Liberty University
DigitalCommons@Liberty University

Faculty Publications and Presentations

Helms School of Government

1-1-2010

David Gress: From Plato to NATO Study Guide

Steven Alan Samson
Liberty University, ssamson@liberty.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov_fac_pubs

Part of the Other Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons, Political Science Commons, and the Public Affairs, Public Policy and Public Administration Commons

Samson, Steven Alan, "David Gress: From Plato to NATO Study Guide" (2010). *Faculty Publications and Presentations.* Paper 94.
http://digitalcommons.liberty.edu/gov_fac_pubs/94

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Helms School of Government at DigitalCommons@Liberty University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications and Presentations by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@Liberty University. For more information, please contact scholarlycommunication@liberty.edu.

DAVID GRESS: FROM PLATO TO NATO
STUDY GUIDE, c. 2003-2004
Steven Alan Samson

PREFACE

Besides being an essay on the concept of the West and the teaching of western civilization, this is a critique of what M. Stanton Evans called "the liberal history lesson" and what David Gress calls "the Grand Narrative." The ironic title of the book (see page 1) may refer to a 1984 BBC radio series, later published as *From Plato to NATO: Studies on Political Thought* (1995), by the late British journalist and BBC announcer Brian Redhead. In preparing this study, Dr. Gress acknowledges the influence of Ernest Gellner's *The Conditions of Liberty*, Paul Rahe's *Republics Ancient and Modern*, and Brian Tierney's *Religion, Law and the Growth of Constitutional Thought, 1150-1650*. David Landes's *The Wealth and Poverty of Nations* is given special notice.

Outline

A. KEY TO THE WEST (xi-xiv)
  1. The **Sceptical Enlightenment** [The author identified with this tradition, p. 174]
    a. A liberalism that does not reject history, religion, or human nature
    b. It seeks the possibilities of liberty and prosperity within those givens, not in abstract rights or visions of justice

Review

Sceptical Enlightenment

INTRODUCTION

Outline

A. INADEQUACY OF THE **GRAND NARRATIVE** (1)
[cf. M. Stanton Evans's "liberal history lesson" and the "consensus history" of the 1950s]
  1. Its Errors
    a. "This account rightly saw liberty as fundamental to the West, but mistakenly defined liberty as an abstract, philosophical principle"
  2. Author's Key Historical Insight
    a. **Liberty** is "a set of practices and institutions that evolved, not from Greece, but from the synthesis of classical, Christian, and Germanic culture that took shape from the fifth to the eighth centuries A.D."
    b. "These practices and institutions . . . made up the Western forms of the **market**, the **state**, the **church**, and what I call **Christian ethnicity**."

B. WHY THE GRAND NARRATIVE WAS MISLEADING: THREE WEAKNESSES (102)
  1. Its **Moralism** [cf. Minogue's "political moralism"]
    a. It posited a **false dichotomy** between high principles (residing outside history) [cf. Straussianism] and a flawed reality
    b. Rebuttal: Western liberty was not distinct from history, "but the initially unintended side effect of the drive for power"
      (1) Passion for God, gold, and glory
    c. What needs explaining is "liberty as the tool and by-product of power in the geopolitical conditions of Europe."
  2. Its **Universalism**
    a. "It saw liberty and democracy, conceived by the Greeks and revived by

modernity, not only as results of Western history . . . but as universally valid."

3. **The Illusion of Newness**
    a. It "imagined modern democracy as an invention of the Enlightenment and of the American and French Revolutions"
    b. **Myth of True Democracy**: It became a future-oriented search for justice
        (1) But the practice of democracy is "impossible to explain apart from the Christian ethnicity of the Old Western Synthesis
    c. The West is "no more and no less than the institutional and cultural result of over a thousand years of the joint practice of power and liberty [cf. the thesis of Eugen Rosenstock-Huessy's *Out of Revolution* (1938)

C. THE GRAND NARRATIVE AND ITS IDEOLOGY OF CENTRIST LIBERALISM (3)
1. **Political Purpose**
    a. Lowest common denominator of American higher education and public opinion of an idea of the West as progressive, secular, democratic, and moderately capitalist [cf. Walter Russell Mead's Fordism]
    b. It rested on a rationalist/humanitarian belief in progress [Lord Macaulay was one of the exemplars of "The Whig Interpretation of History"]
2. The Canon of the Great Books
    a. Selected to ground and confirm this bland but pleasant reading
3. High Point of Centrist Liberalism: **"End of Ideology"**, c. 1960
    a. Daniel Bell [cf. Francis Fukuyama's "end of history," 1989]
4. Two Waves of Attack on Centrist Liberalism
    a. 1960s radicalism
    b. 1980s **postmodernism** and relativism [cf. J. Budziszewski]

D. ATTACKS ON THE IDEA OF THE WEST (3-7)
1. Stanford, 1986: "Hey hey, ho ho, Western culture's gotta go!" [Jesse Jackson.]
2. Martin Bernal's *Black Athena*, 1987
3. Kirkpatrick Sale's Objection to the Columbus Quincentenary, 1992
4. Allan Bloom's 1987 Rejoinder, *The Closing of the American Mind*
5. Paul Kennedy's *Rise and Decline of the Great Powers*, 1987: Imperial Overstretch
6. Francis Fukuyama's Refutation in "The End of History," 1989
7. Battle over the West and Its Identity [cf. Kuehnelt-Leddihn's "identitarianism"]
    a. The Grand Narrative collapsed into a shell of itself
8. By the 1980s Academics and Politicians Had Largely Dismissed the Canon as an Apology for Privilege and Assimilationism [cf. Hanson's *Mexifornia*, Scruton's *The West and the Rest*]
    a. Revised, PC versions of the liberalism and the idea of the West arose

E. THESIS (7-8)
1. Grand Narrative's Idea of the West Is Erroneous
    a. **Origin**: The West is the actually a product of the **marriage of Germanic and Christian ideas**
2. Its Authors Constructed an Ahistorical West
    a. The West presented as a moral enterprise
    b. Thus the vulnerability of the narrative to a moralistic assault
3. Need to Return the New West to Its Historical Identity
    a. Multiculturalists and centrist liberals must both be defied
4. Author's Method
    a. Refuting the three weaknesses [errors] of democratic liberalism
    b. These weaknesses opened the door to those who argued that **economic liberty** is a fraud: a "bourgeois pathology of greed and wealth maximization" that naturally leads to "nihilism"

F. DOES THE WEST HAVE A FUTURE? (8-16)
1. View of the **Optimists** [cf. Thomas Sowell's *A Conflict of Visions*]
    a. Spread of democratic capitalism, human rights, and personal freedom

"would yield a Westernized world"
b. Justifications for this vision
c. Confirmation of Immanuel Kant's argument

2. Four **Groups of Non-Optimists**: Asians, Realists, Pessimists, Radical Left
3. Lee Kwan Yew's Asian Values Group
   a. Two points
      (1) Economic growth does not require democracy
      (2) Economic growth is no longer a Western prerogative
   b. Effects of the Asian Crisis, 1997
4. The Realist Case
   a. Two groups: Western social scientists and Third World intellectuals
      (1) Samuel P. Huntington, Ernest Gellner, Bassam Tibi, Ali Mazrui
   b. Optimist thesis: Democracy and capitalism carried the code of Western civilization
   c. Realist Rejoinder: two arguments
      (1) Procedures and institutions must be distinguished from political culture, social norms, and ideals
      (2) Spread of democracy and capitalism leads to less Western influence; the West would be only one among several cultures
5. The Pessimists: The West Is Declining for Internal Reasons
   Western decline is inevitable and rooted in its own institutions and culture
   a. Different diagnoses
   b. A shared sense that the decline of the West [Spengler's title] is a tragedy
6. The Radical Left
   a. **Sadistically redemptive outlook** of those who deny the West a right to the future [cf. Roger Scruton's culture of repudiation]
7. The Optimist Case Was Contradicted by the Mere Fact That Many People Disagreed
   a. Cold War: **James Burnham**'s *Suicide of the West*
      (1) Liberalism is the ideology of Western suicide
8. Paradox: The West Won the Cold War by Default in the 1990s But Doubts Remained
   a. Whether the victorious forces of democracy and capitalism are solid
   b. Whether these forces are beneficial
   c. Confusion about the future rested on a prior confusion about the West
9. Source of the Confusion: the Protean character of the West

G. PURPOSE OF THE BOOK (16-18)

1. To Explain How and Why Different People Defined the West Differently
   a. The West is not a single story, but many stories
2. The Two Most Important Versions: The Old West and the New West
   a. The **New West** goes off its rails if it divorces itself from its Old origins
      (1) "The optimist vision of the West as triumphant democracy and capitalism utterly ignored the Old West and was therefore superficial and therefore unable to bear the weight of universal significance that the optimists gave it."
4. Author's Pedagogical Purpose: To Add Chronological and Philosophical Depth to Both Visions
5. Renewed Relevance of the History of the West
   a. The "Cold War"
      (1) It created an artificial and ahistorical community of danger
   b. The logic of this structure of institutions and events ended in 1991
6. Two New Factors Brought Long-Term History Back to the Agenda
   a. New, dynamic landscape of world politics
   b. Self-doubt within the West
7. Source of Confusion: Many people continued to talk as though historical perspective is unnecessary

a. Optimists ignore how the principles of democracy and capitalism relate to the history of western civilization
b. Pessimists continued to talk as though the West is adequately defined as a political system and little else

H. UNCERTAIN PROSPECTS FOR THE WEST: THREE POINTS (18-20)
1. **Human Nature Is Flawed**
a. Greater knowledge through the natural and social sciences does not imply that people or institutions would conform to this knowledge
(1) The Reasons: Skepticism, Ignorance, Orneriness, and Inertia
2. Democracy and Capitalism No Longer Imply Westernization [cf. Walter Russell Mead on "the secession of elites"]
a. The West is simply the first of several cultures to have undergone the revolutions of modernity
3. The Question of Which West Is at Issue?
a. The world could not be westernized "because there was no single model of the West to impose."
(1) Two models incompatible: liberal democracy, Christian theocracy

I. MULTICULTURAL REALITY (20-23)
1. The Future of the West Is as One of Several Cultures Reforged in the Crucible of Modernity, Democracy, Capitalism, Science, and Individualism
2. **Norman Davies** Identifies Twelve Variants of Western Civilization
a. *e.g.*, the WASP West or the "Allied scheme"
b. Davies objects particularly to the exclusion of Eastern Europeans
3. Recent Neglect of a Principle of Intellectual Hygiene
a. "The one civilization that voluntarily abolished both the slave trade and slavery was offhandedly denounced as uniquely evil."
4. Summary of the Book's Purpose
a. The two **cardinal sins of the Grand Narrative** (a.k.a. the WASP West and the Allied scheme of history): It "cut eastern Europe off from the West and ignored religion and any history that did not fit into the simple Plato-to-NATO scheme of constant improvement."

J. THREE THEMES: CRITICISMS OF THE GRAND NARRATIVE (23-24)
1. Standard Story Is Partial and Incomplete, Making It Dangerous for Two Reasons
a. It Destroys Cultural Antibodies: Citizens who depended on the traditional story had little with which to resist those who challenged it in order to destroy its influence
(1) The liberal story was abandoned by liberal elites in droves
b. It Destroys Intellectual Defenses: It makes it difficult to resist critics who say the West is not only evil but morally empty and spiritually vacant
2. The Standard Story Was Deaf to Religion and Theology as Cultural Forces in Their Own Right
3. The Standard Story Was Flawed Because It Built a Narrow Linear Narrative That Ignored Great Chunks of Western Civilization

K. ORIGINS OF THE CONCEPT OF THE WEST (24-27)
1. Connotations of the Word: Classical Mythology
2. King Arthur in Avalon
3. Idea of the West as a Region of Vigor and Youth
4. Weakness of the Neoconservative Defense of the West
5. Magic Moments vs. Original Sins

Review

Grand Narrative	working definition of liberty	weaknesses of Grand Narrative
its political purpose	"end of ideology"	postmodernism
origin of the West	threat to economic liberty	optimists vs. non-optimists
sadistically redemptive outlook	James Burnham	need for historical perspective

three uncertainties Norman Davies Grand Narrative's cardinal sins
why it is dangerous

CHAPTER ONE: THE GRAND NARRATIVE AND ITS FATE

Outline

A. FIRST STEP TO RECOVERY FROM CENTRIST LIBERAL HEGEMONY: THE GRAND NARRATIVE IS NOT A REVEALED TRUTH (29-30)
   1. Hegemony of Centrist Liberalism Was Short-Lived: c. 1930s-1965
      a. It ended "when the Vietnam War began to divide the American elites, and the leaders of the adversary culture [Scruton's culture of repudiation] launched their long and magnificently successful **march through the institutions**." [cf. Antonio Gramsci and Rudi Dutschke]
      b. The **adversary culture** "had been there all along as a steadily more vociferous undercurrent in politics and in the elite colleges, media, and cultural institutions."
   2. The Grand Narrative Was Not an Independent Discovery of Scholars, But a Political and Pedagogical Construct (and Self-Justification) of Centrist Liberalism
      a. It is **liberalism's historical and cultural account of itself**, its roots, history, and legitimacy
      b. It dominated elite higher education and culture from the 1920s to the 1960s; it provided the ideological basis of a liberal consensus about the merits of the West
      c. When American liberals stop believing in its values – excellence, reason, science, and assimilation – they lost confidence in the narrative

B. SECOND STEP: UNDERSTANDING WHY IT WAS INVENTED AND BY WHOM (30-38)
   1. **Higher Education** Became a Mass Phenomenon: But Only Part of the Reason
      a. Nothing in the notion of mass higher education in itself that required a college-level core curriculum [these debates went back to the 19C]
   2. The Need for Assimilation Due to Mass Immigration Was the Main Motive
      a. [This was true of the advent of public education in the 1830s: cf. Samuel Blumenfeld's *Is Public Education Necessary?*]
   3. **Assimilation** Took Two Forms
      a. American life itself for adults
      b. Americanization of children through schools and colleges
   4. The First World War Was the **Catalyst** That Precipitated the Grand Narrative in Its Developed Form
      a. Emphasis on teaching young adults the political principles of American government and the democratic heritage of Western civilization
         (1) War and Peace courses
   5. Two Versions of the Grand Narrative
      a. Contemporary Civilization (Columbia University, 1919)
         (1) Part of the general education movement, 1910s-1930s
         (2) **John Herman Randall, Jr.**
      b. Great Books Program (University of Chicago)
         [Another such program was started by in 1937 by Stringfellow Barr an Scott Buchanan at St. John's College in Annapolis]
         (1) **Robert Maynard Hutchins**
         (2) **Mortimer Adler** assisted in developing the **Chicago Plan**
         (3) *Great Books of the Western World* and *Encyclopaedia Britannica*
         (4) [Hutchins subsequently founded the Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions in Santa Barbara, 1959-1987]
   5. A Third Version: **Will and Ariel Durant**'s *The Story of Civilization*, 1935-1975

a. Durant, a one-time seminarian, was principal of the **Ferrer School** [a number of prominent radicals, such as Emma Goldman, Jack London, and Upton Sinclair, taught there; Margaret Sanger was also associated]
b. The eleven volumes are "the apotheosis of the Grand Narrative"

6. Transition: William McNeill's *The Rise of the West*, 1963
7. Radical Critiques: Martin Bernal and Kirkpatrick Sale
8. **Deconstructionists** Were Right in One Thing: The Narrative Was Misleading
   a. But the criticism was at least as ideological and biased
   b. It also merely stood the moralism on its head
9. The Narrative Was Bad History Because It Rested on Three Fundamental Fallacies
   a. That the history of culture was the history of great ideas
   b. That the West was a moral story with a happy ending, and
   c. That this story could be adequately defined as an axis of continuity that began with the Greeks and landed in modern America

C. THE THIRD STEP: TO DISENTANGLE THE ACTUAL STAGES OF THE HISTORY OF WESTERN IDENTITY FROM THE DISTORTIONS OF BOTH MORALISMS (38-39)

1. The Fact That the Deconstructors Won Is Not a Reason to Return to the Grand Narrative; They Did Not Correct Its Errors and Added Their Own Errors
   a. We must defend against both the old errors and the new errors

D. A SYNTHESIS OF THE THREE VERSIONS OF THE GRAND NARRATIVE (39-40)

1. The Liberal Grand Narrative Presented the West as a Coherent Entity Emerging Triumphantly in a Series of Stages
   a. Each stage contributed an essential element to the whole
   b. Thus Western civilization is "a synthesis of democracy, capitalism, science, human rights, religious pluralism, individual autonomy, and the power of unfettered human reason to solve human problems."
   c. **Magic Moments**: The most important stages
2. This Confident and Optimistic Story was Created as a Tool of Mass Higher Education and in the Face of Serious Challenges to Western Identity
   a. Critics began gaining the upper ground from the late 1960s on
   b. "By the 1990s the optimistic story had been fundamentally recast in a number of variants: stories of guilt, doubt, decline, and apology."
3. Both the Optimistic Narrative and the Critical, or Postmodern, Anti-narratives Shared Crucial Assumptions
   a. Both traced key elements of the West (whether Magical Moments or Original Sins) back to ancient Greek
4. The Grand Narrative Was Both a Version of Modern History and a Description of the Ideal Modern Western Identity
   a. "Progress meant moving from subjection, poverty, disease, superstition, and violence to democracy, prosperity, health, science, and peace both domestic and international."
   b. But its authors "unhistorically ignored those areas of past cultures not compatible with the modern liberal West.
   c. Fallacy: "The Grand Narrative assumed what it set out to explain: that the West existed, and that it was good."

E. SUMMARY OF THE NARRATIVE: CRUCIAL TURNING POINTS AND HEROES DEFINED THE MAGIC MOMENTS OF THE WEST

1. History Began in the Ancient Near East: Mesopotamia and Egypt
   a. Irrigation and Autocratic Power [cf. Karl Wittfogel's hydraulic theory of oriental despotism]
2. Israel: **Monotheism**'s Distinction between the Divine and Human
   a. Moral value of individual human acts
   b. Human attention directed to understanding nature
3. Greece

a. **Socrates**: the inventor of moral individualism and first martyr for truth and freedom of expression
b. Cult of the Greeks launched by German romantics and idealists [Heinrich Schliemann, discoverer of Troy, had a house in Athens, now a numismatic museum]

4. Rome
   a. Two Contributions: ***Pax Romana*** (Roman peace) and **Roman law** [progenitor of European civil law and international law traditions]
5. Christianity
   a. Modern democracy had its "roots in the classical political philosophy of freedom as the obligation to participate in civic life, in the Roman respect for law and duty, and in Christianity seen as an ethical teaching about **social justice** and the **moral equality** of all human beings."
   b. But a contradiction in this Western synthesis of Rome and Christianity arose, although largely ignored during the heyday of the Grand Narrative, because most Americans remained committed to a more conservative Christianity
   c. The earlier synthesis was a process that took several centuries until after Constantine's conversion
6. Voyage of Christopher Columbus in 1492
   a. Coincided with the high point of the Renaissance and the fall of Granada, which marked the culmination of the Spanish ***Reconquista*** [reconquest from the Moors]
7. Dozens of Magic Moments of Progress Followed
8. Theme of Universality
9. Freedom and Its Consequences
   a. The courage of Martin Luther
   b. The rediscovery of classical civilization and all its riches [especially after the fall of Constantinople in 1453]
   c. The idea of an unvaried human nature
10. Five Magic Moments
    a. Defeat of the Spanish Armada, 1588
    b. Glorious Revolution, 1688-89
    c. American Revolution, 1776-1787
    d. Emancipation of slaves, 1863
    e. Atlantic Charter of 1941
11. Problems of the Grand Narrative in Its Common Form: A Function of Its Necessary Place in a Crowded Curriculum
    a. Few stories and a lot of condensed ideas
    b. Teleology: it was a story with the goal of building the image of the West
    c. Oversimplification: "History is strong drink, and the Grand Narrative turned it into soda pop."
12. The Fate of the Grand Narrative Was Part of the Fate of Modern American Liberalism
    a. "The opening shots in . . . the American culture wars . . . [also] shattered the outerworks of American liberalism."

F. THE FOURTH STEP: TO DISENTANGLE THE HISTORY OF WESTERN IDENTITY FROM THE MORALIZING DISTORTIONS OF THE GRAND NARRATIVE AND ITS DETRACTORS

G. A FIFTH STEP REMAINS: ASK WHAT THE FUTURE HOLDS
1. "Recovering a Western Identity Free of the Twin Moralisms of the Old and the New Liberalism Frees Us . . . to Understand the True Stakes of Western Survival in the Third Millennium."
   a. It is "a story of creativity and destruction, of joy and tragedy, of loss as well as gain."

b. "But understanding that story permits us to draw the only genuinely moral lessons of history: . . . how civilizations grow, not as icons of perfection or evil, but as social and individual realities."

2. The History of the West Is the Story of Two Great Syntheses
   a. The synthesis of ancient, Christian, and Germanic cultures in late antiquity
   b. The synthesis of liberty, reason, and development -- or democracy, science, and capitalism – that defined modernity
3. Both Are Part of a Continuous Story; the Second, Modern Synthesis Grew Out of the First and Could Not Have Happened Without It

Review

march through the institutions	adversary culture	mass higher education
assimilation	catalyst of the Grand narrative	John Herman Randall, Jr.
Robert Hutchins	Mortimer Adler	Will Durant
deconstructionism	moralism	Magic Moments
irrigation and autocratic power	monotheism	Socrates
Pax Romana	social justice	moral equality
Reconquista	Five Magic Moments	two great syntheses

CHAPTER TWO: THE BATTLE OVER HELLAS

Outline

A. GRAND NARRATIVE (49-57)
   1. Historical Background
   2. Literature
      a. **Homer**
         (1) Astonishing features of the poems
      b. The Trojan War
      c. Homeric Epics: the common patrimony of all Greek speakers
   3. Science and Technology
      a. **Thales** and the solar eclipse of May 28, 585 BC
      b. **Socrates**
         (1) Dialectic
   4. Representational Art
   5. History
      a. **Herodotus** and the **Persian Wars**
         (1) **Demaratus** on ***arête*** (courage)
         (2) **Freedom**: For Xerxes it mean disorganized, for the Greeks it meant willing submission to laws passed by the citizens [and not being subject to alien rule or despotism]
         (3) Object lesson: The Greeks won because they had, not because they were ordered
   6. Democracy
   7. **Thucydides**: **Funeral Oration of Pericles**
      Non-participant is a useless man: idiot
   8. *Arête*
   9. Summary
      a. Problems with the narrative

B. REMOTE ORIGINS OF THE MODERN CULT OF GREECE (57-60)
   1. Conquest of Greece by Rome
      a. It began as an act of cultural homage: "Captive Greece took captive Her savage conqueror" (Horace)
   2. **Philhellenism**

a. Wealthy Romans wrote and thought in Greek
(1) Cultural pilgrimages [early version of the Grand Tour]
b. **Stoicism**: cosmopolitan ideal

3. **Plutarch**
a. The point of the *Lives* was to reveal character and its role in public affairs
4. Isidore of Seville: *Etymologies*
5. Role of Monks in the Period in Which the West Achieved Its Identity
a. By then, Greek civilization had faded from Western knowledge
6. Renewed Interest in Greece During the Renaissance
a. Tentative return of philhellenism
b. **Marsilio Ficino**
7. Recovery of Greek Literature
8. English Renaissance Gave Way to the Rising Tide of English Puritanism
9. College
a. Its original purpose was devotional
b. Purposeless drifting in the 18C after the medieval order dissolved
c. Revival of classical scholarship filled the void but fellows were like monks
d. Ancient Greece as interpreted by the new scholarship became an ersatz religion

C. MODERN ORIGINS OF THE CULT OF GREECE (60-64)

1. **Johann Wolfgang von Goethe**
a. **"**Goethe believed that Christianity was declining and wanted to create a new religion for a free, natural humanity."
b. Greeks seen as both the origins of civilization and the model for a new civilization of the West
c. What Eliza Butler called "the tyranny of Greece over Germany" began
2. **Johann Joachim Winckelmann**, 1760s-70s
a. Apollo of Belvedere
3. Two **Doctrines of Art Appreciation**
a. An act of intuitive appropriation must be followed by intellectual analysis and explanation
b. Greek art is uniquely capable of expressing nature: human emotions and beauty
4. Political Freedom
a. Truthfulness to nature
b. Nature elevates
5. Generation of the 1780s-1790s
a. Germany was political weak but culturally at its peak
5. Goethe's Philosophy of Nature
a. Second renaissance began after Winckelmann's death
b. Man as a creator
c. Interaction of self and nature
7. Philosophy of Beauty, Art, and Nature
a. "One of the points where the esoteric West and its traditions of secret knowledge and inner transformation [the Hermetic tradition] met and influenced the exoteric West of public identity."

D. ROMAN TYRANNY OVER FRANCE AND ITS NEIGHBORS' REACTIONS (64-69)

1. **Classicism**
a. Pierre Corneille, 1630s
b. Louis XIV
c. French revolutionaries turned to Roman Republican models
d. Two traditions inspired the revolutionaries:
(1) How Romans won their liberty and expelled their oppressive king
(2) How the Republic repeatedly defended itself against overwhelming odds
e. Robespierre justified the September Massacres by quoting Cicero

f. Napoleon took the title of consul and modeled himself after Augustus

2. Greek Prestige Enhanced in Britain and Germany
   a. Britain's struggle against Napoleonic France compared with the cohesion of the Greek city-states during Persian Wars
      (1) Britain was a cohesive national state with a single center of government
   b. In Germany, "the French conquests produced not a national resistance movement but rather fragmentation, ignominious squabbling, and unseemly opportunism."
      (1) It was divided into hundreds of states, provinces, principalities, and two religions
3. Scholarly Reaction in Germany in 1807
   a. **Barthold Niebuhr** (historian who became Prussia's ambassador to the Vatican): French attacks resembled the Macedonian invasion of Greece
   b. **Wilhelm von Humboldt** (founder of the University of Berlin): The Germans represented the Greeks to modern Europe
   c. **Johann Gottlieb Fichte** (Idealist philosopher who promoted public education): "The German mission was to bring moral enlightenment through universal education" because "the Germans were the universal, the absolute, the most natural of all nations."
4. Romantic Philosophy
   a. Fichte: The self-conscious individual is the center and sum of all reality
   b. **Friedrich Hölderlin**: The vision of the enlightened poet
      (1) Anticipated Nietzsche's Apollonian and Dionysian types
      (2) French Revolution heralded a "second antiquity"
5. German Thinkers and Poets Saw Themselves as Greek Victims of Roman (French) Imperialism
   a. "This parallelism strengthened the tyranny of Greece over Germany and ultimately gave further impetus to scholarship on Greece."
   b. "The lessons drawn were obvious: national cohesion, martial vigor, athletic training, and indoctrination of youth."
6. **Pro-Spartan Bias** of the Germans
   a. Julius Beloch and Helmut Berve
   b. Thucydides: Athens lost the war because the citizens listened to demagogues who promised riches or easy victories
7. British Regard for Herodotus
   a. **Aeschylus**' *The Persians*: Persian ***hubris***
   b. Germans had little use for Herodotus, being "rational pessimists"
      (1) But accepted "his account of how poverty and strict laws made a people martial. Heroic, and able to defeat superior forces."
      (2) "Gradually, the idea of the nation as a collective entity, morally superior to the individual, replaced Goethe's and Hölderlin's natural man as the focus of German philhellenism."

E. ON THE ROAD TO THE MARTIAL PESSIMISTS (69-72)

1. **Friedrich Nietzsche**
   a. ***The Birth of Tragedy***, 1872
      (1) Attack on optimistic rationalism of Athenian democracy, liberals, and socialists
2. Nietzsche's Diagnosis of Culture
   a. "It is not possible to live with truth."
   b. The will to truth often conceals agendas of power
3. Greek Civilization Was Shaped Fundamentally by Apollo and Dionysus [cf. perhaps Elinor and Marianne Dashwood in Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility*]
   a. **Apollo**: God of clarity, art, culture
      (1) Apollonian experience: contemplative, calm, tranquil
      (2) It sought to create and enjoy a "world of beautiful appearance as

a release from [the struggle of] becoming."

b. **Dionysus**: God of ecstasy, abandon, and primal nature

(1) "The Dionysiac expressed the pain of becoming 'actively, with subjective feeling, as the raging lust of the creator, who also knows the fury of the destroyer.'"

4. Dionysian Element Found in the Ecstatic and Orgiastic Experience of Tragedy

a. T. S. Eliot and Rainer Maria Rilke on the balance of the two

b. "This beauty, inspiring awe and fear in the beholder, was, to Nietzsche , the necessary core of art."

5. Nietzsche's Program

a. Focus on **cathartic relief**: ***catharsis***=cleansing, purging, purifying

6. *Birth of Tragedy* Was Reactionary as History

a. It retained a Magic Moment view of the Greeks even as philologists and archeologists were analyzing the surviving evidence

F. ULRICH VON WILAMOWITZ-MOELLENDORF'S REBUTTAL (72-74)

1. His Background
2. His 1872 Attack on Nietzsche's *Birth of Tragedy*
3. His Final Work Was a Paradoxical Mixture of Scholarship and Faith
4. Apogee of the Tyranny of Greece over Europe Prior to WWI

a. But it was just then that Spengler launched the first serious blow against the idea of the West as the child of Greece

G. **OSWALD SPENGLER** (74-76)

1. ***Decline of the West***
2. Rejection of the Cult of Greece

a. Decline of Greece began with the Peloponnesian War

3. Greeks Were Illiterate for Much of Their Early History

a. but western culture is inconceivable without writing

4. Greek History Writing Was Also Very Different

a. Victorian historiography depended on accurate chronology

b. The Greeks had not universally recognized dating system

5. Spengler's Multicultural Philosophy of History

H. GREEK *ETHOS* (76-83)

"The Grand Narrative saw the Greeks as founders of democracy and . . . of the individualist morality and ethical teachings of the West."

1. West's Ethic of Compassion (represented by Hölderlin and **George Grote**)

a. Whether the Greeks had such an ethic: **Hector and Andromache**

(1) Hector's pity limited by the *arête* of his warrior's pride

(2) Contrast with Christian ethical views

(3) Greek view: "Fame and honor were the only things that the gods could never take away from a man."

b. Another Illustration: **Priam and Achilles**

(1) Shame (*aideisthai*) and Pity (*eleeinai*)

(2) "When Achilles 'knew himself,' he realized that he was risking divine wrath by venting his rage on Hector's body, and relented."

3. "Pity and **Compassion,** to the Greeks, Were Comprehensible Only if They Served Pride and the Drive for Fame."

a. Gratuitous pity seen as a defect of character

(1) **Tacitus** condemned the Jewish teaching that **infanticide and abortion** were sinful as a 'sinister and revolting' doctrine."

4. The Question of Pity Marks a Religious Difference: Christian/Liberal vs. Greek

a. Christian: God loves his human creatures and wants them to be saved

(1) Christian/liberal belief in justice and in the value of human life

b. Greek gods were "indifferent to the fate of human beings, whom they had not created."

(1) "The **purpose of life** was to seek glory while not offending the gods" [which leads to **nemesis**]

(2) **Tacitus**: “The gods care not for our safety, but for our punishment.”

5. Human Crime and Divine Punishment
   a. The Greatest Crimes Were Violations of the Divine Order of Nature: Killing Your Relatives, Incest, Breaking Oaths, Betrayal
      (1) “In the famous cases of legend, the perpetrator either did not know he was committing a crime or had no choice.” [René Girard cites “mimetic desire” and “scapegoating”
      (2) An example of the first was King **Oedipus**
      (3) An example of the second was **Agamemnon** [part of the larger curse of the house of Pelops]
6. Hector and Agamemnon Demonstrated the Fundamental Difference Between Ancient Religion and the Religion of the Old West: Christianity
   a. “The Greeks were obliged to obey the gods and accept fate, but the gods had no responsibility in return.” [By contrast, covenants between God and men lay at the heart of the Bible].
   b. “The purpose of self-knowledge was to remember that you were mortal and to avoid the confidence or arrogance (*hubris*) of excessive pride in your skill or good fortune. The man who forgot himself provoked the goads and brought down their vengeance [*nemesis*].”
   c. “These **cosmic rules** were not made up by the gods but were part of the impersonal structure of the universe, of necessity (*anangke*), fate (*moira*), or destiny (*heimarmene*).”
   d. “A Greek prayer rested not on divine promises, for the goads made none, but on the hope of catching a god’s favorable attention at the right moment.”
7. The Western Idea of Religion Remained Christian Even in the Era of Secularization
   a. Man fell from grace; God provided the means of redemption

I. GEORGE GROTE (83-86)
1. The Progressive Cult of Greece: Grote’s *History of Greece*
2. German and English Visions of Greece Contrasted
   a. Germany: Apolitical, aesthetic vision of beauty remote from the real world [*Idealism* or Transcendentalism]
   b. England: “To the progressive philhellenists, the Greek essence of the West was democracy.”
3. Geopolitics, Liberalism, and Good Fortune Permitted a Golden Vision of Greece as the Birthplace of Democracy and a Model for Further Reform [the Greek war for independence in the 1820s captured the imagination of much of Europe]
   a. **John Stuart Mill**, the founder of modern or reform liberalism: **Battle of Marathon**
   b. Victorian system of elite education established on philhellenism
4. Later German Pessimists, Such as Oswald Spengler, Concluded that Greece Was an Irrelevant or Dangerous Model
   a. Greek democracy sapped the martial vigor of the nation
   b. Greek culture concealed irrational, violent depths
5. Survival of Britain Due to Its Insularity
   a. In the British view, it was due to their invincible patriotism, inventiveness, self-reliance, and craftsmanship
   b. The rediscovery of the Greeks was added to this cultural mix
6. **George Grote**: Banker, co-founder of the University of London, Benthamite, promoter of the Reform Act of 1832
7. Victorian View of Greece

J. SOCRATIC INDIVIDUALISM (86-91)
1. **Benjamin Constant**, 1819: Modern Liberty Marks a Genuine Advance
   a. 18C Quarrel of the Ancients and the Moderns

b. Moderns fatally undermined the prestige of the West's Christian past
c. Constant launched a new attack against the ancients

2. Greek Liberty
   a. Rights of individuals were unknown: "The ancient Greeks defined liberty as the right to participate in government, not as the right to choose and pursue your own private goals."
3. **Trial of Socrates**
   a. Blasphemy Charge: He struck at the legitimacy of the city
   b. His Uselessness: He did not share in the political life
   c. Athenians wanted him ostracized, not dead
   d. His role as "gadfly"
   e. Verdict
4. Socrates' Trial and Death: One of the Defining Moments of the West
   a. He single-handedly created moral philosophy and was the first known example of a radical methodological and moral individualist
5. **Peloponnesian War**
   a. Disaster of the Sicilian expedition
   b. Thirty Tyrants and their association with Socrates
   c. Restoration of the democracy
6. Populist Backlash
   a. Socrates' fate "showed that democratic societies . . . were perhaps not the safest places to offend popular sentiment."
7. **I. F. Stone**'s *The Trial of Socrates*
   a. Nature of **Virtue**: Does it come from character (Aristotle and the democratic theorists) or a superior form of knowledge available only to the few (the antidemocrats Socrates and Plato)?
   b. Two modern Socratic Thinkers, Kierkegaard and Nietzsche, were both "Old Westerners dismayed by the superficial, leveling. trivializing forces of the New West."
8. Illiberality of Socratic Individualism: How individual freedom is defined depends on how members of the culture define human nature

K. PIERRE MANENT ON THE MODERN WESTERN OR LIBERAL PERSONALITY (91-93)

1. **Pierre Manent**: Paradox of the Modern Western or Liberal Personality
   a. Dogmatic, absolute belief in freedom and autonomy, and hence in democracy and human rights
   b. Modern political philosophy tends to deny absolutes and the existence of human nature
   c. "Democracy was the form of politics, social interaction, and personal behavior most compatible with the claim that there was no such thing as human nature."
2. **Purpose of Political Society**: Modern vs. Ancient Greek View
   a. "In democratic theory, individuals pursuing their own goods jointly produced and protected the liberty of all."
   b. Greek view: "Political society was an arena of competition;" its purpose "was not to protect individual desires, but to find and maintain the just balance between the goods and the goals sought by the incompatible desires of varying excellences."
3. **Primary Political Virtue**
   a. Ancient Greece: "**Magnaminity** [great-heartedness] was ambition, skill, constancy, courage, and moderation rolled into one – the mark of the superior man."
   b. Western Democratic modernity: "**Collaboration** . . . required . . . the humility to recognize that achievement rested on interdependence."
4. The Difference Can Be Traced to the **Influence of Christianity**
   a. Desire, conscience, and will must be instructed by faith and humility
   b. The Christian teaching of original sin made modern democracy possible

c. "The democratic pursuit of individual autonomy needed the balance of humility if it was not to degenerate into anarchy or the rule of some ideology."

L. CRITIQUE OF THE CULT OF GREECE: A SUMMATION (93-94)
1. Superior Methods said to Originate with the Greeks
2. Realities of Ancient Greece and the Independent Reality of Western Civilization Were Both Obscured
3. Question of the Nature of the Connection between Them
   a. For the West to emerge, Greece had to die
   b. Critics altogether dismissed the Western heritage as wholly bad
   c. The reconstructed optimist narrative of the 1990s was future-oriented and had little historical depth
4. Summary

Review

Homer	Thales	Socrates
Herodotus	Demaratus on *arête*	Thucydides
Funeral Oration of Pericles	philhellenism	Stoicism
Plutarch	Marsilio Ficino	J. W. von Goethe
J. J. Winckelmann	doctrines of art appreciation	classicism
B. Niebuhr	W. von Humboldt	J. G. Fichte
F. Hölderlin	pro-Spartan bias	*hubris* of the Persians
Aeschylus	Friedrich Nietzsche	*The Birth of Tragedy*
Apollo and Dionysus	Oswald Spengler	*Decline of the West*
Hector and Andromache	Achilles and Priam	infanticide and abortion
purpose of life	Oedipus	Agamemnon
John Stuart Mill	George Grote	Benjamin Constant
Peloponnesian War	I. F. Stone	Pierre Manent
purpose of political society	primary political virtue	influence of Christianity

CHAPTER THREE: THE BURDEN OF ROME

Outline

A. THE ROMAN LEGACY (95-99)
1. Cleopatra's Triumphal Visit to Rome
2. **Battle of Actium**: Another Symbolic Instance (cf. Herodotus's *The Persian Wars*) of the Struggle of the West Against the East, Liberty vs. Despotism
   a. Not until Roman times did "the polarity of West and East" begin "taking on a sustained geopolitical significance that never since entirely faded from view."
   b. Geopolitical Importance: It was a major ideological building block of the East-West divide, a defense of Roman laws, and an affirmation of the Roman ethic of parsimony
3. **Three Accomplishments** (Elements of the Roman Legacy)
   a. Establishing the East-West line or boundary: The **Roman *limes***
   b. Westernizing the Greeks
   c. Creating her own myth of empire
4. Despite Its Origins in the Romantic Cult of Greece, the Narrative Was Mainly an American Invention
   a. When mass education was later introduced to Germany, conservative scholarship was purged in favor of a pan-Western outlook, which meshed well with French cult of Rome
   b. This new continental Grand Narrative found an incarnation in the European Common Market and the later European Union

5. Character of the Continental Narrative [see the above Three Accomplishments]
6. Issue of Greek vs. Roman Roots
7. Implications of a Roman Starting Point for the West
8. Grand Narrative View: Rome Was Original Only in Developing Tools of Power
    a. Rome seen as a transmission belt
9. The Romans Established a Civilization around the Entire Mediterranean Shore
    a. The culture survived the retreat of organized imperial administration and climbed back up the gradient of civilization
10. Rome was an Active Element in the Late Classical Period's Cultural Synthesis

B. ROMAN HISTORY (99-105)
1. Peculiarities of Roman History
    a. It was a long story
    b. ***Libertas*** (Roman idea of freedom): early monarchy vs. the oligarchic Republic bound by the rule of law
2. **Tacitus**: His long view in terms of centuries
    a. Two odd features of Roman historical writing: the lengthy of the time involved and the hatred of kings (*libertas* meant freedom from monarchy)
3. *Libertas*: Aristocratic Freedom
    a. Freedom of a social/cultural elite not to bow to the authority of one man
    b. **Alexis de Tocqueville**: Democratic freedom might easily slide into conformity; aristocratic *libertas* is the best defense against tyranny
4. Traditional Republican Values
    a. **Livy**'s stories of early Rome
    b. Liberal History Lesson: The cause of the Fall of Rome was the tyranny of the empire and the dishonesty, hypocrisy, and corruption it generated
5. Most Important Legend of Early Roman History: Story of the Fall of the Monarchy
    a. Contributions of the Good Kings
    b. **Tarquin Superbus** (the Proud)
        (1) Forced labor on the sewers
        (2) Portent and visit to the Delphic oracle
        (3) Rape of **Lucretia**
        (4) Coup led by **Lucius Junius Brutus**
        (5) Brutus exercises the ***patria potestas*** after his sons turn traitor
        (6) Tarquin defeated after Brutus is slain
        (7) **Horatius** held the bridge until the enemy could be defeated
6. Republican Virtue
    a. **Niccolò Macchiavelli**: *virtù* [manliness]
    b. Exaltation of the civic virtue of early Rome
7. Thomas **Lord Macaulay**: *Lays of Ancient Rome*
8. Roman Ideals: Chastity, Pride, Inflexible Justice, Aristocratic Freedom, Modesty, Noble Simplicity
9. Legend of **Cincinnatus**
10. Grand Narrative's Disapproval of Aristocratic Values and Devaluation of These Stories

C. MODERN HISTORIOGRAPHY (105-07)
1. **Barthold Niebuhr**: Rules of conduct for writing about ancient history
2. Critical Methods: Niebuhr and Theodor Mommsen
3. Rejection of the Stories of the Kings
4. Impact of Archeology
5. Scepticism and the impact of two waves

D. BATTLE OVER ROME AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE (107-13)
1. Eusebius: providential timing of the rise of Christianity
2. French Revolution's Roman Models
    (1) **Jacques-Louis David**
3. Britain and Germany: Roman model was suspect
4. Second Classic 19C Work of Ancient History after Grote's *History of Greece*

a. **Theodor Mommsen**'s *Roman History*
b. Rome's great contribution: the idea of the West

5. **Ernest Barker**: Progressive Liberal
   a. Justification of Rome in *The Legacy of Rome*
      (1) Universal Reason of the **Stoics**: "All men are by nature equal"
      (2) Stoic ideal of social life: ordered communities
      (3) Devaluation of political activity
      (4) Stoic elite eventually came to be reconciled to the empire
   b. Christianity's "fatal" replacement of Stoicism's secular faith
6. **Eric Dodds**'s *The Greeks and the Irrational*
   a. Analysis of *The Bacchae* by **Euripides**
   b. 3C's Age of Anxiety depicted in Freudian terms as a collective neurosis
      a. Dodds drew parallels between 3C "religious paranoia" and 20C
7. Impossible 4C Dilemma for Those Who Wished to Uphold the Roman Empire
   a. Stoicism commanded little allegiance as a religion
   b. The emperors turned to Christianity to hold together the empire's religious unity [religion=binding together], but its adherents did not consider imperial order as their highest goal
8. Struggle Between the Western and Eastern Elements
   a. Barker and others blamed Eastern doctrines and influences
      (1) Rome's only contribution to the idea of the West was in its early republican phase, when the old Roman virtues of thrift, honor, and loyalty survived
9. Rebuttal by **Fergus Millar** in *The Roman Near East*
   a. The culture of the Eastern Mediterranean was a direct continuation of the Hellenistic culture
      (1) Roman imperial power became the framework within which society and culture flourished
10. **Mommsen**'s Tradition of Liberal History-Writing

E. THE GRAND NARRATIVE AND ITS DEFICIENCIES (113-14)
1. Roman Adaptations
   a. East-West line shifted to the Adriatic and middle Danube
2. A Second Legend: Romans as Empire-Builders
   a. Catholic Europe: Myth of Rome as a promise of law, order, and piety
3. The Grand Narrative Downplayed the Role of the Romans
   a. Cult of Greece adopted, forgetting how the Greeks came to be Western
   b. Myth of Rome's rustic innocence
4. Collapse of the Grand Narrative Left the Cult of Greece Untouched
   a. "The entire Roman design of a geopolitically Westernized Greco-Roman culture was only one half of the foundation of the West. The other half was the synthesis of that culture with Christianity." [cf. Sorokin]
5. The Romans, in the Grand Narrative, Abhorred Innovation
   a. Virtue was the virtue of the past: ***mos maiorum*** [way of the ancestors]

F. ROMAN EMPIRE (114-17)
1. Themes of ***Patria Potestas*** and Filial Loyalty [Piety]
2. Magic Moments: Stories of Duty and Tradition
   a. Law and Empire were the most notable Roman contributions
3. Empire Grew Out of the Inveterate Tendency of the Romans to Seek Security through Control
4. Gallic Raids, 386 BC
   a. Acquisition of Cisalpine Gaul, 222 BC; road-building followed
   b. Transalpine Gaul was added in 122 BC to secure Cisalpine Gaul
   c. Iberia was seen as a potential threat after the Second Punic War
   d. Spain conquered but Massilia left unprotected against raids from interior
   e. Gaul proper was secured by Julius Caesar: *The Gallic Wars*
   f. Augustus turned his attention to the Germans

5. **Arminius** Destroyed Three Roman Legions, 9 AD
6. Roman Borders Became Fixed, 50-270 AD; Flow Then Began to Reverse
    a. Germans began occupying Roman territory by the late 4C; the capital was shifted to Constantinople in 324 AD
7. The Empire Was Presented as a Restoration of the Republic
    a. Augustus was called the ***princeps***: the first citizen
    b. Thus monarchy was introduced in the name of the republic

G. LIBERAL VS. RADICAL VERSIONS OF THE NARRATIVE (117-19)
1. Rome Treated as Secondary
    a. Latin language regarded as less expressive
    b. Greek achievements were seen as "possessions for ever"
2. Rome Defined Largely by War and Power
3. Grand Narrative Offered Two Different Perspectives
    a. Condescending view of Rome as crude and rustic, virtuous, and fundamentally well intentioned
    b. Left-wing view sees Rome as a destructive conqueror: *e.g.*, the novel and 1960 film *Spartacus*
        (1) Evidence of slaves was accepted in law only if it had been extracted by torture
        (2) Modern appeal of Spartacus's tragic grandeur

H. NEW SYNTHESIS ON EARLY ROME (119-26)
Contributions of Rome as noted by key figures in literary and archeological revisionism: **Arnaldo Momigliano**, and his pupils Peter Brown and Timothy Cornell
1. **East-West Distinction**
    a. **Norman Davies**
    b. George Grote: Idea of the West originated after the Persian Wars with the line set at the **Hellespont** (inc. the Bosporus and Dardanelles)
        (1) Roman contribution was to shift it westward to the Adriatic, thus excluding Greece
    c. Idea of Europe: legend of Europa
    d. Herodotus's uses of "Europe"
    e. Theopompus
2. **Westernization of Greek Culture**
    a. Roman task was to preserve the best of Greece while maintaining a strict vigilance against the threat of eastern decadence
    b. Threat of the East embodied in Cleopatra
    c. Caracalla and Geta, Diocletian's Tetrarchy,
    d. Europe as Middle-Earth: Aurelian's defeat of Tetricus and Zenobia
    e. End of the western empire, 476 AD
3. Image of Rome as the Bringer of Order, Empire, and Civilization
    a. The living legacy: names for political practices and institutions,
    b. Dream of European unity: Holy Roman Empire, European Union
    c. The idea of Rome survived in the Roman Catholic Church
    d. Rome as a subject and model of elite education: Latin language
    e. Paul's Roman citizenship permitted him to spread Christianity
    f. Two sides of the debate on Rome
        (1) Anglo-American liberals with their Christian-inspired, postimperial guilt
        (2) French and Italians for whom Rome is their history
4. Two Different Narratives: A Summary
    a. Continental: Synthesis of Rome, Christianity, and modern social democracy
    b. Liberal: Synthesis of Greece, the Renaissance, and individualism

I. THE BURDEN OF ROME: A SUMMATION (126-28)
1. Romans Separated Freedom from Equality
2. East-West Dilemma

a. The empire was limited in reality to a specific geographical space
(1) Geopolitical and geocultural ambiguity: image of virtuous but barbaric Rome vs. cultured but dangerous East

3. Constantine's Decision
a. Empire recentered its geopolitical base on Constantinople

4. Christianity
a. The bishop of Rome did not move, thus saving the West
b. The religious power moved west as Roman political power moved east
(1) Roman imperial power survived in the Byzantine empire
(2) In the marginal zone of the geographical West that the legacy of Rome joined with Christianity and the barbarians to produce the synthesis of the Old West

5. Question of Why Rome Fell

Review

Battle of Actium	three accomplishments	*libertas*
Tacitus	Alexis de Tocqueville	Livy
Tarquin Superbus	Lucretia	Lucius Junius Brutus
Horatius	republican virtue	Niccolò Machiavelli
Lord Macaulay	Cincinnatus	Barthold Niebuhr
Jacques-Louis David	Theodor Mommsen	Ernest Barker
Eric Dodds	Euripides	Fergus Millar
mos maiorum	*patria potestas*	Arminius
princeps	Arnaldo Momigliano	east-west distinction
Norman Davies	Hellespont	the two narratives

CHAPTER FOUR: CHRISTIANITY AND THE FALL OF ROME

Outline

A. IMPERAL ROME IN THE POPULAR IMAGINATION (129-35)
1. Samuel Bronston's *The Fall of the Roman Empire*
a. Will Durant
b. Views of Marcus Aurelius and Commodus
c. Film's Stoic and humanitarian moralism
d. Message: Imperial power, arrogance, low cunning, greed, and violent disregard of alien cultures go together
e. Remedy: A great, world-bestriding power should offer the world's diverse peoples a Stoic commonwealth of responsible freedom

2. Marcus Aurelius: Vision of a multicultural world community
a. Ideal match for the 1960s liberal political sensibility
b. Right-wing seems to prefer explanations in terms of foreign policy

3. **Peter Brown**: Rediscovery of Late Antiquity
a. Post-Marcus Aurelius: Formative era of the later West
b. Most decisive new element: Rise of Christianity to become the religion of the Roman Empire

4. Preconditions of the Synthesis That Produced the Old West
a. Christianization of the empire and the rise of late antiquity

5. New Religious Movements

6. Craving for Personal Faith: Platonist elitism was insufficient

7. Cult of the Goddess Chance

B. CHRISTIANITY AS A PERSONAL RELIGION (135-39)
1. Synthesis
2. Christianization of the Roman Empire
3. Appeal to the Marginalized

a. Tacitus: Christian view of women an abomination in Roman eyes
b. **Arnold Toynbee**: Christians were the key element of the "internal proletariat"

4. Its Spread among Influential and Prominent People
   a. Reaction against low value placed on women and children
   b. Conversion of husbands by Christian women
   c. Story of Perpetua and Felicitas
   d. In early Christianity, women enjoyed a favorable sex ratio and therefore greater freedom
5. Changes of Values and Behavior
   a. Ambrose vs. Theodosius, 390: Foundation of the Old West
      (1) Massacre in Thessalonica
      (2) **Theodosius**: ritual abasement and absolution at the cathedral
      (3) First of many encounters of West's two principles of legitimacy

C. QUESTION: HOW WERE THE RISE OF CHRISTIANITY, THE FALL OF ROME, AND THE RISE OF THE WEST RELATED? (139-43)
1. Christianity and the Fall of Rome
2. Reticence of the Grand Narrative
   a. Reasons
      (1) Its progressive bias made it uncomfortable with eras of decline
      (2) It was secular and liberal; prejudiced against the "Dark Ages"
      (3) Religion as a force in human affairs did not fit liberal world view
3. **Edward Gibbon**: *Decline and Fall of the Roman Empire*
   a. Short answer: The triumph of barbarism and religion
   b. Gibbon's two personal crises: conversion to Catholicism (and then to unbelief) and his broken engagement to Suzanne Curchod
   c. Thereafter Gibbon confined his passions to history
   d. Gibbon's Thesis: The strong oppress the weak in a society ruled by ambition; religion provided high-sounding reasons for policies and behavior motivated by baser passions, and discourages active virtues

D. THE CONTINUING DEBATE (143-46)
1. **André Piganiol** vs. Étienne Gautier: Was Roman civilization murdered?
   a. The interesting point is why theories were presented, and by whom
2. Idea of Western Civilization as a Synthesis of Greek Culture, Roman Order, Christianity, and a Shift of the East-West Line: Neutral Description or Argument in Opposition to a Threatening, Corrupt, or Immoral East?
   a. **Hans Erich Stier**: East that subverted and infiltrated ("orientalization and barbarization") ancient culture, leading to "anarchistic individualism and violent selfishness"
      (1) Christian Democratic idea of the West: A purified, Western Christianity "saved the West from the Eastern stranglehold."
   b. **Alfons Dopsch**: German invaders did not destroy culture but maintained it and improved the standard of living of average people
3. **Alexander Demandt** Catalogued 210 Explanations
4. Pre-Enlightenment **Standard Explanation** for Rome's Fall: Decadence Caused By Excessive Wealth, Pride, and Luxury
   a. **Pythagoras** and Will Durant [cf. Polybius, Ibn Khaldun's *Muqaddimah*]
5. Common Element of Virtually All Accounts: Late Antiquity Was an Era of
   a. Transition between Greco-Roman and Medieval Society

E. THE LATE IMPERIAL PERIOD (146-50)
1. Third Century
   a. "Year of Four Emperors, 69:" Secret of empire was discovered" (Tacitus)
   b. Second "Year," 193, Severan Dynasty (Syrian), Barracks emperors
   c. Gothic invasion of Greece, 269
2. Recovery Began in 270
   a. Strong Emperors: Aurelian, Diocletian, Constantine

3. Division of Government: Geopolitical Shift of the East-West Line
4. Leveling Reforms
    a. **Caracalla** decreed that all free persons were full Roman citizens, 212
    b. Subjects tied more closely to their places of work and residence
    c. **Constantine** declared Christianity legal, 313
    d. **Theodosius** declared Christianity the only legal religion, 381
5. Fourth-Century Changes Strengthened the Empire
    a. Growth in population and economic activity in frontier zones where the Roman army was stationed: North Sea, Central Europe, Syria, Arabia
6. Late Antiquity: Religious, Administrative, Social, and Economic Reforms
    a. Late Empire and Great Church shaped a cultural epoch with own identity
    b. Grand Narrative was dominated by the idea of Three Ages: Antiquity, the Middle Ages, and Modern Times
7. Idea of the Three Ages Was Invented by 15C Renaissance Humanists
    a. Protestants later adopted it in opposition to Four World Empires model **Christoph Cellarius**: Its most decisive formulation, 1685
8. The Idea of **Late Antiquity**
    a. **Jacob Burckhardt**: "lower empire" had disparaging implications
    b. Mommsen saw the "dominate" empire as all new (rule by divine right)
    c. Peter Brown: Christian beliefs gradually transformed religion
9. Church Became Rich and Increasingly Independent: People Gave It Their Wealth
    a. Melania the Elder and Melania the Younger
    b. Such massive piety demonstrated a new mentality and altered the economic balance of the empire
    c. Criticisms by **Gibbon** and **Friedrich Nietzsche**

F. WHY DID ROME FALL? CATHOLIC VIEWS (150-52)
1. Explanations in Terms of Religion and Cultural Crisis Were Related: Religion
    a. **Gibbon** blamed Christianity for undermining civic morale
    b. Christian explanation accepted by three groups: Catholics, liberals, and German nationalists
2. Catholic Views
    a. **Pignaniol** believe the synthesis of church and empire was providential
    b. **Chateaubriand**: Rome fell because of decadence; Christianity saved what it could from the wreckage
3. Secondary Factor: Cultural Crisis
    a. This became the most widespread of the explanatory models in the 20C
    b. Pessimism about reason in the interwar period: *e.g.,* **T.S. Eliot**
    c. **Sigmund Freud**: A powerful influence alongside Nietzsche and Spengler
        (1) Theory of personality: irrationality could be explained rationally
4. **Peter Brown** Began Demolishing This Approach with His Life of Augustine
    a. Religion is a cause of change rather than being a reactive neurosis
    b. "The Fall of Rome [reduced] to an administrative event that allowed the positive forces of Christian fervor and aristocratic regionalism to flourish"

G. SECOND GROUP: LIBERALS (152-57)
1. Liberals Also favored the Religious and Cultural Account of Rome's Fall
    a. Contradictory attitudes: Rome was not liberal, but its order was valuable
    b. Problem: Liberals believed in reason, continuity, and progress in history; decadence, decline, and destruction did not easily fit the story
    c. Defensive liberal interpretation of Rome's fall as a warning
2. **Michael Rostovtzev**
    a. He explained the Fall of Rome in reverse Marxist terms: rise of an uneducated proletariat that ignorantly destroyed the high culture
    b. Trigger for the spiral of decline: 3C military crisis
        (1) Government raised taxes and service obligations in response: peasants and laborers responded by waging their own class war
    c. Peasants and laborers allied with local magnates, 4C

d. New rural coalition invaded the urban elites and destroyed their ability to reproduce the high culture
e. Result: Dumbing down of classical civilization, beginning in the 3C

3. **Santo Mazzarino**: *La fine del mondo antico*, 1959
   a. Christianity was a social revolution, a "democratization" of late imperial culture; contrast with Rostovtzev and Dodds
   b. Fall of Rome because it freed marginal nations and a marginal faith from the dead hand of an empty culture
4. Baron **Montesquieu**: Imperial Overstretch and Conspicuous Consumption Blamed [cf. Paul Kennedy's *Rise and Decline of the Great Powers* and Thorstein Veblen's *The Theory of the Leisure Class*]
   a. More Recent Debates: Leading Elites Wanted Transformation
      (1) This conclusion would subvert earlier views of the Fall of Rome
5. **Oswald Spengler**: The Fall of Rome was inevitable
   a. By entering the imperial epoch ancient civilization surrendered its last shreds of vitality and creativity
6. **Arnold Toynbee**: Outbreak of the Peloponnesian War was the beginning of the end of ancient civilization: Time of Troubles lasted until the rise of imperial Rome
   a. The Roman Empire was the universal empire, the final stage
   b. It gave peace to the world, but it was a stagnant and uncreative peace; its culture was eclectic, derivative, and ultimately fragile
7. **Barthold Niebuhr**: Declining population was a reason for Rome's fall
   a. Pierre Chaunu: Medieval population growth was a contributing factor that played a part in promoting the Reformation
   b. Archeological evidence shows that population decline was not universal

H. THIRD GROUP BLAMES GERMAN NATIONALISM (157-61)

1. The Germans Did It: Germanic Kings Ruled the Western Empire after 476
   a. Domino Effect: Defeat at Adrianople, 378
   b. Gothic Treaty of 382: Visigoths settled on the Roman side of the Danube
   c. Vandal cross the Rhine on New Year's Eve of 406
2. **Demandt**'s Thought Exercise
   a. What if the description of Germans as war-like, proud, freedom-loving, and fecund were true?
   b. Descriptions of Germans: Caesar, Tacitus
3. Warrior Values
   a. Disparaged by all classes of Romans; respected and encouraged among the Germans
   b. **Machiavelli**: "Not gold but good soldiers are the sinew of war"
      (1) Mainspring of Roman decline: Departure of *virtù* and dependence on Goths as mercenaries
4. German Invasions Were Not Unique or Fortuitous
   a. They could be explained anthropologically and geopolitically: tip of the demographic balance occurred in the 3 or 4C with migrations of tribes
5. Every One of the Internal Causes Could Be Turned on Its Head as a Positive
   a. The Problem: These diametrically opposed theories of decline were Insufficient in themselves as explanations; all ignored the Germans
6. Odoacer Deposes Romulus Augustulus, 476, in a Dispute over Land
   a. End of the Western Empire
7. The Christian West: The Germans Did Not Want to Reverse Christianization; They Wanted to Promote It

I. DEMISE OF ANCIENT CIVILIZATION (161-62)

1. **Cassiodorus** Proposed a College of Higher Philosophy But Left Italy
   a. War over Italy between Justinian and the Ostrogoths
   b. Post-war collapse of literacy; Cassiodorus lowered his aims
2. Dark Ages

J. THE AFTERMATH OF WORLD WAR ONE: T. S. ELIOT'S *THE WASTE LAND* (162-68)

1. Survivors of World War One: Pessimistic Poets and Philosophers
    a. Some hoped to recover the synthesis by political means (Carl Schmitt)
    b. For others, it could be recovered only as myth [J.R.R. Tolkien] and metaphysics [Eric Voegelin]
2. **T. S. Eliot**
    a. His early modernist critique of secularism: Like the Surrealists, he wanted to restore myth through modernist poetry
        (1) The West was dying because it had forgotten its tradition
    b. The later Eliot argued that both the Church and the literary tradition of antiquity were needed
    c. West was rejecting its cultural moorings: tradition treated as an enemy
3. Double Consciousness: Air of Counterrevolutionary Subversion
    a. Failed attempts to define the essence of the West in terms comprehensible to modernity
4. Contemporary Context of Eliot's ***The Waste Land***, 1922
    a. Joyce, Pound, Spengler, Rostovtzev
5. Post-WWI Breakdown: Sense of Cultural Decline
    a. West at "the end of its tether" [ref. to H. G. Wells]
6. Double Meaning of Eliot's Title: Echoes of Christian and Celtic Legend
    a. Mythological studies of **Jessie Weston** on legends of the Holy Grail
    b. Her general thesis was subsequently disproved
7. Arthurian Romance
    a. Chrétien of Troyes on Perceval and the Fisher King
8. Structure of *The Waste Land*
    a. Tiresias: Myth of the all-knowing hermaphrodite (cf. Carl Jung)
9. Eliot's Dual Cultural Program
    a. The semi-surrealist modernism of *The Waste Land*
    b. The Christian and Virgilian pedagogy of the 1930s and 1940s
    c. The effort appeared doomed, but was splendid in its defiance
10. Conclusion: It Was the Larger Synthesis of the Ancient Philosopher, the Christian Priest, and the Germanic Warrior That Truly Defined the Old West

Review

Peter Brown	Arnold Toynbee	Theodosius
Edward Gibbon	André Piganiol	Hans Erich Stier
Alfons Dopsch	Alexander Demandt	Rome's Fall: standard account
Pythagoras	Caracalla	Constantine
Christoph Cellarius	Late Antiquity	Jacob Burckhardt
Friedrich Nietzsche	Chateaubriand	T. S. Eliot
Sigmund Freud	Peter Brown	Michael Rostovtzev
Santo Mazzarino	Baron Montesquieu	Oswald Spengler
Barthold Niebuhr	Machiavelli	Cassiodorus
The Waste Land	Jessie Weston	Chrétien de Troyes

CHAPTER FIVE: GERMANIC FREEDOM AND THE OLD WESTERN SYNTHESIS

A. ISSUE OF THE OLD WESTERN IDENTITY (169-72)
1. Liberal Grand Narrative: Review
    a. Idealized Vision of Greece
2. The (Real) **Old West**
    a. Synthesis lasted sixteen hundred years
    b. Out of this Old West came the New West and liberalism
3. Rome and Medieval Europe Downplayed

4. Grand Narrative: Primarily an Exercise in Political Pedagogy
5. Post-1960s Anti-Narratives: Legitimacy of the Old West Rejected
6. Basic Drama of Western Identity Is in the Old West: Power, Freedom, Empire
   a. **Drama of Power**: The liberal denial of this drama led to a paradox: the idea of freedom emerged from that drama
   b. **Universal empire:** constant aspiration of the greatest Old Western rulers
   c. **Old Western Universalism**: Very different from the universalism of the **New West**, whose only legitimate political order is a global civilization of **democratic humanism** divorced from all specific cultural roots
      (1) The **great paradox** of Old Western universalism: the attempts to make it succeed promoted that which undermined it -- the Western idea of political and social freedom
   d. The drama of power is the key to Western identity: Failures to impose universal empire promoted the growth of freedom and strengthened the forces of **pluralism, individualism, and ethnic identity**
7. The Search for Power as the Precondition of Liberty, *e.g.*, Religious Liberty
   a. Other consequences: expansion, slave trade, rise of modern science
   b. All these elements were marked by the red thread of individualism
8. Freedom, Conquest, and Imperialism Were Part of the Old West Synthesis

B. COMPETING VIEWS OF THE GERMANS (172-78)
1. Greek vs. Modern Freedom
   a. The liberal version failed to explain how freedom could be the foundation of the West if it was largely absent between 338 BC and 1776 AD
   b. The Continental narrative emphasized Roman law and institutions
   c. The essential missing element in both was the **Germanic ethos of aristocratic and heroic freedom**
2. Origins of the New Freedom
   a. The new freedom of the New West was rooted in habits, institutions, etc.
   b. Great contribution of the moderate or **Sceptical Enlightenment** was to recognize this historical and institutional rootedness
   c. [Three contrasting models of the **new freedom**:]
3. First Model: **Radical Enlightenment**
   a. Its thinkers "shaped the original pattern of the Grand Narrative in opposite terms, as the story of liberal and secular ideals, long suppressed by force and superstition
   b. Institutional Christianity was seen as an obstacle
   c. Their grievance was against Christendom rather than Christianity; classical liberal *laissez faire* view of morality based on reason
   d. Liberals thus denied the Old Western synthesis and its result
4. Missing from the Narrative Is the Second Model: the **Sceptical Enlightenment**'s **Germanic Model**
   a. The **freedom principle** by which the New West and its liberal apologists defined the West is "itself part of the long and ambiguous history that the New West rejected."
   b. To explain that history, the Sceptical Enlightenment constructed what may be called the Germanic model [cf. Thomas Jefferson]
   c. "Where the Greek model delved into time from Plato to NATO, the **Germanic model** delved into time to understand and define the Old Western synthesis [cf. Francis Lieber, F. A. Hayek, M. Stanton Evans]
5. Reasons for Its Rejection in the 20C: World War I and World War II
   a. Columbia's Contemporary Civilization course: "The war had been a war in defense of liberal democracy, represented by the United States, and against tyranny and barbarism, represented by Germany."
6. **Anti-German Argument**: Germans Regarded as Barbarians and Destroyers
   a. The key claim of the Germanic model was incomprehensible in 1918
   b. **Irony**: American Grand Narrative instead adopted what had originally

been a German invention, the cult of Greece as the origin of the West

7. Attempts to Rehabilitate the Germanic Model Took an Ideological Tack That Made Sure the Model Could Not Survive World War II: **Myth of Superior Blood**
    a. Before Adolf Hitler and his regime discredited doctrines of **racial hierarchy and eugenics** in popular discourse, such doctrines had wide appeal, not least among liberals and progressives
8. Third Model: **Racist Germanic Model** [Really a German/American narrative]
    a. It originated with "**Otto Seeck**'s dysgenic account from 1895 of Rome's fall as due to the 'extermination of the best people,' the argument that the Roman elite committed racial and genetic suicide."
    b. American Immigration: Fears engendered by mass immigration from southern and eastern Europe, *e.g.*, David Starr Jordan
9. **Madison Grant**
    a. Nordic race threatened by war, miscegenation, and democracy
    b. Immigration Act of 1924
    c. Hitler, 1942: "the mobilization of the mob in the name of Christianity meant the end of the ancient world."
10. Tenney Frank and Hitler: Contamination of Greek and Roman Racial Stock
11. Racist Model Discredited after WWII, as Was the Enlightenment Germanic Model
    a. "The defeat of racist Germany in 1945 undermined the doctrine that the Germans were racially superior, and also the proposition that Germans brought freedom to the West."
12. Backward Extension of German **War Guilt**
    a. The Grand Narrative and its Greek model of the West won the day thanks in part to the simplistic equation of ancient and modern Germans
    a. Need to delve into the German contribution

C. GERMANIC INVASIONS (178-81)
1. Ancient Germans
    a. Habitation north of the Celts of central and western Europe
2. Beginning of the Move South, 4-3C BC
    a. Bastarnae
3. Three Tribes: Cimbri, Teutones, Ambrones
    a. "Their fearless disregard of casualties and their mass sacrifice of prisoners terrified the Romans."
4. Ariovistus, 70 BC
5. **Arminius**
    a. He defected from Rome due to honor and luck: **hale** vs.**fey**
    b. Rivalry with Maroboduus, king of the Marcomanni
    c. He first destroyed the Romans, then attacked the Marcomannic kingdom
    d. But "the liberator of Germany" fell to an assassin [statue at New Ulm]
    e. Legend that Arminius was the original "**Siegfried**"
6. Rhine Frontier
    a. Franks and Alemanni invaded Gaul, 406
7. The Community of Identification Was the Nation, or Tribe, and Its King
    a. Celts were called *volcae*; *wealas* or Welsh in English
8. **Franks** [free men]: The dominant tribe by the end of the 5C
9. Two Main Groups: Western and Eastern, But No German Nation
10. No Sense of National Identity before the 11C

D. ENLIGHTENMENT MODEL OF THE GERMANS VS. GRAND NARRATIVE (181-85)
1. **Two French Models**
    a. **One-nation ideology**: Franks assimilated with native Roman population
    b. **Ideology of aristocratic freedom**: Ancient Franks seen as direct ancestors of the **sword nobility**
    c. This ideology was directed against the commoners and the second-ranked **nobility of the robe**
2. **Baron Montesquieu** on the Historical Basis of the Frankish Doctrine

a. Aristocratic doctrine of Frankish freedom converted into a liberal doctrine of general republican liberty under law
b. Source of German and modern liberty: conquest of the Roman Empire
c. His great insight: ordered freedom under a **separation of powers**
d. England's constitution was most friendly to liberty
e. Freedom was born in the forests of Germany [cf. Demaratus]

3. Anglo-American Version
   a. **Edward Coke**: Doctrine of the **Ancient Constitution**
      (1) England had been a mixed monarchy from time of the Britons
      (2) Advice and consent of the nobility in parliament
      (3) Despot could be justly resisted or overthrown
      (4) Civil War myth that the monarchy had been implicitly contractual
4. **David Hume** Exploded the Myth of the Ancient Constitution
   a. "What was significant was that Montesquieu and Hume both diagnosed and praised the birth of modern liberty in the commercial and undespotic society of Britain, and that they both anchored this liberty as a cornerstone of the West."
   b. They developed the notion of ancient Germanic freedom into a notion of modern Germanic freedom
5. Coinage of "Anglo-Saxon"
   a. **John Adams** and **Thomas Jefferson**: "Americans adopted the Germanic model of freedom because it seemed to suggest that their own claims to independence were rooted in history as their ethnic heritage."
6. The Model's Central Claim: Liberty Is the Key to Western Civilization
   a. America was at war with modern Germany when the liberal narrative assumed its definitive form
7. Limitations of the Enlightenment Model
   a. "The Germanic contribution to the West was broader, richer, more significant, and more ambiguous than the model suggested."
   b. Geramns also brought the values of the warrior: honor and luck

E. ANCIENT GERMAN SOCIETY (185-91)

1. Ethical Basis: Luck and Honor; Institutional Basis: Cults, Kings, and Companions
   a. Tribal life had two **fundamental purposes**: worship and war
2. Traditional Genealogy: Descent from Tuisto (Earth-God) and Mannus
3. **King's Magic**
   a. No trace of divinizing rulers; Caesar found some tribes ruled by councils of warriors
   b. Criterion of Merit: Winning battles and repelling attacks; competition
   c. Cultic kings replaced by territorial monarchs
4. Kings and Councils
5. Companions, *Comitatus*, or *Gefolgschaft* [Followers] of the King
   a. Olaf the Fat and the *Bjarkamál*
      (1) Story of Rolf and Roar (Hrothgar)
      (2) Canonization as St. Olaf
6. Common Kinship of the Demonic and Heroic Figures of Legend
   a. Story of *Beowulf*: Fame as the only aftermath a warrior will have
7. Doubleness: Two Faces of the Old Western Synthesis [Axiological (values) and Geopolitical]

F. RISE OF THE WEST (191-96)

1. **Boniface**
   a. Theodor Schieffer's *The Christian Foundation of Europe*
   b. Founder of miissionary order resting on the pope, the Franks, and the energy of the Anglo-Saxon missionaries
2. **Geopolitical Shift of the Papacy**: Popes abandoned the eastern empire and chose the Franks as the co-founders of the West
   a. Role of Irish monks and missionaries

b. Carolingian (Charlemagne) cultural revival helped confirm the ***translatio imperii*** (transfer of power or authority to command)

3. **Augustine**
   a. He had absorbed the classical curriculum but knew it was dying
   b. His works: "descriptions and defenses of a culture he considered fitting for a post-classical, Christian world [cf. Rieff's second world]
4. Missionaries Carried This Renewed Classical Learning and Christian Doctrine beyond the Old Imperial Boundaries
   a. **Irish monasteries** became the repositories of learning and traditions that were lost on the Continent
5. Theme of Exile and Return: European *Émigrés* of the 1930s
   a. Ludwig Bieler's *Ireland: Harbinger of the Middle Ages*: Study of manuscripts of classical authors written during the Dark Ages
6. Irish and Later English Learning Was Astounding
   a. Centers: Kells, York, Jarrow, Winchester
   b. Careful attention paid to Latin grammar and rhetoric
7. Western Civilization Was Also Saved by the **Bargain of Church and State**
   a. Papacy looked eastward until the 720s
   b. **Leo III** vs. **Gregory II**: the **Iconoclastic Controversy**
   c. Empire became more eastern and, from the Western viewpoint, heretical
      (1) What began as a simple shift of the East-West line took shape as an unbridgeable cultural, theological, and civilizational divide
   d. Conversely, the papacy was becoming more Westernized
   e. **Stephen II** transferred his political allegiance from the empire to the king of the Franks in dramatic journey across the Alps
   f. Purpose: Create a new, proper, Catholic empire in the West to be a fit partner for the church
8. **Pirenne Thesis**
   a. Antiquity ended not with the Germanic but with the 7C Islamic invasions, breaking the economic and cultural unity of the Mediterranean
   b. Geocultural Transformation: By 711 Muslims controlled the North African shoreline and Spain, imposing the equivalent of an "iron curtain"
   c. The Mediterranean became the border of three civilizations
   d. Trade stopped for several centuries after the late 7C
9. Pirenne's Thesis Works Better Regarding Constitutional and Religious Change
   a. The popes shifted the geopolitical axis from Rome/Constantinople to Rome/northern Gaul, thus creating the West as a physical entity
10. Result: Religious Synthesis of Papacy and Secular Power, c. 800
11. **Charlemagne**
   a. Charlemagne: liberal narrative vs. Enlightenment Germanic model
   b. But he was also a bloodthirsty Germanic war chief
   c. The Germanic Christian hero is the missing figure in the rational story
   d. Germanic freedoms were not distinct from the warrior ethos
12. A Western Doctrine of Holy War
   a. "The true early history of the Western synthesis was the story of how the Germanic warlike love of liberty married the Christian ethic of sacrifice."

G. **SONG OF ROLAND** (196-99)
1. Historic Background, Prior to the First Crusade
2. Charlemagne's Twelve Chief Companions or Peers; Roland Is the Greatest
3. Saracen King Marsile's Peace Message from Saragossa
4. Ganelon: His Designation as an Envoy and His Treachery
5. Heraldry: "St. Peter's Banner Which Is Called Romaine"
   a. Holy or magical banner is a Germanic idea: Story of "Landwaster"
6. Saracen Inhabitants Were Offered a Choice: Baptism or Death
   a. This became a part of Christian holy war doctrine in the Middle Ages

H. **CARL ERDMANN** (199-203)

1. Western Way of War: Descended from Idea of Holy War as a Religious Duty
2. Origins of the Christian Warrior Ethic
    a. Changing view of war in the early Church
    b. Two ideas: ***militia Dei*** and ***militia saecularis***
3. Rise of **Feudal Knighthood** and Monasticism
    a. Knights were assimilated to monks and given almost sacred status as defenders of the Church
4. Two Factors Helped Provoke This Conflation of Divine and Military Effort
    a. Scandinavian invasions and plunder of churches
    b. Normans brought with them a tradition of respect for the warrior
5. Norman Doctrine of Battle
    Christopher Dawson: The knight becomes a consecrated person
6. **Reform Movement** (1050s-60s): Popes launched Norman expeditionary forces against Italian princes; Normans then established themselves in the south of Italy
7. Mid-20C: Positive imagery of crusade and holy war
    a. Erdmann's own attitude
8. Christian Ethic of Sacrifice vs. the Cruder Nazi View That Grew out of

I. THE IDEA OF THE **NOBLE SAVAGE** (203-08)
1. Cliché of the Vigorous, Innocent **Barbarian**: Bravo, Brave
2. Tacitus: German Character