliation.

...as if empathy isn't enough, and to make it even worse, there are forces taking you back. It is enough for something to happen in some village where someone gets shot or whatever and everything goes back. You are always working against these forces. So, a moment of empathy can be precious but it can vanish in a second... both nations are traumatized. So, traumatized people, traumatized nations, they go back to square one very easily.¹⁷⁴

If people can easily go back to square one, regardless of their empathetic nature towards the “other,” then empathy cannot be the end towards establishing and maintaining a relationship with the “other.” Maybe this is where forgiveness comes in, maybe it should be first in the process. Whatever needs to happen for them not to go back to square one, it would be a conscience choice. It is not to say that one will be able to erase the past wrongdoings, but making the choice to continue to move forward. “Forgiveness is not merely a juridical absolution from guilt; it is the medium to lead us to communion and reconciliation.”¹⁷⁵ Forgiveness can be a process, not only in itself, but that it could lead to healing and reconciliation which are elements that need to

¹⁷⁴Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

¹⁷⁵Rodney L. Peterson, “A Theology of Forgiveness: Terminology, Rhetoric, and the Dialectic of Interfaith Relationships,” in *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*, ed. Helmick, Raymond G., S.J., and Rodney L. Petersen (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001), 19.

transpire before making a way for a new shared future. Some say that justice is necessary as well, but complete justice can never be given and if it could, forgiveness would not be needed.¹⁷⁶

Forgiveness is the culmination of healing...it creates solid ground for developing a new identity...the past cannot be restored, but the transformed person is no longer the person who needs the past.¹⁷⁷

If forgiveness is the step needed to start something new, to catapult them out of the vicious cycle, then healing and reconciliation should also be a part of the process.

Healing, reconciliation, and forgiveness are deeply interrelated. Healing and reconciliation help break cycles of violence and enhance the capacity of traumatized people for psychological well-being. Forgiving is essential for reconciliation to take place and both arise from and contribute to healing...it is important for healing to take place at a group level, in the community of others.¹⁷⁸

I foresee that the best atmosphere for this type of healing to transpire would be in the *Let's Talk Music* approach. It is where, as Gilboa mentions, addressing pain of the “other” can be a part of the process, and more importantly ask “how did I give you pain...did I do that in any way and why...and then maybe I can say I am sorry.”¹⁷⁹ The acknowledgement of wrongdoings

¹⁷⁶Miroslav Volf, “Forgiveness, Reconciliation, and Justice: A Christian Contribution to a More Peaceful Social Environment,” *Ibid.*, 46.

¹⁷⁷Olga Botcharova, “Implementation of Track Two Diplomacy: Developing a Model of Forgiveness,” *Ibid.*, 300. This statement was also backed up by Herbert C. Kelman who thought that reconciliation in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict is only possible through change of identity. “But it goes beyond conflict resolution in representing a change in each party’s identity. The primary feature of the identity change constituting reconciliation is the removal of the negation of the other as a central component of one’s own identity. My main empirical reference point here is the Israeli-Palestinian case, in which mutual denial of the other’s identity has been a central feature of the conflict over the decades...yet in each case the negation of the other is somehow embedded in the identity of each of the conflicting parties and must be addressed in the reconciliation process. Changing one’s collective identity by removing the negation of the other from it implies a degree of acceptance of the other’s identity—at least in these sense of acknowledging the legitimacy of the other’s narrative without necessarily fully agreeing with that narrative.” Herbert C. Kelman, “Reconciliation as Identity Change: A Social-Psychological Perspective,” In *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*. ed. Yaacov Bar-Siman-Tov (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 119.

¹⁷⁸Ervin Staub and Laurie Anne Pearlman, “Healing, Reconciliation, and Forgiving after Genocide and Other Collective Violence,” ed. Helmick, S.J., and Petersen, 205-206.

¹⁷⁹Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

is a part of reconciliation and forgiveness. Taking steps that would promote these actions could lead to a positive reshaping of the future.¹⁸⁰

The acknowledgment of wrongdoing (and the concomitant shift in identity that it requires) could make it profoundly easier for victims to let go of their anger and need for revenge, creating the conditions that promote a shift in their identity and relationship.¹⁸¹

If the two parties can come to the place where they can be humble before one another, listen, and be open, then there is a chance that there could be healing and restoration between them, which paves the way for a shared future. Yet, they are the ones that will have to take this step.

“Sometimes it takes the people who actually live the conflict to do the resolution.”¹⁸²

¹⁸⁰Volf, 42.

¹⁸¹Donna Hicks, “The Role of Identity Reconstruction in Promoting Reconciliation,” Helmick, S.J., and Petersen, 149.

¹⁸²Avi Gilboa, Interview by author, Tel Aviv, November 13, 2017.

APPENDIX A:

Ukuleles for Peace





APPENDIX B:

PARENT/GUARDIAN CONSENT FORM
Music and Conflict Resolution: Israeli-Palestinian Conflict
Teresa EnYart
Liberty University
Ethnomusicology/School of Music

Your child is invited to be in a research study of coexistence and peacemaking through music. He/she was selected as a possible participant because of their involvement with _____ . Please read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to allow him/her to be in the study.

Teresa EnYart, a student in the Ethnomusicology/School of Music at Liberty University, is conducting this study.

Background Information: The purpose of this study is to understand how music can be used as a tool to promote peacemaking by opening up lines of communication between a divided people.

Procedures: If you agree to allow your child to be in this study, I would ask him/her to do the following things:

1. Complete a survey (15 minutes).
2. Participate in a private interview (15 minutes).
3. Partaking in video recording and/or photographs as the researcher observes techniques and methods used during class (length of class or rehearsal time).

Risks and Benefits of Participation: The risks involved in this study are minimal, which means they are equal to the risks you would encounter in everyday life. You should not expect to receive a direct benefit from taking part in this study.

Compensation: Your child will not be compensated for participating in this study.

Confidentiality: If you desire that your child remain unidentified in the research, then the records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report, I might publish, I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely, and only the researcher will have access to the records. I may share the data I collect from your child for use in future research studies or with other researchers; if I share the data that I collect about your child, I will remove any information that could identify them, if applicable, before I share the data.

- If you wish your child to remain unidentified, they will be assigned a pseudonym. In addition, I will conduct the interviews in a location where others will not easily overhear the conversation.
- Data will be stored on a password locked computer and may be used in future presentations. After three years, all electronic records will be deleted.
- Interviews will be recorded and transcribed. Recordings will be stored on a password locked computer for three years and then erased. The researcher will only have access to these recordings.
- I cannot assure participants that other members of the focus group will not share what was discussed with persons outside of the group.

Voluntary Nature of the Study: Participation in this study is voluntary. Your decision whether or not to allow your child to participate will not affect his/her current or future relations with Liberty University or _____. If you decide to allow your child to participate, he/she is free to not answer any question or withdraw at any time without affecting those relationships.

How to Withdraw from the Study: If your child chooses to withdraw from the study, please contact the researcher at the email address included in the next paragraph. Should your child choose to withdraw, any data collected, apart from focus group data, will be destroyed immediately and will not be included in this study. Focus group data will not be destroyed, but any contributions to the focus group will not be included in the study if your child chooses to withdraw.

Contacts and Questions: The researcher conducting this study is Teresa EnYart. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact her at tenyart@liberty.edu. You may also contact the researcher's faculty advisor, Katherine Morehouse, at kmorehouse@liberty.edu.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and would like to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd, Green Hall 1887, Lynchburg, VA 24515 or email at irb@liberty.edu.

Please notify the researcher if you would like a copy of this information for your records.

Statement of Consent: I have read and understood the above information. I have asked questions and have received answers. I consent to allow my child to participate in the study.

(NOTE: DO NOT AGREE TO ALLOW YOUR CHILD TO PARTICIPATE UNLESS IRB APPROVAL INFORMATION WITH CURRENT DATES HAS BEEN ADDED TO THIS DOCUMENT.)

The researcher has my permission to audio-record/video-record/photograph my child as part of his/her participation in this study.

Signature of Minor Date

Signature of Parent Date

Signature of Investigator Date

APPENDIX: C

ASSENT OF CHILD TO PARTICIPATE IN A RESEARCH STUDY

What is the name of the study and who is doing the study?

My name is Teresa EnYart and I am doing a study on music and peacemaking.

Why are we doing this study?

I am interested in studying because it allows me to understand how music can be used in different ways.

Why are we asking you to be in this study?

You are being asked to be in this research study because of your love for music that goes beyond yourself and involves others around you.

If you agree, what will happen?

If you are in this study I will ask you questions about music, give you questions to answer on paper and/or video record and photograph you playing music in your group.

Do you have to be in this study?

No, you do not have to be in this study. If you want to be in this study, then tell the researcher. If you don't want to, it's OK to say no. The researcher will not be angry. You can say yes now and change your mind later. It's up to you.

Do you have any questions?

You can ask questions any time. You can ask now. You can ask later. You can talk to the researcher. If you do not understand something, please ask the researcher to explain it to you again.

Signing your name below means that you want to be in the study.

Signature of Child/Witness

Date

Contacts and Questions: The researcher conducting this study is Teresa EnYart. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact her at tenyart@liberty.edu. You may also contact the researcher's faculty advisor, Katherine Morehouse, at kmorehouse@liberty.edu.

Liberty University Institutional Review Board,
1971 University Blvd, Green Hall 1887, Lynchburg, VA 24515
or email at irb@liberty.edu.

APPENDIX: D

CONSENT FORM

Music and Conflict Resolution: Israeli-Palestinian Conflict
Teresa EnYart
Liberty University
Ethnomusicology/School of Music

You are invited to be in a research study of peacemaking and peacebuilding through music. You were selected as a possible participant because _____. Please read this form and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to be in the study.

Teresa EnYart, a student in the Ethnomusicology/School of Music at Liberty University, is conducting this study.

Background Information: The purpose of this study is to understand how music can be used as a tool to promote peacemaking by opening up lines of communication between a divided people.

Procedures: If you agree to be in this study, I would ask you to do one or more of the following things:

4. Complete a survey (15 minutes).
5. Participate in a private interview (20-30 minutes).
6. Partaking in video recording and/or photographs as the researcher observes your techniques and methods (length of class or rehearsal time).

Risks and Benefits of Participation: The risks involved in this study are minimal, which means they are equal to the risks you would encounter in everyday life. You should not expect to receive a direct benefit from taking part in this study.

Compensation: Participants will not be compensated for participating in this study.

Confidentiality: If you desire to remain unidentified in the research, then the records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report I might publish, I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify a subject. Research records will be stored securely, and only the researcher will have access to the records. I may share the data I collect from you for use in future research studies or with other researchers; if I share the data that I collect about you, I will remove any information that could identify you, if applicable, before I share the data.

- If you wish to remain unidentified, you will be assigned a pseudonym. In addition, I will conduct the interviews in a location where others will not easily overhear the conversation.

- Data will be stored on a password locked computer and may be used in future presentations. After three years, all electronic records will be deleted.
- Interviews will be recorded and transcribed. Recordings will be stored on a password locked computer for three years and then erased. The researcher will only have access to these recordings.
- I cannot assure participants that other members of the focus group will not share what was discussed with persons outside of the group.

Voluntary Nature of the Study: Participation in this study is voluntary. Your decision whether or not to participate will not affect your current or future relations with Liberty University or _____. If you decide to participate, you are free to not answer any question or withdraw at any time without affecting those relationships.

How to Withdraw from the Study: If you choose to withdraw from the study, please contact the researcher at the email address included in the next paragraph. Should you choose to withdraw, data collected from you, apart from focus group data, will be destroyed immediately and will not be included in this study. Focus group data will not be destroyed, but your contributions to the focus group will not be included in the study if you choose to withdraw.

Contacts and Questions: The researcher conducting this study is Teresa EnYart. You may ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, **you are encouraged** to contact her at tenyart@liberty.edu. You may also contact the researcher's faculty advisor, Katherine Morehouse, at kmorehouse@liberty.edu.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding this study and would like to talk to someone other than the researcher, **you are encouraged** to contact the Institutional Review Board, 1971 University Blvd., Green Hall Ste. 1887, Lynchburg, VA 24515 or email at irb@liberty.edu.

Please notify the researcher if you would like a copy of this information for your records.

Statement of Consent: I have read and understood the above information. I have asked questions and have received answers. I consent to participate in the study.

(NOTE: DO NOT AGREE TO PARTICIPATE UNLESS IRB APPROVAL INFORMATION WITH CURRENT DATES HAS BEEN ADDED TO THIS DOCUMENT.)

The researcher has my permission to audio-record/video-record/photograph me as part of my participation in this study.

Signature of Participant

Date

Signature of Investigator

Date

APPENDIX: E

QUESTIONS FOR SURVEYS AND INTERVIEWS

Possible Questions Intended for Directors or Heads of Organizations (not in any particular order):

How would you describe or identify yourself? Who would you say that you are?

How are you, if at all, personally tied to this interethnic division or conflict? And if you are not, what makes you, as an “outsider”, interested in this peacemaking endeavor?

What are the things that you are looking to achieve with your work here at _____?

How important is forgiveness and reconciliation through this interaction?

In what way is the music chosen and why?

Does the music reflect the individual’s identities?

How important is the music genre in relation to the act of musicking or making music?

It is mentioned that your organization believes that music is a universal language, why is this so and do you believe that this is so?

What are the ways that you believe that music bridges the gap between ethnically divided people?

What is the desired outcome of the music making between those involved? Are they looking to only interact through music or are they wanting to address more serious political and social issues?

Do you think that there are or will be lasting effects that will come because of your efforts?

What are the ways that you expect the outside community to respond or be affected by the efforts within your organization?

Why have you chosen to use music in this way? Why is this organization important to you and to others around you?

What do you think that lasting benefits will be for those who are involved? Will they make an impact in the world and society around them?

How were you moved to be involved with this cause?

Have your intentions always matched the results that have come about? Were you surprised by the reactions around you?

Were there ways you had to modify your attempts?

Do you think that your efforts could be applied elsewhere, in other cultures, or do you think that its culture specific?

Some would consider this type of work activism; do you consider yourself an activist?

How would you define the type of work that you do here at _____?

Possible Questions Intended for Children/Youth that Participate within the Programs or Organizations:

How would you describe or identify yourself? Who would you say that you were?

What are the ways that you feel connected with others that play music with you?

Does it matter what music is chosen?

What music would you prefer to play when in this group?

Is there music that you don't like to play that is chosen for you here?

Is there any type of music that you would be opposed or against playing?

Why do you like music?

Why do you like to play with this group?

Does it matter that there are others in this group that are different than you?

Does playing music with those that are different from you help you to connect with them better?

What do you have in common with the people you play music with in this group?

Why did you join this music group?

Is there are type of music that helps you identify or express who you are? And in what ways does this happen?

Do you spend time outside of this music activity with others in this group that are different from you?

Have you built friendships with others in this groups that are different from you?

How does participating in this group effected other parts of your life? Personal? Social? Family?

Do you feel comfortable and/or uncomfortable when making or playing music with this group?

How do you feel about music? Why is music important to you? Is music something that will always be a part of your life? And if so, in what way do you think that it will?

Do you play in other music groups besides this one? And if you do, what kind of music do you play?

Are there other things that you are learning here besides music?

Are there things that you are learning that surprise you?

What are the good things that have come because of your participation in this group?

Are there things (type of music played, people, teachers, area of town, transportation) that bother you or make you uncomfortable when you participate in this group? If so, what are they and why?

What is your general attitude, thoughts, and feelings when you think about this music group?

Does playing music with this group inspire you?

APPENDIX: F

EMAIL TO POTENTIAL PARTICIPANT

Dear _____

As a graduate student in the Ethnomusicology/School of Music department at Liberty University, I am conducting research as part of the requirements for a master's degree the title of my research project is Music and Conflict Resolution: Israeli-Palestinian Conflict and the purpose of my research is to explore the ways that your organization practices coexistence, tolerance, and peacemaking through music.

I am writing to request your permission to conduct my research in/at _____. Participants will be asked to answer questions in a survey or by interview in addition to my observation of their music making. Participants will be presented with informed consent information prior to participating. Taking part in this study is completely voluntary, and participants are welcome to discontinue participation at any time. My research in Israel will take place in October and November.

Thank you for considering my request. If you choose to grant permission, respond to tenyart@liberty.edu.

Sincerely,

Teresa EnYart

Bibliography

- Alshaer, Atef. "Identity in Mahmoud Darwish's Poem 'The dice player.'" *Middle East Journal of Culture and Communication* 4 (2011): 90-110.
- Al-Tae, Nasser. "Voices of Peace and the Legacy of Reconciliation: Popular Music, Nationalism, and the Quest for Peace in the Middle East." *Popular Music* 12, no. 1 (January 2002): 41-61. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Anastasiou, Harry. *The Broken Olive Branch: Nationalism, Ethnic Conflict, and the Quest for Peace in Cyprus, Volume One: The Impasse of Ethnonationalism*. New York, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2008.
- "Encountering Nationalism: The Contribution of Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution." In *Handbook of Conflict Analysis and Resolution*, edited by Dennis D. J. Sandole, Sean Byrne, Ingrid Sandole-Staroste, and Jessica Senehi, 32-44 New York: Routledge, 2009.
- Bar-Siman-Tov, Yaacov. *From Conflict Resolution to Reconciliation*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004. Ebook Collection (EBSCOhost). Accessed March 25, 2018.
- Bassele, Parfait Adegboye. "Music and Conflict Resolution: Can a Music and Story Centered Workshop Enhance Empathy?" Master's Thesis, Portland State University, 2013. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu>
- Belkind, Nili. "Israel's J14 Social Protest Movement and its Imaginings of 'Home': On Music, Politics and Social Justice." *Middle East Journal of Culture and Communication* 6, no. 3 (2013): 329-53.
- Berg, Carin. "Tunes of Religious Resistance? Understanding Hamas Music in a Conflict Context." *Contemporary Islam* 6, no. 3 (2012): 297-314. Accessed October 10, 2016. <https://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Bishara, Azmi. "Bridging the Green Line: The PA, Israeli Arabs, and final status. An Interview with Azmi Bishara." *Journal of Palestinian Studies* 26, no. 3 (Spring 1997): 67-80. Accessed September 30, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2538158>
- Brinner, Benjamin. *Playing Across the Divide, Israeli-Palestinian Musical Encounters*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Caspi, Lian and Alex Brott. "Music for Conflict Resolution Symposium Israel/Palestine." Whitman College. Accessed April 15, 2017. <http://musicforconflictresolutionsymposium.wordpress.com>

- Djumaev, Alexander. "Musical Heritage and National Identity in Uzbekistan." *Ethnomusicology Forum* 14, no. 2 (November 2005): 165-184. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20184517>
- Dueck, Johnathan and Suzel Ana Reily, ed. *The Oxford Handbook of Music and World Christianities*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Emerson, Robert M., Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda L. Shaw. *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes*. 2nd ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Fusch, Patricia, Gene E. Fusch, and Lawrence R. Ness. "How to Conduct a Mini-Ethnographic Case Study: A Guide for Novice Researchers." *The Qualitative Report* 22, no. 3 (2017): 923-941. Accessed February 18, 2018. <https://nsuworks.nova.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=https://www.google.com/&httpsdir=1&article=2580&context=tqr>
- Gilboa, Avi. "Let's Talk Music – A Model for Enhancing Intercultural Communication: Trying to Understand Why and How Music Helps." *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy* (online) 16, no. 1 (February 2016): 1-23.
- Hendler, Micah. "Music for Peace in Jerusalem." Senior Essay, Calhoun College, 2012. Accessed October 30, 2016. <https://traubman.igc.org/hendlerpaper.pdf>
- Helmick, Raymond G., S.J., and Rodney L. Petersen. *Forgiveness and Reconciliation: Religion, Public Policy, and Conflict Transformation*. West Conshohochon, PA: Templeton Foundation Press, 2001.
- Johnston, Mindy Kay. "Music and Conflict Resolution: Exploring the Utilization of Music in Community Engagement." Master's Thesis, Portland State University, 2010. Accessed April 23, 2017. <http://pdxscholar.library.pdx.edu>
- Kanari, Shlomit, and Galia Sabar. "I'm Singing My Way Up': The Significance of Music Amongst African Christian Migrants in Israel." *Studies in World Christianity* 12, no. 2 (2006): 101-125.
- Karsh, Efraim. "Resurrecting the Myth: Benny Morris, the Zionist Movement, and the Transfer of Idea." *Israel Affairs* 11, no. 3 (2005): 469-490.
- Kartomi, Margaret. "Tracing Jewish-Babylonian Trade Routes and Identity through Music, with Reference to Seven Versions of a Song of Praise Melody." *Ethnomusicology Forum* 13, no. 1 (June 2004): 75-100. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20184467>
- King, Roberta. "Music, Peacebuilding, and Interface Dialogue: Transformative Bridges in Muslim-Christian Relations." *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 40, no. 3 (July 2016): 202-217. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>

- and Sooi Ling Tan, ed. *(un)Common Sounds: Songs of Peace and Reconciliation among Muslims and Christians*. Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2014.
- LeCompte, Margaret D. and Jean J. Schensul. *Designing & Conducting Ethnographic Research*. Walnut Creek, CA: Alta Mira Press, 2010.
- Mack, John E. "Nationalism and the Self." *Psychohistory Review* 11 (1983): 47-69.
- Mazierska, Ewa, and Georgina Gregory. *Relocating Popular Music*. New York, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire; Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.
- MacDonald, Raymond A. R., David J. Hargreaves, and Dorothy Miell, ed. *Musical Identities*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002. *eBook Collection (EBSCOhost)*, EBSCOhost Accessed January 23, 2018.
- *Handbook of Musical Identities*. Oxford: OUP Oxford, 2017. Accessed January 23, 2018. ProQuest Ebook Central.
- McDonald, David A. *My Voice is My Weapon: Music, Nationalism, and the Poetics of Palestinian Resistance*. London: Duke University Press, 2013.
- Merriam, Alan P. *The Anthropology of Music*. Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press, 1964.
- Nocke, Alexandra. "Israel and the Emergence of Mediterranean Identity: Expressions of Locality in Music and Literature." *Israel Studies* 11, no. 1 (Spring 2006): 143-73. University of Illinois, 2010.
- O'Connell, John Morgan and Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco, ed. *Music and Conflict*. Urbana, IL: 2010
- "Music in War, Music for Peace: A Review Article." *Ethnomusicology* 55, no. 1 (2011): 112-27. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org>
- Regev, Motti, and Edwin Seroussi. *Popular Music and National Culture in Israel*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004.
- Rice, Timothy. "Reflections on Music and Identity in Ethnomusicology." *Musicology* 10, no. 1 (2001): 17-28. Accessed October 30, 2016. <https://doi.org/10.2298/MUZ0707017R>
- Roam, Sharenda. "Taking it to the Bridge: The Arts of Interfaith Peacebuilding." PhD diss., George Fox University, 2015. Accessed October 30, 2016. <file:///C:/Users/primary/Downloads/Literature%20Review%20George%20Fox.pdf>

- Rüsen, Jorn. "How to Overcome Ethnocentrism: Approaches to a Culture of Recognition by History in the Twenty-First Century." *History and Theory* 43, no. 4 (2004): 118-29. Accessed January 27, 2015. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3590639>
- Saada-Ophir, Galit. "Borderland Pop: Arab Jewish Musicians and the Politics of Performance." *Cultural Anthropology* 21, no. 2 (2006): 205-29. Accessed October 30, 2016. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3651603>
- Seter, Ronit. "First Performances - Jerusalem and Tel Aviv: Different News from Israel (Or, One More Step Toward Peace) - Three Contemporary Music Festivals." *Tempo - A Quarterly Review of Modern Music* 59, no. 7 (2005): 46-51. Accessed April 15, 2017. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Shabtay, Malka. "RaGap': Music and Identity Among Young Ethiopians in Israel." *Critical Arts* 17, no. 1-2 (2003): 93-102. Accessed October 10, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Shoshana, Avi. "Minor Language and Major Responses in the Field of Popular Music in Israel." *Poetics* 41, no. 5 (2013): 481-500. Accessed April 15, 2017. <https://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Stein, Rebecca L. and Ted Swedenburg, eds. *Palestine, Israel, and the Politics of Popular Culture*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press Books, 2005.
- Stokes, Martin. "Introduction." In *Ethnicity, Identity, and Music*, ed. Martin Stokes and Jonathan Webber, 1-28. Oxford, UK: Berg, 2014.
- Tas, Hakki. "Melodies of Resistance: Islamist Music in Secular Turkey." *Social Compass* 61, no. 3 (2014): 368-383. Accessed October 30, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- The Jacob's Ladder Festival. "Ukulele's for Peace." Accessed April 15, 2017. <http://www.jlfestival.com/springfestival/artists/ukuleles-for-peace/>
- Turino, Thomas. *Music, as Social Life: The Politics of Participation*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Urbain, Olivier ed. *Music and Conflict Transformation: Harmonies and Dissonances in Geopolitics*. London, UK: I.B.Tauris, 2008.
- Waterman, Stanley. "Place, Culture and Identity: Summer Music in Upper Galilee." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 23, no. 2 (1998): 253-267. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/623270>
- . "The Israeli Music Scene: An Essay in Secular Culture." *Contemporary Jewry* 30, (2010): 105-118. Accessed October 30, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>

- . "Variations on a Hebrew Theme: The Politics of Art Music in Israel." *Geojournal* 65, no. 1-2 (2006): 113-23. Accessed October 30, 2016.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/41148027>
- Wong, Chuen-Fung. "Conflicts, Occupation, and Music-Making in Palestine." *The Israeli Palestinian Impasse: Dialogic Transformations* 3, no. 19 (Spring 2009): 267-84. Accessed April 15, 2017.
- Younan, Munib. "The Future of Palestinian Christianity and Prospects for Justice, Peace, and Reconciliation ." *Currents in Theology and Mission* 34, no. 5 (2007): 338-50. *General OneFile*. Accessed September 29, 2016. <http://ezproxy.liberty.edu>
- Youth and Music Israel. "Arab Jewish Orchestra." Accessed March 15, 2017.
<http://www.youthmusic.org.il/index.php/en/the-arab-jewish-orchestra>